

## HAUSDORFF DIMENSION AND LIMITS OF KLEINIAN GROUPS

R.D. CANARY AND E.C. TAYLOR

### Abstract

In this paper we prove that if  $M$  is a compact, hyperbolizable 3-manifold, which is not a handlebody, then the Hausdorff dimension of the limit set is continuous in the strong topology on the space of marked hyperbolic 3-manifolds homotopy equivalent to  $M$ . We similarly observe that for any compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold  $M$  (including a handlebody), the bottom of the spectrum of the Laplacian gives a continuous function in the strong topology on the space of topologically tame hyperbolic 3-manifolds homotopy equivalent to  $M$ .

### 1 Introduction

Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold and let  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  denote the space of discrete faithful representations of  $\pi_1(M)$  into  $\mathrm{PSL}_2(\mathbf{C})$ . Given  $\rho \in \mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$ , let  $D(\rho)$  denote the Hausdorff dimension of the limit set of  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$ . A sequence  $\{\rho_i\}$  in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converges to  $\rho$  in the strong topology if and only if  $\{\rho_i\}$  converges to  $\rho$  in the compact-open topology and  $\{\rho_i(\pi_1(M))\}$  converges to  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$  geometrically.

The main result of this paper is the following theorem:

**Main Theorem.** *Let  $M$  be a compact, hyperbolizable 3-manifold which is not homeomorphic to a handlebody. Then  $D$  is continuous on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  in the strong topology.*

One can also consider the function  $\Lambda$  on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  given by letting  $\Lambda(\rho)$  be the bottom  $\lambda_0(N_\rho)$  of the spectrum of the Laplacian of the quotient manifold  $N_\rho = \mathbf{H}^3/\rho(\pi_1(M))$  associated to  $\rho$ . It follows from work of Patterson [P], Sullivan [S1], Bishop-Jones [BiJo] and Canary [C], that if  $\rho$  is topologically tame, then  $\Lambda(\rho) = D(\rho)(2 - D(\rho))$  if  $D(\rho) \geq 1$  and that  $\Lambda(\rho) = 1$  otherwise. Let  $TT(\pi_1(M))$  denote the set of topologically

---

Research of the first author was supported in part by the National Science Foundation and a fellowship from the Sloan Foundation.

tame representations in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$ . Our main theorem will follow from the following result and work of Bishop-Jones [BiJo], Canary [C] and Taylor [T].

**Theorem 4.1.** *Let  $M$  be a compact, hyperbolizable 3-manifold. If  $\{\rho_i\}$  is a sequence in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converging strongly to  $\rho$ , where  $\rho$  is geometrically finite, then  $\{\Lambda(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $\Lambda(\rho)$ .*

By combining Theorem 4.1 with work of Canary [C] we obtain the following corollary.

**COROLLARY A.** *Let  $M$  be a compact, hyperbolizable 3-manifold. Then  $\Lambda$  is continuous on  $TT(\pi_1(M))$  in the strong topology.*

The Main Theorem also gives rise to the following characterization of strong convergence in the case when the algebraic limit is geometrically finite.

**COROLLARY B.** *Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold which is not homeomorphic to a handlebody. Suppose that a sequence  $\{\rho_i\}$  in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converges (in the compact-open topology) to  $\rho \in \mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  such that  $\rho$  is geometrically finite. Then  $\{\rho_i\}$  converges strongly to  $\rho$  if and only if  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $D(\rho)$ .*

It has previously been observed, see Taylor [T], Canary-Minsky [CMi] or Bishop-Jones [BiJo], that  $D$  and  $\Lambda$  are not continuous in the compact-open (or algebraic) topology on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$ . Canary and Minsky [CMi] proved that  $\Lambda$  is continuous on the subset of purely hyperbolic representations in  $TT(\pi_1(M))$  in the algebraic and the strong topologies. McMullen [Mc] has recently proven that  $D$  is not continuous in the strong topology on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  if  $M$  is a handlebody.

Bonahon [Bo] proved that  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M)) = TT(\pi_1(M))$  if  $\pi_1(M)$  is freely indecomposable. It is conjectured that  $TT(\pi_1(M))$  always equals  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  (see Marden [M].) One conjectures that  $\Lambda$  is always continuous on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  in the strong topology.

McMullen [Mc] has independently proven a generalization of Theorem 4.1 and a variety of interesting related results. His proof makes use of the language of Patterson-Sullivan measures, while ours uses spectral theory. Related results have also been obtained by Comar-Taylor [ComT].

**Acknowledgements.** The authors would like to thank the University of Southampton and EPSRC for their support.

## 2 Preliminaries

In this section, we recall the definitions of some of the terms used in the introduction and introduce some necessary background material.

A compact, orientable 3-manifold is called *hyperbolizable* if there exists a complete hyperbolic 3-manifold homeomorphic to the interior of  $M$ . We will assume throughout the remainder of the paper that  $\pi_1(M)$  is non-abelian. (If  $\pi_1(M)$  is abelian, then both  $\Lambda$  and  $D$  are constant on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$ .)

A *Kleinian group* is a discrete subgroup of  $\mathrm{PSL}_2(\mathbf{C})$ , which we regard both as the group of conformal automorphisms of the Riemann sphere and as the group of orientation-preserving isometries of  $\mathbf{H}^3$ . A sequence  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  of Kleinian groups is said to converge *geometrically* to a Kleinian group  $\Gamma$  if every element  $\gamma \in \Gamma$  is a limit of a sequence  $\{\gamma_i \in \Gamma_i\}$ , and every accumulation point of such a sequence lies in  $\Gamma$ . A sequence  $\{\rho_i\}$  in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converges *strongly* to  $\rho$  if  $\{\rho_i\}$  converges to  $\rho$  in the compact-open topology and  $\{\rho_i(\pi_1(M))\}$  converges geometrically to  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$ . The resulting topology on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  is called the *strong topology*. (One may explicitly exhibit a basis for the strong topology on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  by combining open sets in the compact-open topology and open sets coming from the Chabauty, or geometric, topology on the space of all Kleinian groups, see section 3.1 of Canary-Epstein-Green [CEGr]. Since the resulting topology is Hausdorff and first countable it will always suffice to discuss sequences.)

