

Prognostic significance of regulatory T cells in tumor

Cailin Moira Wilke^{1,2}, Ke Wu³, Ende Zhao^{2,3}, Guobin Wang³ and Weiping Zou^{1,2}

¹ Graduate Program in Immunology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI

² Department of Surgery, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI

³ Department of Surgery, Union Hospital, Tongji Medical College, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, Wuhan, China

Since entering the immunological stage several decades ago, regulatory T cell biology has been realized as fundamentally important in the prevention of autoimmune conditions, induction of transplant tolerance and the immune response to cancer. The role of regulatory T cells in tumor immunobiology is still being elucidated. Currently, regulatory T cells are implicated in the dampening of antitumor T-cell responses both through direct and indirect means. A number of investigators have demonstrated that regulatory T cell density and location may serve as independent prognostic factors in several types of cancer and are alternately detrimental or beneficial to patient survival. In this article, we will review the characteristics and functional phenotype of classical regulatory T cells, describe their distribution and quantification in tumor-bearing hosts and summarize recent studies investigating the prognostic significance of regulatory T cell number and locality in various cancers.

Regulatory T (T_{Reg}) cells are a subpopulation of $CD4^+$ T cells with suppressive functionality. In healthy individuals, perhaps the most important role of regulatory T cells is to maintain immune tolerance to self-antigens, which prevents development of autoimmune disease. T_{Reg} cells are also responsible for limiting tissue damage during ongoing and resolving immune responses, maintaining oral and fetomaternal tolerance and restraining asthma and allergy. In settings of organ transplant and cancer, the suppressive function of T_{Reg} cells is currently being manipulated to improve patient health and survival. Investigators of transplantation biology are exploring ways to increase the number of alloantigen-reactive regulatory T cells in transplant recipients to minimize grafted tissue damage and prevent organ rejection.¹ In cancer patients, where regulatory T cells contribute to the dampening of the antitumor immune response, combination therapies that include the inhibition of regulatory T cell function have been explored. Although few Stage III trials of T_{Reg} inhibition have reached their clinical endpoints, analysis of T_{Reg} cells in tumor environments can still yield useful information about patient prognosis and tumor growth, and may eventually lead to new, more successful treatment regimes.

Definition

Regulatory T cells, originally termed suppressive T cells, were first described by Gershon *et al.*^{2,3} in the early 1970s as thy-

Key words: T_{Reg} , tumor, regulatory T cell, prognosis, immunity, immune suppression, immune editing, effector T cell, myeloid suppressor cell, inhibitory B7 family member

DOI: 10.1002/ijc.25464

History: Received 11 Jan 2010; Accepted 11 May 2010; Online 13 May 2010

Correspondence to: Weiping Zou, University of Michigan School of Medicine, C560B MSRB II, 1150 W. Medical Center Dr., Ann Arbor, MI 48109-0669, USA, Tel.: 734-615-5554, E-mail: wzou@med.umich.edu

mus-derived lymphocytes that tolerized bone marrow-derived lymphocytes to antigenic challenge. Research in the laboratory of R.J. North subsequently demonstrated that T cells expressing CD4 and CD25 from tumor-bearing mice abrogated tumor rejection; this suggested the existence of a tumor-suppressor T cell population⁴⁻⁶. Many years later, after more than a decade of intense skepticism regarding the suppressive cells' existence, Sakaguchi *et al.* ascertained that the interleukin-2 (IL-2) receptor α -chain (also called CD25) could be used to identify them.⁷ Later studies in the same laboratory, as well as studies from Rudensky *et al.*, established the transcription factor forkhead box P3 (FoxP3) as both a key intracellular marker of $CD4^+$ $CD25^+$ regulatory T cells and necessary factor for development and proper function of these cells,⁸⁻¹⁰ which was described early on as prevention of autoimmune conditions (e.g., colitis¹¹) and suppression of $CD8^+$ T cell homeostatic proliferation.¹² Beginning with these reports, the field of regulatory T cells has expanded and progressed rapidly. In fact, several distinct regulatory T cell populations have been proposed, including $CD8^+$ subsets. These include thymically derived $CD8^+$ $CD25^+$ T cells that utilize cytotoxic T-lymphocyte-associated antigen-4 (CTLA4) and transforming growth factor β (TGF β) to suppress cell proliferation and activation,¹³ as well as a $CD8^+$ $CD28^-$ T cell population from the periphery that targets immunoglobulin-like transcripts 3 (ILT3) and 4 (ILT4) on dendritic cells (DCs).¹⁴ Our group has identified $CD8^+$ T cells^{15,16} in human ovarian cancer that secrete the suppressive cytokine interleukin-10 (IL-10). Interestingly, a $CD8^+$ regulatory T cell population specific for heme oxygenase-1 has recently been identified.¹⁷ This population, isolated from the peripheral blood of cancer patients, inhibited proliferation, cytotoxicity and cytokine production of other cell immune cells. Groux *et al.* identified a FoxP3- $CD4^+$ population (termed T_{R1} cells), which may also suppress through IL-10 *in vitro*.¹⁸ Weiner characterized a $CD4^+$ TGF β^+

population (T_H3) that exerts suppressive action *in vivo* through TGF β .¹⁹ Both aforementioned populations are likely derived from the periphery. Classic regulatory T cells (T_{Reg}), CD4+CD25+FoxP3+ T cells, differentiate in the thymus and migrate to the periphery.^{20,21} They constitutively express leukocyte common antigen isoform RO (CD45RO), glucocorticoid-induced tumor-necrosis factor receptor-related protein (GITR) and CTLA-4.^{22–26} Fascinatingly, research from Arne Akbar's group has demonstrated that functional T_{Reg} may be induced from memory CD4+ T cell populations found in inflamed skin.²⁷ These antigen-specific CD4+ T cells were isolated, rendered anergic and then tested for suppressive capacity. Interestingly, in parallel with their newly acquired suppressive ability, FoxP3+ mRNA and protein expression in these cells increased profoundly, while CD25, GITR and CTLA-4 expression were all up-regulated. Finally, a recent paper from the laboratory of Shimon Sakaguchi presents the possibility of further categorizing naturally occurring T_{Regs} into three subgroups: CD45RA+ FoxP3^{lo} resting T_{Reg}, termed "rTreg" by the authors, CD45RA– FoxP3^{hi} activated Treg (aTreg) cells and cytokine-secreting CD45RA-FoxP3^{lo} nonsuppressive T cells.²⁸ Ongoing investigations into phenotype, function and associations with disease states will likely contribute to knowledge of an even wider range of regulatory T cell populations in the future. Regardless, it is important to emphasize that regulatory T cells must be defined not only by phenotypic markers but also by their suppressive activity *in vivo*.

Distribution in Tumor-Bearing Hosts

In healthy mice and humans, T_{Reg} cells are found primarily in the thymus, peripheral blood, lymph nodes and spleen. They constitute 5–10% of the resident CD4+ T cells in each of these organs.^{29–31} In bone marrow, however, T_{Reg} cells account for a remarkable 25% of CD4+ T cells.³² Bone marrow is the preferential site of metastasis for some cancers (such as breast, lung and prostate), suggesting that the suppressive environment here is conducive to tumor growth. In tumors themselves, however, there are a number of ways that T_{Reg} cells might accumulate: trafficking to the tumor under the influence of chemokine ligand 22 (CCL22),³³ differentiation^{15,16,34–37} or expansion^{38–40} within the tumor stroma and conversion from normal T cells.^{41–44} Many tumors express tumor-associated antigens (TAAs), molecules found not only on tumor cells but also on certain populations of normal cells. The work of several groups has identified multiple mechanisms of suppression by TAA-specific T_{Reg} cells. These include induction of IL-10, which can drastically suppress antigen-presenting cell (APC) and T cell function,⁴⁵ induction of TGF β , which may suppress natural killer (NK) cell function,⁴⁶ competitive consumption of interleukin-2 (IL-2), which is a survival factor for conventional T cells,^{29,47,48} perforin- and granzyme-dependent killing of T cells and APCs,^{49,50} CTLA-4 induction of indolamine 2,3-dioxygenase (IDO)-expressing APCs, which suppress T cell activation and promote tolerance,^{51,52} and finally, induction of B7-H4

expression on APCs, which renders them immunosuppressive.^{53,54} Thus, T_{Reg} cells target both T cells and APCs to create a generally tolerant tumor microenvironment.

