

CHRONIC RESPIRATORY DISEASE IN MINING COMMUNITIES *

Ian T. T. Higgins

*Department of Epidemiology, School of Public Health
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104*

INTRODUCTION

The role of coal mine dust exposure in the development of chronic respiratory disease and disability among miners needs to be accurately assessed if we are to practice wisely, set sound dust standards, or compensate justly. In the present paper, the community studies bearing on this problem with which I have been associated during the past two decades will be reviewed. Between 1953 and 1963, surveys were carried out in communities in England and Wales by the British Medical Research Council's Pneumoconiosis and Epidemiological Research Units. More recently, I have conducted similar studies in communities in Marion County, West Virginia, under contract with the Bureau of Occupational Health. The community approach was adopted because we realized that patients in hospital, miners applying for compensation, and working miners constitute selected groups. Only by studying the whole geographically defined community or a representative sample of it could this selectivity be avoided. The community approach facilitates the study of exminers as well as working miners. It also provides the investigator with perhaps the most appropriate group for comparison, namely, men who have lived in the same area but who have never worked in mining.

The Communities

The communities differed considerably in respect to air pollution. Leigh, the most densely populated, was also the most polluted. Staveley was moderately polluted, and the Rhondda, less so. The towns in Marion County, West Virginia, are situated in rural surroundings and are very much less polluted than the British communities. Other characteristics of the communities are shown in TABLE 1.

* Supported in part by United States Public Health Service Contract P.H. 86-64-89 from the Division of Occupational Health, Grant No. O.H. 00243-01 from the American Medical Association's Education and Research Foundation Committee for Research on Tobacco and Health, a grant from the Michigan Tuberculosis and Respiratory Disease Association, and an Institutional grant from the University of Michigan.

TABLE I
SALIENT FEATURES OF THE MINING COMMUNITY STUDIES REVIEWED

| Country | Area | Year Studied | Population (Approximate) | Main Occupations | Sample Size * | Age Groups | Miscellaneous |
|---------|---|--------------|--------------------------|---|---------------|----------------|-----------------------------------|
| England | Leigh (Lancashire) | 1954 | 48,000 | Mining Cotton | 245 | 55-64 | Men |
| | Staveley (Derbyshire) | 1957 | 18,000 | Mining Foundry Chemicals Railway | 776 | 25-34 55-64 | Men Wives of Men aged 55-64 |
| | Staveley (Derbyshire) | 1966 | 18,000 | Mining Foundry Chemicals Railway | 990 | 25-74 | Men |
| Wales | Rhondda (Glamorgan) | 1959 | 30,000 | Mining | 600 200 | 35-64 55-64 | Men Women |
| | 3 Towns in Marion County, West Virginia | 1964/5 | 4,000 | Mining | 1173 | 20-69 | White Males Women |

* In Leigh the sample was drawn from the register of electors. In all the other communities a census was carried out and the samples were drawn from information obtained at the census. In Marion County, all men aged 20-69 were seen. Response rates have varied from 84 to 92%.

METHODS AND PROCEDURE

Similar methods have been used in each survey. They are summarized as follows:

1. questionnaire: symptoms, illnesses, smoking habits;
2. occupational and residential histories;
3. lung function test: forced expiratory volume (FEV) and forced vital capacity (FVC);
4. P.A. chest x-ray;
5. sputum volume and quality;
6. height and weight;
7. E.C.G. and B.P.

The questionnaire was similar to that recommended by the Medical Research Council⁶ to record respiratory symptoms, past chest illnesses, and smoking habits. The forced expiratory volume (FEV) and forced vital capacity (FVC) were measured using a direct reading Poulton Spirometer.⁷ In Marion County, we measured the one-second forced expiratory volume (FEV_{1.0}); in the second Staveley survey, we recorded both the FEV_{1.0} and the FEV_{0.75}. In the other communities, we recorded the FEV_{0.75}.

The great majority of subjects were seen by appointment at a center. A small number were visited in their own homes. In Leigh and the Rhondda, I completed all the questionnaires and carried out all the lung function measurements; in the first Staveley survey, the sample was randomized between Dr. John Gilson and me; in the second Staveley survey, in addition to Dr. Gilson and me, the sample was randomized between Dr. Millicent Higgins and Dr. Ben Ferris; in Marion County, the observations were made by Dr. Higgins, Dr. Michael Lockshin, and me.

