

Environmental Law NGOs and Social Media Use: An Analysis of Strategies and Organizational Impacts

A THESIS

Submitted to the University of Michigan Department of Political Science
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Honors Bachelor of Arts
Department of Political Science

Kate Lambert
April 2014
Advised by Dr. Julia Wondolleck

ABSTRACT

When analyzing the existing literature regarding social media and environmental law NGOs, it becomes evident that there is a lack in research and understanding of how these two entities are connected. The literature that does exist about social media predominantly addresses how social interactions are mediated by the new technology, the expansion of the ‘information age’ and marketing strategies for businesses. The literature about environmental law NGOs focuses on their foundation and the political and legal implications of their work. There is little organizational analysis of the intersection between social media use and effects on environmental law non-government organizations.

This research is designed to bridge this gap. It focuses on how and why environmental law organizations employ social media, as well as how they perceive its usefulness for their organization. The content of the organizations’ Facebook and Twitter pages will be examined, as these are the most popular social media forums. To add another perspective, interviews were conducted with those who manage the organizations’ social media accounts. The four most prominent environmental law NGOs were the focus of this study: The Center for Biological Diversity, Earthjustice, Environmental Defense Fund, and Natural Resources Defense Council.

I found that in my research, environmental law NGOs are using social media for relatively the same goals, which include branding, increasing their potential audience, engagement, and to some extent, fundraising. There are some general patterns among their behavior in terms of the content of their social media pages. Nevertheless, environmental law NGOs are able to distinguish themselves from among their peers. Each organization manages its social media page in a unique way with different levels of resources. Overall, it seems that social media is successful at achieving environmental law NGOs intended goals and is considered an important outreach strategy both presently and in the future.

Social media is a remarkable tool that has extensively influenced the way people interact with each other and institutions. Its effects reverberate throughout society and it is undeniably changing how organizations structure themselves within as well as how they formulate mobilization and outreach strategies. This research is the first study of this type. As such, it will provide insights into potential influence of social media on environmental law NGOs and their implications for the future of these organizations.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Throughout the research and drafting of my thesis, I relied on many people for moral support, academic guidance, and helpful contributions to my work. First off, I would like to thank my parents for all of their support during my undergraduate experience. This year has been particularly trying, but I was able to successfully finish my thesis with their words of reassurance and belief in my abilities.

I would also like to express my appreciation of those who I was able to interview from the organizations I studied: Clayton Norman from the Center for Biological Diversity, Lauren Guite from the Environmental Defense Fund, Ray Wan from Earthjustice, and Liz Langton from the Natural Resources Defense Council. I am so thankful that they all took the time out of their schedules to help me further develop my thesis, and I hope that my work can provide them with a unique perspective on their social media activity.

I thank Mika LaVaque-Manty for being a wonderful mentor, “cheerleader,” grammar expert, and impromptu psychologist over this past year. He provided a classroom setting that was fun, engaging, collaborative, and encouraging. I could not think of a more knowledgeable and patient person to serve in his position.

My utmost gratitude goes to my thesis advisor, Professor Julia Wondolleck. Professor Wondolleck took me under her wing my freshman year by taking a chance and hiring me as her research assistant, enabling me to further my interest in environmentalism. It was my position as her research assistant that inspired me to write this thesis, and provided me with the background I needed to perform original research. Professor Wondolleck has been an amazing mentor and friend during throughout my college experience. I cannot express fully my gratefulness for her words of encouragement and personal investment in both my thesis and my overall success.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ii
Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION	5
Chapter 2 BACKGROUND	8
2.1 SOCIAL MEDIA.....	8
2.1.1 Facebook.....	9
2.1.2 Twitter	11
2.2 SOCIAL MEDIA AS AN ORGANIZING DEVICE FOR NGOS.....	12
Chapter 3 LITERATURE REVIEW	15
3.1 ENVIRONMENTAL LAW NGOs.....	15
3.1.1 DDT and the Formation of the Environmental Defense Fund	17
3.1.2 Scenic Hudson and the Formation of the Natural Resources Defense Council	18
3.1.3 Mineral King and the Formation of Earthjustice	20
3.1.4 Protection of the Mexican Spotted Owl and the Formation of the Center for Biological Diversity	22
3.1.5 Connection to Social Media	23
3.2 SOCIAL MEDIA.....	25
Chapter 4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS & HYPOTHESES.....	30
Chapter 5 METHODS	38
5.1 CONTENT ANALYSIS.....	38
5.2 INTERVIEWS.....	48
Chapter 6 FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS.....	54
6.1 NATURE OF SOCIAL MEDIA STAFFING.....	54
6.2 GOALS.....	57
6.3 TARGET AUDIENCE	61
6.4 ENGAGEMENT.....	65
6.4.1 Overall Support	65
6.4.2 Activity-Specific Support.....	67
6.5 ACTIVITY CLASSIFICATION	72

6.5.1	Topics Analysis	72
6.5.2	Categories Analysis.....	80
6.5.3	Focus Analysis	82
6.5.4	Current Events.....	85
6.5.5	Links and Website Traffic.....	86
6.6	ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES	88
6.6.1	Visuals.....	90
6.6.2	Direct Engagement with Comments and Messages.....	93
6.6.3	Organization-Specific.....	95
6.7	MEASURING SUCCESS	99
6.7.1	Testing	101
6.8	VALUE OF SOCIAL MEDIA	102
Chapter 7 CONCLUSION.....		104
7.1	POSSIBILITIES FOR FUTURE RESEARCH.....	109
7.2	FUTURE IMPLICATIONS	109
Bibliography		113
Appendix A: Center for Biological Diversity Facebook Posts		116
Appendix B: Center for Biological Diversity Twitter Tweets		131
Appendix C: Earthjustice Facebook Posts		139
Appendix E: Environmental Defense Fund Facebook Posts		178
Appendix F: Environmental Defense Fund Twitter Tweets		190
Appendix G: Natural Resources Defense Council Facebook Posts.....		197
Appendix H: Natural Resources Defense Council Twitter Tweets		219

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

Social media offers a way in which people can easily learn what is occurring within an organization and participate in its movements, initiatives, and activities. Organizations can use social media to develop their image and branding, increase the visibility of their concerns and goals, encourage social and political action, and engage a wider audience. In addition, free resources provide by social media sites as well as software allow organizations to analyze determine the success of their outreach and if they are indeed reaching their preferred audience.

To gain an understanding of the organizational implications of social media to environmental law organizations, I assess how and why nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) that primarily engage in litigation strategies utilize social media and with what effect. Narrowing this study's scope to "environmental law NGOs" enables a comparative analysis of social media use and its impacts on a subset of organizations with closely aligned missions and strategies. This research examines the social media activity of four well-known and successful environmental law NGOs: the Center for Biological Diversity ("CBD" or "the Center"), Earthjustice, Environmental Defense Fund ("EDF"), and the Natural Resources Defense Council ("NRDC"). While there are numerous social media platforms, the focus of this study is on two of the most prominent websites – Facebook and Twitter.

Social media platforms provide a new outreach mechanism for environmental organizations. In particular, it increases their ability to connect with potential donors and supporters, rally support for their campaigns, and enhance their overall visibility. Social media has the power to revitalize environmental law NGOs, whose aging membership/support is

literally dying out.¹ Most of the organizations I examine sprouted in the 1970s. During that time, environmentalism became a popular movement, especially after Rachel Carson's iconic *Silent Spring* was published. People who involved themselves with the newly formed environmental law NGOs are therefore much older now. A recent Pew Research Center Study found that older Americans born in the Baby Boomer and Silent Generation (during the Great Depression) are more likely to consider themselves environmentalists.² In order to have longevity of support and funding to maintain themselves, organizations must now try to capture a wider, younger audience. The fast-paced, continuously changing world of social media is geared towards youth, and if it used shrewdly, has the opportunity to garner the support of younger generations. It is therefore crucial for organizations interested in maintaining themselves in the long-term to make effective use of outreach strategies, and social media is an innovative tool to accomplish this task.

While 350.org is not an environmental law NGO, it provides an excellent example of the revolutionizing force of social media. By harnessing the power of social media, 350.org has been able to define itself as a successful global force with established movements in over 180 countries. 350.org was founded by environmental journalist Bill McKibben in 2008 to inspire climate action at the grassroots level.³ As a new environmental organization, 350.org saw the potential of today's younger generations and realized that the use of social media and other technologies could be used as organizing tools.⁴ As of March 2014, 350.org has more than

¹ Hanscom, "Urban Outfitters."

² Suh, "Few Millennials Describe Themselves as Environmentalists."

³ 350.org, "What We Do."

⁴ Schor, "ADVOCACY: The Education of a Climate Upstart with a 'Weird' Name."

325,000 likes of its Facebook page and over 179,000 Twitter followers, far outpacing other major environmental groups like the Sierra Club and Natural Resources Defense Council.⁵

350.org's efforts in the United States this past year have been especially focused on defeating the Keystone XL Pipeline, and social media has served as a crucial tool. In March 2014, 350.org was put in the national spotlight after organizing a civil disobedience protest against the pipeline in which protestors (many of whom were college students) were arrested for handcuffing themselves to the White House fence.⁶ Facebook and Twitter were used to spread the word about the sit-in.⁷ In February 2014 350.org launched an online 24-hour campaign to encourage more than 500,000 Americans to tell the Senate to oppose the Keystone XL Pipeline.⁸ According to McKibben, "The environmental movement is well wired and well connected, and it's got lots and lots of young people who are ready to use social media in powerful ways."⁹ He believes his organization's unique approach to climate action "will take the environmental movement into the wired age."¹⁰

This thesis explores the ways in which environmental law organizations are currently using social media. How and why are environmental law NGOs currently using social media? What types of audiences do they target? What issues do these organizations focus on in their social media outreach? Is social media proving worthwhile to them? These are just a few of the questions that I probe through this research. A two-step approach is employed, first examining the social media pages of each organization, followed by interviews with staff members responsible for each organization's social media output.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ 350.org, "Keystone XL Protest at the White House Leads to Mass Arrests."

⁷ 350.org, "Social Media vs. Big Money."

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

Chapter 2

BACKGROUND

2.1 SOCIAL MEDIA

Social media is an interesting new interface of society today. It has transformed the way that people lead their daily lives and altered human communication. In fact, according to Nielsen, Americans spent twenty percent of their time using PCs and thirty percent of their time on mobile devices using social media networks in 2012.¹¹ Bearing in mind how much time Americans spend on social media sites each day, they have become an integral new forum of outreach at all levels, corporate, non-profit and non-governmental.

Social media also has multiple functions. Most visibly, it facilitates the branding of organizations; they are given great power to portray themselves as they want, which can often be limited in other forms of outreach like mailings. Furthermore, social media provides a simple venue to raise awareness and concern about important issues, and allows a wide variety of interests to be easily communicated. The ‘quick’ nature of Facebook and Twitter posts allows concerns to be stated succinctly, appealing to a more general audience.

Along with raising issue awareness, calls to action can be made. Organizations are able to advertise events on Facebook on Twitter, mobilizing audiences more quickly and in greater numbers. Events can be range from socials and protests to “virtual” events, such as petition drives and “TweetStorms,” which are “coordinated action[s] by many users to send the same tweet out at the same time, generating a ‘storm’ of tweets.”¹² Events can be advertised to other Facebook users when their Facebook friends agree to attend them. Being able to see their friends’ commitment may encourage people to become interested in the organization as well.

¹¹ Nielsen, *State of the Media: The Social Media Report 2012*, 4.

¹² “Digital Activism Tactics.”

Lastly, social media sites are important in that they garner support for the NGOs. Although some people may ultimately decide not to become dues-paying members, their support is still symbolic for the organization and may prompt the attention of others.

2.1.1 Facebook

Facebook was launched in 2004. It is currently the most popular social media website in the world, with 1 billion users worldwide.¹³ Corporations and organizations use Facebook to portray their mission and convey what they have to offer to the public.

The Facebook “wall” is this media’s key feature. It is essentially a user’s profile, which summarizes their Facebook activity. A “status update” allows users to tell their Facebook friends what is on their mind or what they are doing, and shows up in the “news feeds” of their friends. “Status updates” are also referred to “posts.”¹⁴ In addition to sharing thoughts, Facebook users can share pictures and videos on their pages. Recently, Facebook has referred to people’s profiles as “personal Timelines” which are for “individual, non-commercial use.”¹⁵ Facebook changed its format to “Timeline” in 2012, which facilitates searches of Facebook users’ past activity all the way back to their first days on Facebook.¹⁶ Facebook “friends” are people who agree to let each other see each other’s profiles, enabling them to view each other’s profiles and interact by commenting on each other’s activity.

Pages provide another way in which Facebook users can connect. “Facebook pages look similar to personal Timelines, but they offer unique tools for connecting people to a topic they

¹³ Guynn, “Facebook Hits 1 Billion Users, Reaching Historic Milestone.”

¹⁴ For the purpose of my research, I will use the term “post” for status updates and cover photo changes. A cover photo is the picture that appears in the background of a Facebook profile. Additions to photo albums shall not be included in posts.

¹⁵ “How Are Pages Different from Personal Timelines.”

¹⁶ Facebook, “Timeline: Now Available Worldwide.”

care about, like a business, brand, organization or celebrity.”¹⁷ The data collected for this study is extracted from the main Facebook pages of the four organizations I am analyzing, introduced below.

The “News Feed” is a major feature of Facebook, serving as the main hub of Facebook activity. The News Feed is a chronological timeline of the Facebook activity of friends, pages, and advertisements. According to Facebook, “News Feed stories include status updates, photos, videos, links, app activity, and likes.”¹⁸ Facebook is a very visual site, so the News Feed is often dominated by pictures – whether they are posted by Facebook friends or just advertisements.

Facebook enables many methods of communication. One-on-one communications occurs when users make posts on each other’s walls, comment on the wall posts of friends or pages, or send Facebook messages. The term “like” was popularized through Facebook. A “like” is a show of appreciation of the activity of another user, whether it be a status update, a comment, photo, video, etc. Pages can also be “liked,” indicating a user is a fan of the overall page (in contrast to “liking” a single post on the page) and wants to see its profile updates.¹⁹ In analysis of Facebook data, “page likes” are distinguished from “likes”, although Facebook uses the term “like” for both.²⁰ According to Facebook, “when you like a page, you are making a connection... You may be displayed on the Page you connected to, in advertisements about the Page...”²¹ A general like applies to the content of a page, such as thoughts, pictures, and videos on the page. In addition to liking posts, users can “share” the Facebook posts of their friends or pages they like, meaning that post will come up in the newsfeeds of others. In addition, users may add a “personalized

¹⁷ “How Are Pages Different from Personal Timelines.”

¹⁸ Facebook, “How News Feed Works.”

¹⁹ Note that “like” will be used without quotations after this point. If the word “like” is used in a context other than “such as,” it shall refer to a Facebook “like.”

²⁰ Facebook, “What Does It Mean to Like a Page or Content off of Facebook?”

²¹ Ibid.

message” to the content that they are sharing.²² Sharing allows users to be associated with that particular content, and often are a way of indirectly expressing personal views.

2.1.2 *Twitter*

Twitter was created in March of 2006. It has become one of the fastest-growing social media websites, with over 200 million users.²³ Unlike Facebook, which is almost like a digital “scrapbook” because it is picture-heavy, Twitter is more fast-paced with quick news. Users typically “tweet” more often than they would update their Facebook statuses.²⁴ Twitter has become prevalent among businesses, many of which have Twitter pages advertising their products. Twitter is also popular among journalists, who often use the social network to share their work and breaking news updates. Journalists that “live-tweet” a current event can substantially increase their Twitter clout. For example, a journalist who provided live updates on the trial of Whitey Bulger, the elusive crime boss, gained over 1,000 new “followers” during the period of the trial.²⁵

Twitter is based on “tweets”, which are quick, 140 character statements such as stories, headlines, or even just individuals’ thoughts. A user’s tweets are featured on their “profile”.²⁶ To associate a post with a particular “person, place, thing, or event,” a “hashtag” is used.²⁷ According to Twitter, hashtags can be quite useful for journalists, increasing “engagement with other Twitter users by almost 100% for journalists and 50% for news organizations.”²⁸ A “Twitter handle” is a Twitter username, indicated as @[username] in tweets. For example, the

²² Facebook, “Share Button.”

²³ O’Carroll, “Twitter Active Users Pass 200 Million.”

²⁴ This is an observation I have made as a user of both Twitter and Facebook.

²⁵ Twitter, “Twitter for Newsrooms and Journalists.”

²⁶ Twitter, “The Twitter Glossary.”

²⁷ Twitter, “Twitter for Newsrooms and Journalists.”

²⁸ Ibid.

CBD's Twitter handle is @CenterForBioDiv. In order to see another person or organization's tweets, one must request to "follow" them. Twitter notes that "following" someone means "subscribing to their tweets as a follower" and providing them the ability to "direct message" the "follower."²⁹ In addition, their tweets will appear on the follower's Home Twitter feed.³⁰ If the request to follow is permitted, one is considered a "follower" of that Twitter page. Typically, organizations waive the setting that requires their permission for people to follow their page. The "Home" page on Twitter shows a "real-time list of tweets from those you follow."³¹

One can "retweet" what another Twitter user says, meaning that the tweet of another user will show up on one's own feed, while continuing to be identified with the original author. A retweet is the equivalent of a Facebook share. Twitter defines retweeting as, "The act of forwarding another user's Tweet to all of your followers."³² Another way to express approval of a tweet is to "favorite" it, similar to a Facebook like.

2.2 SOCIAL MEDIA AS AN ORGANIZING DEVICE FOR NGOS

Social media can be used as a tool for activists seeking to mobilize people to support their cause. Facebook and Twitter are forms of outreach that are efficient and cost-effective. It does not cost organizations much to make the page itself, but only to advertise it. An organization may eventually be able to cut down the cost of advertising when they gain a sufficient amount of social media followers, as these people essentially provide free advertisement by re-posting, commenting or "liking" a post. Environmental law NGOs have jumped onto the social media bandwagon, becoming part of new forum in which they can contact and interact with the public.

²⁹ Twitter, "FAQs about Following."

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Twitter, "The Twitter Glossary."

³² Ibid.

It is interesting to examine environmental NGOs in the context of social media. Many of the United States' big environmental organizations, like the Sierra Club and The Nature Conservancy, started due to grassroots efforts. Social media can revitalize this grassroots activism as it appeals to the interest of individuals to become involved in an issue, and suggests that change can take place from a ground-up level. Because of social media, participants of a movement do not have to live close together as was the case with historical environmental grassroots activism. Social media enables easy communication and organizing across great distances. As discussed previously, social media presents a major opportunity for environmental organizations to redefine themselves in the public eye in a way that will be highly noticed. Examining how environmental NGOs take advantage of this new opportunity and how it reinforces or expands their missions and identities can shed light on a significant transition point in their organizational histories.

Exploring environmental law NGOs in particular allowed a more narrow focus on a few organizations for a more in-depth analysis. Furthermore, environmental law NGOs differ from other environmental organizations in several notable ways. Whereas environmental organizations employ many different tactics to achieve their environmental aims, whether it be building movements, creating petitions, lobbying political officials for policy influence, increasing awareness, or even just building connections between like-minded people, environmental law organizations mostly employ legal strategies to advance their objectives. They perceive the judicial system as an effective way to go about protecting the environment and they have become well respected and established in this niche. The distinct strategies of environmental law NGOs is discussed further in the forthcoming literature.

It is also worth noting what environmental law NGOs require to support their activity. While both public support and funding are necessary organizational resources, funding is often more crucial for environmental law NGOs because they accrue their “environmental wins” mainly from litigation. The legal process is particularly costly considering lawyers’ salaries, court costs, background research to support cases, and the like. The social presence supplied by activism and volunteering is more integral to the status and effectiveness of general environmental organizations, like the Sierra Club and Audubon Society. A contributing factor is that the role of membership is likely different. Unlike other environmental organizations that involve dues-paying members, public events, protests, and other outreach, environmental law NGOs may be less likely to create an organizational culture for their supporters and instead be concerned about receiving donations from a wide array of people. Environmental law NGOs may have to save a larger amount of their revenue for litigation than typical organizations, potentially increasing their ability to hold more traditional events that inculcate a feeling of membership. Having an awareness of the financial needs of environmental law NGOs would therefore be valuable when analyzing the substance of their social media efforts and whether or not this need is translated in their methods of outreach.

Chapter 3

LITERATURE REVIEW

The world of social media websites is relatively new, and represents an innovative opportunity to communicate, advertise and engage. Most research about social media concerns individual and corporate use. While non-profit use has received some research attention, there has been little in-depth analysis. The current literature regarding environmental organizations' use of social media is limited, and even more limited for environmental law NGOs. However, there is literature on the history and evolution of environmental organizations and the establishment of environmental law NGOs. There is also a growing literature on social media use in general, which can help guide the research questions in this study and explain some observations of environmental law NGOs social media activity.

3.1 ENVIRONMENTAL LAW NGOs

A major difference between environmental law NGOs and general environmental organizations are the tactics they employ to defend the environment. Not only do environmental law NGOs file lawsuits, but they also engage in case appeals, legal advocacy (i.e. *amicus curiae* briefs), regulatory lobbying for stringent policies, and serve as a watchdog to ensure that agencies are fully implementing the law. For example, the Environmental Defense Fund contributed to the emission standards proposal for the 1990 Clean Air Act.³³ Daniel Farber elaborates upon the legal tactics employed by environmental law NGOs, such as “litigation on behalf of environmental quality” and the “effective use of litigation and other procedural delays to stall adverse agency action,” thereby providing an alternative to solely relying on agency

³³ Farber, “Politics and Procedure in Environmental Law,” 71.

enforcement of laws.³⁴ Although environmental NGOs may occasionally adopt some of these approaches, they leave most of the lawsuits in the hands of environmental law NGOs and instead focus their efforts on other strategies like mobilizing activists, protests, lobbying, boycotts, petitions, raising issue awareness, and fostering appreciation of nature as well as a sense of community among members. Due to their different course of action when compared with the general environmental organizations, it is likely environmental law NGOs' social media strategies will also be geared towards their distinctive role in litigation work.

To begin this research, it is necessary to explore the underpinnings of the formation of environmental law NGOs, as the emergence of organizations defines their mission and goals. Understanding why these organizations formed and their specific purposes might help explain their use of social media.

What gained a symbolic role in the environmental movement as a whole also stirred the foundations of the innovative sub-movement of environmental litigation efforts. Rachel Carson's *Silent Spring* portrayed the problems associated with the ubiquitous use of DDT, and not only inspired 'ecological awakening' within the United States, but also provided the underpinnings of what was to become the legal case that introduced the idea of environmental justice. According to Boston College of Law Professor Zygmunt Plater, "the basic analytical approach and policy values underlying environmental law came from a fundamental paradigm shift born of Rachel Carson in 1961."³⁵

³⁴ Farber, "Politics and Procedure in Environmental Law," 72-73.

³⁵ Plater, "From the Beginning, a Fundamental Shift of Paradigms: A Theory and Short History of Environmental Law," 981.

3.1.1 DDT and the Formation of the Environmental Defense Fund

The DDT debacle also engendered the first environmental organization whose main concerns were legal. After reading *Silent Spring*, bird lovers in Stony Brook, Long Island wanted to act to protect their local ospreys. They formed a local group called the Brookhaven Town Natural Resources Coalition, which included bird-lovers, scientists and lawyers. The organization tried to increase awareness of the issue as well as devise a way to combat the problem of DDT, and “sue the bastards” was suggested at one conference.³⁶ The union of science and law resulted when the BTNRC teamed up with a local lawyer, leading to a court-imposed ban on DDT and rousing the realization that a litigation approach to environmental protection might actually be viable. The events that transpired in the Long Island court later led to the governor of New York outlawing use of DDT.³⁷

Out of this victory emerged the first formal environmental law NGO, the Environmental Defense Fund. The Ford Foundation supported it financially.³⁸ A “sue the bastards!” stance was more prominent during the EDF’s emergence, but was later discouraged in an effort portray the organization as more professional.³⁹ The impact of EDF’s involvement with DDT suggested that bringing an issue to court could prompt a governmental legal response to remedy an environmental injustice, providing the underpinnings for environmental law as a whole.

Somewhat like its beginnings, The Environmental Defense Fund today continues to focus on ecosystem health and pollution. As described on the EDF website, “We work to preserve the natural systems on which life depends, focusing on the most critical environmental problems.”⁴⁰

Their four main areas of focus include climate and energy, sustainable oceans policies,

³⁶ Dowie, *Losing Ground*, 34.

³⁷ Environmental Defense Fund, “Our Mission and History.”

³⁸ Plautz, “Market Approach.”

³⁹ Gottlieb, *Forcing the Spring: The Transformation of the American Environmental Movement*, 138.

⁴⁰ Environmental Defense Fund, “What We Do.”

ecosystem conservation, and human health. EDF seems to have replaced its “sue the bastards” position with a “work with the bastards” stance. EDF is now distinguished by its willingness to partner with corporations such as McDonald’s and Wal-Mart for sustainability initiatives.⁴¹ The organization defines itself as “economically literate,” which is supported by its willingness to negotiate with fracking companies and logging corporations.⁴²

3.1.2 Scenic Hudson and the Formation of the Natural Resources Defense

Council

The *Scenic Hudson Preservation Council v. Federal Power Commission*, also known as the Storm King case, broadened the scope of the newly-formed field of environmental litigation and has been a defining case in the environmental litigation movement. In 1962, New York power company Consolidated Edison planned to construct the third largest hydro-electric plant in the world along the Hudson River on Storm King Mountain. The project concerned those who wanted to use the area for recreational purposes as well as those who wished to maintain the aesthetic integrity of the Hudson River area, an important source of inspiration for many written and artistic works. A core group of concerned local individuals created called the Scenic Hudson Preservation Council.⁴³ They filed a lawsuit against the Federal Power Commission, reaching the federal circuit court system. The case set a new legal precedent that enabled lawsuits by citizens and citizen groups, even when they incurred no direct economic harm due to an activity disrupting the environment. Thus, the loss of aesthetic enjoyment was considered to be an adequate claim for standing. The new standing standards ensured progress for future

⁴¹ Plautz, “Market Approach.”

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Saxon, “Stephen Duggan, Environmentalist, Dies at 89.”

environmental law NGOs and extended their opportunities to use the court system to combat threats to nature without having to commoditize the environment.

The Natural Resources Defense Council, one of the first environmental litigation organizations, was created in part due to the landmark *Scenic Hudson Preservation Council v. the Federal Power Commission*. The case – also referred to as ‘Storm King’ – set a new legal precedent in regards to citizen standing, enabling lawsuits by citizens and citizen groups to sue because of damages to the environment even when they incurred no direct harm. For the first time, non-economic damages were considered to have a legitimate value within the American judicial system and a conservation organization was given standing in court to represent the public interest.⁴⁴

In the early 1970s, Gustave Speth – who would later become one of the NRDC’s founders– and some of his fellow graduating Yale Law students were hoping to be able to translate their interests in environmental policy into an actual legal field which at that time did not exist.⁴⁵ The group formed the Legal Environmental Assistance Fund at Yale, later teaming up with the lawyers involved in the *Storm King* case to form NRDC.⁴⁶ NRDC made sure to define itself as focused on legal aspects of environmental issues to separate itself from other popular environmental groups at the time such as the Audubon Society or Nature Conservancy, decreasing the likelihood of overlap with the efforts of other organizations. John Adams, a co-founder of the organization notes, “we were saying that we would be [the big groups’] mouthpiece, and in that way we wouldn’t step on toes.”⁴⁷

⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁵ Gottlieb, *Forcing the Spring: The Transformation of the American Environmental Movement*, 139.

⁴⁶ Dowie, *Losing Ground*, 35.

⁴⁷ Gottlieb, *Forcing the Spring: The Transformation of the American Environmental Movement*, 141.

NRDC has clearly defined itself as an effective and distinctive group and has become a highly successful litigation organization with approximately “1.3 million members and online activists.”⁴⁸ It is considered one of the most professional of the environmental organizations that engage in litigation work and is respected in policymaking.⁴⁹ NRDC appears to stay true to their reputation of professionalism, refusing to join acts of civil disobedience in protest, for example, the recent Keystone Pipeline protests in Washington D.C. “Upholding the law is central to its mission,” explains Chemnick.⁵⁰ Although NRDC’s first concern lied with maintaining the environment for aesthetic and recreation purposes in the Storm King case, it has greatly expanded the issues that it works on. NRDC’s primary focuses include fighting global warming, fostering clean energy, preserving ocean ecosystems, the protection of endangered organisms and places, pollution prevention, safe water, and sustainable communities. NRDC is also concerned with environmental justice, recycling, and a wide variety of other policy issues.⁵¹

3.1.3 Mineral King and the Formation of Earthjustice

The Supreme Court case, *Sierra Club v. Morton*, also addressed the issue of standing in a way that led to gains for environmental law NGOs and contributed to the foundation of Earthjustice, formerly known as the Sierra Club Legal Defense Fund. The case arose when the Disney corporation announced its intentions to purchase land in California’s Mineral King Valley to build a ski resort. Despite mobilized opposition to the project, it seemed unstoppable. The Sierra Club adjusted its approach and instead decided to file a lawsuit, which reached the Supreme Court in a case questioning the Sierra Club’s standing.⁵² Although the Sierra Club

⁴⁸ Natural Resources Defense Council, “About NRDC: Who We Are.”

⁴⁹ Gottlieb, *Forcing the Spring: The Transformation of the American Environmental Movement*, 143.

⁵⁰ Chemnick, “From Legal Mavericks.”

⁵¹ Natural Resource Defense Council, “Environmental Issues and Solutions to Current Environment Problems.”

⁵² Baude, “*Sierra Club v. Morton*,” 203.

ultimately lost the case, what they won was a gain for the environmental litigation movement as a whole. The decision “reversed the FPC’s holding that one must have ‘personal economic injury’ to have standing.”⁵³ While the Storm King case also established this standing, it did so within the circuit courts and thus the issue of standing could have been appealed. *Sierra Club v. Morton* formally “established the right of citizens to sue to protect natural resources.”⁵⁴

Environmental NGOs therefore were able to participate in lawsuits as long as they have at least one member who could be “injured” by the project, including in non-economic terms as was established in the Storm King Case. According to Justice Stewart, “It is clear that an organization whose members are injured may represent those members in a proceeding for judicial review.”⁵⁵

A few of the attorneys that were involved with the Morton case chose to continue their environmental advocacy work, leading to the formation of the Sierra Club Legal Defense Fund (“SCLDF”) with the knowledge that litigation was a feasible option given the standing decision. SCLDF was a separate organization from the Sierra Club but complemented many of its interests within the field of litigation. In 1997 the name was changed to Earthjustice to better distinguish it as a distinct organization from the Sierra Club with its own separate agenda.⁵⁶

Earthjustice is concerned with a wide array of environmental issues. Similar to NRDC, it is one of the environmental law NGOs with the broadest range of focus, acting as a general environmental steward. Its priorities include wildlife and habitat preservation, pollution

⁵³ Oakes, “Environmental Litigation,” 532.

⁵⁴ Switzer, *Environmental Activism*, 144.

⁵⁵ *Sierra Club v. Morton*, 405 727 (U.S. Supreme Court 1972), 739.

⁵⁶ Earthjustice, “Our History.”

protection and combatting global warming with sources of clean energy.⁵⁷ Earthjustice employs over seventy-five attorneys.⁵⁸

3.1.4 Protection of the Mexican Spotted Owl and the Formation of the Center for Biological Diversity

The Center for Biological Diversity (“CBD”), an infamous yet effective litigation organization, was established in connection with the Endangered Species Act. Its founders, Kieran Suckling and Peter Galvin, had become disenchanted with what they perceived to be the environmental movement’s approach of compromise and decided to employ a fiercer tactic towards accomplishing their goal of protecting the environment. One of their most important cases that acted as jurisprudence for later cases regarded the Mexican Spotted Owl. Concerned with the owl’s welfare, “Suckling and Galvin merged their two groups, Friends of the Owl and the Gila Biodiversity Project, into the Regional Southwest Center for Biological Diversity.”⁵⁹ The Center sued the Forest Service, making use of the Endangered Species Act to stop the logging of the land on the owl’s behalf. They also wrote petitions to the Forest Service. CBD won the case, which resulted in a recovery plan for the spotted owl.⁶⁰ Soon after they dropped “Regional Southwest” from their name.⁶¹

The Endangered Species Act continues to be the main weapon for the CBD, whose efforts are still largely focused on the protection of endangered species. Their website notes, “Because diversity has an intrinsic value, and because its loss impoverishes society, we work to

⁵⁷ Earthjustice, “Our Work.”

⁵⁸ Earthjustice, “Staff.”

⁵⁹ Humes, *Eco Barons*, 130.

⁶⁰ Humes, *Eco Barons*, 134.

⁶¹ Humes, *Eco Barons*, 134.

secure a future for all species, big and small, hovering on the brink of extinction.”⁶² Since passage of the Endangered Species Act, action by CBD added seventy percent of the plants and animals currently listed to the endangered classification, and “more than 70 million acres of wildlands have been preserved as habitats for these endangered species.”⁶³ Some consider the group radical and that it values animals more than humans, but it cannot be denied that they are effective in advocating on behalf of endangered species.⁶⁴

The Center for Biological Diversity and by extension other organizations that use similar strategies are often criticized for being extremist and non-compromising. Environmental litigation organizations thus act as a check against governments that may decide to ignore environmental regulations that they disagree with. In the 1970s, lawyers expected that environmental law would be about suing the ‘bad guys’ – the corporations and industries that break environmental laws and desecrate the environment. Like the founders of CBD, environmental lawyers soon realized that even the government could be an adversary: “environmentalists have joined a long list of American political activists who have realized from bitter experience that the government does not enforce its own laws, and that citizens and citizen organizations must do so themselves.”⁶⁵

3.1.5 Connection to Social Media

There are many parallels between the historical groundwork of environmental law groups and their social media use today. Political and judicial developments had to occur for environmental law NGOs to form, but these organizations in turn created political and judicial developments as well. Social media, too, can influence how these NGOs function while they use

⁶² Environmental Defense Fund, “Our Mission and History.”

