- The Thermal Equation of State of $(Mg, Fe)SiO_3$ 1
- Bridgmanite (Perovskite) and Implications for Lower 2

Mantle Structures 3

Aaron S. Wolf^{1,2}, Jennifer M. Jackson², Przemeslaw Dera^{3,4}, and

Vitali B. Prakapenka⁵

nuscri

Corresponding author: Aaron S. Wolf, Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Michigan, 2534 C.C. Little Building, 1100 North University Ave, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, USA. (aswolf@umich.edu)

¹Department of Earth and Environmental

This is the author manuscript accepted for publication and has undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the Version of Record. Please cite this article as doi: DRAFT

D R0A00272015JB012108 September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 2 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

Abstract. The high pressure-temperature equation of state (EOS) of syn-

⁵ thetic 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite (Mg-silicate perovskite) is measured us-

⁶ ing powder x-ray diffraction in a laser-heated diamond anvil cell with a quasi-

 $_{7}$ hydrostatic neon pressure medium. We compare these results, which are con-

 $_{\circ}~$ sistent with previous 300 K sound speed and compression studies, with a re-

⁹ analysis of Fe-free Mg-endmember data from Tange et al. [2012] to determine

Sciences, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA.

²Division of Geological & Planetary Sciences, California Institute of Technology,

Pasadena, California, USA.

³Hawai'i Institute of Geophysics and Planetology, University of Hawai'i,

Honolulu, Hawaii, USA.

 $^4{\rm GeoSoilEnviroCARS},$ Center for

Advanced Radiation Sources, University of

Chicago, Argonne National Laboratory,

Argonne, Illinois, USA.

⁵Center for Advanced Radiation Sources, University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois,

USA.

the effect of iron on bridgmanite's thermoelastic properties. EOS parame-10 ters are incorporated into an ideal lattice mixing model to probe the behav-11 ior of bridgmanite at deep mantle conditions. With this model, a nearly pure 12 bridgmanite mantle composition is shown to be inconsistent with density and 13 compressibility profiles of the lower mantle. We also explore the buoyant sta-14 bility of bridgmanite over a range of temperatures and compositions expected 15 for Large Low Shear Velocity Provinces (LLSVPs), concluding that bridgmanite-16 dominated thermo-chemical piles are more likely to be passive dense layers 17 externally supported by convection, rather than internally supported metastable 18 domes. The metastable dome scenario is estimated to have a relative like-19 lihood of only 4-7%, given the narrow range of compositions and tempera-20 tures consistent with seismic constraints. If buoyantly supported, such struc-21 tures could not have remained stable with greater thermal contrast early in 22 Earth's history, ruling out formation scenarios involving the concentration 23 of radioactive elements. 24

Author

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 4

1. Introduction

The Earth's lower mantle is thought to be composed of primarily aluminous 25 (Mg, Fe)SiO₃ perovskite, now known as bridgmanite [Tschauner et al., 2014], coexist-26 ing with (Mg, Fe)O ferropericlase and CaSiO₃ perovskite [Irifune, 1994]. While the exact 27 phase proportions depend on the assumed compositional model for the lower mantle—e.g., 28 pyrolytic vs. chondritic—iron-bearing bridgmanite is thought to dominate, making it the 29 most common mineral in the silicate Earth (Kesson et al. 1998, Mattern et al. 2005, Iri-30 fune et al. 2010), and giving it a lead role in setting the physical properties and evolution 31 of the lower mantle. 32

Looking beyond average global properties, seismic studies have revealed the two largest 33 coherent structures in the mantle, now known as large low-shear velocity provinces (LLSVPs), which contain $\sim 2\%$ of the mantle's mass and occupy almost 20% of the core-35 mantle boundary's surface area. Located beneath Africa and the Pacific Ocean, as revealed by seismic tomography models [Lekic et al., 2012], the LLSVPs are thought to potentially 37 represent both chemically and thermally distinct structures on the core-mantle boundary 38 [e.g., Tackley, 2011; Hernlund and Houser, 2008; Tan and Gurnis, 2005]. Though their 30 location and dimensions are reasonably well characterized, the nature of LLSVPs is un-40 known: they may be passive piles, plume clusters, pure thermal anomalies, or metastable 41 domes [e.g. Davaille et al., 2005; McNamara and Zhong, 2005; Tan and Gurnis, 2005; 42 Torsvik et al., 2006; Sun et al., 2007; Burke et al., 2008; Garnero and McNamara, 2008; 43 Schuberth et al., 2009; Sun et al., 2010; Davies et al., 2012; Steinberger and Torsvik, 2012]. 44

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

Each of these possibilities has different implications for their origin, evolution, and effect
on surface geological and geochemical expressions.

LLSVPs are particularly challenging to explain, as they appear to have sharp and of-47 ten steep-walled margins and stand roughly 1000 km high off the core-mantle boundary 48 (CMB) [Ritsema et al., 1998; Ni et al., 2002; Ni and Helmberger, 2003]. The sharp seis-49 mic gradients along their edges are generally interpreted as evidence that they cannot be 50 merely thermal anomalies, which would tend to produce diffuse margins [Tackley, 2011], 51 though there is still debate in the literature on this point [Davies et al., 2012]. The 52 viewpoint of a chemically distinct pile is further bolstered by an apparent anticorrelation 53 between shear-wave velocity anomalies and both bulk sound velocity and density anoma-54 lies within the structures relative to average mantle, contrary to the general trends of most 55 heated material [Ishii and Tromp, 1999]. If they do maintain compositional differences from the average mantle, it is a challenge to understand how such structures might remain 57 isolated for geologic time without mixing away through the process of entrainment. Since 58 these competing hypotheses for LLSVPs rest on our understanding of material properties, characterizing the temperature- and composition-dependent equation of state of the dom-60 inant lower mantle phase, iron-bearing bridgmanite, is clearly vital to interpreting these 61 first-order features of our planet. 62

Given its relevance to understanding deep-Earth phase relations, structure, and dynamics, bridgmanite has received considerable scientific attention, though exploring the relevant extreme conditions and wide range of possible chemistries represents a monumental and ongoing task. Many of the earlier x-ray diffraction studies measured bridgmanite compression and thermal expansion over a range of natural and synthetic compositions,

DRAFT

but experimental limitations restricted them to ambient or low pressures (< 30 GPa), 68 largely outside bridgmanite's stability field (e.g. Knittle et al. 1986, Ross and Hazen 69 1989, Mao et al. 1991, Wang et al. 1994, Funamori et al. 1996). Later diffraction stud-70 ies reached higher pressures, and used resistive or laser heating to obtain in situ high 71 temperature measurements of thermodynamically stable bridgmanite, but were mostly 72 performed on the pure Mg-endmember composition [e.g. Fiquet et al., 1998, 2000; Kat-73 sura et al., 2009; Tange et al., 2012]. Recent efforts have been made to understand the 74 compositional effects of aluminum and both ferrous and ferric iron on bridgmanite's equa-75 tion of state, but have been restricted to ambient temperatures [Daniel et al., 2004; Walter 76 et al., 2004; Andrault et al., 2007; Lundin et al., 2008; Mao et al., 2011; Catalli et al., 77 2011; Dorfman et al., 2013; Sinmyo et al., 2014]. First principles density functional theory 78 calculations have also been used to predict the detailed vibrational and elastic properties 79 of Mg-Fe bridgmanite at lower mantle pressures and temperatures [e.g. Kiefer et al., 2002; 80 Wentzcovitch et al., 2004; Metsue and Tsuchiya, 2012]. Glazyrin et al. [2014] recently in-81 vestigated the compression and high pressure thermal expansion of aluminum- and ferric 82 iron-bearing bridgmanite, giving insights into the properties of subducted oceanic crust. 83 Raman and Brillouin spectroscopy as well as ultrasonic interferometry have also been used 84 to help constrain the Mg-endmember's vibrational properties and sound velocities [e.g. 85 Gillet et al., 1996; Chopelas, 1996; Sinogeikin et al., 2004; Li and Zhang, 2005; Chantel 86 et al., 2012; Murakami et al., 2012]. 87

While important to our understanding of the deep Earth, complex compositional studies are challenging to clearly interpret, and thus we must also turn to simpler systems where we can develop a well-characterized understanding of our observations. With this

DRAFT

X - 6

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

motivation, we determine the temperature-dependent equation of state for polycrystalline 91 perovskite-structured $(Mg_{0.87}Fe_{0.13})SiO_3$ (synthetic ferrous bridgmanite), using a novel 92 Bayesian fitting procedure that properly accounts for all major measurement error sources 93 (see **pvt-tool**, *http://github.com/aswolf/pvt-tool*). Though non-hydrostatic stress states 94 have been shown to potentially alter a mineral's compression behavior [e.g., Fei, 1999; 95 Takemura, 2007; You Shu-Jie and Chang-Qing, 2009; Iizuka et al., 2010], most diamond 96 anvil cell studies have used strongly non-hydrostatic pressure media, including bulk load-97 ing without a medium, NaCl, and Ar; to address this problem, we conduct these compres-98 sion experiments in a quasi-hydrostatic neon pressure medium. This sample was probed 99 with x-rays under a wide range of conditions between 30 and ~ 130 GPa and room tem-100 perature up to ~ 2500 K, all of which were entirely within the bridgmanite stability field. 101 Synchrotron Mössbauer spectroscopy measurements were also made after the highest P-102 T diffraction observation, showing that iron within the sample remains in the high-spin 103 ferrous valence state even up to ~ 120 GPa (at 300 K), confirming the sample's integrity 104 against phase separation or chemical diffusion throughout the experiment. These results 105 are then compared with a careful reanalysis of the Fe-free MgSiO₃ bridgmanite data from 106 Tange et al. [2012] to assess the effect of ferrous iron on bridgmanite's high-temperature 107 compression behavior. 108

The resulting equation of state models for Fe-bearing and Fe-free bridgmanite are combined to assess both low- and high-pressure thermoelastic properties. We demonstrate that our equation of state results are fully consistent with previous measurements when the zero-pressure volume parameter V_0 is fixed to the anomalously large ambient volumes characteristic of thermodynamically metastable bridgmanite. Combining the two equa-

DRAFT

tions of state using an ideal lattice mixing model, we obtain thermoelastic properties for a
wide range of compositions up to 25% ferrous iron. By calculating self-consistent mantle
adiabats, combined with a representative core-mantle thermal boundary layer, we demonstrate that bridgmanite alone is incapable of matching the densities and compressibilities
of the bulk mantle (PREM), ruling out the possibility of a bridgmanite-only lower mantle
chemistry.

These findings are finally used to explore bridgmanite's potential role in the behavior of deep-Earth structures. We perform a buoyant stability analysis to test the possibility of compositionally distinct bridgmanite-dominated structures at the base of the lower mantle as a model for the seismically observed LLSVPs. Through this investigation, we show that the passive chemical pile hypothesis for LLSVPs is favored over the metastable dome hypothesis based on the range of temperature-composition values that are supportive of each scenario.

2. Experimental Methods

X - 8

2.1. Sample Preparation and Data Collection

The polycrystalline bridgmanite sample was made from synthetic orthopyroxene-127 structured $(Mg_{0.87}^{57}Fe_{0.13})SiO_3$ starting material. This composition was verified using 128 micro-probe analysis, and initial synchrotron Mössbauer spectroscopy showed it to con-129 tain undetectable levels of ferric iron, constraining it to less than 3% Fe³⁺—see Section 130 2.3 for details Jackson et al., 2009; Zhang et al., 2011]. The sample was loaded into a 131 symmetric diamond anvil cell using a pre-indented Re gasket with beveled 250 micron 132 culets. The sample was also loaded with synthetic ruby spheres for offline pressure de-133 termination using the ruby fluorescence method [e.g., Jacobsen et al., 2008; Silvera et al., 134

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

¹³⁵ 2007]. The cell was filled with a Ne pressure medium using the GSECARS gas-loading ¹³⁶ system at the Advanced Photon Source of Argonne National Laboratory [*Rivers et al.*, ¹³⁷ 2008] and then pressurized to \sim 30 GPa where it was laser annealed within the stability ¹³⁸ field of bridgmanite.

High temperature powder x-ray diffraction (XRD) experiments were conducted at the 139 13-ID-D beamline (GeoSoilEnviroCars) at the Advanced Photon Source, Argonne Na-140 tional Laboratory. Using an incident x-ray wavelength of $\lambda = 0.3344$ Å and focus spot 141 size of better than 4 μ m x 4 μ m, angle-dispersive X-ray diffraction patterns were recorded 142 onto a MAR165 CCD detector. CeO_2 was used to calibrate the sample to detector dis-143 tance at 1 bar. Diffraction patterns were taken in roughly 2 to 4 GPa steps between about 144 33 and 120 GPa (non-heated pressure range). The pressure for each measurement was 145 determined using the Ne pressure medium as the primary pressure marker [Dewaele et al., 146 2008, detailed in Section 3.1, together with the offline ruby fluorescence measurements 147 for secondary verification. High temperatures were achieved in-situ using double-sided 148 laser heating with 1.064 μ m Yb fiber lasers with 'flat top' intensity profiles [*Prakapenka* 149 et al., 2008], enabling uniform laser heating of the complete sample area (20-25 microns) 150 while minimizing temperature gradients and suppressing possible thermally induced iron 151 partitioning. Laser heating was carried out in roughly 5 to 10 GPa steps, where the 152 laser power was gradually increased over a series of stages to measure sample behavior 153 ranging between about 1600 K and 2500 K. These temperatures were determined spectro-154 radiometrically [e.g. Heinz and Jeanloz, 1987; Shen et al., 2001] using the gray-body 155 approximation over the 600-800 nm range of thermal emission. 156

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 10 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

In addition to these experiments, we also rely upon data for the Fe-free endmember 157 $MgSiO_3$ bridgmanite, reported by Tange et al. [2012]. While there are numerous studies 158 of this composition (see Introduction), we chose this dataset for its similar P-T range, 159 usage of an up-to-date thermal pressure marker, and favorably low uncertainties for the 160 sintered-diamond multi-anvil data points. These characteristics are discussed in more 161 detail in Section 3.1. By following an identical procedure for analyzing both our new 162 Fe-bearing data and the iron-free data from Tange et al. [2012], we can make confident 163 comparisons of the two equations of state knowing that differences in model fitting and 164 error analysis have been removed. 165

2.2. High P-T Sample Characterization

The sample's high pressure phase assemblage is readily determined from the processed 166 powder diffraction images. The raw diffraction images are converted into background-167 subtracted one-dimensional patterns using a suite of routines written in MATLAB (see 168 Appendix A for details on the data reduction pipeline). Figure 1 displays a set of rep-169 resentative patterns, together with an interpolated compression map at 300 K, showing 170 the basic compression trends of each diffraction line at room temperature. We also over-171 plot the fitted line positions for each phase, showing that dozens of bridgmanite peaks 172 are visible in the pattern along with peaks from other materials in the sample chamber, 173 including the high-intensity peaks from neon that are used as in situ pressure markers as 174 described in Section 3.1. 175

A recent study by *Zhang et al.* [2014] found that under specific pressure-temperature conditions, iron-bearing bridgmanite was observed to undergo ex-solution, disassociating into two different phases: an iron-free bridgmanite and an iron-rich distorted hexagonal

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

phase (dubbed the H-phase). Zhang et al. [2014] report finding the H-phase, evident 179 by its characteristic diffraction peaks at 2.4 and 2.55 Å, only when the silicate sample 180 was brought up to very high pressure without annealing within the bridgmanite stability 181 field, corresponding to cold compression from ambient conditions up to about 90 GPa, 182 and then laser heated to temperatures above about 2000 K. Though we did not follow 183 this particular P-T pathway, we nevertheless search our diffraction data, but fail to find 184 any evidence of the H-phase, as indicated by the red-boxed zoomed regions of Figure 1. 185 While there does appear to be a slight intensity increase close to 0.416 \AA^{-1} (2.4 \AA), the 186 amplitude is well within the noise of the measurements and maintains constant position 187 over the entire pressure range, indicating that it cannot represent a diffraction line for a 188 phase undergoing compression. Though these data cannot rule out the existence of the 189 H-phase for Fe-bearing bridgmanite systems, neither do they lend support. 190

2.3. Inferring Iron's Valence and Spin State using Synchrotron Mössbauer Spectroscopy

Synchrotron Mössbauer spectroscopy (SMS) is a well-established tool for characterizing 191 the local electronic environment of iron atoms, enabling exploration of valence, spin state, 192 and atomic site distortions [e.g. Sturhahn and Jackson, 2007]. To constrain the valence and 193 spin state of iron in our bridgmanite sample, SMS experiments were performed at beamline 194 3-ID-B of the Advanced Photon Source [e.g. Sturhahn, 2004] immediately following the 195 high P-T x-ray diffraction experiments. After the sample had achieved the highest P-T 196 conditions, it was quenched to 300 K and $P_{ne} = 117$ GPa, and then brought to Sector 197 3 for the SMS measurements. The x-rays at 3-ID-B were prepared with a bandwidth 198 of 1 meV using a multiple crystal Bragg monochromator [Toellner, 2000] and a focus 199

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

X - 12 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

spot-size of about 10 μ m x 11 μ m (which effectively probes the entire previously heated 200 region of the bridgmanite sample given the extended tails of the x-ray beam at 3-ID-B). 201 The storage ring was operated in low emittance top-up mode with 24 bunches that were 202 separated by 153 ns. Accounting for detector-related effects, we were able to observe 203 nuclear resonant scattering in a time window of 16 to 127 ns following excitation. The 204 quadrupole splitting, broadening, and weight fractions of the iron sites are determined 205 by analysis of the SMS time spectrum (see Figure 2), which was obtained with a 3 hour 206 collection time. Further constraints on the hyperfine parameters, such as the isomer shift 207 and the physical thickness of the sample, are obtained by collecting an additional time 208 spectrum with an added natural stainless steel foil (with a physical thickness of 3 μ m) in 209 the x-ray beam path [Alp et al., 1995]. The measured SMS spectra were evaluated using 210 the CONUSS software [Sturhahn, 2000]. 211

The SMS time-spectrum collected without the stainless steel foil, shown in Figure 2, 212 which is clearly dominated by a single oscillatory frequency. The corresponding power 213 spectrum is shown in the inset figure, which confirms a primary frequency induced by a 214 quadrupole splitting of ~ 4.4 mm/s, but also reveals a broad feature underlying this sharp 215 peak. As shown by the solid red line representing the best-fit model, the data can be well 216 represented (reduced $\chi^2 \approx 1.5$) with about 50% texture and two sites, distinguishable 217 only by the broadening of the electric field gradient (or full width at half-maximum of the 218 quadrupole splitting, FWHM). Thus, each iron-site can be characterized by the following 219 hyperfine parameters: quadrupole splitting (QS) of $4.38 \pm .01$ mm/s and an isomer shift 220 (IS) of 0.98 ± 0.02 mm/s (where the isomer shift value is reported relative to α -Fe). The 221 dominant site $(77 \pm 3\%)$ is relatively sharp with a FWHM of $0.14 \pm .01$ mm/s and the 222

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

²²³ broadened site can be described with a FWHM value of $1.20 \pm .05$ mm/s, which is likely ²²⁴ due to the combined effect of atomic site distortions and the pressure gradient sampled ²²⁵ by the x-ray profile. This set of hyperfine fields is indicative of high-spin ferrous iron in ²²⁶ the bipolar-prismatic site (the A site) in the Pbnm-perovskite (bridgmanite) structure ²²⁷ [e.g. Jackson et al., 2005; Li et al., 2006; McCammon et al., 2008; Bengtson et al., 2009; ²²⁸ Jackson et al., 2009; Catalli et al., 2010a, b; Hsu et al., 2010a, b, 2011].