Mouse tumors

Tumor-associated T_{Reg} cells have been studied largely with reagents that target T_{Reg} cells in tumor-bearing mice. Treatment with CD25-specific antibody (PC61) *in vivo* suppressed growth of several tumor types.^{55,56} These early studies demonstrated a correlation between reduced T_{Reg} numbers and reduced tumor volume. Interestingly, depletion of total CD4+ T cells corroborated these data and lead to improved tumor immunity and rejection of tumors.^{57–59} Several groups confirmed these data with CD25-depletion alone or in concert with other treatments, such as anti-CTLA4 antibody,⁵⁸ anti-B7H1 antibodies (Zou *et al.*, unpublished observations), exogenous interferon- α (IFN α)⁶⁰ or interleukin-12 (IL-12),⁶¹ adoptive transfer of DCs^{60,62} and irradiated tumor cells.⁶³ Adoptive transfer of human³³ or mouse^{64,65} T_{reg} cells into mice have also provided a direct functional connection between T_{Reg} cell presence and reduced tumor immunity. One study examined B16 melanoma-bearing mice that received tumor-specific CD8+ T cells with either classic T_{Reg} cells or with CD25– CD4+ T cells.⁶⁵ CD8+ T-cell-mediated tumor immunity was abrogated in mice receiving classic T_{Reg} cells, but not CD25– CD4+ T cells. These studies demonstrate that T_{Reg} cells inhibit murine TAA-specific immunity.

Human tumors

June *et al.* observed increased numbers of T_{Reg} cells in patients with nonsmall cell lung cancer and ovarian carcinoma when compared to healthy patients.⁶⁶ Since this study in 2001, several other groups have made similar observations in the peripheral blood of patients with various types of cancer, including pancreatic and breast cancer,⁶⁷ colorectal cancer (CRC),^{68,69} gastric and esophageal cancer,^{70,71} leukemia and lymphoma,^{72,73} melanoma,^{74,75} lung and ovarian cancer^{66,69} and hepatocellular carcinoma.⁷⁶

Quantification of Regulatory T Cells in Tumor

Regulatory T cell numbers may be evaluated in the tumor and tumor microenvironment in multiple ways. It is common for these cells to be identified on the basis of CD25 and/or FoxP3 expression. Quantification may be presented as a percentage of CD4+ T cells or total (CD3+) T cells, or as absolute number per area (such as mm³) in a given tissue, as in the recent study by Haas *et al.*⁷⁷ Additionally, data may take the form of the ratio of regulatory T cells: effector T cells. Typically, tissue samples are investigated either by creating tissue microarrays and using immunohistochemistry or processing the tissue and examining cell populations via flow cytometry. Importantly, it is known that cell types other than T_{Reg} cells express what were formerly thought of as unique T_{Reg} markers: both CD25 and FoxP3 can be expressed on activated T cells.^{78–80} A recent publication has suggested that

analysis of DNA methylation of the FoxP3+ gene may be a more conclusive way to identify T_{Reg} cells⁸¹: apparently, a certain region within the FoxP3 gene (TSDR, T_{Reg}-specific demethylated region) is demethylated. Because this demethylation is not found in other cell types—including those known to express FoxP3, like activated T cells—it allows for enumeration of T_{Regs} via DNA quantification methods such as PCR. When presenting T_{Reg} quantification data, it is important to consider it in the context of the numbers and locations of other lymphocytes associated with cancer prognoses, such as T-helper-17 (Th17) cells, tumor-associated macrophages (TAMs), and other APCs, especially DCs.

Association with Pathological and Clinical Outcome

Thus far, we have reviewed the current data on regulatory T cell phenotype, quantification and function in the tumor microenvironment. Much of the data suggests that a higher T_{Reg} cell number within the tumor microenvironment would imply a worse prognosis. In many cases, this is true. However, regulatory T cell infiltration in and around the tumor can be beneficial, depending on the type of tumor in question.

Ovarian cancer

A study in 2003 by Zhang *et al.* found significant differences in the distributions of progression-free survival and 5-year overall survival (OS) of 186 epithelial ovarian cancer patients according to the presence or absence of intratumoral CD3+ T cells.⁸² Intratumoral T cells correlated with delayed recurrence or death of patients. T cell presence was additionally associated with microenvironmental expression of lymphocyte-attracting chemokines and increased intratumoral levels of IL-2 and IFN γ . While this study did not specifically address the presence or prognostic significance of T_{Reg} cells, it supports the notion that T cell presence within the tumor is beneficial—the logical hypothesis, then, would be that suppression of intratumoral T cell activation might decrease survival. A subsequent study from the laboratory of Kunle Odunsi demonstrated that epithelial ovarian cancer patients with higher numbers of intraepithelial CD8+ T cells had improved survival (55 *versus* 26 months) compared with patients with lower numbers.⁸³ Interestingly, no survival association was found for CD3+ tumor infiltrating lymphocytes (TILs). However, the patients with high versus low intraepithelial CD8+/CD4+ TIL ratios had median survival of 74 and 25 months, indicating that CD4+ TIL (or subpopulations thereof) might negatively influence the actions of CD8+ TIL. With this in mind, the investigators examined the survival of patients based upon intratumoral CD8+/T_{Reg} ratios. They found that patients with high ratios lived more than two times longer than those with lower ratios (58 *vs.* 23 months), and the study concluded that T_{Reg} presence in tumor tissue can negatively impact patient prognosis. Our group published a study in 2004 in which we examined 104 patients with ovarian carcinoma.³³ In these patients, we

found that human tumor T_{Reg} cells suppressed tumor-specific T cell immunity and contributed to tumor growth *in vivo*. T_{Reg} cells were not only more populous in ascites and tumors of patients with Stage III and Stage IV disease, but were also associated with a strikingly high death hazard and reduced survival—patients with 341 or more T_{Reg} cells per ten high-power fields (HPF) had a 25-fold higher risk of death than patients with 131 or fewer T_{Reg} cells in the same number of fields. It is important to note that both tumor cells and TAMs produced the chemokine CCL22, which mediated T_{Reg} recruitment to the tumor. In 2007, we published a report describing the relationship between B7-H4, T_{Reg} cells, and the survival of 103 patients with ovarian cancer.⁸⁴ We had previously showed that ovarian tumor cells and TAMs expressed B7-H4.⁵³ Our data demonstrated that B7-H4 expression in tumor microenvironmental macrophages was significantly correlated with intratumoral T_{Reg} numbers, and that both of these variables were associated with poor patient outcome. Tumor T_{Reg} cells enabled local macrophages to spontaneously produce IL-10 and IL-6, through which the macrophages stimulated their own B7-H4 expression. Along with the 2004 study³³ and our more recent work demonstrating that T_{Reg} cells induce B7-H4 on APCs (including macrophages),⁵⁴ our data support the notion that T_{Reg} cells may convey suppressive activity to APCs through B7-H4 induction in human ovarian cancer. These four studies present a rather convincing picture that increased T_{Reg} cell presence and function in ovarian cancer correlates with reduced survival. The data detailing involvement of other cell types in T_{Reg} cell recruitment and function in the tumor emphasizes the necessity to comprehensively evaluate the cellular network in the tumor microenvironment.

Gastric cancer

Kawaida *et al.* published a study in 2005 documenting an increased number of CD4+ CD25^{hi} T cells in regional lymph nodes in gastric cancer patients when compared to control mesenteric lymph nodes from the same patients.⁸⁵ Functional tests of these cells confirmed inhibitory activity corresponding to T_{Reg} cells. A subsequent report by Kono *et al.* investigated the proportion of CD4+ CD25^{hi} FoxP3 mRNA-expressing T cells in total PBMC CD4+ T cells in 72 patients with gastric cancer and 42 patients with esophageal cancer.⁸⁶ Although they did not provide concrete numbers in the text of the study, the authors state that there were significant differences in the prevalence of CD4+CD25^{hi} T cells between the early and advanced disease stages, both in gastric cancer (~2% in stage I *vs.* ~7% in stage IV) and esophageal cancer (about 2.5% in stage I *vs.* ~8% in stage IV). They also state that in both cancers, the patients with a high proportion of CD4+ CD25^{hi} T cells showed poorer survival rates (about 40 *vs.* 93% after 6 years for gastric cancer, and 25 *vs.* 55% in esophageal cancer) in comparison to those with a low proportion. This study utilized small groups and was not specific about grouping parameters. A 2008 study by Mizukami *et al.*

