

BOOK REVIEWS

Single Reviews

Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith: New Orleans in the Wake of Katrina

Vincanne Adams. Durham: Duke University Press, 2013. 248 pp.

David Beriss

University of New Orleans

In the years following the 2005 hurricanes and floods in New Orleans, many of the city's residents found themselves explaining the disaster to people in the rest of the country. The destruction of New Orleans was a result of failed engineering, bad planning, cronyism, and corruption. This was true not only of the floods but also of the way in which the rescue and recovery were handled. We wandered the country warning people: this can happen to you. Your city or state may be next. The government will neither prevent this nor save you after it happens. Your insurance may not work. The people who do come may not have your best interests in mind. Those were dark times.

Vincanne Adams's *Markets of Sorrow, Labors of Faith* is a very readable and timely explanation of what all those wandering oracles meant. The focus is not on the events of 2005 but, rather, on the struggles that residents of New Orleans faced in their attempts to rebuild and recover. It is worth recalling that 80 percent of the city was flooded and that the floodwaters did not recede for weeks. This left a moldy, waterlogged mess behind. Every building in the flood zone had to be gutted and rebuilt. Residents had to replace nearly everything they owned. Insurance companies were often slow to provide the resources people needed.

This is where government could have stepped in to help but did not. Programs with names like "Road Home" were created to make people "whole" again, enabling them to restart businesses, rebuild homes, and bring communities back to life. The programs, along with much else, were run by private contractors. The programs did not, however, work well. Stories about denied assistance were common in the years after the floods. Often, the private contractors and government agencies assigned to help were attempting to impose impossible regulations on disaster victims, demanding documentation that may never have existed, refusing to adapt to the circumstances people confronted. Yet behind this failure, as Adams shows, there were enormous profits being made by private contractors.

One of the central arguments Adams makes is that the seeming failure of postdisaster recovery was a huge success for private contractors. This was because they were able to make a lot of money despite failing to provide the services they were hired to provide. This was not a situation in which the free market stepped in to efficiently replace inefficient government programs. It was, instead, a situation in which people's sorrow was turned into opportunity for other people to profit. These were the "markets of sorrow" of the book's title. Demonstrating how they worked is one of this book's key strengths.

Adams also examines the role played in the recovery by faith-based nonprofits. These groups were often more effective in helping people rebuild homes and businesses than government programs or private contractors. Their prominence was, Adams argues, a result of the same ideology that guided elected officials in outsourcing the recovery effort to private companies. Volunteer groups engaged in "labors of faith" eventually were tied into networks with for-profit companies, forming what is often called "philanthrocapitalism." This, rather than a democratically elected and accountable government, is now central to the way disaster recovery is managed.

The book is well written and could easily be read by undergraduates. Yet it is also a frustrating work, both as an ethnography of post-Katrina New Orleans and as a contribution to the anthropology of disaster. Adams portrays New Orleans residents as victims, haplessly torn between ineffective agencies, unresponsive private contractors, and religiously inspired volunteers. This ignores the rapid development of many kinds of local activist groups, working as nonprofits, lobbyists, entrepreneurs, and organizers. There is a far more complex story in New Orleans that reflects a transformation of the recovery into the re-birth of the city. This has included locals and newcomers, long-time activists and outsiders, working—albeit not always successfully—to address some of the city's underlying problems of inequality, racism, and injustice. Adams also neglects the city's culture, which she surprisingly reduces to public performances combined with romantic stereotypes

about the U.S. South. But she misses the myriad ways in which New Orleans social life does not fit within the broader U.S. framework of race, class, and capitalism. It is precisely the combination of a resilient cultural framework, local organization, and activism that has been key to the city's transformation.

Adams means for her book to serve as a warning about the neoliberal order of things. But without culture or ethnography, what insights can anthropologists offer that other social scientists do not already

provide? Perhaps if Adams had engaged more directly with disaster literature in anthropology—or with more of what has been written by anthropologists and others about New Orleans, before and after Katrina—something distinctively anthropological would emerge. Passionate arguments against the neoliberal order are not hard to find. What can a thick ethnography of New Orleans tell us about resistance to that order on the ground? This book is not the place to look for an answer to that question.

Foodscapes, Foodfields, and Identities in Yucatán

Steffan Igor Ayora-Diaz. CEDLA Latin American Studies series. New York: Berghahn, 2012. 332 pp.

Sidney Mintz

Johns Hopkins University

Foodscapes, Foodfields, and Identities in Yucatán is a book about the Mexican people, the meanings of their food habits, and changes related to food that are now affecting the local inhabitants of the southernmost parts of the Mexican nation. The author, from the Yucatecan city of Valladolid, is an educated anthropological member of what he calls “the Yucatecan elite.”

It is a handsome book. The brightly colored cover—which depicts a smiling lady kissing the Yucatecan flag and lots of food—well represents its theme and promises conciseness. The author tells us that “the chapters of this book are structured to facilitate the understanding of Yucatecan gastronomy as a political and cultural construct that has become important in the fashioning of Yucatecan identities vis-à-vis nationalist, homogenizing cultural colonialism” (p. 30).

The book is neat and coherent. We learn of the contention between Mexico and its regions, as reflected in food; how the author and his friends eat; and how the foods of the world (e.g., Italian, French) contend with the abiding local love of the foods of Yucatán.

Yet as I read, I found myself wondering why a work so handsome, compact, and well organized would end up being slightly tiresome. Take, for example, the following sentence: “We need to pay attention to these textual apparatuses as transpositions from other cultural textual and practical strategies that are locatable, constitutive of, and constituted by, an imaginary that allows and naturalizes one particular form of self-understanding of the regional, while subordinating, other different, potentially competing viewpoints” (p. 158).

The basic difficulty with *Foodscapes*, however, is not style. Put more simply, its title promises more than it can deliver. It is not a book about the food of the Yucatecan people but, rather, about the food habits of the Yucatecan middle classes (or “elite,” as the author writes) and about how their outlook fits with that of the governing classes in the capital. Though the author writes about local people eating and talking about food, we do not learn where the foods are produced, who produces them, or how ingredients reach restaurants and homes. We learn of global penetration in the form of fast foods but hardly anything about who eats them. Only rarely do we come to descriptive terms such as the “silenced peasant and poor” (p. 239). People who do not own cars, who may not be literate, who daily do all of the physical labor—doubtless the vast majority of Yucatán's population—are virtually invisible. The most frequently used descriptive term is “elite.” Nearly everything we are told about the food eaten in Yucatán is about food being eaten by people who do not work with their hands, are literate, and own cars.

What the author has studied—how the middle class cooks, its taste preferences, the restaurants it prefers, the negative pressure of national power upon local cultural forms—are worthy of study. For the most part, he has described these well. But that he does not connect such matters analytically to the vast majority of the Yucatecan population strikes me as unfortunate.

It also opens up what might be a fruitful opportunity to study what those other Yucatecan citizens eat; possibly even what they think; whether they, too, are concerned with authenticity, regional identity, and similar issues. Putting the food and lives of the elite together with those of the other Yucatecos might afford us a fuller sense of what Steffan Ayora-Diaz means by “identities.” I hope that he finds this challenge tantalizing.

Tobacco Capitalism: Growers, Migrant Workers, and the Changing Face of a Global Industry

Peter Benson. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012. 336 pp.

Leigh Binford

City University of New York

In this finely crafted ethnography, Peter Benson develops a historical and contemporary analysis of North Carolina's "tobacco capitalism," detailing the strategies used by big tobacco companies to ensure ample supplies of raw material while undermining public health measures that might reduce tobacco consumption. Farmers have the main role here, but migrant workers, sharecroppers, company representatives, anti-tobacco activists, and pro-tobacco politicians all make appearances in six lengthy chapters.

Benson divides the book into two sections. The three chapters of Part I on "The Tobacco Industry, Public Health, and Agrarian Change" track the industry's historic development in the North Carolina Piedmont region and detail the strategies used by Philip Morris and other industry giants to co-opt, fight off, or minimize challenges represented by the accumulated evidence that smoking tobacco causes cancer and many other diseases. Faced with hefty class-action lawsuits, the companies signed on to public health campaigns so as to undermine them from within, a strategy that worked in part because of strong political support in Washington. Benson notes how tobacco companies resolve the contradiction between economic dependence on tobacco and scientifically documented adverse health effects of smoking by focusing on the product's legality and the "free choice" exercised by smokers while underplaying the addictive qualities of nicotine. As public health campaigns threaten domestic sources of tobacco, companies increasingly outsource production to economically strapped Third World countries, undermining U.S. tobacco farmers' economic stability and contributing to their distress. According to Benson, "These conditions of distress became the phenomenological basis for embedding plight as a powerful ideology of undue hardship and lost privilege, and a keyword that the tobacco companies could use to marshal the political support of the very growers they were putting out of business" (p. 107).

The three chapters of Part II, "Innocence and Blame in American Society," focus on the discourses and relationships of growers, workers (especially migrant workers), and company representatives. Benson's respectful interactions with growers enabled him to grasp their anxieties and disentangle the contradictions that mark the social and economic positioning of what he refers to as "plighted citizenship": an aversion to smoking and acknowledgment of its health risks paired with a strong defense of tobacco pro-

duction; denigration of workers' capacities during a period in which purchase contracts reduced farmers to tobacco company employees and defense of tobacco companies that have opposed economic diversification in tobacco regions of North Carolina and that manipulate domestic tobacco prices by outsourcing. Much of the conservatism of tobacco growers can be attributed to their efforts to maintain their dignity through a period of transition in which a known and for some comfortable world is gradually slipping away.

Chapter 6 contains a beautiful discussion of the multiple meanings of *sorriness*. *Sorry* tobacco is low grade and often full of trash. *Sorry* tobacco can reflect on the skill and managerial capabilities of the producer, though the term is frequently deflected downward to represent the shortcomings of the farm labor force: African Americans in the past and primarily Latin American immigrants (documented and undocumented) today. In this way, *sorry* crystallizes the racially discriminatory attitudes and practices that have relegated African Americans to marginal positions in the industry: previously as slaves, then marginalized sharecroppers, and more recently low-paid field hands. Also, *sorriness* plays into the control strategies of big tobacco companies as a facile public explanation for those growers forced to exit tobacco because they lost money under conditions of growing company management of the production process, declining prices, and rigid grading standards. Some successful farmers accept the standardization imposed on their operations by manufacturers, but they frequently also wax nostalgic for the old auction house atmosphere in which personal relations played a substantial role in commercial transactions.

Tobacco Capitalism focuses on one crop, tobacco, and one region, the North Carolina Piedmont, but the book contains a wealth of ideas for interrogating the defensive conservatism of populations elsewhere. Benson does not reference Antonio Gramsci in the text, but his book provides a masterful analysis of the multiple strategies employed by Philip Morris and other companies to retain hegemony over a constantly evolving social field, in the course of which they make carefully crafted appeals to regional history, culture, and anxieties for the future to enroll tobacco growers and others in the maintenance and reproduction of that hegemony. But it also is also an impassioned assessment of the high cost to North Carolinians, tobacco growers, field hands, and the broader public of the "good, clean tobacco" that growers aspire to produce.

Diasporic Generations: Memory, Politics, and Nation among Cubans in Spain

Mette Louise Berg. *New Directions in Anthropology*, 33. New York: Berghahn, 2011. 240 pp.

Ruth Behar

University of Michigan

The Cuban Revolution of 1959, which brought Fidel Castro to power, has spawned several dramatic waves of migration from the island to scattered locations around the world. Close to 20 percent of the nation's population has resettled outside the territorial boundaries of the island while continuing to lay claim to Cuban identities. In the last 54 years, a range of diasporas have developed, each marked by the historical moment in which the departure from Cuba took place and by the influence of gender, race, class, and educational backgrounds on how individuals have fared in their migrant trajectories.

It is well known that the majority of Cubans living outside the island have resettled in Miami, a city that Cubans singlehandedly transformed into a Latin American hub and eventually into a global city. What is less known is that numerous Cubans have chosen to make their way quietly to other locations in Europe, Latin America, Asia, and Africa, preferring not to set foot in the territory of the "imperialist enemy," otherwise known as the United States, and refusing to accept as a second home the distorted mirror image of Cuba that has been created in Miami. Perhaps the most interesting of these alternative destinations is Spain, the country that colonized the island and clung to this "pearl of the Antilles" so fiercely, the Spaniards fighting hopelessly to keep Cuba, only to lose it in the Spanish-American War of 1898.

Mette Louise Berg's book, *Diasporic Generations: Memory, Politics, and Nation among Cubans in Spain*, is the first detailed ethnographic study to examine the lives of Cubans living in Spain since the early 1960s through to the present day. She systematically considers three diasporic generations: (1) the exiles, who left revolutionary Cuba for Franco's Spain and who, like the so-called "historic exiles" of Miami, have refused to return to the island, building social and political organizations to maintain their sense of Cuban nostalgia while also claiming ancestral Spanish roots; (2) the children of the revolution, who grew up under a socialist system and think of themselves as postsocialist and cosmopolitan, who chose to break with the system after having formed part of it

and are thus viewed as "traitors" back on the island, and who remain critical of capitalist ideology and consumption; and (3) the migrants, who arrived in Spain following the crisis of the mid-1990s in Cuba and view themselves as wholly nonpolitical, as seeking to better their economic situation through marriage to a Spaniard or job opportunities in Spain and hoping to help their families still in Cuba by sending back remittances.

Drawing on the life stories of those who form part of these distinct diasporic generations, Berg presents moving epiphanies of how Cubans feel about their condition. Yanet from Havana, for example, missed the sea when she arrived in Madrid and spoke of how she felt "a bit asphyxiated. The sea gives you a sensation of freedom, of plenitude." To adapt, she began to learn the names of trees and now "can tell a birch from a white poplar, and a black poplar from a hazelnut tree" (p. 1). César, who had been an actor in Cuba and immigrated to Barcelona in hopes of furthering his career, found that he was often out of work, and although he felt sad and wanted to tell his mother in Cuba the truth about his struggles whenever he called her, his brothers urged him not to. "I had to call my mother to put her at rest because she would get up every day crying, thinking of what was going to happen with me . . . and I had to tell her a story that I had a new job . . . Maybe she didn't even believe it, but it's just . . . a story to help her dream" (p. 143).

The book's major flaws are its repetitiveness and the author's compulsion to offer unnecessary explanations of ideas that are self-evident from the ethnography itself. I would have liked to see the author break free from the strictures of defending an argument and get more entangled in the threads of the ethnographic tapestry. Although the voices of Cubans in Spain can be heard in Berg's study, they feel a little truncated; their nuanced complexity isn't allowed to emerge fully. Nevertheless, her writing is lucid, and she demonstrates a profound empathy toward the people who became her interlocutors. I congratulate her for offering a poignant contribution to the understanding of how Cubans of the Spanish Diaspora obsess about their lost home, even as the island seems to drift further away with each passing day.

Inka Human Sacrifice and Mountain Worship: Strategies for Empire Unification

Thomas Besom. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013. 328 pp.

Bethany L. Turner
Georgia State University

In *Inka Human Sacrifice and Mountain Worship*, Thomas Besom aims to bring into sharper focus the role of ritual practice and ideology in facilitating the spread of Inca imperialism and maintaining control over subject populations. While the book emphasizes the importance of manipulating ideology and ritual practice in general, of central interest is the role of sacrificed human beings as a currency through which the sacred spaces of subjugated populations could be co-opted and made into satellites of Inca religious power. Besom's approach is informed by the mortuary analyses of John Reinhard (2005) and the political-economic analyses of Inca statecraft of Terrence D'Altroy (1992), and his data are drawn primarily from a combination of ethnohistoric analysis and examination of sacrificial contexts at two different mountaintop sites in Chile.

The book begins with a comprehensive discussion of the different types of human sacrificial victims and immolation contexts found in the Central Andes, including the violent sacrifices of captured prisoners of war, symbolic sacrifices of anthropomorphic figurines, and honorific sacrifices of women and children, known as *kapac huchas* (or *capacochas*), as offerings to mountains and other deities. Besom then moves on to paired chapters involving descriptions, then interpretations, of each of the two sacrificial contexts. The first centers on disturbed human remains from an adult female and a female child from the Esmeralda Mountain near Iquique, Chile; the second focuses on the remains of a male child from the lower peak of El Plomo, just northeast of modern-day Santiago, Chile. Both contexts are rich in Inca artifacts and resemble the *kapac hucha* style of sacrificial offerings seen in a number of Andean contexts, perhaps most famously with the Ice Maiden of Mount Ampato in southern Peru and the Maiden atop Llullaillaco Mountain in Argentina.

Besom presents an interesting study involving ideology, and particularly sacrifice, as symbols by which to maintain control in far-flung regions of the Inca empire. Inca imperial expansion and consolidation happened relatively quickly and often subsumed regions of the Andes that were difficult to access from Cuzco, which raises the question of how Inca authority was established and especially how it was sustained. Besom notes the lack of archaeological evidence of Inca infrastructure in the areas of Chile that he researches and argues that sacrifice was itself a potent mechanism of control

that was less risky and costly than a permanent military or infrastructural presence (p. 213).

Besom's arguments are compelling, though they are tempered somewhat by the relatively limited nature of the study sites themselves. Only three sacrificial victims from two mountaintop contexts were analyzed, which limits his ability to generalize to the rest of Qulla Suyu as a whole. He himself acknowledges that he is using an Inca-centric, top-down perspective in analyzing these immolations and notes that an ethnohistoric analysis of whether these Inca strategies for ideological control were actually effective is beyond the scope of his study. Given the amount of ethnohistoric data he draws into his analysis of the immolations, however, I would have liked to have seen some treatment of this in his chapters. Some discussion on this topic would help in comparing this region to others with similar sacrifices and might shed light on the ways that different symbols were deployed in different sites.