To verify the robustness of this model, we also fit numerous comparison models. First 229 it should be noted that a single site model does not provide an adequate fit to the data, as 230 evidenced by the need to match the broad underlying feature seen in the power spectrum. 231 Likewise, a 3-site model that includes separate sites with QS values of 3.2 mm/s, 4.4 mm/s, 232 and 5.7 mm/s, also provides a poor match to the data, despite the introduction of many 233 more free parameters. Moreover, that model's third site has an unphysically large QS 234 value for bridgmanite [McCammon et al., 2008], indicating that the apparent satellite 235 peaks in the power spectrum actually represent a broadened distribution of field gradients 236 $(\sim 1.2 \text{ mm/s})$ centered on a quadrupole splitting of $\sim 4.4 \text{ mm/s}$. 237

We also explore alternate models that include additional sites with low quadrupole 238 splitting. The well-separated feature found in the power spectrum at a QS of $\sim 0.7 \text{ mm/s}$ 239 is potentially indicative of a small degree of high-spin ferric iron. Using the Monte Carlo 240 algorithm in CONUSS, a second plausible model is found to fit the data almost as well 241 (reduced $\chi^2 \approx 1.9$), with the addition of four more free parameters (QS, FWHM, IS, and 242 weight fraction) describing a third low QS Fe-site. Though this second model, shown as the 243 red-dashed line in Figure 2, provides an adequate description of the data, it is not statisti-244 cally favored due to its higher complexity and somewhat poorer fit quality. The hyperfine 245

DRAFT

X - 14 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

parameters of its two high QS sites agree with those of the primary model described above 246 to within uncertainties, and the third site has QS=0.62(1) mm/s, FWHM=0.70(8) mm/s, 247 and IS=0.18(1) mm/s. These values are consistent with high-spin ferric iron [McCammon] 248 et al., 2008; Hsu et al., 2011, though they represent only 5% of the total iron present, 249 thus providing an upper limit for the ferric iron content. We also explored the possibility 250 of a low QS Fe^{2+} site (QS~2.4 mm/s), which is suggested to be present in bridgmanite 251 at pressure below about 30 GPa [Hsu et al., 2010b], however the data do not support this 252 model, as the fitting procedure reverts this additional ferrous site to a QS of 4.21(1) mm/s, 253 similar to previous models. 254

Taken together, these analyses provide strong constraints on the state of iron within the 255 entire bridgmanite sample, indicating that it has remained in-place and almost entirely in 256 the 2+ valence state. If iron diffusion occurred such that (Mg, Fe)O and SiO_2 exsolved, 257 one would expect to find a low spin (LS) ferropericlase feature in our spectrum. However, 258 the spectrum cannot be fit with a site similar to that of LS (Mg, Fe)O, which has a 259 QS=0, IS of around 0.3 to 0.8 mm/s, and is typically broad. Previous investigations of 260 $(Mg_{0.88}Fe_{0.12})SiO_3$ bridgmanite reported significant broadening of the high quadrupole site 261 [McCammon et al., 2008] in both conventional and time-domain Mössbauer spectroscopy 262 measurements, in support of our primary model. In addition to the broadened ferrous-like 263 site, these measurements also report a few weight percent of a relatively constant low QS 264 site (QS \sim 0.5 to 1.0 mm/s and IS \sim 0.4 mm/s) at 300 K throughout the compression study 265 up to 110 GPa (annealed up to ~ 1000 K), interpreted as high spin Fe³⁺ [McCammon 266 et al., 2008]. However, if Fe^{3+} is indeed present, one would expect Fe metal to also be 267 present [Frost et al., 2004], but a final model exploring this hypothesis was non-convergent, 268

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

²⁶⁹ ruling out the presence of detectable metallic iron. We can therefore surmise that there ²⁷⁰ is no clear evidence for iron diffusion in response to laser-heating, as nearly all the iron ²⁷¹ appears to remain within bridgmanite in its original high-spin ferrous state.

3. Analysis

In order to obtain volume estimates for determining bridgmanite's equation of state, 272 we utilize peak-fitting to extract unitcell dimensions from our 1D diffraction patterns. 273 While more time-consuming than the whole pattern refinement method [e.g. Toby, 2001], 274 individual peak-fitting is useful for lower symmetry phases like bridgmanite, which contain 275 a large number of strongly overlapping peaks which also share diffraction space with 276 other phases present in the sample chamber (see the high inverse-d spacing region of 277 Figure 1). By limiting the potentially biasing influence of unidentified sample peaks as 278 well as stray peaks from unknown phases, the peak-fitting approach can yield more robust 279 volume estimates. We use a custom peak-fitting code written in MATLAB that combines 280 automated minimization with user-driven commands, inferring the sample peak positions 281 by fitting pseudo-Voigt peak profiles to the set of observed and identified diffraction peaks. 282 The set of resulting peak positions are shown as color-coded ticks and crosses in Figure 1. 283 From this list of sample peak positions, including between 10 and 25 identified bridgmanite 284 peaks per diffraction pattern, we obtain estimates of volumes (given in Table 1) and 285 unitcell dimensions using a robust Bayesian peak-list fitting routine (details found in 286 Appendix B) 287

3.1. P-T Conditions

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 16 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

In situ temperature estimates during laser-heating are obtained from measurements of 288 the thermal emission of the sample. The laser heating system at the Sector 13-ID-D beam-289 line of GSECARS is equipped with a set of optics that simultaneously focus a laser-heating 290 spot on the sample, while carrying the thermally radiated light from the sample back to 291 two independently calibrated spectrometers [Prakapenka et al., 2008]. The sample's ther-292 mal radiation spectrum is fit at the beamline assuming a gray-body spectrum [e.g. *Heinz*] 293 and Jeanloz, 1987; Shen et al., 2001, enabling estimation of the temperature for both 294 upstream and downstream sides of the sample, with estimated experimental uncertainties 295 of ~ 100 K. 296

In our experiments, we rely primarily on the diffraction peaks of the quasi-hydrostatic 297 neon pressure medium to determine in situ pressures. Note that we use the high-298 temperature thermally-expanded neon in contact with the sample to determine pressures 299 (rather than the colder denser neon in contact with the diamond surfaces). While Au was 300 also placed inside the sample chamber, the majority of the powder diffraction patterns 301 show weak or absent Au peaks. In contrast, the diffraction lines from neon give the most 302 intense reflections in every pattern. When present, Au peaks allowed confirmation of the 303 pressures inferred from neon in the unheated spectra. 304

³⁰⁵ Using the same peak-fitting procedure described above for bridgmanite, we retrieve peak ³⁰⁶ positions for both the neon 111 and 200 lines. Despite the favorable properties of neon ³⁰⁷ for reducing deviatoric stresses, they often persist at high pressures, inducing differences ³⁰⁸ in apparent unitcell volumes from each diffraction line [see for example *Dorfman et al.*, ³⁰⁹ 2012]. We therefore use the primary 111 peak in order to determine the neon unit cell ³¹⁰ volumes (see Table 1), which due to its high intensity and position within the diffraction

DRAFT

³¹¹ pattern is relatively free from the biasing effects of overlapping sample peaks. Neon ³¹² volumes are converted into pressure estimates using the well-determined equation of state ³¹³ reported in *Dewaele et al.* [2008], which provides a carefully constrained Mie-Grüneisen-³¹⁴ Debye equation of state using high-cadence room-temperature compression data up to ³¹⁵ 200 GPa and precise resistive-heating high-temperature measurements between 300 K ³¹⁶ and 1000 K. A detailed discussion of pressure uncertainties and error propagation is given ³¹⁷ in Section 3.4.

In order to have confidence in the resulting Fe-bearing bridgmanite equation of state, 318 we must pay careful attention to the basis of the secondary Ne-pressure scale, which 319 rests upon the calibration of the SrB_4O_7 : Sm^{2+} fluorescence pressure scale [Datchi et al., 320 1997, 2007], that is in turn tied to the Holzapfel et al. [2005] ruby pressure-scale. Like ruby, 321 $SrB_4O_7:Sm^{2+}$ exhibits a pressure-dependent fluorescence line shift, but is better suited 322 to high temperature experiments since the shift is nearly independent of temperature. 323 Additionally, it shows little dependence on deviatoric stress state and remains high in 324 intensity to very high pressure. Datchi et al. [2007] showed that by calibrating the scale 325 against Holzapfel's (2005) ruby scale, the $SrB_4O_7:Sm^{2+}$ scale accurately recovers the ab-326 initio predictions for the equations of state of both diamond and cubic boron nitride. 327 We therefore have confidence that Dewaele's [2008] neon pressure scale provides the best-328 available neon-based estimate of pressure, which should also correspond closely to the true 329 pressure conditions. 330

To assess the affect of ferrous iron, we compare the behavior of our 13% Fe-bearing sample to that of Fe-free bridgmanite, based on the data of *Tange et al.* [2012]. While those experiments did not use a neon pressure medium, they carefully utilized extensive thermal

DRAFT

relaxation in order to minimize non-hydrostatic stresses. The *Tange et al.* [2012] pressure estimates rely on the MgO pressure scale of *Tange et al.* [2009a], which makes use of a socalled Scale-Free Unified Analysis approach, combining measurements of quantities that do not rely on any pressure scale—including thermal expansion, adiabatic bulk modulus, and shock Hugoniot data. We therefore consider the *Tange et al.* [2009a] MgO pressure scale to be of excellent quality, providing a good estimate of pressure that closely reflects the absolute stress conditions.

3.2. The Mie-Grüneisen-Debye Equation of State

Following after previous investigators, we use the Mie-Grüneisen-Debye model to represent the equation of state of bridgmanite over a wide range of temperatures and pressures. This description employs the thermal pressure approximation, which divides the free energy into *cold* and *thermal* components, leading to separate contributions to the pressure. For convenience, the *cold* contribution to the pressure is often defined with reference to ambient temperature conditions, $T_0 = 300K$, rather than absolute zero, yielding the total pressure expression:

348

$$P(V,T) = P_{\rm ref}(V) + P_{th}(V,T) - P_{th}(V,300{\rm K})$$
(1)

where P_{ref} is the *cold* contribution to the total pressure given by the 300 K reference isotherm, and P_{th} is an expression for the *thermal* contribution, both described below.

At ambient temperature conditions (in the absence of phase transitions), most solid materials are well described by a Vinet equation of state [*Vinet et al.*, 1989]. *Cohen et al.* [2000] showed that the Vinet equation of state is generally favored over the more commonly used third-order Birch-Murnaghan, yielding more accurate extrapolation behavior over

356

$$P_{\rm ref}(x) = 3K_{0T}(1-x)x^{-2}\exp\left[\nu(1-x)\right]$$

where $x = (V/V_0)^{\frac{1}{3}}$ and $\nu = \frac{3}{2}(K'_{0T}-1)$ (2)

where x is the average axial strain, V_0 is the zero-pressure volume, K_{0T} is the zero-pressure isothermal bulk modulus, and K'_{0T} is its derivative $(K' \equiv \partial K/\partial P)$.

The thermal pressure component is evaluated using the Debye crystal model to approximate the energetic contribution of thermal vibrations in a crystalline solid. This simplified vibrational model is derived for monatomic solids, but has been shown to approximately hold true for a limited class of crystals—marked by a sudden drop-off in their phonon density of state curves at a characteristic cut-off frequency—which includes bridgmanite [Anderson, 1998]. The Mie-Grüneisen-Debye expression for the thermal pressure is:

372

$$P_{th}(V,T) = \frac{\gamma}{V} E_{th} = \frac{\gamma}{V} \left[C_V^{\max} T D\left(\frac{\Theta}{T}\right) \right]$$
(3)

³⁶⁶ where γ is the thermodynamic Grüneisen parameter and $E_{\rm th}$ is the thermal energy given by ³⁶⁷ the Debye model. The Debye energy depends on the Dulong-Petit high-temperature limit ³⁶⁸ for the volumetric heat capacity $C_V^{\rm max} = 3k_B N_{\rm cell}$, and the Debye temperature Θ , which ³⁶⁹ sets the energy-scale for the approximate phonon density of states representation. The ³⁷⁰ function D(x) is the Debye integral, which represents how the vibrational heat capacity ³⁷¹ varies with temperature:

 $D(x) = \frac{3}{x^3} \int_0^x \frac{y^3 dy}{e^y - 1}$ (4)

where the integral, which must be evaluated numerically, is a function of $x = \Theta/T$, asymptotically approaching the high temperature limit of 1 as $x \rightarrow 0$.

The Grüneisen parameter is a particularly important thermodynamic quantity, that defines the temperature path along an adiabatic compression curve, $\gamma \equiv -(\partial \log T/\partial \log V)_S$.

379

To complete the equation of state parameterization, we use the common power-law expression for the Grüneisen parameter:

$$\gamma(V) = \gamma_0 (V/V_0)^q \tag{5}$$

where γ is independent of temperature (as required by the Mie-Grüneisen approximation) with a reference value of γ_0 at V_0 and a compression sensitivity described by the power-law exponent q. The corresponding compression dependence of the Debye temperature is:

$$\Theta(V) = \Theta_0 \exp[-(\gamma - \gamma_0)/q]$$
(6)

where Θ_0 is the reference Debye temperature at V_0 . Over the pressure-temperature range of this study, we find this common parametrization is fully sufficient to represent the data.

3.3. Inferring the Equation of State Parameters from PVT Data

Using the model described above, the high P-T datasets for the 13% Fe-bearing bridg-386 manite of this study and the Fe-free bridgmanite of Tange et al. [2012] (Tables 1 & 2) 387 are fit to obtain their equation of state parameters (Table 3). To accomplish this 388 task, we have written a custom MATLAB code called **pvt-tool** (publicly available at 389 http://github.com/aswolf/pvt-tool), that is designed to enable fitting of high temperature 390 compression data while properly accounting for prior information and correlated uncer-391 tainties in the data. This is achieved in two stages: first the cold parameters V_0 , K_{0T} , 392 and K'_{0T} are estimated using ambient temperature data and then the *thermal* parameters 393 Θ_0 , γ_0 and q are inferred from the heated data. According to standard Bayesian practice, 394 we use priors to capture outside knowledge about the likely range of values for each pa-395 rameter. Past studies have shown that ambient bridgmanite volumes display a relative 396 scatter that far exceeds measurement uncertainties (even at fixed composition), implying 397

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

that there is some unmodeled source of sample-to-sample variability. This behavior is 398 shown in Figure 3, which combines data compiled by Kudoh et al. [1990] with a number 399 of more recent studies to show both the compositional trend and high variability in am-400 bient pressure volumes for bridgmanite. This variability may stem from the fact that at 401 0 GPa, bridgmanite is far outside its thermodynamic stability range, potentially leading 402 to inconsistent decompression behavior. Despite this complication, we can estimate the 403 linear dependence of V_0 on Fe-composition along with its scatter, as shown by the solid 404 and dashed lines in the figure, providing useful prior estimates of the zero-pressure volume 405 for 13% Fe-bearing and Fe-free bridgmanite of 163.2 ± 0.2 and 162.5 ± 0.2 Å³, respectively. 406 For the other cold parameters K_{0T} and K'_{0T} , we forgo informative priors since both 407 datasets easily constrain these variables. For the *thermal* parameters, we impose weakly 408 informative priors of $\gamma_0 = 1 \pm 1$ and $q = 1 \pm 1$, indicating their order of magnitude and 409 tendency toward positive values. Finally, we do not attempt to directly determine the 410 value of the reference Debye temperature Θ_0 for both datasets, as it is not well-constrained 411 for the 13% Fe-bearing sample. (This is because all the laser-heated measurements had 412 temperatures well above Θ_0 , thus approaching the Dulong-Petit high-temperature limit, 413 which is independent of Θ .) Instead, we first determine the best-fit value of the reference 414 Debye temperature for the Fe-free dataset, assuming a weakly informed (wide) prior of 415 $\Theta_0 = 1070 \pm 150$ K, based on the approximate relation between wave velocities and 416 the Debye temperature [Anderson, 1998] using measured zero-pressure velocities for Fe-417 free bridgmanite from Brillouin spectroscopy [Sinogeikin et al., 2004]. This initial fit 418 yields an optimal value of $\Theta_0 = 991 \pm 77$ K and shows that the remaining parameters 419 are all relatively uncorrelated with the Debye temperature, where the largest correlation 420

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

X - 22

⁴²¹ coefficient (between Θ_0 and γ_0) was only +0.60. To simplify the analysis and reporting, ⁴²² we proceed by fixing the value of the Debye temperature to $\Theta_0 = 1000$ K, fully consistent ⁴²³ with this best fit, and assume that it remains independent of composition (sensitivity to ⁴²⁴ this assumption discussed later in Section 4.2).

The final best-fit parameter values are presented in Table 3 for both Fe-bearing and Fefree bridgmanite samples, and the corresponding equation of state models are visualized together with the data in Figure 4. The upper and lower panels show the data for the 13% Fe and Fe-free datasets, respectively, color-coded by temperature, along with the 300 K-reduced pressure isothermal data as open circles (calculated by subtracting off the thermal pressure contribution for each data point). These isotherm-reduced data compare well with the 300 K model isotherms, shown as solid blue lines.

The confidence bounds on these model parameters are determined from the covariance matrix, using the standard approach for weighted least-squares modeling. To verify the results from **pvt-tool** (*http://github.com/aswolf/pvt-tool*), we perform the same fit to the error-adjusted dataset in Table 3 with the tested open-source software **MINUTI** (*http://www.nrixs.com*), obtaining results that agree well within mutual uncertainties with nearly identical correlation matrices.