demonstrated a relationship between the localization of T_{Reg} cells and clinical outcome in 80 patients with gastric cancer.⁸⁷ Although the populations of Foxp3+ cells in patients with Stage IV cancer (107.4 cells per five randomly selected high-magnification fields *vs.* 47.2) were significantly larger than those with stage I cancer, this study did not find a significant difference between survival of patients with low levels of T_{Reg} cells (fewer than 34.5 cells per five randomly selected fields) and those with high T_{Reg} levels (more than 34.5) in the tumor. Localization patterns of infiltrating Foxp3+ cells in the tumor were divided into three groups: a peritumour group (more frequent in Stage I), a diffuse group and a follicular group (defined as patients in whom the population of Foxp3+ cells mainly occupied the lymphoid follicles of the submucosal layer compared with any other region of the tumor; more prevalent in Stages II–IV than Stage I). Interestingly, patients with a diffuse pattern of FoxP3+ cells had significantly poorer 10-year survival (60%) than patients with a peritumoral pattern (90%). This suggests that T_{Reg} location, rather than number, might be more important when forecasting the survival of patients with gastric cancer. Shortly afterward, Mizukami *et al.* published another report in which they investigated the frequency of FoxP3+ T_{Regs} within total CD4+ cells in TILs, regional lymph nodes and peripheral blood lymphocytes (PBLs) of gastric cancer patients (*n* = 45).⁸⁸ As might be expected, the frequency of T_{Reg} cells in TILs was significantly higher than in normal gastric mucosa (12.4 *vs.* 4.1%) both in early and late disease. Interestingly, the frequency of CCL17+ or CCL22+ cells among intratumoral CD14+ cells (monocytes and macrophages) was significantly higher than that of normal gastric mucosa, and this frequency correlated significantly with tumor-infiltrating T_{Reg} numbers. The investigators confirmed in an *in vitro* migration assay that T_{Reg} cells could be induced to migrate by CCL17 or CCL22. This study supports the notion suggested previously by our group³³ that chemokines secreted by monocytes and macrophages within the tumor environment are important for T_{Reg} trafficking into the tumor. More recently, Haas *et al.* published an investigation of T_{Reg} prognostic significance in 52 patients with intestinal-type gastric cardiac cancer.⁷⁷ Although the group found no relationship between the numbers of T_{Reg} cells (or macrophages) infiltrating the tumor and patient survival, they did observe that patients with larger T_{Reg} populations in the tumor stroma (>125.9 FoxP3+TILs/mm²) had a median survival time of 58 months while those with smaller populations (<125.9 FoxP3+TILs per mm² of tissue) had a median survival time of 32 months. Interestingly, they also discovered that patients with higher (above 2.9) stromal CD68+ (a glycoprotein expressed on monocytes and macrophages)/FoxP3+ cell ratios in primary tumor had shorter median survival time than those with lower ratios. This data again supports the concept of an immunosuppressive and/or tumor-promoting role for APC in the tumor microenvironment. Haas *et al.* propose that their findings suggest that inflammatory proc-

esses within the tumor stroma of gastric cardiac adenocarcinomas may have direct effects on patient outcome. In opposition to the probable protumor role for macrophages, it is feasible that large numbers of stromal T_{Reg} may inhibit local cancer-promoting inflammatory processes. Therefore, it is possible in patients with chronic inflammation-associated cancers such as gastritis-associated gastric adenocarcinoma and ulcerative colitis-associated colon cancer (see discussion below), T_{Reg} may be protective.

Pancreatic cancer

In 2006, Hiraoka *et al.* performed a study of the clinical significance of T_{Reg} in the progression of pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma.⁸⁹ On investigation of tumor tissue and draining lymph nodes of 198 pancreatic ductal adenocarcinomas, their associated premalignant lesions and 15 non-neoplastic pancreatic lesions, the investigators found an increased T_{Reg} prevalence in the ductal adenocarcinomas compared with that in the stroma of non-neoplastic lesions. This increase significantly correlated with certain clinicopathologic factors, including distant metastasis, advanced tumor stage and higher tumor grade. Interestingly, the investigators documented that infiltration of intraepithelial CD8+ cytotoxic T cells into pancreatic ducts was prominent in low-grade premalignant lesions but diminished during the progression of both pancreatic intraepithelial neoplasias and intraductal papillary-mucinous neoplasms. Conversely, numbers of stromal T_{Reg} cells increased during this progression. Patients with a low frequency (less than the average 34.6% of total intratumoral CD4+ T cells) of tumor-infiltrating T_{Reg} cells had significantly longer survival than those who had a high frequency (more than the average 34.6%) of intratumoral T_{Reg} cells.

Anal cancer

A study by Grabenbauer *et al.* explored the prognostic significance of T_{Reg} cells and TIL subsets in 38 anal squamous cell carcinoma patients treated with radiochemotherapy.⁹⁰ Although they found no prognostic effects for T_{Reg} or macrophages, the investigators did determine that higher numbers of cytotoxic TIL numbers (>0.6 granzyme B+ TILs per 100 tumor cells) served as indicators of poor prognosis (3-year survival rate of 47 *vs.* 89% in patients with fewer than 0.6 granzyme B+ TIL per 100 tumor cells). Additionally, 3-year survival rates for patients with low numbers of TILs (defined as ≤3.8 CD3+ per 100 tumor cells or ≤1.5 CD4+ per 100 tumor cells) were 89 and 95%, respectively, and 54 and 48%, respectively, in cases with high numbers (>3.8 CD3+ per 100 tumor cells or >1.5 CD4+ per 100 tumor cells). It appears here that lower numbers of TILs indicate better patient outcome. However, the prognostic significance of these cell populations must be considered in light of the fact that the patients examined had already been treated with radiochemotherapy, and it is therefore possible that the

remaining tumor cells may have arisen from radiation-resistant precursors.

Colorectal cancer

A recent study by Salama *et al.* assessed the survival correlations of CD8+, CD45RO+ and FoxP3+ T cell frequencies in tumor and normal colonic tissue from 967 patients with Stage II or Stage III CRC.⁹¹ The investigators found that CD8+ and CD45RO+ cell densities (cells per mm²) were lower in tumor than in normal tissue, but FoxP3+ cell density was higher. FoxP3+ cells were not associated with any histopathologic features other than tumor stage: interestingly, lower numbers of FoxP3+ cells correlated with more advanced tumor stages. Further examination demonstrated that tumor stage, vascular invasion, and FoxP3+ density in normal and tumor tissue all served as independent prognostic factors. High FoxP3+ frequency (more than the median value of 44 FoxP3+ cells/mm²) in healthy tissue was associated with worse prognosis, while higher frequencies of FoxP3+ cells in tumors (more than the median value of 116 FoxP3+ cells/mm²) were associated with better survival. In this study, CD8+ and CD45RO+ T cells did not correlate with patient outcome. Two other studies have contributed to our knowledge of T_{Reg} cells in CRC in the past year. Sinicrope *et al.* investigated the prognostic impact of T_{Reg} and CD3+ T cell numbers within 160 Stage II or III colon cancer patients.⁹² On comparison with normal colon tissue from the same patients, the investigators determined that densities of both T_{Reg} and CD3+ T cell populations were increased in tumor tissue. Although intraepithelial FoxP3+ cell numbers were not prognostic, higher levels of expression were found to correlate with poor tumor differentiation, advanced patient age and, interestingly, female gender. As for CD3+ T cells, patients with smaller intraepithelial populations experienced reduced disease-free survival (DFS). A low intraepithelial CD3+/FoxP3+ ratio (lower than the first quartile value of all patients) also served as a prognostic indicator for reduced DFS. Both of these variables were found to be prognostically stronger for patients with colon carcinoma than either numbers of lymph node metastases or tumor stage. More recently, Frey *et al.* investigated the prognostic significance of T_{Reg} cells in CRC patients after their tumors had been stratified by mismatch repair (MMR) status.⁹³ They examined 1,197 MMR-proficient and 223 MMR-deficient CRCs. Fascinatingly, high FoxP3+ numbers (classified as more than 17 FoxP3+ cells per microarray tissue punch, approximately the same area as one 40× field) in the MMR-proficient patients correlated with early T stage, tumor location (rectal) and better 5-year survival rate. In MMR-deficient CRCs, however, larger FoxP3+ populations were associated with an absence of lymph node involvement and absence of vascularization, along with a better 5-year survival rate. Finally, the investigators determined that an elevated FoxP3+ cell frequency served as an independent prognostic factor in MMR-proficient

CRC and could predict enhanced survival in these patients.