Another issue is that Besom periodically describes his interpretations with a high degree of certainty that, given the inherently indirect nature of his data, seems problematic. A discussion of where the sacrificed females from Esmeraldas and the sacrificed boy from El Plomo were from provides one example, as the author emphasizes that they were almost certainly sacrificed in what to them was a foreign land, having been brought from afar to Cuzco and then to Chile for immolation. While aspects of the boy's dress and hair style certainly suggest a cultural affiliation with distant parts of central Chile, there is nothing to unequivocally point to the Esmeralda females as being foreign to Iquique. Valerie Andrushko and colleagues (2011) and I (Turner et al. 2013) have used isotope analysis to argue that sacrificed individuals in the highlands and north coast of Peru, respectively, were local to the region in which their immolation took place and did not travel great distances in the months leading up to their deaths. These and other studies suggest that the *kapac hucha* contexts may not be as clearly defined as originally thought.

Even with these issues, *Inka Human Sacrifice and Mountain Worship* provides an in-depth examination of sacrifice not only as a practice to promote fertility and prosperity but also as a strategy by which a distant power directly appropriated that prosperity. Besom's study is rich in theoretical grounding and a mostly careful interpretation of these two contexts, and he provides an important comparison of sacrificial contexts that are often analyzed separately and subject to fetishizing in popular press.

REFERENCES CITED

- Andrushko, Valerie A., Michele R. Buzon, Arminda M. Gibaja, Gordon F. McEwan, Antonio Simonetti, and Robert A. Creaser
2011 Investigating a Child Sacrifice Event from the Inca Heartland. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 38(2):323–333.
- D’Altroy, Terence N.
1992 *Provincial Power in the Inka Empire*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press.
- Reinhard, Johan
2005 *The Ice Maiden: Inca Mummies, Mountain Gods, and Sacred Sites in the Andes*. Washington, DC: The National Geographic Society.
- Turner, Bethany L., Haagen D. Klaus, Sarah V. Livengood, Leslie E. Brown, Fausto Saldaña, and Carlos Wester
2013 The Variable Roads to Sacrifice: Isotopic Investigations of Human Remains from Chotuna-Huaca de los Sacrificios, Lambayeque, Peru. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 151(1):22–37.

Objects of Time: How Things Shape Temporality

Kevin K. Birth. *Culture, Mind, and Society* series. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. 222 pp.

Thomas A. Offit
Baylor University

Kevin Birth begins *Objects of Time* with a rejoinder—although he is an anthropologist concerned with time, he will not limit his writing to ethnographic treatments of the topic; instead, he will enter “scholarly domains where I probably have no business going, and in which I am not properly trained” (p. vi). In the parlance of the great political philosopher Isaiah Berlin, Birth is a fox, one who knows (and writes) about many things, as opposed to a hedgehog, one who limits his interest to one big thing (Berlin 1953). The purpose of Birth’s explorations is to examine how mundane objects of time (clocks, calendars) influence how we think about time and to situate these artifacts in their proper historical context to illuminate the process by which we have gone from a species that takes its understanding of time from natural cues to one who comprehends time via a small set of artifacts that only approximates the earth’s daily rotation and yearly revolution around the sun. To accomplish this vast endeavor, the author looks to history, social theory, physics, biology, and ethnography. His subject matter is vast and unwieldy, but his presentation is lively and a model of clarity. He is a masterful fox, and his book will be invaluable for cognitive anthropologists, scholars of material culture, and theorists interested in time historically and in our global age.

The first part of the book is devoted to detailed histories of the development of clocks and calendars from the classical age through the medieval period up through the industrial age. Birth shows that our modern understanding of time is a result of our ancestors grappling with a variety of temporal problems (how to divide days that contain wildly irregular amounts of sunlight and dark, how to account for the wobble in the earth’s rotation on its axis) and that the solutions to these problems, largely unknown to modern users, are embedded within the objects that dictate how we currently think about time. We made clocks and calendars, but now they make us.

The most ethnographically dense section of the volume focuses on Birth’s 20-year-plus engagement with time

conceptions in Trinidad, the subject of his excellent earlier work *Any Time Is Trinidad Time* (1999). Here, borrowing Henri Lefebvre’s (2004) concept of polyrhythmia or presence of multiple timescapes, Birth demonstrates that, in rural Trinidad, the nature of work among those who have many occupations (as most of the populace does) requires them to be sensitive to contingent timing or tasks whose ideal performance is contingent upon other events. Instead of following the uniform time of wristwatches, alarm clocks, and calendars, these contingent tasks are set in motion by anticipatory signals such as the sounds of children walking to school, the engines of public taxis, or the onset of a heavy rain. His detailed descriptions of daily life do much to back up his call for the “need to make time contextual and processual and situational, just as other issues, such as identities, have come to be viewed in these terms” (p. 118).

Birth provides his most expansive and theoretically important argument next, delineating the biological consequences of universal clock time in an age of capitalist globalization. Drawing on research from the relatively new field of chronobiology, he takes on the implications of the “flatness” of the modern globe (Friedman 2005) and time–space compression (Harvey 1990), arguing that clock and calendar time, all synchronized to the environmental, social, and political-economic milieus of a few global centers, has created vast arrhythmias or conflicts between timescapes that do danger to all of our lives, disrupting hormone and sleep cycles that should be tied to major environmental cues such as sunrise. As he eloquently states: “Time-space compression does not make a flat earth, but by virtue of existing on a globe, makes some of capitalism’s contradictions physically and mentally excruciating for those touched by such compression” (p. 153). While the oppressive nature of clock time for workers in the age of industrial capitalism is well-trod ground, Birth has provided a major contribution by extending this insight into the global age.

The book concludes with Birth’s analysis of why we have begun an age of homochronicity, a globalized system of uniform timekeeping that is usually credited to technical advance but in Birth’s estimation is more due to the needs of

a managerial class that seeks the standardization of all human routine, especially labor, in a global capitalist system. All of us feel bound to our alarm clocks, wristwatches, and daily planners, but few of us have given thought to where these devices come from and how they have altered us as social and biological beings. In this engaging and intellectually far-reaching work, Birth has done much of the work for us. Glory be to the foxes.

REFERENCES CITED

Berlin, Isaiah

1953 *The Hedgehog and the Fox: An Essay on Tolstoy's View of History*. London: George Weidenfeld and Nicolson.

Birth, Kevin K.

1999 "Any Time Is Trinidad Time": Social Meanings and Temporal Consciousness. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Friedman, Thomas L.

2005 *The World Is Flat: A Brief History of the Twenty-First Century*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Harvey, David

1990 *The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change*. London: Wiley Blackwell.

LeFebvre, Henri

2004 *Rhythmanalysis: Space, Time and Everyday Life*. Athlone Contemporary European Thinkers series. London: Continuum.

Anthropology and the Cognitive Challenge

Maurice Bloch. *New Departures in Anthropology series*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012. 244 pp.

Harold D. Green

RAND Corporation

Anthropology has no lack of theory. We have our own native theories, as well as those borrowed and modified from sociology, evolutionary biology, literary criticism, and even physics. Aside from a fairly small group of researchers, however, few anthropologists engage fully with psychological and cognitive theory. In his book *Anthropology and the Cognitive Challenge*, Maurice Bloch, emeritus professor of anthropology at the London School of Economics, presents a clear explanation of why anthropologists, particularly U.S. cultural anthropologists, avoid engaging with psychological and cognitive sciences and then describes benefits that would accrue should the disciplines reengage. In just over 200 pages, Bloch presents an astonishingly comprehensive but critical review of the trends in anthropological theory, arguing with great skill that we, as anthropologists, through a series of decisions made on political and ethical bases, may have thrown the baby out with the bathwater.

In the first section of the book, Bloch turns a critical eye toward anthropology. First, a historical review of the discipline highlights moments in which, as he posits, "misleading steers" occurred. Bloch argues that anthropologists made certain political and ethical choices both to avoid being considered racist or sexist and to eliminate the possibility that their work might be used to racist or sexist ends. In the drive to avoid racist and sexist reductionism, however, anthropologists also blinded themselves to insights about cognitive processes that enable communication and cooperation, thus overlooking important foundations for human culture and society. He continues by criticizing the common anthropological perspective that humans live in a world constructed by history, society, and culture but not by biology, psychology, and cognition. Focusing on the insights of linguistic

theory in one chapter and on problematic ethnographies of time in another, he argues that humans share common cognitive processes made unique to each individual by personal experience, history, culture, and society and that acknowledging this not only offers opportunities for much richer understanding of the cultural world but also suggests fruitful avenues for future research for both anthropologists and cognitive psychologists.

The second section of the book is more constructive, focusing on the benefits of synthesizing anthropological and cognitive traditions. Bloch takes up the notion of "the self" first, putting forward a framework that reconciles what we have learned from anthropological studies with what we have learned from cognitive sciences. He describes different levels of the self, from the "core" to the "narrative" and on to the "metarepresentational," with culture emerging from the impact of social interaction on the higher levels of the self that deal with memory, abstraction, narrative, and representation. He argues that anthropologists' overreliance on representation and metarepresentation is largely because these generally appear as nice, well-formed stories. However, as one moves closer to core features of the self, cognitive processes become harder for a person to describe because they are so basic to our functioning that they may not even be recognized as cognitive processes at all. He calls this "implicitness" and argues that cognitive sciences have a great deal to contribute to how anthropologists might understand these kinds of processes.

Bloch concludes by discussing how the concepts presented in the book can be used to understand memory. He argues that humans live within two linked continua: one internal (from unconscious cognitive processes to direct access and modification of metarepresentations) and one external (the interpenetration of one individual with others through learning, history, society, and culture). The knowledge

produced by these two continua is memory, and he suggests a framework for understanding it that integrates both cognitive and anthropological knowledge.

I believe that Bloch offers a well-reasoned and balanced perspective on the divide between psychology and anthropology. Most psychological and cognitive anthropologists will find themselves nodding in agreement as they read. Others may take offense at his very direct critique of anthropology, may believe that a stark separation between psychology and anthropology continues to be appropriate, or may think that there is nothing that deeper understanding of cognition

and perception can add to our approach to understanding culture (particularly to the latent assumptions made in many anthropological theories and analyses). However, this book may well change the way many think about the contribution of cognitive sciences to anthropology. The comprehensive and critical appraisal of trends in anthropological theory is appealing as course material for a graduate-level seminar, certainly likely to encourage lively discussion. Bloch's book urges adjustments that could correct an overcorrection made many years ago, returning anthropology to a place more fully engaged with the natural and social sciences.

Homies and Hermanos: God and Gangs in Central America

Robert Brenneman. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011. 312 pp.

Jon H. Carter

Columbia University

Cultural sociologist Robert Brenneman's book is a welcome contribution to studies of transnational gangs in Central America, a still-nascent literature amassing over the last decade. These gangs, called *maras*, have been the *cause célèbre* of security agenda, asserting authoritarian policing as a regular feature of daily life in Guatemala, El Salvador, and Honduras, where booming illicit economies, diminished public investment, and a growing youth population dovetail into a perfect storm for recruitment into criminal communities. Brenneman's study, however, focuses not on persons joining the *maras* but, rather, on those leaving them, a passage forbidden by death at the hands of the gang except in the event of Christian conversion. Brenneman provides the most in-depth analysis of this loophole in gang life to date. By this measure alone, his work is essential to anyone interested in gangs and, what is equally the focus of his book, the changing face of Christianity in the region.

Brenneman's plainly written, gritty account covers a broad range of historical and personal narratives shaping the present. He begins with condensed histories of (1) the *maras* during the last 30 years and (2) Central American Protestantism across the 20th century. In contemporary Central America, where gang members shuttle out of gangs and into grace, transforming from disreputable criminals to mouthpieces for the Holy Spirit, Brenneman urges the reader to consider gang and evangelical worlds as polar extremes of a broad effort to create social safety nets in the absence of state institutions and economic opportunity. With their franchise arrangement, international networks, and strict moral codes, gang and "barrio evangelical" worlds bear a striking resemblance.

In this context, Brenneman details the everyday reasons for surging gang membership in recent years, translating the structural forces of marginalization into a local "sociology of emotions" that trades the common rational choice mod-

eling of gang life for a deep examination of "the profound experience of shame" that *maras*, following Brenneman, are equipped to placate. Complicating the notion that young people are often coerced into gang life, Brenneman draws from narratives of 63 ex-gang members to give a spectrum of reasons for joining gangs, stages and degrees of affiliation, and the multidimensional coping strategies of youth surviving in extraordinarily fractured circumstances. From a Durkheimian interpretation of ritual and group solidarity, Brenneman turns to the work of social psychologist Thomas Scheff, among a variety of others in and outside of sociology, to make evident how gang rituals transform shame into pride, often with violence as an intermediary. It is essential to emphasize here that Brenneman's analysis allows for a qualitative differentiation between the violence of gang life and that of state institutions and paramilitary groups, often muddled together as a singular spectacle in scholastic analysis as much as popular representation.

Cycles of violence in gang life prove unsustainable for many, and Brenneman works to complicate the picture of religious conversion, often characterized as sudden revelation, as much as he complicates gang membership in the preceding chapters. Using biographical narratives, Brenneman argues that conversion is less a sudden, blinding light than a series of pragmatic choices by which gang members weigh the pros and cons of gang versus religious community, the risks of being labeled false converts, and offending the gang or God above, and integrate themselves cautiously into communities of worship. Brenneman emphasizes the need to remain skeptical of some conversion performances, though he was surprised to find the majority of his informants faced conversion with uncertainty, only to be caught suddenly by the emotional release that is the *sine qua non* of evangelical conversion. Brenneman focuses on the mechanics of this emotional rupture, recognized by compulsive weeping and shaking, wherein the violation of expectations of masculinity in gang life crosses a threshold wherein rituals of reintegrative shaming begin. The

transformation of homie to hermano begins with this unfolding of new dimensions of experience, self, and community, as well as of everyday obstacles to acceptance in nongang society.

The final piece of Brenneman's judiciously apportioned argument asks how evangelical and Pentecostal churches have positioned themselves within the gang crisis. Protestant outreach programs differ significantly from their Catholic counterparts, as the former regard gangs as a product of spiritual ill and ex-gang converts as proof of one church or pastor's spiritual efficacy, while the latter retain a spirit of liberation theology that views the current crisis as one of social rather than individual dimensions. However, because

Protestantism continues to grow across the Northern Triangle of Central America while Catholic affiliation is on the decline, Brenneman suggests that the "emotional, embodied, conversion experiences" at the core of evangelical and Pentecostal conversion might be taken up as, invoking Max Weber, track switchers in history. That is, while some religious ideas may not lay the tracks for the course of history, they can shift its trajectory from time to time. Brenneman's resourceful handling of the life stories that buttress this valuable contribution to gang and religious studies will take any reader to the limits of agency and desire as the men are transformed in prisons and chapels of Central America, one convert at a time.

The Past in Pieces: Belonging in the New Cyprus

Rebecca Bryant. *Contemporary Ethnography series*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010. 224 pp.

Lisa Dikomitis

University of Hull

In 2013 the Greek Cypriot presidential elections were dominated by the financial crisis, which rapidly altered the focus of local politics on Cyprus. For the first time since 1974, the island's political conflict was pushed to the background, and debates did not revolve around the internal refugee problem, property rights, territorial limits, and reunification proposals. Yet 1974 remains a watershed year for the majority of Cypriots. In the summer of that year, the Turkish army invaded Cyprus, prompted by a coup orchestrated by the military regime then in power in Greece. The coup itself was preceded by many years of instability with bouts of severe intercommunal violence. Ever since, the island of Cyprus has been divided in a Greek Cypriot south and a Turkish Cypriot north, with each side home to an internal refugee community: Turkish Cypriots who were relocated from south to north and Greek Cypriots who fled during or shortly after the Turkish invasion and now live in the south. There have been continuous diplomatic attempts to resolve the "Cyprus Problem," both in and outside Cyprus, but no solution has been found and the island has remained partitioned.

The Past in Pieces begins with another momentous event in the recent history of Cyprus, which occurred in April 2003: the unexpected opening of the checkpoints along the Green Line that has separated the two communities since 1974. The opening of the border provided scholars with a unique opportunity to study the renewed interaction between the two communities, which is reflected in the growing academic literature on Cyprus. However, many of these studies still focus exclusively on the south of the island and the Greek Cypriot experience. This book, as well as two other recently published monographs (Dikomitis 2012; Navaro-

Yashin 2012), seek to rectify this imbalance by including ethnography collected north of the border and a discussion of Turkish Cypriot experiences.

Rebecca Bryant is a seasoned anthropologist with two decades of fieldwork experience on Cyprus, and her depth of knowledge and commitment is evident in this fascinating work. The book marks a radical departure, in both approach and style, from her first monograph, which dealt with nationalist imaginings on Cyprus (Bryant 2004). It is written in a jargon-free language and an engaging style rich with fine-grained ethnography. The stories of a small number of Greek Cypriot and Turkish Cypriot informants, who are linked by their personal histories to the formerly mixed town of Lapithos (Greek)—Lapta (Turkish), guide the reader through this "new Cyprus." The minutiae of her informants' everyday lives and intimate stories confided to the anthropologist allow the reader to see how the opening of the ceasefire line did not lead to reconciliation or to a permanent solution for the "Cyprus Problem." On the contrary, the one-day visits across the border and contacts between Greek and Turkish Cypriots have created new realities on Cyprus. Bryant demonstrates that the borders, both real and symbolic, between the two communities have not been broken down and that old ones were strengthened and new ones emerged.