The sample seen in Staveley in 1957 was followed up nine years later, in 1966. A follow-up by home interview of those seen in Marion County was carried out after approximately five years. Some of the findings about mortality are included in this paper. Limited information was also obtained about women in certain areas. In 1957, Dr. Christopher Wood interviewed all the wives of the men aged 55–64 in their homes in Staveley. He completed a respiratory symptoms questionnaire and measured the peak expiratory flow rate with a Wright flow meter. In the Rhondda and in Marion County small, age-stratified random samples of women were seen.

RESULTS

Comparison of Chronic Bronchitis, Breathlessness, and Forced Expiratory Volume in Miners, Exminers, and Nonminers

The whole range of respiratory symptoms, either alone or in combination, can be used to compare different groups of people. In this presentation, for the sake of simplicity, I shall use a standardized index of chronic bronchitis that I have found useful in the past, breathlessness and the level of the forced expiratory volume (FEV).

Persons were categorized as having chronic bronchitis if they had persistent sputum for some part of the day for at least three months in the year and had had at least one chest illness with increased cough and sputum during the

past three years. Breathlessness applies to all who were short of breath when walking at a normal pace on the level (grade three and over).

The prevalence of chronic bronchitis and breathlessness, as well as the mean forced expiratory volume ($FEV_{0.75}$) in miners; exminers, and nonminers are shown in TABLE 2. In every survey, miners and exminers had a higher prevalence of chronic bronchitis or breathlessness and a lower average FEV than nonminers. The magnitude of the difference has varied in different places. Sometimes, as in the men aged 55–64 in the first Staveley survey and in Marion County, the differences have been quite small; in other areas they have been much larger. The overall difference has been about twofold.

We can compare our findings with those of Enterline and Lainhart.⁸ In Mullens, in southern West Virginia, a community survey carried out by the Public Health Service showed a higher prevalence of symptoms and lower lung function among miners and exminers than among nonminers. On the other hand, in a further study carried out in Richwood, in central West Virginia, in which the samples were standardized for education, there were no differences between miners and nonminers. A higher frequency of symptoms or bronchitis has also been noted by others both in this country and in Europe.¹⁰⁻¹⁵ Occupational mortality and morbidity statistics also show higher rates for chronic respiratory disease in miners. These figures have been considered at length by others.¹⁶⁻¹⁹ I do not intend to dwell on them here.

Comparison of Chronic Bronchitis, Breathlessness, and F.E.V. in Miners and Exminers With and Without Simple Pneumoconiosis

Evidence strongly suggests that progressive massive fibrosis (PMF) leads to an increased prevalence of respiratory symptoms and reduced ventilatory lung function, especially in its more advanced stages.^{20, 21} My present concern is with the influence of simple pneumoconiosis on symptoms and FEV (TABLE 3).

In contrast to the consistent differences between miners and nonminers, miners with simple pneumoconiosis do not differ consistently in their prevalence of chronic bronchitis, breathlessness, or FEV from miners without pneumoconiosis. No matter which we consider, the values found are largely independent of the chest x-ray. Indeed, it has often appeared that those with simple pneumoconiosis are fitter in respect to respiratory symptoms and lung function than those without.

Since there is a clear correlation between the x-ray category of pneumoconiosis and the weight of dust found in the lungs at autopsy,²²⁻²³ these findings indicate that chronic obstructive lung disease is not closely related to long-term dust exposure.

Number of Years Spent Working Underground or on the Coal Getting Shift in Relation to Chronic Bronchitis, Breathlessness, and FEV

We have explored the dose/response relationship further by considering chronic bronchitis, breathlessness, and FEV in relation to lifetime dust exposure. In epidemiological surveys two indices have been used: the number of years spent working underground and the number of years spent working

TABLE 2
 PREVALENCE OF CHRONIC BRONCHITIS AND MODERATE AND SEVERE BREATHLESSNESS (GRADE THREE AND OVER) AND
 MEAN FORCED EXPIRATORY VOLUME AMONG MINERS, EXMINERS, AND NONMINERS IN MINING
 COMMUNITIES IN ENGLAND, WALES, AND U.S.A.