3.4. Estimating realistic measurement uncertainties

Accurate measurement errors play a crucial role in determining the equation of state parameter values and uncertainties discussed above. This is because data errors provide a weighting scheme for the relative importance of each measurement, while also setting the overall scale for the parameter uncertainties. Further complication for the fitting procedure arises from the fact that errors in measured quantities appear on both dependent

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

and independent variables P, T, and V. This situation is easily remedied using standard 443 error propagation methods to determine the effective error in pressure misfit, ΔP , given 444 by: 445

$$\Delta P = P_{\rm mrk}(T, V_{\rm mrk}) - P_{\rm smp}(T, V_{\rm smp}) \tag{7}$$

where "mrk" and "smp" refer to the corresponding values for the pressure marker and 447 sample phases (i.e. neon/MgO and bridgmanite). By focusing on the data vectors 448 $(V_{\rm mrk}, V_{\rm smp}, T)$ rather than the more familiar $(P, V_{\rm smp}, T)$, we dramatically simplify the 449 error propagation procedure, since uncertainties on the directly measured quantities are 450 independent, and therefore add in quadrature: 451

 $\sigma_{\Delta P}^{2} \approx \left(\frac{\partial P_{\rm mrk}}{\partial T} - \frac{\partial P_{\rm smp}}{\partial T}\right)^{2} \sigma_{T}^{*2} + \left(\frac{\partial P_{\rm mrk}}{\partial V_{\rm mrk}}\right)^{2} \sigma_{V_{\rm mrk}}^{*2} + \left(\frac{\partial P_{\rm smp}}{\partial V_{\rm smp}}\right)^{2} \sigma_{V_{\rm smp}}^{*2}$ (8)

The σ^* terms above represent the adjusted measurement uncertainties for each quantity 453 (more details below), and derivatives are evaluated locally. With this expression, we 454 determine how much uncertainties in sample volume, marker volume, and temperature 455 each contribute to the total effective pressure uncertainty. To get reasonable values for the 456 marker volume errors in our experiment, we assume that the fractional volume uncertainty 457 of neon matches the average for the bridgmanite sample, since both result from peak 458 position errors. When applied to the two datasets considered in this study, we find that 459 the marker and sample volume errors both contribute meaningfully to the overall pressure 460 uncertainty, while temperature errors contribute negligibly, as discussed in detail below. 461 The total propagated uncertainties are then incorporated into a *cost function* which 462 expresses the goodness-of-fit of a set of model parameters, often written in terms of χ^2

DRAFT

463

X - 24 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

⁴⁶⁴ with an additional penalty term that incorporates prior information:

4

478

$$\mathcal{C} = \sum_{i}^{\text{obs}} \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{\Delta P_i(\boldsymbol{\phi})}{\sigma_{\Delta P_i}} \right)^2 + \sum_{j}^{\text{params}} \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{\phi_j - \bar{\phi}_j}{\sigma_{\phi j}} \right)^2 \tag{9}$$

where the model residuals ΔP_i are a function of the model parameters ϕ , and the priors are given by $\bar{\phi}_j \pm \sigma_{\phi j}$ for the j^{th} model parameter. According to the standard leastsquares approach, minimizing the cost-function value yields the best-fit equation of state parameters. Additionally, the covariance matrix, which expresses how uncertainties in the different model parameters are correlated with one another, is determined from the curvature of the cost-function, $\Sigma \approx (\nabla^2 \mathcal{C})^{-1}$, in the local region around the best fit.

Given the important role that parameter uncertainties play in comparing equations of state across different studies or materials, total propagated error bars must accurately reflect pressure misfits. We therefore introduce an additional error modeling procedure, implemented in **pvt-tool**, which adjusts the reported error bars by an empirical corrective percentage, in order to obtain final model residuals that are consistent with the total propagated errors:

$$\sigma_{V_{\rm mrk}}^* = \sigma_{V_{\rm mrk}} \exp\{\delta_V\} \quad , \quad \sigma_{V_{\rm smp}}^* = \sigma_{V_{\rm smp}} \exp\{\delta_V\}$$

$$\sigma_T^* = \sigma_T \exp\{\delta_T\}$$
(10)

where the adjustment is applied separately to the volume and temperature terms using $\exp{\{\delta_V\}}$ and $\exp{\{\delta_T\}}$ as weighting factors, inflating or deflating these error sources as appropriate. Since measurement uncertainty systematics differ depending on data source, we introduce independent error-model parameters for each data source (such as sintered-diamond multi anvil and diamond anvil cell experiments), as indicated by the measurement group IDs in Tables 1 and 2.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

The parameter values for the equation of state model and the error model must be refined iteratively, since the equation of state model relies on the propagated uncertainties for each measurement, which themselves depend on the best-fit residuals. Parameter estimates are thus obtained by first fitting the equation of state without adjustments to reported error bars by minimizing Equation (9). Next the error adjustment parameters are fit given these initial residuals, using the following error-model cost function

$$\mathcal{C}_{\text{err}} = \sum_{i}^{\text{obs}} \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{\Delta P_i}{\sigma_{\Delta P_i}(\delta V, \delta T)} \right)^2 + \sum_{i}^{\text{obs}} \log_e \sigma_{\Delta P_i}(\delta V, \delta T)$$
(11)

where the model residuals are held fixed and only the uncertainty adjustment parameters 492 δV and δT are allowed to vary, expressing how the size of the error bar $\sigma_{\Delta P}$ affects the 493 relative likelihood of a set of observations. In reality, this cost function is considered 494 separately for each independent measurement group, each with their own values of δV 495 and δT to be optimized (see group IDs in Tables 1 and 2). By minimizing Equation 496 (11) with respect to δV and δT individually for each measurement group, we can infer 497 the most probable uncertainty adjustment terms for each data source. The equation of 498 state parameters are then finalized given the updated measurement uncertainties (further 499 iteration yields negligible changes). The favorable results of this error adjustment scheme 500 are demonstrated in the insets of the upper and lower panels in Figure 4, which show 501 histograms of the normalized residuals to the best-fit. The histograms are broken into 502 ambient temperature measurements in blue and heated measurements in red, yielding the 503 total bin counts in black. The results of this error modeling procedure are that volume 504 error bars are adjusted up or down by up as much as $\sim 50\%$, as demanded by the model 505 residuals, while temperature error bars receive negligible adjustment. 506

DRAFT

491

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

The most counterintuitive outcome of this careful error analysis is that *random temperature errors have almost zero impact on the analysis* due to a near-perfect cancellation of temperature derivatives. This can be seen in the temperature scale factor in Equation (8), which depends on the difference in thermal pressures between sample and pressure marker. Even for materials with very different thermal properties, such as bridgmanite and compressed neon, thermal pressure differences are rather small, leading to propagated temperature errors of less than 0.03 GPa.

While this analysis indicates that temperature errors do not play a *direct* role in the 514 modeling of these data, it does not mean that experimental heating does not increase 515 uncertainties. Inherent in the construction of Equation (8) is the assumption that the 516 sample and the marker materials are both at the same temperature and that the sample 517 chamber is free of thermal gradients. Though much effort has been taken to minimize 518 these sources of error, it is impossible to eliminate thermal gradients in the presence of 519 micro-focused x-ray diffraction and laser-heating. The errors in pressure therefore stem, 520 not from random error propagation, but rather from non-ideal experimental conditions. 521 The inevitable presence of thermal gradients within the diamond anvil cell leads to pres-522 sure gradients that drive flows to relax stresses. These relaxations induce spatial varia-523 tions in unit cell volumes that contribute to volume uncertainties. To account for these 524 thermally-induced uncertainties, we adopt the practical approach of placing in situ laser-525 heated measurements into a separate measurement group from ambient measurements 526 (see Tables 1 & 2). This allows the error model to empirically determine the additional 527 errors induced by thermal gradients without needing an explicit physical model. The 528 final adjusted uncertainties, and corresponding propagated uncertainties in pressure mis-529

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

fit are shown in Tables 1 and 2 and were used to obtain our parameter estimates and uncertainties reported in Table 3.

4. Discussion

Given the models for Fe-free and 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite, we now take a deeper look into the effect of ferrous Fe on bridgmanite's equation of state. Our results are compared with previous studies and the covariance estimates are used to assess our degree of confidence in these apparent differences under a range of pressure-temperature conditions. Finally, we incorporate the equation of state determinations into an ideal mixing framework in order to evaluate the plausibility of different bridgmanite-rich compositional models for deep mantle structures.

4.1. Compression Evolution of the Perovskite Crystal Structure

As investigated by other authors, we can compare the evolution of the crystal axial 539 ratios with compression. Past work [Lundin et al., 2008; Dorfman et al., 2013] has found 540 that the addition of iron causes a noticeable change in the normalized axial ratios, which 541 are generally observed to grow roughly linearly with pressure. The normalized unitcell 542 parameters are defined as: $a^* = a(V/\sqrt{2})^{-1/3}$, $b^* = b(V/\sqrt{2})^{-1/3}$, and $c^* = c(2V)^{-1/3}$ 543 [Andrault et al., 2007], constructed to yield values of one for an ideal cubic perovskite 544 crystal structure and deviate progressively with increasing distortion. To track compres-545 sion effects on the unitcell geometry, we use the linear compression ratio $(V/V_0)^{-1/3}$ in 546 place of pressure, since it provides an intuitive purely geometric indicator of the degree 547 of compression that is independent of temperature, thereby removing thermal pressure 548 effects. 549

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

X - 28 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

The compression evolution of the normalized axial ratios is shown for both bridgmanite samples in the upper panel of Figure 5. The Fe-bearing sample is depicted with red crosses and the Fe-free sample from *Tange et al.* [2012] with black circles. These axial ratios can be converted into an estimate of the tilt angle of the corner-sharing silica octahedra comprising the backbone of the perovskite structure. From *O'Keeffe et al.* [1979], we can calculate the octahedral tilt angle as a function of the unit cell parameters:

$$\psi = \cos^{-1}\left(\frac{\sqrt{2}a^2}{cb}\right) = \cos^{-1}\left(\frac{1}{(c/a)^*(b/a)^*}\right)$$
(12)

where $(c/a)^*$ and $(b/a)^*$ are the normalized axial ratios. In the lower panel of Figure 5, 557 we show the nearly linear evolution of the octahedral tilt angle with compression, demon-558 strating how the gradual distortion of the perovskite unitcell is accommodated by the 559 progressive tilting of these octahedra. It is clear from this figure that the compression 560 trends for Fe-bearing bridgmanite are offset from the Fe-free trend, as found by previous 561 authors [Lundin et al., 2008; Dorfman et al., 2012], where the addition of 13% Fe tends 562 to reduce the octahedral tilt angles by about a half-degree. We can also see the hint of a 563 change in slope for the axial tilt trend apparent at the low pressure end (linear compression 564 ratio of 1.04), corresponding to ambient pressures below ~ 40 GPa. Since nearly all our 565 data are above this pressure, this observation is fairly tentative, but it is consistent with 566 the ambient temperature observations of a change in tetragonal shear strain evolution 567 around ~ 40 GPa for 4% Fe-bearing bridgmanite [Ballaran et al., 2012]. 568

4.2. Equation of State Comparison and Uncertainties

Teasing out the effects of ferrous iron on the equation of state of bridgmanite requires careful inter-comparison of our parameter confidence regions for the Fe-free and Fe-bearing

samples, as well as with previously published results. The correlation matrices in Table 4 show strong correlations for the *cold* parameters (K_{0T}, K'_{0T}) and *thermal* parameters (γ_0, q) , reflecting the general trade-off between slope and curvature in matching the observed sample volumes across wide ranges of pressure and temperature. Correlations between the remaining parameters are all fairly small with the exception of (V_0, K_{0T}) , which reveals how poorly constrained low-pressure volumes are (given bridgmanite's stability limit), forcing the model to rely heavily on the V_0 prior.

Focusing on the highly correlated pairs of *cold* and *thermal* parameters, Figure 6 shows 578 the correlated 68% confidence regions for (K_{0T}, K'_{0T}) and (γ_0, q) . The 13% Fe-bearing 579 bridgmanite measured in this study is shown in red, while the Fe-free bridgmanite from 580 Tange et al. [2012] is in black. From these confidence regions, we clearly see that the 581 major cold and thermal parameters of bridgmanite are significantly influenced by the 582 addition of iron, as demonstrated by the wide separation of these confidence ellipses. Also 583 displayed as a black cross is the reported best-fit values from Tange et al. [2012], which 584 should nominally lie at the center of the black confidence ellipses. The cold parameter 585 offset is primarily caused by Tange's fixing of V_0 to its measured value (while the source 586 of the hot parameter offset is unclear). 587

Previous x-ray diffraction studies of Fe-free bridgmanite have typically reported a range of isothermal bulk moduli that have smaller values than reported here, including: 252 ± 5 GPa from *Lundin et al.* [2008], 253-259 GPa from *Fiquet et al.* [2000] depending on whether heated data was included in the fit, and 259.6 ± 2.8 GPa from *Mao et al.* [2011]. All of these studies, however, fixed the value of V_0 to a measured volume, rather than using a prior to loosely constrain its behavior. Both Tange's measured zero-pressure volume

DRAFT

 (162.373 Å^3) and the typical measured value $(162.5 \text{ Å}^3, \text{ see Figure 3})$ exceed our fitted 594 value $(162.12 \pm 0.13 \text{\AA}^3)$ by about 2σ and 3σ , respectively, indicating that the behavior of 595 bridgmanite outside its stability field deviates significantly from its high-pressure behavior, 596 affecting both volumes and compressibilities. If we compute the conditional equation of 597 state parameters for Fe-free bridgmanite (fixing V_0 to its most typical measured value of 598 162.5 Å³), we get a low-pressure appropriate bulk modulus of $K_{0T} = 253.2 \pm 4.4$ GPa, 599 in general agreement with previous diffraction studies. The accuracy of this low pressure 600 prediction can be tested most effectively by comparing it with the direct adiabatic bulk 601 modulus determinations made from low-pressure Brillouin spectroscopy measurements 602 like those of *Sinogeikin et al.* [2004], who reported a zero-pressure adiabatic bulk modulus 603 of 253 ± 3 GPa for single crystal Fe-free bridgmanite. To compare with this measurement, 604 we calculate the adiabatic bulk modulus from the thermodynamic relation $K_S = K_T (1 + K_S)$ 605 $\alpha\gamma T$). Evaluated at zero pressure and 300 K, this yields a value of $K_{S0} = 255.7 \pm 4.4$ GPa 606 for Fe-free bridgmanite, which is nicely consistent with the direct metastable measurement. 607 These measurements show that ferrous iron substitution affects not only the 300 K 608 elastic properties of bridgmanite, but the high-pressure *thermal* parameters as well (see 609 Figure 6b). The 68% confidence regions for γ_0 and q for Fe-bearing and Fe-free bridg-610 manite do not overlap one another, indicating that both γ_0 and q drop a statistically 611 significant amount with the addition of 13% iron. Since the thermal pressure term is 612 roughly linear in the Grüneisen parameter (see Equation 3), this change implies a drop 613 in the thermal pressure component at ambient conditions, coupled with a slower decrease 614 associated with compression. Equivalently, this be seen as a pressure-dependent reduc-615 tion in thermal expansion, since neighboring isotherms are closer to one another, evolving 616

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

from a $\sim 14\%$ drop in α at 24 GPa to equal values at ~ 100 GPa when evaluated along a 617 mantle geotherm. Though there are many studies available on the low-pressure thermal 618 expansion properties of Fe-free and Fe-bearing bridgmanite [i.e. Knittle et al., 1986; Wang 619 et al., 1994; Anderson, 1998], they are dominated by measurements of bridgmanite outside 620 its thermodynamic stability field, hindering reliable comparison with this high-pressure 621 study. In fact, the contrast between high- and low-pressure bridgmanite vibrational prop-622 erties were directly established through Raman spectroscopy by *Chopelas* [1996], who 623 showed that bridgmanite's vibrational frequency compression trends posses a strong kink 624 at about ~ 40 GPa. (The vibrational modes responsible for this change may actually play 625 a role in destabilizing bridgmanite relative to its lower pressure polymorphs.) Such a 626 change in phonon frequency evolution implies changes in thermal properties, like ther-627 mal expansion, as well as static compression properties like the bulk modulus, supporting 628 the idea that thermodynamically metastable bridgmanite behaves quite differently from 629 stable bridgmanite. 630

To explore the robustness of our conclusions, we must revisit our assumption about 631 the composition-independence of the reference Debye temperature. While the available 632 experimental evidence supporting this assumption is somewhat weak, we can assess its 633 plausibility using theoretical calculations. From the formalism of Anderson et al. [1992], 634 we can determine the relative affect of ferrous iron on the Debye temperature, which is 635 proportional to both the Debye sound velocity and the inverse linear compression ratio 636 $(V/V_0)^{-1/3}$. The volume change associated with increasing bridgmanite's iron composition 637 from 0% to 13% is only 0.4%, so the linear compression ratio in this case has negligible 638 effect on the Debye temperature. The Debye sound velocity is a weighted average of 639

DRAFT

both the compressional and shear wave velocities, which can be determined from first-640 principles phonon calculations. Using density functional theory, *Kiefer et al.* [2002] and 641 Metsue and Tsuchiya [2012] found that incorporation of 25% ferrous Fe into bridgmanite 642 induces only a modest change in the sound velocities of $\Delta V_p/V_p \approx -4\%$ and $\Delta V_s/V_s \approx$ 643 -6%, corresponding to a drop of roughly $\sim 5\%$ in the Debye sound velocity and the 644 associated Debye temperature. For 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite, we expect an effect only 645 half this size, yielding a shift of only $\Delta \Theta_0 \sim -25$ K as compared to Fe-free bridgmanite; 646 this small shift is well within the 77 K uncertainties for the iron-free endmember model 647 and can be safely ignored. This theory-based reasoning is consistent with the acoustic 648 measurements of Lu et al. [1994], which were unable to resolve a difference between Fe-649 free and 10% Fe-bearing bridgmanite. Furthermore, the measurements of Murakami et al. 650 [2012] and Jackson et al. [2004, 2005] on Al-bearing and Mg end-member bridgmanite also 651 showed a small drop in shear wave speeds of less than 3%, supporting the conclusion that 652 bridgmanite's rough zero-pressure lattice dynamical properties are not highly sensitive to 653 minor cation substitutions. 654

4.3. Confidence Bounds on High-Pressure Thermal Properties

⁶⁵⁵ While considerable attention is often given to directly comparing equation of state pa-⁶⁵⁶ rameter values, in reality, we are most interested in the behavior of bridgmanite at mantle-⁶⁵⁷ relevant P-T conditions, rather than the room pressure-temperature conditions where the ⁶⁵⁸ parameters are defined. We thus propagate our EOS model uncertainties (given by the ⁶⁵⁹ covariance matrices) to determine confidence bounds on the thermophysical properties at ⁶⁶⁰ elevated pressure-temperature states. In the upper panel of Figure 7, we plot the 68% ⁶⁶¹ confidence regions on a set of isotherms for the two bridgmanite samples. Direct compar-

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

X - 33

ison of the low temperature Fe-bearing and Fe-free isotherms shows the reducing effect of 662 iron on the bulk modulus, yielding a more compressible crystal that undergoes a volume 663 crossover with iron-free bridgmanite at about 40 GPa at 300 K. Iron's influence on the 664 thermal expansion is also visible in the spacing of adjacent isotherms, which is significant 665 below 60 GPa but weakens with increasing pressure. From these confidence bounds, it 666 is clear that the high pressure properties of both Fe-free and Fe-bearing bridgmanite are 667 well constrained throughout the lower mantle P-T range, especially near the core-mantle 668 boundary. 669

To further investigate how these materials might behave at deep mantle conditions, we 670 also estimate the confidence intervals for a representative mantle geotherm. We calculate 671 these profiles (Figure 7 & Table 5) by combining a self-consistent adiabat, chosen to match 672 the 1873 K mantle adiabat (defined at 670 km) from Brown and Shankland [1981], with 673 an added thermal boundary layer up to a nominal CMB temperature of 4000 K. This 674 approach is consistent with recent mantle geotherms presented in Stixrude and Lithqow-675 Bertelloni [2007] and Stixrude et al. [2009]. The resulting bridgmanite-only geotherms 676 and the associated material property profiles, are given in Table 5 for both the 13%-Fe 677 and Fe-free compositions. To visually compare these profiles with bulk mantle values rep-678 resented by the Preliminary Reference Earth Model (PREM) [Dziewonski and Anderson, 679 1981, we determine the 68% confidence bounds on the density and adiabatic bulk mod-680 ulus and plot their lower mantle PREM anomalies in the lower panel of Figure 7. The 681 important takeaway from this figure is that although the addition of iron dramatically 682 increases density, it has only marginal statistically significant impact on the high P-T 683

DRAFT

compressibility in the lowermost mantle, as demonstrated by the near total overlap of the Fe-bearing and Fe-free confidence intervals above ~ 70 GPa.