The book is an interesting blend of political anthropology, oral history, field notes, and memoir. Bryant weaves, in a compelling way, her personal journey into the analysis through her reflections on how both informants and researcher were continuously forced to deal with issues of trust and betrayal. This is brought together in the final chapter: "I also found myself being pulled to *take sides*, to show that one side or the other was right" (p. 185, emphasis in original), which is a predicament shared by researchers conducting fieldwork on both sides of the Green Line.

It deserves to be mentioned that *The Past in Pieces* is also a beautiful book as object. The well-designed layout and typography, the moving cover image, and the striking pictures that accompany this text are all features often overlooked in academic works, which, here, add an element of material pleasure. I hope that this ethnography will create the space for the urgent and much-needed debate on the future of the “new Cyprus,” even though the southern part of that “new Cyprus” is now in the grips of a major financial crisis.

REFERENCES CITED

- Bryant, Rebecca
2004 *Imagining the Modern: The Cultures of Nationalism in Cyprus*. London: I. B. Tauris.
- Dikomitis, Lisa
2012 *Cyprus and Its Places of Desire: Cultures of Displacement among Greek and Turkish Cypriot Refugees*. London: I. B. Tauris.
- Navaro-Yashin, Yael
2012 *The Make-Believe Space: Affective Geography in a Postwar Polity*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Corsican Fragments: Difference, Knowledge, and Fieldwork

Matei Candea. *New Anthropologies of Europe series*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010. 216 pp.

Linda Cool

Union College

Corsica has long been a destination of otherness: tourists in search of the exotic, emigrant islanders in search of an imagined past, French policy makers in search of refashioning a problematic region within their hegemonic vision of the state, Corsican nationalists in search of a political identity separate from that of Continentals, and anthropologists in search of cultural difference within a perceived European tradition. Matei Candea presents this book situated in Corsica as an exploration of anthropological ways of coming to grips with the fragmentary knowledge gained from fieldwork in a region long preoccupied with its disputed identities.

In the beginning of *Corsican Fragments*, Candea offers his readers fair warning not to expect a coherently argued, neatly packaged presentation of a traditional village ethnography. Candea's construction of the Corsican village of Crucetta elaborates upon an ethnographic research and writing style that began with the postmodernists, who perceive ethnography as an uneasy dialogue between the physical place and its construction in the eyes of different observers, including the anthropologist. Candea notes that he intends to challenge the notion of a polished, cohesive, and completely finished piece of ethnographic description and argues instead that anthropologists gain knowledge during fieldwork by negotiating messy, often contradictory fragments of information. This is an important message for readers: anthropological understanding does not miraculously appear as a coherent picture in a flash of inspired insight but, rather, lurches forward (and backward) during the process of discovery. To illustrate this point, the author uses anecdote as the organizing device of each chapter in his ethnographic narrative about what it means to be Corsican (or not). This technique is a useful antidote to some of the excesses of the building-block, holistic approach characteristic of earlier ethnographies.

In his prologue, Candea outlines how each chapter has a kind of thematic focus (place, things, people, language, and knowing) but warns that these foci provide a “sequence of

partial positions which do not add up to a whole but to a journey” (p. 2), presumably a journey toward understanding. The chapters each raise intriguing issues, but they seem oddly detached from one another and lacking in any particular point of reference. Only in chapters 7 (“Knowing”) and 8 (“Anonymous Introductions”) do the author's themes and organizing principles intersect in convincing fashion. Chapter 7 examines the difference between “knowing” others and “being known” by them and questions whether Corsica can ever be understood by continentals or whether one can ever become “local” despite years of living on location. Chapter 8 suggests that a partial answer to the questions of sameness and difference can be found in a bit of ethnographic imponderability—the tendency for people in Crucetta to avoid asking for or giving one another's names at the first meeting (what the author calls the “anonymous introduction”). But Candea's analysis of the anonymous introduction remains at the level of conflicting interpretations (efforts to maintain difference vs. allowances for inclusion), which, while wonderfully interesting and applicable to introductions that one finds in many small, face-to-face societies around the world, raise more questions than provide answers about what constitutes, dare I say, the culture of Crucetta, Corsica, or Mediterranean Europe. To ask Candea's own question, is sameness or difference to be the focus of this work?

I agree that many anthropologists have spent far too much time seeking perfect solutions to human puzzles and have worked perhaps too diligently to find interrelationships among disparate, contradictory facts. Fragments and incoherence have their place in anthropological understanding. And yet, while reading I often found my attention wandering until Candea would present another intriguing ethnographic anecdote (cf. the arbitrariness of location that means different things to different people), then find myself disappointed that a momentary gem of revelation was not pursued during the chapter or elaborated upon elsewhere in the book. This reader longed for some thread of connective tissue that would bind disparate fragments into some kind of organizing continuum of sameness or difference

that might deepen our understanding, even if only partially. While Candea is proud that he is writing the “opposite of a village ethnography” (p. 37), he never convincingly explains to the reader what he believes the “opposite” of a village ethnography to be. How does this alternative practice of ethnography advance anthropological knowledge beyond the novelty of narrating incomplete understandings? One wonders how Candea constructs his reader. There is most likely not enough ethnographic information for the student interested in learning about Corsica

for the first time nor is there enough background for the novice in anthropological fieldwork to understand Candea’s interesting critique of and rebuttal to the methods and theory that have characterized the discipline for a long time. At some point, the ethnographer needs to take an interpretive stand or risk allowing fragmentary knowledge to be constructed by the reader who lacks firsthand experience. To take the latter position to its logical conclusion would be to put into question the act of fieldwork and the role of the ethnographer.

Musical Renderings of the Philippine Nation

Christi-Anne Castro. *The New Cultural History of Music series*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2011. 248 pp.

Michiyo Yoneno-Reyes

University of the Philippines, Diliman

Musical Renderings of the Philippine Nation illustrates how Filipino artists and people expressed the Philippine nation through music in 1898–1998—a period including independence from Spain, U.S. colonial rule, Japanese occupation, and the postindependence decades. The book’s main themes are modernism, hybridity, and actors, and these are discussed respectively vis-à-vis tonality, time and place, and narratives at large (see introduction). More weight is given to the postindependence decades and to the formulation of official nationalism through musical renditions by focusing on key players and their strategy of reifying nationalistic narratives with rhetoric of the past: ruralness, patriotism, nostalgia, unity, and diversity, among others.

By so weighting her arguments, Christi-Anne Castro advances a few existing studies on this topic (e.g., Bankoff and Weekley 2002; Ness 1997) and makes a breakthrough by bravely tackling the sensitive issues around the artists’ engagement with authority, especially that of dictatorship. While a few Filipino social scientists began to objectively reflect on the Marcos period (1965–1986; e.g., see Tadem 2013 and Talledo 2004), sentiments of reluctance and taboo still prevail among Filipino intellectuals and artists in facing engagement with the dictatorship—their own, as well as that of their colleagues, mentors, and friends and relatives. This may be partly because such scholars and artists are themselves often beneficiaries of the institutions crafted under the regime in one way or another: “Collaboration and the pragmatism of survival” (p. 163) continues to be a reality.

The book consists of the introduction and five chapters. Chapters focus, respectively, on the following: the national anthem and art music composers, Bayanihan Dance Company, the Cultural Center of the Philippines, the Philippine Madrigal Singers, and songs of the 1986 People Power Revolution. Consistent with the word *rendering* in the title, the author aptly appropriates and coins numerous nouns by combining verbs with *-ization* suffixes (e.g., *folklorization*, *nationalization*, *institutionalization*)

as well as adjectives with *-ized* suffixes (e.g., *mythologized*, *canonized*, and *Filipinized*). With such terms, the author rightly calls readers’ attention to the idea that nationalist sentiments in music are due to the conscious effort of “doing” construction and negotiation by and between actors and power.

The message is clear. However, it could have been addressed more effectively if the entire book was strategically aligned (and so stated), in terms of theoretical grounding, as an advanced study of “imagined community,” “invention-of-tradition,” and “traditionalization” (e.g., Shuman and Briggs 1993) frameworks, to be reinforced by critical anthropology and practice theory. Ethnomusicology has successfully contributed to the advancement of the imagined community framework since the 1990s by illuminating the role of music played in community building by nation-states and oppositional, regional, or ethnic minorities, especially among the postcolonial nations in the 20th century, aided by the development of electronic mass media. Since the 2000s, ethnomusicology has incorporated nuances of agency to its discourse, appropriating the notion of agency as advanced by anthropology (Yoneno-Reyes 2011). *Musical Renderings of the Philippine Nation* can be comfortably located in the context of such a process of theoretical development. Furthermore, postcolonial ambivalence of the Philippines’ relationship with the United States may have been discussed better by adapting postcolonial critiques.

I have suggested the abovementioned theoretical grounding, so that the relatively weak presentation of empirical data in this book could be forgiven. The author’s graceful writing style is pleasant and seemingly convincing. The narrative about how the three canonical institutions in performing arts in the contemporary Philippines (Bayanihan, CCP, Madrigals) have been formulated is informative. But readers will soon notice that many statements are speculative. Tonality and hybridity could have been discussed more effectively with a textual analysis of music and dances. Then the role of public education in introducing tonality to the general public as a symptom of modernity could have been deliberated separately from the modernism as “a

general movement away from tonality” (p. 54) in art music. Archival research (e.g., Marcos-period official documents, newspaper and magazine articles, and so forth) and interviews could have been conducted more systematically.

Nevertheless, conclusive remarks are telling: “modernity” is “not rooted in time but in ideas”; “what has become mixed cannot be unmixed” (p. 200). *Musical Renderings of the Philippine Nation* is a pioneering work to be celebrated. I look forward to future studies by those inspired by this one.

REFERENCES CITED

Bankoff, Greg, and Kathleen Weekley

2002 Post-Colonial National Identity in the Philippines: Celebrating the Centennial of Independence. Farnham: Ashgate.

Ness, Sally

1997 Originality in the Postcolony: Choreographing the Neoethnic Body of Philippine Ballet. *Cultural Anthropology* 12(1):64–108.

Shuman, Amy, and Charles L. Briggs

1993 Introduction. Special issue, “Theorizing Folklore: Toward New Perspectives on the Politics of Culture.” *Western Folklore* 52(2):109–134.

Tadem, Teresa S. Encarnacion

2013 Social Capital and Martial Law Technocracy: The Making and Unmaking of a Power Elite. *Kritika Kultura* 20: 69–94.

Talledo, Tomasito T.

2004 Construction of Identity in Central Panay: A Critical Examination of the Ethnographic Subject in the Works of Jocano and Mago. *Asian Studies* 40(1):111–123.

Yoneno-Reyes, Michiyo

2011 Singing of Modernity and U.S. Shadow: Bodily Aesthetics and Ideology in Salidummay and Shoka. In *The Philippines and Japan in America’s Shadow*. Kiichi Fujiwara and Yoshiko Nagano, eds. Pp. 227–258. Singapore: National University of Singapore Press.

A Future for Amazonia: Randy Borman and Cofán Environmental Politics

Michael Cepek. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2012. 274 pp.

Veronica M. Davidov

Monmouth University

Michael Cepek’s *A Future for Amazonia: Randy Borman and Cofán Environmental Politics* is a rich ethnography that is conscious and mindful of the intervention it is making in the highly politicized milieu of anthropological work about Amazonian indigenous peoples. The Ecuadorian Cofán are in a sense legendary in the popular imaginary of indigenous Amazonia for their comparatively successful negotiation of their self-determination and their involvement in high-profile indigenous politics in a country that has seen powerful and successful indigenous mobilizations over the last two decades. Randy Borman, the media-famous centerpiece of the story Cepek tells, is the so-called “gringo chief” of the Cofán nation. Borman, the son of missionary parents who grew up in a Cofán community, returned there as an adult and crafted himself into an advocate for Cofán rights for self-determination, commonly portrayed as a unique celebrity in the semiotic universe of indigenous activism in the Amazon, an intercultural leader who “stands both inside and outside Cofán communities” (p. 78).

The book is divided into two sections. The first, “An Individual and a People,” is a story of Cofán told largely through the story of Borman. The first chapter introduces Borman himself. The second chapter starts with the Zabaló Cofán unique success at ejecting oil companies from their territories in the mid-1990s under the leadership of Borman—a testament to the political capital the nation has been able to deploy. In this chapter, Cepek then simultaneously uses the figure of Borman to explore and illumi-

nate the cultural logic of Cofán identity and shows how the Cofán context, in particular Cofán understanding of difference and power, as well as the contingent and flexible nature of Cofán identity, created a space in which ethnically ambiguous leadership is possible, a space that allowed for a leader like Borman to emerge. The third chapter, which concludes the first section, focuses on Cofán practices and discourses of value and the role of brokers of power in that system—specifically, shamans, warriors, and chiefs. These actors, elected or selected to their positions, are on the other side of what Cepek calls “a cultural and moral gap” (p. 96). Cepek offers a nuanced analysis of all Cofán leader figures “enter[ing] into tense and difficult relations with powerful outsiders” (p. 96)—whether spiritual attackers, enemy indigenous peoples, or oil companies. Such leader figures both protect Cofán interest but also, in a sense, necessarily alienate themselves from “regular” Cofán by becoming entangled in social relations that are illegible or abstract to the majority of Cofán. Again, this in-depth ethnographic treatment of the moral ecology of power relations among Cofán shows how a “gringo chief” is categorically not the novelty that many media portrayals would have him be and not the creator of a uniquely “postmodern Indian village” but, rather, a figure that authentically emerges out of and fits into Cofán understandings of the role and position of their leaders. In this in particular, Cepek makes an important intervention in the tendency of Amazonian scholarship to envision a transition from “old” leaders imagined to be fully grounded in their communities to “new leaders” who straddle and negotiate two worlds (generally, “traditional” and “modern,” or some version of that dichotomy). As he notes, “the shaman, the

warrior, and the contemporary Cofán leader teach us that the new leaders might not be so new” (p. 98).

The second half of the book focuses primarily on the institutionalization of Cofán politics and offers an ethnographic perspective on them negotiating bureaucracies of NGO-based activism. The following chapter outlines the history and practice of Cofán conservation, which arose as an indigenous response to Western conservation initiatives. Cepek, who recently published elsewhere (2011) a welcome critique of Arun Agrawal’s concept of environmentality (2005), here again illustrates the limitations of the common interpretation of indigenous environmentalism as an internalization of external “green” discourses and practices and shows Cofán environmentalism as emerging from their own cultural logic of human–nature relations. The final chapter looks at Quito-based education projects designed to create a next generation of leaders who will be able to wield the same cultural capital of “ethnic others” as Borman does, in the service of the Cofán nation. Cepek concludes the book with a meditation on the political implications of the Cofán aspirations to integrate indigenous culture, environmental conservation, scientific research, and an advantageous political-economic position and on the relevance of their case to indigenous politics and environmental conservation in the global South. Cepek’s ethnography makes a case for indigenous sovereignty and against top-down “fortress conservation,” and perhaps especially in the Amazonian context, his work enriches the existing body of ethnographic scholarship, produced by the

likes of Terry Turner (1995) and Beth Conklin and Laura Graham (1995), that debunks the still-common imaginaries of lowland Indians as “ecologically noble savages.” Cepek’s work shows the political possibilities of in-depth ethnography and captures what he calls a “utopian moment in global history” while making clear that “utopian” it is not necessarily unique. It is exciting and always refreshing to read an ethnography that, as Cepek puts it, uses empirical investigation of an existing liberatory project to help us conceptualize alternative futures of hope and possibility.

REFERENCES CITED

- Agrawal, Arun
2005 *Environmentality: Technologies of Government and the Making of Subjects*. New Ecologies for the Twenty-First Century series. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Cepek, Michael
2011 Foucault in the Forest: Questioning Environmentality in Amazonia. *American Ethnologist* 38(3):501–515.
- Conklin, Beth A., and Laura R. Graham
1995 The Shifting Middle Ground: Amazonian Indians and Ecology. *American Anthropologist* (N.S.) 97(4):695–710.
- Turner, Terence
1995 An Indigenous People’s Struggle for Socially Equitable and Ecologically Sustainable Production: The Kayapo Revolt against Extractivism. *Journal of Latin American Anthropology* 1(1):98–121.

Multi-Sited Ethnography: Problems and Possibilities in the Translocation of Research Methods

Simon Coleman and Pauline von Hellermann, eds. *Routledge Advances in Research Methods* series. New York: Routledge, Taylor, and Francis, 2010. 220 pp.

Helena Wulff

Stockholm University

It has been almost 30 years since George Marcus, in a chapter of *Writing Culture* (Clifford and Marcus 1986), launched the concept of “multisited ethnography.” In response to an acute awareness that social life increasingly and more frequently, and in new ways, was being enacted in units of several sites, multisited ethnography became a part of the anthropological fieldwork repertory. Since then the idea to conduct fieldwork in more than one place has been both celebrated and contested. Now we should know that the traditional one year in the field is still needed for the exploration of certain issues, but in order to make sense of relationships and institutions that are managed locally across a number of places, ethnographers often chose to do participant-observation in more than one of them. As always, it is the ethnographer who selects the unit of study and has to make the case for its boundaries.