| Area | Age Group | Numbers in Samples | | | % Bronchitis | | | % Breathlessness (Grade 3 & Over) | | | Forced Expiratory Volume (Liters) | |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------------|------------|--------------------|--------------|---------|--------------------|-----------------------------------|---------|--------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| | | Miners & Ex-miners | Non-miners | Miners & Ex-miners | Non-miners | Ratio * | Miners & Ex-miners | Non-miners | Ratio * | Miners & Ex-miners | Non-miners | Difference † |
| Leigh | 55-64 | 132 | 84 | 23.5 | 10.7 | 2.2 | 23.5 | 7.2 | 3.3 | 2.17 | 2.39 | -0.22 |
| Staveley | 25-34 | 94 | 114 | 10.6 | 1.8 | 5.9 | 0 | 0 | | 3.35 | 3.58 | -0.23 |
| 1957 | 55-64 | 149 | 81 | 20.8 | 14.8 | 1.4 | 11.4 | 11.1 | 1.0 | 2.44 | 2.52 | -0.12 |
| Staveley | 25-74 | 179 | 159 | 17.4 | 2.7 | 6.4 | 13.9 | 1.5 | 9.3 | 2.56 | 2.84 | -0.28 |
| Rhondda | 35-64 | 275 | 262 | 28.5 | 9.2 | 3.1 | 24.5 | 6.9 | 3.6 | 2.53 | 2.87 | -0.34 |
| Marion County, W. Va. | 20-69 | 426 | 402 | 4.8 | 4.0 | 1.2 | 8.6 | 6.5 | 1.3 | 3.41 | 2.53 | -0.12 |

* Miners & Exminers

Nonminers

† (Miners & Exminers) - Nonminers

TABLE 3
 PREVALENCE OF CHRONIC BRONCHITIS AND MODERATE AND SEVERE BREATHLESSNESS (GRADE THREE AND OVER) AND
 MEAN FORCED EXPIRATORY VOLUME ACCORDING TO PRESENCE OR ABSENCE OF SIMPLE PNEUMOCOINOSIS
 IN MINING COMMUNITIES IN ENGLAND, WALES, AND U.S.A.

| Area | Age Group | Numbers | | % Bronchitis | | % Breathlessness | | Forced Expiratory Volume | | Difference ‡ | | |
|------------|-----------|---------|--------|--------------|--------|------------------|--------|--------------------------|--------|--------------|------|-------|
| | | 0 | Simple | 0 | Simple | 0 | Simple | 0 | Simple | | | |
| Leigh | 55-64 | 101 | 21 | 26.7 | 14.3 | 0.5 | 24.8 | 9.5 | 0.4 | 1.90 | 2.13 | +0.23 |
| Staveley | 25-34 | 89 | 5 | 11.2 | 0 | — | 0 | 0 | — | 3.33 | 3.75 | +0.42 |
| 1957 | 55-64 | 96 | 53 | 18.8 | 24.5 | 1.3 | 8.3 | 17.0 | 2.0 | 2.18 | 2.18 | 0.0 |
| Staveley * | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1966 | 25-74 | 113 | 19 | 14.8 | 19.2 | 1.3 | 12.1 | 27.4 | 2.3 | 2.58 | 2.64 | +0.06 |
| Rhondda * | 35-64 | 88 | 123 | 27.0 | 25.0 | 0.9 | 23.5 | 19.9 | 0.8 | 2.33 | 2.39 | +0.06 |
| Marion | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| County, | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| W. Va.* | 20-69 | 393 | 28 | 6.3 | 1.7 | 0.3 | 9.9 | 6.5 | 0.7 | 3.24 | 3.16 | -0.08 |

* Age adjusted to the total population by direct method.

† Ratio: $\frac{\text{Simple}}{0}$

‡ Difference: Simple - 0.

TABLE 4
RELATIONSHIP OF CHRONIC BRONCHITIS * TO NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT WORKING ON THE COAL FACE IN MINING COMMUNITIES IN ENGLAND AND WALES

| Chronic Bronchitis | Years on the Coal Face | | | | 30 & Over |
|--|------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|
| | < 1 | 1-9 | 10-19 | 20-29 | |
| Observed | 35 | 53 | 43 | 40 | 11 |
| Expected | 39.4 | 51.1 | 42.3 | 33.9 | 15.2 |
| Ratio $\frac{\text{Observed}}{\text{Expected}} \times 100$ | 88.8 | 103.7 | 101.7 | 118.0 | 72.4 |

* Persistent sputum and at least one chest illness during the past 3 years.

on the coal getting shift. In Britain the duration of face work is probably the better index; but in this country the duration of underground work seems to be equally good. The findings in these communities are shown in TABLES 4 to 7. In each dust category the expected numbers are those which would have occurred had duration of exposure had no effect, but differences in age between the categories have been allowed for. The deviations from expectation are not very impressive. In the British studies there is a slight trend both for bronchitis and breathlessness. In West Virginia there is no trend for bronchitis; but a suspicion of a trend for breathlessness. The numbers are, however, very small, and the deviation from expectancy is statistically insignificant.