5. Geophysical Implications

To explore the thermophysical properties of Mg-Fe bridgmanite at arbitrary iron compositions, we construct an ideal lattice mixing model based on the equation of state properties determined for 0% and 13% Fe-containing bridgmanite.

5.1. Assessing a Bridgmanite-Dominated Lower Mantle

Though most compositional models of the lower mantle include a significant compli-689 ment of other phases, including about $\sim 15-20\%$ ferropericlase and a few percent CaSiO₃ 690 perovskite [e.g. Irifune, 1994; Irifune et al., 2010; Stixrude and Lithqow-Bertelloni, 2011], 691 there are many uncertainties and underlying assumptions that go into constructing these 692 models. This view has been challenged by previous authors, including Stixrude et al. 693 [1992] and Murakami et al. [2012], who put forward a simpler compositional model in-694 volving a bridgmanite-dominated lower mantle. Murakami et al. [2012] suggested that 695 the lower mantle may be composed of nearly pure bridgmanite (>93%) based upon its 696 match to seismic shear-wave velocities from PREM. Given the equation of state models 697 developed here, we are well positioned to further explore this possibility. 698

In place of the familiar ideal mixing model, where volumes mix linearly in composition at constant (P & T), we employ an ideal lattice mixing model more appropriate to solid solutions. In this framework, energies of the reference components are combined linearly in composition, implying linear behavior in both energy and its volume-derivative (pressure),

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

⁷⁰³ yielding the following simple expression:

704

$$P(X, V, T) = \frac{X}{0.13} P_{\text{MgFe}}(V, T) + \frac{0.13 - X}{0.13} P_{\text{Mg}}(V, T)$$
(13)

where $P_{MgFe}(V,T)$ and $P_{Mg}(V,T)$ are the calculated pressures for 13% and 0% Fe-bearing 705 bridgmanite, as determined in this study. The Mie-Grüneisen-Debye equation of state at 706 arbitrary composition is then determined by fitting ideal model pressures over a grid of 707 volumes and temperatures (120 to 200 $Å^3$ and 300 to 5000 K). This type of ideal mixture, 708 which is carried out at constant V and T, accounts for the energetic cost of straining 709 the end-members to a common lattice volume prior to mixing, which can contribute sig-710 nificantly to apparent "non-ideal" behavior [e.g. Vinograd and Sluiter, 2006]. In this 711 application, a common volume is required for Mg and Fe atoms to share the same bridg-712 manite crystal lattice, and this simple approach automatically incorporates the lattice 713 strain energy without needing to introduce any regular solution parameters. 714

The results of this mixture model comparison are given in Figure 8, where we examine 715 the material properties of bridgmanite at deep-mantle conditions. We construct represen-716 tative geothermal profiles as in the previous section by combining self-consistent adiabats 717 with an added thermal boundary layer, as depicted in Figure 8a. Since both composition 718 and temperature of the deep mantle remain fairly uncertain, we consider a range of pos-719 sible values, allowing the geotherm to be elevated relative to the representative mantle 720 geotherm, shown in gray, based on the 1873 K adiabat from *Brown and Shankland* [1981]. 721 The excess temperature, $\Delta T_{\rm ex}$ is defined as the adiabatic temperature difference from the 722 reference adiabat at 120 GPa, just outside the thermal boundary layer. By repeating this 723 calculation for a range of possible compositions and excess temperatures, we can explore 724 the role that both variables play in determining lower mantle properties. Figure 8b shows 725

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 36

density and bulk modulus anomalies relative to PREM at 120 GPa by solid and dashed 726 contours, respectively. The figure confirms that bridgmanite has a high relative bulk mod-727 ulus over nearly the entire range of plausible temperatures and compositions, indicated 728 by the orange and red dashed contours. Density, on the other hand, is more sensitive to 729 composition, where the zero-anomaly line shown in solid gray increases from about 9%730 to 15% Fe content as the assumed excess temperature is raised by 1500 K. Even over 731 this wide range of possible lower-mantle adiabatic temperatures, there is no bridgmanite 732 composition that can satisfy both the density and bulk modulus of the average mantle, as 733 indicated by the non-intersection of the gray dashed and solid zero-anomaly lines. This 734 analysis of density and compressibility anomalies thus disagrees with the findings of Mu-735 rakami et al. [2012], which preferred a nearly pure bridgmanite mantle based upon its 736 agreement with seismic shear-wave velocities. 737

5.2. Bridgmanite-Dominated Chemical Piles

The composition-dependent bridgmanite equation of state developed above is also useful 738 in assessing the relative merits of different possible explanations for the Large Low Shear 739 Velocity Provinces (LLSVPs). Under the umbrella of chemically distinct explanations for 740 these lower mantle structures, there are two broad endmember theories that account for 741 their large topographic relief relative to the CMB [Tan and Gurnis, 2007; Garnero and 742 McNamara, 2008]. At one extreme, they might represent chemically dense passive piles, 743 which are dynamically propped up by external convective stresses, while at the other, 744 they could be free-standing and internally convecting *metastable* piles, whose topography 745 is a direct reflection of the thermophysical properties of the pile material. 746

DRAFT
The passive pile explanation is the more intuitive of the two, in which the piles reside at 747 the base of the mantle reflecting their greater chemical density. Fighting their tendency 748 to spread out and pool as thin shallow layers on the CMB, some external force must be 749 invoked to sweep them into domed piles, such as cold dense plates descending to the CMB 750 and pinching the sides of these structures in order to dynamically prop them up [Bower 751 et al., 2013]. This story assumes a sufficient plate-flux at the CMB with appropriate 752 geometry to provide the needed lifting force to counteract the pile's negative chemical 753 buoyancy. Under the competing scenario, no external force is required, but rather the 754 chemically distinct piles are made of a material that is less dense than the surrounding 755 mantle at the base but experiences a density crossover, or height of neutral buoyancy, 756 near the top of the pile about 1000 km above the CMB. Under this explanation, the 757 pile undergoes internal convection with hot low-density material rising from the thermal 758 boundary layer at the base of the pile toward a neutral buoyancy point, where it cools 759 and falls back to the CMB enabling the pile to prop itself up without the help of external 760 stresses. This behavior clearly depends on both the thermal structure of the pile as well 761 as its thermophysical properties, which depend on composition. 762

Though we have little knowledge about of the detailed composition of LLSVPs, one possible model for such structures is a dome composed primarily of bridgmanite. While the bulk mantle likely boasts a (Mg, Fe)O ferropericlase component of roughly 15-20% (by volume) and lesser amount of CaSiO₃ perovskite [e.g. *Irifune*, 1994; *Irifune et al.*, 2010; *Stixrude and Lithgow-Bertelloni*, 2011], the pile material must be exceptionally incompressible in order to produce a neutrally buoyant self-supporting structure. This requires a much higher contribution from a silica-rich phase like bridgmanite, since (Mg, Fe)O is

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 38 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

more compressible than its co-existing silicates and calcium silicate perovskite is thought 770 to have a bulk modulus lower than bridgmanite and about equal to that of PREM. It is 771 therefore useful to consider the limiting case of a pile made entirely of Fe-bearing bridg-772 manite. The possibility of bridgmanite-dominated LLSVPs was explored in *Dorfman and* 773 Duffy [2014], by approximating chemical and thermal effects as independent, noting that 774 observed density anomalies are plausibly explained by iron-enrichment. With the high-775 temperature equation of state information obtained in this study, we can investigate this 776 possibility in greater detail, allowing for chemistry-dependent thermal effects to alter the 777 pile's buoyant stability. 778

In order to model the LLSVPs, we calculate geothermal profiles for pure bridgmanite 779 layers and compare relative density anomalies as a function of pressure. Figure 9a shows a 780 few sample calculations of the geothermal trend for bridgmanite with an elevated temper-781 ature of $\Delta T_{\rm ex} = 900$ K above the average mantle profile for a range of iron compositions. 782 Confirming intuition, the plot demonstrates that adding iron increases the density of the 783 bridgmanite layer, taking it from buoyantly unstable at 11%, with a density everywhere 784 lower than bulk mantle values, to a dense stable layer at 13%, with a higher than average 785 density over most of the lower mantle. The curve corresponding to 12% Fe shows the 786 qualitatively different case of a neutrally buoyant structure, that is less dense than aver-787 age mantle at the CMB, but undergoes a density crossover at mid-mantle depths due to 788 its high bulk modulus. This special case corresponds to the metastable dome model for 789 LLSVPs suggested by Tan and Gurnis [2007]. 790

⁷⁹¹ Using the same geotherm comparison procedure, we can predict the expected heights of ⁷⁹² neutral buoyancy for a bridgmanite-only pile in the deep mantle. First we focus in on the

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

expected temperature contrast for LLSVPs relative to average mantle, which are estimated 793 from seismic tomography models and geodynamic simulations to be roughly 1000 K [Tan 794 and Gurnis, 2007; Bower et al., 2013]. Panel b of Figure 9 maps out this parameter space 795 by noting the relative buoyant stability of the structure as a function of composition and 796 temperature, where the pink shading denotes the metastable dome region with neutral 797 buoyancy heights falling between 600 and 1200 km above the CMB, generally matching the 798 observed LLSVP heights. The green shaded region to the left contains piles that extend 799 too high above the CMB or are fully unstable to convection, while the unshaded region to 800 the right corresponds to dense passive piles that rely on viscous stresses to dynamically 801 prop them up off the CMB. For comparison, the CMB density contours from Figure 8 802 are also shown indicating anomalies between -3 and +3%, which reflect the maximum 803 plausible range of density differences based on seismic observations (such as the normal 804 mode inversion of Ishii and Tromp [1999]). 805

As is clear from the figure, there is only a tiny sliver of allowable phase space that 806 corresponds to the delicate balance required by the metastable dome hypothesis. In 807 contrast, passive piles are extremely insensitive to composition and temperature. We can 808 thus assess the relative plausibility of the passive pile and metastable dome explanations 809 by calculating the fraction of allowable phase space occupied by the two theories—this is 810 given simply by the relative area of the red-shaded and unshaded regions falling within 811 the desired maximum density anomaly contour. This probability fraction is only $\mathcal{P}{\sim}4\%$ 812 for up to 3% density anomalies (or $\mathcal{P}\sim7\%$ if restricted to 1.5% anomalies), indicating 813 that while metastable domes are possibly consistent with our current understanding of 814 the bridgmanite equation of state, they imply very tight constraints on the temperature-815

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

X - 39

X - 40 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

dependent composition of the LLSVP material and are thus highly unlikely. Furthermore, 816 we recognize that the positive slope of this metastable region places strong restrictions on 817 the allowable thermal evolution of a metastable dome. If the pile is buoyantly metastable, 818 then it must have remained stable since its creation early in Earth's history, meaning that 819 it could not have had greater thermal contrast in the distant past. We can thus rule out 820 any formation scenarios that would produce increased thermal anomalies early on, even if 821 they might result in a metastable structure today. For instance, the layer cannot contain 822 an increased concentration of radiogenic heat-producing elements, since this would cause 823 it to heat up rendering it unstable. Similarly, an increased core-mantle boundary heat 824 flux early on could also make it difficult to form a long-lived metastable pile, since any 825 initially metastable structure would gradually cool relative to the mantle, evolving into 826 a passive chemically dense layer. These constraints on relative thermal evolution cast 827 further doubt onto the metastable dome hypothesis. 828

In this analysis, we consider a pure simplified bridgmanite chemistry, neglecting the 829 roles of other phases like ferropericlase, calcium silicate perovskite, aluminum-bearing 830 phases or basaltic components, or post-bridgmanite. As stated above, the addition of 831 ferropericlase, which has a lower high-pressure bulk modulus lower than bridgmanite, 832 would render metastable domes more difficult to form, since a high bulk modulus is needed 833 to provide convective self-support. Post-bridgmanite is also neglected since it would only 834 play a potential role at the very base of the LLSVP, and its positive Clapevron slope 835 diminishes its importance within hot LLSVPs due to the increased transition pressure. 836 Given our simplified compositional model as a foundation, the possible effects of a more 837 realistic bridgmanite chemistry is certainly worth exploring. We can estimate the effect 838

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 41

of substituting 10% Al into bridgmanite using the Fe, Al-bridgmanite equation of state of *Catalli et al.* [2011], which showed a roughly 4% drop in the bulk modulus and density. For the most part, this would merely increase the bulk modulus and density values and would therefore shift the metastable dome region toward higher iron contents, but would not significantly alter its size. We thus conclude that aluminum should have little affect on either the assessment of a bridgmanite-dominated lower mantle or in the likelihood of dynamically metastable LLSVPs.

6. Conclusion

Iron-bearing magnesium silicate perovskite (or bridgmanite) is thought to make up most 846 of the Earth's lower mantle, enabling it to exert strong controls over lower mantle dy-847 namics and thermodynamics. Laser-heated diamond anvil cell experiments are performed 848 using a nearly hydrostatic neon pressure medium to determine the thermal equation of 849 state of synthetic 13% Fe-bearing ferrous (Mg, Fe)SiO₃ bridgmanite. We combine this new 850 dataset with the sintered diamond multi-anvil and diamond anvil cell measurements of a 851 pure $MgSiO_3$ bridgmanite sample reported in Tange et al. [2012] to determine the effect 852 of ferrous iron on the high P-T behavior of bridgmanite. These data are fit with a Mie-853 Grüneisen-Debye equation of state, using a novel Bayesian error-modeling procedure (im-854 plemented in a publicly-available MATLAB code pvt-tool, http://github.com/aswolf/pvt-855 tool) to determine accurate parameters along with their correlated uncertainties. Particu-856 lar care is taken to investigate the possible differences between the high-pressure behavior 857 of bridgmanite, most relevant to the Earth's mantle, and its low-pressure metastable be-858 havior observed in many past experiments. Through this analysis, we find evidence that 859 metastable bridgmanite shows distinctly different properties outside its thermodynamic 860

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 42 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

stability field, including its overly large zero-pressure volume and associated higher compressibility. To account for these changes, we show that fixing V_0 to measured zero-pressure volumes produces isothermal and adiabatic bulk moduli values that are fully consistent with previous equation of state studies and direct sound-velocity based measurements.

The high-pressure equations of state for 13%-Fe and Fe-free bridgmanite are incor-865 porated into an ideal lattice mixing model enabling the estimation of thermophysical 866 properties for a large range of ferrous iron compositions. Using this mixture model, we 867 examine the range of plausible values in temperature-composition space relevant to the 868 deep mantle. Through this analysis, we demonstrate that there is no combination of tem-869 perature and composition capable of matching the Earth's bulk properties near the base 870 of the mantle, ruling out the possibility of a pure bridgmanite lower mantle composition. 871 Furthermore, we explore the buoyancy properties of bridgmanite-dominated piles in the 872 deep mantle, directly relevant to Large Low Shear Velocity Provinces. Using plausibility 873 arguments, we show that metastable bridgmanite domes are marginally possible, given 874 our knowledge of the equation of state, but represent a sensitive balance between iron 875 content and temperature, and are therefore unlikely. Instead, we find the passive chem-876 ical pile explanation more compelling, as it allows for a broad range of composition and 877 temperature values in the deep mantle, but may require external forces to sweep them 878 into coherent structures. 879

Appendix A: Data Reduction Pipeline

Raw powder diffraction images are converted to one-dimensional patterns using a suite of routines written in MATLAB. In these routines, the observing geometry is first determined from calibration diffraction images using an automated statistical method. This has the

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

advantage over the standard 'click-based' method employed in FIT2D that it requires 883 little user input and generates a reproducible result using maximum likelihood estimation 884 of the observing geometry from calibration image data. With the derived geometric 885 calibration, the observed diffraction angle (2θ) is calculated for each pixel on the CCD. 886 Diffraction angle is converted to inverse d-spacing (1/d) by applying Bragg's law for 887 first-order reflections, $1/d = 2\sin(2\theta/2)/\lambda$, where d is the distance between coherently 888 reflecting lattice planes, and λ is the wavelength of the monochromatic x-rays used to 889 probe the sample. Each raw image is then *integrated* assuming Poisson statistics for the 890 uncertainties in number of photons hitting each pixel. For some of the diffraction images, 891 which contain over-exposed pixels, a further preprocessing step is required to produce 892 accurate 1-D patterns (discussed below). The final step in the integration process is to 893 subtract off an initial estimate of the background intensity so that datasets can be easily 894 examined and fit. We employ the Bayesian background identification and subtraction 895 method presented in *David and Sivia* [2001], which automatically determines a reasonable 896 polynomial background curve assuming the potential presence of large positive deviations 897 due to as-yet unmodeled diffraction peaks. 898

⁸⁹⁹ We determine the detector geometry using a method similar to that reported in [*Hinrich-*⁹⁰⁰ sen, 2006]. After determining an approximate beam-center location, the diffraction data ⁹⁰¹ for a known calibration standard-such as CeO₂ or LaB₆-is sliced radially using bi-cubic ⁹⁰² interpolation to obtain a set of 1-D radial pattern. Peak fitting with pseudo-Voigt profiles ⁹⁰³ is then used to extract the 2θ locations of every line in each radial slice. These calibra-⁹⁰⁴ tion line positions (with associated uncertainties) are then fit by varying the experimental ⁹⁰⁵ geometry parameters controlling the orientation and position of the detector: detector

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 44 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

distance, beam-center location, and detector tilt and rotation. The geometric calibration parameters are chosen as the values with the maximum likelihood given the measured line positions using the standard least-squares method (as is appropriate to simple data fitting with Gaussian uncertainties and in the absence of strong prior information).