The limit set  $L(\Gamma)$  of a Kleinian group  $\Gamma$  (which is not virtually abelian) is defined to be the smallest non-empty, closed subset of the Riemann sphere which is invariant under  $\Gamma$ . We define a function  $D$  on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  by letting  $D(\rho)$  denote the Hausdorff dimension of the limit set  $L(\rho(\pi_1(M)))$  of  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$ .

If  $N$  is a complete hyperbolic 3-manifold, we let  $\lambda_0(N) = \inf \mathrm{spec}(-\Delta)$  where  $\Delta = \mathrm{div}(\mathrm{grad})$  is the Laplacian. We define the function  $\Lambda$  on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  by setting  $\Lambda(\rho) = \lambda_0(N_\rho)$  where  $N_\rho = \mathbf{H}^3/\rho(\pi_1(M))$ .

The convex core  $C(N)$  of a hyperbolic 3-manifold  $N = \mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma$  is defined to be the quotient of the convex hull  $CH(L(\Gamma))$  of the limit set  $L(\Gamma)$  by  $\Gamma$ . Given any  $K \geq 0$ , let  $C_K(N)$  denote the closed metric  $K$ -neighborhood of  $C(N)$ . There is a retraction  $r_K$  of  $N$  onto  $C_K(N)$  given by taking any point in  $N$  to the unique point in  $C_K(N)$  nearest to it. (This retraction is discussed extensively in Epstein-Marden [EM].)

A hyperbolic 3-manifold  $N$  is said to be *geometrically finite* if  $C_K(N)$  has finite volume for all  $K \geq 0$ .  $N$  is said to be *topologically tame* if it is homeomorphic to the interior of a compact manifold. We will call a

representation  $\rho \in \mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  geometrically finite (or topologically tame) if  $N_\rho = \mathbf{H}^3/\rho(\pi_1(M))$  is geometrically finite (or topologically tame).

If  $N$  is a hyperbolic 3-manifold then  $\lambda_0(N) \leq \lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3) = 1$ . If  $\lambda_0(N) < 1$  and  $N$  is geometrically finite, then there exists a unique  $C^\infty$  positive eigenfunction  $\phi$  of  $-\Delta$  on  $N$  with  $L^2$ -norm 1 and the eigenvalue of  $\phi$  is  $\lambda_0(N)$  (see Lax-Phillips [LPh] or Sullivan [S2].) When it exists, we call  $\phi$  the *normalized first eigenfunction*. If  $N$  is geometrically finite and  $\lambda_0(N) = 1$ , then  $N$  does not carry any eigenfunctions of  $-\Delta$  which lie in  $L^2(N)$ .

Patterson and Sullivan first observed that there is a deep relationship between  $D$  and  $\Lambda$  if  $\rho$  is geometrically finite. In deriving the Main Theorem from Theorem 4.1 we will use the following theorem, whose statement combines results of Patterson [P], Sullivan [S1], Canary [C] and Bishop-Jones [BiJo].

**Theorem 2.1.** *Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold. If  $\rho \in TT(\pi_1(M))$  then  $\Lambda(\rho) = D(\rho)(2 - D(\rho))$  if  $D(\rho) \geq 1$ , while  $\Lambda(\rho) = 1$  otherwise.*

One may combine the main results of Canary [C] and Bishop-Jones [BiJo] to show that the volume of the convex core of a hyperbolic 3-manifold provides a lower bound for the Hausdorff dimension of its limit set.

**Theorem 2.2.** *Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold. There exists a constant  $K$  so that if  $\rho \in \mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$ , then  $D(\rho) \geq 2 - \frac{K}{\text{vol}(C(N_\rho))}$ .*

*Proof of 2.2.* If  $\text{vol}(C(N_\rho))$  is infinite, then  $N_\rho$  is geometrically infinite, so the main theorem of Bishop and Jones [BiJo] implies that  $D(\rho) = 2$ . If  $\text{vol}(C(N_\rho))$  is finite, then the main result of Canary [C] (see also Corollary B of Burger-Canary [BuC]) implies that  $D(\rho) \geq 2 - \frac{4\pi|\chi(\partial C(N_\rho))|}{\text{vol}(C(N_\rho))}$  where  $\chi(\partial C(N_\rho))$  denote the Euler characteristic of the boundary of  $C(N_\rho)$ . Since  $\chi(\partial C(N_\rho)) = \chi(\partial M)$  if  $N_\rho$  is geometrically finite (see Bowditch [Bow]), the theorem holds with  $K = 4\pi|\chi(\partial M)|$ .  $\square$

It is useful to divide a hyperbolic 3-manifold  $N$  up into thick and thin parts. Given  $\epsilon > 0$  we define  $N_{\text{thin}(\epsilon)}$  to be the set of points in  $N$  with injectivity radius at most  $\epsilon$  and  $N_{\text{thick}(\epsilon)}$  to be the set of points with injectivity radius at least  $\epsilon$ . The Margulis lemma (see Benedetti-Petronio [BPe] for example) implies that there exists  $\mathcal{M}_3 > 0$  such that if  $\epsilon < \mathcal{M}_3$  then every component of  $N_{\text{thin}(\epsilon)}$  is either a solid torus neighborhood of a closed geodesic or the quotient of a horoball in  $\mathbf{H}^3$  by a discrete group of parabolic elements preserving the horoball. If  $T$  is a component of  $N_{\text{thin}(\epsilon)}$  we let  $\mathcal{S}(T)$  denote the neighborhood of radius 1 of  $\partial T$  in  $T$ . We will often

consider the submanifold  $N_\epsilon^S$  which is taken to be  $N_{thick(\epsilon)} \cup \mathcal{S}(N_{thin(\epsilon)})$ .

**Outline of paper.** In the next two sections we will assemble the proof of Theorem 4.1 (which asserts that the lowest eigenvalue of the Laplacian is continuous on a strongly convergent sequence with a geometrically finite limit) and in section 5 we observe that the Main Theorem and its corollaries follow from Theorem 4.1 and previously known results. In a final section we describe a conjecture concerning the relationship between geometric convergence and the behavior of  $\Lambda$ .