⁶³ Humes, *Eco Barons*, 99.

⁶⁴ Blackmon, “The ‘Sue And Settle’ Racket.”

⁶⁵ Dowie, *Losing Ground*, 37.

it to further their aims. Both court cases and social media therefore represent an opportunity for engagement, outreach, mobilization, and self-definition.

As noted by Peter Lehner, “NGOs fundamentally altered what had been a bilateral, often isolated dialogue between polluter and regulator into a trilateral and often multilateral debate that included those affected in ways other than solely their pocket book.”⁶⁶ Social media also presents an opportunity to expand the confines of debate due to the increased possibility of outreach to the general public. Environmental law NGOs can utilize social media as a force to empower and involve the masses in environmental discussions and policymaking. Those who are concerned can voice their opinions via social media and provide environmental law organizations with concerns, opinions and perspectives they can consider when making agendas or analyzing cases.

Both legal developments and technological developments within social media additionally have an impact on the organizational strategies of environmental law NGOs and the tactics they employ to get things accomplished. The precedents set by legal cases in regards to issues like standing and the expansion of environmental laws within the United States catalyzed the success of many environmental law NGOs. Each advancement and institutional change allotted environmental organizations more power to take a stand against the exploitation of nature and portrayed them as legitimate and meaningful entities for people also interested in protecting the environment. This enlargement of power meant environmental law NGOs had to create an organizational structure on which they would operate and that allowed them to exist in the long-term. Like their environmental NGO counterparts, environmental law NGOs also needed funding, so they reached out to the public for donations and members. Money was especially important so that they did not just have to depend on the whims of pro bono lawyers and could have their own consistent legal staff. Social media comes into play here now forty

⁶⁶ Lehner, “Environment, Law, and Nonprofits,” 21.

years later as it becomes another method by which organizations can reach their funding goals. Traditional methods of outreach like mailings and e-mails are instead replaced with a more direct contact that allows for instant feedback. Social media also can be an organizational tool in that is a form of ‘free advertising’, like their legal battles. Oftentimes people will become familiar with environmental law NGOs because of news reporting on their lawsuits and the verdicts on those suits. Social media also allows the organizations a way of getting their name out to the world, but has the added benefit that the organization can choose how it presents itself to the outside world.

3.2 SOCIAL MEDIA

Social media use is ubiquitous in the United States, with Americans spending over 121 billion minutes on social networking sites in only one month.⁶⁷ Clearly, social media networks have gained a large role within society, creating implications at the individual, business, organizational, and governmental levels. While there is little literature concerning the ways in which social media is used by environmental law NGOs, there is a wealth of information in other areas that complements my research.

There is a trove of research that analyzes social media strategies of businesses, which could possibly be related to non-governmental organizations. Like businesses, organizations – including environmental law NGOs – go through a process of branding. Branding is the way in which a corporation or organization portrays itself to the world and is framed with a target audience in mind. A simple form of branding is a slogan. For instance, the Natural Resources Defense Council refers to itself as “the earth’s best defense”. Successful branding contributes to the goal of attracting as many people as possible to a product, service or cause.

⁶⁷ Nielsen, *State of the Media: The Social Media Report 2012*, 6.

Turner and Shaw, authors of *How to Make Money with Social Media: An Insider's Guide on Using New and Emerging Media to Grow Your Business*, refer to the 'social media magnetism' of online branding. They note, "If your brand has social media magnetism, it's so powerful that people are attracted to it the way metal is attracted to a magnet. Your brand is so powerful that people will go out of their way to be affiliated with your company, because it gives them a sense of style, cache and panache."⁶⁸ The loyalty to a brand is related to the amount of social media magnetism it has. Starbucks is used as an example of a company that has tapped into the power of branding and customer loyalty.⁶⁹ Starbucks has branded itself as somewhat of a status-symbol and effectively engaged with customers and prospective customers through online interfaces to build loyalty. Turner and Shaw provide a few tips about how to create a successful social media campaign, mainly focusing on the idea that social media sites of businesses must provide something valuable. For example, they suggest traditional 'special promotions' as well as useful information, which can be used to bring people back to the social media sites repeatedly.⁷⁰

Despite similarities in the goals of outreach and loyalty, the major differences between corporate and organizational use of social media must be recognized to understand their distinct approaches to social media strategies. Businesses sell an actual tangible product or service. Products and services appeal to individualism and can be immediately used. No additional action has to be taken. The nature of what environmental organizations 'sell' is quite different; membership is not a good, and requires that more effort be committed to the organization. Membership involves the investment of time and an altruistic attitude. Due to the different

⁶⁸ Turner and Shah, *How to Make Money with Social Media*, 65.

⁶⁹ Turner and Shah, *How to Make Money with Social Media*, 65.

⁷⁰ Turner and Shah, *How to Make Money with Social Media*, 66.

qualities of what environmental law NGOs try to advertise, business models for social media usage are insufficient to fill in the gaps in knowledge of organizational use.

A small amount of literature concerning general organizational use of social media also exists, although it does not venture into specific types of organizations and therefore is also not adequate alone to explain the how social media is employed by environmental law NGOs. Curtis et al. researched how non-profits are taking on the world of social media. The research indicated that organizations with public relations departments are more likely to use social media as a tool, illustrating how social media is becoming more of a legitimate way to enact organizational aims and attract the attention of the public. The research notes that as social media becomes more of a credible advertising tool, its use may expand: “Social media techniques will become more abundant as public relations practitioners become mindful of their effectiveness in regards to reaching target audiences, promoting a specific cause, and further developing communication strategies.”⁷¹ When exploring how environmental law NGOs use social media, I will also examine how credible they perceive it to be and whether or not they have an established group of employees that manage social media efforts.

Non-profit organizations’ use of social media receives some analysis as “Networked Nonprofits”, which are “simple and transparent organizations...They engage people in shaping and sharing their work in order to raise awareness of social issues, organize communities to provide services, or advocate for legislation.”⁷² Environmental law NGOs appear to be engaging in the process described. Kanter and Fine, who note that employing social media to create change is harder than it appears, also portray organizational use of social media realistically. Although sites like Facebook and Twitter are user-friendly and simple to use, this does not

⁷¹ Curtis et al., “Adoption of Social Media for Public Relations by Nonprofit Organizations,” 92.

⁷² Kanter and Fine, *The Networked Nonprofit*, 3.

necessarily translate into a mastery of social media. Attention does not come easily, therefore organizations must keep in mind how they pose their messages and the content of these messages. However, over time as organizations practice their use of social media, they are able to act more effectively.⁷³ With the notion of understanding the ‘learning curve’ of social media, it will be interesting to explore the evolution of social media use within particular environmental law NGOs – whether or not they feel they have a grasp of social media tools.

The idea of building “social capital” through social networking sites can also lend some understanding to how organizations function online, a lesson which may also be applied to environmental law NGOs. Social capital is defined as “the stuff that makes relationships meaningful and resilient. Within such relationships two things generally exist: trust and reciprocity.”⁷⁴ The power of social capital can be tapped into by non-profits on social media, creating a lively interaction between an organization and social media participants. It is important that organizations understand when they do and do not have social capital. It is also critical that they do not overestimate the amount of social capital they possess. ... use the example of a man asked to donate to a cancer research fund by his close friend. The organization then begins to mail him more appeals for donations. Dave ignores these requests because he does not possess social capital with the cancer organization – his relationship with it is solely due to his relationship with his friend.⁷⁵ The trust and reciprocity that define social capital were not present between Dave and the cancer organization. It is important that organizations therefore try to foster the latter sentiments to create loyalty and ultimately increase their donations. Kanter and Fine suggest that organizations send thank you e-mails or post their appreciation publicly on

⁷³ Kanter and Fine, *The Networked Nonprofit*, 3.

⁷⁴ Kanter and Fine, *The Networked Nonprofit*, 33.

⁷⁵ Kanter and Fine, *The Networked Nonprofit*, 34.

their social media sites.⁷⁶ Thanking someone through a public forum in a genuine manner could cause that person to feel more liking for an organization, therefore potentially leading to future interactions. Considering that environmental law NGOs are donation-heavy, it is likely they are already mindful of the ways in which social capital can be built.

⁷⁶ Kanter and Fine, *The Networked Nonprofit*, 35.

Chapter 4

RESEARCH QUESTIONS & HYPOTHESES

When examining social media, there are a number of questions that can be explored. However, I would like to focus my research on a few overarching questions:

1. What is the nature of the organizations' social media staffing? How many people are responsible for managing the social media pages and how much of their time does it take?

I would like to understand the level of staff resources of the various organizations as I believe it serves as an indicator of how valuable social media use is perceived to be. I suspect that multiple people may run the organizations' social media pages. I am doubtful that there are staff members who are solely devoted to maintenance of their organization's social media platforms because Facebook and Twitter are easy to use.

2. What are the objectives of the social media pages? For example, are they being used to increase membership, funding, or general awareness of environmental issues?

Understanding the goals of social media use by environmental NGOs is one of the most critical aspects of my research. The answer to this question will provide a lens through which I can examine the content of posts and tweets to attempt to understand how their language furthers the organization's aims. I expect that fundraising would be one of the main drivers of social media use. Social media enables organizations to quickly and effectively reach an audience of millions, thereby increasing the pool of potential donors. In addition, I believe environmental law NGOs are using Facebook and Twitter to become well-known among people interested in the environment. I suspect they may also be trying to increase environmental-consciousness

generally among social media users to widen their base of social media fans and prospective donors/members.

3. What is their target audience? Is this the same as the audience they are reaching?

I am curious as to whether or not environmental law organizations are competing for the same audience base, as this may drive them to make efforts to distinguish their social media pages from those of the other organizations. I predict that environmental law NGOs may be in direct competition with each other. As discussed in my introduction, the majority of members in environmental NGOs are older people.⁷⁷ Environmental law NGOs therefore must replenish their membership levels before they ‘die out’. I think this leads them to focus their social media efforts to interest younger people. It is also interesting to explore whether or not environmental law NGOs are reaching their intended target audience. Perhaps if all of the organizations are targeting a certain type of audience, some of the organizations are more effective at obtaining their social media support than others.

4. How do the organizations’ Facebook and Twitter pages compare in terms of user engagement through likes, favorites, retweets, shares, and comments?

It would be too narrow to claim certain organizations more successfully use social media solely based on the extent of their audience’s engagement. However, the level of engagement is nevertheless part of understanding their overall success. The content of posts and tweets may play a role in determining what type of engagement social media users partake in. Perhaps some organizations have more shares/retweets than others, while others have more likes/favorites. Are some organizations crafting posts and tweets that are more shareable?

⁷⁷ Hanscom, “Urban Outfitters.”

I would like to compare how organizations' number of friends/followers is related to engagement. I suspect that some of the organizations' social media pages would have higher rates of engagement than others. I would expect there to be a correlation between Facebook pages with the most overall page likes/Twitter accounts with the most followers and higher engagement rates on individual posts and tweets.

5. What types of posts/tweets do they make, and what is their relative frequency? Are the organizations making similar types of posts/tweets? What are some qualities of these posts/tweets?

I intend to analyze the nature and framing of messages, what issues are given primate attention, and the rate and type of contact with social media audiences. I would like to discover whether the environmental law NGOs in my study are using social media in different ways or if their activity seems relatively undistinguished from each other. This may feed into the question of how they seek to engage their target audiences. Also if the organizations are targeting the same social media audience demographic, understanding the nature of the organizations posts/tweets will allow me to see whether they are all using the same strategies to attract this audience or if they are being more innovative and trying to separate themselves from the pack.

I hypothesize that environmental law NGOs are struggling in how they use social media. Environmental law NGOs are essentially in competition for donations and attention not only with each other, but with environmental organizations in general. It therefore may be necessary for them to be able to distinguish themselves from other groups. However, the counterbalance to this is that environmental law NGOs also most likely are trying to appeal to a wide audience. Funding is imperative for any non-profit organization. In the process of appealing to a broader audience, environmental law NGOs may begin to look more like each other, creating more

competition for donations. If multiple organizations are discussing the horror of the same oil spill, it will be difficult for people to discern which group they should pay attention to. I expect that among the environmental law NGOs, some aspects of posts will be popular among all of them. Nevertheless, I believe organizations will still be distinguishable from each other, with some focusing more or less on particular topics and other aspects I shall later define in my methods section. For example, I expect CBD may have a higher percentage of posts about species protection because species protection is a huge part of their organizational history and overall identity.

6. How do organizations seek to engage their audience? How do they attempt to counteract “slacktivism?”

It is important to ask these questions as the answers may feed into how much environmental law NGOs value social media. If they see it as ineffective and empty engagement, they may not devote many resources towards it. The Internet allows people to explore a wide variety of interests. However, a negative side of having virtual interests is that people may be unwilling to take action that requires them to get up from their computer chairs.

Social media allows for shallow commitments because people are not held accountable for their actions and it is unlikely that those they associate with on Facebook and Twitter will question their involvement in a particular issue or group. People try to brand themselves on Facebook and Twitter, and the lack of accountability allows people to falsely represent themselves without receiving much of a challenge from their social media friends and followers. People may consider themselves environmentalists and want to represent themselves to the world in that way. In the past, actual action was needed. Now, with the advent of social media, simply becoming a fan of a Facebook page or “retweeting” something by an organization seems to

satisfy self-identification with a cause. This may direct energy away from meaningful action, as people may perceive a showing of online support as a sufficient impetus for change.

I am curious to know if social media has been able to encourage people to support the organizations financially and in other respects, or if it has led to more “slacktivism” – “low-risk, low-cost activity via social media, whose purpose is to raise awareness, produce change, or grant satisfaction to the person engaged in the activity.”⁷⁸ People may engage with NGOs via social media but are not willing to commit to more traditional engagement. I believe environmental law NGOs recognize ‘slacktivism’ as an issue and therefore try to use different strategies to increase engagement and reduce apathy.

I also believe that “slacktivists” may still hold value to environmental law NGOs, which may create ‘sub-categories’ of such people. A user of Facebook or Twitter may decide to become a fan or follower of a specific organization and do nothing else; therefore they are of little worth to an organization apart from the promotion through their like or follow. However, another person that is a fan/follower may take their involvement further by sharing things featured on the organizations’ social networking site, commenting on the organizations’ posts, or signing a suggested petition. While this effort is not as much of a commitment as becoming a donor, it still provides benefits to environmental law NGOs in the form of free publicity. For example, if someone has never heard of Earthjustice but sees that a friend shared an intriguing Earthjustice Facebook post they may decide to research that organization and perhaps become involved. Traditional mailings discussing the goals of an organization may be overlooked as ‘junk mail’, whereas the post of a friend on Facebook or Twitter could receive more attention. This hypotheses appears to be supported by the Natural Resource Defense Council’s description of itself as having “1.3 million members and *online activists*” (“About NRDC: Who We Are”,

⁷⁸ Rotman et al., “From Slacktivism To Activism,” 3.

NRDC). By including ‘online activists’ alongside members, the NRDC implies that making a donation is not the only way a person can provide value to their organization.

7. Do the organizations track the reach and organizational impact of their use of social media?

What are some metrics they look at?

If environmental law NGOs have particular goals in mind with their use of social media, it is key to ask how they know such goals are being achieved. Considering environmental law NGOs must be devoting the time and resources of at least one employee to managing their social media presence, such organizations might try to quantify the return on their investment to determine if it is worthwhile. I believe organizations pay attention to how much users engage with their posts and tweets by tracking likes/favorites, shares/retweets, and comments. I predict that environmental law NGOs also use the free metrics provided to them through Twitter and Facebook.⁷⁹ Although I am unaware of other specific analytics tools, I believe organizations may be employing their use to some degree to better understand what is successful.

8. What difference is social media making for organizations?

It is important to ask whether social media use is worth it for environmental law NGOs to devote resources towards. If it is not, these organizations may have to consider other approaches to gain an audience. I wonder if for some organizations the value of an online audience is different in degree and type from other organizations. For example, one organization may find that social media is most helpful for fundraising while another considers social media more important for making themselves more well-known.

⁷⁹ Facebook, “About Page Insights;” Twitter, “Analytics.”

While social media may enable outreach and connections with more diverse demographics, this may not necessarily lead to an increased or diversified overall membership, however organizations define this term. As discussed by Evgeny Morozov, sometimes an expansion of political discussions dilutes their meaningfulness. Philosopher Soren Kierkegaard was disillusioned by the effects of the Industrial Revolution and Enlightenment period, which enabled more freedom of debate about political issues through a variety of different mediums like newspapers. “For Kierkegaard, the problem with the growing chatter was that it lay outside of political structures and exerted very little influence on them. The press forced people to develop strong opinions on everything but rarely cultivated the urge to act on them.”⁸⁰ Morozov applies Kierkegaard’s disenchantment to modern times through the lens of social media, “a world where professing one’s commitment to social justice requires nothing more than penning a socially conscious Facebook status.”⁸¹ Such negative perceptions about the organizing power of social media are also explored by Malcolm Gladwell, who argues that revolutions will not occur via social media because the ties it creates to a cause and between proponents of a cause are too weak. He states, “Facebook activism succeeds not by motivating people to make a real sacrifice but by motivating them to do the things that people do when they are not motivated enough to make a real sacrifice.”⁸²

Despite ‘slacktivism’ and other challenges, I anticipate social media is of value to environmental law NGOs, otherwise they would not have active Facebook and Twitter pages. Social media must have some effect on environmental law NGOs simply by attracting people towards its cause. Social media pages encourage people to become part of a ‘community’ and outwardly define themselves. Opportunities for action and engagement are presented

⁸⁰ Morozov, *The Net Delusion*, 184.

⁸¹ Morozov, *The Net Delusion*, 185.

⁸² Gladwell, “Small Change: Why the Revolution Will Not Be Tweeted.”

straightforwardly and people do not have to actively seek them out. People may find that helping an organization is easier than they expected, and therefore decide to become active members and/or participate in advertised activities. Even if this impact is marginal, any increase in membership, donations, or visibility would be positive.

Chapter 5

METHODS

I employed a bi-level approach with the following two components:

1. Tracking Facebook and Twitter activity to collect and examine observable data.
2. Collecting information from direct contact with social media staff via messaging through social media, email, and phone conversations.

5.1 CONTENT ANALYSIS

Initially, I began my research with an analysis of the Facebook and Twitter pages of the respective organizations. I examined Facebook posts during the month of January and Twitter posts beginning from January 9th to January 15th. I limited the scope of my Twitter analysis to one week because organizations typically make numerous posts on Twitter daily, providing sufficient opportunity for analysis. I chose the week of the 9th – the day of the West Virginia oil spill – because I was interested in exploring how the organizations responded to big environmental events.

I performed a comparative analysis of Facebook posts and Tweets based on multiple factors:

1. Numerical data

Numerical data includes the number of Facebook posts and tweets, retweets, favorites, likes, shares, comments, comments, pictures/videos, links to websites. Note that I only count links when they lead to a webpage owned by the organization. This does not necessarily have to be the main website of the organization. For instance, the link could lead to a blog by staff members of an organization, such as NRDC's "Switchboard" blog.

2. Topics

I define a topic as the subject of a particular social media post. I determine the topic of a post by examining its rhetoric and looking for certain keywords. In cases where the topic of a post may not be obvious, I examine the associated website link for further clarification. Overall, I identified fifteen topics during my research.

- **Climate Change:** Posts and tweets that contain direct references to climate change, include keywords such as “extreme weather” and “carbon”
 - Example from the NRDC Facebook 1/8/14: “BREAKING – Today the Environmental Protection Agency will start taking comments on its carbon pollution limits for new power plants. Join the call for the first-ever national limits on carbon pollution – the biggest contributor to climate change. Support these limits today: <http://bit.ly/1dvbnpy>”
- **Energy:** Posts and tweets which refer to types of energy sources, energy conservation, include keywords such as “fossil fuels,” “solar energy,” “energy efficiency,” “green”
 - Example from Earthjustice Twitter 1/15/14: “Solar energy costs plummet to historic low thanks to tech advances & competition - now on par with many fossil fuels. <http://ow.ly/sCipJ>”
- **Food:** Posts and tweets concerned with food security, include keywords such as “food,” “eat,” “farms,” “pesticides”
 - Example from the NRDC Facebook 1/13/14: “Our NRDC Food & Sustainable Agriculture team wants to know: "eating green" — what does it mean to you? Let us know in the comments below! Learn more about

the effect of your everyday food choices here: <http://bit.ly/1fbxRQY>.

"Eating green" - what does it mean to you? Learn

more: <http://bit.ly/1fbxRQY>"

- **Fracking:** Posts and tweets concerned with hydraulic fracturing, include keywords “fracking,” “frack.”
 - Example from Center for Biological Diversity Facebook 1/9/14 “@EPA begins requiring California oil companies to report #fracking chemical discharges in federal waters <http://ow.ly/sqwJb>”
- **Keystone XL:** Posts and tweets that specifically mention Keystone XL or include the keyword “pipeline” with a link to an article that specifically discusses the Keystone XL. I thought it important to consider the Keystone Pipeline on its own because it is a major current environmental event.
 - Example from NRDC Twitter 1/11/14: “Aquifer Alert - can it survive a future of #drought, #pollution, and pipelines? <http://j.mp/1cMhzcR> via @OnEarthMag
- **Land Conservation:** Posts and tweets that express a desire to protect a specific place
 - Example from NRDC Twitter 1/12/14: “A Major Victory in the Fight to Protect #Patagonia as HidroAysén Disappears from Investor List <http://j.mp/1cMhyWq>”
- **Mining:** Posts and tweets discussing mining and/or mining sites, keywords include “mining,” “mountaintop removal,” “Pebble Mine,” and “Bristol Bay.”

- Example from Earthjustice Twitter 1/14/14: “Harmful Mountaintop Removal Policy Exacerbates WV Public Health Crisis
<http://ow.ly/2CWkPy>”
- **Other:** Posts and tweets for which the topics listed do not apply.
 - Example from EDF Twitter 1/13/14: “EDF welcomes new Senior Director, Smart Power Collaboration <http://bit.ly/1dKA9Qn>”
- **Politics/Elected Officials:** Posts and tweets advocating for/against a policy or law or referring to specific politicians, keywords include political titles, “White House,” “program,” “law,” “bill,” “President Obama,” “Senator,” “Representative,” and “Congressman”
 - Example from EDF Twitter 1/14/14: “Governor Cuomo Announces \$40 Million in Post-Sandy Microgrid Competition
<http://bit.ly/1aCuOgJ> #Energy”
- **Pollution:** Posts and tweets containing references to pollution or pollution events like the recent West Virginia oil spill, keywords include “Superfund,” “chemical,” and “spill”
 - Example from EDF Twitter 1/15/14 “West Virginia disaster highlights need to modernize our nearly 40-year old chemical safety law known as #TSCA: <http://www.edf.org/ofD/>”
- **Public Health:** Posts and tweets that discuss dangers to human health, include specific illnesses and/or chemical known to cause serious sicknesses, keywords such as “health,” “danger,” and “exposure”

- Example from EDF Facebook 1/4/14: “Effective January 1, companies are no longer required to use toxic flame retardants in their furniture in California. But these chemicals are not banned - companies can still add them to your couch! We need federal reform to protect human health. Take action: www.bit.ly/1i2YZzk”
- **Resource Conservation:** Posts and tweets that are concerned with preserving the quality natural resources like water and air, include keywords such as “preserve,” “conserve,” “water,” “air,” and “quality.” Note that posts that refer to energy conservation are grouped into the “energy conservation” category.
 - Example from NRDC Twitter 1/11/14: “California’s #Drought - We Can Do More Than Pray for Rain <http://j.mp/1cMhyWi> #CA”
- **Species Protection:** Posts and tweets that refer to the protection of a specific type of species or the Endangered Species Act, include keywords such as the name of a particular species, “Endangered Species Act,” “endangered,” “populations,” and “save.”
 - Example from CBD Twitter 1/12/14: “Return of #Jaguarundis: New Federal Plan Could Bring Small Endangered Cats Back to South Texas <http://ow.ly/st0ED>”
- **Urban Sustainability:** Posts and tweets concerning the quality of life and sustainability of cities, keywords include “cities,” “urban,” “sustainability,” “green,” and “development.”
 - Example from NRDC Facebook 1/20/14: “We have an opportunity and a duty to make our habitat work both for us as people and for the sustainable

health of the planet writ large. Indeed, if our solutions do not work for people, they will never work for the planet." READ MORE from NRDC's Special Counsel for Urban Solutions, Kaid Benfield:"

- **W. VA Spill:** Posts and tweets that discuss the oil spill that occurred in Charleston, West Virginia on January 9th, keywords include "West Virginia," "oil spill," "contaminated water"

3. Category

Categories are a broad characterization of a post or tweet's main intent – the thoughts the environmental law NGOs' social media audiences should come away with. I have identified eight categories, which are defined:

- **Action-personal:** Posts and tweets that advocate a non-political behavior, such as changing a habit, nominating someone for an award, or buying/boycotting particular items.
 - Example from NRDC Twitter 1/11/14: "Looking for a way you can help save #whales? Shop local and support American fisherman who invest in safer methods: <http://j.mp/1cMhyWu>"
- **Action-political:** Posts and tweets that ask the audience to become politically engaged by expressing opinion to an elected representative, signing a petition,
 - Example from CBD Facebook 1/10/14: "Ohioans: call Senator Sherrod Brown at (202) 224-3121 and urge him to oppose current efforts to include any policy riders in the 2013 Farm Bill that would amend the Clean Water Act, Endangered Species Act or Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and

Rodenticide Act to limit protections for our waterways and endangered wildlife from pesticide discharges.”

- **Information:** Posts and tweets that inform about an issue or current event or provide tips.
 - Example from EDF Twitter 1/14/14: “West Virginia chemical spill: More hard lessons from coal - <http://www.edf.org/ofs/> #energy #climate”
- **Nature Appreciation:** Posts and tweets that inspire readers to value nature for its intrinsic value and/or beauty.
 - Example from Earthjustice Facebook 1/24/14: “WINTER WONDERLAND: What does your winter currently look like? Are you knee-deep in snow or building sandcastles on the beach? SHOW US>> What does your winter look like where you live? Tag your photos on Instagram with #reasonsweprotect or upload your photo to the comments section below. Stay safe and warm, and Happy Friday”
- **News:** Posts and tweets that discuss current events and news updates.
 - Example from NRDC Twitter 1/11/14: “Obama Administration Starts the New Year with More #Climate Action <http://j.mp/1a8aeV8> #ActOnClimate”
- **Other:** Posts and tweets that do not fit into the other categories.
 - Example from CBD Facebook 1/1/14: “Happy New Year from the Center -- thank you for making 2013 great!”
- **Provoking Thought:** Posts and tweets that ask the audience to consider a particular idea.

- Example from NRDC Twitter 1/12/13: “How are you going to stand up for the environment in 2014? Let us know! #greenresolutions”
- **Recognition:** Posts and tweets that recognize a person’s contribution to environmental goals.
 - Example from EDF Facebook 1/7/14: “December 22 marked 25 years since rubber tapper and environmental leader Chico Mendes was assassinated. Steve Schwartzman, EDF's Director of Tropical Forest Policy and friend of Mendes, remembers him: www.edf.org/oNT/”

4. Focus

“Focus” is based on the content of the post or tweet, and the type of issue in particular that is being examined. There are four types of focus: Negative, Positive, Neutral, and 50/50.

- **Negative:** Posts and tweets with discouraging news/information or that point to an environmental problem.
 - Example from CBD Twitter 1/10/14: “#EPA will let #frackers keep on dumping chemicals into the sea <http://ow.ly/sts6j> via @grist”
- **Positive:** Posts and tweets that discuss encouraging news, environmental “wins”
 - Example from NRDC Facebook 1/12/14: “Is it time for a refresher course? Truly successful recycling involves minimizing waste along the entire life cycle of a product, from acquiring raw materials to manufacturing, using, and disposing of a product. Start 2014 off right by brushing up on the basics and taking your recycling game to the next level!”
- **Neutral:** Posts and tweets that do not focus on positive or negative information.

- Example from EDF Facebook 1/16/14: “Why did Google invest so much money in a business with only two products: a thermostat and a smoke detector? Read our latest blog post to find out!”
- **50/50 posts:** Posts and tweets that include both positive and negative information. In the example below, the positive aspect is that a representative is speaking against a bill that would weaken Superfund, providing the positive feeling of hope. At the same time, the tweet has a negative focus because it discusses the possibility that a bill is being considered that could be harmful to the environment.
 - Example from Earthjustice Twitter 1/10/14: “WATCH Rep. @keithellison speak against #HR2279.Bill will expose Americans 2 dangerous chemicals #Superfund”

5. **Current Event**

Current events are issues that would most likely be reported in the general news media – environmental catastrophes, political updates, and other major events. I classify posts and tweets as containing a current event if they address an issue or phenomenon that will occur in the near future (such as an upcoming state of the union address), have occurred in the near past over the previous month, or are present/ongoing. In my classification of what constitutes a current event, I exclude posts and tweets that address things that would only be discussed in the environmental community rather than appear on national news, like “National Eagle Day” or events occurring within an organization, such as the election of a new president.

6. **Visual Content**

For the purpose of my analysis, I consider visual content to be pictures and videos. In my classification of what constitutes a picture, I consider them images deliberately added by the organizations to their posts. I do not include preview images that are associated with links. When classifying a post as containing a video, it must be able to be directly played on the organizations' Facebook pages, as opposed to being accessed through a link.

Visual content is more relevant for Facebook, which is image and media-friendly. Pictures and videos are much less common on Twitter, and it is not considered a visual platform like Facebook. However, in October 2013, Twitter tried to become more picture and video friendly by allowing its users to directly tweet pictures and videos.⁸³ Nevertheless, Twitter still remains more of a tool for getting quick news rather than for sharing photos and videos. In my analysis of Twitter, I did not sense that pictures were used much despite Twitter's efforts to increase photo and video content. I also did not see embedded videos. Therefore, in my discussion of my data and findings, the visual content category will only pertain to Facebook.

Apart from the actual content of the respective environmental law NGOs' Facebook and Twitter pages, I also examine the demographics of their audience. I mainly employ Facebook for this analysis as it includes the demographic information for people that are fans of their page, unlike Twitter. Facebook also reveals the "most popular city" which distinguishes where the highest concentration of fans lives, as well as the average age of the Facebook users that visit their webpage. Age is an especially important indicator of the audience to which organizations' social media usage is most receptive.

Morozov, *The Net Delusion*.
Hanscom, "Urban Outfitters."

⁸³ Twitter, "Picture This."

5.2 INTERVIEWS

Interviews add an important additional layer to understanding how environmental law NGOs utilize social media. I specifically sought to speak with those responsible for managing the Facebook and Twitter pages of the organizations. To get in touch with the relevant staff members, I contacted organizations through messages to their Facebook accounts and emails. I provided a brief summary of my project and explained my intentions for interviewing them. I sent them a document of the questions I planned to ask and questioned if they would allow me to tape record our interview. In addition, I ensured that I understood the confidentiality preferences of the staff member who I planned to interview – whether or not they wish to be identified by name, whether or not they would like the information they provide to be explicitly connected with their organization, and whether or not they would like certain comments to be off-the-record.

All of the people that I interviewed managed the main Twitter and Facebook pages of their respective organizations. Some organizations may have associated Twitter accounts and pages specific to certain campaigns, such as the NRDC Food Twitter, but those who I spoke to were only responsible for the organization's original social media pages. From CBD, I spoke with Clayton Norman, the Online Organizer. My next interview was with Earthjustice's Senior Marketing Manager, Ray Wan. In addition, I interviewed EDF's Digital Marketing Specialist, Lauren Guite, and Liz Langton, NRDC's Online Campaigns and Engagement Manager.

In the phone interviews, I initially re-iterated that I would be recording the phone call and reminded the interviewee to tell me if they would like particular statements excluded from my published research. In addition, I reminded them that I would send them a copy of my thesis to ensure that they felt accurately represented.

I began with asking the staff members if they could provide me with an overview of the role they play in managing their site's social media. I then asked questions from the following list:

OBJECTIVES

1. What are your main objectives with social media usage?
 - a. Increased membership?
 - b. Diversity of membership?
 - c. Funding?
2. What would you say is your target audience?
 - a. To what extent does this differ from your traditional membership?
 - b. Are you more focused on recruiting actual members or having a “virtual membership”?
 - c. How do you attempt to address “slacktivism”?
3. How do you seek to distinguish your social media sites from those of other environmental law NGOs?

IMPACTS

4. Are you able to track the effects of social media outreach on your organization (ex: new members, increased website hits, donations, younger membership, etc)?
 - a. If so, how, and what metrics do you use?
 - b. Are likes, comments, shares, retweets or favorites more important for measuring success?

5. What difference is your social media presence making for you organization? (ex: new members, increased website hits, donations, younger membership, etc)?
6. Has social media changed the extent or type of issues your organization focuses on? Are there particular issues for which emphasis has decreased or increased?
7. What would you say is the importance of social media for your organization?
 - a. Is it generally viewed to be an important outreach strategy?
 - b. How many staff members help to manage your social media sites?
 - i. Do they do other things than social media outreach?
 - c. How compares in importance and nature to more traditional methods of outreach like mailings, magazine articles, emails

LESSONS

8. Has your use of social media changed over time?
 - a. If so, in what ways, and why?
9. Looking back upon your organization's experience with social media, what do you believe are some future implications for the use of social media and its impacts on environmental NGOs?
 - a. Do you have concerns for the future?
 - b. What changes would you like to see in your organization's social media use?

SPECIFIC QUESTIONS

10. Can you share any of your results and/or what aspects of social media are examined?
11. Do you use Facebook and Twitter differently? How so?