In light of the impact of multisited ethnography, it comes as no surprise that it has generated an ample methods literature. This is where Simon Coleman’s and Pauline von Hellermann’s *Multi-Sited Ethnography* comes in (at least the third edited volume devoted to the topic). Drawing on a workshop held at the University of Sussex in 2005, the volume features 12 chapters. In their introduction, the editors set the tone by identifying the volume as “not meant to be read as a program but as an extended provocation” (p. 2). Coleman and von Hellerman discuss how Marcus in his *Annual Review of Anthropology* article from 1995 famously argued for “the following of ‘sites’ such as commodity chains/productive processes, migration networks, plots/narratives, metaphors, or circulations of ideas” and then added collaborating with informants (paraethnographers) and students as research strategies. Juxtaposing an opening chapter by Marcus with a concluding chapter by James Ferguson, the editors see these chapters as to some extent in critical dialogue. Marcus writes about how

multisited ethnography facilitates the development of new experimental forms of anthropological research, while Ferguson discusses the notion of novelty, not least in relation to methodological practices and the risk that what is assumed to be new may in fact not be all that novel. Before Marcus put a name on multisited ethnography, there were, for instance, migration anthropologists who were doing fieldwork in both sending and receiving societies for the same study. When it comes to Ferguson's wise call that "we, as a discipline, need to value a shifting plurality of methodological strategies, involving very different styles of fieldwork" (p. 204), wherein data categories such as governmental documents and web logs are integral to the research process, Marcus and Ferguson can be said to converge, even though they arrive at the same place from different positions.

A number of the contributors build their chapters around Marcus's idea "to follow." Kanwal Mand follows the biographies of Sikh women from London to Tanzania, and Ester Gallo follows Malayali female migrants working in Italy back to Kerala. In his fine chapter on Senegalese migrants in Italy and Senegal, Bruno Riccio shows that had he stayed put in Italy he would not have realized "the importance for them of living within transnational social fields" (p. 82). The pivotal point is, as Riccio argues, to take both transnational connections and local context into account.

Ingie Hovland focusses on the Norwegian Mission Society and its alleged renewal. Based in Norway, this non-governmental organization engages in mission activity and development work across the globe. A global system of

several sites was also what Dinah Rajak found in the mining company she studied, which connected boardrooms in London and Johannesburg with mineshafts of Rustenburg. Writing about HIV/AIDS in Uganda, Michael A. Whyte, Susan Reynolds Whyte, and Jenipher Twebaze provide an excellent example of collaboration between fieldworkers and informants in multisited practice. Also, Werner Krauss's research on the politics of the making of a coastal landscape in Northern Germany took place in many locales. Kathryn Tomlinson reports eloquently on the skepticism of her research on indigenous rights in Venezuela, both among Venezuelan researchers and her Ph.D. examiners in the United Kingdom. Drawing on his experience of teaching fieldwork methods with Marcus, Kaushik Sunder Rajan suggests that multisited ethnography is not as much a literalist methodology as a conceptual topology that opens up new spaces for experimentation.

As this volume shows, while multisited ethnography is routine practice, the debate goes on.

REFERENCES CITED

- Clifford, James, and George Marcus, eds.
1986 *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Marcus, George E.
1995 Ethnography in/of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-Sited Ethnography. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24:96–117.

Becoming Mapuche: Person and Ritual in Indigenous Chile

Magnus Course. *Interpretations of Culture in the New Millennium series*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2011. 224 pp.

Florencia Mallon

University of Wisconsin, Madison

Magnus Course's ethnography of the ambivalent relationship between the individual and sociality among rural Mapuche is based on his residence in the community of Conoco Budi in Piedra Alta, in the Lago Budi region of southern Chile, during which he learned Mapudungun, the Mapuche language, and about Mapuche culture from his hosts and other people in the region. In an in-depth exploration of the tensions involved in Mapuche conceptions of the individual as separate from, yet also constituted by, society, Course provides us with a deep reflection on the intellectual and cultural complexities involved in maintaining the delicate balance between the act of creating a "true person," or *che* in Mapudungun, and the danger of losing individual autonomy that is seen as inherent in social relations.

In critical dialogue with anthropology more broadly, as well as with current understandings of Mapuche culture

specifically, Course narrates rural Mapuche cultural practices and beliefs at the local level, taking seriously and at face value the explanations provided by the people themselves. As he explains in the introduction, in so doing he is reversing "the traditional Durkheimian anthropological paradigm" (p. 3) by not presuming the existence of a collectivity or society and then describing its influence on the individual person. Beginning instead from what he terms "Mapuche people's own logic," Course is able to analyze "Mapuche social aggregates, such as patrilineages for example, without endowing them with an a priori analytical naturalness and primacy not shared by the people with whom I worked" (p. 3).

Though I am not an anthropologist by training and therefore cannot comment in detail on the role of Durkheimian approaches in the field, Course's alternative approach strikes me as particularly productive because it takes seriously rural people's own experiences and explanations, using these as stepping stones for broader generalizations about culture. Key here is his rethinking

of sociality as such for the Mapuche. As he writes in his conclusion, among the Mapuche “people make society because it is through making society that they become people” (p. 163).

Course suggests that this vision of individual autonomy and personhood, in complex and uncomfortable relation with conceptions of society, is at odds with many of the current notions of Mapuche culture espoused by urban Mapuche leaders and intellectuals. Urban Mapuche intellectuals and political leaders, he explains, often see rural communities’ suspicion of the collectivity as politically “backward”; yet perhaps this suspicion is actually better explained through a complex cultural and intellectual analysis.

These are stimulating suggestions, yet from a historical perspective they need to be worked out more fully. Since the beginning of the 20th century, the conflict between the individual and the collective has been central in urban Mapuche politics. For example, Manuel Manquilef—who is abundantly cited in Course’s discussions of Mapuche rituals—believed strongly in Mapuche people’s right to individual self-realization, very much in keeping with the emphasis on the individual person discussed by Course for Piedra Alta. Manuel Aburto Panguilef, however, emphasized the communal and collective nature of Mapuche politics and practices, and in so doing he was among the first Mapuche leaders to entertain an alliance with the Left. Urban Mapuche leaders generally believed, however, that they needed to “educate” the “backward” rural communities, an idea based most likely in Mapuche society’s complex internal stratification.

Since the rise of the Centros Culturales Mapuches at the end of the 1970s in response to Pinochet’s privatization of Mapuche lands, followed by the emergence of the Consejo de Todas las Tierras at the beginning of the 1990s in conflictual interaction with postdictatorship economic policies and political negotiations, Mapuche political leaders have moved beyond earlier strategic alliances with leftist parties to an indigenous politics of autonomy that has evolved toward a broader notion of “Wallmapu,” a concept encompassing Mapuche historical territory on both sides of the Andes mountains. In the process, Mapuche organizations have entered into dialogue with indigenous political organizations and intellectuals in other parts of the Americas, as well as with ideas of community as conceptualized in indigenous politics more broadly. In such a context, political strategies that start from ideas of collective or communal mobilizations have become ever more present in Mapuche politics, even as these strategies are sometimes looked at with suspicion from the rural communities that have, since the early 1990s, borne the brunt of police and military repression.

Nevertheless, if we consider Course’s crucial ethnographic insight in broader temporal perspective, we move beyond individual self-realization as merely a nonindigenous concept. New insights on the age-old tension between individual and collective, at the center of human politics more broadly, emerge dramatically from a Mapuche history that is more respectful of the deep complexity of Mapuche rural and urban society, culture, and philosophy.

A Grammar of Nzadi [B865]: A Bantu Language of Democratic Republic of Congo

Thera Marie Crane, Larry M. Hyman, and Simon Nsielanga Tukumu. *UC Publications in Linguistics*, 147. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011. 312 pp.

Lee S. Bickmore
University at Albany

Every other year I teach a class on the structure of Bantu languages. For most of the languages assigned to students, I have cobbled together several sources, which, taken together, provide enough information for the students to make quality presentations. In a precious few cases, there is a single grammar that’s so clear and thorough that nothing beyond it is required. To that select group, I can add Thera Crane and colleagues’ *A Grammar of Nzadi [B865]: A Bantu Language of Democratic Republic of Congo*. To say Nzadi is a little-known Bantu language is putting it mildly. Beyond a couple of small word lists, there was no previous record of this language at all. The language is spoken by only several thousand people who reside largely in fishing communities along the north side of the Kasai River in the Bandundu Province of

the Democratic Republic of Congo. Neighboring languages to whom Nzadi is most closely related include Lwal and Dzing.

In addition to ten chapters detailing its grammatical structure, the grammar contains two appendices, three texts, and an English-to-Nzadi lexicon. Chapter 1 addresses the demographics of the speakers and the goals of the study. Chapter 2 deals with phonological matters. While the typical Bantu language has a canonical C_0V syllable structure, Nzadi differs in having undergone a diachronic process whereby many word-final vowels have been lost, thus introducing large numbers of coda consonants. It has a seven-vowel system with contrastive length. The consonant inventory includes labiovelar stops /kp/ and /gb/ as well as both labiodental and alveolar affricates. The relatively few segmental phonological processes are then discussed and exemplified. Those affecting vowels include

coalescence, shortening, centralization, and harmony. Processes affecting consonants include affrication and nasal deletion.

Chapter 3 discusses tone. The language exhibits a fair bit of tonal absorption and contour simplification. Some tonal processes are confined to certain morphemes (e.g., subject nouns, tense markers, and the genitive). Not only does the language have falling and rising tones, but due to the loss of word-final vowels that historically bore a tone, the language has a LHL (rising-falling) tone as well. However, what is particularly striking is that this double-contour tone can be borne by not only long vowels but short vowels as well—e.g., *dzi* “eye” (certainly rare cross-linguistically).

Chapter 4 discusses the nominal morphology. Nzadi is shown to be a very interesting case of a language wherein the typical Bantu class distinctions have become somewhat eroded. Singular markers include {o-, i- e-, N-}, and plurals {e-, a-, N-}, with six productive combinations. Chapter 5 deals with noun phrases. There it is shown that we do not find in Nzadi the typical nominal class agreement seen in many Bantu languages. For instance, whereas a third-person subject (or object) pronoun will normally differ by class, in Nzadi only a four-way distinction is made: number (singular vs. plural) and human versus nonhuman. For demonstratives, there is only a three-way distinction: nonhuman versus singular human versus plural human. The only trace of full-class agreement that remains is within associative (genitive) constructions.

Chapters 6 and 7 address the structure of verbs and their TAM distinctions. The majority of verb stems are monosyllabic, having the shape CV(V)(C). Some are bisyllabic, and many of those end in an identifiable (mostly frozen) Bantu suffixal extension (e.g., -sa, -ul, -uk, -an). What is striking

from the perspective of a typical Bantu language is that the verb is not especially agglutinative. It does not take affixes that express TAM, subject agreement, or object agreement. Rather, these are expressed analytically as distinct words. While the well-described TAM system is rich and complex, it differs from a large number of Bantu systems in not making obligatory distinctions between degrees of past time. There are seven basic TAM prefixes (one null), the presence of each having a different tonal effect on the verb stem. In some cases, the base tone melody is replaced by a fixed one (usually HL), and in some others, the various base tones are individually altered.

Chapters 8–10 provide an excellent overview of the sentential syntax. This includes discussions of transitive clauses, adjuncts, negation, comparatives, coordination, subordination, relative clauses, and interrogatives. In each case, multiple, fully glossed examples are given as illustrations of the various phenomena.

The first appendix provides an overview of the Nzadi people and their history and culture. The second one examines the sound correspondences between Proto Bantu and Nzadi. Finally, the book concludes with a full transcription of three Nzadi texts and an English–Nzadi lexicon of just over 1,000 words.

A Grammar of Nzadi makes a truly outstanding contribution to the still-too-small but growing collection of full Bantu grammars. As such, it provides the reader with the ability not only to make “surgical strikes” into some area of particular interest (e.g., the tonology of genitives or NP coordination) but also to see these in a larger context and explore how they may connect with other parts of the language. The authors have done the field a great service, and my Bantu language structure students next year will be among the many beneficiaries.

The Harkis: The Wound That Never Heals

Vincent Crapanzano. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011. 248 pp.

Michel Naepels

École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales

Vincent Crapanzano’s book analyzes the exclusion experience of the Harkis, the 260,000 Algerian auxiliary troops that took sides with the French government during the Algerian war (1954–1962). It is known that a number of these soldiers were among the resolute perpetrators of acts of torture committed by the French army. At the time of the signature of the independence treaty, most Harkis were sent back to their villages, where a large number of them (60,000–100,000) were tortured and killed by the villagers. A likely equivalent number of Harkis succeeded in getting to France where they were gathered into camps and later

used as labor for a reforestation program in isolated villages in the South of France, as well as for industries around the big cities of northern France.

The major strength of the book lies in the way Crapanzano makes the reader perceive the subjective effects of a dynamic characterized by the “magnitude of the change of their [the Harkis’] situation” (p. 29) and “dramatic loss of their future” (p. 114). A key feature of the approach underlines the necessity to analyze the Harkis’ historical consciousness. Crapanzano’s argument is that the Harkis constitute a “mnemonic community” (Cappelletto 2003). To support this, he relies at the same time on the best historic and ethnological works concerning the event, on literary texts, and on fieldwork led in France during several years.

The bulk of Crapanzano's interlocutors is made up of some of the more involved activists of the politicization of the Harki cause, and in the process several beautiful individual portraits are presented.

One key point to note is that the Harki community itself is woven around a paradoxical experience. On the one hand, the Algerian history of the Harkis forms an absent or repressed memory, a dead past, which ignores the responsibility in their choice to become an auxiliary force as well as their own involvement in perpetuation of the situation. On the other hand, we are presented with the memory of the absolutely terrible conditions met upon arrival in France and the Harkis' confrontation with French racism. Although painful, this new reality is easier for them to accept than the violent past. Silence appears then to the Harkis to be a vital strategy and the last remaining part of their masculinity. In the words of one of Crapanzano's interlocutors: "I don't want my children to know what I can't forget" (p. 83). This choice of silence becomes distressing for a younger generation, who in turn focus their rage on their current situation. It is mainly within this group of direct descendants that the transition occurs from individual anger to a collective mobilization. More than the construction of the memory of singular events, a narrative of betrayal and abandonment of the Harkis by France prevails. The description that Crapanzano offers of Harki historical consciousness leans on a rather remarkable reflection on his engagement with the subject and the ambivalent impressions he feels vis-à-vis the Harki "politicized litany" (p. 129).

I perceive two necessary extensions of the author's analysis. First, regarding the Algerian War, Crapanzano indicates the importance of longtime family and village feuds and their manipulation by the French army to recruit auxiliary troops. This topic definitely warrants further fieldwork in Algeria, in the footprints of Camille Lacoste-Dujardin (1997), who described the role of the academic anthropologist Jean Servier in the manipulation of local conflicts to the advantage of the French army. The link between colonial racist narratives, anthropological insights or research, and military operations is part of the long history of colonization. Some

of the more recent extensions of this synergy can be seen in the Human Terrain System developed by the U.S. Army in Iraq and Afghanistan.

The second amendment concerns the contemporary period. Focused on activists, the book regrettably leaves in the shadows those who remained strangers to the Harki mobilization, as the longstanding forms of urban and labor integration in France. In addition, Crapanzano could have focused on Harki's descendants who reject or ignore this collective identity by their partial integration in the more general category of the "Beurs," young Frenchmen of north-African origin, as well as by their possible rejection of their history. It is 50 years after the end of the war, and only now can one begin to understand the effects of the contingent transmission of the psychic wound to Harkis' grandchildren. Being part of a collective identity that confirms their marginality and victimization is a subjective choice. The choice of integration appears increasingly as an alternative to Harki militancy in French society, where they are outnumbered by other descendants of migrants of Algerian origin and schooled in a noncommunity system. As Crapanzano suggests, Harki identity might gradually become an optional justification more than a community membership.

Crapanzano's final reflections on justice, revenge, and forgiveness are part of his current broader discussion on emotions, temporal trajectories of feelings and trauma, hope, and memory, making one look forward to the future extensions of this stimulating work.

REFERENCES CITED

- Cappelletto, Francesca
2003 Long-Term Memory of Extreme Events: From Autobiography to History. *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 9(2):241–260.
- Lacoste-Dujardin, Camille
1997 *Opération "Oiseau Bleu": Des Kabyles, des ethnologues, et la guerre en Algérie [Operation "Blue Bird": On Kabyle people, social anthropologists, and the war in Algeria]*. Paris: La Découverte.

Maya and Catholic Cultures in Crisis

John D. Early. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2012. 512 pp.

John M. Watanabe
Dartmouth College

John D. Early brings over half a century of experience as anthropologist, demographer, and former Jesuit priest to this study of the religious reformulation of Maya and Catholic worldviews in highland Guatemala and Chiapas since the mid-20th century. *Maya and Catholic Cultures in Crisis* addresses the respective crises and responses of Maya

and Catholicism relative to an increasingly secular, globally articulated, market-driven world. For Maya, Early tells an anthropologically familiar tale of indigenous subsistence farmers immersed in local worlds of immanent powers and ritual covenants related to cycles of birth, maturation, death, and regeneration brought to crisis by loss of Maya lands and local population pressure that belie accepted powers and practices. For Catholics, he relates the story of a 20th-century institution still largely dedicated to the sacraments

and personal salvation privileged by the 16th-century Council of Trent's response to famine, plague, the spread of Islam and the Reformation, and (unmentioned by Early) the transoceanic expansion of Europe. The modern crisis of conscience over this "Tridentine" worldview led to the Second Vatican Council (1962–1965) and the possibility of a more "liberationist" pursuit of God through loving as oneself the others God has created, especially the poor.