The relation of FEV to duration of coal face work in the British surveys is shown in TABLE 8. The mean FEV declined with increasing duration of coal face work in some areas but not in others. In Marion County a lower average FEV was found in those who had worked for 30 years or more underground (TABLE 9). But most of this reduction can be accounted for on the basis of age, since the men in that category were ten years older than the men in the previous category.

TABLE 5
RELATIONSHIP OF MODERATE AND SEVERE BREATHLESSNESS * TO NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT WORKING ON THE COAL FACE IN MINING COMMUNITIES IN ENGLAND AND WALES

| Breathlessness (Grades Three & Over) | Years on the Coal Face | | | | 30 & Over |
|--|------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|
| | < 1 | 1-9 | 10-19 | 20-29 | |
| Observed | 28 | 51 | 49 | 40 | 20 |
| Expected | 40.7 | 46.1 | 45.3 | 35.8 | 20.0 |
| Ratio $\frac{\text{Observed}}{\text{Expected}} \times 100$ | 68.8 | 110.6 | 108.2 | 111.7 | 100.0 |

* M.R.C. Breathlessness Grades 3 & Over.

TABLE 6

RELATIONSHIP OF CHRONIC BRONCHITIS TO NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT WORKING UNDERGROUND IN MINERS AND EXMINERS AGED 20-69 IN THREE TOWNS IN MARION COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

| Chronic Bronchitis | Number of Years Spent Working Underground | | | | |
|--|---|-------|-------|-------|-----------|
| | < 1 | 1-9 | 10-19 | 20-29 | 30 & Over |
| Observed | 4 | 4 | 2 | 7 | 10 |
| Expected | 3.4 | 2.9 | 3.7 | 7.6 | 9.4 |
| Ratio $\frac{\text{Observed}}{\text{Expected}} \times 100$ | 117.6 | 137.9 | 54.1 | 92.1 | 106.4 |

Regional Variation in Chronic Respiratory Disease Frequency

Our community studies have shown that there may be considerable regional variation in the frequency of chronic respiratory disease. TABLE 10 compares the prevalence of pneumoconiosis in each area.

The prevalence of pneumoconiosis was much higher, particularly of PMF, in the Rhondda than in either Leigh or Staveley. In Marion County pneumoconiosis was less prevalent than in Leigh. A higher prevalence of respiratory symptoms and bronchitis and lower ventilatory lung function was also found in the Rhondda than in the other areas. Evidence is increasing that considerable regional variation exists in this country, also.²⁴⁻²⁶

Validation of the Findings in Relation to Mortality

Cochrane and his colleagues²⁷ studied death rates among miners, exminers, and nonminers living in the Rhondda fach during a six-year period, 1950-1956. Miners and exminers had a higher mortality from all causes, and particularly

TABLE 7

RELATIONSHIP OF BREATHLESSNESS TO NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT WORKING UNDERGROUND IN MINERS AND EXMINERS AGED 20-69 IN THREE TOWNS IN MARION COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

| Breathlessness (Grades Three & Over) | Number of Years Spent Working Underground | | | | |
|--|---|------|-------|-------|-----------|
| | < 1 | 1-9 | 10-19 | 20-29 | 30 & Over |
| Observed | 3 | 2 | 6 | 8 | 24 |
| Expected | 5.2 | 4.8 | 5.2 | 8.0 | 20.0 |
| Ratio $\frac{\text{Observed}}{\text{Expected}} \times 100$ | 57.7 | 41.7 | 115.4 | 100.0 | 120.0 |

TABLE 8
RELATIONSHIP OF FORCED EXPIRATORY VOLUME TO NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT
WORKING ON THE COAL GETTING SHIFT