Liver cancer

In 2007, Kobayashi *et al.* examined the infiltration of FoxP3+ T_{Regs} and CD8+ T cells in the tumor stroma and nontumorous liver parenchyma of patients with liver cancer.⁹⁴ Their samples included 323 hepatic nodules (including precursor lesions), early hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC), and advanced HCC, in addition to 39 intrahepatic cholangiocarcinomas and 59 metastatic liver adenocarcinomas. The investigators found that T_{Reg} numbers were significantly higher in HCC than in non-tumorous liver, and higher in primary HCC than in metastatic HCC. In both cases, HCC-infiltrating T_{Reg} cell density was an independent prognostic factor. T_{Reg} frequency was also increased in nontumorous liver (both with and without hepatitis) bearing primary tumors. Higher T_{Reg} numbers within tumor tissue correlated with higher tumor grade and tended to correlate ($p = 0.064$) with fewer infiltrating CD8+ T cells. The patient group with a high prevalence of T_{Regs} (greater than 29% of CD4+ T cells) infiltrating HCC showed a significantly lower DFS and overall survival (OS) rate (27.3 and 45.1 months, respectively) than patients with fewer than 29% of CD4+ T cells identified as T_{Reg} cells (36.2 and 60.3 months, respectively). Contrastingly, there was no significant difference in the OS or DFS between patients with low numbers of tumor-infiltrating CD8+ T and those with high numbers. Kobayashi *et al.* observed that during hepatocarcinogenesis, the prevalence of T_{Regs} increased, while CD8+ T cell numbers decreased. This work supports the notion that primary hepatic cancers develop in liver that is immunosuppressed by large populations of T_{Reg} cells. In the same year, Gao *et al.* published a manuscript detailing their investigation into the prognostic value of TILs in 302 HCC patients after tumor resection.⁹⁵ Interestingly, numbers of CD3+, CD4+ and CD8+ TILs were not associated with patient survival. However, fewer intratumoral T_{Regs} (<2.24 per 400× field) in combination with more (>17.74 per 400× field) activated CD8+ cytotoxic cells (CTLs, activation as defined by positive Granzyme B staining), served as an independent prognostic factor for both improved DFS and OS. Patients with high numbers of tumor-infiltrating T_{Regs} and low numbers of CD8+ CTLs (fewer than 17.74 per 400× field) had 5-year OS and DFS rates of 24.1 and 19.8%, respectively, whereas the group with low T_{Regs} and high CD8+ CTLs had rates of 64.0 and 59.4%. Both T_{Regs} alone and activated CTLs alone within the tumor served as independent predictors for OS. Patients with low numbers of intratumoral T_{Regs} had longer OS (70 months) and DFS (69 months) than did those with high numbers of T_{Regs} (higher than 2.24 per 400× field; 51 and 34 months, respectively). Interestingly, the investigators found a correlation between high T_{Reg} cell density and both absence of tumor encapsulation and presence of tumor vascular invasion, which suggests an association of T_{Reg} cells with tumor invasiveness. If a

CD8+ CTL-heavy balance of CTL and T_{Reg} in the tumor microenvironment is indicative of better patient outcome, then therapy which increases CD8+ number and efficacy while simultaneously depleting T_{Reg} cells would be ideal. In 2006, Cai *et al.* explored the potential of intratumoral DCs and T cells to serve as prognostic indicators in 123 patients who underwent surgical resection of hepatocellular carcinoma.⁹⁶ Although the investigators did not find a significant correlation between the number grade of infiltrating immune cells in HCC nodules or pericancerous tissues and DFS, they observed that an absolute number of DCs in HCC nodules of 25 or more per ten HPF did correlate with DFS. However, 28 or more DCs per ten HPF in pericancerous tissues had no correlation with survival. As might be expected, more DCs alone or with T lymphocytes (CD3+, CD45RO+ or CD8+), or more CD8+ T lymphocytes alone in HCC nodules strongly correlated to longer tumor-free survival time. It is important to consider this study because it explores numbers and locations of immune cells other than T_{Reg} cells that likely interact with T_{Regs} in the tumor microenvironment. In 2009, we published a study of B7-H1 and PD-1 expression in HCC patients in which we determined not only that B7-H1 expression on Kupffer cells (KC) was increased in tumor tissues compared with surrounding nontumor liver tissues, but also that this expression correlated with poor survival.⁹⁷ Additionally, numbers of PD-1+ CD8+ T cells were higher in tumor tissues than in non-tumor tissues, and B7-H1+ KCs and PD-1+ T cells colocalized in the HCC stroma. PD-1+ CD8+ T cells had decreased proliferative ability and effector function, but these attributes were rescued on PD-1/B7-H1 blockade. In summary, it is clear from the aforementioned studies that T_{Regs} are not the only prognostic marker of survival in HCC patients. Zhang *et al.* recently published a study investigating the prognostic potential of Th17 cells in 178 patients with hepatocellular carcinoma.⁹⁸ The investigators found that Th17 cell numbers were higher in tumors of HCC patients than in non-tumor tissue, and that these Th17 displayed an effector memory phenotype. It was also determined that intratumoral frequency of IL-17-producing cells, which correlated proportionally with tumor microvessel density, could serve as an independent prognostic factor for OS and DFS. Other studies have documented a proangiogenic role for IL-17.^{99,100} In HCC, intratumoral density of Th17 cells is negatively associated with patient outcome.

Head and neck cancer

In 2006, a study from the laboratory of Eric Tartour investigated the prognostic value of various tumor-infiltrating CD4+ T-cell populations in 84 untreated patients with head and neck squamous cell carcinoma.¹⁰¹ The investigators found that larger populations of tumor-infiltrating CD4+ CD69+ (activated) T cells (greater than 2.6 cells per field using a 40× objective) correlated with both better local control of the tumor and longer patient survival. Interestingly, higher numbers of intratumoral regulatory Foxp3+ CD4+ T

cells (more than 1.5 cells per 40× field) were also positively associated with and served as an independent prognostic factor for better regional control of the tumor. CD4+ CD69+ T cells made up the only population within the tumor that significantly influenced OS: more infiltration correlated with better patient outcome. In head and neck cancer, T_{Reg} cells may enact better local tumor control through suppression of inflammatory intermediates.

Breast cancer

Also in 2006, Bates *et al.* performed experiments to assess the clinical significance of T_{Reg} cells in breast cancer patients with pure ductal carcinoma *in situ* (DCIS; *n* = 62), invasive breast cancer (*n* = 237) or from samples of normal breast tissue (*n* = 10). The investigators found increased T_{Reg} numbers in *in situ* and invasive breast carcinomas when compared with normal breast tissue, and larger T_{Reg} populations in invasive tumors than in DCIS. Increased levels (greater than or equal to 15 positively-stained cells per 1 mm diameter invasive tumor cores) of T_{Reg} cells distinguished both patients with DCIS at increased risk of relapse and patients with invasive tumors who would go on to have shorter DFS and OS. High-grade tumors, patients with lymph node involvement and estrogen receptor (ER)-negative tumors all displayed significantly larger numbers of T_{Reg} cells. Patients with larger T_{Reg} populations in ER+ tumors were categorized as high risk. In this study, high numbers of T_{Reg} cells identified patients at risk of relapse after 5 years. Bates *et al.* recommend T_{Reg} as a novel marker for identifying late-relapse patients who might be good candidates for aromatase therapy (which suppresses estrogen production) after tamoxifen treatment.

Lymphoma

Research from the lab of Miguel Piris in 2005 explored the relevance of T_{Reg} and CTL (defined by TIA-1 and Granzyme B) populations in the reactive background of Hodgkin's lymphoma (HL) samples in the prognosis of 257 patients with classic HL (cHL).¹⁰² Previous research reported by Oudejans *et al.* that increased numbers of CTLs were associated with poor patient outcome¹⁰³ was met with skepticism.¹⁰⁴ The 2005 report showed that a smaller population of FoxP3+ cells (lowest quartile of total patient numbers) combined with higher numbers of CTL (highest quartile) in the infiltrate served as an independent prognostic factor that negatively influenced event-free survival (EFS) and DFS in cHL patients. Alvaro *et al.* tested four cases in which patients relapsed and discovered that these samples tended to have more TIA-1+ cells and a lower proportion of FoxP3+ cells than at the time of diagnosis. The results of this investigation suggest that a combination of more CTLs with small numbers of FoxP3+ cells in the reactive background may predict a poor outcome in cHL patients. Three years later, Karube *et al.* analyzed the expression of FoxP3 in adult T-cell leukemia and lymphoma.¹⁰⁵ Interestingly, 60 (36%) of the 169 cases examined had FoxP3

expression in lymphoma cells. On closer examination, the investigators found that FoxP3+ and FoxP3- leukemia/lymphoma cases did not differ in clinical stage, age distribution, lactate dehydrogenase and calcium in serum or in overall survival. However, a larger proportion of FoxP3+ cases (8/34) suffered from severe infection; while in FoxP3- cases, only two of 62 patients did so. Karube *et al.* also demonstrated that FoxP3 expression in adult T-cell leukemia/lymphoma indicated certain morphological features (including chromosome abnormalities) and concluded that this T_{Reg} marker is associated with patient immunosuppression.