For diffraction images containing both strong and weak x-ray scatterers, it is often 910 impossible to obtain high quality patterns that do not suffer from over-exposure in certain 911 regions of the image. Due to the basic properties of CCD detectors, exposure of a pixel 912 beyond its full-well depth causes 'blooming' in the final image, where electrons spill over 913 into neighboring pixel wells causing full-intensity streaks to emanate from the excessively 914 bright points in the image. The typical approach to this problem is to adjust exposure 915 times to limit its occurrence. Unfortunately, in many cases this method is either ineffective 916 (e.g., in the presence of very weak scatterers) or impractical (e.g., during high-temperature 917 measurements). It would be highly advantageous to be able to use these data while 918 minimizing the impact of the erroneous intensities caused by blooming-such an approach 919 is made possible by the conservation of electrons within the affected region. Since the 920 total number of electrons, equal to the number of photons registered by the CCD, remains 921 constant as electrons spill into neighboring pixel bins, simple summation in an overexposed 922 region will give an approximate total intensity for that region. In order to determine how 923 to reasonably distribute this total amongst the affected pixels, we leverage the angular 924 symmetry inherent to powder diffraction by setting the relative intensity of each pixel to 925 the values from integrated 1-D pattern. Iterating this procedure then results in reasonable 926 pixel intensities which will no longer induce wild bias into the final integrated pattern. 927

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

The final data reduction step is the integration procedure itself, which operates on 928 the powder diffraction images (pre-corrected for saturation if necessary) using the geo-929 metric parameters derived from the calibration image. Using the equations presented in 930 *Hinrichsen et al.* [2008], we determine the proper intensity weighting factors required to 931 transform each measured pixel value into an equivalent ideal pixel intensity for a per-932 pendicular and hemispherical detector. This factor is combined with the standard 2-D 933 Lorentz and polarization correction factors (see, e.g., *Hinrichsen et al.* [2008]), forming a 934 single overall weighting factor for each pixel on the detector. Since this intensity weighting 935 map is independent of the data collected, it need only be calculated once for each detector 936 configuration. To obtain a reasonably smooth one-dimensional pattern, as remarked by 937 Hammersley et al. [1996], measured pixel intensities are divided amongst sub-pixel regions 938 according to standard bi-cubic interpolation. These sub-pixels are then sorted into bins 939 according to their diffraction angle 2θ . The sub-pixel intensities are combined together as weighted observations of a Poisson process, using the intensity weight map described 941 above, resulting in a one-dimensional pattern of intensity as a function of diffraction angle. 942 After the integration, we apply the method derived by *David and Sivia* [2001] to estimate 943 and subtract a robust Chebyshev polynomial background from the pattern. This acts as 944 a good initial guess of the background, which can later be refined, and provides a simple 945 flat pattern ready for analysis and visualization. 946

Appendix B: Extracting Crystal Volumes and Cell Dimensions

After obtaining line position estimates from the powder diffraction pattern, the next step is to fit these positions with a crystal lattice model to estimate unit cell dimensions and volumes. As an orthorhombic crystal, the predicted peak positions are a simple function

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

X - 46 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

of the lattice parameters and the hkl values for each reflection in the bridgmanite pattern:

$$\left(\frac{1}{d}\right)^2 = \left(\frac{h}{a}\right)^2 + \left(\frac{k}{b}\right)^2 + \left(\frac{l}{c}\right)^2 \tag{B1}$$

where hkl are the reflection order parameters, abc are the crystal unit cell parameters, 947 and d is the atomic plane spacing. Using this model for the 10 to 25 identified peak 948 positions, we obtain an initial guess for the unit cell parameters by fitting the volume V =949 abc, and axial ratios ((c/a) and (b/a)) using standard weighted least-squares regression, 950 where the uncertainties for each peak are determined from the empirical scatter of the 951 measurements about the best-fit smooth (quadratic) trend with pressure. Subsequently, 952 we carry out a more careful Bayesian analysis that accounts for the potential presence of 953 misidentified lines and determines realistic estimates of the unit cell parameters along with 954 their correlated uncertainties. Additionally, we make use of the ambient pressure relative 955 peak intensities, obtained from the crystal model of Sugahara et al. [2006], as rough order-956 of-magnitude guide for which lines most likely dominate the diffraction pattern over the 957 full range of pressures and temperatures. 958

In order to address line misidentification, we use a simple Bayesian mixture model 959 approach, which is robust against moderate degrees of contamination by peak identifica-960 tion errors. This general statistical tool is useful in analyzing "polluted" datasets where 961 there are a variety of possible data sources, such as bona fide bridgmanite peaks together 962 with unwanted misidentified peaks. (See section 8.3 of Sivia and Skilling [2006] for a 963 useful and succinct general discussion of the importance of properly handling outliers 964 in generic data analysis applications.) To account for the contribution of misidentified 965 peaks, we assume that each position measurement is drawn at random from one of two 966 possible populations: either it is properly identified and drawn from the true sample line 967

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

population or it is misidentified and draw from a population of confused lines. As with 968 the standard least squares approach, properly identified peaks are considered normally 969 distributed about the model value with uncertainties given by the line position errors. 970 The confused line population is represented with a flat distribution centered on the ex-971 pected position with a width of Δp , corresponding to how closely spaced observed and 972 predicted line positions must fall in order for misidentification to occur. We estimate a 973 reasonable value for the width of $\Delta p \approx 0.02$, which is roughly a few times larger than 974 the typical uncertainties on line position. The total likelihood for each data point is just 975 a mixture, or a weighted average, of these two distributions [Sivia and Skilling, 2006]: 976 $\mathcal{L} = \prod_i \left((1-f)\mathcal{N}(p_i - p_i^{\text{mod}}, \sigma_i) + \frac{f}{\Delta p} \right)$, where f is the expected fraction of the data 977 points that are incorrectly identified. When there are no misidentified peaks, f = 0 and 978 we recover the standard least-squares approach. Taking the negative log of this expres-979 sion, we obtain the goodness-of-fit metric to be minimized, akin to χ^2 , for the Bayesian 980 mixture model: 981

982

$$-\log \mathcal{L} = -\sum_{i} \log \left(\frac{(1-f)}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma_i} \exp \left[-0.5 \left(\frac{p_i - p_i^{\text{mod}}}{\sigma_i} \right)^2 \right] + \frac{f}{\Delta p} \right)$$
(B2)

We assume a modest degree of contamination from misidentified lines (f = 0.1), though the results are fairly insensitive to its exact value as long as it is nonzero. This goodnessof-fit equation is then used in conjunction with the line position model to obtain a robust fit to the observed line positions.

Though we present peak identification and crystal modeling in two separate sections, in truth there exists large overlap between the two. Peak identification and fitting is inherently an iterative process, where peak identification improves as the model is refined

⁹⁹⁰ with the addition of each new peak. At the same time, however, the addition of an ⁹⁹¹ incorrect peak at such an early stage can be quite detrimental when using the standard ⁹⁹² least-squares approach. The Bayesian mixture model significantly reduces the effect of the ⁹⁹³ misidentified peaks on the overall fit, making it useful both for obtaining final estimates ⁹⁹⁴ as well as early on in the peak identification and fitting process.

Uncertainties for the inferred bridgmanite volumes are obtained by propagating the 995 uncertainties in the individual line positions. Thus far, we have roughly estimated line 996 position errors based on the observed scatter about a smooth pressure trend. This is a 997 reasonable approach, but is limited to ambient temperature measurements. Additionally, 998 it also folds extra scatter due to pressure uncertainties back into the line position errors, 999 essentially double-counting the pressure errors. We can handle both of these limitations 1000 by instead examining the scatter of the line positions in an entirely geometric space 1001 independent of pressure. Unit analysis and inspection of Equation (B1) suggests that 1002 the line positions, 1/d, behave smoothly when plotted against the inverse average cell 1003 dimension, $1/\langle a \rangle = V^{-1/3}$, resulting in linear behavior that is independent of temperature, 1004 due to its purely geometric construction. To further improve the model, we also assume 1005 that the error on each individual line is roughly proportional to peak width ($\sigma_i = \alpha w_i$), 1006 as this is the primary variable controlling the ability to determine the location of a peak 1007 assuming it is clearly visible. The constant of proportionality, α , is specific to each line, 1008 and determined empirically using the scatter of peak positions about their linear trend 1009 with compression. By scaling all of the line-specific constants of proportionality, we ensure 1010 that the observed scatter is well explained by the inferred line position errors. Obtaining 1011 a final uncertainty on the volume and axial ratios now reduces to the usual approach of 1012

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

calculating standard errors from the curvature of the goodness-of-fit in parameter space (in this case, using the Bayesian mixture model rather than χ^2 to obtain robust error estimates).

Acknowledgments. The authors would like to thank Wolfgang Sturhahn, June K. 1016 Wicks, Dan J. Bower, Mike Gurnis, Jeroen Ritsema, and John Johnson for useful con-1017 versations throughout the development of this study, as well as both reviewers for their 1018 detailed and helpful comments. The authors would like to thank the National Science 1019 Foundation CSEDI EAR-1161046, CAREER EAR-0956166, and the Turner Postdoctoral 1020 Fellowship at the University of Michigan for support of this work. The x-ray diffraction 1021 experiments were performed at GeoSoilEnviroCARS (GSECARS, Sector 13) and the syn-1022 chrotron Mössbauer experiments at X-ray Science Division (Sector 3), both located at the 1023 Advanced Photon Source (APS), Argonne National Laboratory. GeoSoilEnviroCARS is 1024 supported by the National Science Foundation - Earth Sciences (EAR-1128799) and De-1025 partment of Energy - Geosciences (DE-FG02-94ER14466). Use of the APS is supported 1026 by the U.S. D.O.E., O.S., and O.B.E.S. (DE-AC02-06CH11357). Sector 3 operations and 1027 the gas-loading system at GSECARS are supported in part by COMPRES under NSF 1028 Cooperative Agreement EAR 11-57758. The data analyzed in this study are included in 1029 the tables; any additional data may be obtained from Aaron S. Wolf (aswolf@umich.edu). 1030

References

Alp, E., W. Sturhahn, and T. Toellner (1995), Synchrotron Mossbauer spectroscopy of
 powder samples, Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section B: Beam
 Interactions with Materials and Atoms, 97(1-4), 526–529.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- X 50 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES
- Anderson, O. L. (1998), Thermoelastic properties of MgSiO 3 perovskite using the Debye approach, *American Mineralogist*, 83(1-2), 23–35.
- ¹⁰³⁶ Anderson, O. L., D. Isaak, and H. Oda (1992), High-temperature elastic constant data on ¹⁰³⁷ minerals relevant to geophysics, *Rev. Geophys.*, 30(1), 57–90.
- Andrault, D., N. Bolfan-Casanova, M. Bouhifd, N. Guignot, and T. Kawamoto (2007),
 The role of Al-defects on the equation of state of Al-(Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 263(3-4), 167–179.
- Ballaran, T. B., A. Kurnosov, K. Glazyrin, D. J. Frost, M. Merlini, M. Hanfland, and
 R. Caracas (2012), Effect of chemistry on the compressibility of silicate perovskite
 in the lower mantle, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 333-334(0), 181–190, doi:
 10.1016/j.epsl.2012.03.029.
- ¹⁰⁴⁵ Bengtson, A., J. Li, and D. Morgan (2009), Mössbauer modeling to interpret the spin ¹⁰⁴⁶ state of iron in (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 36(15), L15,301–.
- Bower, D. J., M. Gurnis, and M. Seton (2013), Lower mantle structure from paleogeographically constrained dynamic Earth models, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, 14(1), 44–63.
- ¹⁰⁵⁰ Brown, J. M., and T. J. Shankland (1981), Thermodynamic parameters in the Earth ¹⁰⁵¹ as determined from seismic profiles, *Geophysical Journal of the Royal Astronomical* ¹⁰⁵² Society, 66(3), 579–596.
- ¹⁰⁵³ Burke, K., B. Steinberger, T. H. Torsvik, and M. A. Smethurst (2008), Plume Genera-¹⁰⁵⁴ tion Zones at the margins of Large Low Shear Velocity Provinces on the core-mantle ¹⁰⁵⁵ boundary, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 265(1-2), 49–60.

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

- Catalli, K., S.-H. Shim, V. Prakapenka, J. Zhao, and W. Sturhahn (2010a), X-ray
 diffraction and Mössbauer spectroscopy of Fe3+-bearing Mg-silicate post-perovskite
 at 128–138 GPa, American Mineralogist, 95 (2-3), 418–421, doi:10.2138/am.2010.3352.
- Catalli, K., S.-H. Shim, V. B. Prakapenka, J. Zhao, W. Sturhahn, P. Chow, Y. Xiao,
 H. Liu, H. Cynn, and W. J. Evans (2010b), Spin state of ferric iron in MgSiO3 perovskite
 and its effect on elastic properties, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 289(1-2), 68–
 75.
- Catalli, K., S.-H. Shim, P. Dera, V. B. Prakapenka, J. Zhao, W. Sturhahn, P. Chow,
 Y. Xiao, H. Cynn, and W. J. Evans (2011), Effects of the Fe3+ spin transition on the properties of aluminous perovskite—New insights for lower-mantle seismic heterogeneities, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 310(3-4), 293–302, doi:
 10.1016/j.epsl.2011.08.018.
- ¹⁰⁶⁸ Chantel, J., D. J. Frost, C. A. McCammon, Z. Jing, and Y. Wang (2012), Acoustic
 ¹⁰⁶⁹ velocities of pure and iron-bearing magnesium silicate perovskite measured to 25 GPa
 ¹⁰⁷⁰ and 1200 K, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 39(19), L19,307–.
- ¹⁰⁷¹ Chopelas, A. (1996), Thermal expansivity of lower mantle phases MgO and MgSiO3
 ¹⁰⁷² perovskite at high pressure derived from vibrational spectroscopy, *Physics of the Earth* ¹⁰⁷³ and Planetary Interiors, 98(1-2), 3–15.
- ¹⁰⁷⁴ Cohen, R. E., O. Gülseren, and R. J. Hemley (2000), Accuracy of equation-of-state for-¹⁰⁷⁵ mulations, *American Mineralogist*, 85(2), 338–344.
- Daniel, I., J. D. Bass, G. Fiquet, H. Cardon, J. Zhang, and M. Hanfland (2004), Effect
 of aluminium on the compressibility of silicate perovskite, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 31(15),
 L15,608–.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

X - 52 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES

¹⁰⁷⁹ Datchi, F., R. LeToullec, and P. Loubeyre (1997), Improved calibration of ¹⁰⁸⁰ the SrB4O7:Sm2+ optical pressure gauge: Advantages at very high pressures ¹⁰⁸¹ and high temperatures, *Journal of Applied Physics*, *81*(8), 3333–3339, doi: ¹⁰⁸² http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.365025.

- ¹⁰⁸³ Datchi, F., A. Dewaele, Y. Le Godec, and P. Loubeyre (2007), Equation of state of cubic ¹⁰⁸⁴ boron nitride at high pressures and temperatures, *Phys. Rev. B*, 75(21), 214,104–.
- Davaille, A., E. Stutzmann, G. Silveira, J. Besse, and V. Courtillot (2005), Convective
 patterns under the Indo-Atlantic ;; box ;;, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 239 (34), 233-252.
- David, W. I. F., and D. S. Sivia (2001), Background estimation using a robust Bayesian analysis, *Journal of Applied Crystallography*, 34(3), 318–324, doi: doi:10.1107/S0021889801004332.
- Davies, D. R., S. Goes, J. Davies, B. Schuberth, H.-P. Bunge, and J. Ritsema (2012),
 Reconciling dynamic and seismic models of Earth's lower mantle: The dominant role of
 thermal heterogeneity, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 353-354(0), 253-269.
- ¹⁰⁹⁴ Dewaele, A., F. Datchi, P. Loubeyre, and M. Mezouar (2008), High pressure-high tem-¹⁰⁹⁵ perature equations of state of neon and diamond, *Phys. Rev. B*, 77(9), 094,106–9.
- Dorfman, S., and T. Duffy (2014), Effect of Fe-enrichment on seismic properties of per ovskite and post-perovskite in the deep lower mantle, *Geophysical Journal International*,
 1997 (2), 910–919.
- Dorfman, S. M., V. B. Prakapenka, Y. Meng, and T. S. Duffy (2012), Intercomparison of
 pressure standards (Au, Pt, Mo, MgO, NaCl and Ne) to 2.5 Mbar, J. Geophys. Res.,
 1101 117(B8), n/a-n/a.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- ¹¹⁰² Dorfman, S. M., Y. Meng, V. B. Prakapenka, and T. S. Duffy (2013), Effects of Fe-¹¹⁰³ enrichment on the equation of state and stability of (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite, *Earth and*
- Planetary Science Letters, 361(0), 249-257.
- Dziewonski, A. M., and D. L. Anderson (1981), Preliminary reference Earth model,
 Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 25(4), 297–356.
- Fei, Y. (1999), Effects of temperature and composition on the bulk modulus of (Mg,Fe)O, American Mineralogist, 84 (3), 272–276.
- ¹¹⁰⁹ Fiquet, G., D. Andrault, A. Dewaele, T. Charpin, M. Kunz, and D. Haüsermann (1998),
- P-V-T equation of state of MgSiO3 perovskite, *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 105(1-2), 21–31.
- ¹¹¹² Fiquet, G., A. Dewaele, D. Andrault, M. Kunz, and T. Le Bihan (2000), Thermoelastic
- Properties and Crystal Structure of MgSiO3 Perovskite at Lower Mantle Pressure and
 Temperature Conditions, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 27, –.
- ¹¹¹⁵ Frost, D. J., C. Liebske, F. Langenhorst, C. A. McCammon, R. G. Tronnes, and D. C.
- Rubie (2004), Experimental evidence for the existence of iron-rich metal in the Earth's lower mantle, *Nature*, 428(6981), 409–412.
- ¹¹¹⁸ Funamori, N., T. Yagi, W. Utsumi, T. Kondo, T. Uchida, and M. Funamori (1996),
- ¹¹¹⁹ Thermoelastic properties of MgSiO3 perovskite determined by in situ X ray observations ¹¹²⁰ up to 30 GPa and 2000 K, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 101 (B4), 8257–8269.
- Garnero, E. J., and A. K. McNamara (2008), Structure and Dynamics of Earth's Lower
 Mantle, *Science*, 320(5876), 626–628.
- ¹¹²³ Gillet, P., F. Guyot, and Y. Wang (1996), Microscopic anharmonicity and equation of ¹¹²⁴ state of MgSiO3-perovskite, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 23(21), 3043–3046.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- X 54 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES
- 1125 Glazyrin, K., T. Boffa Ballaran, D. Frost, C. McCammon, A. Kantor, M. Merlini, M. Han-
- fland, and L. Dubrovinsky (2014), Magnesium silicate perovskite and effect of iron oxi-
- dation state on its bulk sound velocity at the conditions of the lower mantle, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 393(0), 182–186.
- Hammersley, A. P., S. O. Svensson, M. Hanfland, A. N. Fitch, and D. Hausermann (1996),
 Two-dimensional detector software: From real detector to idealised image or two-theta
 scan, *High Pressure Research*, 14(4), 235–248.
- Heinz, D. L., and R. Jeanloz (1987), Temperature measurements in the laser-heated
- diamond cell, in *Geophys. Monogr. Ser.*, vol. 39, pp. 113–127, AGU, Washington, DC.
- ¹¹³⁴ Hernlund, J. W., and C. Houser (2008), On the statistical distribution of seismic velocities
 ¹¹³⁵ in Earth's deep mantle, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 265(3-4), 423–437.
- Hinrichsen, B. (2006), Advances in data reduction of high-pressure x-ray powder diffraction
 tion data from two-dimensional detectors: a case study of schafarzikite (FeSb2O4).
- Hinrichsen, B., R. E. Dinnebier, and M. Jansen (2008), Chapter 14 Two-dimensional
 Diffraction Using Area Detectors, in *Powder Diffraction: Theory and Practice*, pp.
- ¹¹⁴⁰ 414–438, The Royal Society of Chemistry.
- Holzapfel, C., D. C. Rubie, D. J. Frost, and F. Langenhorst (2005), Fe-Mg Interdiffusion in
 (Mg,Fe)SiO3 Perovskite and Lower Mantle Reequilibration, *Science*, 309(5741), 1707–
 1710.
- Hsu, H., K. Umemoto, P. Blaha, and R. M. Wentzcovitch (2010a), Spin states and hyperfine interactions of iron in (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite under pressure, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 294 (1-2), 19–26, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2010.02.031.