| Area | Age Group | Mean FEV According to Number of Years Spent on the Coal Getting Shift | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------|------------|--|------|-----|------|-------|------|-----------|------|-----|------|-----|------|
| | | < 1 | | 1-9 | | 10-19 | | 20 & Over | | | | | |
| | | No. | Mean | No. | Mean | No. | Mean | No. | Mean | No. | Mean | No. | Mean |
| Leigh | 55-64 | 40 | 1.98 | 18 | 2.00 | 33 | 2.00 | 41 | 1.80 | | | | |
| | 25-34 | 41 | 3.35 | 38 | 3.33 | 10 | 3.37 | | | | | | |
| | 55-64 | 41 | 2.33 | 25 | 2.28 | 40 | 2.10 | 43 | 2.05 | | | | |
| Rhondda | 35-44 | 16 | 2.80 | 46 | 2.83 | 18 | 2.58 | 6 | 2.55 | | | | |
| | 45-54 | 6 | 2.80 | 38 | 2.23 | 23 | 2.03 | 28 | 2.08 | | | | |
| | 55-64 | 10 | 2.25 | 33 | 1.88 | 28 | 1.82 | 23 | 1.78 | | | | |
| | All Ages * | 32 | 2.61 | 117 | 2.30 | 69 | 2.13 | 57 | 2.12 | | | | |
| Staveley 1966 | 24-34 | 11 | 3.56 | 11 | 3.54 | 8 | 3.68 | 0 | — | | | | |
| | 35-44 | 10 | 3.32 | 5 | 2.94 | 9 | 2.76 | 8 | 3.13 | | | | |
| | 45-54 | 12 | 2.12 | 1 | 1.63 | 3 | 2.89 | 20 | 2.74 | | | | |
| | 55-64 | 9 | 1.60 | 8 | 2.02 | 2 | 2.18 | 18 | 1.88 | | | | |
| | 65-74 | 6 | 2.07 | 2 | 2.28 | 9 | 1.54 | 26 | 1.65 | | | | |
| | All Ages * | 48 | 2.46 | 27 | 2.43 | 31 | 2.53 | 72 | 1.91 | | | | |

* Age-adjusted to the total population.

TABLE 9

MEAN FEV ACCORDING TO NUMBER OF YEARS SPENT WORKING UNDERGROUND IN MINERS AND EXMINERS AGED 20-69 IN THREE TOWNS IN MARION COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

| Mean Values | Number of Years Spent Working Underground | | | | |
|--------------------|---|-------|-------|-------|-----------|
| | < 1 | 1-9 | 10-19 | 20-29 | 30 & Over |
| FEV _{1.0} | 3.48 | 3.48 | 3.43 | 3.37 | 2.64 |
| Age | 45.2 | 44.0 | 45.6 | 48.1 | 58.8 |
| Height | 174.9 | 174.5 | 173.7 | 174.3 | 170.5 |
| Adjusted FEV * | 3.16 | 3.11 | 3.17 | 3.21 | 3.15 |

* To age 50, height 172.5 cm.

from respiratory diseases, than nonminers. The highest mortality rates were among miners with PMF. Miners and exminers without PMF had slightly increased death rates from all causes and moderately increased (roughly 60%) death rates from respiratory diseases. But radiological category of simple pneumoconiosis was not related to mortality. If anything, the respiratory mortality rates were lower in those with simple pneumoconiosis than in those without.

In the nine year follow-up of men aged 55-64 in Staveley no excess mortality was found among the miners compared with the men who were not exposed to dust at work. Nor did mortality rates differ between those with and those without simple pneumoconiosis. In West Virginia the follow-up of mortality so far shows only a small difference between the mining and nonmining groups in the oldest age category. These observations on mortality therefore agree quite well with the findings which I have presented.

Unlike the chest x-ray, respiratory symptoms and the level of the FEV appear to be useful predictors of mortality. TABLE 11 shows the standardized

TABLE 10

COMPARISON OF PNEUMOCONIOSIS PREVALENCE IN MINERS AND EXMINERS IN DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES

| Place | Age Group | No. x-rayed | % Pneumoconiosis | | |
|------------------------------|-----------|-------------|------------------|-----|-------|
| | | | Simple | PMF | Total |
| Leigh | 55-64 | 135 | 16 | 7 | 23 |
| Staveley | 55-64 | 149 | 36 | 0 | 36 |
| Rhondda | 35-44 | 440 | 33 | 8 | 41 |
| | 45-54 | 210 | 27 | 24 | 51 |
| | 55-64 | 411 | 32 | 25 | 57 |
| Marion County, West Virginia | 40-49 | 139 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| | 50-59 | 145 | 14 | 0 | 14 |
| | 60-69 | 87 | 7 | 5 | 11 |