- a. Compared to your Twitter, you use your Facebook only a couple of times a day.
How do you choose what to post on your Facebook?
12. What types of strategies do you use to attract the attention of social media users?
- a. (I.e. pictures, types of posts (“scare”, inspirational, etc))
13. Are there guidelines for the content of Facebook and Twitter posts, and if so, what are they?

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY -SPECIFIC QUESTIONS

14. I’ve noticed that your posts are mainly consistent with the theme of your organization in that they pertain to species protection, climate change, and pollution. Are you crafting those posts with that in mind or is it just a coincidence?
15. Looking at your social network data, I have seen that posts have been repeated verbatim. Is this intentional?
- a. Why do you choose to repeat these posts?
16. At the end of the year, environmental NGOs and other organizations often make appeals for donations. I noticed that in December you made 31 appeals, far outpacing other environmental law NGOs. Can you explain what went into this decision and why you believe the others might have not acted similarly?

ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND -SPECIFIC

17. I’ve noticed your posts focus on pollution, energy conservation, and climate change – is this intentional?
18. Looking at your Facebook data, I have seen that posts have been repeated verbatim, sometimes twice in a row. Is this intentional?

- a. Why do you choose to repeat these posts?
19. At the end of the year, environmental NGOs and other organizations often make appeals for donations. I noticed that in December you only made one such appeal. Why is this so?

EARTHJUSTICE-SPECIFIC

20. From what I have seen, you have the most successful social media presence on Facebook. In January you had the least posts out of the organizations, and the 2nd lowest overall Facebook page likes, but had astronomically more likes and shares of your posts. To what do you attribute this success?
21. I noticed that your Facebook posts are much longer compared with other environmental NGOs. Furthermore, you use pictures the most. What is the logic behind this?
22. I noticed a lot of your posts are focused on pollution, climate change, and politics and elected officials. Does this seem consistent with what you aim to write about?
23. Out of all the NGOs I am researching, you have the lowest age range for the most popular age group (25-34). Are you intentionally seeking these people out?

NATURAL RRESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL-SPECIFIC

24. I looked at your Facebook data for the month of January and your Twitter data for the week of January 9th, when the West Virginia oil spill occurred. I noticed that you never had any posts directly referencing the spill as many other organizations did. Why was this so?
25. Climate change and energy seem to be what most of your posts concern. Are these targets intentional?

- a. While I only looked at your Twitter posts for a week, I noticed that posts about politics and elected officials were much more dominant during the month I examined on Facebook. Do you tend to post more politics-related things on Facebook?
26. 40% of your tweets during the week in January that I studied were repeats – in that they occurred at least twice during that week verbatim. Is this intentional and do you have a reason for doing so?
27. I note that approximately 75% of your pages provide links to an article on your own site. How is this related to your overall goals? Have you found this led to significantly more hits on your website?

Chapter 6

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

6.1 NATURE OF SOCIAL MEDIA STAFFING

Clayton Norman, the CBD's Online Organizer, runs CBD's main social media platforms. Norman began his position a little over a year ago.⁸⁴ He adds content to CBD's overall Facebook and Twitter accounts and interacts directly with those that comment on CBD's activity.⁸⁵ CBD is also planning to expand its social media presence to other websites relatively soon.⁸⁶ There are other Facebook and Twitter accounts associated with CBD that are more local or campaign-based, but these are run by other people.⁸⁷ Norman is the sole person that manages CBD's main Facebook and Twitter. He estimates that social media is only about 50 percent of his job.⁸⁸ The other half of his time is devoted towards online fundraising efforts, especially via email.⁸⁹ Norman typically does not write the emails but he ultimately edits them and sends them out.⁹⁰ The social media part of Norman's job is to include some of the appeals CBD sends out via email on their Facebook account, as well as "press stories, news stories and stuff about what we've done, and just sharing the information about the different activities that our different programs have been involved in."⁹¹

Ray Wan, who runs Earthjustice's main Facebook and Twitter pages, is the Senior Marketing Manager. Wan oversees Earthjustice's social media program across all of the platforms it uses. Wan considers Facebook and Twitter the "bread and butter" social media

⁸⁴ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

⁸⁵ Ibid.

⁸⁶ Ibid.

⁸⁷ Ibid.

⁸⁸ Ibid.

⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁹¹ Ibid.

platforms, but Earthjustice is beginning to dabble in some others, such as the picture-sharing application called Instagram.⁹² Wan is also involved in digital online advertising and graphic design, helping to create print collateral and promotional materials.⁹³ Wan's focus with both his social media and graphic design work is brand upkeep.⁹⁴ Earthjustice does not have staff members whose sole focus is social media.⁹⁵ Wan spends approximately sixty percent of his time with social media work.⁹⁶ Three other employees spend about twenty percent of their time doing this. Overall, Wan estimates that everyone's hours combined would equal the equivalent of "two full time employees' [hours] worth of social media staff."⁹⁷

Lauren Guite serves as EDF's Digital Marketing Specialist. She began working at the EDF approximately six years ago to run their Facebook and Twitter pages, a time when "social media wasn't really a big-hit with non-profits yet."⁹⁸ According to Guite, social media became an "organizational priority" a couple of years ago.⁹⁹ EDF has a digital marketing team composed of three members, including Guite. She spends approximately a third of her time on social media.¹⁰⁰ Each team member has a different focus. Guite's is "brand level communications."¹⁰¹ Her role is to run the Facebook and Twitter pages, but she occasionally helps others on her team, who are running EDF's pages on newer social media platform sites like Google Plus and Pinterest.¹⁰² EDF has other Facebook and Twitter accounts that focus on specific issues run by EDF's program departments. For example, they have a Twitter account specifically focusing on

⁹² Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

⁹³ Ibid.

⁹⁴ Ibid.

⁹⁵ Ibid.

⁹⁶ Ibid.

⁹⁷ Ibid.

⁹⁸ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

⁹⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid.

¹⁰¹ Ibid.

¹⁰² Ibid.

energy issues.¹⁰³ EDF has four program areas: oceans, climate and energy, ecosystems, and health, whose goals are typically to affect legislation.¹⁰⁴ Guite and members of her department serve as consultants for the program staff, “helping them build up their own channels and build up their target audiences.”¹⁰⁵ Program goals are very different from brand level goals, which seek to develop and portray EDF as a whole.¹⁰⁶ The programs want to reach the brand-level audience, so Guite occasionally makes posts that will help them.¹⁰⁷ However, it is clear her main objective on EDF’s original Facebook and Twitter accounts is branding rather than furthering program goals.¹⁰⁸ This objective is similar to that of Earthjustice.

Liz Langton is NRDC’s Online Campaigns and Engagement Manager. She is part of a team of four that create social media content. Unlike EDF, NRDC’s Facebook and Twitter activity is highly geared towards promoting its program areas and campaigns, which can be multi-year efforts.¹⁰⁹ Langton said the NRDC is distinctive from other organizations in that it does not have a specific team or person solely devoted to social media, because she and her fellow staff members coordinate with program staff and campaigns.¹¹⁰ “We work with those program teams that have these campaigns and we work to create social media, email and other online assets or whatever in order to help them achieve their goals.”¹¹¹ Programs come forth to Langton with specific goals in mind and Langton crafts posts and tweets she believes will help fulfill these aims.¹¹² Langton notes that the programs must approve the Facebook posts and tweets she writes on their behalf, indicating that she has less autonomy than some of the other

¹⁰³ Ibid.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid.

¹⁰⁹ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

¹¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹¹ Ibid.

¹¹² Ibid.

organizations' social media coordinators.¹¹³ Some specific programs have their own social media accounts.¹¹⁴ Sometimes Langton takes content from NRDC's issue-oriented social media accounts, like the NRDC Food Twitter, and retweets that information on the main Twitter.¹¹⁵

6.2 GOALS

CBD has three main goals for its social media pages. Their primary goal is increasing their visibility. "It's critical today that any organization that wants to be effective and active in any type of activism and also wants to raise funds to have this public persona" that allows people to learn about and respond to their programs' actions, according to Norman.¹¹⁶ Norman seeks to craft dialogue that engages people on social media and encourages them to become supporters, which he defines as people that follow CBD on social media, receive emails, and are involved in CBD petitions.¹¹⁷ A second goal of CBD is advocacy through recruiting people to sign and share petitions.¹¹⁸ CBD's tertiary objective is fundraising. This is the least important goal of CBD for its social media pages, as few people make donations when prompted on social media.¹¹⁹

According to Norman, emails soliciting donations have a much higher return on investment.

Earthjustice's three main objectives in its social media use, in order of decreasing importance, are engagement, brand building, and list-building/fundraising.¹²⁰ In order to encourage people to donate to Earthjustice, Wan tries to "engage with [Earthjustice's] audience and make them feel like they're part of an extremely effective group that's making a difference

¹¹³ Ibid.

¹¹⁴ Ibid.

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

¹¹⁶ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

¹¹⁷ Ibid.

¹¹⁸ Ibid.

¹¹⁹ Ibid.

¹²⁰ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

on the ground.”¹²¹ He hopes that effectively engaging an audience may lead them to attend a future event and/or potentially donate.¹²² Brand building is another important aspect of Earthjustice’s social media aims, as it is a precursor to engagement. Wan compares brand building to advertising for a product – if someone has never heard of it, they will not buy it. “When people hear our name we want them to think ‘they’re the environmental law folks’”.¹²³ List-building and fundraising are accomplished through links to Earthjustice’s website, where they can learn more about the organization and sign up to receive emails.¹²⁴ According to Wan, acquiring emails “helps build our base of support. And sometimes that includes fundraising but that’s definitely not our heavy focus on social media.”

EDF’s goals include brand building, engagement, and to a very small extent list-building/fundraising. As discussed earlier, EDF is using its social media page to give internet users a better understanding of its organizational identity, what Guite calls “branding.”¹²⁵ EDF is unique in that it is one of the few environmental organizations willing to work with businesses and create market-based solutions.¹²⁶ EDF wants to portray their unique take on environmental issues to their audience. Guite sometimes writes posts and tweets that pertain to a particular program, but overall her aim is to create a virtual persona for EDF.¹²⁷ In line with this aim, Guite works to increase the reach of EDF’s Facebook and Twitter pages.¹²⁸ Reach is the number of people who see what is posted on a social media page. Engagement is when a social media user takes action on something they have read – whether it be a like/favorite, share/retweet, or

¹²¹ Ibid.

¹²² Ibid.

¹²³ Ibid.

¹²⁴ Ibid.

¹²⁵ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

¹²⁶ Ibid.

¹²⁷ Ibid.

¹²⁸ Ibid.

comment. According to Guite, EDF's Facebook used to be owned by the membership department, with the aim of increasing donations and building email lists. Fundraising and list-building through Facebook was of little success, so the management of EDF's social media was transferred to the digital marketing team.¹²⁹ Nevertheless, fundraising and acquiring email addresses are still a small part of EDF's goals, but the expectation now is more realistic.

NRDC's goals are campaign-driven goals, short-term project goals, and general engagement. NRDC focuses on three to six campaign areas at a time, for instance, climate change.¹³⁰ Based on what a specific program desires to do, Langton and her team help craft posts and tweets to engage and inform social media users.¹³¹ Short-term project goals are connected to the program campaigns but have a definitive start and end time.¹³² Langton gave the examples of driving comments to the D.C. City Council or asking people to email their representative asking them to vote a certain way on a bill. General engagement gets conversations going. An example of how Langton conceives of engagement is displaying pictures every Friday on their Facebook from an affiliated page called "We Love Birds," run by the NRDC. NRDC's audience enjoyed these posts and would like and share them.¹³³ While Langton did not specifically mention reach and visibility when asked about goals, from our conversation I gathered that these are still part of NRDC's aims as they value the importance of their social media audience sharing their content. NRDC calls those who are a part of its online community on its Facebook, Twitter, and email lists "supporters" or "activists" whereas "members" are people who have donated.¹³⁴

¹²⁹ Ibid.

¹³⁰ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

¹³¹ Ibid.

¹³² Ibid.

¹³³ Ibid.

¹³⁴ Ibid.

I was surprised to learn that my hypothesis was wrong about the importance of fundraising efforts, with social media not being considered a very effective approach when compared with more traditional email solicitations. However, while it is generally agreed upon that social media is not very successful at directly garnering donations, it seems that social media still holds a valuable indirect role. For instance, Norman explains that when someone becomes involved in CBD's advocacy work by signing a petition, they may be added to CBD's email list. He hopes that the continued interaction with CBD via Facebook, Twitter, and emails may encourage people to transition from mere supporters to "members," which are people that have made a donation. In this way, CBD's goals of increased visibility, advocacy, and fundraising are intertwined. This seems to be the case for most of the organizations in my study except for NRDC, as Langton did not specifically speak to fundraising. It seems the environmental law NGOs in my study rarely create content with the direct intent of adding to their donations and email lists. Instead, they try to create a bond with their social media audiences that will keep them coming back to their pages and increase their interest in the organization enough so they are willing to take a further step in commitment.

I looked back at all of the organizations' Facebook and Twitter accounts to see if there were any direct appeals for fundraising in December, as I would have expected a push at the end of the fiscal year as organizations tried to increase their earnings last minute. The only organizations that I saw requests for donations from were CBD and Earthjustice. I noticed many more solicitations from CBD than Earthjustice. Norman explained that the CBD was involved in a matching challenge grant from a foundation, which had a deadline of December 31.¹³⁵

¹³⁵ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

Earthjustice was involved in a similar contest, tweeting “Double your impact! Any donation to @Earthjustice will be matched \$1-for-\$1 thru Dec 31. Great way to help the earth!”¹³⁶

6.3 TARGET AUDIENCE

CBD is interested in targeting slightly older people. Norman explained that while the Center is considering how to better reach younger generations like Millennials, they are putting more of their efforts on focusing on older generations because they are in more financially stable situations and thus would more likely become donors.¹³⁷ Also true of their email lists, “generally the people who are able to be interested and involved in a financially-giving way are a bit older.”¹³⁸ Unsurprisingly, Norman’s target audience is anyone who is interested on the types of issues CBD works on, mainly species protection.

According to CBDs “likes” page, which shows information about who likes a page, CBD is most popular in the city of Los Angeles.¹³⁹ The most popular age group it is reaching is 35 to 54 year olds.¹⁴⁰ Norman, who has more specific data, said the main demographic for CBD’s Facebook page is women ranging from 45 to 65 years of age.¹⁴¹

Earthjustice’s target audience, like CBD, consists of an older demographic of 45 and up, divided equally between men and women.¹⁴² They target the big cities where they already have support bases, such as Seattle, San Francisco, Chicago, and New York.¹⁴³ Their ideal audience also is conscientious consumers concerned about the environment, tending to be politically left-

¹³⁶ “Earthjustice’s Twitter.”

¹³⁷ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

¹³⁸ Ibid.

¹³⁹ “Center for Biological Diversity’s Facebook.”

¹⁴⁰ Ibid.

¹⁴¹ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

¹⁴² Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

¹⁴³ Ibid.

leaning.¹⁴⁴ However, Earthjustice still has a surprisingly substantial conservative donor base concerned with traditional environmental issues like nature preservation.¹⁴⁵

The audience Earthjustice is actually reaching, as of February 2014, is more skewed towards females.¹⁴⁶ Earthjustice's Facebook page is most popular in Los Angeles. It is also younger, with an age range of 25 to 44 years of age.¹⁴⁷ Out of all the environmental law NGOs, Earthjustice had one of the younger audiences. Wan is aware that compared to the audience for traditional mailings, social media is younger. Despite the decreased ability of a younger audience to donate, Wan claims "there's still value in engaging them because when they get older and when they have the financial wherewithal to contribute they will."¹⁴⁸ Wan notes that Twitter offers a more ethnically diverse and urban audience than Facebook.¹⁴⁹

Guite was intentionally a bit more vague in defining EDF's target audiences. She and her team have four particular key audiences that are very different.¹⁵⁰ Traditional environmentalists are EDFs main online audience. EDF also targets those who appreciate its pragmatic "economist and science-based approaches."¹⁵¹ Guite notes that such people may not consider themselves aligned with the environmental movement but that support EDF's unique stance.

According to Facebook, EDF is most popular in New York City.¹⁵² The age group that predominantly engages with its Facebook page is 25 to 34, the youngest audience out of all the other organizations' Facebook pages.¹⁵³ Guite agrees with Wan that it is important to diversify

¹⁴⁴ Ibid.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid.

¹⁴⁷ "Earthjustice's Facebook."

¹⁴⁸ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid.

¹⁵⁰ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

¹⁵¹ Ibid.

¹⁵² "Environmental Defense Fund's Facebook Page."

¹⁵³ Ibid.

the age of membership and consider younger generations as future members and donors: “we have an idea of how we would speak to a younger crowd and get them interested.”¹⁵⁴

NRDC was also not as specific as CBD and Earthjustice when defining its target audience, but that is because it depends on the programs and campaigns they are working on. Overall, NRDC seeks to gain a social media audience that really cares about the issues they discuss.¹⁵⁵ Langton and her team members meet with program and campaign staff in order to determine their target audiences.¹⁵⁶ For instance, she notes that she and program staff will do background research like examining polls to see the type of demographic that cares about a particular issue.¹⁵⁷ The example she offered was that mothers and grandparents respond strongly to water issues, so that would be a target audience if a program were examining such a problem.¹⁵⁸ NRDC is most concerned with having a specific audience in mind when they are putting money behind promoting the campaigns via Facebook.¹⁵⁹

NRDC’s Facebook page insights reveal that it is reaching a very similar audience as Earthjustice.¹⁶⁰ Like Earthjustice, NRDC’s most popular age group consists of people ranging in age from 24 to 44. Their Facebook is also very popular among residents of Los Angeles.¹⁶¹

Promoted Posts

Facebook recently changed their algorithm to make it more difficult for pages and page content to be seen by its users.¹⁶² In order to make their pages more visible, page owners can choose to “promote” their pages or “boost” specific posts. A promotion is essentially an ad for a

¹⁵⁴ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

¹⁵⁵ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

¹⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁵⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁵⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁵⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁶⁰ “Natural Resources Defense Council’s Facebook.”

¹⁶¹ *Ibid.*

¹⁶² Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

page. The daily cost of promotion can range from five to twenty dollars.¹⁶³ The promoted ads can be targeted towards a particular audience based on gender, age, interests, and location ranging from a country down to a specific city.¹⁶⁴ Another form of promotion for specific Facebook posts is called a “boost,” which can be used interchangeably with a “promotion.” Posts can be “boosted” or “promoted” to show up at the top of a news feed, increasing the likelihood of them being seen.¹⁶⁵

All of the organizations use the promote feature to some degree. Earthjustice uses the promote feature for approximately two to five percent of the things Wan posts on their Facebook page.¹⁶⁶ Because they have a small budget, Earthjustice only promotes “things that have high value” and that the organization has spent a lot of time to create, such as podcasts and videos.¹⁶⁷ In crafting EDF’s social media content, Guite employs a “content-marketing” approach, meaning that she gets a sense of what its audience is interested in and crafts posts and tweets to conform.¹⁶⁸ EDF then tries to promote this content “on the channels this audience is.”¹⁶⁹ NRDC also does promotions but it cannot afford to promote every post.¹⁷⁰ NRDC varies in how often it promotes something on Facebook, but Langton says she probably promotes a post once a week.¹⁷¹ Because her department has limited funding, Langton will ask program staff to consider putting money behind their campaign-related posts if she believes they will perform well with additional visibility.¹⁷²

¹⁶³ Facebook, “Promote Your Page.”

¹⁶⁴ Ibid.

¹⁶⁵ Facebook, “Boost Your Posts.”

¹⁶⁶ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid.

¹⁶⁸ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

¹⁶⁹ Ibid.

¹⁷⁰ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

¹⁷¹ Ibid.

¹⁷² Ibid.

CBD rarely uses the promote feature. To test the efficacy of promoting posts, Norman recently ran a promoted campaign targeted towards people with specific interests of the Keystone Pipeline, conservation, climate change, and energy development.¹⁷³ He did not find the results of the promoted campaign to be worth the cost as much as he had hoped, noting that he was able to double the number of CBD's overall page likes in a little bit over six months organically without the use of promoted ads and posts.¹⁷⁴ However, Norman noted that he may consider using the promote tool if CBD has something really big "that we want to drive as much exposure to as possible."¹⁷⁵

6.4 ENGAGEMENT

6.4.1 Overall Support

As previously discussed, a Facebook "like" is the basic show of support for a page or its activities. I distinguish a "page like" as a like of a Facebook page as a whole, whereas a general like pertains to the content of an organization's page. I recorded the total number of page likes each organization received at the end of January, illustrated below in Table 1. Out of the four environmental NGOs I study, EDF had the most Facebook likes with over 230,000. NRDC and Earthjustice had approximately 127,000 and 115,500 likes, respectively. Finally, CBD had 40,800 likes of its page.

In addition to tracking page likes, I examined weekly growth in page likes – a metric Facebook calls "New Likes Per Week". "New Likes Per Week" applies to likes of the overall page of an organization, rather than specific content of the page. "New Likes Per Week" can be found by clicking the button at the top of an organization's profile that says "Likes", which will

¹⁷³ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

¹⁷⁴ Ibid.

¹⁷⁵ Ibid.

lead to a page with various data, including a graph of the “New Likes Per Week.” The rate of new likes per week is one metric for the success of the organizations’ outreach. I chose to examine a four-week span ranging from January 15th to February 15th, featured in Table 2. I recorded the lowest number of new likes per week as well as the highest number of new likes per week.

Interestingly, while the NRDC has many likes, it did not stand out among the other organizations in terms of its lowest and highest “New Likes Per Week”. On the other hand, Earthjustice experienced weekly growth in page likes between January and February that far exceeded the growth of the other NGOs’ pages. This success seems consistent with Earthjustice’s 75 percent growth rate in page likes between January 2013 and January 2014.¹⁷⁶ CBD’s range of “New Likes Per Week” is 476-600. Comparing the range of these new likes to their overall page likes indicates significant growth during January and February. This success seems consistent with CBD’s performance this past year. According to CBD Online Organizer Clayton Norman, CBD doubled its Facebook page likes between August 2013 – when it only had about 20,000 page likes – and January 2014.¹⁷⁷

Table 1. Facebook Page Likes as of January 31st, 2014 (Rounded to the Nearest 100th)

Center for Biological Diversity	40,800
Earthjustice	115,500
Environmental Defense Fund	231,700
Natural Resources Defense Council	127,000

Table 2. Range of New Likes Per Week (January 15th-February 15th)

Center for Biological Diversity	476-660
Earthjustice	2433-3116
Environmental Defense Fund	614-834
Natural Resources Defense Council	310-615

¹⁷⁶ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

¹⁷⁷ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

On Twitter, the number of followers a page has is typically a measurement of its overall popularity on Twitter. Table 3 features the number of Twitter followers of each organizations' page on January 31st. According to the table, the NRDC has the most popular Twitter page of the four organizations, with over 121,000 followers. This is somewhat comparable to their performance on Facebook (Table 1). It is clear that the NRDC is dominant in the Twittersphere compared to CBD, Earthjustice, and EDF. EDF's Twitter page is the second most popular, yet it only has half the followers that NRDC possesses. Earthjustice's prevalence on Twitter reflects a similar position as its Facebook in that it is less popular than the other organizations just when considering the overall support of the page through page likes and follows. CBD has nearly 21,000 followers, about half of its page likes on Facebook. However, like its Facebook page, CBD's Twitter page has experienced nearly a two-fold increase in followers over the past 6 months.¹⁷⁸

Table 3. Twitter Followers as of January 31st, 2014

Center for Biological Diversity	20,725
Earthjustice	43,411
Environmental Defense Fund	61,921
Natural Resources Defense Council	121,242

6.4.2 *Activity-Specific Support*

6.4.2.1 Likes and Favorites

The number of likes a Facebook post receives implies that users appreciate and support what they read and/or see. For each organization, I chronicled the total posts during January made by each organization and calculated the average number of daily posts in Table 4. To calculate the average number of daily posts, I used the formula average posts per day = total

¹⁷⁸ Ibid.

posts in January 1st to January 31st/31.¹⁷⁹ I also included the total number of likes for all of the organizations' posts and average likes per post rounded to the nearest whole for posts made during January 2014. To calculate the average likes per post, I used the formula: total post likes/total posts.

Earthjustice received the most likes on their posts, albeit having the lowest frequency of posts. I will later discuss some potential reasons that may explain their high engagement rate. CBD, EDF, and NRDC perform somewhat similarly, with their average likes per post in the 300-400 range. Despite having the most posts out of all the organizations in my study, the EDF has the lowest average of likes per post when compared to the other environmental law NGOs in my research.

Table 4. Facebook Post Likes, January 1st - January 31st

Organization	Total Posts	Average Posts Per Day	Total Post Likes	Average Likes Per Post
Center for Biological Diversity	37	1.2	12181	329.2
Earthjustice	25	0.8	44242	1769.7
Environmental Defense Fund	53	1.7	16243	306.5
Natural Resources Defense Council	47	1.5	18020	383.4

Favorites are the Twitter version of likes. Table 5 exhibits the total tweets and the average of tweets per day. I calculated the average tweets per day by dividing the total tweets of each organization by seven, which is the number of days for which I study their tweets. In addition, the table includes total favorites and average favorites per post during the period of my Twitter examination.

The NRDC provides the most opportunities for favorites with an average of over 15 tweets a day. In return, they receive the highest total favorites during the week with 3.8 favorites

¹⁷⁹ 31 days is the time period over which I examined the organizations' Facebook posts.

per tweet. Yet, their average number of favorites does not stand out much from the other organizations, who have approximately 2 and 3 average favorites. The data does support some correlation between the average daily tweets and average favorites.

Table 5. Twitter Favorites, January 9th- January 15th

Organization	Total Tweets	Average Tweets Per Day	Total Favorites	Average Favorites Per Tweet
Center for Biological Diversity	37	5.3	76	2.1
Earthjustice	50	7.1	139	2.8
Environmental Defense Fund	30	4.3	74	2.5
Natural Resources Defense Council	108	15.4	407	3.8

6.4.2.2 Shares and Retweets

Generally, the social media coordinators for each of the environmental law NGOs indicated that they valued shares and retweets over likes and favorites. This is because shares and retweets make that organizations' social media activity more easily seen by others who may not have liked or followed their Facebook and Twitter or are unaware of their organization, which could encourage more attention to their social media platforms. Shares and retweets become part of a person's own social media page, and thus are visible to all of their friends and followers. Sometimes, likes may show up in the main Facebook newsfeed, but not nearly as much as shares. Similarly, a retweet of another Twitter user is added to a user's profile, whereas a favorite is not.

Table 6 includes the average daily shares and total shares for January. Average daily shares were calculated by dividing the total number of shares of content in January by the 31 days in which I conducted by study. I once again include the total Facebook posts and average Facebook posts per day for comparison purposes. In addition to having the highest average likes (featured in Table 4) of the organizations, Earthjustice also has the highest number of shares. In

January, its Facebook posts were shared nearly 63,000 times. The organization with the closest number of total shares to Earthjustice is CBD with over 8,500 – more than seven times less than Earthjustice’s 62,735 shares. The average shares of Earthjustice’s January posts exceed the other NGOs average shares by more than ten times.

Despite having the most post output in terms of total posts per month and average posts per day, the EDF and NRDC have fewer shares (100 and 140, respectively). This is intriguing, especially considering that both groups have the largest Facebook audience when analyzing their overall page likes (Table 1). While CBD’s posts are comparable to EDF and NRDC in terms of the amount of likes, it seems that their content is more popular to share. CBD’s January posts, on average, were twice as shared than those of EDF and NRDC.

Table 6. Facebook Post Shares, January 1st - January 31st

Organization	Total Posts	Average Posts Per Day	Total Shares	Average Shares Per Post
Center for Biological Diversity	37	1.2	8657	234.0
Earthjustice	25	0.8	62735	2509.4
Environmental Defense Fund	53	1.7	5125	96.7
Natural Resources Defense Council	47	1.5	6648	141.4

Table 7 reflects the total retweets and average retweets per tweet during January 9th and 15th. For clarification, the table examines how many times the organizations’ tweets were re-tweeted by others, as opposed to the number of tweets by the organizations which were retweets. The average retweets per post was calculated by dividing the total retweets by the total of tweets. Unlike its Facebook share rate, Earthjustice’s average retweets rate does not significantly set it apart from the other organizations. Its tweets were retweeted by other Twitter users an average of 11.2 times, close to the NRDC, which had an average of 11.7. CBD and EDF performed similarly with 7.7 and 7.2 retweets per tweet, respectively.

Table 7. Twitter Retweets, January 9th-January 15th

Organization	Total Tweets	Average Tweets Per Day	Total Retweets	Average Retweets Per Tweet
Center for Biological Diversity	37	5.3	284	7.7
Earthjustice	50	7.1	559	11.2
Environmental Defense Fund	30	4.3	215	7.2
Natural Resources Defense Council	108	15.4	1268	11.7

6.4.2.3 Comments

I chose to explore the comment function of Facebook only. Twitter has a similar feature in which users can “tweet back” to someone, creating a conversation, but it is more cumbersome to monitor and made data collection difficult. The data I gathered on Facebook comments is featured in Table 8. “Average comments per post” was calculated by dividing an organization’s total comments by its total posts in January.

Earthjustice once again distinguished itself in garnering the most reaction from its Facebook audience with on average, nearly 170 comments per Facebook post. The NRDC averaged 43 comments per post, almost four times less than the average of Earthjustice comments. The comment data reflects a similar pattern as the data for likes and shares during January, with Earthjustice possessing a staggering level of reaction and engagement by its Facebook audience, followed by the NRDC, CBD, and EDF in order of decreasing comments.

Table 8. Facebook Comments, January 1st- January 31st

Organization	Total Posts	Average Posts Per Day	Total Comments	Average Comments Per Post
Center for Biological Diversity	37	1.2	935	25.3
Earthjustice	25	0.8	4180	167.2
Environmental Defense Fund	53	1.7	577	10.9
Natural Resources Defense Council	47	1.5	2047	43.6

6.5 ACTIVITY CLASSIFICATION

6.5.1 *Topics Analysis*

Tables 9 and 10 feature the frequency of the topic classifications I defined in my methods section. Note that “Freq” refers to frequency. Some Facebook and Twitter posts were designated as having multiple topics, so the percentage is calculated based on the frequency of which the topics are found as opposed to the overall number of posts. I calculated the percentage through this equation: (frequency of topic)/(total frequency of all topics). Note that the “Overall” data, combines the data for all of the environmental law NGOs I researched. The “frequency” is the total of the posts/tweets of that nature among all of the organizations. The overall percentage rates are the average of percentages at which each classification is prevalent for the respective organizations. These definitions for the Overall data shall remain consistent in later tables.

In order of decreasing overall percentage, species protection, climate change, other, and energy were the dominant topics on Facebook. Pollution, species protection, climate change, and energy (in order of decreasing overall percentage) appeared most often among all of the organizations’ tweets. It is apparent that overall, the organizations discuss approximately the same topics on each forum. The largest gap for the most popular topics is for species protection, which has a 5 percent gap between its prevalence on Facebook versus Twitter. The overall percentage of the “other” topic for tweets was much lower than for Facebook posts. This may be due to Twitter being more to the point as a journalism-oriented platform with a word limit. Urban sustainability, the Keystone Pipeline, mining, and land conservation (in order of increasing frequency) were the least prevalent on Facebook. Similarly, the Keystone XL Pipeline, land conservation, public health and urban sustainability were the topics that came up the least when examining the overall tweet numbers.

It is surprising to see that all of the organizations Facebook posts and tweets combined only discussed the Keystone Pipeline twice on each platform, considering the pipeline is a recently contested issue. However, the Keystone Pipeline was likely more popular during February and the beginning of March, as the public comment period closed on March 7th.¹⁸⁰ I also expected the West Virginia Oil spill to be more popular among the organizations' Facebook posts and tweets as a major ongoing environmental disaster.

CBD's tweets mainly concerned species protection, which comprised 49 percent of the topics that appeared in their Facebook posts (Table 9) and 40 percent of the topics that appeared in their tweets (Table 10). Out of all of the organizations, CBD is most distinguished in this topic. The prevalence of social media activity related to species protection is unsurprising given the mission and history of the organization. On CBD's Facebook, pollution was the second most common topic with about 16 percent, then "other" with approximately 14 percent. On Twitter, pollution also the second most common topic with 22 percent, while fracking was the third most frequent with 13 percent. Out of all the organizations, CBD's Twitter contained the highest proportion of tweets referring to fracking, which on average, had an overall appearance rate of only 4.6 percent. Curiously, CBD only discussed fracking in one Facebook post during January.

In my conversation with CBD's online organizer, Clayton Norman, I questioned his reasoning in only discussing the Keystone Pipeline once on Facebook and Twitter. According to Norman, much of his Keystone-related posts were in February, which was the month leading up to the public comment period deadline. CBD formed a coalition with 350.org, and were able to get their social media followers to submit nearly 50,000 comments.¹⁸¹

¹⁸⁰ Department Of State. The Office of Website Management, "New Keystone XL Pipeline Application."

¹⁸¹ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

When compared to the overall profile of all of the organizations, Earthjustice's Facebook and Twitter activity during the week I examined was certainly distinct from that of its fellow environmental law NGOs. On Facebook, Earthjustice discussed energy and pollution most often, with a four-way tie for the third most popular topic between climate change, politics/elected officials, other, and species protection. Their Twitter activity was especially distinguished, as it focused mostly on pollution, politics/elected officials, followed by the West Virginia oil spill in order of decreasing frequency.

Of all the environmental law NGOs in this study, Earthjustice had the most Facebook posts and tweets about the oil spill. However, Earthjustice only discussed the spill 3 times in January on Facebook. I suspect they discussed the spill more on Twitter because it is a more journalist-focused arena. Furthermore, Earthjustice only makes about 1 post per day on Facebook, so it is important to maintain a variety of topics.¹⁸² The NRDC and CBD rarely addressed the spill, while it composed 14.9 percent of EDF's topics.