As the next section is spent proving the technical lemmas used in the proof of Theorem 4.1, we will provide a brief outline of the proof here. A theorem of Taylor [T] insures us, since  $N_\rho$  is geometrically finite, that we may assume that  $N_i = N_{\rho_i}$  is geometrically finite for all  $i$ . Since  $\Lambda$  is upper semicontinuous, we can reduce to the case that  $\lim \lambda_0(N_i)$  exists and is less than 1. Let  $\{\phi_i\}$  be the sequence of normalized first eigenfunctions associated to  $\{\rho_i\}$ . We observe that most of the support of each  $\phi_i$  lies on a definite neighborhood  $C_K(N_i)$  of the convex core (see Lemma 3.5) and that a definite portion of the support of each  $\phi_i$  lies in the thick part  $(N_i)_\epsilon^S$  (see Lemma 3.3.) It then follows that there is a definite portion of the support contained in  $C_K(N_i) \cap (N_i)_\epsilon^S$  for all  $i$ . We then show (see Lemma 3.6) that there is a definite bound on the diameter, and hence the volume, of  $C_K(N_i) \cap (N_i)_\epsilon^S$ . Putting this together we find a point in each  $N_i$  at which  $\phi_i$  is at least some definite value. This will imply that the limit of a subsequence of  $\{\phi_i\}$  is a non-zero, positive,  $L^2$  eigenfunction of  $-\Delta$  on  $N_\rho$  whose eigenvalue is equal to  $\lim \lambda_0(N_i)$ , and hence that  $\lambda_0(N) = \lim \lambda_0(N_i)$ .

### 3 The Lemmas

We first prove that if  $N$  is geometrically finite and  $\lambda_0(N) \neq 1$ , then some definite proportion of the normalized eigenfunction is supported on the thick part of the manifold. The proof relies on the following generalization of Lemma 2 in Dodziuk-Randol [DR]. The proof of Lemma 3.1, which relies on the fact that if  $T$  is a component of  $N_{thin(\epsilon)}$  then  $\lambda_0(T) \geq 1$ , is the same as that of Lemma 2 in [DR].

LEMMA 3.1 (Dodziuk-Randol [DR]). *Let  $0 < \epsilon < \mathcal{M}_3$  and  $\delta > 0$ . There exists a constant  $\alpha > 0$  such that if  $N$  is a hyperbolic 3-manifold,  $T$  is a component of  $N_{thin(\epsilon)}$ ,  $T \neq \mathcal{S}(T)$ , and  $f \in C^1(N) \cap L^2(N)$  such that*

1.  $\int_T f^2 \geq c,$
2.  $\int_{\mathcal{S}(T)} |\nabla f|^2 \leq \alpha c,$  and

3.  $\int_{S(T)} f^2 \leq \alpha c,$

then

$$\int_T |\nabla f|^2 \geq (1 - \delta)c.$$

We will also make repeated use of Yau’s Harnack inequality (see [Y]) which we state in the restricted setting in which we use it.

LEMMA 3.2 (Yau’s Harnack Inequality). *There exists a constant  $R$  such that if  $N$  is a complete hyperbolic 3-manifold and  $\phi$  is a positive  $C^\infty$ -eigenfunction of  $-\Delta$  with eigenvalue between 0 and 1, then  $|\nabla\phi(x)| \leq R\phi(x)$  for all  $x \in N$ .*

We are now prepared to prove that the  $L^2$ -norm of the restriction of the normalized first eigenfunction to the thick part is bounded from below.

LEMMA 3.3. *Given  $0 < \epsilon < \mathcal{M}_3$  and  $\delta_1 > 0$ , there exists  $C > 0$  such that if  $N$  is a geometrically finite hyperbolic 3-manifold,  $\lambda_0(N) \leq 1 - \delta_1$ , and  $\phi$  is its normalized first eigenfunction, then*

$$\int_{N_\epsilon^S} \phi^2 \geq C.$$

*Proof of 3.3.* Since  $\lambda_0(N) \geq 0$ ,  $\delta_1 \leq 1$ . Lemma 3.1 assures that we can choose  $\alpha > 0$  such that if  $f \in C^1(N) \cap L^2(N)$ ,  $\int_{N_{thin(\epsilon)}} f^2 \geq c$ ,  $\int_{S(N_{thin(\epsilon)})} |\nabla f|^2 \leq \alpha c$ , and  $\int_{S(N_{thin(\epsilon)})} f^2 \leq \alpha c$ , then  $\int_{N_{thin(\epsilon)}} |\nabla f|^2 \geq (1 - \frac{\delta_1}{2})c$ . Let  $C = \min = \{ \frac{\delta_1}{2}, \frac{\alpha}{2R^2} \}$  where  $R$  is the constant in Yau’s Harnack inequality. If  $\int_{N_\epsilon^S} \phi^2 \leq C$ , then the above inequalities hold with  $c = 1 - \frac{\delta_1}{2}$ . Therefore,

$$\int_{N_{thin(\epsilon)}} |\nabla\phi|^2 \geq \left(1 - \frac{\delta_1}{2}\right)^2 > 1 - \delta_1 \geq \lambda_0(N)$$

which contradicts the fact that  $\int_N |\nabla\phi|^2 = \lambda_0(N)$ . This establishes our claim. □

We next observe that a definite portion of the support of the normalized first eigenfunction of a geometrically finite hyperbolic 3-manifold lies in a definite radius neighborhood of the convex core. We first obtain the following generalization of Proposition 4.2 in Burger-Canary [BuC] which asserts that outside a definite neighborhood of the convex core the normalized first eigenfunction decays exponentially at a definite rate.

LEMMA 3.4. *Given  $\delta_1 > 0$  there exists  $B > 0$  and  $\delta_2 > 0$  such that if  $N$  is a geometrically finite hyperbolic 3-manifold with  $\lambda_0(N) < 1 - \delta_1$ ,*

$\phi$  is its normalized first eigenfunction, and  $d(x, C(N)) > B$ , then  $\phi(x) \leq e^{-(1+\delta_2)d(x, r_B(x))} \phi(r_B(x))$ .

