



**University of Colorado at Boulder**

**Laboratory for Atmospheric and Space Physics**

---

3665 Discovery Dr.  
Boulder, CO 80303  
Telephone: (303) 492-7672  
[nick.schneider@lasp.colorado.edu](mailto:nick.schneider@lasp.colorado.edu)

*Confidential note to the Editor on 2019JA027318RR, "Imaging of Martian circulation patterns and atmospheric tides through MAVEN/IUVS nightglow observations" by Schneider et al.*

Dear Dr. Balikhin

The comments by Reviewer 1 have in general been insightful and useful, and have improved our paper. We have, however, reached irreconcilable differences on one broad matter which spans several points of this second review. Specifically, he/she insists on the analysis of a single pixel's data in a 3-second observation, out of the 41 million such measurements used in the paper. A single pixel observation is intrinsically noisy, and we never use the data this way. We only average over hundreds or thousands of measurements giving excellent SNR, as clearly shown in the revised Figure 1. This single-pixel-mindset also prevents the reviewer from grasping the averaging approach described in a carefully crafted paragraph specifically addressing the reviewer's concerns (originally L276-286). We therefore ask you as Editor to intervene on our behalf on these items. The other substantive reviewer comments should be completely satisfied in the Response and revised manuscript.

With thanks-  
Nick Schneider