For Early, these parallel stories converge as Maya and Catholicism come to seek redemption through each other, with problematic results. Contending liberationist commitments to social justice and Tridentine claims to orthodoxy confront pragmatically minded Maya, Marxist revolutionaries, and challenges to church authority from within and without. Maya catechists' use of biblical reflection to guide their actions and systematize the moral injustices they suffer make especially younger catechists increasingly impatient for change, some enough to join guerrilla insurgencies in Guatemala and Chiapas that bring down state repression on all, others enough to drift from the church (or become Catholic charismatics, if not evangelicals), and even some faithful to wonder how to "inculturate" Catholicism by articulating an "Indian theology" that finds Christ within their own cultures, not simply in the historical Jesus or the Bible as a book of literal, revealed truths.

Early's book is wide ranging, well informed, and even-handed (but never afraid to express a view, as when he rejects any moral justification for priests taking up revolutionary arms in Guatemala). In each regard, however, opportunities are lost. Despite detailed compilation of examples from highland Chiapas, the Lacandón lowlands, Santiago Atitlán, El Quiché, and the Ixcán in Guatemala, the book neglects Maya Catholicism in Yucatán without explaining why. Is it because of Yucatán's lack of a liberationist bishop like Samuel Ruiz in Chiapas or foreign Catholic missionaries as in Guatemala; its single Maya language crosscutting ethnic, class, and geographic divides from the Caste War and the Mexican Revolution; or the particular demands of commercial *henequen* (twine fiber) production on Maya land and labor? Similarly, despite Early's careful detailing of his own and others' work in highland Maya communities, he forgets that Max Weber

always historically grounded as best he could ideal types such as worldviews that define seeing the world in certain ways but also from particular places at specific times, important in periods of rapid change. In contrast, Early anthologizes his case studies of encounters between Maya catechists and Catholic pastoral workers without systematically comparing why certain church efforts and Maya responses occur where and when they do. This can lead readers unfamiliar with Maya ethnography and recent Chiapas and Guatemalan history to take his compilation as comprehensive and generalize his chosen accounts too quickly to all Maya or Catholic religionists.

Ultimately, the story Early's cases tell is essentially biblical in the sense he defines the Bible as a "manual of moral teachings" (p. 436) centered on repeated cycles of covenants with God; moral transgression; God's judgment, punishment, and redemption; then renewed covenants that beget further trials. Far from utopian, the Bible for Early teaches about striving for God by enacting one's own moral worthiness. Consequently, I found this book less about Maya and Catholic worldviews than about the dilemmas of being Catholic, Maya or otherwise, in a multicentered moral universe in which living one's faith across cultural differences inevitably challenges church orthodoxies and personal convictions. Early reminds us that the religious struggle for other souls always calls into question one's own.

As such, this book sets itself no small task, heartfelt in intent and commendable in its attention to both Maya catechists and the Catholic Church, but it remains more about Maya Catholics and Catholic pastoral workers than about Maya and Catholic worldviews. While speaking to issues central to the anthropology of religion—particularly religious conversion and practice across the divide between this-worldly local religions and otherworldly universal ones that necessarily raise Weberian questions about inner faith and institutional authority in an individuated modern world that is ironically ever more ready for personal experience of the transcendent—Early could have articulated these themes more explicitly and thus strengthened the moral of the story he tells.

Mobilizing Bolivia's Displaced: Indigenous Politics and the Struggle over Land

Nicole Fabricant. *New Directions in Indigenous Studies* series. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012. 280 pp.

Miriam Shakow

The College of New Jersey

Bolivia is marked by extreme economic inequality, and the distribution of agricultural land reflects this in-

equality. In this fine-grained ethnography of a social movement, Nicole Fabricant examines the organizing strategies, successes, and failures of Bolivia's Landless Movement, the *Movimiento Sin Tierra* (MST), which formed to remedy the inequality of land ownership and

consequent political and social marginalization of many Bolivians.

Narrating her travels between communities occupying corners of large plantations, MST public protests, and right-wing elite political demonstrations, the author traces how MST members have forged a vibrant movement despite differences in regional origin and ethnic self-identification. Fabricant demonstrates the paradoxes MST members encounter when attempting to negotiate with, and ultimately, confront the “friendly” government of Evo Morales, which proclaims itself to be carrying out the very structural redistribution of wealth and power in the name of indigenous power and socialism that the MST demands but which is in fact deeply constrained by Bolivia’s marginality in the global economy and weakness relative to right-wing elites. Fabricant also frames her study through the important issue of resource extraction and the resource curse, looking at how the global boom in world soybean prices has played out in Bolivia.

In chapter 1, Fabricant traces MST members’ origins throughout Bolivia and the diverse set of organizing models they offer the movement, stymying traditional anthropological accounts of Bolivia that depict it as a wholly Andean country or as bifurcated between western highlands and eastern lowlands. Highlanders and lowlanders found common ground, despite different cultural backgrounds, in shared narratives of colonial and neocolonial dispossession of land, slave labor, and racist marginalization. Colonial and postcolonial rebellions in both highlands and lowlands also served as inspiration for political action. These inspirations helped sustain MST members during their land occupations, as they faced down elite landowner violence despite massacres and ever-present danger.

Chapter 2 details the political and economic geography of the Bolivian Department of Santa Cruz, in which right-wing elites’ wealth is largely based on extensive landholdings and indentured, slave-like labor. As soy has replaced cotton, sugar, and ranching as a lucrative agribusiness crop, small-scale farmers have been increasingly marginalized. The MST has opposed the dispossession of land from peasant farmers and landless laborers and pushed the Bolivian government to support organic, smallholder agriculture following many decades of government subsidies and political support for large landowners.

Chapter 3 narrates how MST adopted indigenous rights language as indigenous organizations’ stature rose around the world and in Bolivia during the 1990s. MST activists

commonly spoke indigenous languages but followed heterogeneous traditions. They found in the indigenous *ayllu*—an agricultural community form based in the western Bolivian highlands around kinship ties and common management of land—an inspiration for organizing their new communities on occupied land. The example of the *ayllu* provided a supremely flexible model, and MST activists defined the *ayllu* in various ways, depending on political needs. From forging communal identity to combatting theft within communities, confronting racist violence from upper-class Bolivians, and promoting land reform, the *ayllu* offered a malleable model of (idealized) indigenous community. The *ayllu* proved problematic, however, as an inspiration for punishing suspected criminals within MST communities and for pursuing gender equality.

Chapter 4 narrates MST leaders’ pursuit of food sovereignty, centering on communal ownership of land, organic agricultural production, and government support for a shift from a national economy based on industrial resource extraction to a smallholder-based economy. Following the Morales’ government’s foot dragging, however, the MST began political protests, detailed in chapter 5. The movement was eventually successful in securing passage of new agrarian reform that would support smallholder agriculture in the spirit of food sovereignty. Yet, as Fabricant notes in chapter 6 and her conclusion, legal change is not enough. Agribusiness elites’ opposition and Bolivia’s dependent position in the global economy limited the government’s room to enact structural change. Indeed, one of the main ideas of the book is that, despite the Morales government’s attempt to form a “social movement state,” strong pressure from reactionary elites and the limitations of an economic model based on resource extraction led the Morales government to use violence and delay tactics to stymie demands for substantive redistribution of power and wealth in Bolivia.

This book could have been more useful for introductory undergraduate courses if its theoretical exegesis had been pared down a little and theoretical language simplified. Nevertheless, this book would be excellent in advanced undergraduate courses. Overall, *Mobilizing Bolivia’s Displaced* provides a nuanced and ethnographically rich account of a social movement attempting to change a deeply exclusionary society. Fabricant offers a tempered pessimism regarding the possibility that “new left” governments can and will significantly redistribute wealth to the indigenous and poor in the face of the ultimately illusory economic model based upon natural resource extraction.

Debating Authenticity: Concepts of Modernity in Anthropological Perspective

Thomas Fillitz and A. Jamie Saris, eds. New York: Berghahn, 2012. 276 pp.

Richard Handler
University of Virginia

This collection of essays, stemming from a 2006 conference at the University of Vienna, grapples with the contradictions at the heart of the concept of authenticity and those that inform anthropology's concerns with it. In modern ideology, authenticity indicates the true essence of a social or material entity, but modern knowledge, with its methods of description and analysis, almost by definition deconstructs (or, in the anthropological variant, relativizes) authenticity in every attempt it makes to discover it.

The problem is particularly acute in anthropology because our discipline has been predicated on the work of describing, interpreting, objectifying, and "salvaging" cultures as pristine objects—pristine in their absolute difference from the culture of anthropology itself. But such work brings us into conversation with those cultures and hence changes them, and us, in the process. And anthropologists are hardly the only ones interested in making contact with "the real thing." Contemporary capitalism, with its restless energy and apparently unlimited reach, seems intent on objectifying all aspects of experience and marketing them as authentic products to be consumed, thereby destroying the authenticity consumers seek, which creates new marketing opportunities for those who sell it and new desires for purchasers.

The first two essays of the volume take opposite positions with regard to authenticity. A. Jamie Saris uses a subtle reading of Edward Sapir's 1924 essay on genuine and spurious culture to retrieve a definition of *authenticity* he thinks can be useful. Saris recognizes the endless possibilities for mechanical (and, now, digital) reproduction and for the creation of tradition that modernity affords. For him, authenticity as a concept can be used to discriminate between situations in which local people have some measure of control over those processes and those in which they don't. In Saris's treatment, authenticity cannot be analyzed without attention to the political economy of taste making.

Rajko Muršič rejects authenticity as a useful analytic concept, arguing that the term is hopelessly entangled in exclusionary (racist, nationalist) politics. Yet he is at some pains to analyze the relationship between performers and audiences in popular music. Musicians perform authenticity, and both they and their fans believe that performance is by definition fake. Still, when the music succeeds, audiences and performers achieve a kind of communion in which they

experience "ecstasy and catharsis" (p. 54). But "stardom," defined as the ability to provoke such ecstatic fan experiences, is often built on the kinds of essentialized identities that Muršič rejected at the outset.

Taken together, these two opening essays are typical of the volume as a whole (which contains 12 chapters in addition to the editors' introduction). The contributors recognize the difficulties of salvaging authenticity as a useful concept, yet for particular ethnographic cases, they describe how the term and the idea can be used by insiders and outsiders alike to negotiate cultural transactions.

For example, Lawrence Taylor examines "the search for authentic wilderness" (p. 64) in Arizona's Sonoran Desert, showing that environmentalists and ranchers, transformed into sometimes bitter antagonists by the Endangered Species Act, nonetheless share similar ideas about the "moral geography" (p. 73) that the desert offers, a landscape in which "the search for authenticity . . . conjoins a bruising contact with divinity, romantic nationalism and the postmodern quest for therapy" (p. 76).

Inger Sjørsvlev describes a tour she led to introduce "Danish college teachers of religion" to "*Candomblé* and its derivatives" (p. 117). Both she and her charges judged their experiences in "*Candomblé* houses in the north-eastern State of Bahia" to feel more authentic than "a most impressive and skilful presentation" of dancing and ritual mounted by "traditionalists" who were "mainly white middle-class people . . . of São Paulo" (p. 117). Not wanting to distinguish the two situations in terms of authenticity, Sjørsvlev focuses on types of sociality and attitudes toward fetish objects. In the São Paulo performance, "the social choreography was clumsy," and it relied on the show's director. In the Bahian rituals, "there had been a feeling . . . of organic sociality" (p. 119). Sjørsvlev concludes with the suggestion that the kind of "trust in social relations" and "rootedness" that can emerge from ritual are "probably essential, no matter which part of the world we deal with and whether people use the term authenticity or not" (pp. 124–125).

Examining the experiences of the French colonial administrator Henri Gaden in West Africa, Roy Dille shows that the authentic knowledge and experiences of one generation of colonial officials can be devalued by their successors. The point is that judgments about authenticity are made by historically specific actors in politically specific contexts. Authentic today, inauthentic tomorrow, we might say. For the most part, these essays make similar points about the necessity of situating both actors' and analysts' uses of the

concept of authenticity in the social worlds in which they deploy them. No sweeping definitions are possible. In this, *Debating Authenticity* is an authentic representation of the state of play in contemporary anthropology.

REFERENCE CITED

Sapir, Edward

1924 Culture, Genuine and Spurious. *American Journal of Sociology* 29(4):401–429.

Producing Bollywood: Inside the Contemporary Hindi Film Industry

Tejaswini Ganti. Durham: Duke University Press, 2012. 440 pp.

Sanjukta Dasgupta

University of Calcutta

Tejaswini Ganti's *Producing Bollywood* provides commendable structured insights into the making of Bollywood films. Facts, data, dates, and statistics are juxtaposed with impressions, conversations, and interviews with filmmakers, actors, producers, distributors, and film critics. The nine chapters in the book address crucial parameters that define the road map of the now internationally recognized Bollywood film industry. In fact, Ganti identifies the use of the signifier *industry* to describe the production of Bollywood films as a historically significant tour de force. Recognized as an industry, Bollywood—the Bombay-based Hindi film industry—extended the dimensions of its marketing ambitions, giving it a global presence while not ignoring the local domestic market. As a result, the Bollywood film industry has become the model and envy of the Indian regional cinema. Indian regional cinema is often regarded as being more daring, creative, and nonconformist. However, its restricted market base—due to the use of a regional or state language, as opposed to the Hindi that is recognized as the national language and used in Bollywood films—is one of the chief reasons for the limited market and distributorship of regional language cinema.

Ganti's book is about filmmaking and makers, and not about films per se, so there is hardly any content analyses of specific films, as close reading of film content is not quite germane to the primary intention of the book. The introduction makes some incisive observations about the paradigm shifts in targets and trade practices and emphasizes the systemic prioritization of middle-class value systems and transitions therein, ranging from the conservative to the modern. Ganti describes this as the concerted attempt at gentrification of the Hindi film industry, which would soon be known to the world as Bollywood. This metaphor of gentrification ushered in three crucial paradigm shifts from the mid-1990s. First, instead of the working class and the subalterns, the upwardly mobile elite classes became the integral part of film narratives. Second, a more sophisticated plethora of trained, skilled, affluent, and educated classes seemed to have taken

over the reins of filmmaking. Also to be noted is the fact that circulation and distribution now seemed to be aimed toward overseas markets. Third, Ganti observes that, along with gentrification, the corporatization of the film industry led to the integration of the process of production, distribution, and exhibition in a more highly skilled professional manner since 2000. In the earlier decades, such aspects of filmmaking were slipshod, lacking in organized initiatives and relying on subjective responses.

Ganti's book is divided into three parts. Part 1 deals with the "Social Status of Films and Filmmakers." Part 2 explores the practices and processes of film production, focusing on the uncertainties, risks, and work culture of the industry. Part 3 deals with "Discourses and Practices of Audience-Making." This is an interesting insight into the audience imaginaries that compel the film narratives and also subtly direct audience expectation. The commercially successful Bollywood film formula that includes raunchy dances popularly known as item numbers, violence, comic sequences, familial conflicts, and song-and-dance sequences packaged as "masala movies" attracts eyeballs, according to young filmmakers, though many of them prefer alternative narratives, which too have become Bollywood blockbusters. Yet compulsions linger, such as the use of songs in films, considered to be indispensable for the success of a Hindi film. Similarly, one might refer to the gender stereotypes that Hindi films reiterate and even so-called women-centric films such as *Heroine* (2012), *Kahaani* (2011), or *The Dirty Picture* (2012) essentially promote the helplessness and vulnerability of even strong and talented women. In terms of social paradigms, producers and filmmakers seem to collude in consolidating gender stereotypes and gender inequality, even in such slick, cosmopolitan productions.

Ganti has researched her focus area very well, but she could have emphasized that, despite the formulaic compulsions of the Hindi film industry as part of the larger entertainment industry intent on profit, Bollywood productions have enabled filmmakers to experiment with forms, themes, scripts, and special effects, often successfully deconstructing stereotypes. Ganti's book is a commendable pioneering initiative. It will be useful for students, researchers, and those

interested in South Asian film studies and can be read along with her earlier book *Bollywood: A Guidebook to Popular Hindi Cinema* (2004).

REFERENCES CITED

Bhandarkar, Madhur, dir

2012 *Heroine*. 150 min. Ronnie Screwvala, Madhur Bhandarkar, and Siddharth Roy Kapur, producers. Mumbai, India: UTV Motion Pictures.

Ganti, Tejaswini

2004 *Bollywood: A Guidebook to Popular Hindi Cinema*. Routledge Film Guidebooks series. New York: Routledge.

Ghosh, Sujoy, dir.

2012 *Kahaani*. 122 min. Sujoy Ghosh and Kushal Kantilal Gada, producers. Mumbai, India: Viacom 18 Motion Pictures.

Luthria, Milan, dir.

2011 *The Dirty Picture*. 144 min. Ekta Kapoor and Shobha Kapoor, producers. Mumbai, India: ALT Entertainment and Balaji Motion Pictures.

Indigenous Peoples and Archaeology in Latin America

Cristóbal Gnecco and Patricia Ayala, eds. *Archaeology and Indigenous Peoples series*. Walnut Creek: Left Coast, 2011. 352 pp.

K. Anne Pyburn

Indiana University

Indigenous Peoples and Archaeology in Latin America is an important book for several reasons. First, it provides a good overview of the evolving relationships between indigenous people and archaeology in Latin America, especially South America. Second, the chapters cover so many fundamental issues that the book offers an excellent general introduction to the topic. Third, the quality of the projects described is outstanding, and the range of strategies and ideas included is bound to be useful for archaeologists working anywhere. And, finally, this edited volume marks a coming of age for the field of archaeology, which has finally progressed to a self-conscious social science that not only draws theory from other disciplines but also makes theoretical contributions of its own.