*Proof of 3.4.* Let  $N = \mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma$ . We will work in the ball model for  $\mathbf{H}^3$ . Given  $\xi \in S^2 = \partial\mathbf{H}^3$ , let  $f_\xi : \mathbf{H}^3 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be given by  $f_\xi(x) = \frac{1-|x|^2}{|x-\xi|^2}$ . For any  $x \in \mathbf{H}^3$ , the geodesic ray determined by  $\nabla f_\xi(x)$  ends at  $\xi$  and  $|\nabla f_\xi(x)| = f_\xi(x)$  for all  $x$ .

Patterson and Sullivan (see [S2]) proved that if  $N$  is geometrically finite,  $\lambda_0(N) < 1$  and  $\phi$  is its normalized first eigenfunction, then there exists a measure  $\mu$  on  $S^2$  which is supported on the limit set of  $\Gamma$  such that if we define

$$\tilde{\phi}(x) = \int_{S^2} (f_\xi(x))^{\delta(N)} d\mu,$$

for all  $x \in \mathbf{H}^3$  (where  $\lambda_0(N) = \delta(N)(2 - \delta(N))$  and  $\delta(N) > 1$ ), then  $\tilde{\phi}$  descends to the map  $\phi$ . In particular, there exists  $1 > d > 0$  such that if  $\lambda_0(N) < 1 - \delta_1$ , then  $\delta(N) > 1 + d$ .

We may choose  $B$  large enough so that if  $y$  lies on the positive portion of the  $x_3$ -axis and  $d(0, y) \geq B$ , then if  $u$  and  $v$  are any two unit vectors in  $T_y(\mathbf{H}^3)$  whose associated geodesic rays end in the southern hemisphere then  $u \cdot v \geq 1 - \frac{d}{2}$ .

We now claim that if we choose  $B$  in this manner then the above statement is true with  $\delta_2 = \frac{d}{2} - \frac{d^2}{2}$ . Given  $x \in N - C_B(N)$ , let  $x'$  denote a point in the preimage of  $x$  in  $\mathbf{H}^3$ . We may normalize so that  $x'$  lies on the positive  $x_3$ -axis and  $\tilde{r}_0(x') = 0$  (where  $\tilde{r}_K$  is the nearest point retraction of  $\mathbf{H}^3$  onto the closed neighborhood of radius  $K$  of  $CH(L(\Gamma))$ ). In this normalization,  $L(\Gamma)$  lies entirely in the southern hemisphere.

If  $y$  is a point on the  $x_3$ -axis between  $x'$  and  $\tilde{r}_B(x')$  and  $\xi \in L(\Gamma)$ , then

$$\nabla(f_\xi(y)^{\delta(N)}) \cdot \vec{u}_y \geq (1 + d) \left(1 - \frac{d}{2}\right) f_\xi(y)^{\delta(N)} = (1 + \delta_2) f_\xi(y)^{\delta(N)}$$

where  $\vec{u}_y$  is the unit vector in  $T_y(\mathbf{H}^3)$  pointing towards the origin. Therefore,

$$\nabla\tilde{\phi}(y) \cdot \vec{u}_y \geq (1 + \delta_2)\tilde{\phi}(y).$$

We then establish the desired inequality by integrating  $\nabla\tilde{\phi}$  along the positive  $x_3$ -axis from  $x'$  to  $\tilde{r}_B(x')$  and noticing that  $\tilde{r}_B(x')$  covers  $r_B(x)$ .       $\square$

We use this to prove

**LEMMA 3.5.** *Given  $\delta_1 > 0$  and  $\delta_3 > 0$ , there exists  $K > 0$  such that if  $N$  is a geometrically finite hyperbolic 3-manifold,  $\lambda_0(N) \leq 1 - \delta_1$ , and  $\phi$  is its*

normalized first eigenfunction then

$$\int_{C_K(N)} \phi^2 \geq 1 - \delta_3.$$

*Proof of 3.5.* Choose  $B$  and  $\delta_2$  as given by Lemma 3.4. Let  $h : N - C_B(N) \rightarrow \partial C_B(N) \times (0, \infty)$  be given by  $h(x) = (r_B(x), d(x, r_B(x)))$ . As in the proof of Theorem 2.3.1 of Epstein-Marden [EM], we see that  $h$  is Lipschitz and that there exist constants  $D > 0$  and  $D' > 0$  so that

$$De^{2d(x, r_B(x))} \leq \frac{1}{|dh(x)|} \leq D'e^{2d(x, r_B(x))}$$

almost everywhere. Therefore, for all  $T > S \geq 0$ ,

$$\int_{C_{B+T}(N) - C_{B+S}(N)} \phi^2 \leq D' \int_{\partial C_B(N)} \int_S^T e^{-2\delta_2 t} \phi^2(x) dA dt$$

(where  $dA$  denotes the area measure on  $\partial C_B(N)$ ) which implies that

$$\int_{C_{B+T}(N) - C_{B+S}(N)} \phi^2 \leq \frac{D'}{2\delta_2} (e^{-2\delta_2 S} - e^{-2\delta_2 T}) \int_{\partial C_B(N)} \phi^2 dA.$$

On the other hand, applying Yau's Harnack inequality we see that if  $x \in N - C_B(N)$ , then  $\phi(x) \geq e^{-Rd(x, r_B(x))} \phi(r_B(x))$ . Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{C_{B+1}(N) - C_B(N)} \phi^2 &\geq D \int_{\partial C_B(N)} \int_0^1 e^{-2Rt} \phi^2(x) dA dt \\ &\geq \frac{D}{2R} (1 - e^{-2R}) \int_{\partial C_B(N)} \phi^2 dA. \end{aligned}$$

Since,  $\int_{C_{B+1}(N) - C_B(N)} \phi^2 \leq 1$ , we see that

$$\int_{\partial C_B(N)} \phi^2 dA \leq \frac{2R}{D(1 - e^{-2R})}.$$

Therefore, if we set

$$S = \frac{\log(D'R) - \log(\delta_2 \delta_3 D(1 - e^{-2R}))}{2\delta_2},$$

then

$$\int_{N - C_{B+S}(N)} \phi^2 \leq \delta_3.$$

Let  $K = B + S$  and the claim is established.  $\square$

We now need to know some basic facts about the convergence of the convex cores in our sequence. The following argument is a generalization of arguments given in Taylor's paper [T].