Earthjustice's political Facebook posts and tweets are generally more focused on discussion of how federal environmental laws are endangered rather than specific politicians.¹⁸³ Wan notes "singl[ing] out an elected official" could endanger the group's 501c3 non-profit status.¹⁸⁴ However, laws are pivotal to Earthjustice's success as a litigation-focused organization, and thus often the focus of their political posts. According to Wan, "What makes us powerful are the laws out there... The Endangered Species Act, the Clean Water Act, Clean Air Act – these are our weapons. And when they're being weakened or dismantled by Congress, then it does get a little political."¹⁸⁵

¹⁸² Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

¹⁸³ Ibid.

¹⁸⁴ Ibid.

¹⁸⁵ Ibid.

Wan also shared the topics (what he calls “focuses”) he makes sure to discuss on Facebook and Twitter. He divides the issues he writes about into three themes: natural heritage, human health, and climate change and energy. The natural heritage focus is based on “traditional environmental issues” and “nature-oriented work” concerning the protection of forests, wildlife, and public places.¹⁸⁶ Examples of health issues discussed by Earthjustice include clean water, toxic exposure, and pesticides.¹⁸⁷

Generally, the EDF’s most popular topics matched the most popular overall topics. On Facebook, EDF discussed climate change, pollution, other, and energy (in order of decreasing frequency) the most. EDF most frequently wrote about energy, climate change, and pollution on Twitter, with all three topics showing up about 20 percent of the time. Species protection, the most popular overall topic, only appeared twice on Facebook and once on Twitter. My analysis seems consistent with what Lauren Guite, EDF’s Digital Marketing Specialist, said her organization discussed: “Climate change is our big, big program, and talking about it as pollution is very intentional. And energy is another big push for us too.” Similar to CBD, EDF had the least diverse Facebook posts and tweets. On Facebook, CBD and EDF did not discuss five and six of the topics in my study, respectively. Both organizations excluded six topics entirely from their tweets during the week of my analysis.

Like EDF, the NRDC’s social media activity falls mostly in line with the overall trend of the most popular topics. NRDC’s three most prevalent Facebook post topics in January were climate change, politics/elected officials, and energy in decreasing order. NRDC’s tweets include the popular topics of pollution, climate change, and energy in the highest frequencies, once again reflecting the topics that dominate the overall picture of the organizations. Also like the EDF, the

¹⁸⁶ Ibid.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid.

NRDC did not discuss species protection very often. The NRDC has the most variation in the topics it discusses in that the only topic they do not address at least once is the West Virginia oil spill. The diversity of the NRDC's tweets is unsurprising considering that the NRDC sends out the highest average tweets per day out of all four organizations, so it would seem they have the most opportunity to discuss a variety of topics.

According to Langton, many of her posts and tweets are connected with particular NRDC campaigns. Therefore, she must communicate with the campaign program managers to determine what type of content to include on social media in order to meet their goals. Currently, climate change is NRDC's main focus, which accounts for it being one of their most popular topics.¹⁸⁸ Langton revealed the NRDC is part of a coalition of organizations working on the issue of climate change cooperatively.¹⁸⁹

In regards to the lack of activity focusing on the oil spill disaster, Langton explains that "From the social media and online point of view, we couldn't move forward [on the West Virginia oil spill] without additional information."¹⁹⁰ Langton also noted that she is limited in her ability to respond on behalf of her organization to issues that come up on the spot.¹⁹¹ At the time of my Facebook and Twitter analysis, Langton and her team were working with NRDC's climate staff, which is most likely the reason climate change and energy were most frequently discussed.¹⁹² Langton attributes the predominance of political posts on NRDC's Facebook to the fact that Congress had just got back in session and that her team was working on public engagement.¹⁹³ "A lot of the stuff we're asking people to do relates to emailing their senator,

¹⁸⁸ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁹¹ *Ibid.*

¹⁹² *Ibid.*

¹⁹³ *Ibid.*

talking to the Obama administration, etcetera.”¹⁹⁴ However, in the future if Langton were to work more closely with another campaign area, the focus could shift: “in a month or two we’ll be working on water issues and we’ll barely mention politics.”¹⁹⁵

¹⁹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁹⁵ Ibid.

Table 9

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
climate change	2	3.9%	4	9.5%	15	24.2%	17	25.8%	38	15.8%
energy	1	2.0%	8	19.0%	8	12.9%	10	15.2%	27	12.3%
food	0	0.0%	3	7.1%	1	1.6%	4	6.1%	8	3.7%
fracking	1	2.0%	2	4.8%	0	0.0%	1	1.5%	4	2.1%
keystone xl	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	1.5%	2	0.9%
land conservation	0	0.0%	2	4.8%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	2	1.2%
mining	1	2.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	1.5%	2	0.9%
other	7	13.7%	4	9.5%	9	14.5%	9	13.6%	29	12.9%
politics/elected officials	5	9.8%	4	9.5%	3	4.8%	12	18.2%	24	10.6%
pollution	8	15.7%	6	14.3%	9	14.5%	1	1.5%	24	11.5%
public health	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	6	9.7%	0	0.0%	6	2.4%
resource conservation	0	0.0%	2	4.8%	6	9.7%	3	4.5%	11	4.7%
species protection	25	49.0%	4	9.5%	2	3.2%	5	7.6%	36	17.3%
urban sustainability	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	2	3.0%	2	0.8%
W.VA spill	0	0.0%	3	7.1%	3	4.8%	0	0.0%	6	3.0%

Table 10. Twitter Topic Frequency

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	Average %
climate change	2	4.4%	6	7.1%	10	21.3%	23	17.6%	41	12.6%
energy	0	0.0%	2	2.4%	11	23.4%	25	19.1%	38	11.2%
food	0	0.0%	2	2.4%	0	0%	12	9.2%	14	2.9%
fracking	6	13.3%	1	1.2%	0	0%	5	3.8%	12	4.6%
keystone xl	1	2.2%	0	0.0%	0	0%	1	0.8%	2	0.7%
land conservation	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.1%	2	1.5%	3	0.9%
mining	2	4.4%	3	3.5%	0	0%	3	2.3%	8	2.6%
other	4	8.9%	0	0.0%	2	4.3%	11	8.4%	17	5.4%
politics/elected officials	1	2.2%	19	22.4%	5	10.6%	5	3.8%	30	9.8%
pollution	10	22.2%	25	29.4%	9	19.1%	11	8.4%	55	19.8%
public health	0	0.0%	2	2.4%	0	0%	3	2.3%	5	1.2%
resource conservation	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	2.1%	11	8.4%	12	2.6%
species protection	18	40.0%	8	9.4%	1	2.1%	14	10.7%	41	15.6%
urban sustainability	0	0.0%	1	1.2%	0	0%	5	3.8%	6	1.3%
W. VA spill	1	2.2%	16	18.8%	7	14.9%	0	0.0%	24	9.0%

6.5.2 *Categories Analysis*

Tables 11 and 12 summarize data on the categories I assigned for Facebook posts and tweets. Some posts and tweets have multiple categories. The category percentages are calculated as: $(\text{frequency of category})/(\text{total frequency of all categories})$. To find the overall frequency to which categories appeared, I just added their frequencies for the individual organizations. The overall average is calculated by averaging the rates at which categories appeared in the organizations' posts and tweets.

Among all four environmental law NGOs, information, news, political action, and (in decreasing order) were the most prominent on Facebook and Twitter. Most of the organizations fell in line with this overall standard. Approximately 36 percent of the overall Facebook posts offered information. The largest plurality of the tweets, approximately 44 percent, also offered information. News was the second most common category with an overall appearance of nearly 20 percent on Facebook and 31 percent on Twitter. Political action prompts comprised 14 percent of Facebook posts 13 percent of tweets. I also note that there is more variety of categories among the organization's Facebook posts than tweets, as some categories not included on Twitter are included on Facebook.

Both the NRDC and EDF's posts and tweets were most heavily information-based. They also had the most similarity in the proportions of which each topic was discussed on Twitter. CBD and Earthjustice, on the other hand, most often had news-oriented tweets. The biggest proportion of Earthjustice's Facebook posts also fit into the news category. CBD was the only organization that had action-political posts/tweets appear as equally as information posts/tweets. In fact, on both Facebook and Twitter they had the highest percentages of posts and tweets urging political action. As previously discussed, one of the CBD's focus areas is advocacy.

Norman tries to encourage people to become involved in political discussions with “action alerts,” which are petitions.¹⁹⁶

The NRDC’s tweets are unique in that they are the only organization that made tweets that fit into the “provoking thought” category, which directly asks the social media audience to ruminate a particular topic. For instance, on January 11th, NRDC wrote “What steps are you going to take to protect the #environment in 2014? We want to hear your #GreenResolutions!” This category was more popular on the NRDC’s Facebook than its Twitter. While CBD, Earthjustice, and EDF did not have “provoking thought” tweets, they did have Facebook posts of this nature.

The “recognition” category was most noticeable in Earthjustice’s Twitter activity, comprising 13 percent of its tweets (Table 12). The only other organizations with “recognition” tweets were EDF and NRDC, with one tweet each. As a reminder, I categorized a post/tweet as “recognition” if it expressed gratitude towards a specific person for their environmental contributions. For instance, Earthjustice thanked Representative Scott Peters for speaking against a bill that would weaken Superfund. Earthjustice tweeted, “WATCH @RepScottPeters speech against #HR2279. TY 4 defending program 2 clean up #toxic waste sites #Superfund.”¹⁹⁷ Posts concerning “recognition” played no role for Earthjustice on Facebook. EDF and NRDC’s proportions of “recognition” posts increased when compared to their “recognition” tweets. On both Facebook and Twitter, CBD excluded this category in its activity.

Table 11. Facebook Category Frequency

¹⁹⁶ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

¹⁹⁷ See Appendix D.

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	Avg %
action-personal	3	7.1%	2	5.4%	1	1.6%	6	10.2%	12	6.1%
action-political	11	26.2%	2	5.4%	6	9.8%	10	16.9%	29	14.6%
information	12	28.6%	10	27.0%	34	55.7%	19	32.2%	75	35.9%
nature appreciation	5	11.9%	3	8.1%	3	4.9%	3	5.1%	14	7.5%
news	9	21.4%	13	35.1%	5	8.2%	8	13.6%	35	19.6%
other	1	2.4%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	1.7%	2	1.0%
provoking thought	1	2.4%	7	18.9%	7	11.5%	9	15.3%	24	12.0%

Table 12. Twitter Category Frequency

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	Avg %
action-personal	3	8.1%	1	1.9%	0	0.0%	14	11.4%	18	5.3%
action-political	10	27.0%	4	7.5%	2	6.5%	13	10.6%	29	12.9%
information	10	27.0%	12	22.6%	21	67.7%	70	56.9%	113	43.6%
nature appreciation	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	3.2%	1	0.8%	2	1.0%
news	13	35.1%	29	54.7%	6	19.4%	19	15.4%	67	31.2%
other	1	2.7%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	1	0.7%
provoking thought	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	5	4.1%	5	1.0%
recognition	0	0.0%	7	13.2%	1	3.2%	1	0.8%	9	3.7%

6.5.3 Focus Analysis

Unlike for topics and categories, I classified each post and tweet as having a single focus. Therefore, the formula I used to calculate the percentages for Facebook and Twitter information goes as follows: (frequency of topic /number of Facebook posts during January). This data is below in Table 12. For Twitter, I used the formula (frequency of topic /number of Twitter posts during January 9th to January 15th) to calculate the percentage of tweets that pertained to a particular focus. The Facebook and Twitter focus data are recorded in Tables 13 and 14, respectively.

It is evident that a majority of Facebook posts and tweets have either a positive or negative focus. The overall Facebook activity of the organizations indicates they write positive

and negative tweets approximately equally (Table 12). However, on Twitter there is somewhat more emphasis on negative tweets, which represented nearly half of all the tweets (Table 13). According to NRDC's Online Campaigns and Engagement Manager, she recently conducted tests that revealed negative messaging is more effective than positive messaging.¹⁹⁸ Langton measured effectiveness by examining how many people were "liking, sharing, clicking, and taking action on those posts."¹⁹⁹ Perhaps other organizations are aware of this given that on Twitter negative tweets occur the most overall. 50/50 posts and tweets were less frequent, while neutral tweets comprised the smallest number of Facebook posts and tweets with 7 and 10 percent, respectively.

CBD and Earthjustice conform to the overall trends on Facebook and Twitter with regard to the ratios of positive and negative posts/tweets. On Facebook, both groups' made posts with a positive focus just as equally as posts with a negative focus. On Twitter, CBD and Earthjustice employed tweets with a negative focus more often than a positive focus. The majority of CBD's tweets have a negative focus. Earthjustice's tweets are split in half, with half negative, and the other half a combination of neutral, 50/50, and positive.

On both Twitter and Facebook, Earthjustice has the most 50/50 tweets and posts. EDF has the most negative Facebook posts, while CBD has the most negative tweets. EDF has the most neutral tweets and Facebook posts. NRDC has the most positive posts and tweets. The NRDC and Earthjustice look similar in that they have approximately equal rates of positive and negative tweets hovering close to 40 percent for each. As previously discussed, Langton of the NRDC recently found that negative messaging tends to be more effective.²⁰⁰ It would be

¹⁹⁸ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

¹⁹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

interesting to examine whether or not the NRDC’s current ratios of positive and negative Facebook posts and tweets have changed in light of this discovery.

The negative skew of CBD’s tweets seems to fall in line with Norman’s considerations. “We try to toe the line by having some risqué content and also sort of just the straight news reporting of what it is that we’re doing. Kind of staying through to those little bit edgier roots is definitely one of our trademarks and I try to embody that.”²⁰¹ In addition, having a significant plurality of posts about species protection also may have contributed to a higher proportion of negative tweets, as the organization mainly discusses the endangered species they are fighting for rather than positive success stories, which occur less often. However, it is unclear as to why CBD’s Facebook has a more equal ratio between positive and negative posts than its Twitter.

Wan of Earthjustice frequently varies the focus of his post to keep his organizations social media pages interesting to their audience. This may account for why never more than half of the CBD’s activity has a negative focus. According to Wan, “If you post three or four consistently great news, victory posts consecutively for several days, you will find that people kind of get victory fatigue after a while. It’s the same thing with sad news.”²⁰² Wan therefore tries to change up the nature of his posts and tweets every couple of days, either posting “great news,” “bad news,” or interesting news that people will want to share.²⁰³

Table 13. Facebook Focus Frequency

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	Avg %
50/50	5	13.5%	7	28.0%	5	9.4%	7	14.9%	24	16.5%
negative	15	40.5%	9	36.0%	23	43.4%	14	29.8%	61	37.4%
neutral	2	5.4%	0	0.0%	9	17.0%	4	8.5%	15	7.7%
positive	15	40.5%	9	36.0%	16	30.2%	22	46.8%	62	38.4%

²⁰¹ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²⁰² Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁰³ Ibid.

Table 14. Twitter Focus Frequency

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	Avg %
50/50	3	8.0%	12	24.0%	0	0.0%	10	9.3%	25	10.3%
negative	22	59.0%	25	50.0%	12	40.0%	43	39.8%	102	47.2%
neutral	1	3.0%	4	8.0%	6	20.0%	11	10.2%	22	10.3%
positive	11	30.0%	9	18.0%	12	40.0%	44	40.7%	76	32.2%

6.5.4 Current Events

All groups capitalized upon current events, which can attract social media users' attention because of their prominence in the general media. Approximately half of Earthjustice and NRDC's Facebook posts comment on current events (Table 16). CBD discussed current events in 40 percent of its posts. In contrast to the other organizations, EDF only noted current events 23 percent of the time.

All of the organizations except for NRDC mentioned current events on Twitter more often than on Facebook. Current events comprised a massive portion – 88 percent – of Earthjustice's tweets, and became a majority of CBD's tweets. EDF included current events on Twitter 20 percent more than on Facebook, with 43 percent of its tweets addressing a current event. NRDC tweeted about current events 37 percent of the time.

It is puzzling that NRDC has a lower proportion of tweets about current events on Twitter, considering that Twitter is used for live updates on current news.²⁰⁴ Langton notes that she tries to “latch onto news moments so that we're involved in the conversations that are happening organically on these channels.”²⁰⁵ For example, she noted discussing the Olympics and live tweeting the State of the Union.²⁰⁶ However, a possible explanation for the lower

²⁰⁴ Grabowicz, “The Transition to Digital Journalism.”

²⁰⁵ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²⁰⁶ Ibid.

proportion of current events on Twitter than Facebook is that the week I examined was before the State of the Union address occurred. Because I examined Facebook data for the entire month of January, it was able to capture posts about the State of the Union, possibly increasing the proportion of posts on current events.

Table 15. Facebook Current Events Frequency and Percentage of Posts

CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
15	40.5%	13	52.0%	12	22.6%	22	46.8%	62	40.5%

Table 16. Twitter Current Events Frequency and Percentage of Tweets

CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
20	54.1%	44	88.0%	13	43.3%	40	37.0%	117	55.6%

6.5.5 Links and Website Traffic

From speaking to those responsible for the social media outputs of the environmental law NGOs I am researching, driving traffic to their websites is a very important goal. Earthjustice’s Senior Marketing Manager notes the importance of providing links in their posts and tweets: “We’re hoping people will visit [the links]. Oftentimes we’ll try to optimize the landing pages where it’s very easy for people to sign up to learn more. By signing up we get their emails and it helps build our base of support.”²⁰⁷ Tables 17 and 18 below summarize how frequently CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC added links to their organization-owned websites on Facebook and Twitter, respectively. Note that in the appendices, the number of links each group provides to their own website is recorded in the column with the heading that states “Link to [organization name] article.” When an organization’s social media page includes a link to an article of a

²⁰⁷ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

webpage owned by the organization, I put 1 in the column. 0 indicates that there is no link provided, or that the link provided does not lead to a website of the organization (i.e. a link to a New York Times article).

CBD and Earthjustice use links the least out of all of their organizations, both on their Facebook and Twitter. Earthjustice has the most marked difference in its use of links on Facebook versus Twitter, with a difference in nearly 20 percent. EDF and the NRDC use links to their own pages the most out of their organization, and their rates are similar for both their Facebook and Twitter activity.

One prominent way the organizations try to drive traffic to their websites is by making their audience curious. Guite of the EDF notes that if she is trying to drive traffic to EDF's website, she will leave out pictures and "just stick to links and intriguing text to get them to click through."²⁰⁸ Wan of Earthjustice takes advantage of Twitter's character limit to leave some intrigue and mystery to encourage people to click on the links. He said one of the guidelines he follows on Twitter is, "Don't give away the cow... definitely try to tease people and make them want to click [the link]."²⁰⁹ Wan gave the example of asking people, "Guess what cities are in the top ten for greenest space?" to make them want to visit the link, rather than providing a tweet with the facts already there.²¹⁰

CBD's goal is not to drive traffic to their website content per se, but rather petitions and donation pages that happen to be on their website. According to Clayton Norman, the CBD is concerned with recruiting people to sign and share petitions.²¹¹ Unlike some of the other organizations' social media gurus, Norman did not discuss the desire to get people from

²⁰⁸ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

²⁰⁹ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²¹⁰ Ibid.

²¹¹ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

Facebook and Twitter reading their website articles.²¹² Indeed, many of the links I followed led to petitions.

Table 17. Facebook Frequency and Percentage of Posts with Links to Organizations'

Websites

CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC	
Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
16	43.2%	13	52.0%	43	81.1%	34	72.3%

Table 18. Twitter Frequency and Percentage of Tweets with Links to Organizations'

Websites

CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC	
Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%
14	38.9%	17	34.0%	25	83.3%	80	74.1%

6.6 ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES

CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC all perceive 'slacktivism' as an inherent problem of social media. However, they are not as concerned with 'slacktivism' in the way I expected. I expected that they would be frustrated that people may not be getting out of their computer chairs to come to events. Conversely, these environmental law NGOs consider virtual engagement to be a valuable asset for their organization but understand its limitations.

While the organizations appreciate likes and retweets of their page and its content, likes do little to further their organizational goals of spreading their message or getting its audience involved in its advocacy work. In contrast to likes/favorites, shares and retweets show more commitment to the organization and help increase its visibility. For instance, Wan does not consider a person that only shares Earthjustice's messages a slacktivist. He explained, "the more

²¹² Ibid.

it gets shared, the more you're actually snowballing more and more people to get interested in it... it's one of the best things [people] can do for us."²¹³ As previously discussed, the organizations perceive shares to be more important to likes because shares allow their message to spread to people that may have never heard of their organization or are unfamiliar with what they do.

Environmental law NGOs also try to influence 'clicktivists' to serve in a meaningful way. Norman defines 'clicktivists' as "people who are plenty happy to see a petition, click it, sign it, and share it."²¹⁴ 'Clicktivists' are important because they can contribute towards political goals with their signatures and emails to politicians. Because 'clicktivists' do have a higher level of engagement and commitment than someone who is merely a follower or a fan of a page, organizations try to further engage them to get them to make more helpful contributions. The organizations acquire the email addresses of those that participate in their petitions and try to reach out to them through emails. Norman noted it is important to engage these people so that they will continue participating in petitions.²¹⁵ The hope is that over time, "hopefully one of our fundraising appeals will resonate with them enough to go ahead and take that next step and just go from being a clicktivist to being someone who has donated and has more of an investment in our work."²¹⁶

It seems that environmental law NGOs have an understanding of what they can expect out of social media users, and they craft opportunities for their audience to easily engage from the comfort of their own homes. According to Langton, studies show that many people are unwilling to leave social media platforms to get involved. Langton and the other social media

²¹³ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²¹⁴ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²¹⁵ Ibid.

²¹⁶ Ibid.

overseers seem to recognize this: “if everything’s showing you that people don’t want to leave Facebook to do something or they don’t want to leave Twitter to do something, then it’s up to us and my team to think about how can we get people to do something right then and there.”²¹⁷ The organizations understand they must think of creative ways to get people involved on the spot. Many of the action-political posts I discussed earlier in the categories section asked people to send an email to a public official or to sign an online petition. Overall, those who manage the Facebook and Twitter accounts of CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC recognize that there are limits on what can be expected from their social media audience. They hope that over time they can develop a relationship with their social media audience that will eventually encourage them to transition to a more significant form of engagement apart from virtual activism.

6.6.1 *Visuals*

Staff members of the organizations I spoke to all agreed that visuals are an important tool for engagement on Facebook. According to a 2012 study of companies revealed that “photos on Facebook pages received 53 [percent] more likes than the average post... photo posts attracted 104 [percent] more comments than the average post, too.”²¹⁸

Table 19 summarizes the frequency and percentage of Facebook posts by each organization that included videos and pictures. Note that in my methods section, I classify pictures as images directly added by organizations to their posts, as opposed to images that may show up in previews of a link. To be included in my measurements, videos must also be originally uploaded by the respective organizations rather than included in a link, so that they are directly embedded into the Facebook page. Out of all the organizations, Earthjustice has the

²¹⁷ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²¹⁸ Corliss, “Photos on Facebook Generate 53% More Likes Than the Average Post [NEW DATA].”

highest percentage (92 percent) of Facebook posts that include pictures. NRDC has the second to highest percentage of Facebook posts containing images with 40 percent. Pictures account for approximately 28 percent of EDF's posts and 19 percent of CBD's posts.

Ray Wan, the Senior Marketing Manager of Earthjustice, treats Facebook posts as feature pieces in magazines. "For us, on Facebook you're really telling a story. It's a very visual-rich medium. We believe that pictures and words go hand and hand when you're telling a story."²¹⁹ Earthjustice uses a pre-made template for their pictures that includes the Earthjustice logo, a "theme word and then a short subtitle."²²⁰ Wan thinks strong pictures are important as the length of Earthjustice's Facebook posts may intimidate readers.²²¹ The "templated" photos, therefore, can provide Earthjustice's Facebook audience with the gist of the post and give them a sense of how they should feel about a particular issue – happy, outraged, etcetera – which may draw them into actually reading the post's content to learn more.²²²

While CBD had least percentage of posts that included visual content (only 19 percent), their Online Organizer certainly knows the value of pictures. Like CBD's Ray Wan, Norman also notices images with text overlays tend to be the posts that receive the most attention.²²³ Norman ensures such posts have a link in the photo's post "to drive people to either some type of action they can take, signing a petition, or making a donation."²²⁴ In order to keep their Facebook newsfeed engaging, Norman sometimes uses photos with a shock factor.²²⁵ For their recent

²¹⁹ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²²⁰ Ibid.

²²¹ Ibid.

²²² Ibid.

²²³ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²²⁴ Ibid.

²²⁵ Ibid.

campaign against wolf-hunting, CBD's Facebook has posted "pretty gruesome, dead wolves pictures."²²⁶

EDF and NRDC also include photos with their logo and text overlays.²²⁷ EDF's Digital Marketing Specialist will often add visuals to posts to increase their shares.²²⁸ NRDC's Langton says she considers visuals to be the "starting point" of her posts on behalf of the organization.²²⁹ "Our creative process is to start thinking about the visuals first and how we can visually get across to people and kind of make them stop in their feet and look at what we're putting out," says Langton. While I did not discuss the use of pictures on Twitter with the other organizations, Langton indicated that Twitter is becoming more image-friendly, and that she will often use the same images on Facebook and Twitter.²³⁰

Picture use is quite variable among the other organizations, although none of them exceed the 50 percent mark except for Earthjustice. Once again, note that the Facebook pages may contain more images than are included in my classification because of images that show up as link previews. When a link is posted on Facebook, a snapshot of a picture associated with the link and a short description of the link accompany it.²³¹ I am unsure if Facebook users respond to link previews in the same way as pictures.

Videos are noticeably absent or lacking in most of the organizations' posts. CBD has the highest percentage of videos with 8 percent. Unfortunately, I was unable to discuss with the organizations as to why they did not include videos as often. One possible explanation may be that organizations like to share content that leads their audience to go to their websites, and that

²²⁶ Ibid.

²²⁷ "Environmental Defense Fund's Facebook Page" ; "Natural Resources Defense Council's Facebook Page."

²²⁸ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

²²⁹ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²³⁰ Ibid.

²³¹ Darwell, "Facebook Gives Links More Prominence in News Feed with 3x Larger Image Preview."

videos are ineffective at driving website traffic. Videos take more time and resources to create, so it is doubtful each organization would have the opportunity to show a video about something their organization does very often. Furthermore, videos take longer to convey a message than a quick Facebook post accompanied by a picture.

Table 19. Facebook Video and Picture Frequency and Percentage

	CBD		Earthjustice		EDF		NRDC		Overall	
	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	%	Freq	Average %
picture	7	18.9%	23	92.0%	15	28.3%	19	40.4%	64	44.9%
video	3	8.1%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	3	6.4%	6	3.6%
neither	27	73.0%	2	8.0%	38	71.7%	25	53.2%	92	51.5%

6.6.2 Direct Engagement with Comments and Messages

Both Earthjustice and CBD directly engage with Facebook users' comments, which perhaps augments their frequency of comments over others (Table 8). While CBD has the second to least comments, they also have the least overall page likes, so their comment rate is still remarkable. According to Earthjustice's Senior Marketing Manager, "With social media it's so important that it not become a one-way, one-directional kind of conversation where it's just you with a megaphone telling what you want to say to people. You also want to listen, and you want to respond and engage. So when someone is writing a comment on our page, or they're sharing it, that's their way of engaging with us. And for us to respect their time, we engage with them."²³² Earthjustice directly interacts with comments, liking comments they appreciate and giving "kudos," as well as respectfully disagreeing with comments that do not reflect their views.²³³

²³² Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²³³ Ibid.

The Center's online organizer also understands the value of direct engagement with comments. But, unlike Earthjustice, CBD's responses to Facebook comments do not seem as direct. CBD's online organizer typically will comment on posts that are receiving many shares, "sort of piggybacking on the popularity of the initial post", requesting that their Facebook audience sign a petition.²³⁴ Therefore, CBD's intentions with their comments seem less oriented to direct interaction, but rather furthering their environmental aims.

Perhaps the EDF's few comments despite its overwhelming number of likes of their Facebook page may be explained by their lack of direct engagement with Facebook users' comments. While I did not have the opportunity to ask them about their willingness to engage with their social media audience on Facebook, I did not observe any instances in which they commented on their own posts.²³⁵

Liz Langton, NRDC's Online Campaigns and Engagement Manager also revealed that the NRDC tries to interact with their social media audience when they reach out to them. The NRDC is particularly focused on answering private messages that come through Twitter and Facebook that ask questions.²³⁶ Unlike the other organizations, a majority of NRDC's interactions occur on Twitter rather than Facebook, as Langton is more likely to comment on Twitter discussions rather than Facebook comments: "If someone retweets us or sends us a nice comment or something on Twitter, then we'll make sure we respond".²³⁷ She notes that for Facebook, "If someone posts a question, sometimes our audience will take care of itself... But then we'll make sure as well that no one's just hanging out there with a question that needs

²³⁴ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²³⁵ "Environmental Defense Fund's Facebook Page."

²³⁶ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²³⁷ Ibid.

answers.”²³⁸ The NRDC does not respond to negative comments as Earthjustice sometimes does: “We make sure we’re not striking up unhealthy conversations that won’t go anywhere.”²³⁹

6.6.3 *Organization-Specific*

6.6.3.1 Center for Biological Diversity

Norman does not have a set formula for enhancing engagement on their social media pages. Nevertheless, Norman does have a few things he keeps in mind when creating content. The first is not to overload social media pages with information. CBD has projects across the nation and puts out numerous press releases each year – approximately four hundred annually.²⁴⁰ Norman must therefore try to maintain a balance between portraying CBD’s actions and not overburdening audiences.

Norman creates social media content that sets CBD apart from other organizations by portraying CBD’s identity in post and tweets. Norman wants the social media pages to “stay true to those wild roots where we came from.”²⁴¹ In order to accomplish this, Norman tries to keep feeds lively and engaging with content that is humorous, provocative, and has a “little more bit to it” without seeming too radical.²⁴²

6.6.3.2 Environmental Defense Fund

EDF distinguishes itself on social media from among its peers by its unique perspective on environmental issues. The nature of how EDF addresses environmental problems is very different from the other organizations in that it is more compromising and willing to work with

²³⁸ Ibid.

²³⁹ Ibid.

²⁴⁰ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²⁴¹ Ibid.

²⁴² Ibid.

businesses.²⁴³ Guite tries to represent EDF's distinctiveness by "mak[ing] sure to talk about what makes us unique than what makes us like every other environmental organization."²⁴⁴

Guite also considers her "content-driven marketing" strategy an effective way to draw in prospective audiences, as she writes posts and tweets she believes they will respond to based on background research.²⁴⁵ "We're constantly being where we think our audience is to see how people are talking about things so we can mimic that language and get in on the conversations that they care about."²⁴⁶ EDF tries to cater to the needs and wants of their audience.

6.6.3.3 Earthjustice

A key aspect of Earthjustice's Facebook posts that struck me was their length, which was much longer than other organizations. One might assume that people would not read through such a lengthy post, but it seems that they do considering the high engagement of Earthjustice's posts through likes, shares, and comments. It was a strategic decision by Wan to use longer posts, taking advantage of the ability to use Facebook as a storytelling advice and making their page a "destination page".²⁴⁷ A downside to longer posts is that they may lead less people to visit Earthjustice's website because their audience can engage with the information that is already present rather than clicking a link to find out more.²⁴⁸ However, this ability to directly engage probably contributes to Earthjustice's staggering number of likes, shares, and comments.

Another special characteristic of Earthjustice's Facebook posts is that they have a very visible formula. Many of them begin with a capitalized word or phrase that sets the tone of what is to come. For instance, a January 11th post began with the word "OUTRAGEOUS" before

²⁴³ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

²⁴⁴ Ibid.

²⁴⁵ Ibid.

²⁴⁶ Ibid.

²⁴⁷ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁴⁸ Ibid.

discussing a plan to kill two wolf packs in Idaho.²⁴⁹ At the end of many of the Facebook posts, Earthjustice directly asks for likes, shares, and comments. Although the posts are long, this formula gives readers cues about what they should think and how they should respond.

Wan also chooses to only post about once per day on Facebook as part of a strategic move: “If tell you hey, this is really, really important and then two hours later I post something that’s completely irrelevant to what I just talked about, it seems to lack a certain sincerity.”²⁵⁰ Wan posts much more on Twitter in what he considers a “scattershot approach.”²⁵¹ Twitter’s word limit does not allow much to be said about a particular topic, and therefore does not enable Earthjustice to use engaging stories as a way to garner engagement. Earthjustice’s Twitter page had approximately 7 tweets per day (Table 5).

Wan’s promotion of global current events stories has helped diversify Earthjustice’s online audience, and therefore who engages with their page. While Wan tries to promote Earthjustice stories the most, he sometimes promotes other stories from around the world that are particularly interesting when they are connected to some type of work that Earthjustice does.²⁵² The strategy of discussing global environmental news widens Earthjustice’s engagement base to people outside of the U.S. He estimates Earthjustice’s audience base is comprised of twenty to twenty five percent non-U.S. residents.²⁵³

Earthjustice tries to craft meaningful ways for their audience to engage apart from the typical requests for sending letters and signing petitions. Wan’s example was Earthjustice’s Mountain Heroes campaign against mountaintop removal mining. Wan promoted the campaign through Earthjustice’s social media channels, asking for people to upload a picture of themselves

²⁴⁹ Appendix C.

²⁵⁰ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁵¹ Ibid.

²⁵² Ibid.

²⁵³ Ibid.

with a personal message about why they value mountains to be used as part of the campaign's propaganda.²⁵⁴ In addition to submissions from everyday people, Earthjustice received submissions from well-known celebrities and individuals such as Edward Norton, Woody Harrelson, and Robert Kennedy Junior.²⁵⁵ Earthjustice posted submissions on an interactive site, and later created a banner in which a mosaic mountain was created out of the pictures people sent in.²⁵⁶ Mountain Heroes and campaigns like it offer an innovative and fresh way for an audience to engage in a meaningful way without being cumbersome.