TABLE 11

MORTALITY IN FIVE YEARS IN RELATION TO SYMPTOMS. MEN AGED 20-69 IN THREE TOWNS IN MARION COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

| Symptoms | Number Seen | Number of Deaths | Expected Number of Deaths | Ratio: $\frac{\text{Expected}}{\text{Observed}} \times 100$ | Relative Risk |
|-----------------------------------|-------------|------------------|---------------------------|---|---------------|
| None | 317 | 14 | 19.5 | 72.8 | 1.0 |
| Cough &/or Sputum | 149 | 8 | 10.1 | 79.6 | 1.1 |
| Wheeze | 160 | 9 | 10.0 | 90.0 | 1.2 |
| Chest Illness | 14 | 1 | 1.0 | 100.0 | 1.4 |
| Cough &/or Sputum & Wheeze | 214 | 19 | 16.9 | 118.3 | 1.6 |
| Cough &/or Sputum & Chest Illness | 9 | 1 | 0.8 | 125.1 | 1.7 |
| Chest Illness & Wheeze | 19 | 2 | 1.3 | 153.8 | 2.1 |
| All Three | 44 | 9 | 3.6 | 250.0 | 3.4 |
| Chronic Bronchitis | 50 | 10 | 4.2 | 238.1 | 3.3 |
| Breathlessness | | | | | |
| Grade 1 | 550 | 28 | 33.0 | 84.8 | 1.0 |
| Grade 2 & Over | 376 | 35 | 30.2 | 116.2 | 1.4 |
| Grade 3 & Over | 82 | 16 | 9.0 | 177.8 | 2.1 |
| Grade 4 | 23 | 10 | 2.8 | 357.2 | 4.2 |

mortality ratios for men reporting various symptoms in Marion County. If the risk of death in the next five years for those without respiratory symptoms is taken as one, then relative risks for those with various symptoms and combinations of symptoms can be calculated. These relative risks are shown in the last column of the table. The relative risk increased progressively as the prevalence of symptoms increased.

This increase is seen especially clearly in the case of breathlessness in the men aged 55-64 in Staveley (TABLE 12). TABLE 13 shows the mortality accord-

TABLE 12

RELATION OF BREATHLESSNESS TO MORTALITY. MEN AGED 55-64 IN STAVELEY, 1957-1966

| Breathlessness Grade in 1957 | Number | Percentage Dead by 1966 |
|------------------------------|--------|-------------------------|
| 1 (None) | 229 | 13.5 |
| 2 | 97 | 35.1 |
| 3 | 33 | 45.5 |
| 4 | 18 | 66.7 |
| 2 & Over | 148 | 41.2 |
| 3 & Over | 51 | 52.9 |

TABLE 13
MORTALITY IN NINE YEARS ACCORDING TO INITIAL FEV_{0.75}
STRATIFIED SAMPLE OF MEN AGED 55-64 SEEN IN 1957 IN STAVELEY, U.K.
REVIEWED IN 1966.

| FEV _{0.75} in 1957 (liters) | Number in Range in 1957 | Respiratory Causes | | Dead by 1966 Other Causes | | Total | |
|---|-------------------------------|-----------------------|------|---------------------------------|------|-------|------|
| | | No. | % | No. | % | No. | % |
| Under 1.0 | 25 | 9 | 36.0 | 8 | 32.0 | 17 | 68.0 |
| 1.0- | 40 | 8 | 20.0 | 15 | 37.5 | 23 | 57.5 |
| 1.5- | 74 | 3 | 4.1 | 12 | 16.2 | 15 | 20.3 |
| 2.0- | 124 | 2 | 1.6 | 22 | 17.7 | 24 | 19.4 |
| 2.5- | 96 | 1 | 1.0 | 15 | 15.6 | 16 | 16.7 |
| 3.0 and over | 28 | 0 | — | 1 | 3.8 | 1 | 3.8 |
| Total | 387 | 23 | 5.9 | 73 | 18.9 | 96 | 24.8 |

ing to level of FEV. The lower the FEV, the worse the outlook. Curiously, nonrespiratory as well as respiratory causes of death appear to be involved, possibly because of the confusion of heart and lung failure.

DISCUSSION

It is unlikely that the differences between miners and nonminers in the frequency of chronic obstructive lung disease could be due to general air pollution because, while working underground, the miner is spared some of the pollution experienced by the nonminer. Tobacco smoking cannot explain the findings since smoking habits of miners and nonminers in these areas did not differ appreciably. Furthermore, the differences persisted after standardizing for smoking.