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

- Hsu, H., K. Umemoto, Z. Wu, and R. M. Wentzcovitch (2010b), Spin-State Crossover of
 Iron in Lower-Mantle Minerals: Results of DFT+U Investigations, *Reviews in Miner- alogy and Geochemistry*, 71(1), 169–199, doi:10.2138/rmg.2010.71.09.
- ¹¹⁵⁰ Hsu, H., K. Umemoto, M. Cococcioni, and R. M. Wentzcovitch (2011), The Hub¹¹⁵¹ bard U correction for iron-bearing minerals: A discussion based on (Mg,Fe)SiO3
 ¹¹⁵² perovskite, *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 185(1-2), 13–19, doi:
 ¹¹⁵³ 10.1016/j.pepi.2010.12.001.
- Iizuka, R., H. Kagi, and K. Komatsu (2010), Comparing ruby fluorescence spectra at high
 pressure in between methanol-ethanol pressure transmitting medium and its deuteride,
 Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 215(1), 012,177–.
- Irifune, T. (1994), Absence of an aluminous phase in the upper part of the Earth's lowermantle, *Nature*, 370(6485), 131–133.
- Irifune, T., T. Shinmei, C. A. McCammon, N. Miyajima, D. C. Rubie, and D. J. Frost
 (2010), Iron Partitioning and Density Changes of Pyrolite in Earth's Lower Mantle, *Science*, 327(5962), 193–195.
- Ishii, M., and J. Tromp (1999), Normal-Mode and Free-Air Gravity Constraints on Lateral
 Variations in Velocity and Density of Earth's Mantle, *Science*, 285(5431), 1231–1236,
 doi:10.1126/science.285.5431.1231.
- Jackson, J. M., J. Zhang, and J. D. Bass (2004), Sound velocities and elasticity of aluminous MgSiO3 perovskite: Implications for aluminum heterogeneity in Earth's lower mantle, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 31(10), L10,614–.
- Jackson, J. M., W. Sturhahn, G. Shen, J. Zhao, M. Y. Hu, D. Errandonea, J. D. Bass, and
 Y. Fei (2005), A synchrotron Mossbauer spectroscopy study of (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

- X 56 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES
- up to 120 GPa, American Mineralogist, 90(1), 199–205.
- Jackson, J. M., W. Sturhahn, O. Tschauner, M. Lerche, and Y. Fei (2009), Behavior of iron in (Mg,Fe)SiO3 post-perovskite assemblages at Mbar pressures, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 36, –.
- Jacobsen, S. D., C. M. Holl, K. A. Adams, R. A. Fischer, E. S. Martin, C. R. Bina, J.-F.
 Lin, V. B. Prakapenka, A. Kubo, and P. Dera (2008), Compression of single-crystal
 magnesium oxide to 118 GPa and a ruby pressure gauge for helium pressure media, *American Mineralogist*, 93(11-12), 1823–1828, doi:10.2138/am.2008.2988.
- 1178 Katsura, T., S. Yokoshi, K. Kawabe, A. Shatskiy, M. A. G. M. Manthilake, S. Zhai,
- H. Fukui, H. A. C. I. Hegoda, T. Yoshino, D. Yamazaki, T. Matsuzaki, A. Yoneda,
- E. Ito, M. Sugita, N. Tomioka, K. Hagiya, A. Nozawa, and K.-i. Funakoshi (2009),
- P-V-T relations of MgSiO3 perovskite determined by in situ X-ray diffraction using a
 large-volume high-pressure apparatus, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 36, -.
- ¹¹⁸³ Kesson, S. E., J. D. Fitz Gerald, and J. M. Shelley (1998), Mineralogy and dynamics of ¹¹⁸⁴ a pyrolite lower mantle, *Nature*, *393*(6682), 252–255.
- ¹¹⁸⁵ Kiefer, B., L. Stixrude, and R. M. Wentzcovitch (2002), Elasticity of (Mg,Fe)SiO3-¹¹⁸⁶ perovskite at high pressures, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 29(11), 34–1–34–4.
- ¹¹⁸⁷ Knittle, E., R. Jeanloz, and G. L. Smith (1986), Thermal expansion of silicate perovskite ¹¹⁸⁸ and stratification of the Earth's mantle.
- Kudoh, Y., C. T. Prewitt, L. W. Finger, A. Darovskikh, and E. Ito (1990), Effect of
 iron on the crystal structure of (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 17(10),
 1481–1484.

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

- Lekic, V., S. Cottaar, A. Dziewonski, and B. Romanowicz (2012), Cluster analysis of global lower mantle tomography: A new class of structure and implications for chemical heterogeneity, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 357-358(0), 68–77.
- Li, B., and J. Zhang (2005), Pressure and temperature dependence of elastic wave velocity
- ¹¹⁹⁶ of MgSiO3 perovskite and the composition of the lower mantle, *Physics of the Earth* ¹¹⁹⁷ and Planetary Interiors, 151(1-2), 143–154.
- Li, J., W. Sturhahn, J. Jackson, V. Struzhkin, J. Lin, J. Zhao, H. Mao, and G. Shen (2006),
- Pressure effect on the electronic structure of iron in (Mg,Fe)(Si,Al)O3 perovskite: a combined synchrotron Mössbauer and X-ray emission spectroscopy study up to 100 GPa, 33(8-9), 575–585–.
- Lu, R., A. M. Hofmeister, and Y. Wang (1994), Thermodynamic properties of ferromagnesium silicate perovskites from vibrational spectroscopy, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 99(B6), 11,795–11,804.
- Lundin, S., K. Catalli, J. Santillán, S.-H. Shim, V. Prakapenka, M. Kunz, and Y. Meng
 (2008), Effect of Fe on the equation of state of mantle silicate perovskite over 1 Mbar,
 Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 168, 97–102.
- Mao, H. K., R. J. Hemley, Y. Fei, J. F. Shu, L. C. Chen, A. P. Jephcoat, Y. Wu, and W. A.
 Bassett (1991), Effect of pressure, temperature, and composition on lattice parameters
 and density of (Fe,Mg)SiO3-perovskites to 30 GPa, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 96(B5), 8069–
 8079.
- ¹²¹² Mao, Z., J. Lin, H. Scott, H. Watson, V. Prakapenka, Y. Xiao, P. Chow, and C. Mc-¹²¹³ Cammon (2011), Iron-rich perovskite in the Earth's lower mantle, *Earth and Planetary* ¹²¹⁴ Science Letters, 309(3-4), 179–184, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.06.030.
 - DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- X 58 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES
- Mattern, E., J. Matas, Y. Ricard, and J. Bass (2005), Lower mantle composition and temperature from mineral physics and thermodynamic modelling, *Geophysical Journal International*, 160(3), 973–990.
- ¹²¹⁸ McCammon, C., I. Kantor, O. Narygina, J. Rouquette, U. Ponkratz, I. Sergueev,
- M. Mezouar, V. Prakapenka, and L. Dubrovinsky (2008), Stable intermediate-spin ferrous iron in lower-mantle perovskite, *Nature Geosci*, 1(10), 684–687.
- McNamara, A. K., and S. Zhong (2005), Thermochemical structures beneath Africa and the Pacific Ocean, *Nature*, 437(7062), 1136–1139.
- Metsue, A., and T. Tsuchiya (2012), Thermodynamic properties of (Mg,Fe2+)SiO3 perovskite at the lower-mantle pressures and temperatures: an internally consistent LSDA+U study, *Geophysical Journal International*, 190(1), 310–322.
- Murakami, M., Y. Ohishi, N. Hirao, and K. Hirose (2012), A perovskitic lower mantle
 inferred from high-pressure, high-temperature sound velocity data, *Nature*, 485 (7396),
 90–94.
- ¹²²⁹ Ni, S., and D. V. Helmberger (2003), Seismological constraints on the South African ¹²³⁰ superplume; could be the oldest distinct structure on earth, *Earth and Planetary Science* ¹²³¹ *Letters*, 206(1-2), 119–131.
- Ni, S., E. Tan, M. Gurnis, and D. Helmberger (2002), Sharp Sides to the African Superplume, *Science*, 296 (5574), 1850–1852.
- ¹²³⁴ O'Keeffe, M., B. Hyde, and J.-O. Bovin (1979), Contribution to the crystal chemistry of ¹²³⁵ orthorhombic perovskites: MgSiO3 and NaMgF3, 4(4), 299–305–.
- Prakapenka, V. B., A. Kubo, A. Kuznetsov, A. Laskin, O. Shkurikhin, P. Dera, M. L.
 Rivers, and S. R. Sutton (2008), Advanced flat top laser heating system for high pressure
 - DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- research at GSECARS: application to the melting behavior of germanium, *High Pressure Research*, 28(3), 225–235, doi:10.1080/08957950802050718.
- Ritsema, J., S. Ni, D. V. Helmberger, and H. P. Crotwell (1998), Evidence for strong shear
 velocity reductions and velocity gradients in the lower mantle beneath Africa, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 25 (23), 4245–4248.
- Rivers, M., V. B. Prakapenka, A. Kubo, C. Pullins, C. M. Holl, and S. D. Jacobsen (2008), The COMPRES/GSECARS gas-loading system for diamond anvil
 cells at the Advanced Photon Source, *High Pressure Research*, 28(3), 273–292, doi:
 10.1080/08957950802333593.
- Ross, N., and R. Hazen (1989), Single crystal X-ray diffraction study of MgSiO3 perovskite
 from 77 to 400 K, 16(5), 415–420–.
- Schuberth, B. S. A., H.-P. Bunge, G. Steinle-Neumann, C. Moder, and J. Oeser (2009), Thermal versus elastic heterogeneity in high-resolution mantle circulation models with pyrolite composition: High plume excess temperatures in the lowermost mantle, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, 10(1), Q01W01–.
- ¹²⁵³ Shen, G., M. L. Rivers, Y. Wang, and S. Sutton (2001), Laser heated diamond cell system ¹²⁵⁴ at the Advanced Photon Source for in situ x-ray measurements at high pressure and ¹²⁵⁵ temperature, *Review of Scientific Instruments*, 72(2), 1273–1282.
- ¹²⁵⁶ Silvera, I. F., A. D. Chijioke, W. J. Nellis, A. Soldatov, and J. Tempere (2007), Calibration ¹²⁵⁷ of the ruby pressure scale to 150 GPa, *physica status solidi* (b), 244(1), 460–467.
- ¹²⁵⁸ Sinmyo, R., E. Bykova, C. McCammon, I. Kupenko, V. Potapkin, and L. Dubrovinsky
 ¹²⁵⁹ (2014), Crystal chemistry of Fe3+-bearing (Mg, Fe)SiO3 perovskite: a single-crystal
 ¹²⁶⁰ X-ray diffraction study, 41(6), 409–417–.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- X 60 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES
- ¹²⁶¹ Sinogeikin, S. V., J. Zhang, and J. D. Bass (2004), Elasticity of single crystal and poly ¹²⁶² crystalline MgSiO3 perovskite by Brillouin spectroscopy, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 31(6),
 ¹²⁶³ L06,620-.
- ¹²⁶⁴ Sivia, D., and J. Skilling (2006), Data analysis: a Bayesian tutorial.
- Steinberger, B., and T. H. Torsvik (2012), A geodynamic model of plumes from the
 margins of Large Low Shear Velocity Provinces, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, 13(1),
 Q01W09–.
- Stixrude, L., and C. Lithgow-Bertelloni (2007), Influence of phase transformations on
 lateral heterogeneity and dynamics in Earth's mantle, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 263(1-2), 45–55.
- Stixrude, L., and C. Lithgow-Bertelloni (2011), Thermodynamics of mantle minerals II.
 Phase equilibria, *Geophysical Journal International*, 184(3), 1180–1213.
- Stixrude, L., R. J. Hemley, Y. Fei, and H. K. Mao (1992), Thermoelasticity of Silicate Perovskite and Magnesiowüstite and Stratification of the Earth's Mantle, *Science*,
 257(5073), 1099–1101.
- Stixrude, L., N. de Koker, N. Sun, M. Mookherjee, and B. B. Karki (2009), Thermodynamics of silicate liquids in the deep Earth, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*,
 278 (3-4), 226–232.
- Sturhahn, W. (2000), CONUSS and PHOENIX: Evaluation of nuclear resonant scattering
 data, 125(1-4), 149–172–.
- Sturhahn, W. (2004), Nuclear resonant spectroscopy, Journal of Physics: Condensed Mat ter, 16(5), S497-.

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

- ¹²⁸³ Sturhahn, W., and J. M. Jackson (2007), Geophysical applications of nuclear resonant ¹²⁸⁴ spectroscopy, *Geological Society of America Special Papers*, 421, 157–174.
- ¹²⁸⁵ Sugahara, M., A. Yoshiasa, Y. Komatsu, T. Yamanaka, N. Bolfan-Casanova, A. Nakat¹²⁸⁶ suka, S. Sasaki, and M. Tanaka (2006), Reinvestigation of the MgSiO3 per¹²⁸⁷ ovskite structure at high pressure, *American Mineralogist*, 91(4), 533–536, doi:
 ¹²⁸⁸ 10.2138/am.2006.1980.
- ¹²⁸⁹ Sun, D., E. Tan, D. Helmberger, and M. Gurnis (2007), Seismological support for the ¹²⁹⁰ metastable superplume model, sharp features, and phase changes within the lower man-¹²⁹¹ tle, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 104 (22), 9151–9155.
- ¹²⁹² Sun, D., D. Helmberger, and M. Gurnis (2010), A narrow, mid-mantle plume below ¹²⁹³ southern Africa, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 37(9), L09,302–.
- Tackley, P. J. (2011), Dynamics and evolution of the deep mantle resulting from thermal, chemical, phase and melting effects, *Earth-Science Reviews*, (0), –, doi: 10.1016/j.earscirev.2011.10.001.
- ¹²⁹⁷ Takemura, K. (2007), Pressure scales and hydrostaticity, *High Pressure Research: An* ¹²⁹⁸ International Journal, 27(4), 465–472.
- Tan, E., and M. Gurnis (2005), Metastable superplumes and mantle compressibility, *Geo- phys. Res. Lett.*, 32, -.
- Tan, E., and M. Gurnis (2007), Compressible thermochemical convection and application
 to lower mantle structures, J. Geophys. Res., 112, -.
- Tange, Y., Y. Nishihara, and T. Tsuchiya (2009a), Unified analyses for P-V-T equation
 of state of MgO: A solution for pressure-scale problems in high P-T experiments, J. *Geophys. Res.*, 114 (B3), B03,208–.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

- X 62 WOLF ET AL.: FE-BRIDGMANITE EOS & MANTLE STRUCTURES
- Tange, Y., E. Takahashi, Y. Nishihara, K.-i. Funakoshi, and N. Sata (2009b), Phase relations in the system MgO-FeO-SiO2 to 50 GPa and 2000°C: An application of experimental techniques using multianvil apparatus with sintered diamond anvils, *J. Geophys.* Res., 114 (B2), B02,214–.
- Tange, Y., Y. Kuwayama, T. Irifune, K.-i. Funakoshi, and Y. Ohishi (2012), P-V-T equation of state of MgSiO3 perovskite based on the MgO pressure scale: A comprehensive reference for mineralogy of the lower mantle, J. Geophys. Res., 117(B6), B06,201–.
- ¹³¹³ Toby, B. (2001), EXPGUI, a graphical user interface for GSAS, *Journal of Applied Crys-*¹³¹⁴ *tallography*, *34*(2), 210–213, doi:10.1107/S0021889801002242.
- Toellner, T. (2000), Monochromatization of synchrotron radiation for nuclear resonant scattering experiments, 125(1-4), 3–28–.
- ¹³¹⁷ Torsvik, T. H., M. A. Smethurst, K. Burke, and B. Steinberger (2006), Large igneous ¹³¹⁸ provinces generated from the margins of the large low-velocity provinces in the deep ¹³¹⁹ mantle, *Geophysical Journal International*, 167(3), 1447–1460.
- Tschauner, O., C. Ma, J. R. Beckett, C. Prescher, V. B. Prakapenka, and G. R. Rossman
 (2014), Discovery of bridgmanite, the most abundant mineral in Earth, in a shocked
 meteorite, *Science*, 346 (6213), 1100–1102.
- Vinet, P., J. Rose, J. Ferrante, and J. Smith (1989), Universal features of the equation of
 state of solids, *Journal of Physics: Condensed Matter*, 1, 1941–1963.
- Vinograd, V. L., and M. H. Sluiter (2006), Thermodynamics of mixing in pyrope-grossular,
 Mg3Al2Si3O12-Ca3Al2Si3O12, solid solution from lattice dynamics calculations and
 Monte Carlo simulations, American Mineralogist, 91(11-12), 1815–1830.