6.6.3.4 Natural Resources Defense Council

Langton uses NRDC's Facebook and Twitter pages to develop NRDC's reputation for strong scientific and legal work.²⁵⁷ Compared to other organizations, Langton says NRDC is "not a little afraid to be wonkier and let that content go out to the public as is."²⁵⁸ NRDC's Facebook and Twitter pages are very program and campaign-oriented.²⁵⁹ The links that Langton provides in posts and tweets are meant to enhance the audience's view of these programs and campaigns by showing them the perspective of the staff members.²⁶⁰ According to Langton, her team's role is to emphasize the work and thoughts of NRDC's scientific and legal staff, "either just through themselves in their blogs and the content that they write and also through the program areas that they're helping create."²⁶¹ Reading the thoughts of those deeply involved in the NRDC's work may lead their audience to feel a closer connection with its work and therefore want to engage.

²⁵⁴ Ibid.

²⁵⁵ Ibid.

²⁵⁶ Ibid.

²⁵⁷ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²⁵⁸ Ibid.

²⁵⁹ Ibid.

²⁶⁰ Ibid.

²⁶¹ Ibid.

6.7 MEASURING SUCCESS

Facebook and Twitter provide some basic free metrics to page owners, such as information about their audience like gender, age, location, and interests.²⁶² Facebook insights provide information about “reach” and “engagement.” Facebook defines reach as “the number of unique people who saw any activity from your page.”²⁶³ The engagement rate measures “the percentage of people who saw a post that liked, shared, clicked, or commented on it.”²⁶⁴ In addition, software like Google Analytics can provide additional insights at a cost.²⁶⁵

CBD is the only organization that does not pay for any analytics software. Norman explained that donations can be tracked easily via social media because links posted to the CBD’s Facebook page requesting donations include a tracking code.²⁶⁶ As previously discussed, CBD has had tremendous increases in Facebook page likes and Twitter followers over the past six months despite Norman only being able to use simple, free data.²⁶⁷

Earthjustice uses Google Analytics and other tracking tools to see the effects of its usage. One of the metrics Earthjustice tracks using Google Analytics is the percentage of their web traffic that derives from social media sites.²⁶⁸ Wan would like to improve upon the current numbers, which indicate that approximately five to seven percent of the traffic comes through their social media platforms.²⁶⁹ Earthjustice anticipates that upcoming modifications to their website to be more mobile phone –friendly could help increase this percentage.²⁷⁰ Google

²⁶² Twitter, “Analytics.” I know that Facebook contains this information as well because I own a page for an organization, and therefore have access to page insights.

²⁶³ Facebook, “How Is Reach Defined for Each of My Page Posts?”.

²⁶⁴ Facebook, “How Is Engagement Rate Defined?”.

²⁶⁵ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁶⁶ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²⁶⁷ Ibid.

²⁶⁸ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁶⁹ Ibid.

²⁷⁰ Ibid.

analytics also allows codes to be embedded in links to track if a donation came from social media.²⁷¹ Wan estimates that through social media, ten to fifteen thousand in donations is raised annually.²⁷² Currently, Earthjustice is does not know of any service that could quantify how their social media activity contributes to increases in membership.²⁷³

Guite considers EDF very “metric-centric” when it comes to tracking the success of their social media pages. EDF is able to track specific key performance indicators such as “how much traffic we’re driving... how many sign ups, how many new members are coming from these channels and the donations from each channel.”²⁷⁴ Generally the EDF does not track the demographics but it is visited occasionally so they can get a sense of the type of audience they are attracting.²⁷⁵

NRDC is quite invested in tracking the performance of its social media sites. Langton and her online engagement team utilize four tracking tools: Google analytics, software connected to action pages, and two other social media products.²⁷⁶ Campaigns work with Langton to set out concrete goals, such as acquiring 50,000 comments to the EPA.²⁷⁷ This goal is then broken down into the various arenas of internet engagement – email, blogs, social media, and videos.²⁷⁸ Langton can determine “who’s clicking on each link, how many people that click on a link will actually take the action, how many people share the action, how many people from an action

²⁷¹ Ibid.

²⁷² Ibid.

²⁷³ Ibid.

²⁷⁴ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

²⁷⁵ Ibid.

²⁷⁶ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²⁷⁷ Ibid.

²⁷⁸ Ibid.

that's shared end up taking that action."²⁷⁹ Langton tries to determine what is garnering the most attention and engagement, promoting posts that do well.²⁸⁰

6.7.1 *Testing*

I found that some organizations use testing tactics to understand the success of certain types of posts among certain types of audiences. Langton from NRDC and Guite from EDF indicated they used AA and AB testing on Facebook. AA testing is used to compare audiences.²⁸¹ On Facebook, the same post may show up twice. Each post is promoted to target a specific audience to determine how they respond differently to the same content.²⁸² This may account for some of the repeated posts/tweets of organizations on Facebook and Twitter, which are highlighted yellow in the appendices. Guite indicated she was doing a lot of AA testing at the time I collected my data.²⁸³

AB testing compares different posts against each other.²⁸⁴ Two posts may have similar content that is framed in a different way. For instance, the same link could be used but the post itself may have different language.²⁸⁵ Another example is using the same text content but slightly different images.²⁸⁶ The goal of such testing is to see what type of language or image attracts the most attention and from where.

²⁷⁹ Ibid.

²⁸⁰ Ibid.

²⁸¹ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

²⁸² Ibid.

²⁸³ Ibid.

²⁸⁴ Ibid.

²⁸⁵ Ibid.

²⁸⁶ Ibid.

6.8 VALUE OF SOCIAL MEDIA

Among the staff members I spoke with, all agreed that social media has become an especially important part of their organization's outreach and that it is enhancing the visibility and success of their group. Many even expressed that their organization was looking to expand its use of social media.

CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC all perceive social media as having the ability to introduce their organization and their goals to audiences they could not typically reach. Norman of CBD notes, "We know for sure that having grown our social media presence has definitely brought more of a recognition just among the general public of our work and our organization."²⁸⁷ Wan believes social media provides a leg up from traditional media because "it empowers your supporters to be a conduit for your message."²⁸⁸ Wan commented that emails have low open rates of only ten to fifteen percent, meaning that very few people actually see what Earthjustice sends them.²⁸⁹ On the other hand, social media posts on Facebook and Twitter are more difficult to ignore because they are thrust in social media user's attention in news feeds.²⁹⁰ All of the organizations additionally find that social media drives traffic to their webpages and blogs. NRDC, for example, finds that when they promote a blog post on Facebook or Twitter, they get a lot of traffic to their blog website.²⁹¹ The organizations say they are also recruiting more people to sign up for their emails via links provided on their social media pages.²⁹²

²⁸⁷ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²⁸⁸ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁸⁹ Ibid.

²⁹⁰ Ibid.

²⁹¹ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²⁹² Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

The organizations also perceive that social media lends to increase their visibility within the media. Guite notes that a few years ago, when breaking news came out EDF would first add it to their website, then quickly contact reporters. Now, social media is being used as a platform to release breaking news – especially Twitter.²⁹³ CBD’s Norman notes that doing well on social media (through larger reach) has given his organization more attention from major conventional media outlets.²⁹⁴ Guite attributes increases in mentions of EDF in news publications to Twitter, recognizing its use by influential journalists.²⁹⁵

NRDC finds that using social media is furthering the success of its targeted campaigns. Langton noted that her organization recently did an online ad campaign on Facebook that targeted eight representatives asking them to vote no on a bill. Ultimately, two of the representatives did vote against the bill.²⁹⁶ According to Langton, “it seem[ed] like the ads we were putting out asking them to say no made a difference.”²⁹⁷

²⁹³ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

²⁹⁴ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

²⁹⁵ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

²⁹⁶ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

²⁹⁷ Ibid.

Chapter 7

CONCLUSION

A main finding of my research is that each environmental law NGO has a different take on social media in terms of the organizational structure behind their involvement as well as the ways in which they craft posts and tweets. While all of the organizations have one person in charge of maintaining their Facebook and Twitter accounts, the amount of time they spend vary. Their other roles apart from social media also differ, ranging from involvement in email communications to digital advertising. Some of the organizations had larger teams devoted to all online communications. CBD, Earthjustice, and EDF social media use is mainly concerned with branding, whereas NRDC seeks to serve its program areas and campaigns, thereby working more closely with them.

I found that the organizations' goals converged on visibility, engagement, branding, more website traffic, increasing email lists, and to some extent, fundraising. I was surprised to find that the organizations in my study do not find Twitter and Facebook to be important direct sources of fundraising. Most of the organizations agree that email is instead the best mechanism for soliciting donations, despite low open rates.

Nevertheless, there seems to be near consensus that social media are useful for indirect fundraising by driving traffic to websites discussing the organizations' activities and encouraging signing up for email notifications. Environmental law NGOs are willing to devote resources to social media because it spreads their visibility as an organization. If they effectively engage their social media audiences over a period of time, their audience may feel they have a part in the organization and could ultimately contribute donations.

While some organizations were more revealing about their target audiences than others, I gather that environmental law NGOs are looking to engage middle-aged people that have the capability to donate. More generally, environmental law organizations all want the attention of people that genuinely care about the issues they address. They are aware that not everyone in their audience can afford to donate. I found that the organizations in my study perceive non-donors who try to further their organizational ambitions with other forms of activism (such as emailing a representative) just as important as donors.

One of the central lessons I learned through my research is that each organizations is “successful” in its own way in terms of audience engagement. EDF has the largest presence on Facebook, while NRDC has the most Twitter followers and highest engagement rate on Twitter. Earthjustice has the best Facebook engagement rate. While CBD may have the lowest number of overall likes on Facebook and followers on Twitter, it is growing rapidly on both platforms and has engagement rates comparable to other environmental law NGOs.

In my analysis of topics, categories, and focuses, I saw some general overall patterns among environmental law NGOs. Generally there is a correlation between the topics, categories, and focuses that are prominent on Facebook versus those that are prominent on Twitter. In addition, individual organizations usually had higher percentages of the topics, categories, and focuses that were the most prominent overall. Nevertheless, environmental law NGOs were able to distinguish themselves with the less popular topics, categories, and focuses. For example, CBD discussed fracking more than other organizations on its social media pages, while EDF addressed the West Virginia oil spill much more frequently (Tables 9 and 10).

Information, news, and political action posts and tweets occurred the most often overall among categories. However, like for topics, some organizations were more unique in that they

had more diversity of categories. Earthjustice set itself apart with a high percentage of “recognition” tweets, for example. NRDC was the only organization with tweets that fit into the “provoking thought” category (Table 12).

Negative and positive posts dominated overall on Facebook and Twitter (Table 13 and 14). However, on Facebook I noticed there was a near equal ratio between positive and negative posts, whereas on Twitter, negative posts were more prominent. Similar to my results for topics and categories, some environmental law NGOs set themselves apart from others. For example, EDF had the highest proportion of neutral Facebook posts and tweets (Table 13 and 14).

Generally speaking, each organizations’ staff member responsible for their main social media pages was able to spin ‘slacktivism’ into something positive. They all noted that being able to reach a wider audience has intrinsic worth, despite the fact that ‘armchair activists’ may not engage in activities apart from what they can do on their computers. Environmental NGOs try to meet what they perceive to be the wishes of their audience with regard to engagement, enabling them to get involved in environmental action without ever having to leave their computer screens.

In some ways, organizations are similar in how they seek to increase their audience’s attention on their social media activity. They all use pictures as a way to attract people to read their posts. The nature of the pictures may differ from organization to organization. CBD has some of the more gruesome pictures, such as dead or injured wolves to appeal to people’s emotions.²⁹⁸ Some organizations use pictures much more often than others. For example, pictures were included in 92 percent of Earthjustice’s Facebook posts but only 19 percent in CBD’s posts (Table 19).

²⁹⁸ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

In addition to pictures, environmental law NGOs use direct engagement with people that reach out to them as a strategy to keep people coming back to their pages. The organizations do this direct engagement in their own way. For example, Earthjustice becomes involved in conversations by responding to people's Facebook comments, while NRDC communicates more with people that comment on their Twitter posts or send them a private message.

CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC also sought to encourage engagement by distinguishing themselves. CBD and EDF try to play up on their organizational identities. CBD conveys its "edgier roots" on its Facebook and Twitter while EDF highlights its distinctive collaborative approach to environmental problems.²⁹⁹ Earthjustice uses many innovative approaches, such as longer Facebook posts, the use of capitalized key words, and more involved campaign activities apart from asking their audience to send emails or sign petitions.³⁰⁰ NRDC's social media engagement strategy focuses on presenting NRDC as a prominent scientific and legal resource in the environmental movement.³⁰¹ Langton seeks to form a connection between NRDC's social media fans and their staff members by including links to blogs.³⁰²

All of the environmental law NGOs in my research agree that tracking the effects of their social media use is crucial. Apart from CBD, which only uses the free metrics provided by Facebook and Twitter, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC utilize other services like Google Analytics. Environmental law NGOs pay attention to the success of particular posts as well as larger patterns and trends, such as the make-up of the audience. It seems that CBD does not

²⁹⁹ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview; Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

³⁰⁰ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

³⁰¹ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

³⁰² Ibid.

invest as much resources into its social media as it does not use tracking services or software that does not already come with Facebook and Twitter.³⁰³

Finally, and most importantly, I conclude that social media is making a difference for environmental law NGOs. Social media provides these organizations with the opportunity to reach audiences they would otherwise not be able to engage. Mailings and donations are targeted towards people who have agreed to provide the NGOs with their information, whereas on Facebook and Twitter, people who have no prior connection with the organizations can learn about them easily. Social media is effectively driving Facebook and Twitter users to environmental law NGOs websites and getting them to sign up to receive more information through emails. People are also getting involved by participating in campaigns, whether it be through signing a petition, writing an email, or making a donation. Environmental law NGOs are also getting more attention from the media as a result of their involvement on social media, especially through Twitter.

Based on my analysis, I find that social media certainly plays a critical role for environmental law NGOs. Each organization believes it to be an important mode of communication. In some respects, I CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC are using social media for similar aims and at times, conform to overall patterns. Nevertheless, these organizations are effectively crafting their own social media identities to varying degrees. Considering the success of social media for CBD, Earthjustice, EDF, and NRDC over the past few years, it seems likely social media will grow in its importance for these organizations and that they will expand the resources they devote to it in the future.

³⁰³ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

7.1 POSSIBILITIES FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

While my research has enhanced understanding of the motivations behind environmental law NGOs' social media usage, as well as how they are using it and with what effects, there are many more questions that can be delved into. With more time and better resources, it would be interesting to explore the social media activity of environmental law NGOs over a longer period, such as a year. I am curious whether or not the 'snapshots' of data I took from Facebook and Twitter are representative of organizations' social media activity generally. Furthermore, I would like to explore how social media use has changed over time for these organizations. Have the topics, categories, and focuses that comprise posts and tweets generally remained in the same proportions or have the organizations slowly over time changed them o their current proportions?

One area of particular interest is how the activity of environmental law NGOs compares with general environmental organizations such as The Audubon Society, The Nature Conservancy, and Sierra Club. Do organizations that involve themselves in arenas other than litigation discuss different types of issues and in different types of ways? Do general environmental organizations share the same goals as environmental law NGOs for the social media sites?

7.2 FUTURE IMPLICATIONS

The social media staff of environmental law NGOs believe that over time, social media will continue to grow for their organizations. However, they believe there will be changes of the social media status quo, which will require them to adjust how and to what extent they use social media.

One challenge organizations perceive is social media sprawl.³⁰⁴ While Facebook and Twitter are currently popular platforms, it is possible that a few years down the road other social media sites will gain precedence. Langton from NRDC predicts that over the next five years, Facebook may meet its downfall as it faces competition from new and innovative platforms. “We have to constantly be aware of all these tools that are coming up,” said Langton.³⁰⁵ However, environmental law NGOs understand that it is important to know which platforms are best for them. As Guite of EDF notes, people may be excited about a new social media site but her organization must ensure not to confuse its audience and spread itself thin by getting involved in platforms that may not be effective in achieving their goals.³⁰⁶

Another concern of environmental NGOs for the future is how they can continue to keep their content engaging. Wan of Earthjustice worries that people may take on a “been there, done that” type of attitude towards organizations’ pages on social media if they no longer see them as “fresh and meaningful.”³⁰⁷ Over time, according to Guite, audiences become more intelligent. “They’re no longer going to click on things that are like big spammy glittery – now they’re savvier. They’re not going to want to necessarily be marketed to.”³⁰⁸ Norman of CBD agrees, noting the importance of content that is accessible and “going to make [readers] laugh and be not only educated but entertained by what they discuss, and share and participate in this conversation about issues.”³⁰⁹

³⁰⁴ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

³⁰⁵ Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

³⁰⁶ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

³⁰⁷ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

³⁰⁸ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

³⁰⁹ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

Wan predicts that start-up tech companies will create more innovative ways to connect advocacy efforts with social media that can be used by non-profits.³¹⁰ EDF's Digital Marketing Specialist is also concerned with audience apathy, recognizing the need for appealing content. She believes one way to go about engaging audiences in the future is to have their scientists and economists use EDF social media pages.³¹¹

The biggest concern of environmental law NGOs is the monetization of social media. As discussed in the engagement section of my findings and analysis, "the tide is turning in terms of Facebook being an open and free platform."³¹² Facebook is making it more difficult for people to see pages' content, even if a person has chosen to like a page. Because CBD does not use the promote feature, they have been struggling to maintain the same number of likes and shares as they used to achieve.³¹³ Since different organizations have different levels of funding, it may be more difficult for some to afford to put money behind promoting their social media activity.

Despite the increased difficulty of getting content to intended audiences, CBD has done very well over the past few months. In fact, CBD doubled its Facebook page likes and Twitter followers since August 2013.³¹⁴ CBD seems to use the promote feature least out of all the organizations as well, and Norman noted that the growth was "organic."³¹⁵ In light of CBD's success, perhaps engaging and interesting content will be enough to empower environmental law organizations to overcome obstacles created by Facebook and other platforms.

After seeing what social media has provided them with over the past few years, environmental law NGOs are excited to see what the future holds. As social media is recognized

³¹⁰ Wan, Earthjustice Interview.

³¹¹ Guite, Environmental Defense Fund Interview.

³¹² Langton, Natural Resources Defense Council Interview.

³¹³ Norman, Center for Biological Diversity Interview.

³¹⁴ Ibid.

³¹⁵ According to Norman, organic growth is growth that does not involve the use of Facebook promotions.

as a more legitimate outreach tool, I expect environmental law NGOs to devote more staff and funding towards maintaining their online personas. It is evident that social media serves as a defining force for environmental law NGOs and that its influence will only continue to grow.

Bibliography

- 350.org. "Keystone XL Protest at the White House Leads to Mass Arrests," March 2, 2013.
<http://350.org/press-release/keystone-xl-protest-at-the-white-house-leads-to-mass-arrests/>.
- . "Social Media vs. Big Money: Wiring the Fight Against Keystone XL." *350.org*. Accessed March 27, 2014. <http://350.org/social-media-vs-big-money-wiring-fight-against-keystone-xl/>.
- . "What We Do." *350.org*. Accessed March 27, 2014. <http://350.org/about/what-we-do/>.
- Baude, Patrick. "Sierra Club v. Morton: Standing Trees in a Thicket of Justiciability." *48 Indiana Law Journal* 197 (1973) 48, no. 2 (January 1, 1973).
<http://www.repository.law.indiana.edu/ilj/vol48/iss2/2>.
- Blackmon, David. "The 'Sue And Settle' Racket." *Forbes*, May 27, 2013.
<http://www.forbes.com/sites/davidblackmon/2013/05/27/the-sue-and-settle-racket/>.
- "Center for Biological Diversity's Facebook." *Facebook*. Accessed March 30, 2014.
<https://www.facebook.com/CenterforBioDiv?sk=likes>.
- Chemnick, Jean. "From Legal Mavericks to Inside Policy Players," December 12, 2013.
- Corliss, Rebecca. "Photos on Facebook Generate 53% More Likes Than the Average Post [NEW DATA]." *Hubspot*, November 15, 2012. <http://blog.hubspot.com/blog/tabid/6307/bid/33800/Photos-on-Facebook-Generate-53-More-Likes-Than-the-Average-Post-NEW-DATA.aspx>.
- Curtis, Linda, Carrie Edwards, Kristen Fraser, Sheryl Gudelsky, Jenny Holmquist, Kristina Thornton, and Kaye D. Sweetser. "Adoption of Social Media for Public Relations by Nonprofit Organizations." *Public Relations Review* 36, no. 1 (2010): 90–92.
- Department Of State. The Office of Website Management, Bureau of Public Affairs. "New Keystone XL Pipeline Application," January 17, 2012. <http://www.keystonepipeline-xl.state.gov/>.
- "Digital Activism Tactics: TweetStorms." *Global Freedom Movement*. Accessed March 28, 2014.
<http://globalfree.wordpress.com/2010/10/02/tweetstorms/>.
- Dowie, Mark. *Losing Ground: American Environmentalism at the Close of the Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1996.
- Earthjustice. "Our History." *Earthjustice*. Accessed April 16, 2013.
http://earthjustice.org/about/our_history.
- . "Our Work: In the Courts and On the Hill." *Earthjustice*. Accessed April 16, 2013.
http://earthjustice.org/our_work.
- . "Staff." *Earthjustice*. Accessed April 16, 2013. <http://earthjustice.org/about/staff>.
- "Earthjustice's Facebook." *Facebook*. Accessed March 30, 2014.
<https://www.facebook.com/Earthjustice>.
- "Earthjustice's Twitter." *Twitter*. Accessed March 30, 2014. <https://twitter.com/Earthjustice>.
- Environmental Defense Fund. "Our Mission and History." *Environmental Defense Fund*. Accessed April 16, 2013. <http://www.edf.org/about/our-mission-and-history>.
- . "What We Do." *Environmental Defense Fund*. Accessed April 16, 2013.
<http://www.edf.org/what-we-do>.
- "Environmental Defense Fund's Facebook Page." *Facebook*. Accessed March 15, 2014.
<https://www.facebook.com/EnvDefenseFund>.
- Facebook. "About Page Insights." *Facebook Help Center*. Accessed March 31, 2014.
<https://www.facebook.com/help/336893449723054>.
- . "Boost Your Posts." *Facebook Help Center*. Accessed March 30, 2014.
<https://www.facebook.com/help/547448218658012/>.
- . "How Is Engagement Rate Defined?" *Facebook Help Center*. Accessed March 30, 2014.
<https://www.facebook.com/help/www/178043462360087>.

- . “How Is Reach Defined for Each of My Page Posts?” *Facebook Help Center*. Accessed March 30, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/help/241332825914969>.
- . “How News Feed Works.” Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/help/327131014036297/>.
- . “Promote Your Page.” *Facebook Help Center*. Accessed March 30, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/help/294671953976994/>.
- . “Share Button.” *Facebook Developers*. Accessed March 20, 2014. <https://developers.facebook.com/docs/plugins/share-button/>.
- . “Timeline: Now Available Worldwide.” Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/notes/facebook/timeline-now-available-worldwide/10150408488962131>.
- . “What Does It Mean to Like a Page or Content off of Facebook?” Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/help/131263873618748>.
- Farber, Daniel A. “Politics and Procedure in Environmental Law.” *Journal of Law, Economics, and Organization* 8 (1992): 59.
- Gladwell, Malcolm. “Small Change: Why the Revolution Will Not Be Tweeted.” *The New Yorker*, October 4, 2010. http://www.newyorker.com/reporting/2010/10/04/101004fa_fact_gladwell?currentPage=all.
- Gottlieb, Robert. *Forcing the Spring: The Transformation of the American Environmental Movement*. Washington, D.C.: Island Press, 1993.
- Grabowicz, Paul. “The Transition to Digital Journalism.” KdmcBerkeley, March 17, 2014. <http://multimedia.journalism.berkeley.edu/tutorials/digital-transform/twitter-and-microblogging/>.
- Guite, Lauren. Environmental Defense Fund Interview, February 27, 2014.
- Guynn, Jessica. “Facebook Hits 1 Billion Users, Reaching Historic Milestone.” *Los Angeles Times*, October 4, 2012. <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/oct/04/business/la-fi-tn-facebook-hits-historic-milestone-1-billion-users-20121004>.
- Hanscom, Greg. “Urban Outfitters: The Nature Conservancy Goes to the City.” *Grist*, February 9, 2012. <http://grist.org/cities/urban-outfitters-the-worlds-largest-conservation-group-goes-to-the-city/>.
- “How Are Pages Different from Personal Timelines.” Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/help/217671661585622>.
- Humes, Edward. *Eco Barons: The New Heroes of Environmental Activism*. New York: Ecco, 2010.
- Kanter, Beth, and Allison H Fine. *The Networked Nonprofit: Connecting with Social Media to Drive Change*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2010.
- Langton, Liz. Natural Resources Defense Council Interview, March 17, 2014.
- Lehner, Peter. “Environment, Law, and Nonprofits: How NGOs Shape Our Laws, Health, and Communities.” *Pace Environmental Law Review* 26, no. 1 (2009): 19.
- Morozov, Evgeny. *The Net Delusion: The Dark Side of Internet Freedom*. PublicAffairs, 2011.
- Natural Resource Defense Council. “Environmental Issues and Solutions to Current Environment Problems.” *Natural Resources Defense Council: Earth’s Best Defense*. Accessed April 5, 2013. <http://www.nrdc.org/issues/>.
- Natural Resources Defense Council. “About NRDC: Who We Are.” Accessed April 19, 2013. http://www.nrdc.org/about/who_we_are.asp.
- “Natural Resources Defense Council’s Facebook.” *Facebook*. Accessed March 28, 2014. <https://www.facebook.com/nrdc.org>.

- Nielsen. *State of the Media: The Social Media Report 2012.*, 2012.
<<http://www.nielsen.com/content/dam/corporate/us/en/reports-downloads/2012-Reports/The-Social-Media-Report-2012.pdf>>.
- Norman, Clayton. Center for Biological Diversity Interview. Telephone, March 14, 2014.
- O'Carroll, Lisa. "Twitter Active Users Pass 200 Million." *The Guardian*, December 18, 2012, sec. Technology. <http://www.theguardian.com/technology/2012/dec/18/twitter-users-pass-200-million>.
- Oakes, James L. "Environmental Litigation: Current Developments and Suggestions for the Future." *Connecticut Law Review* 5 (1973 1972): 531.
- Plater, Zygmunt. "From the Beginning, a Fundamental Shift of Paradigms: A Theory and Short History of Environmental Law." *Boston College Law School Faculty Papers*, 1994, 981–1008.
- Plautz, Jason. "Market Approach to Fighting Pollution Produces Results -- and Compromises -- That Set EDF Apart," December 10, 2013. <http://www.eenews.net/stories/1059991558>.
- Rotman, Dana, Sarah Vieweg, Sarita Yardi, Ed Chi, Jenny Preece, Ben Shneiderman, Peter Pirolli, and Tom Glaisyer. "From Slacktivism to Activism: Participatory Culture in the Age of Social Media." University of Maryland, 2011. <http://www.umiacs.umd.edu/publications/slacktivism-activism-participatory-culture-age-social-media>.
- Saxon, Wolfgang. "Stephen Duggan, Environmentalist, Dies at 89." *The New York Times*, November 13, 1998. <http://www.nytimes.com/1998/11/13/nyregion/stephen-duggan-environmentalist-dies-at-89.html>.
- Schor, Elana. "ADVOCACY: The Education of a Climate Upstart with a 'Weird' Name." *E & E News*, December 13, 2013. <http://www.eenews.net/stories/1059991802>.
- Sierra Club v. Morton, 405 727, (U.S. Supreme Court 1972).
- Suh, Michael. "Few Millennials Describe Themselves as Environmentalists." *Pew Research Center's Social & Demographic Trends Project*, March 5, 2014. <http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/2014/03/07/millennials-in-adulthood/sdt-next-america-03-07-2014-3-10/>.
- Switzer, Jacqueline Vaughn. *Environmental Activism: A Reference Handbook*. Santa Barbara, Calif.: ABC-CLIO, 2003.
- Turner, Jamie, and Reshma Shah. *How to Make Money with Social Media: An Insider's Guide on Using New and Emerging Media to Grow Your Business*. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: FT Press Delivers, 2011.
- Twitter. "Analytics." *Twitter for Business*. Accessed March 30, 2014. <https://business.twitter.com/products/analytics>.
- . "FAQs about Following." *Twitter Help Center*. Accessed March 28, 2014. <https://support.twitter.com/articles/14019-faqs-about-following>.
- . "Picture This: More Visual Tweets." *Twitter Blogs*. Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://blog.twitter.com/2013/picture-this-more-visual-tweets>.
- . "The Twitter Glossary." Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://support.twitter.com/articles/166337-the-twitter-glossary>.
- . "Twitter for Newsrooms and Journalists." Accessed March 24, 2014. <https://media.twitter.com/best-practice/for-newsrooms-and-journalists>.
- Wan, Ray. Earthjustice Interview. Telephone, March 12, 2014.

Appendix A: Center for Biological Diversity Facebook Posts³¹⁶

Date	Post	Topic	Category	Focus	Current Event	Likes	Shares	Comments	Picture/ Video	Link to CBD Website
1-Jan	Happy New Year from the Center for Biological Diversity. Let's make 2014 an incredible year for all creatures great and small!	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	1264	426	43	picture	0
1-Jan	Happy New Year from the Center -- thank you for making 2013 great!	other	other	positive	0	555	108	33	video	0
2-Jan	Today's the last chance to speak up for ailing bats. Take action now!	species protection	action-personal	negative	0	401	158	29	0	1
3-Jan	Have you made your New Year's resolution yet? Why not join us and resolve to help the planet!	other	action-personal	positive	0	184	38	5	0	1
3-Jan	Center supporters from Maine: Please take a minute to weigh in on this survey from the Bangor Daily News. Should wolves receive federal protection?	species protection	provoking thought	neutral	0	152	23	23	0	0

³¹⁶ "Center for Biological Diversity's Facebook."