Social class differences in Britain are possibly more important. They were supported in the Rhondda by the higher prevalence of respiratory symptoms and lower FEV among the wives of miners and exminers than among the wives of nonminers. In Staveley we also found a higher prevalence of symptoms and a lower mean peak expiratory flow rate in the wives of men who worked in dust than in wives of the nondust-exposed groups. In Marion County, however, there were no differences in symptom prevalence or mean FEV between the wives of miners and those of nonminers.

Other factors in mining such as heavy work, exposure to fumes from shot firing, and changes of temperature have sometimes been suggested as explanations for a high prevalence of bronchitis among miners. We have no evidence to present on these factors, which perhaps merit further study.

It is possible that various types of occupational selection could conceal an association between dust exposure and chronic respiratory disease. This possibility has been considered by Cochrane and his colleagues.²¹ Briefly, fitter men may tend to work in dustier jobs, for example at the coal face, because the pay is better; and those who are affected by the dust may tend to move to less dusty employment within the industry or to leave mining altogether.

Thus, those who are still working underground after long periods would be the fitter survivors.

The inconsistent dose/response relations between dust and bronchitis should not lead to the conclusion that dust exposure is unimportant. There is no doubt that dust is important in pneumoconiosis; in bronchitis dust exposure can hardly be beneficial. There should be no relaxation in measures to reduce dust levels in the mines and improve the working conditions of the coal miner.

It also seems desirable to monitor respiratory symptoms and measure lung function, at least when chest x-rays are taken. In this way, any man who is unduly susceptible to dust could be identified early and could be advised appropriately. The Mine Health and Safety Act would appear to offer an excellent opportunity for collecting scientifically valuable information through periodic examinations.

SUMMARY

Studies of chronic respiratory disease that have been carried out in mining communities in England, Wales, and the state of West Virginia, in the United States, are reviewed in the present paper. In each community, miners and exminers have been compared with nonminers, using standardized methods. The influence of pneumoconiosis and dust exposure on respiratory symptoms and lung function has been assessed. A higher prevalence of symptoms and a lower average forced expiratory volume has consistently been found in miners compared with nonminers. Miners with simple pneumoconiosis have not, however, been found to differ consistently either in symptom prevalence or in lung function from miners without pneumoconiosis. An increasing prevalence of symptoms and decreasing lung function with increasing duration of work either underground or at the coal face has been found in some surveys but not in others. These findings suggest that long term dust exposure cannot explain all the excess of chronic nonspecific respiratory disease found in miners.

REFERENCES

1. HIGGINS, I. T. T., P. D. OLDHAM, A. L. COCHRANE & J. C. GILSON. 1956. Respiratory symptoms and pulmonary disability in an industrial town. Survey of a random sample of the population. *Brit. Med. J.* **2**: 904.
2. HIGGINS, I. T. T., A. L. COCHRANE, J. C. GILSON & C. H. WOOD. 1959. Population studies of chronic respiratory disease. A comparison of miners, foundry workers and others in Staveley, Derbyshire. *Brit. J. Ind. Med.* **16**: 255.
3. HIGGINS, I. T. T. & A. L. COCHRANE. 1961. Chronic respiratory disease in a random sample of men and women in Rhondda Fach in 1958. *Brit. J. Ind. Med.* **18**: 93.
4. HIGGINS, I. T. T., J. C. GILSON, B. G. FERRIS, W. E. WATERS, H. CAMPBELL & M. W. HIGGINS. 1968. Chronic respiratory disease in an industrial town: A nine-year follow-up study. Preliminary report. *Am. J. Public Health.* **58**: 1667.
5. HIGGINS, I. T. T., M. W. HIGGINS, M. D. LOCKSHIN & N. CANALE. 1968. Chronic respiratory disease in mining communities in Marion County, West Virginia. *Brit. J. Ind. Med.* **25**: 165.
6. MEDICAL RESEARCH COUNCIL'S COMMITTEE ON THE AETIOLOGY OF CHRONIC BRONCHITIS. 1960. Standardized questionnaire on respiratory symptoms. *Brit. Med. J.*, **2**: 1665.
7. MCKERROW, C. B., M. McDERMOTT & J. C. GILSON. 1960. A spirometer