In their introduction, editors Cristóbal Gnecco and Patricia Ayala lay out the controversies as they see them: the ongoing effects of colonialism that archaeology has bolstered and replicated, the use of archaeology to essentialize indigenous people, and the violence of exoticism especially when promoted for tourism, nationalism, and capitalism. They discuss the ways in which archaeological reconstructions have contributed to a rupture between the past and the present, which undermines land claims and political sovereignty of living people and connects ancestral triumphs not with descendant communities but with the power of modern nation-states.

Alejandro Haber's poetic introduction traces the competing realities of indigenous people and archaeologists in Argentina, making an important distinction between "peasants" and "indigenous people" to foreground the progression of capitalism. Beginning the first section, which is concerned with the history of archaeology, Federico Navarrete traces the expropriation of the indigenous past in Mexico in support of a nationalist agenda that harms indigenous people

and places responsibility for "heritage management" in the hands of the state. Cristóbal Gnecco considers how colonial experience in Colombia is woven into the fabric of indigenous reality to a degree that can make its effects invisible and how the distinction between democratization and appropriation of knowledge bears careful scrutiny. Alexander Herrera argues that archaeology in Peru has distanced indigenous people from their ancestry by privileging questions of foreign academics, whose minor concessions to local interests have yet to seriously impact research practices.

Dante Angelo's Bolivian perspective locates the origins of contemporary concern with indigenous rights, multiculturalism, identity politics, and economic development in a suspiciously globalized ethic. Patricia Ayala addresses the archaeologists' construction of a cultural "other" and how Chilean Atacameños reacted to the museumification of their ancestors by struggling to exert some degree of control. Striking an opposing view, Diego Salazar believes the Chilean community of Conchi values the contribution of archaeology to understanding their past and that mutual accommodation has been made with the local mining industry.

Two chapters address legislation's impact on heritage (Cornejo, Endere et al.), and the final section of the book is a series of fascinating case studies. Fernando Aguilar exposes the strange manner in which Otomí people disappeared from Mexican history and describes the refreshingly positive role of archaeology in their vindication. Wilhelm Londoño, riffing on Faust, considers the interplay among differently motivated essentialisms in the development of Colombian cultural policy. Just as anthropologists abandon the concept of authentic culture, indigenous peoples in Colombia (and elsewhere) have begun to derive some benefits from strategic essentialism, however temporary. Luis Guillermo Vasco, also working in Colombia, describes an interesting, and important, negotiation between indigenous and archaeological experts. In this case, the Guambiano actually worked

out a pottery typology for archaeological materials based on their cultural expertise, which the archaeologists then supplemented with additional criteria. Archaeologists have begun to consider the possibility of collaborative research design, but to my knowledge this is the first such experiment in the democratization of knowledge production at the level of artifact classification that goes beyond “ethnoarchaeology.” Hugo Benavides eloquently explains that it is neither the conservatism of Ecuadoran archaeology nor the inauthenticity of indigenous claims that needs critique but, rather, the mutually constitutive relationship between the two. Francisco García considers heritage tourism in Bolivia; Juana Carinao provides an indigenous perspective on the significance of material culture; Flavia Moi and Walter Morales show how the Brazilian Paresi use archaeology as a source of empowerment.

The most powerful chapter is by Lesley Green, David Green, and Eduardo Nevis, who worked with Brazilian Palikur speakers. The authors trace the evolution of their research design as they became more aligned with the local community and show how their scholarly interests interdigitated with their growing ethnographic comprehension to produce new knowledge (for them and the Palikur) and a new paradigm for preservation. The chapter by Denise Gomes, also Brazilian, is almost a counterpoint to Green and colleagues; she presents a scenario in which she be-

comes progressively more sensitive to indigenous interests but maintains her original commitment to a traditional archaeological paradigm.

To say this book is important is not to say that it is perfect. While condemning archaeologists for essentializing indigenous people, most authors flagrantly essentialize archaeologists. This is a bit ironic because all the authors are themselves archaeologists. A little more nuance in the ethnography of us would likely bring forth the changes so ardently enjoined more rapidly than the finger pointing and breast beating. Unfortunately, the book is riddled with grammatical errors and poorly translated phrases that don’t actually mean anything in English. I have mixed feelings about this because to be forced to publish in English (to achieve a wide readership) is certainly politically irritating, so the use of weird sentence structure is possibly a sort of resistance. Nevertheless, there were several places where I think a really important thought was lost, though of course I cannot be sure . . .

In the closing essay, Marcelo Fernández-Osco gives a brilliant explication of the Bolivian Aymara concept of time. In this ethos, nothing is irreversible—the past is alive in the present but can always be fixed as part of an interconnected whole.

The heritage of archaeology being what it is, I certainly hope the Aymara are correct.

Ancestral Appetites: Food in Prehistory

Kristen J. Gremillion. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011. 196 pp.

William Pestle
University of Miami

In *Ancestral Appetites: Food in Prehistory*, Kristen Gremillion makes the claim that the food choices of human societies, past and present, are the complex product of intertwined processes of biological evolution, historical process, cultural transmission, and culinary innovation. From her very first lines, the author reminds readers that “every meal we eat tells an evolutionary tale . . . That hot dog you ate for lunch has a surprisingly rich history” (p. 1). Untangling the biological, historical, and cultural ingredients of that hot dog is the challenge taken up by Gremillion and one that is dealt with deftly.

Throughout the work, the reader is presented with clear examples, some well known and others less so, of how humanity’s vertebrate, mammalian, and primate ancestries; historical accident; the retention and transmission of foodways; and our species’ unique capability to rapidly adapt and invent have interacted with one another to produce the

diversity of prehistoric and historic food systems observed in the archaeological record. It is this broadly inclusive archaeological and anthropological approach to the topics of food acquisition, processing, and consumption that is this work’s greatest strength and that gives it its broad appeal. The author’s comfort with a wide variety of biological (botanical and zoological), anthropological, and archaeological evidence is apparent, and her ready grasp of the material allows the work to flow fluidly.

While brief (with a proper text of just over 150 pages), *Ancestral Appetites* nonetheless addresses a number of the major issues in the archaeology and prehistory of human food, including the following: the composition of ancient hominin diets, the practice of food foraging, the origins of food production and intensification, the diversity of responses to both shortage and abundance, the ramifications of cultural contact, and the environmental consequences of the human food quest. In each chapter, the discussion of the broader issue(s) at hand is augmented substantially by the inclusion of case studies and the presentation of areas of past and present

debate (e.g., the role of USOs [underground storage organs, e.g., roots and tubers] in early hominin diet, the pace and tempo of the spread of agriculture, and the contentious issue of human–environment interaction in insular settings). The author is to be commended for her even-handed treatment of these topics of debate, for her resistance to accept one-size-fits-all explanations, and also for presenting case studies and regional examples that are not as widely known as some of those from “core” archaeological regions. For instance, in the chapter on cultural contact, the presentation of data on the “Columbian Exchange” as experienced in the protohistoric period of the U.S. southeast is a welcome addition to the perspectives provided by better-known examples from Neolithic Europe and the Roman Empire. That certain regions or time periods are un- or underrepresented (e.g., SE Asia, Sub-Saharan Africa, many portions of South America, the northwest coast of the United States and Canada) represents one of the few weaknesses of the work. Alas, in such a brief presentation, to expect the author to deal with all examples through time and space would be unreasonable.

While experts in the archaeology of the food would likely find this work too general for their needs, for a student audience (particularly undergraduate or early postgraduate), the tone and level of detail would be most appropriate. As such, *Ancestral Appetites* fits comfortably beside other recent works on the evolution of human foods and foodways such as

Richard Wrangham’s *Catching Fire* (2009) or Martin Jones’s *Feast* (2008). Those desiring more detail on the broad and complex topic of the prehistory and history of human food could turn instead to any of the several excellent recent edited works on the topic (such as Hublin and Richards 2009, Twiss 2007, or Ungar 2006).

REFERENCES CITED

- Hublin, Jean-Jacques, and Michael P. Richards, eds.
2009 *The Evolution of Hominin Diets: Integrating Approaches to the Study of Palaeolithic Subsistence*. Vertebrate Paleobiology and Paleoanthropology series. New York: Springer.
- Jones, Martin
2008 *Feast: Why Humans Share Food*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Twiss, Katheryn C., ed.
2007 *The Archaeology of Food and Identity*. Occasional Paper No. 34. Carbondale: Center for Archaeological Investigations, Southern Illinois University Carbondale.
- Ungar, Peter S., ed.
2006 *Evolution of the Human Diet: The Known, the Unknown, and the Unknowable*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wrangham, Richard
2009 *Catching Fire: How Cooking Made Us Human*. New York: Basic.

Places of Pain: Forced Displacement, Popular Memory and Trans-Local Identities in Bosnian War-Torn Communities

Hariz Halilovich. *Space and Place*, 10. New York: Berghahn, 2013. 288 pp.

Sarah Wagner

George Washington University

In his study of Bosnia and Herzegovina’s legacy of forced migration, Hariz Halilovich takes us on a powerful, at times heartwrenching, journey into the lives, memories, and communities of the war’s displaced. The book sets out a challenging task from its very first page: to tease out the relationships among forced migration, popular memory, and—what will be a key concept throughout the study—translocal identity. In uncovering the interconnections among these phenomena, the chapters circumnavigate the globe, moving in and among Bosnian diaspora communities in places as distant as Melbourne, Australia, and St. Louis, Missouri, as well as returning periodically to the sites of wartime violence and their contested memory (Podrinje, Prijedor, Sarajevo, Mostar) and to the homes of those who have decided to

return. The multisitedness of the ethnography could well be dizzying in this tacking to and fro, but Halilovich is an excellent steward, having structured his study to move logically though the themes arising from these different sets of people and localities.

Places of Pain has its own particular origin—in an ethnographer’s deep sensitivity and intellectual commitment to understanding how identities change and lives persist in the wake of war’s destruction. That he himself was exiled by the war grants privileged insight but does not overwhelm the text with reflexivity; rather, Halilovich honors his informants and their experiences by carefully, subtly interlacing his social analysis with his self-ascribed “cultural insider,” individual perspective. The rewards of this sensibility are soon obvious: the chapters are full of lives, scarred and resilient, laid bare for our understanding by survivors who have put their trust in the author.

Narrative analysis, the backbone of his ethnography, lays the foundation for Halilovich's central theoretical contribution—that is, illustrating the mutually constituting elements of popular memory (here, he draws heavily on the Foucauldian definition of popular memory as “fragmented collective knowledge”) and translocal identity. For Halilovich, translocalism reorients the diasporic experience beyond—from above and below, as he often underscores—the more facile framing of transnationalism; identity and the social bonds that maintain it are inextricably bound to a shared sense of place. However damaged by war, that sense of place endures in the Bosnian (and former Yugoslavian) notion of *zavičaj*, literally translated as “local homeland.” It travels with the displaced, uniting people with landscapes; emphasizing local dialects, cultural practices, and social networks; and evoking “deep feelings of belonging to and nostalgia for a place that is or was the intimate and ultimate home” (p. 11).

In one of the most evocative passages of the book, Halilovich recounts his visit to the parents of a man who went missing at the fall of the United Nations “safe area” of Srebrenica in July 1995. Since their first encounter with the anthropologist, the elderly couple had wanted their son Senad “to find his place” in Halilovich's book. That his place is “found”—that we read of the young man's fate and imagine his suffering—happens because of the storytellers' and ethnographer's shared sense of community: all three hail from the same eastern Bosnian village; all of them are permanently displaced. Indeed, as Halilovich movingly demonstrates, it is the intimacy of *zavičaj* that allows the mother Hida to “inscribe some meaning on an otherwise meaning-

less landscape” (p. 227). Here, he argues, is translocalism in action.

While much of the book examines such action among the displaced—translocal stories of movement, rebuilding, returning, and so forth—in chapter 3 Halilovich focuses on the interplay between individual and collective memory that characterizes commemorative practices in postwar Bosnia. Personal narratives of forced displacement find their echo in the public acts of remembering: memorials etched in stone, ritual burials, and contested symbols. With the analysis stretched across the geography of Bosnia's wartime destruction, the scope precludes an in-depth study of the commonalities and differences among these sites, leaving the reader curious about how much translocalism influences the politics of remembering and forgetting unfolding within the country. Interestingly, the discussion of diverse diaspora communities, though wide ranging, reads more fluidly, tethered together by the notion of *zavičaj*, as we travel from Vienna to Zvornik and back; from German Bosnians in Sweden to Melbourne Brčaci who no longer need to return to Bosnia because their “Brčko is here” (in Australia). A photographic essay nested in the middle of the book animates the sites and stories, helping to bridge the temporal and spatial gaps that arise from the multisited study.

Places of Pain represents an important contribution to the anthropological scholarship of the region, forced migration, and transnationalism. Halilovich has done a masterful job in leading us through critical, underexamined interstices of pain and place that so forcefully define the experiences of Bosnia's displaced persons.

Our Bodies Belong to God: Organ Transplants, Islam, and the Struggle for Human Dignity in Egypt

Sherine Hamdy. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012. 370 pp.

Lesley A. Sharp

Barnard College, Columbia University

The international literature on organ transplantation is littered with efforts to provide monolithic pronouncements on where various nations and world religions stand on the conditions that make organ procurements and surgeries possible. Advocates and policymakers frequently root out specialists (ranging from academics, clinicians, chaplains, and clerics) to make pronouncements on how adherents of particular faiths do—or should—think about both organ and tissue procurement practices and subsequent transplant surgeries. Chosen with care, such specialists lend their support in helping to solve both ethical dilemmas and heated debates over

the rights of ailing patients, the utilitarian use of the dead, the moral limits of organ retrieval, and questions of whether brain death is true death. Two driving assumptions are that a wide swath of people—including Orthodox Jews, various conservative Christians, and Muslims—are known within transplant circles to object regularly on religious grounds to the transfer of parts between bodies and that authoritative voices can help assert that all the world's faiths condone organ donation, procurement, and transplantation as benevolent, moral acts that all people should thus embrace.

Sherine Hamdy's *Our Bodies Belong to God* is an important addition to a growing corpus of ethnographic studies of organ transplantation. Most of these studies detail the sociomoral consequences of organ transfer. Hamdy instead addresses

the complex moral deliberations that precede and inform surgeons' willingness to offer such procedures, patients' decisions to undergo transplantation, and family members' offers to provide an organ or go in search of an organ seller. Her project spans 21 months (2001–2004) in Egypt, a richly complex terrain where transplants are hardly new but extend back to the 1970s, and where Islam (and, to a lesser extent, Coptic Christianity) informs people's daily deliberations over what might be the right thing to do under trying medical circumstances. Hamdy guides us through two complementary medical realms: endemic causes of blindness that generate widespread need for cornea transplants, and legions of people suffering from kidney failure who must weigh the consequences of dialysis dependency against the promises of transplantation. As Hamdy illustrates meticulously and astutely, all engage in a quotidian sort of bioethics marked by ongoing, moral struggles over what is best for oneself, one's kin, organ sellers, and the dead.

Hamdy thus challenges the universalism that pervades bioethics and, as she reminds us early on, within the United States the field originated in the 1960s in response to debates over brain death and organ procurement. Hamdy's purpose, however, is not to demonstrate an alternative "Islamic" or Egyptian blend of bioethics; instead, we encounter a full range of people who demonstrate that "bioethics" is very much a part of daily discourse in Egypt. At the very heart of this is the Islamic concept of *haram*: Is it *forbidden* to take a body part from another? To acquire an organ from the dead? To opt for transplantation rather than remain on dialysis? One soon realizes that these are not merely "bioethical" concerns but also those of jurisprudence. Furthermore, all parties engage in these sorts of heady debates—with one's colleagues, one's doctor or nurse, one's kin and friends, with the anthropologist, and within one's own private thoughts, too.

Whereas *muftis* or Muslim clerics certainly engage in these discussions or issue *fatwa* or official pronouncements relevant to organ transfer, Hamdy exposes a variegated field from which no singular party line emerges. This reviewer's favorite section is the fourth chapter of seven entitled "Shaykh of the People: Genealogy of an Utterance," wherein Hamdy weighs the long-term consequences of words uttered by a charismatic and beloved television personality, Shaykh Sha'rawi, who sought to reawaken Muslim piety among Egyptians of all social strata. A defining moment occurred in 1988 when during an interview he stated that transplants were haram because "the body belongs to God."

Many Egyptians today employ his words in their efforts to articulate their beliefs. In wonderful fashion, Hamdy explores ongoing debates among clerics on whether his words were in fact a fatwa (official decree) or *madhhab* (and, thus, merely a point of view). As such, Hamdy expertly demonstrates that bioethics is malleable, situational, personal, and political.

So brief a review cannot do justice to this rich ethnography. As Hamdy wends her way through dialysis units, private clinics, and public hospitals, sitting by the bedside to record the details of patients' lives, she tells many other stories: of political upheaval and social hardships under three regimes; of iatrogenics and widespread public distrust of medicine; of eyes robbed from bodies in morgues, of the black market in kidneys, and of state surveillance efforts; and the inextricable relationship between environmental pollution and endemic disease. Overall, Hamdy offers a dense, cogent, and rewarding read of the struggles faced by Egyptians determined to make dignified decisions about transplantation. This is a must-read for those weary of bioethics' presumed universalism; it is also of significant value to Islamicists, medical anthropologists, and anyone interested in the sociomoral politics of organ transfer.