3-Jan	Washington's state wildlife agency is putting wolves in the crosshairs -- removing them from the state's endangered species list and considering allowing hunting. Please take action before midnight tonight: In the write-in option, tell officials to keep wolves out of the game management plan. They are endangered species and should be protected.	species protection	action-political	negative	1	96	53	19	0	0
3-Jan	It's Frostpaw the Polar Bear's last day in Hawaii, but he couldn't leave without one last message to President Obama. Here he is on Hawaii News Now talking about the harms of climate change and the disastrous Keystone XL pipeline.	climate change, keystone xl	information	negative	1	230	39	10	0	0
6-Jan	Check out this article in the Knoxville Daily Sun about our Stand With Wolves event in Sacramento back in November where we urged the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to help keep wolves protected under the Endangered Species Act.	species protection	information	positive	0	392	63	14	0	0

6-Jan	Read our response letter to the editor by the Center's Noah Greenwald: The Endangered Species Act -- "which turned 40 on Dec. 28 -- has prevented the extinction of 99 percent of the more the 1,500 plants and animals it protects, in the process preserving the irreplaceable forests, waterways and ecosystems we all share."	species protection	information	positive	0	111	25	4	0	0
6-Jan	The Center fights for species great and small: We filed a petition with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service today seeking Endangered Species Act protection for the wingtail crayfish, a tiny resident of Florida's Panhandle.	species protection	news	positive	0	103	5	3	0	1
6-Jan	Wondering what the Center worked on in 2013? Maybe you want to know more about what we're doing in your area. Check out this cool interactive map of all of our activities throughout the year.	other	information	positive	0	135	22	8	0	1

6-Jan	Yesterday the Green Bay Packers lost to the San Francisco 49ers, but what was really notable was the weather -- it was one of the coldest games in NFL playoff history (with a windchill temperature near -20 degrees).What the heck made it so bitterly cold in Green Bay?	other	information	negative	1	202	170	9	0	0
6-Jan	Here's a Center op-ed from The Oregonian: Endangered Species Act still needed 40 years later. "Since being passed almost unanimously by Congress, the act has prevented extinction of 99 percent of the more than 1,500 plants and animals it protects. And in the process it has put many of those species on the road to recovery, including Steller sea lions, which just this fall were declared recovered."	species protection	information	positive	1	283	56	6	0	0
6-Jan	changed cover photo to picture of brown bear. Caption: "life is good"	species protection	nature appreciation	positive	0	383	76	5	picture	0
6-Jan	233 Endangered Species are threatened by Sea-level rise. Watch our video.	species protection	information	negative	0	123	30	4	video	0
7-Jan	Take Action: Ask Amazon and its wholesalers to stop selling bluefin tuna.	species protection	action-political	negative	1	352	120	34	0	1

7-Jan	The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service today finalized designation of 10,968 acres of protected critical habitat for the Cape Sable thoroughwort, a rare plant found only in South Florida and threatened by habitat destruction. Check out our press release to learn more: http://www.biologicaldiversity.org/news/press_releases/2014/cape-sable-thoroughwort-01-07-2014.html	species protection	news	positive	1	357	73	9	picture	1
7-Jan	changed cover photo to picture of polar bear with cub. Caption: "Because life is good"	species protection	nature appreciation	positive	0	272	36	1	picture	0

8-Jan	<p>The Obama Administration released a new set of standards for power plants today, but the regulations fall short on reducing pollution caused by gas-fired power plants. "The EPA's lax standards for gas-fired power plants contradict President Obama's strong statements about the urgent need to cut carbon and other greenhouse pollution," said the Center's Bill Snape. Check out our press release to learn more: http://www.biologicaldiversity.org/news/press_releases/2014/power-plants-01-08-2014.html</p>	climate change, energy, politics/elected officials	news	negative	1	139	137	38	picture	1
8-Jan	<p>Last month, the first wild wolf recorded in California in nearly 90 years made another visit to the Golden State. "Coinciding with OR7's December dashes across the California border, the Center for Biological Diversity had obtained the Department of Fish and Wildlife's draft status-review of that proposal to protect gray wolves in California its petition had initiated."</p>	species protection	information, news	positive	0	468	93	20	0	0

8-Jan	<p>The Center joined a coalition of groups today in a lawsuit to stop a state-hired bounty hunter from exterminating two entire packs of wolves in Idaho. "Hiring a bounty hunter to kill wolves in one of America's crown-jewel wilderness areas, just to make sure there are more elk for hunters to kill, is one more example of the deeply sad, cruel and reactionary nature of Idaho's 'management' of wolves," said Noah Greenwald, the Center's endangered species director. "This outrageous slaughter is a clear reminder of why all of our country's wolves need the protection of the Endangered Species Act." Read more in our press release, and stay tuned to take action to call off the hunt.</p> <p>http://www.biologicaldiversity.org/news/press_releases/2014/wolf-01-08-2014.html</p>	species protection	news	50/50	1	1404	4960	264	picture	1
-------	--	--------------------	------	-------	---	------	------	-----	---------	---

8-Jan	Have you joined the Bluefin Tuna Boycott? Take action now to send the message that serving bluefin tuna is unacceptable by signing our pledge. Then head over to the Facebook page: Bluefin Tuna Boycott: Join the Bluefin Brigade to get more information.	species protection	action-political	neutral	1	192	64	10	0	1
9-Jan	The EPA announced today it will now require California oil companies to report fracking chemical discharges in federal waters. This reporting is a good first step, but allowing fracking to continue in California's coastal waters puts endangered whales, sea turtles and other marine species in harms way. Learn more in our press release.	species protection, pollution, fracking	news, information	50/50	1	204	36	16	0	1
9-Jan	It's Thursday afternoon, and sometimes you just need a cute break. How about a video of a baby polar bear cub taking his first steps?	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	395	129	23	video	0
9-Jan	The Center issued a formal notice of intent today to sue the EPA for failing to enforce air-quality standards that limit dangerous particulate pollution from coal-fired power plants and other sources. Learn more in our press release.	pollution	news, information	50/50	0	166	20	8	0	1

9-Jan	Check out these striking photos by Thomas Mangelsen with commentary by Dr. Jane Goodall. "Those responsible for managing wolf populations typically think in terms of the species as a whole; they calculate the number of wolves that an environment can support or lose. But it is important to remember that each pack is composed of bonded individuals. When leaders are killed, the pack and its traditions may disintegrate. When breeders are killed, the pack's survival is threatened even more directly."	species protection	nature appreciation	positive	0	449	211	39	0	0
9-Jan	Join us this Saturday, Jan. 11 in Pittsburg, CA for a rally and march to stop the WesPac oil facility. Check out our events page for more information: http://www.biologicaldiversity.org/action/events/index.html#wespac	other	action-personal	50/50		70	15	1	picture	1

<p>10-Jan</p>	<p>Ohioans: call Senator Sherrod Brown at (202) 224-3121 and urge him to oppose current efforts to include any policy riders in the 2013 Farm Bill that would amend the Clean Water Act, Endangered Species Act or Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act to limit protections for our waterways and endangered wildlife from pesticide discharges.</p>	<p>species protection, pollution, politics/elected officials</p>	<p>action-political</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>1</p>	<p>79</p>	<p>17</p>	<p>4</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>
<p>10-Jan</p>	<p>Iowans: call Senator Tom Harkin at (202) 224-3121 and urge him to oppose current efforts to include any policy riders in the 2013 Farm Bill that would amend the Clean Water Act, Endangered Species Act or Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act to limit protections for our waterways and endangered wildlife from pesticide discharges.</p>	<p>species protection, pollution, politics/elected officials</p>	<p>action-political</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>1</p>	<p>5</p>	<p>2</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>

10-Jan	<p>Minnesotans: call Senator Amy Klobuchar at (202) 224-3121 and urge her to oppose current efforts to include any policy riders in the 2013 Farm Bill that would amend the Clean Water Act, Endangered Species Act or Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act to limit protections for our waterways and endangered wildlife from pesticide discharges.</p>	<p>species protection, pollution, politics/elected officials</p>	<p>action-political</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>1</p>	<p>12</p>	<p>2</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>
10-Jan	<p>Coloradans: call Senator Michael Bennett at (202) 224-3121 and urge him to oppose current efforts to include any policy riders in the 2013 Farm Bill that would amend the Clean Water Act, Endangered Species Act or Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act to limit protections for our waterways and endangered wildlife from pesticide discharges.</p>	<p>species protection, pollution, politics/elected officials</p>	<p>action-political</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>1</p>	<p>19</p>	<p>2</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>0</p>

10-Jan	<p>A new federal recovery plan for Gulf Coast jaguarundis - rare and enigmatic felines slightly larger than house cats -- calls for reintroducing them to south Texas, provided none can be found to still live there and other conditions are met. Jaguarundis, which have long necks, short legs and elongated tails, have been protected as an endangered species since 1976. The closest known population is 130 miles south of the border, in Mexico</p>	species protection	news, information	positive	0	904	331	40	0	1
--------	---	--------------------	-------------------	----------	---	-----	-----	----	---	---

10-Jan	The Center filed a formal notice of intent to sue the EPA yesterday for failing to enforce sanctions and federal regulations on states that missed a 2012 deadline to prove they're cleaning up air pollution. "The Clean Air Act saves lives and protects ecosystems, but only when there is a plan to attack pollution at its source," said Jonathan Evans, the Center's Toxics and Endangered Species Campaign Director. "We need the EPA and Obama administration to show the political will to enforce the law and clean up the air breathed by millions of Americans."	pollution	news, information	50/50	0	139	16	5	0	0
10-Jan	Please take action now to urge Texas officials to ban the use of gasoline for hunting and protect Texas's snakes and other wildlife that share their underground homes.	species protection	action-political	negative	0	436	277	55	0	0

13-Jan	Since they were stripped of federal protection in Idaho, 890 wolves have been killed in the state. But Idaho is taking its slaughter one gruesome step further: The state has sent a hired bounty hunter into our public lands to gun down wolves. Send a letter to the U.S. Forest Service and Idaho officials today telling them to call off the hunt.	species protection	action-political	negative	0	416	214	70	0	1
14-Jan	The PolyMet mine in northern Minnesota will pollute some of the wildest lakes and streams in the state. In order to meet water-quality standards for sulfates, mercury and other nasty stuff that will be released in the mining process, the company will need to mechanically treat wastewater for at least 500 years. If you're in Minnesota take action today and urge the Minnesota Department of Natural Resources to reject PolyMet's mine proposal.	pollution, mining	action-political	negative	1	476	212	26	0	1

15-Jan	The U.S. Department of Agriculture's Wildlife Services may sound harmless, but this secretive wildlife-extermination agency is killing as many as 3 million coyotes, bears, beavers, foxes, birds, wolves and other native animals each year. Now, Wildlife Services is gunning to expand its wolf-killing program to Washington state. Please act now to urge the USDA to protect Washington's recovering wolf populations and rein in Wildlife Services.	species protection	action-political	negative	0	613	398	57	0	1
--------	--	--------------------	------------------	----------	---	-----	-----	----	---	---

Appendix B: Center for Biological Diversity Twitter Tweets³¹⁷

Date	Tweets	Topic	Category	Focus	current event	RTs	Faves	Link to CBD website
9-Jan	Whales, dolphins collateral damage in #seafood, but the Center, @NRDC, others are doing something about it http://ow.ly/sqoE7 via @NPR	species protection	information	50/50	0	5	3	0
9-Jan	@EPA begins requiring California oil companies to report #fracking chemical discharges in federal waters http://ow.ly/sqwJb	fracking, pollution	news	positive	1	13	3	1
9-Jan	RT from another organization: EPA Will Require Offshore #Frackers to Report #Chemicals Discharged Into #Pacific - http://ecowatch.com/2014/01/09/off-shore-frackers-report-chemicals-discharged-in-pacific/ ... @CenterForBioDiv @EndangeredOcean	fracking, pollution	news	positive	1	11	4	0

³¹⁷ "Center for Biological Diversity's Twitter."

9-Jan	Endangered Earth: Emergency Action to Stop Idaho Wolf Killing http://bit.ly/JKGAeL	species protection	information	positive	1	12	2	1
9-Jan	Holy Icebergs! A Warmer, Thirstier Future on Tap http://ow.ly/sqDEs via @HuffingtonPost @humpsmarter #climate #climatechange	climate change	news	negative		5	0	0
9-Jan	The last #wolves? Beautiful photos by Thomas D. Mangelsen and commentary by Dr. Jane Goodall http://ow.ly/sqSB8 via @washingtonpost	species protection	information	50/50		10	2	0
9-Jan	Join Us at a Movie Premiere: "Momenta" http://bit.ly/KFa9hX	other	other	neutral		1	0	1
9-Jan	Lawsuit Launched to Protect People, Wildlife From Toxic Soot #Pollution http://ow.ly/sqVeq	pollution	information	50/50	0	6	0	1
9-Jan	The anniversary of a federal act of empathy http://ow.ly/srg6y via @sltrib #ESA	species protection	information	positive	1	1	2	0

10-Jan	Caltrans will remove nets from Petaluma highway project -- save swallows http://ow.ly/st1Cf via @NorthBayNews	species protection	news	positive	1	2	1	0
10-Jan	Return of #Jaguarundis: New Federal Plan Could Bring Small Endangered Cats Back to South Texas http://ow.ly/st0ED	species protection	news	positive	1	5	2	1
10-Jan	National group threatening to sue #EPA over not enforcing sanctions for missed clean air deadlines http://ow.ly/st2ul via @newsminer	pollution	news	negative		3	2	0
10-Jan	Keep Open-pit Mines Out of Wild Minnesota http://bit.ly/JO83ft	mining	action-political	negative		5	1	1
10-Jan	Take Action and Tell Texas: Stop Gassing Animals http://ow.ly/st4oc	species protection	action-political	negative		8	1	1
10-Jan	Stop Idaho's Wolf-killing Hired Gun http://bit.ly/KKOq8p	species protection	action-political	negative		10	0	1
10-Jan	#EPA will let #frackers keep on dumping chemicals into the sea http://ow.ly/sts6j via @grist	fracking, pollution	news	negative	1	12	3	0

10-Jan	When Big Carnivores Go Down, Even Vegetarians Take The Hit http://ow.ly/stDiC via @NPR	species protection	information	negative		20	3	0
11-Jan	RT from EcoWatch "Until recently, no one even knew that our oceans were being fracked." http://ecowatch.com/2014/01/09/off-shore-frackers-report-chemicals-discharged-in-pacific/ ... @CenterForBioDiv @EndangeredOcean	fracking, pollution	information	negative		31	11	0
13-Jan	RT from mother jones: After Years of Decline, Carbon Emissions Rose Again in 2013 http://bit.ly/11VzB1c	climate change	news	negative		20	5	0
13-Jan	RT from defenders of wildlife; Restore large carnivores to save struggling ecosystems http://dfnd.us/L3brEl via @ConversationUK	species protection	information	negative		11	3	0

13-Jan	RT from Jarrett Schaff (associated with 350.org): 1 min video by @CenterForBioDiv shows all the pipeline spills since 86'. All I can say is Holy Shnikes! http://youtu.be/3rxqUXqPzog @Detroitcats	pollution	information	negative	1	4	3	0
13-Jan	RT from San Diego zoo: Dec 2013 marked 40 years of the Endangered Species Act & the @CenterForBioDiv released facts & stats: http://ow.ly/sujaZ	species protection	information	positive	1	2	1	1
14-Jan	Tell @Amazon: Stop Selling #Bluefin Tuna! http://www.thepetitionsite.com/takeaction/913/567/836/ ...	species protection	action-political	negative	1	4	1	0
14-Jan	Join @CenterForBioDiv or renew your membership to save #wolves & #bears by 9 pm Thurs & you could win this poster http://ow.ly/szZg0	other	action-personal	positive		0	0	1
14-Jan	Renew Your Membership to Save Wolves, Bears http://bit.ly/1aCxnPY	other	action-personal	positive		2	0	1

14-Jan	Renew Your Membership to Save Wolves, Bears http://bit.ly/1aCxnQ4	other	action-personal	positive		1	0	1
14-Jan	RT from Ross Hammond (with Friends of the Earth): "Californians deliver 100k comments opposing fracking http://credoaction.com/californians-submit-100000-public-comments-opposing-gov-browns-dangerous-fracking-regulations/ ... #unfrackcal @CenterForBioDiv @CRPE_EJ @DFAaction @MoveOn"	fracking	news	negative		10	3	0
14-Jan	Stop Idaho's #Wolf-killing Hired Gun! http://www.thepetitionsite.com/take-action/379/209/656/ ...	species protection	action-political	negative		6	2	0
15-Jan	RT from Sierra Club MN: "Local View in @duluthnews - PolyMet study proves risk is too high http://bit.ly/1eDynCr Great commentary by @centerforbiodiv"	mining	news	negative	1	2	1	0

15-Jan	Don't Let Wildlife Services Kill Our Wolves http://bit.ly/1m5ZFXE	species protection	action-political	negative		5	3	1
15-Jan	New Year brings protections for California #bobcats and atonement for a Joshua Tree conservationist http://ow.ly/sC8er @highcountrynews	species protection	news	positive	1	3	0	1
15-Jan	Don't let Wildlife Services kill our #wolves http://ow.ly/sC8Hd	species protection	action-political	negative		15	7	
15-Jan	It's Official: Federal Report Confirms Diluted Bitumen Sinks http://ow.ly/sCqck #dilbit #NoKXL #tarsands	pollution, keystone XL	news	negative	1	2	3	0
15-Jan	Shocking negligence revealed at West Virginia chemical facility http://www.salon.com/2014/01/15/shocking_negligence_revealed_at_west_virginia_chemical_facility/ ... via @Salon	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	6	0	0
15-Jan	Tell @Amazon: Stop selling #bluefin #tuna http://www.thepetitionsite.com/takeaction/913/567/836/ ...	species protection	action-political	negative	1	5	0	0

15-Jan	Stop Idaho's #Wolf-killing Hired Gun! http://www.thepetitionsite.com/takeaction/379/209/656/#bbtw=691912070 ...	species protection	action-political	negative	0	9	1	0
15-Jan	Tell Governor Brown: Ban #Fracking Now, Protect California's #water #wildlife and #climate http://ow.ly/sCZVT	fracking, pollution, politics/elected officials	action-political	negative	0	17	3	0

Appendix C: Earthjustice Facebook Posts³¹⁸

Date	Post	Topic	Category	Focus	current event	Likes	Shares	Comments	Picture/ Video	Link to Earthjustice Website
1-Jan	HAPPY NEW YEAR! We want to wish all of our supporters a joyous start to 2014. As we look ahead, we know there will be many important battles to come as we fight for our fundamental right to a healthy environment. But we're optimistic. Why? Because we've got the best attorneys on Earth and the best supporters we can ask for. Click SHARE or LIKE to celebrate the beginning of 2014! TELL US >> What do you wish for most in the coming year?	other	provoking thought	positive	0	1140	236	55	picture	0

³¹⁸ "Earthjustice's Facebook."

2-Jan	<p>A JOURNEY TOWARDS CLEAN ENERGY: The Four Corners Power Plant in New Mexico has been operating without modern pollution controls for the past 50 years – but after dedicated litigation, it has been announced that the plant will retire Units 1, 2, and 3 of the Plant and install long-overdue pollution controls on the remaining two units. Uncontrolled pollution from this plant threatens the health of its Navajo neighbors and mars visibility in surrounding national parks, including the iconic Grand Canyon. Retirement of three of the plant’s units is an important step forward for environmental justice, protection of public lands, and our ongoing struggle against climate change. Learn about the case here>> http://ow.ly/sdpXE. SHARE and LIKE if you think this is a great step toward a clean energy future!</p>	energy	news	positive	0	440	222	23	picture	1
-------	---	--------	------	----------	---	-----	-----	----	---------	---

3-Jan	<p>GMO: ENGINEERING AN ENVIRONMENTAL DISASTER. When it comes to genetically modified organisms, there are concerns about cross-contamination with organic crops, increased herbicide use, ecosystem degradation, and the development of 'superweeds'. But what's really at stake when our crops are modified? LISTEN to learn more about GMO regulations, and how consumers can be aware of what's being sold at the supermarket. TELL US>> What facts did you find most interesting? https://soundcloud.com/earthjustice-down2earth/gmos-environmental-disaster</p>	food	information, provoking thought	negative	0	326	193	22	0	0
-------	--	------	-----------------------------------	----------	---	-----	-----	----	---	---

6-Jan	<p>BEWILDERING: The USDA has just released a draft environmental impact statement dismissing serious concerns about a new class of GMOs and the powerful, toxic herbicide they were manufactured to resist: Dow Agrosience's 2,4-D. When crops were first doused with Monsanto's Roundup in the 1970s, some naturally immune weeds survived and reproduced, creating millions of acres of farmland infested with super weeds. The industry's response now? Create a new generation of even deadlier pesticides with the USDA's blessing. We'll let you guys know when you can send comments to the USDA on this issue. For now, please click SHARE or LIKE to spread the news around! Share your comments below.</p>	food	news and information	negative	0	10003	1707	167	picture	0
-------	--	------	----------------------	----------	---	-------	------	-----	---------	---

7-Jan	<p>Album "Tom Murphy Yellowstone Pictures". "It's not about money. It's about taking care of this place." That's the philosophy behind acclaimed photographer, Tom Murphy, who has spent much of his life documenting the stunning landscape and wildlife of Yellowstone. From erupting geysers to close encounters with grizzly bears, Tom has seen it all. Check out our incredible slideshow and interview with Tom. http://ow.ly/skpA4 Click SHARE or LIKE if you enjoyed it! TELL US>> Which was your favorite photo in the slideshow? Why?</p>	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	357	69	14	picture	1
-------	---	-------	---------------------	----------	---	-----	----	----	---------	---

8-Jan	<p>GLIMPSE OF WHAT'S AHEAD: Our 80+ attorneys are excited for the new year as they gear up for big court battles over our environment. Take a sneak peak at some of our cases!http://ow.ly/smwnE. Among the highlights:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stopping Wyoming's Brutal Wolf Hunts - Protecting Communities from Fracking - Reducing Toxic Emissions from the Dirtiest Power Plants - Safeguarding Bees from Dangerous Pesticides - And much more... <p>Check out our interactive 2014 docket to learn more about our upcoming cases! Click SHARE or LIKE if you agree the earth needs a good lawyer!</p>	other	information	positive	0	456	256	16	picture	1
-------	--	-------	-------------	----------	---	-----	-----	----	---------	---

<p>9-Jan</p>	<p>DON'T LET THEM GET AWAY WITH IT: CBS' 60 Minutes has come under fire for airing an extremely one-sided report on the "clean energy crash" that cherry picks data favorable to the fossil fuel industry while ignoring the numerous successes of clean tech.http://ow.ly/sop1V. Host Lesley Stahl ignores facts such as the whopping 97% success rate of the federal government's clean energy loan program, and that wind was America's largest source of new electrical capacity in 2012. Instead, Stahl focuses on one-off failures like Solyndra and never once mentions climate change. Unsurprisingly, Exxon Mobil has been paying big bucks to promote the tweets of 60 Minutes... TAKE ACTION>> Let CBS and 60 Minutes know clean energy is NOT dead and you expect balanced reporting! Email them at 60m@cbsnews.com or call (212) 975-3247. You can also tweet them at @LesleyRStahl and @60Minutes or leave a comment on their page: http://ow.ly/soxjl Share your thoughts below.</p>	<p>energy, climate change</p>	<p>action-personal</p>	<p>50/50</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>792</p>	<p>677</p>	<p>134</p>	<p>picture</p>	<p>0</p>
--------------	--	-------------------------------	------------------------	--------------	----------	------------	------------	------------	----------------	----------

10-Jan	<p>UPDATE: WV Residents - here's a list of places where you can get free, clean water: http://ow.ly/ssTqA Stay strong! BREAKING NEWS: A chemical used in coal processing has spilled into West Virginia's Elk River, contaminating the water supply for 300,000 people and shutting down much of the capitol, Charleston. Both the federal government and the state have declared an emergency state of disaster. http://ow.ly/ssC20 Panicked residents have emptied supermarket shelves of bottled water as authorities warn people not to drink, bathe, wash, or cook with the frothy, licorice-smelling water. The chemical spilled last night from a plant owned by Freedom Industries, a chemical manufacturer. Click SHARE or LIKE to spread the breaking news! Share your thoughts with the people of West Virginia below.</p>	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	869	3071	215	picture	0
--------	---	-----------------------	------	----------	---	-----	------	-----	---------	---

11-Jan	<p>OUTRAGEOUS: In an unprecedented move, the Forest Service has just approved Idaho's disastrous plan to eradicate two wolf packs deep within one of the largest, protected wilderness areas in the Lower 48? Why? So that hunters can kill more elk.http://ow.ly/srnYM Our attorneys are furiously working to halt this plan, which undermines the very notion of having protected wilderness areas. These are majestic places that are supposed to be governed by nature - they are not elk breeding farms where hunters can bag another trophy. We're going to fight Idaho and the Forest Service tooth and nail on this. If you want to help donate to our emergency wolf fund, here's the link: http://ow.ly/sroIP Please click SHARE or LIKE and add your comment below!</p>	species protection	news, action-personal	negative	1	1562	4399	492	picture	1
--------	--	--------------------	-----------------------	----------	---	------	------	-----	---------	---

12-Jan	<p>HOPE FOR ELEPHANTS: Conservationists are hailing China's recent move to destroy over 6 tons of illegal ivory as a potential breakthrough in the global effort to stop the poaching of elephants. http://ow.ly/smALQ The much publicized event in China, the world's largest market for ivory, marks the first time the country has taken such a firm stance against illegal ivory trading, and comes on the heels of its recent decision to enforce strict limits on shark finning, which has resulted in a 70% drop. The US, where ivory is unfortunately also legal, conducted a similar purge last November, as have Kenya, Gabon, and the Philippines. Now France has indicated that it too may do the same. Click SHARE or LIKE if you think China, US, and other countries should continue their efforts to stamp out the ivory trade! Share your thoughts below.</p>	species protection	news	positive	1	1057	664	100	picture	0
--------	---	--------------------	------	----------	---	------	-----	-----	---------	---

<p>14-Jan</p>	<p>ORWELLIAN: Life in West Virginia's capitol city, Charleston, ground to a halt last week as a chemical spill contaminated water for 300,000 people in the area. Nonetheless, GOP members of the Senate are still pushing forward with a bill to create "Economic Freedom Zones" that would exempt polluters from complying with the Clean Water Act in high-poverty regions like parts of West Virginia. http://earthjustice.org/blog/2014-january/bill-would-cripple-epa-s-power-to-prevent-toxic-spills Billed as an anti-poverty measure, the "freedom" zones would hamstring the EPA's ability to enforce water pollution restrictions in some of our most vulnerable communities. Ironically, the company responsible for the chemical spill is also named "Freedom Industries".... We'll keep everyone informed as the bill progresses and let you know when you can take action. For now, click SHARE or LIKE to help spread this news! Share your thoughts below.</p>	<p>pollution, W.VA spill</p>	<p>news, information</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>1</p>	<p>2,213</p>	<p>16,311</p>	<p>750</p>	<p>picture</p>	<p>1</p>
---------------	--	------------------------------	--------------------------	-----------------	----------	--------------	---------------	------------	----------------	----------

15-Jan	<p>GOOD NEWS: For anyone doubting whether solar energy will play an even larger role in our energy mix, look no further than this latest graph from Bloomberg News. Thanks to technological advances and increased competition, the price of solar has plummeted from to \$0.74/watt in 2013 - on par with a number of dirty fossil fuels! http://ow.ly/sCipJ . That may help explain why California added more rooftop solar in 2013 than in the past 30 years combined. As the cost of renewable sources like wind and solar continue to fall, utilities may not have a choice but to switch to cleaner energy. Click SHARE or LIKE to give two thumbs up to solar energy! TELL US >> Does your home or city get any of its energy from solar or other renewables? What has your experience been?</p>	energy	news, provoking thought	positive	0	1068	905	57	picture	
--------	--	--------	-------------------------	----------	---	------	-----	----	---------	--

16-Jan	<p>THE NEXT KEYSTONE XL: That's how people are describing the fight over plans to build a huge fracked gas export facility on the Chesapeake Bay that could lock the US into decades of more fracking. But you can speak up now!</p> <p>>> http://ow.ly/sD8TS. The proposal would pipe fracked gas from Pennsylvania to Maryland, and ship it halfway across the globe to be burned. This project, and others like it, could also encourage even more fracking across the country, in places like California and New York. That's why folks from nurses to watermen to local business owners are opposing it. TAKE ACTION NOW! Even if you don't live in Maryland, your voice is important - don't let the fracking industry win! Click SHARE or LIKE and take action now! >></p> <p>http://ow.ly/sD8TS</p>	fracking	information, action-political	negative	1	1007	1158	83	picture	0
--------	---	----------	-------------------------------	----------	---	------	------	----	---------	---

17-Jan	<p>ACTIONS, NOT WORDS: Although the President has made some bold moves to reduce fossil fuel use and tackle climate change, his continuous insistence on an "ALL OF THE ABOVE" energy policy is threatening the very progress he's trying to make.http://ow.ly/sFAPs . We understand the US can't immediately end all fossil fuel use, but America needs a smart, ambitious clean energy strategy that moves us forward - not a blind pursuit of every energy source out there, no matter how dirty or inefficient. In two weeks, the President will be giving his State of the Union speech. Click SHARE or LIKE if you think he needs to drop his insistence on "all of the above" and focus on clean energy! Share your thoughts below.</p>	energy, climate change, politics/elected officials	information	50/50	1	385	212	39	picture	0
--------	---	--	-------------	-------	---	-----	-----	----	---------	---

21-Jan	<p>JUST WALK AWAY: That's what polluters of the nation's most toxic industrial sites would be able to do thanks to the House GOP. Without much media spotlight, the House has quietly passed a bill gutting Superfund, the landmark law that requires industries to safely handle and clean up their toxic messes. http://ow.ly/sygXm Why would the House want to kill Superfund? One main reason is to protect the coffers of polluting industries. The bill would prevent the EPA from establishing rules to ensure polluters can't just walk away from toxic sites and foot taxpayers with the clean-up bill. The good news is that the bill will have a hard time passing the Senate and President Obama has hinted that he would veto it. But click SHARE or LIKE to let the House GOP know we are watching their every move! Share your thoughts below.</p>	pollution, politics/elected officials	news, information	50/50	1	1034	2232	121	picture	0
--------	---	---------------------------------------	-------------------	-------	---	------	------	-----	---------	---

22-Jan	<p>GMO DISASTER: Once hailed by the chemical industry as a savior for modern agriculture, GMOs are now turning into an ecological headache. They increase pesticide use, creating superweeds and contaminating other non-GMO crops in the field. Listen to Earthjustice Attorney, Paul Achitoff, as he talks about how we are using the courts to stop the spread of GMOs. Click SHARE or LIKE and feel free to leave a comment below! https://soundcloud.com/earthjustice-down2earth/gmos-environmental-disaster</p>	food	information	negative	0	1451	324	61	audio	0
--------	---	------	-------------	----------	---	------	-----	----	-------	---

23-Jan	<p>VICTORY! Shell Oil won't be happy with the latest setback to its plan to drill in the Arctic. The Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals has ruled that the Dept. of Interior violated the law when it sold offshore oil and gas leases in the Chukchi Sea to oil companies like Shell. http://ow.ly/sR6iM. Dept. of Interior is now forced to revise its environmental analysis and reconsider the controversial leases. The Chukchi, part of the Arctic Ocean, is prime habitat for polar bears, beluga whales, walrus and seals. It is also home to vibrant Alaska Native Communities who depend on the ocean for their subsistence. Click SHARE or LIKE to give two thumbs up to the court ruling and to the Earthjustice attorneys who helped make it happen! TELL US >> Should special places in the Arctic be off-limits to oil drilling?</p>	land conservation, species protection	news, provoking thought	positive	1	3054	3471	181	picture	1
24-Jan	<p>WINTER WONDERLAND: What does your winter currently look like? Are you knee-deep in snow or building sandcastles on the beach? SHOW US>> What does your winter look like where you live? Tag your photos on Instagram with #reasonsweprotect or upload</p>	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	488	94	34	picture	0

	your photo to the comments section below. Stay safe and warm, and Happy Friday!									
--	---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

<p>24-Jan</p>	<p>RIBBON OF LIFE: We're less than a month in, but 2014 is already shaping up to be a tough year for rivers. Coast to coast, the headlines have been bleak. http://ow.ly/sVo2k It is imperative that we remember that a river is more than a sponge that can be wrung dry to meet our municipal, industrial and agricultural needs. The Colorado River is home to endangered species and the linchpin of a complex regional ecosystem supporting irreplaceable wildlife and natural communities. Arising in the mountains of Wyoming and Colorado and cutting across an arid region to the Gulf of California, this river is the lifeblood of its region like no other. The Colorado is also host to numerous recreational and economic opportunities, a vital element of our region, but only as long as it flows. LEARN >> about what our attorneys are doing to move ahead with the litigation to stop piecemeal assault on vital river systems. TELL US>> What river system is near you? Have you seen any impacts to local ecosystems as a result of drought? http://ow.ly/sVo2k</p>	<p>resource protection</p>	<p>nature appreciation, provoking thought</p>	<p>50/50</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>736</p>	<p>410</p>	<p>31</p>	<p>picture</p>	<p>1</p>
---------------	---	----------------------------	---	--------------	----------	------------	------------	-----------	----------------	----------

27-Jan	<p>BREAKING NEWS! Two wolf packs deep within the largest protected wilderness area in the Lower 48 are now safe after Idaho announced it was abandoning plans to wipe them out.</p> <p>http://ow.ly/t0Kg4 The Golden and Monumental wolf packs - featured on PBS' Nature series - were targeted for extermination when Idaho and the Forest Service wanted to maximize elk numbers to appease hunters. But Earthjustice and our allies immediately jumped in and took emergency legal action. Our victory is a stunning reversal of fortune for the two wolf packs and we are thrilled to share this news with you all! Click SHARE or LIKE to celebrate the protection of Idaho's wolves! We are still fighting Wyoming's wolf hunts, so if you want to donate to keep the momentum going, here's the link! http://ow.ly/t0LHO</p>	species protection	news	50/50	1	7571	12,955	940	picture	1
--------	---	--------------------	------	-------	---	------	--------	-----	---------	---

<p>28-Jan</p>	<p>19 days later, West Virginia is still in a clean water crisis. The chemical spill that left 300,000 West Virginia residents without usable water involved more chemicals than the company responsible had previously reported- leading the state's Department of Environmental Protection to order Freedom Industries to give a full accounting of the chemicals that had leaked into the Elk River. http://ow.ly/t2yhy Interestingly, during the time since we last posted about this clean water crisis, the company - Freedom Industries - has filed for bankruptcy. Initially claiming 7,500 gallons spilled into a river supplying water in the state, they now admit approximately 10,000 gallons of chemicals was released. Nonetheless, GOP members of the Senate are still pushing forward with a bill to create "Economic Freedom Zones" that would exempt polluters from complying with the Clean Water Act in high-poverty regions like parts of West Virginia. http://ow.ly/t2you We need your help. SIGN THE PETITION TODAY>>> Demand justice for West</p>	<p>pollution, W.VA spill</p>	<p>news, action-political</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>1</p>	<p>752</p>	<p>1336</p>	<p>92</p>	<p>picture</p>	<p>1</p>
---------------	--	------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------	------------	-------------	-----------	----------------	----------

	Virginians whose water has been poisoned: http://j.mp/CAREpetition									
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

29-Jan	<p>"... the debate is settled. Climate change is a fact." - President Obama, 2014 State of the Union. There were some encouraging signs yesterday that President Obama would put climate change and clean energy on the forefront in 2014. He talked about the need to end \$4 billion in fossil fuel subsidies and increase fuel efficiency to reduce our carbon pollution.</p> <p>http://ow.ly/t4P3x But if the US is to really tackle the climate crisis, we can't rely on an "all of the above" energy policy - we need the "best of the above." And that means steadily weaning ourselves off coal, oil, and gas and pursuing an aggressive renewable energy policy. TELL US >> What grade would you give the State of the Union? Do you agree that we need "best of the above" rather than a blind "all of the above" strategy?</p>	climate change, energy, politics/elected officials	information, provoking thought	50/50	1	408	78	81	picture	1
--------	--	--	--------------------------------	-------	---	-----	----	----	---------	---

30-Jan	<p>DONE! Shell Oil's CEO just announced the company was dropping all plans to drill in the Arctic in 2014, and even hinted that it may withdraw from the region for good. http://ow.ly/t7vsh Shell's highly controversial plan to extract oil from one of the most remote, pristine and risky places on earth hit a major hurdle last week when Earthjustice and our partners won a court victory halting its drilling leases in the Chukchi Sea. Shell hinted it will not be prioritizing Arctic drilling in the future and was now "reviewing" its options there. Click SHARE or LIKE to celebrate the great news! TELL US >> Should other oil companies follow Shell's lead and withdraw from the Arctic?</p>	land conservation, energy	news	positive	1	5527	10938	411	picture	1
--------	--	---------------------------	------	----------	---	------	-------	-----	---------	---

31-Jan	<p>FINALLY! After years of delay, communities struggling with toxic coal ash pollution are celebrating the EPA's historic announcement that it will finalize first-ever coal ash regulations by the end of the year. http://ow.ly/t7xDN Not one ounce of the millions of tons of toxic ash generated every year by coal burning is currently regulated by the federal government - in fact, our household garbage is more strictly regulated! We hope this will change by the end of the year. For communities struggling with mercury, arsenic, and lead contamination due to coal ash, it couldn't come soon enough. Click SHARE or LIKE to celebrate this historic achievement on coal ash! Share your thoughts below.</p>	pollution, energy	news	50/50	1	1456	784	52	picture	1
--------	--	----------------------	------	-------	---	------	-----	----	---------	---

31-Jan	<p>SAY YES TO CLEAN AIR: Earthjustice and our partners are telling the Colorado Air Quality Control Commission to adopt strong rules that will protect communities across the state from greenhouse gasses and toxic pollutants. http://ow.ly/ta4Fw The oil and gas industry wants to restrict the state's pollution control rules to the Front Range communities where air quality already violates federal standards—leaving the rest of the state vulnerable to dirty air. Oil and gas activities, such as fracking, is already the leading source of smog in Colorado. Should we really wait until everyone's air is toxic before we make industry pay its fair share? Click SHARE or LIKE to tell the Commission and the Governor that every Coloradan deserves pollution-free air! TELL US >> Why is clean air important for your family and Colorado?</p>	<p>resource conservation, climate change, energy, fracking, pollution, politics/elected officials</p>	<p>information, provoking thought</p>	<p>negative</p>	<p>0</p>	<p>90</p>	<p>51</p>	<p>9</p>	<p>picture</p>	<p>1</p>
--------	---	---	---------------------------------------	-----------------	----------	-----------	-----------	----------	----------------	----------

Appendix D: Earthjustice Twitter Tweets³¹⁹

Date	Tweets	Topic	Category	Focus	Current event	RTs	Faves	Link to Earthjustice Website
9-Jan	Bravo to LA for being the largest American city to-date to ban plastic bags! http://ow.ly/soGY9	urban sustainability	news	positive	1	14	5	0
9-Jan	TY @RepSinema 4 amendment & attempt 2 fix #HR2279. We need safe management & prompt clean up of #Superfund sites!	pollution, politics/elected officials	information	50/50	1	1	0	0
9-Jan	TY @RepPaulTonko 4 your amdt & leadership 2 protect our communities from #toxic waste. We need prompt clean up of #Superfund sites!	pollution, politics/elected officials	information	50/50	1	2	1	0
9-Jan	TAKE ACTION: Pres.Obama proposes first-ever carbon pollution standards for power plants. Tell him you support it: http://ow.ly/sqHu4	climate change	action-political	positive	1	8	4	1

³¹⁹ "Earthjustice's Twitter."