LEMMA 3.6. *Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold,  $0 < \epsilon < \mathcal{M}_3$  and  $K > 0$ . Let  $\{\rho_i\}$  be a sequence of representations in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converging strongly to a geometrically finite representation  $\rho$ . Then there exists a constant  $A > 0$  such that the diameter of  $(N_i)_\epsilon^S \cap C_K(N_i)$  is less than  $A$  for all sufficiently large  $i$ .*

In the proof of Lemma 3.6, and later in the proof of Theorem 4.1, we will make use of the following alternative characterization of geometric convergence (see Canary-Epstein-Green [CEGr] or Benedetti-Petronio [BPe] for a proof.)

LEMMA 3.7. *Let  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  be a sequence of Kleinian groups converging geometrically to  $\Gamma$ . Let  $N_i = \mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_i$  and  $N = \mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma$ . There exists a sequence  $\{(r_i, k_i)\}$  and a sequence of maps  $\tilde{f}_i : B_{r_i}(0) \rightarrow \mathbf{H}^3$  such that*

1.  $r_i \mapsto \infty$  and  $k_i \mapsto 1$ ,
2. the map  $\tilde{f}_i$  is a  $k_i$ -biLipschitz diffeomorphism onto its image,  $\tilde{f}_i(0) = 0$ , and  $\{\tilde{f}_i|_A\}$  converges to the identity on any compact set  $A$ , and
3.  $\tilde{f}_i$  descends to an embedding  $f_i : V_i \rightarrow N$  where  $V_i = B_{r_i}(0)/\Gamma_i$  is a submanifold of  $N_i$ .

*Proof of 3.6.* Let  $N_i = N_{\rho_i}$  and  $N = N_\rho$ , and let  $\{f_i : V_i \rightarrow N\}$  be the sequence of biLipschitz embeddings given by Lemma 3.7. Proposition 3.3 in Canary-Minsky [CMi] implies that for all large enough  $i$ ,  $(f_i)_*$  is conjugate to  $\rho \circ \rho_i^{-1} \circ (j_i)_*$  where  $j_i : V_i \rightarrow N_i$  is the inclusion map.

We first note that  $N_\delta^S \cap C(N)$  has bounded diameter for all  $\delta$ , since  $N$  is geometrically finite (see Bowditch [Bow].) We first choose  $0 < \epsilon'' < \epsilon' < \epsilon$  such that every closed geodesic  $\gamma$  in  $N$  either lies entirely in  $N_{\epsilon'}^S$  or entirely in  $N_{thin(\epsilon')}$ , in which case we set  $\gamma' = \gamma$ , or has a homotopic representative  $\gamma'$  lying entirely in  $N_{\epsilon''}^S \cap C(N)$  all of whose segments are of length at least  $L$  and are either geodesic subarcs of  $\gamma$  ending in  $\partial N_{thin(\epsilon')}$  or lie entirely in  $\partial N_{thin(\epsilon')}$  and are geodesics in the induced metric on  $\partial N_{thin(\epsilon')}$ . (By choosing  $\epsilon'$  and  $\epsilon''$  sufficiently small, we can make  $L$  as large as we like.) Let  $X$  be obtained from  $N_{\epsilon''}^S \cap C(N)$  by appending every compact component of  $N_{thin(\epsilon'')}$ . Then every representative  $\gamma'$  constructed as above lies in  $X$ .

We assume that we have chosen  $i$  large enough so that  $k_i \leq 2$  and  $X \subset f_i(V_i)$ . Given a closed geodesic  $\gamma$  in  $N$ , let  $\gamma_i$  denote the closed geodesic in  $N_i$  in the homotopy class of  $f_i^{-1}(\gamma')$ . One shows using hyperbolic trigonometry, as in Taylor [T], that there exists  $D > 0$  such that for all large enough  $i$  and all  $\gamma$ ,  $\gamma_i$  lies in  $\mathcal{N}_D(f_i^{-1}(\gamma')) \cup (N_i)_{thin(\epsilon)}$ . For large enough  $i$ , every closed geodesic in  $N_i$  either lies entirely in  $(N_i)_{thin(\epsilon)}$  or is homotopic to  $f_i^{-1}(\gamma')$  for some closed geodesic  $\gamma$  in  $N$ . Hence, every closed geodesic

in  $N_i$  lies in  $\mathcal{N}_D(f_i^{-1}(X)) \cup (N_i)_{thin(\epsilon)}$  for all large enough  $i$ . Since there exists a uniform constant  $E > 0$  such that any point in the convex core of any hyperbolic 3-manifold lies within  $E$  of a closed geodesic, it follows that  $(N_i)_\epsilon^S \cap C(N_i)$  lies in  $\mathcal{N}_{D+E}(f_i^{-1}(X))$  for all large enough  $i$ . Since the diameter of  $f_i^{-1}(X)$  is at most twice the diameter of  $X$  for large enough  $i$ , it follows that  $(N_i)_\epsilon^S \cap C(N_i)$  has diameter at most  $2diam(X) + (D + E)$  for all sufficiently large  $i$ . It is easy to check that  $(N_i)_\epsilon^S \cap C_K(N_i)$  is contained in  $\mathcal{N}_{2K}((N_i)_\epsilon^S \cap C(N_i))$ , so  $(N_i)_\epsilon^S \cap C_K(N_i)$  has diameter at most  $2diam(X) + D + E + 2K$  for all sufficiently large  $i$ .  $\square$

### 4 The Proof of Theorem 4.1

**Theorem 4.1.** *Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold. If  $\{\rho_i\}$  is a sequence in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converging strongly to  $\rho$  so that  $\rho$  is geometrically finite. Then  $\{\Lambda(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $\Lambda(\rho)$ .*