Life in Debt: Times of Care and Violence in Neoliberal Chile

Clara Han. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012. 298 pp.

Edward Murphy

Michigan State University

In this moving ethnography, Clara Han delivers a devastating and thought-provoking portrait of urban poverty in contemporary Chile. Han's focus is on the multiple entanglements and registers of debt that the urban poor confront. Her analysis begins—perhaps not surprisingly—with the rising and onerous consumer indebtedness of the lower classes in Santiago. Yet Han's analysis is much richer, spreading into varied domains and circumstances. She explores, for example, how the center-left governments of the 1990s and

2000s officially assumed particular moral and social debts to those who suffered human rights abuses and economic dislocation under the Pinochet dictatorship (1973–1990). Han also looks closely at the debts and obligations that neighbors and family members have developed among themselves. Through such a layered analysis, Han evocatively demonstrates how her interlocutors negotiate a life lived in debt.

Han's ethnographic engagement is impressive. Over an 11-year period, Han spent some 36 months working in La Pincoya, a low-income neighborhood in greater Santiago. A committed participant-observer, Han practiced ethnography in the most trying, intimate, and entangled of ways. Han's

presence is thus viscerally felt in the pages of the book: a disgruntled daughter shows Han records of the mother's debts and spending patterns; she intervenes in the middle of violent domestic disputes; a once-feared drug dealer reaches out to her as he slides into solitude, poverty, and eventually death.

Han's ethnographic commitment helps to produce impressive and novel results. She untangles the weave of relationships that sustain households amid not only economic deprivation and insecurity but also a generally hostile sociopolitical landscape. Through the book, readers will become acutely aware of how Santiago's urban poor confront insecure and low-paying jobs, a high prevalence of drug abuse and addiction, the legacies of human rights abuses, and ongoing expectations about gender roles, particularly motherhood. Han carefully reconstructs how her interlocutors build their homes and intimate relations, illuminating how people sustain each other, if in somewhat troubled and volatile ways. Households, Han brilliantly shows, are projects in restless motion, helping to constitute particular and often troubled life worlds.

Amid the epistemic, political-economic, and interpersonal forms of violence that her interlocutors suffer, Han finds ways in which they can care for each other in surprising ways. She discusses, for example, how neighbors, friends, and family members discreetly offer aid and comfort. They might casually include those in need with an invitation to a meal, mention a job opportunity, or offer help in childcare. Such acts stand in contradistinction to the intrusive and humiliating ways in which the state dispenses services. At the same time, these forms of discretion minimize the stigmatizing gossip that can gain momentum at the neighborhood level.

Han insists that paying attention to such everyday moments of care is about being open to possibility and contingency. Han's openness in this regard is part and parcel of a broader claim. She argues that the lives of those with whom she interacts should be understood in their singularity. In asserting this, Han seeks to undermine normative or essentialized understandings of the urban poor. Yet she also wishes to make a broader argument. Han writes that "rather

than make general claims about neoliberalism or liberalism, about men and women in Chile, I argue that engagement with specific lives reveals both traces and subtle reworkings of conventions and norms" (p. 169). For Han, illuminating these traces and reworkings was a difficult task. She states that attending "to aspirations, disappointments, and bitter compromises became my struggle in writing. The struggle lies not in grasping a world but in being receptive to it" (p. 11).

Han's receptivity allows her to reveal contingent forms of care that might otherwise be overlooked. But Han's argument becomes slippery and problematic at this point. In the example cited above, being discreet and thoughtful about another's sense of shame is not a "subtle reworking." The hostile field of stigmatizing signs that contributes to the shame in the first place is far from undone. Nor does the Chilean political-economic context that ensnares the urban poor in a precarious existence of debt and violence leave a mere "trace." For this reader, at least, Han's ethnographic work revealingly demonstrates how potent and devastating this context is.

Certainly, Han's attention to contingency opens up new possibilities. She also convincingly argues that many existent interpretations of neoliberalism and urban poverty, in Chile and elsewhere, are overdetermined. Yet Han's insistence on singularity provides little of a counternarrative, especially as she tends to construct her account using the devices, categories, and frameworks that already exist. The familiar characters in descriptions of neoliberalism and urban poverty—in Chile and often elsewhere—all make an appearance: indebted consumers, human rights victims, stressed-out families, suffering mothers, battered leftist militants, and hardened, if sympathetic, criminals. Han's depiction of the individuals who fit these descriptions is the most moving and effective one that I have encountered. No other analysis so elegantly covers and questions the existing explanations for why such individuals confront the obstacles they do. For these reasons alone, *Life in Debt* deserves a wide readership. The book should provide productive debate for a long time to come, if in somewhat inconclusive and open-ended ways.

Weathering the World: Recovery in the Wake of the Tsunami in a Tamil Fishing Village

Frida Hastrup. *Environmental Anthropology and Ethnobiology*, 16. New York: Berghahn, 2011. 158 pp.

Maarten Bavinck
University of Amsterdam

Those familiar with the impact of the 2004 tsunami in Asia will find the title of this book suggestive. After all, weren't

the killer waves, triggered by an earthquake off the coast of Sumatra, followed by a second surge of humanitarian relief, appropriately nicknamed "the golden wave"? A study on the way in which a coastal population responded to this double onslaught might well be called "weathering the world."

Significantly, however, this is not the author's only intention. Rather than focusing entirely on the tsunami, Frida Hastrup attempts to situate this catastrophic event in the way the fishing population of Tharangambadi, Tamil Nadu, recovers more generally from the misfortunes that befall them and integrates these into their daily lives. The focus here is on anthropological understanding and a process of "local theorizing" or provision of meaning, and the result is in many ways a relief from the mainstream literature that has considered the post-tsunami process predominantly as a management problem.

Tharangambadi is a small town (and an ex-Danish trading post) with a substantial fishing population that is situated along the section of the Indian coastline most severely impacted by the 2004 tsunami. More than 300 people from this town died as a result of the disaster, and the settlement was so severely devastated that it largely had to be rebuilt. As was the case in other parts of this coast, the local caste council (or *panchayat*) played an important role in mediating between aid agencies and the local population with regard to rehabilitation. The author, who happened to travel to the region in the wake of a relief mission, subsequently spent ten months (divided over three periods) doing intensive field research on the recovery process. The result of her study was presented as a Ph.D. thesis in 2009 and has now been reworked for this brief monograph of 130 pages.

The book contains eight chapters, the four most substantial of which are grouped around intriguing questions such as how have people acted to recover "a sense of being at home" (ch. 3), how have they regained confidence in their natural (oceanic) environment on which they depend for a living (ch. 4), how have they "folded" their reactions to disaster aid into existing patterns of political authority and negotiation (ch. 5), and how do they act to remember the disaster rather than commemorate it (ch. 7)? Discussions are based on a small selection of cases, or vignettes, written up with a great sense of color and visual detail. The tone is commanding, and the author shows a preference for pronounced viewpoints and theoretical arguments. The evidence provided, however, is

sometimes uneven and on the thin side. While some arguments are convincing of their own accord, in other instances they are debatable and provide no more than hypotheses for further study. The author regretfully also neglects to draw on most of the great works of maritime anthropology in South Asia, which would have provided more depth to the analysis. Kinship and religion—both of which play an important role in the fishing societies of this region—are barely mentioned.

Perhaps the most interesting chapter in the book is the one on "homes and hazards" (ch. 3). Having noted how the tsunami—a phenomenon relatively unknown to South Asia—caused panic and a severe sense of uncertainty, not only on December 26, 2004, but also on the occasion of subsequent tsunami rumors, the author asks how people were again able to "appropriate" a sense of belonging in their dwellings. The two vignettes illustrate that such processes do not necessarily coincide with physical rehousing to areas officially considered "safe." In the middle of the rainy season, Saravanan and his young family move into a half-finished house that is located on the same spot where their old hut had succumbed to the flood waves. Suggesting that he will finish the work on the house bit by bit, Saravanan says: "We like it here . . . This is a safe place and a good home" (p. 43). The widow Tamarasi, who lost her husband in the tsunami, has more difficulty in rerooting herself. She is torn between her old house, close to the seashore, and a new dwelling provided by an aid agency. The latter is in itself a fine house, but she cannot find reason to plant plants, make fencing, or plan for future alterations. Hastrup comments, "It was as if she had refused to bring mourning to an end" (p. 55).

In all cases, the tsunami and its aftermath have become an integral part of divergent, everyday lives. Vice versa, "tsunami time" has inserted itself into the villagers' worldview, helping to organize their daily experiences and observations. Hastrup is a promising young anthropologist with a fresh and lively gaze, and this provocative volume augurs well for her future contribution to the field of environmental anthropology.

Lifeworlds: Essays in Existential Anthropology

Michael Jackson. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012. 360 pp.

Thomas Csordas

University of California, San Diego

Lifeworlds is considerably more than a compendium of articles representing 40 years of fieldwork supplemented by a few new pieces, both because of how anthropologist Michael

Jackson has constructed the text and because of the consistency of his intellectual purpose. As a text, the book synthesizes the genres of autobiography and ethnography, tracing a career as well as presenting data and interpretation. The chapters are organized in chronological order, representing 40 years of fieldwork mostly among the Kuranko of Sierra

Leone but also among the Aboriginals of Australia and Maori of New Zealand. The distinctive feature of text construction, however, is inclusion of a brief page before each chapter describing how it came to be written and how it fits into Jackson's intellectual trajectory. As for intellectual purpose, the book synthesizes anthropology and philosophy in a way that makes it perfectly clear that the two disciplines share the same concerns. Anthropology provides the substance of human experience to a philosophy that otherwise would be overly abstract, while the kinds of philosophy engaged are those most congenial to anthropological sensibility, including phenomenology, existentialism, critical theory, and pragmatism. Psychology figures in as well, particularly in the form of psychoanalysis. The overall effect can only be described as prospectively retrospective, insofar as what one comes away with is not a summary of what Jackson has done but an exemplar of how to proceed along the lines of what he calls "existential anthropology," and this not so much in terms of an agenda as the articulation of a methodological stance.

Jackson's approach to ethnography is less of the variety "observe to see what happens" than "touch to see—feel the response." This kind of intimate engagement makes use of his own experience of understanding divination by consulting diviners, approaching embodiment as someone who has practiced yoga, analyzing his own poem written as a spontaneous sense-making action, and encountering a man with the ability to transform into an elephant. He invokes both Werner Heisenberg's uncertainty principle and the crisis of authorship in 1980s ethnography, never with the latter's sometimes agonizing self-consciousness or even self-indulgence but according to the dictum that the ethnographic other is "oneself in other circumstances." Jackson also contributes to the anthropological critique of social suffering, addressing the civil war in Sierra Leone and its aftermath, both in the country and among emigrants to the United Kingdom across generations of his acquaintance, as well as traumatic experience among Aboriginal children and World War II veterans and the struggle for autonomy among the Maori. If there is a place where he perhaps inevitably falters, it is in advocating silence instead of vocal witnessing and suspending judgment instead of taking action. Without question, there are moments when silence is the most dignified, respectful response and can even, as he suggests, be therapeutic; suspending judgment remains one of anthropology's greatest strengths and by no means amounts to complacency or paralysis. Jackson practices an active silence and a suspension

of judgment that is alert, anticipatory, and engaged, but one has a sense that in the end he feels stymied in the face of violence and suffering.

More than anything, this book is a clear definition of what Jackson means by "existential anthropology," the focus of which is "the paradox of plurality and the ambiguity of intersubjective life" evident in acknowledging "the full force of appearances" that constitute the immediate phenomena of lived reality. The fundamental question of existentialism here remains that of freedom versus determinism, whether one is an actor or acted upon, whether humans are complicit in their fate or creatures of circumstance, sharing identity with others while standing out as singular persons, or becoming aware of themselves through relations with others. Lived reality cannot be inferred from discourse or cognition, but contrary to some positions that insist it is inevitably obscured by impersonal media, it is intersubjectively accessible. Power is not to be understood as possession of position or things but of being where one is, in Jackson's phrase, ontologically secure. The existential is there before it is constructed as cultural, social, religious, historical, or political—in phenomenological terms, it is preobjective. Hence, Jackson is concerned with what at various points he refers to as the relation between individual biographies and cultural preunderstanding, abstract possibilities and sensible truths, the word and the flesh, experience and episteme. The anthropologist must treat thought and practice on a par, and subject and object as equivalent moments of experience, bringing intersubjectivity to bear in overcoming both the scientism that drives them apart and the romanticism that merges them.

This existential anthropology is in fact, as Jackson elaborates, an ethnographically grounded philosophical anthropology. It requires an analytic vocabulary including "such terms as *lifeworld*, *relatedness*, *intersubjectivity*, *coexistence*, *negotiation*, *multiplicity*, *potentiality*, *transitivity*, *event*, *paradox*, *ambiguity*, *margin*, and *limit*." One could easily add *indeterminacy*, *immediacy*, *intentionality*, *imagination*, *interpretation*, *experience*, and *embodiment*. The important point is that Jackson, particularly in his opening chapter, deploys this vocabulary in a way that is accessible and avoids the charge that existential–phenomenological thinking is necessarily obscure and esoteric. Even for those preferring another style of anthropology, awareness of this one is critical, and no anthropology graduate student should be considered adequately trained without having read at least the first chapter of *Lifeworlds*.

Emergence and Collapse of Early Villages: Models of Central Mesa Verde Archaeology

Timothy A. Kohler and Mark D. Varien, eds. *Origins of Human Behavior and Culture*, 6. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012. 376 pp.

Gregson Schachner

University of California, Los Angeles

Inspired by current environmental problems and shifts in research funding, archaeologists are pursuing renewed investigations of socio-natural systems. This research is interdisciplinary, reaching well beyond archaeology to engage hydrologists, ecologists, and computer scientists, and it examines diverse data sets across broad regions. Its goal is no less than to explore what the archaeological record can teach us about the long-term relationship between human societies and environmental change. *Emergence and Collapse of Early Villages* presents an overview of the first phase of the Village Ecodynamics Project (VEP), one of the pioneering efforts in this domain. The VEP employs diverse methods, including sophisticated modeling of environmental parameters and human action, as well as archaeological field and archival research, to examine the socio-natural systems of Pueblo societies in the Mesa Verde region of the arid U.S. Southwest from C.E. 600 to 1300. As noted in the editors' introduction, this region is an ideal study area in which to explore these questions as a result of its exceptional archaeological record as well as the fact that its depopulation in the late C.E. 1200s is often held up as a defining example of the vulnerability of human societies to environmental change. The VEP team and others have shown this seminal event to be far more complex than previously thought.

Agent-based modeling is central to the VEP approach. The VEP model, outlined in chapter 4, draws explicitly on adaptationist perspectives in evolutionary theory to identify factors that would have affected the settlement and subsistence choices of Pueblo farmers. In the introductory chapter, the editors (and Kohler in his conclusion) discuss how optimality models drive the construction of the VEP digital world while at the same time recognizing that people in the real world often act in ways that contradict the expectations of strict optimality. They argue that models serve as a means of being explicit about one's assumptions, provide a well-understood comparative benchmark, and, most importantly, note that it is often the ways in which human behavior departs from our comparatively simple models that are the most interesting. Thus, the VEP involves the construction and many runs of a complex model incorporating numerous (and varying) factors that might affect settlement choices, including agricultural

productivity (ch. 6, also see ch. 3) and the availability of wild game (ch. 7–9), water (ch. 5), firewood (ch. 7), and exchange partners (ch. 11). The model results are then contrasted against multiple syntheses and reexaminations of the enormous body of archaeological data that has been collected from the study area over the last century (ch. 2, 12–14). The goal of the VEP is not necessarily to model reality but, rather, to create a model that challenges archaeologists' assumptions about the ancient Pueblo world and highlights new research topics. In this endeavor, the project has been enormously successful. The modeling efforts have questioned longstanding conjectures about shortages of domestic water driving settlement pattern shifts (ch. 5) and underscored the domestication of turkeys in addressing protein-deficiencies arising from human impacts on wild game populations (ch. 7–9). Perhaps of most interest was the fact that, despite varying input parameters across model runs, the researchers were never able to produce digital populations as high or as densely aggregated as the real populations of the ancient past (ch. 10, 15), which they attribute to factors lacking in the model, such as migration, conflict, and the rise of social hierarchies, that have been central to southwestern archaeological research in recent years. These important departures are seen as illustrating the necessity of exploring social and historical explanatory factors alongside those based on strict interpretations of evolutionary models (ch. 15).

Emergence and Collapse of Early Villages is an exemplary study of the rise of farming villages in the ancient past and should be of interest well beyond Southwest specialists. The strong interplay between the modeling effort and archaeological studies is refreshing, as models have the potential to drift off into their own digital worlds. There is, of course, room for improvement. A more accessible presentation of how the model works for those less steeped in this particular model and modeling in general would be helpful for convincing, or at least engaging, modeling's skeptics. Also, the VEP researchers will hopefully build on one of the strengths of their modeling efforts by further exploring how variation in input parameters and baseline assumptions influence the model runs as well as the archaeological benchmarks against which the runs are compared. This volume well illustrates the promise of the VEP researchers' approach, and I look forward to future successes as the ongoing phase 2 of the VEP continues its innovative undertaking.

She's Mad Real: Popular Culture and West Indian Girls in Brooklyn

Oneka LaBennett. New York: New York University Press, 2011. 253 pp.