9-Jan	TY @keithellison @WaxmanClimate @repblumenauer @FrankPallone 4 speaking against #HR2279 a destructive bill attacking #Superfund	pollution, politics/elected officials	recognition	50/50	1	4	3	0
9-Jan	TY @john_dingell @RepSeanMaloney @RepJaredPolis @GerryConnolly speaking against #HR2279 a destructive bill attacking #superfund	pollution, politics/elected officials	recognition	50/50	1	3	3	0
9-Jan	Good news: China joins US in crushing tons of illegal ivory as more & more countries take stand to protect #elephants http://ow.ly/smyPI	species protection	news	positive	1	18	8	0
10-Jan	Our thoughts are with the 300,000 people of WV who could be affected by this coal plant's chemical spill: http://www.theguardian.com/ world/2014/jan/10/west- virginia-chemical-spill-elk- river-charleston ...	pollution, W. VA spill	information, news	negative	1	22	3	0

10-Jan	WATCH @RepScottPeters speech against #HR2279. TY 4 defending program 2 clean up #toxic waste sites #Superfund http://bit.ly/1gUAN1V	pollution, politics/elected officials	recognition	50/50	1	7	0	0
10-Jan	WATCH Rep. @keithellison speak against #HR2279.Bill will expose Americans 2 dangerous chemicals #Superfund http://bit.ly/1cUsQo6	pollution, politics/elected officials	information, recognition	50/50	1	10	1	0
10-Jan	State of disaster declared as coal processing chemical contaminates water supply for 300,000 & shuts down WV capitol:	pollution, W. VA spill	news	negative	1	63	4	0
10-Jan	WV Residents: Here's a list of places to get clean water during the chemical spill disaster http://ow.ly/ssSAI Our thoughts are w/ you!	pollution, W. VA spill	information	negative	1	41	5	0
10-Jan	RT @kenwardjr: OSHA has opened investigation and is on site at Freedom Industries, source of big WV chem spill.	pollution, W. VA spill	news	negative	1	5	0	0

11-Jan	Pls keep the people of WV in thoughts & prayers: Hundreds sickened after West Virginia coal chemical spill http://usnews.nbcnews.com/news/2014/01/10/22258897-hundreds-report-symptoms-after-west-virginia-chemical-spill ... @NBCnews	pollution, W. VA spill	information	negative	1	32	2	0
11-Jan	EMERGENCY: Idaho plans to eradicate two entire #wolf packs from protected wilderness area. Help us stop them now! http://ow.ly/srolP	species protection	action-personal	negative	1	13	3	1
11-Jan	FACT: Power plants are US' single largest contributor to climate change. Tell Obama you support strong bold action: http://ow.ly/sqIdt	climate change, energy	action-political	negative	0	21	1	1

12-Jan	<p>Want to help people in WV get clean water during this coal chem spill emergency? Visit</p> <p>https://www.facebook.com/pages/WV-Clean-Water-Hub/207054796151900 ... & sign</p> <p>http://petitions.moveon.org/sign/demand-coal-enforcement-1?source=c.url&r_by=4510024 ...</p>	pollution, W. VA spill	action-political	50/50	1	16	3	0
12-Jan	<p>Time for bold climate action: first-ever carbon pollution standards for power plants just announced. Show support now</p> <p>http://ow.ly/sqJKp</p>	climate change	action-political	positive	1	17	3	1
13-Jan	<p>"...all Americans will lose a powerful advocate and public servant when Rep. George Miller [@askgeorge] retires."</p> <p>http://earthjustice.org/news/press/2014/earthjustice-statement-on-rep-george-miller-s-retirement ...</p>	politics/elected officials	recognition	neutral	1	0	1	1

13-Jan	Earthjustice Statement on Rep. George Miller's (@AskGeorge) Retirement: http://earthjustice.org/news/press/2014/earthjustice-statement-on-rep-george-miller-s-retirement ...	politics/elected officials	recognition	neutral	1	1	1	1
13-Jan	Florida farmworker comes to DC to #fendforfarmworkers. Check out @CivilEats story: http://bit.ly/1aGMCUe	food	information	positive	1	5	5	0
13-Jan	EPA Issues Flawed Air Pollution Plan for Wyoming - New federal plan allows some coal-fired power plants to continu... http://ow.ly/2CUAEm	pollution	news	negative	1	5	3	0
13-Jan	Five days after West Virginia chemical spill, clean water still not fully restored to residents yet. http://ow.ly/sy1rL	pollution, W. VA spill	news	negative	1	4	4	0
13-Jan	Inspiring: Daughter of Farmworkers Lobbies in DC for Better Working Conditions #fendforfarmworkers http://ow.ly/sy72w	food	news	positive	0	2	2	0

13-Jan	Senate confirms final empty seat in #DCCircuit http://bit.ly/1dkz0Ta #courts matter	politics/elected officials	news	neutral	1	2	0	1
13-Jan	What WV chemical spill? Proposed "economic freedom zones" would exempt polluters from Clean Water Act in poor areas. http://ow.ly/syadR	pollution, W. VA spill	news, information	negative	1	20	3	1
13-Jan	MUST-READ piece by @anamariex: That WV chemical spill? It's likely a bigger scandal than Bridgegate http://gu.com/p/3yz9p/tw	pollution, W. VA spill	news	negative	1	19	9	0
13-Jan	Senate Confirms Judge to Last Open Seat on D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals http://ow.ly/2CV5YW	politics/elected officials	news	neutral	1	2	2	1
14-Jan	Right Now: @SenatorBoxer & @SenWhitehouse are leading a new Climate Action Task Force and "Waking Up Congress" to #ActOnClimate. Big ups!	climate change, politics/elected officials	news	positive	1	6	3	0

14-Jan	Sick of climate denial & lies, 12 Senators launch a Climate Action Task Force to "wake up Congress." #ActonClimate http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/post-politics/wp/2014/01/09/boxer-whitehouse-announce-new-push-on-climate/ ...	climate change, politics/elected officials	news	50/50	1	18	8	0
14-Jan	Con Job: House quietly passes bill allowing polluters to walk away from toxic mess & foot taxpayers w clean-up cost http://ow.ly/sygXm	pollution, politics/elected officials	news	negative	1	9	3	1
14-Jan	While Senate leaders push climate solutions http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/01/09/senate-climate-task-force_n_4570627.html ..., a House subcomm tries to block climate action: http://docs.house.gov/meetings/IF/IF03/20140114/101659/BILLS-113HR3826pih-HR3826theElectricitySecurityU1.pdf ...	climate change, politics/elected officials	news	50/50	1	4	1	0

14-Jan	Great story from @gbtrauss @Marisol_Bello: WV company Freedom Industries under scrutiny for chemical spill http://usat.ly/1ePqQRn @USATODAY	pollution, W. VA spill	news	negative	1	1	0	0
14-Jan	Chem spill leaves 300K in WV w/out water and Congress tacks a pro-water-dumping, pro-MTR rider on approps bill. SHAME http://earthjustice.org/news/press/2014/harmful-mountaintop-removal-policy-exacerbates-wv-public-health-crisis ...	pollution, W. VA spill, politics/elected officials	news	negative	1	31	5	1
14-Jan	Harmful Mountaintop Removal Policy Exacerbates WV Public Health Crisis http://ow.ly/2CWkPy	mining, W.VA spill, public health	news	negative	1	7	1	1
14-Jan	LISTEN: Why Idaho should stop its plans to kill two entire wolf packs in premier wilderness area. http://ow.ly/sylFi	species protection	information	negative	1	8	4	0

14-Jan	West Virginia Water Crisis: Behind Chemical Spill, Gaping Holes in State and Federal Regulation @democracynow	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	8	3	1
14-Jan	Murky dealings and secrecy behind Freedom Industries, company responsible for West Virginia chemical spill. @USATODAY http://usat.ly/1ePqQRn	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	5	0	0
15-Jan	ORWELLIAN: GOP senators push for creation of "economic freedom zones" that exempts polluters from Clean Water Act. http://ow.ly/sAFhz	pollution, politics/elected officials	news	negative	1	21	4	1
15-Jan	Check out this http://huff.to/1eJYHgo story by @kate_sheppard on an awful MTR rider included in the spending plan	mining, politics/elected officials	news	negative	1	2	2	0

15-Jan	Solar energy costs plummet to historic low thanks to tech advances & competition - now on par with many fossil fuels. http://ow.ly/sCipJ	energy	information	positive	0	14	3	0
15-Jan	Navy Training and Testing Activities Imperil Marine Mammals and Sea Turtles in Waters off Hawai'i and Southern California...	species protection	information	negative	0	11	2	0
15-Jan	Thx @Jim_Moran for fighting for cleaner water, air and protecting our public health for over two decades. http://bit.ly/1b3RuD7	politics/elected officials	recognition	positive		3	3	1
15-Jan	EPA will let frackers keep dumping chemicals into sea - even those known to stunt human development & hurt wildlife http://ow.ly/sAJGu	pollution, species protection, public health, fracking	news	negative	1	22	3	0

15-Jan	Kicking people while they're down: House GOP Assails Clean Water Act as West Virginians Go W/out Clean Water via @tnr http://www.newrepublic.com/article/116218/spending-bill-january-2014-irony-house-gop-and-west-virginia-water ...	pollution, W.VA spill, politics/elected officials	news	negative	1	17	3	0
15-Jan	Navy Sued: Sonar Plan Imperils Marine Mammals and Sea Turtles in California and Hawai'i http://ow.ly/sCJd1	species protection	news	50/50	1	17	3	1
15-Jan	Is the water really "safe to use" now in West Virginia? Spike in water-related ER visits being reported. #coal	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	11	1	0
15-Jan	Earthjustice Welcomes EPA's Bristol Bay Assessment - Large-scale study describes harmful impacts of proposed P... http://ow.ly/2CYw9P	mining	news	50/50	1	4	0	1
15-Jan	Environmentalists sue Navy over sonar use @AP @WashingtonPost http://ow.ly/sD43S	species protection	news	50/50	1	12	6	0

15-Jan	Decline of Earth's top carnivore species damages broader ecosystems http://www.latimes.com/science/sciencenow/la-sci-sn-predator-decline-ecosystems-20140110,0,1178481.story ...	species protection	information	negative	0	11	2	0
--------	---	--------------------	-------------	----------	---	----	---	---

Appendix E: Environmental Defense Fund Facebook Posts³²⁰

Date	Post	Topic	Category	Focus	Current Event	Likes	Shares	Comments	Picture/ Video	Link to EDF Website
1-Jan	Happy New Year! Here's why environmental activism will win big in 2014: www.edf.org/opF/ (Changed cover photo)	other	information	positive	0	1112	311	12	picture	1
2-Jan	It's a new year and time for the inevitable resolutions about losing weight - but diet and exercise are not the only factors we need to worry about. A number of studies have linked exposures to the chemical bisphenol A (better known as BPA) to obesity in children and teens.	public health	information	negative	0	199	32	7	0	1
2-Jan	Will 2014 be the year of solar? Plans for a huge solar power plant complex in China suggests so!	energy	information	positive	0	418	59	6	0	0
4-Jan	Effective January 1, companies are no longer required to use toxic flame retardants in their furniture in California. But these chemicals are not banned - companies can still add them to your couch! We need federal reform to protect human health. Take action: www.bit.ly/1i2YZzk	public health	action-political	negative	1	358	0	10	picture	1

³²⁰ "Environmental Defense Fund's Facebook Page."

6-Jan	To date, ALEC has failed to repeal clean energy standards in any state, despite its promise that 2013 would be "the most active year ever" for efforts to repeal renewable energy mandates. Active? Yes. Effective? No.	energy	information	negative	0	409	81	13	0	1
6-Jan	By making ecosystems a part of the economy, farmers and their families will benefit from diverse opportunities to make more money off their land.	food	information	positive	0	242	27	1	0	1
7-Jan	December 22 marked 25 years since rubber tapper and environmental leader Chico Mendes was assassinated. Steve Schwartzman, EDF's Director of Tropical Forest Policy and friend of Mendes, remembers him: www.edf.org/oNT/	other	recognition	50/50	0	327	53	5	picture	1
7-Jan	"Climate change means a change in the overall system, not just in our backyard." Find out why it's so cold and how weather impacts opinion polls on global warming.	climate change	information	negative	1	324	94	13	0	1
7-Jan	"Environmentally speaking, 2013 was a bad year for the House of Representatives."	politics/elected officials	information	negative	0	253	123	18	0	0

8-Jan	If we want to move the needle on climate change, it will take a global community to make it happen. Check out how California is leading the way with their carbon market.	climate change	information	positive	0	265	39	8	0	1
8-Jan	"To paraphrase the philosopher Edmund Burke, bad things happen only when not enough of the good people stand up. And this year, some good people really did stand up." In your opinion, who else should be on this list?	other	recognition	positive	0	377	75	15		0
9-Jan	"Most people don't realize how much carbon is stored in a prairie." EDF is part of a coalition that launched a program designed to pay landowners to keep stored carbon in the ground. Read all about it on Climate Progress.	climate change	information	positive	0	173	44	5	0	0
9-Jan	The New York Times featured a story about water in the West this week. The article helped to elevate the issue, but left out an important point - what all of this means for the Colorado River itself: www.edf.org/oxU/	resource conservation	information, news	neutral	0	664	156	7	picture	0

10-Jan	Obesity is impacting our nation's health and our elected officials have taken notice of the problem, but they have yet to fully consider the contribution of chemical exposures. www.edf.org/oxn/	public health	information	negative	0	116	67	7	picture	1
10-Jan	Could toxic chemicals be affecting your waistline? If your New Year's resolution is to diet, you should also add "de-plasticize." www.edf.org/oxh/	public health	information, action-personal	negative	0	137	104	2	picture	1
10-Jan	On December 28, 1973 America breathed life into the landmark Endangered Species Act, and it has, ironically, been fighting its own extinction ever since. How has it remained so durable all these years?	species protection	provoking thought, information	50/50	0	174	1	2	0	1
10-Jan	On December 28, 1973 America breathed life into the landmark Endangered Species Act, and it has, ironically, been fighting its own extinction ever since. How has it remained so durable all these years?	species protection	provoking thought, information	50/50	0	144	2	17	0	1
13-Jan	"The mighty Colorado is not simply infrastructure for water delivery. It is the lifeline of the American West."	resource conservation	information	neutral	0	117	22	3	0	1

13-Jan	"The mighty Colorado is not simply infrastructure for water delivery. It is the lifeline of the American West."	resource conservation	information	neutral	0	206	45	2	0	1
13-Jan	More than 22 inches of rain fell on Boynton Beach, FL over a 24-hour period, last week. According to the IPCC, "extreme precipitation events will very likely be more intense and more frequent in these regions in a warmer climate." Check out our slideshow to see how extreme weather events are connected to rising temperatures.	climate change	information	negative	1	26	0	4	0	1
13-Jan	Take action now and tell Congress to let the EPA do its job: www.edf.org/of5/	pollution	action-political	negative	0	283	141	10	picture	1
13-Jan	Take action now and tell Congress to let the EPA do its job: www.edf.org/of5/	pollution	action-political	negative	0	264	138	19	picture	1
14-Jan	Our reliance on coal-fired generation makes us vulnerable. Are we finally ready to accelerate the transition to safer renewable fuel sources?	pollution, energy	information	negative	0	304	85	14	0	1

15-Jan	Opponents are quick to pin the challenge of reliability as one that only applies to renewables. But access to abundant water resources for water-intensive energy sources like fossil fuels makes that argument moot.	resource conservation	information	negative	0	120	34	3	0	1
15-Jan	Opponents are quick to pin the challenge of reliability as one that only applies to renewables. But access to abundant water resources for water-intensive energy sources like fossil fuels makes that argument moot.	resource conservation	information	negative	0	108	23	5	0	1
15-Jan	Why do we know so little about the chemical that spilled into Elk River in West Virginia? All of this traces back to the 1976 Toxic Substances Control Act: www.edf.org/oYf/	pollution, W.VA spill	information	negative	1	638	697	41	picture	1
15-Jan	California's cap-and-trade program has been running for one whole year. Do you have questions about what that means for your environment and your economy? Ask our experts in an exclusive online chat at the link!	climate change	information	neutral	0	21	2	0	0	1

16-Jan	Smog so bad that, "on Thursday, some residents of Beijing woke up with splitting headaches." Don't let that happen here! Ask President Obama to finalize these new gasoline and vehicle standards ASAP: www.edf.org/ogF/	pollution, public health	information	negative	0	9	0	0	0	1
16-Jan	Why did Google invest so much money in a business with only two products: a thermostat and a smoke detector? Read our latest blog post to find out!	other	information	neutral	0	32	2	0	0	1
16-Jan	Why did Google invest so much money in a business with only two products: a thermostat and a smoke detector? Read our latest blog post to find out!	other	information	neutral	0	44	2	1	0	1
16-Jan	Rural areas have higher rates of poverty and economic disparity. Investing in energy efficiency projects helps pump capital back into these communities.	energy	information	positive	0	132	25	0	0	1
16-Jan	Rural areas have higher rates of poverty and economic disparity. Investing in energy efficiency projects helps pump capital back into these communities.	energy	information	positive	0	109	25	2	0	1

17-Jan	Britain has historically emitted the most climate-changing pollution into the air. So they should lead the effort to find solutions, right? Obviously, it's not that simple.	climate change	provoking thought	negative	0	183	13	11	0	1
19-Jan	Smog so bad that, "on Thursday, some residents of Beijing woke up with splitting headaches." Don't let that happen here! Ask President Obama to finalize these new gasoline and vehicle standards ASAP: www.edf.org/ogF/	pollution, politics/elected officials	action-political	negative	1	546	231	39	0	0
21-Jan	We environmentalists work on some very serious issues. Are we taking ourselves too seriously, though?	other	provoking thought	neutral	0	70	2	3	0	1
21-Jan	We environmentalists work on some very serious issues. Are we taking ourselves too seriously, though?	other	provoking thought	neutral	0	77	1	9	0	1
21-Jan	Don't let this cold fool you. New data released by NOAA said 2013 continues a long-term trend of rising global temperatures.	climate change	news	negative	1	389	204	21	0	0
22-Jan	Why did it take 12 days for this information to come out? Has this chemical been monitored for in the river and drinking water samples? Just a few of the questions Richard Denison, senior scientist at EDF, is asking as new information about the West Virginia chemical spill comes to light.	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	463	252	48	0	1

22-Jan	What happens when a GIS specialist gets a hold of a new timelapse tool? These four videos that dramatically illustrate changes on our planet.	climate change	information	negative	0	292	178	10	0	1
23-Jan	The costs of BPA exposure will likely be borne by society for decades. We need a more rational system of regulating environmental chemicals.	public health, pollution	information	negative	0	288	81	4	0	0
23-Jan	Birdwatchers have been treated to an increase in snowy owl sightings as far south as Texas this winter. Have you seen one? Read about our own staffer's sightings and why this is happening on LiveScience: http://www.livescience.com/42787-snowy-owls-spreading-south.html	climate change	information, nature appreciation	50/50	0	436	82	11	picture	1
24-Jan	It's the Solar Energy Industries Association's Shout Out For#Solar day! Spread the word and learn more about why we work for cleaner energy: www.edf.org/oQ6/	energy	information, nature appreciation	positive	0	428	223	17	picture	1
24-Jan	\$40 is the cost to society per ton of carbon but large companies like Exxon are voluntarily using a higher price. Why? Science! Find out how the price was set and how you can advocate for strong, science-based climate policies.	climate change	information, action-political	positive	0	128	11	1	0	1

27-Jan	In the lead up to the State of the Union address, President Obama is hearing from many special interest groups. While the dirty air lobby attempts to get his attention, he needs to know Americans across the country are behind his plan to fight climate change.	climate change, politics/elected officials	action-political	negative	1	342	46	11	0	1
28-Jan	"Every good politician knows it's more effective to tease yourself than to make fun of others,' EDF's Keith Gaby said. 'So we almost as a political tool need to recognize that it's a little disarming and makes more friends when you're willing to laugh at yourself.'"	other	provoking thought	neutral	0	78	1	2	0	0
28-Jan	EDF's senior scientist Dr. Richard Denison has been tracking the WV chemical spill. What has he found? Poor information, poor communications, and poor decisions all added up to a seriously "epic fail."	pollution, W.VA spill	news	negative	1	265	86	11	0	1
28-Jan	EDF Climate Corps Fellow, Tyrone Davis, is joining the First Lady at State of the Union Address, representing millions of Americans and our shared goal to protect the environment. www.edf.org/oAb	climate change	recognition	positive	1	297	32	3	picture	1

28-Jan	The time is now to harness wind, sunlight and the latest in technology to move to a clean energy future. Our climate can't wait. www.edf.org/oAz	energy, climate change	Information	50/50	0	1299	504	64	picture	1
29-Jan	It's fitting that such an extraordinary young man -- who embodies everything we hope EDF Climate Corps can achieve -- was able to sit with the First Lady and hear President Obama renew his commitment to fighting climate change. Did YOU see Tyrone Davis at the State Of The Union last night? Full story: http://huff.to/1hMuNYG	climate change	recognition	positive	1	213	1	5	picture	1
29-Jan	"There is still much work to be done before we can begin to say we are turning the corner toward a more stable climate. But young leaders like Tyrone Davis should give all of us hope."	climate change	recognition	positive	1	166	4	6	0	1
30-Jan	California is sending a powerful signal to the world that leaving forests standing is more profitable than cutting them down - even when they're far away. Read how: www.edf.org/odh/	resource conservation	information, nature appreciation	positive	0	691	192	19	picture	1

31-Jan	Our mission is to preserve the natural systems on which all life depends – and part of the human impact on natural systems are the molecules we make and the products through which we use them. We want nothing short of molecular sustainability.	other	provoking thought	positive	0	228	38	6	0	1
31-Jan	"Of particular interest are the continued high wages among solar installers, who earn an average of \$20 to \$23.63 per hour. We also found higher than average employment of veterans in the solar industry, a sign that their high-tech skills are valued in this sector."	energy	news	positive	0	1250	434	24	0	0

Appendix F: Environmental Defense Fund Twitter Tweets³²¹

Date	Tweets	Topic	Category	Focus	current Event	RTs	Faves	Link to EDF Website
9-Jan	Why we're excited about CA's #AB32, reason #3: The foundation is set for a strong, long-term program - http://www.edf.org/oNn @MarkeyMemo	politics/elected officials, climate change	information	neutral	1	0	0	1
9-Jan	New Protocol Will Help Create Investor Confidence in Small-Scale Energy Efficiency Retrofits http://bit.ly/1ag7TII @EEperformance	energy	news	positive	0	4	1	1
9-Jan	Can America's Grasslands Be Saved? http://bit.ly/1d2UnIy	land conservation	news	negative	0	2	0	0
9-Jan	Why we're excited about CA's #AB32, reason #4: The world is watching...and is starting to act - http://www.edf.org/oNh @billmaher	politics/elected officials, climate change	information	positive	1	5	2	1

³²¹ "Environmental Defense Fund's Twitter."

9-Jan	California on Course to Give Power to the People http://bit.ly/1ak87O8	energy	information	positive	0	4	4	1
9-Jan	Cost Savings Aren't the Only Benefit to Energy Efficiency http://bit.ly/1ak87Oa	energy	information	positive	0	7	2	1
10-Jan	What the @NYTimes misses about the Colorado River: http://www.edf.org/oxw #water	other	nature appreciation	neutral	0	4	2	1
10-Jan	Today at 2pm ET, join @WhiteHouse and discuss the connection between weather events and climate change http://bit.ly/19inoR0	climate change, politics/elected officials	information	neutral	1	14	2	0
10-Jan	The swirling relationship between science, weather and public opinion: http://www.edf.org/ox7/ #WeTheGeeks #PolarVortex	climate change	information	neutral	0	4	2	1
13-Jan	Take Action: Inhofe's Latest Attack on #CleanAir http://bit.ly/1dIxruM	politics/elected officials, pollution	action-political	negative	1	3	0	1

13-Jan	EDF welcomes new Senior Director, Smart Power Collaboration http://bit.ly/1dKA9Qn	other	recognition	positive	0	3	1	1
13-Jan	We have no way of knowing whether WV's water is safe. The data needed simply doesn't exist. http://www.edf.org/ofk/ #wvchemleak	pollution, W.VA spill	information	negative	1	17	4	1
13-Jan	Nearly 2 feet of rain in 24 hours in #Florida - see how climate and weather is connected: http://www.edf.org/ofU/ #Climate	climate change	information	negative	1	8	1	1
13-Jan	Is WV's drinking water really safe? The one-part-per-million "safe" threshold has questionable basis. http://www.edf.org/ofk/ #wvchemleak	pollution, W.VA spill	information	negative	1	19	5	1
13-Jan	The clean-tech venture capital market is once again showing signs of life: http://bit.ly/1j4IN4F via @GreenBiz	energy	information	positive	0	4	5	0

14-Jan	U.S. Carbon Emissions Jump 2% In 2013, Largely Due To Increased Coal Consumption: http://bit.ly/1hkg87s #Climate	climate change, energy	news	negative	0	21	3	0
14-Jan	Overfishing doesn't just shrink fish populations-they often don't recover afterwards: http://bit.ly/1cj7W1X	species protection	information	negative	0	11	4	0
14-Jan	Governor Cuomo Announces \$40 Million in Post-Sandy Microgrid Competition http://bit.ly/1aCuOgJ #Energy	energy, politics/elected officials	news	positive	1	12	3	1
14-Jan	Dow Chemical, Jones Lang LaSalle and Starwood Hotels & Resorts Sign On for Smart #Energy Wins with EDF Climate Corps http://bit.ly/1aBZn6e	energy	news	positive	0	1	3	1

14-Jan	9-county environmental catastrophe in W. VA is tragic reminder of risks that spring from dependence on fossil fuels: http://www.edf.org/ofn/	pollution, W.VA spill, energy	information	negative	1	12	4	1
14-Jan	West Virginia chem spill raises crucial question: are we finally ready to accelerate transition to renewable #energy? http://www.edf.org/ofb/	pollution, energy, W.VA spill	information	negative	1	15	6	1
14-Jan	Take Action: Stand Strong for Cleaner Fuel and Cleaner Air http://bit.ly/1aDdqsk	energy, pollution	action-political	positive	0	7	2	1
14-Jan	Along with new EDF Climate Corps hosts, new project offerings in 2014 http://bit.ly/1aDdfxg	climate change	information	neutral	0	3	2	1
14-Jan	West Virginia chemical spill: More hard lessons from coal - http://www.edf.org/ofs/ #energy #climate	pollution, W.VA spill	information	negative	1	5	4	1

15-Jan	West Virginia officials trust shaky science in rush to restore water service: http://www.edf.org/ofk #wvchemleak	pollution, W.VA spill	news, information	negative	1	5	1	1
15-Jan	West Virginia disaster highlights need to modernize our nearly 40-year old chemical safety law known as #TSCA: http://www.edf.org/ofD/	pollution, W.VA spill	information	negative	1	6	5	1
15-Jan	CA cap-and-trade success is serving as a global model to cut pollution. Have questions about how it works? Ask here: http://www.edf.org/ofH	climate change	information	positive	0	5	2	1
15-Jan	Have questions about how CA cap-and-trade effects environment and economy? #AskTheExperts at our online chat here: http://www.edf.org/ofH	climate change	information	positive	0	2	0	1

15-Jan	We can't expect a reliable #energy future without talking #water: http://www.edf.org/oYp/	energy, resource conservation	information	neutral	0	8	3	1
15-Jan	Our experts want to answer your questions about California cap-and-trade! Ask them here: http://www.edf.org/ofH	climate change	information	positive	0	4	1	1

Appendix G: Natural Resources Defense Council Facebook Posts³²²

Date	Post	Topic	Category	Focus	Current Event	Likes	Shares	Comments	Picture/Video	Link to NRDC Website
1-Jan	Changed cover photo picture of mountains. Caption: "Cheers! To a new year of protecting open spaces"	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	313	40	313	picture	0
1-Jan	Happy New Year from everyone at NRDC! What better way to start 2014 than with a few resolutions to help the planet! What green resolutions are you making this year?	other	provoking thought	positive	0	149	2	17	0	0
2-Jan	The fight isn't over yet! Stand by NRDC in 2014 and together we can help protect our natural resources — > http://wefb.it/urz7Ua	other	action-personal	positive	0	1131	222	29	picture	1
3-Jan	10 Resolutions For A Life With Less Plastic (and a Better You) in 2014 - http://bit.ly/1cNqifV . This year, why not start small and plot a sustainable course for success? Use the Natural Resources Defense Council's tips for a more sustainable 2014, and simplify your life with less plastic, less clutter,	resource conservation	action-personal	positive	0	324	232	9	picture	1

³²² "Natural Resources Defense Council's Facebook."

	and a whole lot more fun (and money).									
3-Jan	<p>Still looking for a New Year's resolution? Check out this suggestion from the NRDC Food & Sustainable Agriculture team! Did you know? More than 40% of food in the U.S. today goes uneaten. Help reduce your family's food waste by learning the truth behind food date labels, and developing waste-reducing practices in the New Year: http://bit.ly/1kgJLuW#FoodResolutions</p>	food	action-personal, information	positive	0	148	4	4	picture	1

4-Jan	Some good news out of the departing Bloomberg Administration in NYC last week – citywide climate change pollution is down 19% since 2005. This means that the city is already nearly two-thirds of the way toward reaching its PlaNYC goal of reducing this pollution 30 percent by 2030. Yet, in the wake of Hurricane Sandy and with ever-growing global concern about the impacts of climate change, there is still an enormous need to reduce emissions even further, and as quickly as possible.	climate change, urban sustainability	news	50/50	1	30	2	1	0	1
6-Jan	Is protecting the environment on your list of New Year's resolutions? Tell us about your green resolutions!	other	provoking thought	positive	0	183	2	25	0	0
7-Jan	More than 650,000 whales, dolphins, and other marine mammals are killed or seriously injured every year by foreign fishing fleets. http://youtu.be/Iqve mlU00dc . Join NRDC in demanding that NOAA Fisheries Service enforce the law that protects marine mammals from foreign fishing fleets —> http://bit.ly/19Q8phM	species protection	action-political	negative	0	434	142	23	video	0

7-Jan	Looking for a way to help save whales and other marine mammals? Shop local! More than 650,000 whales, dolphins, and other marine mammals are killed or seriously injured by foreign fishing fleets. Do your part — buy U.S. caught seafood and demand that NOAA Fisheries Service enforce safer methods: http://bit.ly/19Q8phM	species protection	action-personal, action-political	negative	0	305	232	13	picture	1
8-Jan	With subzero temperatures and wind chill factors even more brutal than normal in many parts of the United States, many Americans will be hit with higher heating bills at the end of the month as they pay the price of the energy used to keep their homes safe and warm. Updated standards for furnaces and furnace fans, combined, could save consumers roughly \$37 billion over three decades and reduce cumulative carbon emission by over 500 million metric tons—the equivalent of shutting down about 5 coal-fired power plants. READ MORE:	energy	information	50/50	1	94	18	2	0	1

8-Jan	<p>BREAKING – Today the Environmental Protection Agency will start taking comments on its carbon pollution limits for new power plants. Join the call for the first-ever national limits on carbon pollution – the biggest contributor to climate change. Support these limits today: http://bit.ly/1dvbnpy</p>	climate change, energy	action-political	positive	1	271	104	14	picture	1
9-Jan	<p>The destruction from climate change can be seen today, and the costs are real. That’s why the federal government estimated the cost of each ton of carbon pollution -- the biggest contributor to climate change. But climate deniers don’t think there’s any real cost to carbon pollution. That’s ridiculous. Tell the White House you agree that carbon pollution costs us all: http://bit.ly/1cC6U4r</p>	climate change, politics/elected officials	action-political	negative	0	283	116	9	picture	1