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

- ¹³²⁸ Walter, M., A. Kubo, T. Yoshino, J. Brodholt, K. Koga, and Y. Ohishi (2004), Phase
 ¹³²⁹ relations and equation-of-state of aluminous Mg-silicate perovskite and implications for
- Earth's lower mantle, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 222(2), 501–516.
- ¹³³¹ Wang, Y., D. J. Weidner, R. C. Liebermann, and Y. Zhao (1994), P-V-T equation of state
- ¹³³² of (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite: constraints on composition of the lower mantle, *Physics of* ¹³³³ The Earth and Planetary Interiors, 83(1), 13–40.
- ¹³³⁴ Wentzcovitch, R. M., B. B. Karki, M. Cococcioni, and S. de Gironcoli (2004), Thermoe-
- lastic Properties of MgSiO₃-Perovskite: Insights on the Nature of the Earth's Lower Mantle, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 92(1), 018,501–.
- ¹³³⁷ You Shu-Jie, C. L.-C., and J. Chang-Qing (2009), Hydrostaticity of Pressure Media in ¹³³⁸ Diamond Anvil Cells, *Chinese Physics Letters*, 26(9), 096,202–.
- ¹³³⁹ Zhang, D., J. M. Jackson, W. Sturhahn, and Y. Xiao (2011), Local structure variations
 ¹³⁴⁰ observed in orthoenstatite at high pressures, *American Mineralogist*, 96(10), 1585–1592.
- ¹³⁴¹ Zhang, L., Y. Meng, W. Yang, L. Wang, W. L. Mao, Q.-S. Zeng, J. S. Jeong, A. J.
- ¹³⁴² Wagner, K. A. Mkhoyan, W. Liu, R. Xu, and H.-k. Mao (2014), Disproportionation of
- (Mg,Fe)SiO3 perovskite in Earth's deep lower mantle, *Science*, 344(6186), 877–882.

Autho

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

X - 63

Sample X-ray diffraction patterns from high P-T experiments on 13% Fe-bearing Figure 1. bridgmanite sample, ranging between 33 and 120 GPa (at 300 K), using the Dewaele et al. [2008] Ne pressure scale. Diffraction peaks are color-coded as indicated in the legend, showing the bridgmanite sample (brg), neon (Ne), stishovite and post-stishovite silica phases (SiO_2) , and the rhenium gasket (Re), along with uncertain gold peaks (Au?) and other unknown peaks (?). The upper panel displays 300 K example diffraction patterns, together with a laser-heated high P-T pattern in red, which are dominated by bridgmanite (cyan) and neon (red) peaks, with fitted peak positions indicated by ticks (high-amplitude peaks are truncated for visibility). To the right, the red-bordered panel shows a zoomed view of the bridgmanite-triplet and suggested H-phase region. For the high pressure pattern above ~ 100 GPa, the red X's mark the expected positions of the unobserved H-phase 110 and 101 lines at 0.392 and 0.416 $Å^{-1}$, respectively [Zhang et al., 2014]. The central panel shows an interpolated cold-compression map of all unheated diffraction measurements, using a geometric intensity scale to make both high- and low-amplitude peaks visible. The lower panel displays the best-fit diffraction peak positions, showing the upward evolution of inverse d-spacing with compression for each diffraction line. The detailed panel to the right displays the H-phase and bridgmanite-triplet region, where the proposed H-phase peaks remain unobserved throughout the experiment.

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

Figure 2. Synchrotron Mössbauer spectroscopy time spectrum and associated power-spectrum (inset), collected for 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite sample at $P_{Ne} = 117$ GPa and 300 K. The main panel shows the data as black circles with associated Poisson errorbars. The red solid and dashed lines represent the two best-fit CONUSS models described in the text. The solid line shows the preferred ferrous high-spin 2-site model, and the dashed line introduces an additional low quadrupole splitting site that contains ~5% of the total iron in the high-spin ferric state, though this alternate model is statistically less likely.

Manu

Figure 3. Analysis of previous zero-pressure volume measurements of Al-free bridgmanite as a function of iron content. Error bars indicate uncertainty on diffraction measurements, which clearly under-predict the scatter between the measured samples. We model V_0 as linearly dependent on Fe composition, following *Kudoh et al.* [1990] and *Tange et al.* [2009b], together with an intrinsic scatter to represent the large sample-to-sample variation. The best-fit and 68% confidence intervals are shown in solid and dashed lines, and are used as priors in fitting both Fe-bearing and Fe-free datasets considered in this study.

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

IDa	Р	<i>σ</i>	T	V-	Vee	IDa	Р	<i>σ</i> .	T	V-	Vee	IDa	P	<i>σ</i> .	T	V-	V
112	1	$^{o}\Delta P$	1	^v Pv	Ne	112	1	$^{o}\Delta P$	1	Pv	Ne	112	1	$^{o}\Delta P$	1	Pv	Ne
	[GPa]	[GPa]	[K]	$[A^{O}]$	$[A^{O}]$		[GPa]	[GPa]	[K]	$[A^{O}]$	$[A^{O}]$		[GPa]	[GPa]	[K]	$[A^{O}]$	$[A^{O}]$
4	00.15	0.05	200	140 50(04)	94 505(50)		49.00	1.07	1500(100)	140.05(40)	94 495 (96)		100.04	1.00	1010(100)	100.00(00)	00.074(00)
1	33.15	0.65	300	146.59(24)	34.707(58)	2	43.88	1.27	1700(100)	146.35(48)	34.435(86)	2	102.34	1.60	1810(100)	128.90(30)	26.874(68)
1	33.88	0.58	300	145.81(21)	34.524(58)	2	44.32	1.32	1755(100)	146.38(50)	34.423(86)	2	102.51	1.76	1850(100)	128.95(34)	26.885(68)
1	37.95	0.84	300	144.97(30)	33.580(57)	2	49.71	1.85	1652(100)	142.58(63)	33.088(83)	2	102.65	1.47	1890(100)	128.94(27)	26.898(68)
1	39.50	0.86	300	144.32(30)	33.252(56)	2	48.88	1.84	1720(100)	142.49(62)	33.354(84)	2	102.88	1.44	1932(100)	128.93(26)	26.905(68)
1	41.91	0.42	300	142.88(11)	32.771(55)	2	50.43	1.73	1790(100)	142.63(58)	33.141(83)	2	113.71	2.28	1835(100)	126.27(42)	26.068(66)
1	44.58	0.68	300	142.23(21)	32.273(54)	2	49.40	1.58	1750(100)	142.64(53)	33.291(84)	2	112.72	1.26	1695(100)	126.34(16)	26.061(66)
1	46.85	0.73	300	141.49(22)	31.877(54)	2	49.46	1.61	1665(100)	142.69(54)	33.155(83)	2	113.24	1.78	1738(100)	126.52(31)	26.049(65)
1	49.21	0.92	300	140.53(28)	31.488(53)	2	50.83	1.28	1750(100)	143.50(43)	33.004(83)	2	112.47	1.70	1655(100)	126.56(29)	26.057(65)
1	51.39	0.73	300	139.52(20)	31.146(52)	2	54.21	0.77	1924(100)	142.52(22)	32.599(82)	2	112.70	2.17	1610(100)	126.45(40)	26.018(65)
1	55.20	1.39	300	138.53(41)	30.591(51)	2	61.32	1.40	1652(100)	140.14(42)	31.093(78)	2	112.83	1.75	1640(100)	126.53(30)	26.025(65)
1	56.22	0.90	300	138.40(25)	30.449(51)	2	62.38	1.51	1780(100)	140.21(46)	31.074(78)	2	113.35	1.69	1715(100)	126.56(29)	26.029(65)
1	59.22	1.03	300	137.40(28)	30.051(51)	2	64.86	2.39	1875(100)	139.70(74)	30.815(77)	2	113.67	1.74	1758(100)	126.56(30)	26.030(65)
1	61.07	1.19	300	137.14(33)	29.817(50)	2	62.20	1.37	1916(100)	139.20(40)	31.251(78)	2	112.90	1.49	1600(100)	126.26(23)	25.999(65)
1	63.17	0.82	300	136.23(20)	29.560(50)	2	63.78	1.46	2065(100)	139.24(43)	31,176(78)	2	113.51	1.81	1685(100)	126.47(32)	26.003(65)
1	64 21	0.88	300	136.06(22)	29.437(49)	2	71.07	1.65	1845(100)	136 88(45)	29.955(75)	2	114 61	1 49	1832(100)	126.45(23)	26.006(65)
1	66.38	0.81	300	135.48(19)	20.107(10)	2	71.16	1 71	1922(100)	136.93(47)	30.015(75)	2	114 66	1 44	1852(100)	126.10(20) 126.54(22)	26.014(65)
1	67.99	0.80	200	125.40(19)	20.020(40)	2	71.66	1.50	2000(100)	136.00(41)	20.025(75)	2	114.00	1.44	1872(100)	126.54(22) 126.54(22)	26.014(00)
1	70.94	1.09	200	133.01(13) 124.08(24)	29.020(49)	2	71.51	1.50	2000(100) 2085(100)	130.90(40) 127.20(42)	30.023(73) 20.124(76)	2	114.91	2.20	1875(100) 1825(100)	120.34(33) 126.24(42)	26.000(65)
1	72.02	1.02	300	134.08(24) 132.28(26)	28.702(48)	2	71.31	1.30	1862(100)	137.29(42) 136.69(34)	30.124(70) 30.988(75)	2	119.00	2.30	1325(100)	120.34(43) 196 E8(98)	20.000(03)
1	73.92	1.11	300	133.38(20)	20.300(40)	2	71.73	1.34	1072(100)	130.03(34)	29.000(75)	2	118.03	1.09	2275(100)	120.38(28)	25.970(05)
1	73.39	0.94	300	133.72(21)	28.441(48)	2	72.18	1.36	1972(100)	136.60(35)	29.934(75)	2	117.69	1.77	2095(100)	126.61(31)	25.939(65)
1	74.57	0.79	300	133.07(16)	28.325(48)	2	72.95	1.33	2015(100)	136.68(34)	29.878(75)	2	123.71	2.03	2141(100)	124.77(34)	25.578(64)
1	74.95	0.96	300	133.17(21)	28.287(48)	2	84.70	1.01	2155(100)	133.71(38)	28.668(72)	2	120.30	1.39	1990(100)	125.39(19)	25.717(65)
1	76.94	0.94	300	132.38(20)	28.095(47)	2	83.17	1.67	1940(100)	133.63(39)	28.664(72)	2	119.76	1.44	1920(100)	125.40(20)	25.716(65)
1	79.58	1.17	300	131.90(26)	27.849(47)	2	84.01	1.29	1945(100)	133.80(28)	28.582(72)	2	119.65	1.38	1890(100)	125.40(19)	25.708(65)
1	81.59	1.01	300	131.26(21)	27.668(47)	2	84.64	1.28	1975(100)	133.79(28)	28.542(72)	2	120.48	1.40	2020(100)	125.42(19)	25.720(65)
1	85.09	1.04	300	130.65(21)	27.365(46)	2	85.84	1.24	2125(100)	133.92(27)	28.535(72)	2	121.20	1.41	2175(100)	125.41(20)	25.752(65)
1	86.34	0.97	300	130.44(19)	27.261(46)	2	87.81	1.24	2375(100)	133.96(27)	28.527(72)	2	121.55	1.39	2228(100)	125.42(19)	25.756(65)
1	86.64	1.35	300	130.22(29)	27.236(46)	2	84.19	1.28	1840(100)	133.81(28)	28.484(72)	2	121.48	1.39	2240(100)	125.40(19)	25.767(65)
1	87.62	0.98	300	130.39(19)	27.156(46)	2	83.70	1.23	1755(100)	133.86(26)	28.469(72)	2	126.59	2.37	2045(100)	124.05(40)	25.356(64)
1	88.87	1.07	300	129.88(21)	27.054(45)	2	84.00	1.31	1780(100)	133.91(29)	28.458(72)	2	126.34	2.58	2025(100)	124.42(45)	25.361(64)
1	90.14	1.38	300	129.25(28)	26.953(45)	2	83.53	0.96	1715(100)	133.56(17)	28.456(72)	2	125.71	2.58	1970(100)	123.98(45)	25.373(64)
1	92.68	1.00	300	128.59(18)	26.756(45)	2	84.12	1.36	1740(100)	133.71(30)	28.416(71)	2	121.37	1.98	1740(100)	124.96(33)	25.526(64)
1	93.20	1.11	300	128.68(21)	26.717(45)	2	84.12	1.57	1735(100)	133.75(37)	28.412(71)	2	122.26	2.14	1895(100)	124.55(36)	25.547(64)
1	95.41	1.17	300	128.33(22)	26.551(45)	2	84.59	1.32	1800(100)	133.84(29)	28.414(71)	2	122.61	2.33	1975(100)	124.33(40)	25.564(64)
1	96.95	0.99	300	127.91(17)	26.439(44)	2	85.02	1.35	1900(100)	133.82(30)	28.447(72)	2	123.11	1.65	2060(100)	124.94(25)	25.575(64)
1	98.72	1.54	300	127.56(30)	26.312(44)	2	85.91	1.36	2008(100)	133.89(30)	28.439(71)	2	123.63	1.77	2145(100)	125.14(28)	25.584(64)
1	103.54	1.61	300	125.99(30)	25.980(44)	2	95.37	1.74	1685(100)	130.59(36)	27.356(69)	2	123.63	2.43	2155(100)	125.23(44)	25.589(64)
1	104.68	1.12	300	126.31(19)	25.904(44)	2	94.28	1.92	1548(100)	130.63(41)	27.359(69)	2	123.96	1.75	2225(100)	125.22(28)	25.603(64)
1	106.09	1.26	300	126.37(22)	25.811(43)	2	95.61	1.57	1678(100)	130.74(32)	27.332(69)	2	124.14	2.86	2262(100)	124.54(52)	25.610(64)
1	109.67	2.10	300	125.12(39)	25.582(43)	2	94.38	1.65	1635(100)	130.21(34)	27.407(69)	2	123.80	2.19	2240(100)	124.55(37)	25.621(64)
1	111.20	1.31	300	124.55(22)	25.487(43)	2	95.31	1.68	1792(100)	130.25(34)	27.430(69)	2	126.03	2.30	2340(100)	124.82(40)	25.532(64)
1	111.03	0.96	300	125.39(13)	25.498(43)	2	95.55	1.58	1846(100)	130.36(32)	27.445(69)	2	122.33	2.62	1944(140)	124.52(47)	25.567(64)
1	112.88	1.33	300	124.61(22)	25.385(43)	2	95.85	1.94	1895(100)	130.24(41)	27.451(69)	2	121.06	2.29	1815(100)	124.63(40)	25.582(64)
1	114.60	2.02	300	123.89(36)	25.282(43)	2	96.14	2.01	1935(100)	130.47(43)	27.453(69)	2	120.89	4.20	1840(100)	124.19(78)	25.605(64)
1	108.59	1.97	300	124.91(36)	25.651(43)	2	96.70	1.79	2030(100)	130.69(38)	27.467(69)	2	128.72	1.78	1865(100)	122.98(26)	25.147(63)
1	113.88	1.79	300	124.96(32)	25.325(43)	2	103.11	1.45	1825(100)	128.73(26)	26.824(67)	2	129.18	2.21	1895(100)	124.32(37)	25.135(63)
1	116.98	1.78	300	124.19(31)	25.142(42)	2	102.52	1.53	1750(100)	128.70(28) 128.70(28)	26.825(67)	2	130.08	3.36	1995(100)	124.89(62)	25.129(63)
1	120.09	2.08	300	122.42(35)	24 964(42)	2	102.30	1.36	1765(100)	128 99(23)	26.850(67)	2	130 73	2.54	1980(100)	124 90(45)	25 084(63)
1	117 19	1.30	300	124.52(33)	25.130(42)	2	102.47	1.50	1805(100)	128 92(30)	26.861(68)	2	127.35	1 46	2180(100)	124 60(19)	25.004(03) 25.375(64)
-	111.13	1.00	300	124.02(21)	20.100(42)		104.41	1.09	1000(100)	120.02(00)	20.001(00)	2	127.72	1.40	2268(100)	124.68(26)	25.394(64)
												2	128 35	1.09	2268(100)	124.00(20)	25.354(04)
												2	128.00	1.79	2306(100) 2415(100)	124.03(20)	25.404(04)
												2	128.02	1.71	2410(100) 2455(100)	124.70(20)	25.410(04)
												2	120.07	1.79	1005(100)	124.00(20)	25.420(04)
												2	132.27	2.58	1995(100)	124.01(40)	25.004(63)
		-				1						2	132.70	3.76	∠002(100)	124.09(70)	⊿0.010(63)

 Table 1.
 P-V-T Data for 13% Fe-bearing Bridgmanite

Uncertainties are provided as appropriate for each quantity in parentheses (giving error in

trailing digits).

These data are split into measurement groups with distinct measurement uncertainty charac-

teristics, indicated by their ID value.

Temperature uncertainties are empirically estimated to be ~100 K (except for one datum at ~122 GPa, where the downstream measurement was unavailable, increasing error by $\sqrt{2}$).

• ID Key for DAC measurements: (1 = 300 K, 2 = Laser-Heated)

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

X - 67

 Table 2.
 P-V-T Data for Fe-free Bridgmanite (Reanalyzed from Tange et al. [2012])

ID ^a	P	$\sigma_{\Delta P}$	T	$V_{\rm Pv}$	$V_{\rm MgO}$	ID^{a}	P	$\sigma_{\Delta P}$	T	V_{Pv}	$V_{\rm MgO}$
	[GPa]	[GPa]	[K]	$[\mathring{A}^3]$	$[\mathring{A}^{\breve{3}}]$		[GPa]	[GPa]	[K]	$[\mathring{A}^3]$	$[\mathring{A}^3]$
1	30.43	0.17	1300	150.260(74)	66.4150(74)	3	59.98	0.21	1500(20)	139.930(22)	60.6300(329)
1	30.22	0.22	1100	149.630(94)	66.1360(67)	2	53.80	0.27	300	139.410(31)	60.3700(414)
1	29.67	0.23	900	149.130(94)	65.9500(47)	3	60.81	0.33	1980(30)	140.900(22)	61.0600(548)
1	28.97	0.25	700	148.770(100)	65.8100(134)	2	51.71	0.33	300	140.110(41)	60.7200(517)
1	28.68	0.17	500	148.420(67)	65.5860(74)	3	68.94	0.13	1500(20)	137.230(22)	59.2080(164)
1	27.96	0.10	300	148.260(40)	65.5060(13)	2	60.63	0.16	300	137.320(41)	59.2810(114)
1	42.82	0.16	1500	145.920(47)	63.8500(201)	3	93.64	0.46	1500(20)	131.150(99)	55.9200(219)
1	42.14	0.14	1300	145.600(47)	63.7100(134)	3	86.15	0.19	1900(30)	133.408(21)	57.2100(219)
1	41.37	0.41	1100	145.170(53)	63.5910(802)	3	83.92	0.19	1500(20)	133.270(22)	57.1200(219)
1	41.02	0.13	900	144.830(40)	63.3900(134)	2	76.10	1.59	300	133.280(31)	57.1000(2068)
1	40.33	0.15	700	144.500(53)	63.2660(74)	3	108.51	0.27	1870(60)	128.140(55)	54.5680(88)
1	39.67	0.14	500	144.280(47)	63.1510(74)	3	106.07	0.21	1550(50)	128.140(44)	54.5690(44)
1	39.02	0.18	300	144.140(53)	63.0700(201)	2	97.74	0.28	300	128.100(52)	54.5450(145)
1	52.30	0.12	1500	142.420(33)	61.9800(134)	3	104.21	0.16	2430(60)	130.040(33)	55.5050(77)
1	51.73	0.16	1300	142.130(47)	61.8310(127)	2	88.84	0.20	300	130.140(31)	55.5370(165)
1	51.14	0.16	1100	141.770(47)	61.6900(134)						
1	50.63	0.18	900	141.460(53)	61.5400(134)						
1	50.15	0.22	700	141.190(53)	61.3900(267)						
1	49.42	0.21	500	140.970(47)	61.3000(267)						
1	48.72	0.15	300	140.820(33)	61.2400(201)						
1	62.22	0.25	1500	139.330(74)	60.2600(134)						
1	62.56	-0.27	1300	138.790(74)	59.9800(201)						
1	62.43	0.32	1100	138.450(60)	59.7800(401)						
1	61.82	0.36	900	138.130(87)	59.6600(334)						
1	61.51	0.49	700	137.800(127)	59.5000(334)						
1	60.91	0.45	500	137.570(114)	59.4000(334)						
1	60.58	0.43	300	137.380(107)	59.2900(334)						

Uncertainties are provided as appropriate for each quantity in parentheses (giving error in

trailing digits).