Melanoma

In 2007, Miracco *et al.* analyzed 66 vertical growth phase primary cutaneous melanomas for correlation of T_{Reg} cell presence with recurrence potential.¹⁰⁶ The investigators discovered that the percentage of T_{Regs} within tumor parenchyma, at its periphery, and among TILs at the tumor-stroma boundary, was significantly higher in patients that experienced recurrence than in those that did not. Interestingly, many of the T_{Regs} identified in these samples were found in close proximity to TAMs, the presence of which has been correlated to poor prognosis in patients with advanced melanoma.¹⁰⁷ Although the Miracco study did not analyze such parameters as distant metastases and patient survival, the preliminary data point to the possibility of using T_{Reg} quantification as a prognostic indicator in melanoma.

Conclusions

Although regulatory T cells share functionality and mechanisms of suppression across cancers, it is important to recognize the individual (tumor-specific) nature of the T_{Reg} component of any given tumor microenvironment. As we have reviewed above, T_{Regs} play an important role in the development and maintenance of tumors and in the abrogation of the immune responses against them. In many cancers, elevated T_{Reg} cell presence and number imply a worse prognosis for the patient in question. However, this is not always the case. As the studies of gastric, colorectal and anal cancer suggest, it seems that T_{Regs} also have a different role. In these reports, increased T_{Reg} populations within the tumor tissue

seemed to be beneficial. It is interesting to note that all of these cancers are localized to the gastrointestinal tract, portions of which are sites of the most rapid cell turnover in the human body. It is possible that T_{Reg} cells in this environment are more crucial for restraining inflammation (and thus preventing angiogenesis and other developments beneficial to tumor growth and survival) than for shutting off the host's response to the tumor.^{108,109} Chronic inflammation is often linked to cancer development in the gastrointestinal system. Further investigation into this phenomenon is warranted. In addition to tumor location, then, it is important to consider T_{Reg} populations in the context of their upstream and downstream mediators, as well as alongside their cohorts in the tumor microenvironment. It is prudent to acknowledge the recently identified population of myeloid-derived suppressor cells (MDSC), the known functions of which thus far include inhibition of T cell activation, proliferation, migration and cytokine production through a variety of mechanisms.¹¹⁰ As many studies have described, other T cell subsets and APCs (notably macrophages and dendritic cells) are significant in their relationships to intratumoral T_{Reg} cells in the recruitment of T_{Regs} into the tumor, influence of T_{Reg} function within the tumor environment and in the molecules they (as target cells) upregulate in response to T_{Reg} signaling. For example, IDO, a molecule induced in APC via CTLA-4 expression on T_{Reg}, has been shown to diminish local CD8+ T cell infiltration and responses to allogeneic target cells *in vitro* and *in vivo*.¹¹¹ Interestingly, Sørensen *et al.* identified IDO-specific cytotoxic effector CD8+ T cells in the peripheral blood and tumor microenvironment of some cancer patients,¹¹² demonstrating that the immune system can mount responses against at least some of the mechanisms designed to suppress it. This affirms the importance of evaluating intratumoral T_{Reg} presence in the context of other T cells, especially CD8+ T cells. Indeed, no single molecule or cell examined thus far within the tumor environment can serve as an absolutely independent indicator of patient survival. Therefore, it will be necessary to examine multiple tumor-associated cell populations in tandem with well-defined pathological, clinical and genetic parameters to more accurately predict patient outcome.

References

1. Long E, Wood KJ. Regulatory T cells in transplantation: transferring mouse studies to the clinic. *Transplantation* 2009;88:1050-6.
2. Gershon RK, Kondo K. Infectious immunological tolerance. *Immunology* 1971;21:903-14.
3. Gershon RK, Kondo K. Cell interactions in the induction of tolerance: the role of thymic lymphocytes. *Immunology* 1970;18:723-37.
4. Berendt MJ, North RJ. T-cell-mediated suppression of anti-tumor immunity. An explanation for progressive growth of an immunogenic tumor. *J Exp Med* 1980;151:69-80.
5. Bursucker I, North RJ. Generation and decay of the immune response to a progressive fibrosarcoma. II. Failure to demonstrate postexcision immunity after the onset of T cell-mediated suppression of immunity. *J Exp Med* 1984;159:1312-21.
6. North RJ, Bursucker I. Generation and decay of the immune response to a progressive fibrosarcoma. I. Ly-1+2-suppressor T cells down-regulate the generation of Ly-1-2+ effector T cells. *J Exp Med* 1984;159:1295-311.
7. Sakaguchi S, Sakaguchi N, Asano M, Itoh M, Toda M. Immunologic self-tolerance maintained by activated T cells expressing IL-2 receptor alpha-chains (CD25). Breakdown of a single mechanism of self-tolerance causes various autoimmune diseases. *J Immunol* 1995;155:1151-64.
8. Hori S, Nomura T, Sakaguchi S. Control of regulatory T cell development by the