*Proof of 4.1.* The main theorem of Taylor [T] assures us that  $\rho_i(\pi_1(M))$  is geometrically finite for all large enough  $i$ . It is well known, see for example Lemma 5.2 in Canary-Minsky-Taylor [CMiT], that if  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  converges geometrically to  $\Gamma$ , then  $\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma) \geq \limsup \lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_i)$ . Thus,  $\Lambda(\rho) \geq \limsup \Lambda(\rho_i)$ . We may pass to a subsequence  $\{\rho_j\}$  of  $\{\rho_i\}$  such that  $\{\Lambda(\rho_j)\}$  converges to  $L = \liminf \Lambda(\rho_i)$  and  $\rho_j$  is geometrically finite for all  $j$ . We will prove that  $\Lambda(\rho) = L$  which will suffice to establish the theorem. If  $L = 1$ , then by upper semicontinuity of  $\Lambda$  and the fact that  $\Lambda(\rho) \leq \lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3) = 1$ , we see that  $\Lambda(\rho) = 1$  and we are done. Thus, we may assume that  $L < 1$  and hence that  $\Lambda(\rho_j) \leq 1 - \delta_1 < 1$  for all sufficiently large  $j$  and some  $\delta_1 > 0$ .

Let  $N_j = N_{\rho_j}$  and  $N = N_\rho$  and let  $\{f_j : V_j \rightarrow N\}$  be the sequence of biLipschitz embeddings given by Lemma 3.7. Let  $\phi_j$  be the normalized first eigenfunction associated to  $\lambda_0(N_j)$  and let  $p_j : \mathbf{H}^3 \rightarrow N_j$  be the covering map. Choose  $\mathcal{M}_3 > \epsilon > 0$ . We may assume, without loss of generality, that  $b_j = p_j(0) \in (N_j)_\epsilon^S \cap C(N_j)$  for all  $j$ .

Lemma 3.3 implies that there exists  $C > 0$  such that  $\int_{(N_j)_\epsilon^S} \phi_j^2 \geq C$  for all  $j$ . Lemma 3.5 implies that there exists  $K > 0$  such that  $\int_{C_K(N_j)} \phi_j^2 \geq 1 - \frac{C}{2}$  for all  $j$ . Therefore,

$$\int_{C_K(N_j) \cap (N_j)_\epsilon^S} \phi_j^2 \geq \frac{C}{2}$$

for all  $j$ .

Lemma 3.6 implies that there exists  $A > 0$  such that  $C_K(N_j) \cap (N_j)_\epsilon^S$

has diameter less than  $A$ , for all sufficiently large  $j$ , and hence has volume less than the volume, say  $V$ , of the ball of radius  $A$  in  $\mathbf{H}^3$ . Hence, for all sufficiently large  $j$ , there exists a point  $x_j \in C_K(N_j) \cap (N_j)_\epsilon^S$  such that  $\phi_j(x_j) \geq \sqrt{\frac{C}{2}}/V$ .

Let  $\{\tilde{\phi}_j : \mathbf{H}^3 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}\}$  denote the lifts of  $\{\phi_j\}$  to  $\mathbf{H}^3$ . Yau's Harnack inequality implies that  $\tilde{\phi}_j(0) = \phi_j(b_j) \geq \frac{\sqrt{C/2}}{V e^{KA}}$  for all sufficiently large  $j$ . Basic elliptic theory and Yau's Harnack inequality, then imply that a subsequence, still called  $\{\tilde{\phi}_j\}$ , of  $\{\tilde{\phi}_j\}$  converges (uniformly on compact sets) to a non-zero, positive function  $\tilde{\phi}$  on  $\mathbf{H}^3$  which is an eigenfunction for  $-\Delta$  with eigenvalue  $L$ . Since  $\{\rho_j(\pi_1(M))\}$  converges geometrically to  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$ ,  $\tilde{\phi}$  descends to a function  $\phi$  on  $N$ . Since  $\{\phi_j \circ f_j^{-1}\}$  converges (uniformly on compact sets) to  $\phi$ , it is easy to check that  $\int_N \phi^2 \leq 1$ . Thus,  $\phi$  is a multiple of the normalized first eigenfunction of  $N$ . Therefore,  $\lambda_0(N) = \Lambda(\rho) = L$  which completes the proof.  $\square$

REMARKS. (1) The above proof can be easily generalized to obtain an analogous result in any dimension. It may also be generalized to yield McMullen's analogue of Theorem 4.1 which allows for a weaker notion of strong convergence.

(2) One might similarly ask if the discrete spectra of  $N_{\rho_i}$  converge to the discrete spectrum of  $N_\rho$ . See Colbois-Courtois [CoCou], Chavel-Dodziuk [ChD] and Ji [J] for related work on finite volume hyperbolic 3-manifolds.

## 5 The Proofs of the Main Theorem and Corollaries

We first use Theorem 4.1 to prove the Main Theorem.

**Main Theorem.** *Let  $M$  be a compact, hyperbolizable 3-manifold which is not homeomorphic to a handlebody. Then  $D$  is continuous on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  in the strong topology.*

*Proof of Main Theorem.* First suppose that  $M$  is not an  $I$ -bundle and that the sequence  $\{\rho_i\} \subset \mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converges to  $\rho$  in the strong topology.

If  $\rho$  is geometrically finite, then the main result of [CT] implies that  $\Lambda(\rho) \neq 1$ . Theorem 4.1 then implies that  $\{\Lambda(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $\Lambda(\rho)$ . One then applies Theorem 2.1 to see that  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $D(\rho)$ .

If  $\rho$  is not geometrically finite then  $D(\rho) = 2$  and  $vol(C(N)) = \infty$ . Since the volume of the convex core is a continuous function in the strong topology (see Taylor [T])  $\lim vol(C(N_i)) = \infty$ . (One may also argue more

directly in the geometrically infinite setting, as in the proof of Lemma 7.1 in Canary-Minsky [CMi], that  $\lim \text{vol}(C(N_i)) = \infty$ .) Theorem 2.2 then implies that  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to 2. Therefore,  $D$  is continuous in the strong topology on  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  if  $M$  is not an  $I$ -bundle.