These data are split into measurement groups with distinct measurement uncertainty charac-

teristics, indicated by their ID value.

 $^{\rm a}$ ID Key for measurements: (1= Sintered Diamond Multi-Anvil, 2= 300 K DAC, 3=Laser-Heated DAC)

Au

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

$X_{\rm Fe}$	13% Fe ^a	0% Fe ^b
V_0 [Å ³]	163.16(19)	162.12(13)
K_{0T} [GPa]	243.8(43)	262.3(32)
K'_{0T}	4.160(110)	4.044(75)
Θ_0 [K]	1000	1000
γ_0	1.400(110)	1.675(45)
q	0.56(37)	1.39(16)

Table 3. Vinet and Mie-Grüneisen-Debye Equation of State Parameters for Bridgmanite

We fix the zero-pressure Debye temperature to the value $\Theta_0 = 1000$ K, consistent with the best-fit value for the Fe-free dataset (see text for details).

Priors: $\gamma_0 = 1 \pm 1$, $q = 1 \pm 1$, and $V_0 = 163.2 \pm 0.2$ and 162.5 ± 0.2 Å³, for 13% and 0% Fe bridgmanite samples.

Error estimates give a 68% confidence interval.

- ^a data from this work—uses Neon pressure scale from *Dewaele et al.* [2008]
- ^b data reanalyzed from *Tange et al.* [2012]—uses MgO pressure scale from *Tange et al.* [2009a]

Figure 4. Fitted high P-T equations of state for 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite and Fe-free bridgmanite shown in the upper and lower panels, respectively. The data are shown color-coded by temperature, with the reduced isothermal data shown with open circles comparing well to the dark blue 300 K isotherms, and the corresponding measured data represented by crosses. The data for the Fe-free MgSiO₃ sample is from *Tange et al.* [2012], but has been reanalyzed using **pvt-tool** to incorporate our new adjusted error model. The inset panels each show a histogram of the normalized pressure residuals, $(P_{mod} - P_{obs})/\sigma_P$, where the unheated and heated contributions are separately shown in blue and red, respectively, together with the total histogram in black. These residuals all compare favorably with a standard normal distribution, shown by the gray line, reflecting the effectiveness of our error-modeling approach.

DRAFT September 28, 2015, 3:20pm DRAFT

		$X_{\rm Fe}$ =	= 13% ^a	,	
	V_0	K_{0T}	K'_{0T}	γ_0	q
V_0	+1.00	-0.85	+0.62	+0.03	+0.03
K_{0T}	-0.85	+1.00	-0.93	-0.32	-0.32
K'_{0T}	+0.62	-0.93	+1.00	+0.48	+0.50
γ_0	+0.03	-0.32	+0.48	+1.00	+0.97
q	+0.03	-0.32	+0.50	+0.97	+1.00
		$X_{\rm Fe}$	= 0% b		
	V_0	$\begin{array}{c} X_{\rm Fe} \\ K_{0T} \end{array}$	$= 0\%^{\rm b} K'_{0T}$	γ_0	q
$\overline{V_0}$	$V_0 + 1.00$	$\begin{array}{c} X_{\rm Fe} \\ K_{0T} \\ -0.96 \end{array}$	$= 0\%^{\text{b}}$ K'_{0T} +0.85	γ_0 -0.12	$\frac{q}{-0.16}$
$\frac{1}{V_0}$ K_{0T}	V_0 +1.00 -0.96	$X_{\rm Fe} \ K_{0T} \ -0.96 \ +1.00$	$ = 0\%^{b} \\ $	$\gamma_0 -0.12 -0.07$	q = -0.16 -0.02
$\overline{\begin{matrix} V_0 \\ K_{0T} \\ K'_{0T} \end{matrix}}$	V_0 +1.00 -0.96 +0.85	$X_{\rm Fe} \ K_{0T} \ -0.96 \ +1.00 \ -0.96$	$= 0\%^{b} K'_{0T} + 0.85 - 0.96 + 1.00$	$\gamma_0 -0.12 -0.07 +0.27$	q = -0.16 -0.02 +0.24
$\begin{matrix} V_0 \\ K_{0T} \\ K'_{0T} \\ \gamma_0 \end{matrix}$	V_0 +1.00 -0.96 +0.85 -0.12	$\begin{array}{c} X_{\rm Fe} \\ K_{0T} \\ -0.96 \\ +1.00 \\ -0.96 \\ -0.07 \end{array}$	$= 0\%^{b} \frac{K'_{0T}}{K'_{0T}}$ $+ 0.85$ $- 0.96$ $+ 1.00$ $+ 0.27$	γ_0 -0.12 -0.07 +0.27 +1.00	q = -0.16 -0.02 +0.24 +0.95

 Table 4.
 Equation of State Parameter Correlations

The correlation matrix ρ is a convenient scaled form of the covariance matrix Σ , where the correlation coefficient between parameters *i* and *j* is simply: $\rho_{ij} = \frac{\Sigma_{ij}}{\sqrt{\Sigma_{ii}\Sigma_{jj}}}$.

a, b: See footnote to Table 3.



Figure 5. Normalized axial ratios and octahedral tilt angles are shown in the upper and lower panels for the 0% and 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite samples. The 13% Fe sample measured in this study is plotted in red crosses while the Fe-free data from *Tange et al.* [2012] is shown in black circles. Best-fit linear trends are displayed as solid lines, and reflect the systematic effect of adding iron on bridgmanite's crystal geometry.

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

Figure 6. Covariance between the primary *cold* parameters (at 300 K) (K_{0T} , K'_{0T}), defining the room temperature isotherm, and the *thermal* parameters (γ_0 , q), are shown in panels (a) and (b), respectively. These ellipses represent the 68% confidence regions for the 13% Fe-bearing bridgmanite sample in red and the Fe-free sample in black. Also shown in black crosses are the originally reported best-fit Fe-free values from *Tange et al.* [2012]. These parameter values are generally inconsistent with our analysis due to important differences in the fitting procedure, including the use of a prior on V_0 in place of fixing its value, in addition to our adjustment of the estimated observational errors to ensure consistency with the model residuals.

Figure 7. The derived equation of state models for 13% Fe-bearing and Fe-free bridgmanite are used to sample the 68% confidence bounds for a set of high P-T profiles relevant to the Earth's manue. The Fe-bearing and Fe-free bridgmanite samples are represented using red and gray shaded regions, respectively. The upper panel shows the evolution of volume for a set of isothermal profiles, clearly depicting the reduced thermal expansion properties of Fe-bearing bridgmanite. The lower panel shows the density and adiabatic bulk modulus anomalies (relative to PREM) for a bridgmanite-only lower mantle; geotherm composed of a representative 1873 K mantle adiabat (defined at 670 km, *Brown and Shankland* 1981) and a thermal boundary layer rising to a CMB temperature of 4000 K. Despite the large differences in thermal properties, the adiabatic bulk moduli of these two compositions are quite similar, and are nearly indistinguishable throughout the bottom half of the lower mantle.

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

Р T K_S $C_V/(3Nk_B)$ α γ ρ [g/cc][] [K][GPa] [1e-5/K][GPa] 1873(1873)4.47(4.29)318.2(325.1)2.38(2.76)1.36(1.58)0.9838(0.9839)23.81891(1893)4.50(4.32)326.6(333.2)1.36(1.57)0.9838(0.9839)26.12.33(2.68)28.4 1908 (1913) 4.53(4.34)2.27(2.60)334.9(341.3)1.35(1.55)0.9838(0.9839)30.6 1925 (1932)4.56(4.37)343.2(349.3)2.22(2.53)1.35(1.54)0.9838(0.9839) $32.9 \ 1942 \ (1951)$ 4.59(4.40)351.4(357.2)2.18(2.46)1.34(1.52)0.9838(0.9839)1959(1970)35.14.62(4.43)359.6(365.1)2.13(2.40)1.34(1.51)0.9838(0.9839)37.4 1975 (1988) 4.65(4.46)367.7(373.0)2.09(2.34)1.33(1.50)0.9838(0.9839)39.7 1991 (2006) 4.68(4.48)375.8(380.8)2.05(2.28)1.33(1.49)0.9838(0.9839)41.9 2006 (2023) 4.71(4.51)383.8(388.5)2.01(2.23)1.32(1.47)0.9838(0.9839)44.2 2022 (2040) 4.74(4.54)1.97(2.18)1.32(1.46)391.8(396.3)0.9838(0.9839)46.52037(2057)4.76(4.56)399.7(404.0)1.94(2.13)1.32(1.45)0.9838(0.9839)48.7 2052 (2074) 4.79 (4.59) 407.6 (411.6) 1.90(2.08)1.31(1.44)0.9838(0.9839)51.02067 (2090) 4.82 (4.61)415.4 (419.2) 1.87(2.04)1.31(1.43)0.9838(0.9839) $53.2 \ 2081 \ (2106) \ 4.84 \ (4.64)$ 423.2 (426.8) 1.84(2.00)1.30(1.42)0.9838(0.9839)55.52095(2121) 4.87(4.66)431.0(434.3)1.81(1.95)1.30(1.41)0.9838(0.9839) $57.8 \ 2109 \ (2137) \ 4.89 \ (4.69)$ 438.7(441.8)1.78(1.91)1.30(1.40)0.9838(0.9839)60.0 2123 (2152) 4.92(4.71)446.4 (449.3) 1.75(1.88)1.29(1.39)0.9838(0.9839)62.3 2137(2167)4.94(4.73)454.0(456.8)1.72(1.84)1.29(1.38)0.9838(0.9839)64.5 2150 (2181) 4.97(4.76)461.6(464.2)1.70(1.81)1.28(1.37)0.9838(0.9839)66.8 2164 (2196) 4.99(4.78)469.2 (471.6) 1.67(1.77)1.28(1.36)0.9838(0.9839) $69.1 \ 2177 \ (2210) \ 5.02 \ (4.80)$ 476.8 (478.9) 0.9838(0.9839)1.65(1.74)1.28(1.35)71.3 2190 (2224) 5.04(4.82)484.3 (486.3) 1.63(1.71)1.27(1.34)0.9838(0.9839)73.6 2203 (2237) 5.06(4.85)491.8 (493.6) 1.61(1.68)1.27(1.33)0.9838(0.9839)75.9 2216 (2251) 5.09(4.87)499.2(500.8)1.58(1.65)1.27(1.32)0.9838(0.9839)78.1 2228 (2264) 5.11(4.89)506.7(508.1)1.56(1.62)1.26(1.32)0.9838(0.9839)80.4 2241 (2277) 5.13(4.91)514.1(515.3)1.54(1.60)1.26(1.31)0.9838(0.9839)82.6 2253 (2290) 5.15(4.93)521.4(522.5)1.52(1.57)1.26(1.30)0.9838(0.9839)84.9 2265 (2303) 5.18(4.96)1.26(1.29)528.8(529.7)1.50(1.55)0.9838(0.9839)87.2 2277(2316)5.20(4.98)536.1(536.8)1.49(1.52)1.25(1.29)0.9838(0.9839)2289(2328)1.25(1.28)89.4 5.22(5.00)543.4(544.0)1.47(1.50)0.9838(0.9839)2301 (2340) 5.24(5.02)550.7(551.1)1.45(1.48)1.25(1.27)0.9838(0.9839)91.794.0 2312 (2352) 5.26(5.04)557.9 (558.2) 1.43(1.45)1.24(1.26)0.9838(0.9839) $96.2 \quad 2324 \quad (2364)$ 5.28(5.06)565.2(565.2)1.42(1.43)1.24(1.26)0.9838(0.9839)97.3 2329 (2370) 5.29(5.07)568.8(568.7)1.41(1.42)1.24(1.25)0.9838(0.9839)99.6 2341 (2382) 5.32(5.09)575.9(575.8)1.39(1.40)1.24(1.25)0.9838(0.9839) $101.9 \ 2352 \ (2393)$ 5.34(5.11)583.1(582.8)1.38(1.38)1.23(1.24)0.9838(0.9839) $104.1 \quad 2363 \quad (2405)$ 5.36(5.13)590.3(589.8)1.36(1.36)1.23(1.23)0.9838(0.9839)106.4 2375 (2417) 5.38(5.15)0.9838(0.9839)597.4(596.7)1.35(1.34)1.23(1.23) $108.7 \ 2387 \ (2429)$ 5.40(5.17)604.5(603.7)1.34(1.33)1.23(1.22)0.9838(0.9839)110.9 2401 (2443) 5.42(5.19)1.32(1.31) 1.22(1.21)611.5(610.6)0.9838(0.9839)113.2 2418 (2460) 5.44(5.21)618.5(617.4)1.31(1.29) 1.22(1.21)0.9839(0.9840)0.9841 (0.9842) $115.4 \ 2442 \ (2483)$ 5.46(5.22)625.4(624.0)1.30(1.28) 1.22(1.20) $117.7 \ 2477 \ (2518)$ 5.47(5.24)632.1 (630.5) 1.29 (1.26) 1.22 (1.20)0.9844(0.9845) $120.0\ 2531\ (2571)$ 5.49(5.26)638.6 (636.6) 1.28 (1.25) 1.22 (1.19)0.9850(0.9850) $122.2 \ 2612 \ (2650) \ 5.50 \ (5.27)$ 644.8 (642.2) 1.27 (1.24) 1.21 (1.19)0.9858(0.9858)D1B445 F2731 (2766) 5.52 (5.28) S650 em 6647.28, 12001 \$1,23) 20 p21 (1.18) 0.9869 (0.9869) R A F T 126.8 2896 (2926) 5.53(5.29)655.6(651.4) 1.26(1.23) 1.21(1.18) 0.9883(0.9882) $129.0 \quad 3111 \quad (3136) \quad 5.53 \quad (5.30)$ 660.2 (654.7) 1.25 (1.23) 1.21 (1.18) 0.9898 (0.9897) $131.3 \ 3375 \ (3392) \ 5.53 \ (5.30)$ 664.2 (657.1) 1.25 (1.23) 1.21 (1.18) 0.9914 (0.9912) $133.5 \ 3677 \ (3686) \ 5.53 \ (5.30) \ 667.8 \ (658.9) \ 1.25 \ (1.23) \ 1.21 \ (1.18) \ 0.9927 \ (0.9925)$

Table 5. Geothermal Profiles for 13%-Fe (Fe-free) Bridgmanite

Computed from equation of state parameters in Table 3 using Brown and Shankland [1981]

135.8 4000 (4000) article is protected by 0 copyright (1A2B) ights 1 reserved 0.9938 (0.9936)

An ideal mixture model is used to sample the behavior of bridgmanite under a Figure 8. range of temperatures and compositions, corresponding to potential conditions for a bridgmanitedominated lower-mantle region. Panel (a) depicts the nominal bulk mantle geotherm (in gray) with a potentially elevated thermal profile through a bridgmanite-dominate region (in red). The lower-mantle geotherm corresponds to the 1873 K mantle adiabat (at 670 km) from Brown and Shankland [1981] (gray dashed-line) combined with an additional thermal boundary layer up to the nominal CMB temperature of 4000 K. We consider elevated bridgmanite thermal profiles with excess temperatures of ΔT_{ex} above the reference adiabat (defined at 120 GPa), overlying an additional thermal boundary layer reaching the nominal core temperature. In Panel (b), a range of ΔT_{ex} and Fe-composition values are explored, where the behavior of bridgmanite is calculated from our ideal mixing model, and the results are mapped as percentage anomalies relative to PREM at 120 GPa, with density anomalies in solid contours and adiabatic bulk modulus anomalies in dashed contours. Bridgmanite's bulk modulus just outside the thermal boundary layer tends to be about 1% to 3% higher than the average mantle, while the density contrast depends strongly on composition. The zero-difference contours (in gray) never intersect, indicating that no combination of temperature and composition for pure bridgmanite is capable of reproducing average mantle properties.

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT
Figure 9. Thermo-chemical pile hypotheses for bridgmanite-dominated LLSVPs are explored using our ideal mixing model. Panel (a) shows pile density anomalies (relative to PREM) assuming a nominal excess temperature of 900 K, using the adiabat plus thermal boundary layer construction of Figure 8. By considering a range of Fe-contents, we see a systematic shift in relative buoyancy changing from a dense stable layer above 13% Fe, that is everywhere denser except in the thermal boundary layer, through a neutrally-buoyant structure at 12% Fe with a density crossover near ~ 70 GPa, to a fully unstable transient layer below 11% Fe. Panel (b) applies this relative buoyancy calculation for the plausible range of LLSVP temperatures [Tackley, 2011], to map out the different buoyancy regimes: The metastable dome region (shown in the narrow pink wedge) is defined by density crossover depths yielding 600 to 1200 km tall structures above the CMB, consistent with the observed LLSVPs; stable passive piles (to the right of the gray line) require dynamic stresses to lift these otherwise flat dense layers off the CMB; while dynamically unstable structures (shaded in green) readily escape through convection, erasing the chemically distinct reservoir. The probability of the metastable dome and stable passive pile hypotheses for LLSVPs is determined by the relative area of those regions that falls within plausible density anomaly limits [e.g. Ishii and Tromp, 1999], shown in solid colored contours. This metastable dome probability is only $\mathcal{P}\sim 4\%$ if allowing up to 3% density anomalies, and rises to $\mathcal{P}\sim 7\%$ if restricted to 1.5% density anomalies.

DRAFT

September 28, 2015, 3:20pm

DRAFT

