- transcription factor Foxp3. *Science* 2003; 299:1057–61.
9. Fontenot JD, Gavin MA, Rudensky AY. Foxp3 programs the development and function of CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells. *Nat Immunol* 2003;4:330–6.
 10. Khattri R, Cox T, Yasayko SA, Ramsdell F. An essential role for Scurfin in CD4+CD25+ T regulatory cells. *Nat Immunol* 2003;4:337–42.
 11. Asseman C, Mauze S, Leach MW, Coffman RL, Powrie F. An essential role for interleukin 10 in the function of regulatory T cells that inhibit intestinal inflammation. *J Exp Med* 1999;190:995–1004.
 12. Murakami M, Sakamoto A, Bender J, Kappler J, Marrack P. CD25+CD4+ T cells contribute to the control of memory CD8+ T cells. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2002;99:8832–7.
 13. Cosmi L, Liotta F, Lazzeri E, Francalanci M, Angeli R, Mazzinghi B, Santarlasci V, Manetti R, Vanini V, Romagnani P, Maggi E, Romagnani S, et al. Human CD8+CD25+ thymocytes share phenotypic and functional features with CD4+CD25+ regulatory thymocytes. *Blood* 2003;102:4107–14.
 14. Chang CC, Ciubotariu R, Manavalan JS, Yuan J, Colovai AI, Piazza F, Lederman S, Colonna M, Cortesini R, Dalla-Favera R, Suciuc-Foca N. Tolerization of dendritic cells by T(S) cells: the crucial role of inhibitory receptors ILT3 and ILT4. *Nat Immunol* 2002;3:237–43.
 15. Zou W, Machelon V, Coulomb-L'Hermin A, Borvak J, Nome F, Isaeva T, Wei S, Krzysiek R, Durand-Gasselini I, Gordon A, Pustilnik T, Curiel DT, et al. Stromal-derived factor-1 in human tumors recruits and alters the function of plasmacytoid precursor dendritic cells. *Nat Med* 2001;7:1339–46.
 16. Wei S, Kryczek I, Zou L, Daniel B, Cheng P, Mottram P, Curiel T, Lange A, Zou W. Plasmacytoid dendritic cells induce CD8+ regulatory T cells in human ovarian carcinoma. *Cancer Res* 2005;65:5020–6.
 17. Andersen MH, Sorensen RB, Brimnes MK, Svane IM, Becker JC, thor Straten P. Identification of heme oxygenase-1-specific regulatory CD8+ T cells in cancer patients. *J Clin Invest* 2009;119: 2245–56.
 18. Groux H, O'Garra A, Bigler M, Rouleau M, Antonenko S, de Vries JE, Roncarolo MG. A CD4+ T-cell subset inhibits antigen-specific T-cell responses and prevents colitis. *Nature* 1997;389:737–42.
 19. Weiner HL. Induction and mechanism of action of transforming growth factor-beta-secreting Th3 regulatory cells. *Immunol Rev* 2001;182:207–14.
 20. Wood KJ, Sakaguchi S. Regulatory T cells in transplantation tolerance. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2003;3:199–210.
 21. Bach JF. Regulatory T cells under scrutiny. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2003;3:189–98.
 22. Takahashi T, Tagami T, Yamazaki S, Uede T, Shimizu J, Sakaguchi N, Mak TW, Sakaguchi S. Immunologic self-tolerance maintained by CD25(+)CD4(+) regulatory T cells constitutively expressing cytotoxic T lymphocyte-associated antigen 4. *J Exp Med* 2000;192:303–10.
 23. Dieckmann D, Plottner H, Berchtold S, Berger T, Schuler G. Ex vivo isolation and characterization of CD4(+)CD25(+) T cells with regulatory properties from human blood. *J Exp Med* 2001;193: 1303–10.
 24. Read S, Malmstrom V, Powrie F. Cytotoxic T lymphocyte-associated antigen 4 plays an essential role in the function of CD25(+)CD4(+) regulatory cells that control intestinal inflammation. *J Exp Med* 2000;192:295–302.
 25. McHugh RS, Whitters MJ, Piccirillo CA, Young DA, Shevach EM, Collins M, Byrne MC. CD4(+)CD25(+) immunoregulatory T cells: gene expression analysis reveals a functional role for the glucocorticoid-induced TNF receptor. *Immunity* 2002;16:311–23.
 26. Shimizu J, Yamazaki S, Takahashi T, Ishida Y, Sakaguchi S. Stimulation of CD25(+)CD4(+) regulatory T cells through GITR breaks immunological self-tolerance. *Nat Immunol* 2002;3:135–42.
 27. Vukmanovic-Stejic M, Agius E, Booth N, Dunne PJ, Lacy KE, Reed JR, Sobande TO, Kissane S, Salmon M, Rustin MH, Akbar AN. The kinetics of CD4+Foxp3+ T cell accumulation during a human cutaneous antigen-specific memory response in vivo. *J Clin Invest* 2008;118: 3639–50.
 28. Miyara M, Yoshioka Y, Kitoh A, Shima T, Wing K, Niwa A, Parizot C, Taflin C, Heike T, Valeyre D, Mathian A, Nakahata T, et al. Functional delineation and differentiation dynamics of human CD4+ T cells expressing the FoxP3 transcription factor. *Immunity* 2009;30:899–911.
 29. Shevach EM. CD4+ CD25+ suppressor T cells: more questions than answers. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2002;2:389–400.
 30. Sakaguchi S. Naturally arising Foxp3-expressing CD25+CD4+ regulatory T cells in immunological tolerance to self and non-self. *Nat Immunol* 2005;6: 345–52.
 31. Stephens LA, Mottet C, Mason D, Powrie F. Human CD4(+)CD25(+) thymocytes and peripheral T cells have immune suppressive activity in vitro. *Eur J Immunol* 2001;31:1247–54.
 32. Zou L, Barnett B, Safah H, Larussa VF, Evdemon-Hogan M, Mottram P, Wei S, David O, Curiel TJ, Zou W. Bone marrow is a reservoir for CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells that traffic through CXCL12/CXCR4 signals. *Cancer Res* 2004;64: 8451–5.
 33. Curiel TJ, Coukos G, Zou L, Alvarez X, Cheng P, Mottram P, Evdemon-Hogan M, Conejo-Garcia JR, Zhang L, Burow M, Zhu Y, Wei S, et al. Specific recruitment of regulatory T cells in ovarian carcinoma fosters immune privilege and predicts reduced survival. *Nat Med* 2004;10:942–9.
 34. Zou W. Immunosuppressive networks in the tumour environment and their therapeutic relevance. *Nat Rev Cancer* 2005;5:263–74.
 35. Gabrilovich D. Mechanisms and functional significance of tumour-induced dendritic-cell defects. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2004;4:941–52.
 36. Dhodapkar MV, Steinman RM, Krasovsky J, Munz C, Bhardwaj N. Antigen-specific inhibition of effector T cell function in humans after injection of immature dendritic cells. *J Exp Med* 2001;193:233–8.
 37. Chakraborty NG, Chattopadhyay S, Mehrotra S, Chhabra A, Mukherji B. Regulatory T-cell response and tumor vaccine-induced cytotoxic T lymphocytes in human melanoma. *Hum Immunol* 2004;65:794–802.
 38. Ghiringhelli F, Puig PE, Roux S, Parcellier A, Schmitt E, Solary E, Kroemer G, Martin F, Chauffert B, Zitvogel L. Tumor cells convert immature myeloid dendritic cells into TGF-beta-secreting cells inducing CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cell proliferation. *J Exp Med* 2005;202:919–29.
 39. Yamazaki S, Iyoda T, Tarbell K, Olson K, Velinzon K, Inaba K, Steinman RM. Direct expansion of functional CD25+ CD4+ regulatory T cells by antigen-processing dendritic cells. *J Exp Med* 2003;198:235–47.
 40. Tarbell KV, Yamazaki S, Olson K, Toy P, Steinman RM. CD25+ CD4+ T cells, expanded with dendritic cells presenting a single autoantigenic peptide, suppress autoimmune diabetes. *J Exp Med* 2004; 199:1467–77.
 41. Chen W, Jin W, Hardegen N, Lei KJ, Li L, Marinos N, McGrady G, Wahl SM. Conversion of peripheral CD4+CD25-naive T cells to CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells by TGF-beta induction of transcription factor Foxp3. *J Exp Med* 2003;198:1875–86.
 42. Curotto de Lafaille MA, Lino AC, Kutchukhidze N, Lafaille JJ. CD25- T cells generate CD25+Foxp3+ regulatory T cells by peripheral expansion. *J Immunol* 2004;173:7259–68.
 43. Fantini MC, Becker C, Monteleone G, Pallone F, Galle PR, Neurath MF. Cutting edge: TGF-beta induces a regulatory phenotype in CD4+CD25- T cells through Foxp3 induction and down-