Suppose that  $M$  is an  $I$ -bundle over a closed surface and  $\{\rho_i\}$  converges to  $\rho$  in the strong topology. If  $\rho$  is geometrically finite and  $\Lambda(\rho) < 1$ , or  $\rho$  is geometrically infinite, then the proof that  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $D(\rho)$  is just as above. If  $\Lambda(\rho) = 1$  and  $\rho$  is geometrically finite, then the main result of Canary-Taylor [CT] implies that  $\rho$  is convex cocompact. (In fact,  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$  contains a Fuchsian subgroup of index at most 2.) Marden's Stability Theorem [M] then implies that there is an open neighborhood  $W$  of  $\rho$  in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  consisting of representations quasiconformally conjugate to  $\rho$ . It is then a standard consequence of results of Gehring and Väisälä [GV], see for example the proof of Corollary D in Canary-Minsky [CMi], that  $D$  is continuous on  $W$ . (In fact, Corollary D in [CMi] implies immediately that  $D$  is continuous on  $W$ .) In particular,  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $D(\rho)$  in this case as well. Therefore,  $D$  is a continuous function in the strong topology of  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  if  $M$  is an  $I$ -bundle over a closed surface.  $\square$

Corollary A follows immediately from the Main Theorem and Theorem 2.1 if  $M$  is not a handlebody. We will give a self-contained proof.

**COROLLARY A.** *Let  $M$  be a compact, hyperbolizable 3-manifold. Then  $\Lambda$  is continuous on  $TT(\pi_1(M))$  in the strong topology.*

*Proof of Corollary A.* Let  $\{\rho_i\}$  be a sequence in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converging strongly to  $\rho \in TT(\pi_1(M))$ . If  $\rho$  is geometrically finite, then Theorem 4.1 implies immediately that  $\{\Lambda(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $\Lambda(\rho)$ . If  $\rho$  is not geometrically finite, then it is shown in Canary [C] that  $\Lambda(\rho) = 0$ . As above, this implies that  $\lim \text{vol}(C(N_{\rho_i})) = \infty$ . It then follows from the main result of Canary [C] that  $\{\Lambda(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $\Lambda(\rho)$ .  $\square$

Corollary B follows from the Main Theorem and results of Bishop-Jones [BiJo] and Canary-Taylor [CT].

**COROLLARY B.** *Let  $M$  be a compact hyperbolizable 3-manifold which is not homeomorphic to a handlebody. Suppose that a sequence  $\{\rho_i\}$  in  $\mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  converges (in the compact-open topology) to  $\rho \in \mathcal{D}(\pi_1(M))$  such that  $\rho$  is geometrically finite. Then  $\{\rho_i\}$  converges strongly to  $\rho$  if and only if  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $D(\rho)$ .*

*Proof of Corollary B.* If  $\{\rho_i\}$  converges strongly to  $\rho$ , then it follows immediately from the Main Theorem that  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  converges to  $D(\rho)$ .

In order to complete the proof we will suppose that  $\{\rho_i\}$  does not converge strongly to  $\rho$  and show that  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  does not converge to  $D(\rho)$ .

If  $\rho_i$  is geometrically infinite for infinitely many  $i$ , then, by work of Bishop and Jones [BiJo],  $D(\rho_i)=2$  for infinitely many  $i$ , so  $\limsup D(\rho_i)=2$ . However, since  $\rho$  is geometrically finite, Sullivan [S1] and Tukia [Tu] showed that  $D(\rho) < 2$ . So, in this case,  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  does not converge to  $D(\rho)$ .

We may now assume that  $\rho_i$  is geometrically finite for all  $i$ . We first pass to a subsequence,  $\{\rho_j\}$ , so that  $\{\rho_j(\pi_1(M))\}$  converges geometrically to a torsion-free Kleinian group  $\hat{\Gamma}$  which contains  $\rho(\pi_1(M))$  as an infinite index subgroup (see Jørgensen-Marden [JøM].) Notice that since  $M$  is not a handlebody, the main result of Canary-Taylor [CT] implies that  $D(\rho_i) \geq 1$  for all  $i$  and that  $D(\rho) \geq 1$ . Lemma 5.2 in Canary-Minsky-Taylor [CMiT] implies that  $\lambda_0(\hat{N}) \geq \limsup \Lambda(\rho_j)$  where  $\hat{N} = \mathbf{H}^3/\hat{\Gamma}$ . Since  $D(\rho) \geq 1$ , Theorem 1 of Canary-Taylor [CT] implies that  $\Lambda(\rho) > \lambda_0(\hat{N})$ . Hence,  $\Lambda(\rho) > \limsup \Lambda(\rho_j)$ . Since  $\rho_j$  is geometrically finite for all  $j$ , Theorem 2.1 implies that  $D(\rho) < \liminf D(\rho_j)$ , which implies that  $\{D(\rho_j)\}$  does not converge to  $D(\rho)$  and hence that  $\{D(\rho_i)\}$  does not converge to  $D(\rho)$ .       $\square$

## 6    A Conjecture

There are many examples in which a sequence  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  of Kleinian groups converges geometrically to a Kleinian group  $\Gamma$ , yet  $\{\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_i)\}$  does not converge to  $\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma)$ . (See, for instance, Taylor [T] or Comar-Taylor [ComT].) The easiest way to construct such examples is to let  $\Theta$  be a fixed Kleinian group such that  $\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Theta) \neq 1$ , and let  $\gamma$  be an element of  $\text{PSL}_2(\mathbf{C})$  neither of whose fixed points lie in the limit set  $L(\Theta)$ . If we let  $\Gamma_j = \gamma^j \Theta \gamma^{-j}$ , then  $\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_j) = \lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Theta)$  for all  $j$ , but  $\{\Gamma_j\}$  converges to the trivial group  $\Gamma = \{1\}$ , and  $\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma) = 1$ . Moreover, in all the examples known to us there exists (up to subsequence) a sequence  $\{\gamma_i\}$  of elements of  $\text{PSL}_2(\mathbf{C})$  such that  $\{\gamma_i \Gamma_i \gamma_i^{-1}\}$  converges to a Kleinian group  $\Gamma'$  and  $\{\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_i)\}$  converges to  $\lambda_0(\Gamma')$ . This leads us to make the following conjecture.