- for measuring the forced expiratory volume with a simple calibrating device. *Lancet* **1**: 149.
8. ENTERLINE, P. E. & W. S. LAINHART. 1967. The relationship between coal mining and chronic nonspecific respiratory disease. *Am. J. Public Health*, **57**: 484.
 9. LAINHART, W. S., H. N. DOYLE, P. E. ENTERLINE, A. HENSCHER & M. A. KENDRICK. 1969. Pneumoconiosis in Appalachian Bituminous Coal Miners. U.S. Department of HEW, PHS, Environmental Control Administration, Bureau of Occupational Safety and Health. Cincinnati, Ohio.
 10. WORTH, G., L. GASTHAUS, W. LUHNING, K. MUYSERS, F. SIEHOFF & K. WERNER. 1959. Kritische bemerkungen zur diagnostik des lungenemphysems bei kohlenbergarbeitern. *Arch. Gewerbepathol. Gewerbehyg.* **17**: 442.
 11. PEMBERTON, J. 1956. Chronic bronchitis, emphysema, and bronchial spasm in bituminous coal workers. *Arch. Ind. Health* **13**: 529.
 12. CARSTENS, M., O. BRINKMANN, H. J. LANGE, A. MEISTERERNST & H. SCHLICHT. 1958. Beitrage zur pathophysiologie der Staublungenkrankheit im Bergbau. I: Über die korrelativen beziehungen zwischen dynamischen lungenfunktionswerten und Lebens- und Berufsalter. *Arch. Gewerbepathol. Gewerbehyg.* **16**: 203.
 13. VYSKOCIL, J. Chronic bronchitis and pulmonary emphysema in coal miners. 1964. *Scr. Med. Fac. Med. Bruenensis*. **37**: 289.
 14. VYSKOCIL, J., K. KADLEC, V. KUCERA & V. CHALUPA. 1965. Repeated studies of coal miners during 5 years with special consideration of chronic bronchitis and pulmonary emphysema. *Vnitri Lek.* **11**: 638.
 15. MINISTRY OF PENSIONS AND NATIONAL INSURANCE. 1965. Report on an Enquiry into the Incidence of Incapacity for Work. Chapter 6: The relationship between incapacity and air pollution. Her Majesty's Stationery Office. London, England.
 16. ENTERLINE, P. E. 1964. Mortality rates among coal miners. *Am. J. Public Health* **54**: 758.
 17. LOWE, C. R. 1968. Chronic bronchitis and occupation. *Proc. Roy. Soc. Med.* **61**: 98.
 18. GILSON, J. C. 1970. Occupational bronchitis. *Proc. Roy. Soc. Med.* **63**: 857.
 19. HIGGINS, I. T. T. 1970. Occupational factors in chronic bronchitis and emphysema. *In* *Bronchitis*. N. G. M. Orie and R. van der Lende, Eds. Vol. 3: 83-99. Royal Vangorcum, Ltd. Assen, Holland.
 20. GILSON, J. C. & P. HUGH-JONES. 1955. Lung function in coal workers' pneumoconiosis. *Med. Res. Council. Spec. Rep. Ser. No. 290*. Her Majesty's Stationery Office. London, England.
 21. COCHRANE, A. L., I. T. T. HIGGINS & J. THOMAS. 1961. Pulmonary ventilatory functions of coal miners in various areas in relation to the x-ray category of pneumoconiosis. *Brit. J. Prev. Soc. Med.* **15**: 1.
 22. RIVERS, D., M. E. WISE, E. J. KING & G. NAGELSCHMIDT. 1960. Dust content, radiology, and pathology in simple pneumoconiosis of coal workers. *Brit. J. Ind. Med.* **17**: 87.
 23. ROSSITER, C. E., D. RIVERS, I. BERGMAN, C. CASSWELL & G. NAGELSCHMIDT. 1967. Dust content, radiology and pathology in simple pneumoconiosis of coal workers (further report). *In* *Inhaled Particles and Vapors*. C. N. Davies, Ed. Vol. 2: 419. Pergamon Press. Oxford, England.
 24. LIEBEN, J. & W. MCBRIDE. Pneumoconiosis in Pennsylvania's bituminous mining industry. 1963. *J.A.M.A.* **183**: 176.
 25. LAINHART, W. S. 1969. Roentgenographic evidence of coal workers' pneumoconiosis in three geographic areas in the United States. *J. Occup. Med.* **11**: 399.
 26. HYATT, R. E., A. D. KISTIN & T. K. MAHAN. 1964. Respiratory disease in Southern West Virginia coal miners. *Am. Rev. Resp. Dis.* **89**: 387.
 27. COCHRANE, A. L., R. G. CARPENTER, F. MOORE & J. THOMAS. 1964. The mortality of miners and exminers in the Rhondda Fach. *Brit. J. Ind. Med.* **21**: 38.