- regulation of Smad7. *J Immunol* 2004;172:5149–53.
44. Liang S, Alard P, Zhao Y, Parnell S, Clark SL, Kosiewicz MM. Conversion of CD4+ CD25- cells into CD4+ CD25+ regulatory T cells in vivo requires B7 costimulation, but not the thymus. *J Exp Med* 2005;201:127–37.
 45. Hawrylowicz CM, O'Garra A. Potential role of interleukin-10-secreting regulatory T cells in allergy and asthma. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2005;5:271–83.
 46. Ghiringhelli F, Menard C, Terme M, Flament C, Taieb J, Chaput N, Puig PE, Novault S, Escudier B, Vivier E, Lecesne A, Robert C, et al. CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells inhibit natural killer cell functions in a transforming growth factor-beta-dependent manner. *J Exp Med* 2005;202:1075–85.
 47. von Boehmer H. Mechanisms of suppression by suppressor T cells. *Nat Immunol* 2005;6:338–44.
 48. de la Rosa M, Rutz S, Dorninger H, Scheffold A. Interleukin-2 is essential for CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cell function. *Eur J Immunol* 2004;34:2480–8.
 49. Grossman WJ, Verbsky JW, Barchet W, Colonna M, Atkinson JP, Ley TJ. Human T regulatory cells can use the perforin pathway to cause autologous target cell death. *Immunity* 2004;21:589–601.
 50. Gondek DC, Lu LF, Quezada SA, Sakaguchi S, Noelle RJ. Cutting edge: contact-mediated suppression by CD4+CD25+ regulatory cells involves a granzyme B-dependent, perforin-independent mechanism. *J Immunol* 2005;174:1783–6.
 51. Mellor AL, Munn DH. IDO expression by dendritic cells: tolerance and tryptophan catabolism. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2004;4:762–74.
 52. Fallarino F, Grohmann U, Hwang KW, Orabona C, Vacca C, Bianchi R, Belladonna ML, Fioretti MC, Alegre ML, Puccetti P. Modulation of tryptophan catabolism by regulatory T cells. *Nat Immunol* 2003;4:1206–12.
 53. Kryczek I, Zou L, Rodriguez P, Zhu G, Wei S, Mottram P, Brumlik M, Cheng P, Curiel T, Myers L, Lackner A, Alvarez X, et al. B7-H4 expression identifies a novel suppressive macrophage population in human ovarian carcinoma. *J Exp Med* 2006;203:871–81.
 54. Kryczek I, Wei S, Zou L, Zhu G, Mottram P, Xu H, Chen L, Zou W. Cutting edge: induction of B7-H4 on APCs through IL-10: novel suppressive mode for regulatory T cells. *J Immunol* 2006;177:40–4.
 55. Onizuka S, Tawara I, Shimizu J, Sakaguchi S, Fujita T, Nakayama E. Tumor rejection by in vivo administration of anti-CD25 (interleukin-2 receptor alpha) monoclonal antibody. *Cancer Res* 1999;59:3128–33.
 56. Shimizu J, Yamazaki S, Sakaguchi S. Induction of tumor immunity by removing CD25+CD4+ T cells: a common basis between tumor immunity and autoimmunity. *J Immunol* 1999;163:5211–8.
 57. van Elsas A, Suttmuller RP, Hurwitz AA, Ziskin J, Villasenor J, Medema JP, Overwijk WW, Restifo NP, Melief CJ, Offringa R, Allison JP. Elucidating the autoimmune and antitumor effector mechanisms of a treatment based on cytotoxic T lymphocyte antigen-4 blockade in combination with a B16 melanoma vaccine: comparison of prophylaxis and therapy. *J Exp Med* 2001;194:481–9.
 58. Suttmuller RP, van Duivenvoorde LM, van Elsas A, Schumacher TN, Wildenberg ME, Allison JP, Toes RE, Offringa R, Melief CJ. Synergism of cytotoxic T lymphocyte-associated antigen 4 blockade and depletion of CD25(+) regulatory T cells in antitumor therapy reveals alternative pathways for suppression of autoreactive cytotoxic T lymphocyte responses. *J Exp Med* 2001;194:823–32.
 59. Yu P, Lee Y, Liu W, Krausz T, Chong A, Schreiber H, Fu YX. Intratumor depletion of CD4+ cells unmasks tumor immunogenicity leading to the rejection of late-stage tumors. *J Exp Med* 2005;201:779–91.
 60. Steitz J, Bruck J, Lenz J, Knop J, Tuting T. Depletion of CD25(+) CD4(+) T cells and treatment with tyrosinase-related protein 2-transduced dendritic cells enhance the interferon alpha-induced. CD8(+) T-cell-dependent immune defense of B16 melanoma. *Cancer Res* 2001;61:8643–6.
 61. Nagai H, Horikawa T, Hara I, Fukunaga A, Oniki S, Oka M, Nishigori C, Ichihashi M. In vivo elimination of CD25+ regulatory T cells leads to tumor rejection of B16F10 melanoma, when combined with interleukin-12 gene transfer. *Exp Dermatol* 2004;13:613–20.
 62. Prasad SJ, Farrand KJ, Matthews SA, Chang JH, McHugh RS, Ronchese F. Dendritic cells loaded with stressed tumor cells elicit long-lasting protective tumor immunity in mice depleted of CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells. *J Immunol* 2005;174:90–8.
 63. Golgher D, Jones E, Powrie F, Elliott T, Gallimore A. Depletion of CD25+ regulatory cells uncovers immune responses to shared murine tumor rejection antigens. *Eur J Immunol* 2002;32:3267–75.
 64. Turk MJ, Guevara-Patino JA, Rizzuto GA, Engelhorn ME, Sakaguchi S, Houghton AN. Concomitant tumor immunity to a poorly immunogenic melanoma is prevented by regulatory T cells. *J Exp Med* 2004;200:771–82.
 65. Antony PA, Piccirillo CA, Akpınarlı A, Finkelstein SE, Speiss PJ, Surman DR, Palmer DC, Chan CC, Klebanoff CA, Overwijk WW, Rosenberg SA, Restifo NP. CD8+ T cell immunity against a tumor/self-antigen is augmented by CD4+ T helper cells and hindered by naturally occurring T regulatory cells. *J Immunol* 2005;174:2591–601.
 66. Woo EY, Chu CS, Goletz TJ, Schlienger K, Yeh H, Coukos G, Rubin SC, Kaiser LR, June CH. Regulatory CD4(+)CD25(+) T cells in tumors from patients with early-stage non-small cell lung cancer and late-stage ovarian cancer. *Cancer Res* 2001;61:4766–72.
 67. Liyanage UK, Moore TT, Joo HG, Tanaka Y, Herrmann V, Doherty G, Drebin JA, Strasberg SM, Eberlein TJ, Goedegebuure PS, Linehan DC. Prevalence of regulatory T cells is increased in peripheral blood and tumor microenvironment of patients with pancreas or breast adenocarcinoma. *J Immunol* 2002;169:2756–61.
 68. Somasundaram R, Jacob L, Swoboda R, Caputo L, Song H, Basak S, Monos D, Peritt D, Marincola F, Cai D, Birebent B, Bloome E, et al. Inhibition of cytolytic T lymphocyte proliferation by autologous CD4+/CD25+ regulatory T cells in a colorectal carcinoma patient is mediated by transforming growth factor-beta. *Cancer Res* 2002;62:5267–72.
 69. Wolf AM, Wolf D, Steurer M, Gastl G, Günsilius E, Grubeck-Loebenstein B. Increase of regulatory T cells in the peripheral blood of cancer patients. *Clin Cancer Res* 2003;9:606–12.
 70. Sasada T, Kimura M, Yoshida Y, Kanai M, Takabayashi A. CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells in patients with gastrointestinal malignancies: possible involvement of regulatory T cells in disease progression. *Cancer* 2003;98:1089–99.
 71. Ichihara F, Kono K, Takahashi A, Kawaida H, Sugai H, Fujii H. Increased populations of regulatory T cells in peripheral blood and tumor-infiltrating lymphocytes in patients with gastric and esophageal cancers. *Clin Cancer Res* 2003;9:4404–8.
 72. Karube K, Ohshima K, Tsuchiya T, Yamaguchi T, Kawano R, Suzumiya J, Utsunomiya A, Harada M, Kikuchi M. Expression of FoxP3, a key molecule in CD4CD25 regulatory T cells, in adult T-cell leukaemia/lymphoma cells. *Br J Haematol* 2004;126:81–4.
 73. Marshall NA, Christie LE, Munro LR, Culligan DJ, Johnston PW, Barker RN,