**CONJECTURE.** *Let  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  be a sequence of Kleinian groups such that each  $\Gamma_i$  is generated by at most  $K$  elements. Then there exists a subsequence  $\{\Gamma_j\}$  of  $\{\Gamma_i\}$  and a sequence of elements  $\{\gamma_j \in \text{PSL}_2(\mathbf{C})\}$  such that  $\{\gamma_j \Gamma_j \gamma_j^{-1}\}$  converges geometrically to  $\Gamma$  and  $\lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma) = \lim \lambda_0(\mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_j)$ .*

As evidence we notice that the argument used to establish Theorem 4.1, also establishes the above conjecture in the case that there exists a uniform

bound on the diameter of  $C(N_i) \cap (N_i)_\varepsilon^S$  where  $N_i = \mathbf{H}^3/\Gamma_i$ .

## References

- [BPe] R. BENEDETTI, C. PETRONIO, Lectures on Hyperbolic Geometry, Springer-Verlag Universitext, 1992.
- [BiJo] C. BISHOP, P.W. JONES, Hausdorff dimension and Kleinian groups, *Acta Math.* 179 (1997), 1–39.
- [Bo] F. BONAHOON, Bouts des variétés hyperboliques de dimension 3, *Annals of Math.* 124 (1986), 71–158.
- [Bow] B.H. BOWDITCH, Geometrical finiteness for hyperbolic groups, *J. Func. Anal.* 113 (1993), 245–317.
- [BuC] M. BURGER, R.D. CANARY, A lower bound for  $\lambda_0$  for geometrically finite hyperbolic  $n$ -manifolds, *J. reine angew. Math.* 454 (1994), 37–57.
- [C] R.D. CANARY, On the Laplacian and the geometry of hyperbolic 3-manifolds, *J. Diff. Geom.* 36 (1992), 349–367.
- [CEGr] R.D. CANARY, D.B.A. EPSTEIN, P. GREEN, Notes on notes of Thurston, in “Analytical and Geometrical Aspects of Hyperbolic Spaces,” Cambridge University Press (1987), 3–92.
- [CMi] R.D. CANARY, Y.N. MINSKY, On limits of tame hyperbolic 3-manifolds, *J. Diff. Geom.* 43 (1996), 1–41.
- [CMiT] R.D. CANARY, Y.N. MINSKY, E.C. TAYLOR, Spectral theory, Hausdorff dimension and the topology of hyperbolic 3-manifolds, *Journal of Geometric Analysis*, to appear.
- [CT] R.D. CANARY, E.C. TAYLOR, Kleinian groups with small limit sets, *Duke Math. J.* 73 (1994), 371–381.
- [ChD] I. CHAVEL, J. DODZIUK, The spectrum of degenerating hyperbolic 3-manifolds, *J. Diff. Geom.* 39 (1994), 123–137.
- [CoCou] B. COLBOIS, G. COURTOIS, Convergence de varietes et convergence du spectre du Laplacien, *Ann. Sci. École Norm. Sup.* 24 (1991), 507–518.
- [ComT] T. COMAR, E.C. TAYLOR, Geometrically convergent Kleinian groups and the lowest eigenvalue of the Laplacian, *Indiana Math. J.* 47 (1998), 601–623.
- [DR] J. DODZIUK, B. RANDOL, Lower bounds for  $\lambda_1$  on a finite volume hyperbolic manifold, *J. Diff. Geom.* 24 (1986), 133–139.
- [EM] D.B.A. EPSTEIN, A. MARDEN, Convex hulls in hyperbolic spaces, a theorem of Sullivan, and measured pleated surfaces, in “Analytical and Geometrical Aspects of Hyperbolic Spaces”, Cambridge University Press (1987), 113–253.
- [GV] F.W. GEHRING, J. VÄISÄLÄ, Hausdorff dimension and quasiconformal mappings, *Journal of the L.M.S.* 6 (1973), 504–512.
- [J] L. JI, Spectral convergence for degenerating sequences of three-

- dimensional hyperbolic manifolds, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* 348 (1996), 2673–2688.
- [JøM] T. JØRGENSEN, A. MARDEN, Algebraic and geometric convergence of Kleinian groups, *Math. Scand.* 66 (1990), 47–72.
- [LPh] P. LAX, R.S. PHILLIPS, The asymptotic distribution of lattice points in Euclidean and non-Euclidean spaces, *J. Funct. Anal.* 46 (1982), 280–350.
- [M] A. MARDEN, The geometry of finitely generated Kleinian groups, *Annals of Math.* 99 (1974), 383–462.
- [Mc] C.T. MCMULLEN, Hausdorff dimension and conformal dynamics I: Strong convergence of Kleinian groups, preprint.
- [P] S.J. PATTERSON, Lectures on limit sets of Kleinian groups, in “Analytical and Geometrical Aspects of Hyperbolic Spaces,” Cambridge University Press (1987), 281–323.
- [S1] D. SULLIVAN, Entropy, Hausdorff measures old and new, and limit sets of geometrically finite Kleinian groups, *Acta. Math.* 153 (1984), 259–277.
- [S2] D. SULLIVAN, Aspects of positivity in Riemannian geometry, *J. Diff. Geom.* 25 (1987) 327–351.
- [T] E.C. TAYLOR, Geometric finiteness and the convergence of Kleinian groups, *Communications in Analysis and Geometry*, 8 (1997), 497–533.
- [Tu] P. TUKIA, The Hausdorff dimension of the limit sets of geometrically finite Kleinian groups, *Acta Math.* 152 (1984), 127–140.
- [Y] S.T. YAU, Harmonic functions on complete Riemannian manifolds, *Comm. Pure Appl. Math.* 28 (1975), 201–228.

Richard D. Canary and Edward C. Taylor

Department of Mathematics

University of Michigan

Ann Arbor, MI 48109C

USA

canary@math.lsa.umich.edu      ectaylor@math.lsa.umich.edu

Submitted: January 1998