9-Jan	<p>2014 has kicked off with welcome progress in the fight against climate change. On Wednesday, the Obama Administration published limits on carbon pollution from new power plants. This step confirms the President's National Climate Action plan is on track to deliver real and lasting climate solutions in 2014. READ MORE from NRDC President Frances Beinecke: (link http://switchboard.nrdc.org/blogs/fbeinecke/obama_administration_starts_th.html?utm_source=fb&utm_medium=post&utm_campaign=blog)</p>	climate change, politics/elected officials	news, information	positive	1	226	51	4	0	1
10-Jan	<p>QUICK POLL: Which environmental issue concerns you the most in 2014? A. Carbon pollution B. Food safety C. Water pollution D. Over-consumption of natural resources E. Other (please specify)</p>	other	provoking thought	neutral	0	299	48	839	0	0

10-Jan	<p>Today is Save the Eagles Day! A day to raise awareness and support efforts to protect the once-endangered American bald eagle.</p> <p>NRDC President Frances Beinecke discusses the need to focus on a science-based, conservationist approach to moving forward with wind energy and protecting eagles at the same time. More from HuffPost Green: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/frances-beinecke/we-must-protect-eagles-and-expand-wind-power_b_4575471.html?1389367181</p>	species protection	nature appreciation	positive	0	292	59	22	0	1
11-Jan	<p>Yikes. As we saw during Superstorm Sandy, the consequences of climate change are expensive – and can be devastating. Let’s give carbon pollution a real cost -- and help get a real sense of the true benefits of fighting climate change: http://bit.ly/1cC6U4r</p>	climate change	information	negative	0	390	122	12	picture	1

12-Jan	Is it time for a refresher course? Truly successful recycling involves minimizing waste along the entire life cycle of a product, from acquiring raw materials to manufacturing, using, and disposing of a product. Start 2014 off right by brushing up on the basics and taking your recycling game to the next level!	resource conservation	action-personal, information	positive	0	255	69	6	0	1
13-Jan	Our NRDC Food & Sustainable Agriculture team wants to know: "eating green" — what does it mean to you? Let us know in the comments below! Learn more about the effect of your everyday food choices here: http://bit.ly/1fbxRQY . "Eating green" - what does it mean to you? Learn more: http://bit.ly/1fbxRQY (Photo courtesy of USDA)	food	information, provoking thought	neutral	0	142	1	18	picture	1
13-Jan	More than 30 public interest organizations have signed on to a letter demanding that Foster Farms adopt healthy practices, and commit to #antibiotic stewardship in its chicken operations. Join us in demanding to know what's in our food!	food	action-political	negative	0	269	65	9	0	1

14-Jan	The Pebble Mine project is hanging by a thread, and it's time to sever it once and for all. Northern Dynasty Minerals is trying to hold on to its reckless plan but thanks to a campaign led by NRDC and our allies in Alaska, concerned citizens have built a formidable opposition and exposed the Pebble project for what it truly is: a toxic investment. READ MORE and join NRDC President Frances Beinecke in telling the CEO to abandon this dangerous project:	mining	action-political	50/50	1	428	71	12	0	1
14-Jan	Residents in three communities in Pennsylvania, Wyoming, and Texas, have noticed problems with their drinking water. Despite evidence of water contamination, the EPA abruptly stopped their investigations. The EPA is supposed to protect us from pollution, but it seems to be backing down from oil and gas companies. Join in demanding safe water for all —> http://bit.ly/1a4VPvm	pollution, fracking	news, action-political	negative	1	849	1007	72	picture	1

15-Jan	Renewable energy isn't just about cutting pollution. It also helps keep our homes heated and the lights on during extreme weather. When frigid temperatures last week caused the unexpected shutdown of two power plants in Texas, wind energy stepped in to help keep residents warm.	energy	information	positive	1	291	68	2	0	1
16-Jan	NRDC #GreenTip: Use sunlight wisely! During colder months, leave shades and blinds open on sunny days, but close them at night to reduce heat loss. What are your green methods for staying warm in the winter months?	energy	action-personal, provoking thought	positive	0	70	4	11	0	0

17-Jan	<p>NRDC Asks New York to Restrict its Ivory Tradehttp://bit.ly/1eXcU7W. Seventy-two percent of elephants have been lost. An unprecedented amount of poaching is occurring in Africa. And preliminary indicators suggest that 2013 may have seen the highest levels of illicit ivory trade ever. Yet, despite the fact that elephants are being killed at such an alarming rate that they could be gone entirely within a decade, demand for ivory is booming.</p>	species protection	information	negative	0	725	522	93	picture	1
19-Jan	<p>California made significant progress this week toward relying on clean energy efficiency to avoid the need for new power plants and grid infrastructure. For the first time, the California Energy Commission (CEC) fully relies on energy efficiency in its forecast of the state's energy needs over the coming decade. In planning to meet those future energy needs, the cleanest, cheapest, and fastest resource is energy efficiency.</p>	energy	news	positive	1	71	16	4	0	1

20-Jan	<p>"We have an opportunity and a duty to make our habitat work both for us as people and for the sustainable health of the planet writ large. Indeed, if our solutions do not work for people, they will never work for the planet." READ MORE from NRDC's Special Counsel for Urban Solutions, Kaid Benfield:</p>	urban sustainability	provoking thought	neutral	0	287	61	5	0	1
21-Jan	<p>GRAMMYs Honor Carole King for Protecting Wild Placeshttp://bit.ly/KD9v4n. Many people know Carole King as one of America's best songwriters and performers, but over the years NRDC has had the opportunity to see another side of Carole: the dedicated environmental advocate. On Friday she will be named the 2014 MusiCares Person of the Year in recognition of her wide-ranging philanthropy and environmental leadership. We're thrilled to celebrate Carole's environmental leadership. Congratulations, Carole!</p>	other	recognition	positive	1	441	104	9	video	1

22-Jan	When it comes to connecting the dots between climate change, extreme weather and health, the lines are clear. What impacts have you noticed in your own community? What impacts have you noticed in your own community?	climate change	provoking thought	negative	0	236	71	20	0	1
23-Jan	A nature moment of zen for your Thursday from our team atNRDC Northern Rockies Wildlife! Out and about in Yellowstone!	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	692	1	15	picture	0
23-Jan	Last week, Dan Lashof, director of NRDC's climate and clean air program, testified at a Senate Environment and Public Works Committee hearing titled "Review of the President's Climate Action Plan". "Senators spent more time debating whether global warming stopped in 1998 than whether the president's plan is a good idea." Read his full discussion about climate confusion:	climate change, politics/elected officials	information	negative	1	126	21	3	0	1

24-Jan	A warming climate means more coastal floods. We need to develop smarter, safer ways to protect our communities from the potential harm of flooding. It's time to reform the National Flood Insurance Program to protect families, taxpayers, and the environment. READ MORE from NRDC's Peter Lehner in The Hill Newspaper:	climate change	information	negative	0	72	3	0	0	0
24-Jan	2013 was the driest year on record in cities across the West Coast and this year isn't looking any better. 2014 is projected to become the new driest year on record, without a drop yet this year. Almost 90 percent of the state is in severe or extreme drought. What can cities and individuals do to help conserve water under drought conditions? Find out:	resource conservation	information	negative	1	230	110	16	0	1

25-Jan	Nine in ten Latinos want the nation to take action to protect future generations from the dangers of climate change, according to a poll NRDC released on this week. Specifically eight in ten want President Obama to reduce the carbon pollution that is driving climate change. Like millions of other Americans, many Latinos agree the time has come for climate action. READ MORE from the Los Angeles Times:	climate change	information	negative	0	278	23	10	0	0
26-Jan	Join us in congratulating Carole King! Carole King is best known as one of America's best songwriters and performers but aside from her obvious musical talent, she has worked tirelessly to protect the environment we live in. http://bit.ly/KD9v4n #GRAMMYS	other	recognition	positive	1	2497	567	67	picture	1

27-Jan	<p>In the U.S., we waste around 40 percent of all edible food. How can we begin to address the problem of food waste? Peter Lehner, NRDC's Executive Director, sat down with PBS NewsHour to discuss how the regulation of food date labeling can help curb the amount of food that ends up in landfills across the country. Find out how you can reduce food waste in your home: http://bit.ly/1n7VICm</p>	food	information	50/50	0	261	70	16	0	1
28-Jan	<p>What environmental issues do you want The White House to address in tonight's State of the Union address? We'll be tuning in tonight to find out what's next — keep an eye out for our thoughts here or follow @NRDC on Twitter for live updates during the speech. For a look at how President Obama is doing on his Climate Action Plan, here's our checklist!</p>	politics/elected officials, climate change	provoking thought, information	neutral	1	247	28	21	picture	0

28-Jan	Tonight the President will give his State of the Union. How's Obama doing on his Climate Action Plan? US agencies announced they would end public financing for coal plants overseas. And the Federal government is on track to buy 20% of electricity from renewable sources by 2020. SHARE if you like this climate progress!	politics/elected officials, climate change energy	information	positive	1	211	49	19	picture	0
28-Jan	What issue do you want President Obama to address in his Climate Action Plan? An update on climate progress: Federal programs are being updated to protect families, small businesses, and communities from the risks posed by sea level rise and more extreme weather events. Task forces are helping communities protect themselves from droughts and storms and increase climate resilience. #SOTU	climate change, politics/elected officials	provoking thought, information	50/50	1	94	11	12	picture	0
28-Jan	You heard him, time to move forward on climate — SHARE if you agree! #SOTU	climate change, politics/elected officials	other	positive	1	1479	944	108	picture	0

29-Jan	NRDC President Frances Beinecke on President Obama's State-of-the-Union address: "Power plants account for 40 percent of our carbon pollution, and President Obama underscored why we must move quickly to impose limits on them, as we do now for other pollutants." Support Obama's climate plan and tell the EPA to protect our planet and the health of our families. http://bit.ly/1dvbnpy	energy, climate change, politics/elected officials	action-political, information	50/50	1	303	52	13	picture	1
29-Jan	Last night's #SOTU highlighted US progress on climate change. What's next? From NRDC president Frances Beinecke: "The EPA is scheduled to release draft standards for existing power plants in June that must deliver deep reductions here at home... In the coming months, NRDC will rally public support for strong standards and make sure the administration meets its deadlines." Read the rest here:	energy, climate change, politics/elected officials	information	50/50	1	83	5	5	0	1

29-Jan	As President Obama mentioned in last night's State of the Union address, "...climate change is a fact," and in a historic turning point, President Obama reiterated his commitment to implement carbon pollution limits on all power plants. http://bit.ly/1exsR2G Do you feel the President's commitment will help move the needle on climate change? http://youtu.be/KX3yfm4_fes	climate change, politics/elected officials	news	positive	1	163	11	18	video	1
29-Jan	The president said it—now Congress can make it happen. Urge your members of Congress to restore support for clean energy. http://bit.ly/1exTLHX	energy, politics/elected officials	action-political	positive	0	891	769	32	picture	1

30-Jan	<p>In most cities, up to 50 or even 75 percent of carbon emissions come from buildings. Making buildings more efficient presents a major opportunity for cities to save money, improve air quality, and become more resilient. That's why 10 mayors of American cities announced today that they'll be partnering with NRDC and the Institute for Market Transformation in the new City Energy Project. By working to transform energy-sucking buildings into energy sippers, these cities will slash energy use, cut pollution, and save residents and businesses combined \$1 billion a year on their bills. READ MORE to find out if your city is involved!</p>	energy	news	positive	1	193	36	6	0	1
--------	--	--------	------	----------	---	-----	----	---	---	---

30-Jan	All Americans have benefited from the dedicated service of Representative Henry Waxman. In every battle and in every moment that mattered most, Rep. Waxman stood up for the air we breathe, the water we drink, and the wild places we cherish. Today he announced he will retire from Congress when the legislative session ends next fall, and while we will miss his leadership and fiery commitment, we are grateful for all he has done to protect public health and the environment.	other	recognition	positive	1	262	14	12	0	1
--------	---	-------	-------------	----------	---	-----	----	----	---	---

31-Jan	<p>The number of monarch butterflies that migrates across the United States each year and overwinters in the forests of Mexico has dropped to an all-time low. The decline of monarch butterflies over the last decade or more has coincided with the wide-scale adoption of genetically modified crops that are resistant to the weed-killer glyphosate. This change in our agricultural system has led to the near extermination of milkweed from huge swaths of our country, the only type of plant that monarchs use for laying their eggs. This year's news follows a continuing downward trend — it signals a species in crisis.</p>	species protection	news, information	negative	0	472	376	45	0	1
31-Jan	<p>BREAKING: The State Department issued its final environmental review, confirming that the Keystone XL tar sands pipeline could accelerate climate change. President Obama has all the information he needs to reject the pipeline – so tell him to reject it today!</p>	climate change, keystone xl, politics/elected officials	news, action-political	negative	1	530	103	32	0	1

Appendix H: Natural Resources Defense Council Twitter Tweets³²³

Date	Tweets	Topic	Category	Focus	Current Event	RTS	Faves	Link to NRDC Website
9-Jan	The Cold Truth - Could #climatechange be to blame for biting low temps? http://j.mp/1d1dEdj via @OnEarthMag #extremeweather	Climate change	Information	negative	1	15	4	1
9-Jan	#GreenTip: Use sunlight wisely: During colder months, leave shades & blinds open on sunny days, but close them at night to reduce heat loss	energy	action- personal, information	positive	0	17	3	0
9-Jan	MT @TEDxManhattan: 2013 #TEDxMan speaker Peter Lehner of @NRDCFood "Why 2013 Was Not a Waste: http://j.mp/1aIllzE #foodwaste	food	information	neutral	0	4	1	0
9-Jan	California's #Drought - We Can Do More Than Pray for Rain http://j.mp/1dxjkIr #CA	resource conservation	action- personal	negative	1	8	3	1
9-Jan	Carbon #pollution costs us all - tell the White House you agree: http://j.mp/1cZXVLD pic.twitter.com/kRe2Gmhgs4	climate change	action -political	negative	0	25	7	1

³²³ "Natural Resources Defense Council Twitter."

9-Jan	#Green news roundup from @GuardianEco: Artificial volcanoes, sludge and ivory crushing http://j.mp/1dw7v5j	other	news	neutral	0	1	0	0
9-Jan	What steps are you going to take to protect the #environment in 2014? We want to hear your #GreenResolutions!	other	provoking thought	positive	0	18	4	0
9-Jan	MT @NRDCFood: European crops struggle with #honeybee shortage as #pesticides and disease take their toll: http://j.mp/1a3UHFy @BBCNews	food, species protection	news, information	negative	1	12	4	0
9-Jan	Oh Behave! Better System Needed to Assess Behavior Changes by #EnergyEfficiency Programs http://j.mp/1dyHulO	energy	information	neutral	0	7	3	1
9-Jan	Obama Administration Starts the New Year with More #Climate Action http://j.mp/1ajd0XS #ActOnClimate	climate change, politics/elected officials	news	positive	1	8	5	1
9-Jan	650,000+ marine mammals are killed or seriously injured every year by foreign fishing fleets. Demand protection: http://j.mp/1gFFmwN	species protection	action-political	negative	0	14	2	1

9-Jan	RT @NRDCBioGems: 10 Countries With The Most Balanced Energy Systems...Norway does it best. See who else tops the list: http://j.mp/1gLYZmX	energy	information	positive	0	10	3	0
9-Jan	Business Resilience Comes From Working With Nature http://j.mp/1dyPALv via @HuffPostGreen #climate #extremeweather	climate change	news	positive	0	10	3	0
9-Jan	Warmer temps forcing emperor #penguins to journey out of traditional breeding grounds http://j.mp/1ahZ8NA via @GuardianEco #climate	climate change	information	negative	0	22	4	0
9-Jan	Lead And Arsenic #Pollution In East Los Angeles http://j.mp/1dzI2YM #CA	pollution, public health	information	negative	1	12	1	1
10-Jan	A Side of #Dolphin with Your Shrimp Cocktail - 650,000 marine mammals are killed or seriously injured every year http://j.mp/1cIyD3n	species protection	information	negative	0	5	2	1
10-Jan	Cold Snap Highlights Need for Updated Furnace #Efficiency Standards http://j.mp/1cIyBZA	energy	information	negative	1	3	4	1

10-Jan	Road Map to Clean Energy and #Climate Initiatives in Governor Cuomo's 2014 State of the State Report http://j.mp/1a541cm #NY	climate change, politics/elected officials	information	positive	1	5	1	1
10-Jan	How are you going to stand up for the environment in 2014? Let us know! #greenresolutions	other	provoking thought	positive	0	9	1	0
10-Jan	EPA Starts New Year w/ #Climate Action: Carbon #Pollution Standards for New Power Plants Published for Public Comment http://j.mp/1a541co	climate change	information, news	positive	1	11	2	1
10-Jan	Retweet from NRDC food @NRDCFood: NRDC's Peter Lehner describes how imported #seafood comes with a price: dead whales and dolphins: http://j.mp/KLmu4Q	species protection	information	negative	0	6	2	1
10-Jan	#India #Green News: glaciers on retreat due to #climatechange, Supreme Court mandates new enviro regulatory agency http://j.mp/1dAqA6t	climate change	news	50/50	1	6	3	1
10-Jan	#Hamburg's ambitious green network addresses nature, #climate resilience, #sustainable transportation http://j.mp/1dC2ND7	climate change	information	positive	0	11	3	1

10-Jan	California #Efficiency Programs: A Lot to Be Thankful For, but Room for Improvement http://j.mp/1anG14I #CA	energy	information	50/50	0	5	2	1
10-Jan	NRDC in @HuffPostGreen - We Must Protect #Eagles and Expand #Wind Power at the Same Time http://j.mp/KQ3H8u	energy, species protection	information	positive	0	9	3	0
10-Jan	Latin America #Green News: Chile leads #solar-thermal, Costa Rica lags on water management, Mexico leads #emissions http://j.mp/1anRR4	energy, resource conservation	information	50/50	0	11	2	0
10-Jan	Retweet from NRDC Food: @NRDCFood: Know any food or farm heroes? Nominate them for a 2014 #GrowingGreen Award: http://j.mp/1cLWrUd #sustainableag #GGA2014	food	action-personal	positive	0	6	6	1
10-Jan	Weekend #Green Reads from @OnEarthMag: Murdered Over Turtle Eggs, Beef w/ the Beef Tax, Case for Drinking Icebergs http://j.mp/1dDskfe	other	information	neutral	0	4	2	1
10-Jan	Concerned about the extreme weather? This map of danger zones can help you to learn the facts and prepare yourself: http://j.mp/1cMhxSo	climate change	information	negative	0	12	2	1

10-Jan	Warmer temps forcing emperor #penguins to journey out of traditional breeding grounds http://j.mp/1a8aeV6 via @GuardianEco #climate	climate change	information	negative	1	37	9	0
11-Jan	The Cold Truth - Could #climatechange be to blame for biting low temps? http://j.mp/1a8afbo via @OnEarthMag #extremeweather	climate change	Information	negative	1	8	4	0
11-Jan	Making a resolution to change your diet? Check out the Eating #Green Guide for better #food choices: http://j.mp/1a8ahA6	food	information	positive	0	8	5	1
11-Jan	Aquifer Alert - can it survive a future of #drought, #pollution, and pipelines? http://j.mp/1cMhzcR via @OnEarthMag	keystone XL, pollution, resource conservation	information	negative	0	10	2	1
11-Jan	A Side of #Dolphin with Your Shrimp Cocktail - 650,000 marine mammals are killed or seriously injured every year http://j.mp/1a8ahjx	species protection	information	negative	0	17	2	1
11-Jan	California's #Drought - We Can Do More Than Pray for Rain http://j.mp/1cMhyWi #CA	resource conservation	action-personal	negative	1	15	6	1

11-Jan	As we saw during #Sandy, consequences of #climatechange are expensive – & can be devastating. http://j.mp/1aIrUTT pic.twitter.com/A3MsrMUpHr	climate change	information	negative	0	17	7	1
11-Jan	Carbon Pollution Funds Poised to Deliver on Advancing #CleanEnergy in California http://j.mp/1a8ahjF #CA	energy, climate change	information	positive	1	8	1	1
11-Jan	Looking for a way you can help save #whales? Shop local and support American fisherman who invest in safer methods: http://j.mp/1cMhyWu	species protection	action-personal	positive	0	16	4	1
11-Jan	Oh Behave! Better System Needed to Assess Behavior Changes by #EnergyEfficiency Programs http://j.mp/1cMhyWg	energy	information	neutral	0	5	4	1
11-Jan	Shopper's Guide to Home Tissue Products - Shop smart, save #forests. http://j.mp/1a8ahA2	resource conservation	action-personal, information	positive	0	10	3	1
11-Jan	Obama Administration Starts the New Year with More #Climate Action http://j.mp/1a8aeV8 #ActOnClimate	climate change, politics/elected officials	news	positive	1	9	9	1
11-Jan	An easy way to go #green: pick your pots and pans wisely http://j.mp/1a8ahjB	other	action-personal, information	positive	0	10	7	1

11-Jan	Road Map to Clean Energy and #Climate Initiatives in Governor Cuomo's 2014 State of the State Report http://j.mp/1cMhyWo #NY	climate change, energy, politics/elected officials	information	positive	1	17	2	1
11-Jan	What steps are you going to take to protect the #environment in 2014? We want to hear your #GreenResolutions!	other	provoking thought	positive	0	21	6	0
11-Jan	#India #Green News: Petroleum Minister takes on conflicting role as #Environmental minister, World Bank eyes #solar http://j.mp/1a8ah3h	energy	news	50/50	1	17	1	1
12-Jan	A Major Victory in the Fight to Protect #Patagonia as HidroAysén Disappears from Investor List http://j.mp/1cMhyWq	land conservation	News	positive	1	8	1	1
12-Jan	650,000+ marine mammals are killed or seriously injured every year by foreign fishing fleets. Demand protection: http://j.mp/1cMhw0Q	species protection	action-political	negative	0	28	8	1
12-Jan	#GreenTip: Use sunlight wisely: During colder months, leave shades & blinds open on sunny days, but close them at night to reduce heat loss.	energy	action-personal, information	positive	0	13	7	0

12-Jan	As Court Reviews #NJ's Repeal of Power Plant Rules, State Should Rejoin Regional #ClimateChange Program http://j.mp/1cMhxSm	Climate change	information	negative	1	9	4	1
12-Jan	The Real Price of #Seafood http://j.mp/1iPIIAF via @OnEarthMag #whales #dolphins	species protection	Information	negative	0	18	3	1
12-Jan	Concerned about the extreme weather? This map of danger zones can help you to learn the facts and prepare yourself: http://j.mp/1hdo2zA	Climate change	information	negative	1	11	5	1
12-Jan	NRDC in @HuffPostGreen - We Must Protect #Eagles and Expand #Wind Power at the Same Time http://j.mp/11QDtRg	species protection, energy	information	neutral	0	3	4	0
12-Jan	How are you going to stand up for the environment in 2014? Let us know! #greenresolutions	other	provoking thought	positive	0	11	2	0
12-Jan	Latin America #Green News: Chile leads #solar-thermal, Costa Rica lags on water management, Mexico leads #emissions http://j.mp/1hdo4qZ	energy, resource conservation	information	50/50	0	14	2	1
12-Jan	California #Efficiency Programs: A Lot to Be Thankful For, but Room for Improvement http://j.mp/1hdo4r1 #CA	energy	information	positive	0	5	0	1

12-Jan	EPA Starts New Year w/ #Climate Action: Carbon #Pollution Standards for New Power Plants Published for Public Comment	climate change	information, news	positive	1	17	6	1
12-Jan	Weekend #Green Reads from @OnEarthMag: Murdered Over Turtle Eggs, Beef w/ the Beef Tax, Case for Drinking Icebergs http://j.mp/1lQDtRe	other	information	neutral	0	2	1	1
12-Jan	#Petcoke Blight Tells Bigger Story About #Chicago's Waterways http://j.mp/1al80SF	pollution	news, information	negative	1	8	3	1
12-Jan	Use Less Water...Pollute Less Water: #Sacramento Can Reduce Sewage Overflows Through #Water Conservation http://j.mp/1cMhxSe #CA	resource conservation	Information	positive	1	12	9	1
12-Jan	New Proposal Seeks Change to Plumbing Codes that will Save Americans Money on #Energy & #Water Bills http://j.mp/1a8afbE	energy, resource conservation	news	positive	0	13	10	1
13-Jan	Five ways to think about greener, healthier cities http://j.mp/1dJTck0 #smartgrowth	urban sustainability	Information	positive	0	17	5	1

13-Jan	RT @OnEarthMag: Does the #deepfreeze suggest #climatechange is fake? Just the opposite: http://j.mp/1axTIOw #extremeweather	Climate change	Information	negative	1	9	3	1
13-Jan	#China Fights Back Against Airpocalypse: A new air #pollution initiative that just might work! http://j.mp/1dIE4x8	resource conservation, pollution	news	positive	1	8	5	1
13-Jan	#GreenTip: Small changes can add up to a big difference. Turn off lights, unplug appliances, & lower the thermostat. http://j.mp/1axT9ED	energy	action-personal, information	positive	0	17	5	1
13-Jan	Int'l #Climate Update: Dominoes falling on public financing of #coal, leaders have work cut out after Warsaw, & more http://j.mp/1dKdqE3	energy	information	negative	0	12	0	1
13-Jan	New Study Finds Over 1.8 Million #Mercury Thermostats Still in Use in Illinois http://j.mp/1dKIHba #IL	pollution	information, news	negative		9	0	1
13-Jan	RT @NRDCenergy: The city as an environmental solution? How to make the city a balance of #nature and #urban life http://j.mp/1azglCg	urban sustainability	Information	positive	0	9	3	1

13-Jan	RT @NRDCFood: We're honored to be on this great list from @Food_Tank: http://j.mp/1j4mLOp '101 Organizations to Watch in 2014' #goodfood	food	information	positive	0	5	1	0
13-Jan	Which #renewable #energy sources can your state tap into? Find out: http://j.mp/1j4rtLV	energy	Information	positive	0	13	10	1
13-Jan	Confused by the many claims you see on #produce products? Let Label Lookup be your guide to what they mean: http://j.mp/1j4rv6B	food	information	neutral	0	12	3	1
13-Jan	#GreenTip: Get lower utility bills & a cleaner #environment! Use EnergyGuide to find #energy saving appliances: http://j.mp/1d2avFQ	energy	action-personal	positive	0	19	6	1
13-Jan	Pls RT! Dear @FosterFarms: Please commit to using #antibiotics responsibly: http://j.mp/1gC4HqM	food	action-political	negative	0	20	4	1
14-Jan	#China wetlands shrank 9% in a decade – an area larger than the Netherlands http://j.mp/1axFk96 via @GuardianEco #climate	land conservation	information	negative	0	21	0	0

14-Jan	RT @NRDCFood: Great news - U.S. to fund research to reduce use of #pesticides harmful to #bees http://j.mp/1j4RbzV via @reuters	species protection	news	positive	0	26	10	0
14-Jan	MT @NRDCWater: Going #Green Helps Philadelphia Businesses' Bottom Line http://j.mp/1aAomXN via @CBSPhilly #Philly #GreenEdge	urban sustainability	information, news	positive	0	6	0	1
14-Jan	Major Investors Dump #PebbleMine - tell the last man standing that it's time to abandon this project once & for all: http://j.mp/1aBmpW9	mining	action-political	50/50	1	9	1	1
14-Jan	Groups to Foster Farms: Come Clean on #Antibiotics http://j.mp/1ay30KC	food	information	negative	0	6	0	1
14-Jan	Did you know you're being exposed to flame retardant chemicals just by sitting on your couch? Here's what you can do: http://j.mp/1d2anGi	public health	information, action-personal	negative	0	7	2	1
14-Jan	RETWEET from NRDC Govt' Affairs: Thank you @SenatorBoxer & @SenWhitehouse for leading the new Climate Action Task Force and "Waking Up Congress" to #ActOnClimate	climate change, politics/elected officials	recognition	positive	1	5	3	0

14-Jan	RETWET from Laurie David: BREAKING: More than 30 orgs call on @FosterFarms to adopt stewardship practices for healthy chicken: http://bit.ly/19q7nbR	food	news	neutral	1	8	5	1
14-Jan	The Cold Truth - Could #climatechange be to blame for biting low temps? http://j.mp/1gGeDzu via @OnEarthMag #extremeweather	Climate change	information	negative	1	7	4	1
14-Jan	A Side of #Dolphin with Your Shrimp Cocktail - 650,000 marine mammals are killed or seriously injured every year http://j.mp/1gGeAUK	species protection	information	negative	0	9	5	1
14-Jan	California's #Drought - We Can Do More Than Pray for Rain http://j.mp/1aCKEb8 #CA	resource conservation	action- personal	negative	1	4	3	1
14-Jan	#GreenTip: Use sunlight wisely: During colder months, leave shades & blinds open on sunny days, but close them at night to reduce heat loss.	energy	action-personal, information	positive	0	12	6	1
14-Jan	Families in #TX shouldn't be on their own when it comes to safe #water-tell @EPA to reopen #fracking investigations! http://j.mp/1aD89RE	fracking, pollution	action-political	negative	1	12	2	1

14-Jan	Families in #WY shouldn't be on their own when it comes to safe #water-tell @EPA to reopen #fracking investigations! http://j.mp/1m1CnCi	fracking, pollution	action-political	negative	1	10	2	1
14-Jan	Demand safe water in #PA! Tell the @EPA to reopen investigations into contaminated water linked to #fracking. http://j.mp/1aD8nbs	fracking, pollution	action -political	negative	1	42	18	1
14-Jan	The #Green Lunchbox: Packing An #Eco-Friendly Meal http://j.mp/1aDt1bq via @HuffPostGreen	other	information	positive	0	5	1	0
14-Jan	Protect our #water from dangerous #fracking! Demand safe water for all - > http://j.mp/1j6deX7	fracking, pollution	action-political	negative	1	26	10	1
14-Jan	How has #fracking affected your community? SHARE your story and join us in demanding safe water for all! http://j.mp/1ckzJPv	fracking, pollution	provoking thought, action-political	negative	1	16	5	1
14-Jan	#CleanEnergy Continues to Be a Smart Investment http://j.mp/1aDdTe7 #renewables	energy	information	positive	0	20	4	1

15-Jan	A more reliable, less polluting #energy system that can usher us into an era of energy security & #climate stability http://j.mp/1j6Kcqb	energy	information	positive	0	17	6	1
15-Jan	Major Investors Dump #PebbleMine - tell the last man standing that it's time to abandon this project once & for all: http://j.mp/1cmsKWz	mining	action-political	50/50	1	9	3	1
15-Jan	MT @NRDCFood: Did you know #CA grows 82% of world's almonds? Farmers fear #honeybee losses may change this:	species conservation, food	information	negative	0	6	1	0
15-Jan	Are we creating family-friendly cities? If not, shouldn't we be? http://j.mp/1dQeIxx #smartgrowth #urbanplanning	urban sustainability	information	positive	0	3	4	1
15-Jan	Pls RT! Dear @FosterFarms: Please commit to using #antibiotics responsibly: http://j.mp/1m3vu3o	food	action-political	negative	0	7	1	1

15-Jan	MT @NRDCscience: Emissions from coal plants in #China responsible for a quarter million premature deaths in 2011.	Effective January 1, companies are no longer required to use toxic flame retardants in their furniture in California. But these chemicals are not banned - companies can still add them to your couch! We need federal reform to protect human health. Take action: www.bit.ly/1i2YZzk	information	negative	0	7	2	1
15-Jan	#Sustainable development only possible w/in cities if it's inclusive & representative of needs & priorities of people http://j.mp/1d7dM6J	urban sustainability	information	positive	0	10	2	1
15-Jan	#GreenTip: Try new pest prevention methods so you don't have to use toxic #pesticides. http://j.mp/1m6jdez	other	information	50/50	0	9	5	1
15-Jan	Company makes promises on cockroaches and #Salmonella, but no pledge to prevent #antibiotic resistant bacteria http://j.mp/1j7J7P0	food	news	negative	1	9	1	1
15-Jan	If You Don't Believe in #ClimateChange, Just Look Out the Window http://j.mp/1dQb7PY via @HuffPostGreen	climate change	information	negative	1	14	4	0

15-Jan	#CA #drought - The more efficient we all are with our #water use, the more there will be to go around. http://j.mp/1d7gp8F	resource conservation	information, action-personal	50/50	1	9	3	1
15-Jan	Looking for a #nature moment of zen? A Peek At #Arctic #Alaska Life Courtesy Of Instagram http://j.mp/1aGnocn via @HuffPostGreen	other	nature appreciation	positive	0	11	8	0
15-Jan	Where have Florida's sea cows gone? More #manatees died last year in #FL than ever before recorded http://j.mp/1dQGcTE via @GuardianEco	species protection	news	negative	0	15	4	0
15-Jan	Federal Spending Bill Completed - What Does It Mean For #Water? http://j.mp/1aGjqRa	resource conservation	information	neutral	1	9	4	1
15-Jan	California, step aside: New York State's #solar industry is on the rise http://j.mp/1dQXpwb #CA #NY #Renewables	energy	information	positive	0	21	7	0
15-Jan	Retweet from NRDC energy RT @NRDCEnergy: Got #Science? Beyond the Spin: Here's Why #EnergyEfficiency Standards Are Worth Celebrating http://j.mp/1d7iqlf	energy	information	positive	0	12	2	0

15-Jan	<p>The #PebbleMine project is hanging by a thread, and it's time to sever it once and for all. http://j.mp/1j7IQM7 #AK #BristolBay #mining</p>	mining	action-political	50/50	1	16	5	1
--------	--	--------	------------------	-------	---	----	---	---