- Vickers MA. Immunosuppressive regulatory T cells are abundant in the reactive lymphocytes of Hodgkin lymphoma. *Blood* 2004;103:1755–62.
74. Viguier M, Lemaitre F, Verola O, Cho MS, Gorochov G, Dubertret L, Bachelez H, Kourilsky P, Ferradini L. Foxp3 expressing CD4+CD25(high) regulatory T cells are overrepresented in human metastatic melanoma lymph nodes and inhibit the function of infiltrating T cells. *J Immunol* 2004;173:1444–53.
 75. Gray CP, Arosio P, Hersey P. Association of increased levels of heavy-chain ferritin with increased CD4+ CD25+ regulatory T-cell levels in patients with melanoma. *Clin Cancer Res* 2003;9:2551–9.
 76. Ormandy LA, Hillemann T, Wedemeyer H, Manns MP, Greten TF, Korangy F. Increased populations of regulatory T cells in peripheral blood of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma. *Cancer Res* 2005;65:2457–64.
 77. Haas M, Dimmler A, Hohenberger W, Grabenbauer GG, Niedobitek G, Distel LV. Stromal regulatory T-cells are associated with a favourable prognosis in gastric cancer of the cardia. *BMC Gastroenterol* 2009;9:65.
 78. Morgan ME, van Bilsen JH, Bakker AM, Heemskerck B, Schilham MW, Hartgers FC, Elferink BG, van der Zanden L, de Vries RR, Huizinga TW, Ottenhoff TH, Toes RE. Expression of FOXP3 mRNA is not confined to CD4+CD25+ T regulatory cells in humans. *Hum Immunol* 2005;66:13–20.
 79. Wang J, Ioan-Facsinay A, van der Voort EL, Huizinga TW, Toes RE. Transient expression of FOXP3 in human activated nonregulatory CD4+ T cells. *Eur J Immunol* 2007;37:129–38.
 80. Gavin MA, Torgerson TR, Houston E, DeRoos P, Ho WY, Stray-Pedersen A, Ocheltree EL, Greenberg PD, Ochs HD, Rudensky AY. Single-cell analysis of normal and FOXP3-mutant human T cells: FOXP3 expression without regulatory T cell development. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2006;103:6659–64.
 81. Wieczorek G, Asemussen A, Model F, Turbachova I, Floess S, Liebenberg V, Baron U, Stauch D, Kotsch K, Pratschke J, Hamann A, Loddenkemper C, et al. Quantitative DNA methylation analysis of FOXP3 as a new method for counting regulatory T cells in peripheral blood and solid tissue. *Cancer Res* 2009;69:599–608.
 82. Zhang L, Conejo-Garcia JR, Katsaros D, Gimotty PA, Massobrio M, Regnani G, Makrigiannakis A, Gray H, Schlienger K, Liebman MN, Rubin SC, Coukos G. Intratumoral T cells, recurrence, and survival in epithelial ovarian cancer. *N Engl J Med* 2003;348:203–13.
 83. Sato E, Olson SH, Ahn J, Bundy B, Nishikawa H, Qian F, Jungbluth AA, Frosina D, Gnjjatic S, Ambrosone C, Kepner J, Odunsi T, et al. Intraepithelial CD8+ tumor-infiltrating lymphocytes and a high CD8+/regulatory T cell ratio are associated with favorable prognosis in ovarian cancer. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2005;102:18538–43.
 84. Kryczek I, Wei S, Zhu G, Myers L, Mottram P, Cheng P, Chen L, Coukos G, Zou W. Relationship between B7-H4, regulatory T cells, and patient outcome in human ovarian carcinoma. *Cancer Res* 2007;67:8900–5.
 85. Kawaida H, Kono K, Takahashi A, Sugai H, Mimura K, Miyagawa N, Omata H, Ooi A, Fujii H. Distribution of CD4+CD25high regulatory T-cells in tumor-draining lymph nodes in patients with gastric cancer. *J Surg Res* 2005;124:151–7.
 86. Kono K, Kawaida H, Takahashi A, Sugai H, Mimura K, Miyagawa N, Omata H, Fujii H. CD4(+)CD25high regulatory T cells increase with tumor stage in patients with gastric and esophageal cancers. *Cancer Immunol Immunother* 2006;55:1064–71.
 87. Mizukami Y, Kono K, Kawaguchi Y, Akaike H, Kamimura K, Sugai H, Fujii H. Localisation pattern of Foxp3+ regulatory T cells is associated with clinical behaviour in gastric cancer. *Br J Cancer* 2008;98:148–53.
 88. Mizukami Y, Kono K, Kawaguchi Y, Akaike H, Kamimura K, Sugai H, Fujii H. CCL17 and CCL22 chemokines within tumor microenvironment are related to accumulation of Foxp3+ regulatory T cells in gastric cancer. *Int J Cancer* 2008;122:2286–93.
 89. Hiraoka N, Onozato K, Kosuge T, Hirohashi S. Prevalence of FOXP3+ regulatory T cells increases during the progression of pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma and its premalignant lesions. *Clin Cancer Res* 2006;12:5423–34.
 90. Grabenbauer GG, Lahmer G, Distel L, Niedobitek G. Tumor-infiltrating cytotoxic T cells but not regulatory T cells predict outcome in anal squamous cell carcinoma. *Clin Cancer Res* 2006;12:3355–60.
 91. Salama P, Phillips M, Griew F, Morris M, Zeps N, Joseph D, Platell C, Iacopetta B. Tumor-infiltrating FOXP3+ T regulatory cells show strong prognostic significance in colorectal cancer. *J Clin Oncol* 2009;27:186–92.
 92. Sinicrope FA, Rego RL, Ansell SM, Knutson KL, Foster NR, Sargent DJ. Intraepithelial effector (CD3+)/regulatory (Foxp3+) T-cell ratio predicts a clinical outcome of human colon carcinoma. *Gastroenterology* 2009;137:1270–9.
 93. Frey DM, Droeser RA, Viehl CT, Zlobec I, Lugli A, Zingg U, Oertli D, Kettelhack C, Terracciano L, Tornillo L. High frequency of tumor-infiltrating FOXP3(+) regulatory T cells predicts improved survival in mismatch repair-proficient colorectal cancer patients. *Int J Cancer* 2010;126:2635–43.
 94. Kobayashi N, Hiraoka N, Yamagami W, Ojima H, Kanai Y, Kosuge T, Nakajima A, Hirohashi S. FOXP3+ regulatory T cells affect the development and progression of hepatocarcinogenesis. *Clin Cancer Res* 2007;13:902–11.
 95. Gao Q, Qiu SJ, Fan J, Zhou J, Wang XY, Xiao YS, Xu Y, Li YW, Tang ZY. Intratumoral balance of regulatory and cytotoxic T cells is associated with prognosis of hepatocellular carcinoma after resection. *J Clin Oncol* 2007;25:2586–93.
 96. Cai XY, Gao Q, Qiu SJ, Ye SL, Wu ZQ, Fan J, Tang ZY. Dendritic cell infiltration and prognosis of human hepatocellular carcinoma. *J Cancer Res Clin Oncol* 2006;132:293–301.
 97. Wu K, Kryczek I, Chen L, Zou W, Welling TH. Kupffer cell suppression of CD8+ T cells in human hepatocellular carcinoma is mediated by B7-H1/programmed death-1 interactions. *Cancer Res* 2009;69:8067–75.
 98. Zhang JP, Yan J, Xu J, Pang XH, Chen MS, Li L, Wu C, Li SP, Zheng L. Increased intratumoral IL-17-producing cells correlate with poor survival in hepatocellular carcinoma patients. *J Hepatol* 2009;50:980–9.
 99. Numasaki M, Fukushi J, Ono M, Narula SK, Zavodny PJ, Kudo T, Robbins PD, Tahara H, Lotze MT. Interleukin-17 promotes angiogenesis and tumor growth. *Blood* 2003;101:2620–7.
 100. Takahashi H, Numasaki M, Lotze MT, Sasaki H. Interleukin-17 enhances bFGF-, HGF- and VEGF-induced growth of vascular endothelial cells. *Immunol Lett* 2005;98:189–93.
 101. Badoual C, Hans S, Rodriguez J, Peyraud S, Klein C, Agueznay Nel H, Mosseri V, Laccourreye O, Bruneval P, Fridman WH, Brasnu DF, Tartour E. Prognostic value of tumor-infiltrating CD4+ T-cell subpopulations in head and neck cancers. *Clin Cancer Res* 2006;12:465–72.
 102. Alvaro T, Lejeune M, Salvado MT, Bosch R, Garcia JF, Jaen J, Banham AH, Roncador G, Montalban C, Piris MA. Outcome in Hodgkin's lymphoma can be predicted from the presence of accompanying cytotoxic and regulatory T cells. *Clin Cancer Res* 2005;11:1467–73.

103. Oudejans JJ, Jiwa NM, Kummer JA, Ossenkuppele GJ, van Heerde P, Baars JW, Kluin PM, Kluin-Nelemans JC, van Diest PJ, Middeldorp JM, Meijer CJ. Activated cytotoxic T cells as prognostic marker in Hodgkin's disease. *Blood* 1997; 89:1376–82.
104. Younes A. Are activated cytotoxic T cells in Hodgkin's disease biopsies a poor prognostic marker? *Blood* 1997;90:890–1.
105. Karube K, Aoki R, Sugita Y, Yoshida S, Nomura Y, Shimizu K, Kimura Y, Hashikawa K, Takeshita M, Suzumiya J, Utsunomiya A, Kikuchi M, et al. The relationship of FOXP3 expression and clinicopathological characteristics in adult T-cell leukemia/lymphoma. *Mod Pathol* 2008;21:617–25.
106. Miracco C, Mourmouras V, Biagioli M, Rubegni P, Mannucci S, Monciatti I, Cosci E, Tosi P, Luzi P. Utility of tumour-infiltrating CD25+FOXP3+ regulatory T cell evaluation in predicting local recurrence in vertical growth phase cutaneous melanoma. *Oncol Rep* 2007;18: 1115–22.
107. Hussein MR. Tumour-associated macrophages and melanoma tumourigenesis: integrating the complexity. *Int J Exp Pathol* 2006;87: 163–76.
108. Coussens LM, Werb Z. Inflammation and cancer. *Nature* 2002;420:860–7.
109. Mantovani A, Allavena P, Sica A, Balkwill F. Cancer-related inflammation. *Nature* 2008;454:436–44.
110. Ostrand-Rosenberg S, Sinha P. Myeloid-derived suppressor cells: linking inflammation and cancer. *J Immunol* 2009;182:4499–506.
111. Liu H, Liu L, Liu K, Bizargity P, Hancock WW, Visner GA. Reduced cytotoxic function of effector CD8+ T cells is responsible for indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase-dependent immune suppression. *J Immunol* 2009;183: 1022–31.
112. Sorensen RB, Berge-Hansen L, Junker N, Hansen CA, Hadrup SR, Schumacher TN, Svane IM, Becker JC, thor Straten P, Andersen MH. The immune system strikes back: cellular immune responses against indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase. *PLoS One* 2009;4:e6910.