A. Lynn Bolles

University of Maryland, College Park

One of the ultimate goals of being an engaged public anthropologist—simultaneously the researcher, scholar, and advocate—is to bring your project—the detailed analysis of the issue facing that group under study—to the attention of the public. This “public” includes not only the discipline of anthropology but also other academics interested in the issue or concern as well as the wider world of readers. Oneka LaBennett has done all of that in this remarkable ethnography on adolescent girls of Caribbean descent living and learning in Brooklyn, New York. *She's Mad Real* provides a panorama of theory, deep description, and praxis to understand these black teenage girls. LaBennett is writing against the grain, as urban black female adolescents are typecast by their race, gender, age, and presumed class position. Furthermore, as urban black teen girls, it is assumed that they are “at risk” for becoming underage mothers with low educational aspirations and with little thought of how to become wage earners. LaBennett breaks that mold and brings other variables into the mix. Here, the young women with whom LaBennett worked for a number of years are 1.5 immigrants or born in the English-speaking Caribbean—Jamaica, Guyana, Trinidad—and are being raised in Brooklyn. They are “West Indian,” to use the colonial phrase. Besides navigating the terrain of adolescence, *She's Mad Real* demonstrates the fluidity of identities that these teens negotiate, from being “West Indian” to “African American” to locating their families in a U.S. class structure and understanding the process of migration in terms of what was left back home in the Caribbean and, thus, what modes of behavior, worldview, and motivations dictate their current status as West Indian teen girls in Brooklyn. One of the ways the girls circumnavigate their situation is through their consumption of popular culture as they strive to be authentic young black women who are also West Indians—living in Brooklyn; loving rap, hip-hop, reggae, and dance hall music; donning female “urban-wear” styled clothing; and employing code-switching language. With these behaviors, they strive to “being for real” (p. 5).

She's Mad Real begins by presenting just who these teens are in terms of their transnational position and considering how as they straddle identities via popular culture as a social and cultural mechanism to satisfy their own self-identification, bringing up issues of authenticity. LaBennett critically examines the existing body of literature on

these transnational urban black teenage girls, and her study methodologically and theoretically carves out new terrain in the study of transnational urban black teenage girls. As she argues, “at-risk youth” literature does a disservice to the teens by its narrow vision of containment and control, rarely expanding on creativeness of those built-in “urban youth.” LaBennett explains that none of the group in this study is impoverished, but all are guarded in the use of money. Next, she remarks that issues of age and complications of larger social processes are rarely examined in migration studies of West Indians. Those studies typically focus on adult West Indian migrants’ leisure habits, their consumption patterns, education aspirations, and their modes of employment. This is where *She's Mad Real* comes into play.

Situated in the developing literature on the anthropology of children, childhood, and youth, LaBennett integrates play and labor, as the teens with whom she worked have afterschool jobs either at the Brooklyn Children’s Museum (BCM), the site of her research, or other places of employment; consume cultural styles and habits that are sometimes U.S. based and other times based in the Caribbean; and work hard at school to please themselves and their families. As black young women, they worried about going to college, their strained relationships with their mothers, and their body images. Overall, they wondered, what would life be like after graduating from high school and leaving the BCM, “our museum” that provided financial and social support for them since the sixth grade?

Popular culture and consumerism is central to teen life, and here Black Diaspora youth identity is expressed in material culture and music. From the beginning, hip-hop has been a transnational musical genre, borrowing from African, Caribbean, and African American musical traditions. Assuming “authentic blackness” connects West Indian dancehall music with their claims of being African American via understandings of what is “real.” Realness is about negotiating the complex of structural inequalities and power relations as the girls experiment with ways to deal as consumers and discover the female musical artists who they admire, such as Mary J. Blige, who is referred to in the title of the ethnography. Mary J. Blige “brings it real,” all the while championing black women’s independence and celebrating black beauty. Brooklyn-based West Indian teenage-girl identity necessitates a complex, symbolic dual citizenship, as these young women function as members of the global “hip-hop planet” and bring it “real” in an authentic black female space.

The People of the Eye: Deaf Ethnicity and Ancestry

Harlan Lane, Richard C. Pillard, and Ulf Hedberg. *Perspectives on Deafness series*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011. 296 pp.

Jack Levinson

City College of New York

The first television show with multiple Deaf main characters, the popular *Switched at Birth*, recently aired an episode in American Sign Language (ASL) with English subtitles. Such instances of visibility depend on a vibrant Deaf world that the authors of *The People of the Eye* argue remains misunderstood with substantial consequences. Actually, it is the “Deaf World,” which is the English translation of the ASL signs the Deaf use to describe themselves. More than a group tied together merely by “signing” and other shared experiences, the Deaf are an ethnic group. The category of “ethnicity” best explains the Deaf World, and what makes Deaf ethnicity unique adds new dimensions to the relevant scholarly debates. Ethnic status would also accord the Deaf the formal protections extended, in principle, to vulnerable minorities.

The People of the Eye has the potential to transform conceptions of Deafness. The affirmative character of ethnicity permits a refreshing refusal to engage disability, which is acknowledged simply as a basis of and persistent impediment to changing entrenched assumptions about Deafness. This is not the first argument for Deaf ethnicity, but it offers, as the first monograph on the subject, perhaps the most sophisticated and encompassing effort. Despite the claim, it is not an ethnography, even though the examination of ethnicity in the first section does have an ethnographic texture, drawing widely from anthropology, sociology, linguistics, and oral history (as well as cultural and social theories). A related but more important contribution is the analytic scope and organization of published research on Deaf people, settings, language, and history.

By the late 1960s, linguists demonstrated that sign languages are autonomous, independent of dominant spoken languages, and independent of each other, which makes Deafness a kind of diasporic ethnicity. Sign language always develops where there is a sizable Deaf population, and the book’s cross-cultural descriptions are fascinating. The uniqueness of sign language as a completely visual and embodied form presents a rich illustration of language’s relationship to group identity. Facial expressions, bodily orientation, and the use of the eyes are integral to the semantic and grammatical complexity of visual languages and make the Deaf “the people of the eye.”

The book is intended for professional and lay audiences. Certain readers will find, in the first section, that the analysis sometimes reads like a textbook, plodding in the attempt to be comprehensive and plowing through every possible objection to the idea of Deaf ethnicity. If style is compromised here, substance is not. A preemptive strategy is understand-

able given an argument that, however compelling, has been repeatedly resisted. The stakes are high: life for many Deaf is shaped still by hearing assumptions, especially among professionals with a stake in what Deafness means.

Unlike language, ancestry is a less apparent aspect of Deaf ethnicity. In the second section, ancestry is demonstrated with genealogical data that involved mining and assembling an impressive historiographical record. (Much could not be included and is freely available on a Harvard Library website.) The genealogies are explicated in historical narratives—a welcome stylistic shift—each organized by the origin and growth of select hereditary Deaf families since the 17th century. Genetic transmission makes Deaf ancestry unusual, involving perhaps the only ethnic physical trait that is not universal and even skips generations. Upwards of 96 percent of Deaf children are born to hearing parents. Deaf ancestry challenges the conventional ideas about socialization and ethnicity examined in the book’s first section. What is the fate of children born of but often not into their ethnic group? Even apparently beneficent accommodations like educational mainstreaming isolate individual children from their own potential world and undermine the capacities of an ethnic group to reproduce its linguistic and cultural heritage.

The narratives trace hereditary Deaf families and clans as well as the founding and development of Deaf culture in the United States. Deaf–Deaf intermarriage is examined in its broader context as integral to the burgeoning Deaf World. By the early 19th century, the sizable and integrated Deaf presence led to the founding of residential schools that taught ASL and served as institutional nodes in expanding social, professional, and political networks. Group identity was such in the 1860s that some proposed petitioning Congress to establish a Deaf state out West. In 1880, the first national association was founded and exists today.

That same year, however, an international convention on Deaf education endorsed “oralism”—the replacement of signed language with spoken language. The authors note the context of European nationalism that suppressed minority languages to impose standardized national ones. By the 1920s, four-fifths of U.S. Deaf schools promoted oralism. Not until the 1960s did culture and civil rights movements spark the Deaf to embrace their own.

The People of the Eye offers a unique, even challenging, contribution to scholarship across fields on ethnicity, identity, language, cultural reproduction, and so forth. The authors argue for recognition that the Deaf World is a worthy scholarly topic outside Deaf and disability studies. Yet academic inclusion is only one part of the book’s larger aim, which is to increase the long overdue visibility in hearing societies of “the people of the eye.”

Transnational Desires: Brazilian Erotic Dancers in New York

Suzana Maia. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2012. 256 pp.

Thaddeus Gregory Blanchette

Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Macaé

In the face of the hurricane of prejudice and opinion surrounding the topics of “sexual exploitation” and “human trafficking,” Suzana Maia’s *Transnational Desires: Brazilian Erotic Dancers in New York* comes as a breath of fresh air, dealing as it does with a numerically large group of sex workers who have been ignored by policy makers and moral entrepreneurs alike: middle-class, female immigrants.

Maia’s ethnographic research details the trajectories of nine Brazilian women—lawyers, social workers, small-business owners, secretaries, and government employees—who, in the face of the Brazilian economic crisis of the late 1990s, chose to emigrate to New York City to work as erotic–exotic dancers. Using participant-observation methodology, she follows these women as they negotiate the ins and outs of sex work and transnational living during a period (2003–2005) when reaction to the terrorist attacks of 9/11 began to close loopholes previously exploited by Brazilian immigrants in the United States.

Maia’s informants are a surprising bunch, from the perspective of the stereotypical view of female immigrants from the “developing world.” The women in *Transnational Desires* are hardly examples of the “oppressed female masses” so often imagined when the subjects of sex work and migration come up. White and middle class in Brazil, the combination of sex work and migration to the United States racially “darkens” these women and occludes their markers of privilege, even as it allows them to achieve a level of economic success that would be improbable in their country of origin. The book’s focus is on how the women deal with this mixture of economic success and social decline within a highly racialized and engendered context. Maia follows them in their attempts to build cosmopolitan, middle-class lives that allow freedom of international movement in the face of increased nativism, state surveillance, and the stigma of sex work. Shot through these descriptions is an intriguing depiction of what Brazilian researcher Adriana Piscitelli (2003) calls “middle-class prostitution.”

Here, we see women exchanging sexual–affective labor for material advantages in the context of ongoing, superficially reciprocal relationships, often initiated through erotic dancing. Maia’s informants clearly describe how affective labor is crucial to this sort of sex work: “That’s part of the relationship,” says her informant, Barbara. “One has to be between a babysitter, a mother, and a therapist, and keep him busy, giving [the man] constant attention,” both on and off the dance floor, inside the club and beyond its four walls (p. 138). In these sorts of relationships, sex is almost of secondary concern to the stroking of male egos, the per-

formance of exotic–erotic femininity, and the provision of female attention for pay. Furthermore, as *Transnational Desires* shows, this kind of sexual, performative labor is very much a product of normative social views regarding women that transcend class, race, and national boundaries but are powerfully reinforced by markers of ethnic alterity.

Nevertheless, what Maia is describing is indeed prostitution—albeit in a camouflaged form. If there is a weak point to *Transnational Desires*, it is the author’s reluctance to theoretically engage in the debate regarding the nature of sex work and its intersections with class and race. Often, just when the book seems about to dive into this topic, it draws back and lets the data speak for itself.

Like her informants, Maia is a middle-class Brazilian transnational. As such, much of her theoretical impetus is spent on analyzing a more subtle question: What does it mean to be “white,” “middle class,” and from a country that is marked by enormous racial and class divisions, internationally understood as only marginally part of “the West”? In this project, she follows some of the themes developed by her mentor Vincent Crapanzano in his studies of white South Africans (1985). Maia’s discussion of the category of “morena”—white but not white—as constructed in an international context showcases her analytical powers and makes a real contribution to a greater debate regarding race, color, and privilege in Brazil.

Brazilianists—like the clients in New York gentlemen’s clubs—often seem to be excessively interested in that which is exotic (read: poor and nonwhite). *Transnational Desires* challenges this tendency by foregrounding the experiences of middle-class immigrant women involved in sex work, performing “Brazilianness” to a clientele that is apparently incapable of conceiving of an educated, reflexive “other.” In this sense, Suzana Maia subtly turns the tables on many of the prejudices currently dominating North American and European thought regarding the place of Brazilian women in a globalized—yet increasingly surveilled—world.

REFERENCES CITED

- Crapanzano, Vincent
1985 *Waiting: The Whites of South Africa*. New York: Random House.
- Piscitelli, Adriana
2004 Entre a Praia de Iracema e a União Européia: Turismo sexual internacional e a imigração feminina [Between Iracema Beach and the European Union: International sexual tourism and female immigration]. In *Sexualidade e saberes: Convenções e fronteiras* [Sexuality and knowledge: Conventions and frontiers]. Adriana Piscitelli, Maria Filomena Gregori, and Sérgio Carrara, organizadores. Pp. 283–218. Rio de Janeiro: Garamond.

Occupy: Three Inquiries in Disobedience

W. J. T. Mitchell, Bernard E. Harcourt, and Michael Taussig. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013. 152 pp.

Gregory Reck

Appalachian State University

In the preface to this slim volume, W. J. T. Mitchell, one of the three essayists who are featured, suggests that the book's structure might be best described "as three concentric circles of history" (p. vii) that move from the highly particular events in New York's Zucotti Park to more general reflections on the state of national and global politics, the media, symbols, and public space. While this claim might be dismissed as academic hyperbole, it does in general capture the spirit of the book, even though the essays fail to live up completely to their billing as both concentric circles and history.

The initial essay by Columbia University anthropologist Michael Taussig is by far the most original. Utilizing an approach that he describes as "occupy ethnography," Taussig intentionally creates a text that is as transgressive as the Occupy movement itself. His essay is a dizzying combination of his own reflections, participation, and observations; those of a handful of his students who participated in Occupy Wall Street; and periodic quotations from OWS signs, philosophers, poets, and newspaper headlines. As a scholar, Taussig ties it all together with references to what many would consider unrelated ideas from the scholarly and artistic works of E. P. Thompson, Friedrich Nietzsche, Eric Hobsbawm, Karl Marx, Henry David Thoreau, Diego Rivera, and John Cage. At times, his descriptions may push the borders a bit too strenuously, as when he describes OWS as "a messianic movement after the death of God that kindles our polymorphously perverse infancy with relish" (p. 39). Yet, his essay paradoxically captures the elusive essence of the movement by freeing the text from the normal confines of traditional academic writing. The result is less of a cognitive comprehension of OWS and more of what Kurt Wolff (1964) called "the catch" of the ethnographer's "surrender."

The other two essays are written by W. J. T. Mitchell, a professor of English and art history at the University of Chicago, and Bernard E. Harcourt, a professor of political science and law at Chicago. Utilizing much more traditional academic genres, both essays offer informative perspectives on the OWS movement and its tenuous links to various global movements. Harcourt's essay is constructed around the distinction he draws between "civil disobedience" and "political disobedience." He describes political disobedience as a "new paradigm" that, unlike civil disobedience, "fundamentally rejects the ideological landscape that has dominated our collective imagination" (p. 46) by the very absence of traditional markers of protest movements: leadership, precise demands, and a grammar that transcends the actual space of the protest. OWS, politically disobedient to the

core, exemplifies this new paradigm. While thought provoking, the distinction is drawn too sharply and unfairly. For example, Mitchell quotes a well-known passage from Martin Luther King's *Letter from Birmingham City Jail* to suggest that the King-led civil rights movement respected "the legal norm at the very moment of resistance" and aimed "not to displace the law making institutions or the structure of legal governance" (p. 46). This conclusion ignores the broad and diverse ideological space of that movement in general, as well as the evolution of King's radical critique of capitalism.

Mitchell's essay on "the arts of occupation" is equally thought provoking. In posing the question "Was this a revolution?" he arrives at the trope of *occupatio*, which he describes as "the tactic of anticipating an adversary's arguments by preempting them, taking the initiative in a space where one knows in advance that there will be resistance and counterarguments" (p. 102). With temporal, spatial, and rhetorical dimensions, *occupatio* becomes the unifying verbal-visual image that connects the revolutionary movements from the Arab Spring to OWS. From there, Mitchell explores the relationships of art, imagery, and aesthetics to the global Occupy movements. Drawing from Siegfried Kracauer's notion of the "mass ornament" that occupies public spaces while making political statements, he sees parallels with the "phalanxes of posters, mass gatherings, lone individuals facing massive police lines, momentary performances, enduring tent cities" (p. 125) that aesthetically and politically defined the spaces occupied by these various movements.

The authors are obvious fans of OWS. As a history, their characterization of OWS as a spontaneous movement on September 17, 2011, ignores the precursors to that day. These include the creation of the web address <http://www.OccupyWallStreet.org> by *Adbusters*, a Canadian anticconsumerist publication, on June 9; the June 13 call by *Adbusters* for a Tahrir moment in the United States; the August 1 Wall Street arrest of a group of artists who over several days engaged in nude performance art entitled "Ocularpation: Wall Street"; the formation in July of a group called New Yorkers against Budget Cuts (NYAB) that promoted a lower Manhattan "sleep in"; and the splintering off of group from NYAB, which included anthropologist David Graeber, that eventually formed the New York General Assembly, which was instrumental in laying the groundwork for the OWS movement. While celebrating OWS and other linked global movements, the authors also inevitably beg the question of Occupy's enduring legacy. One wonders whether "Occupy" has become just another brand in the culture of spectacles or whether it survives in the Occupy Sandy

movement that trumped many conventional relief efforts in the wake of that storm, or in the localized networks of solidarity kitchens, doctor's offices, people's pharmacies, and tutoring services that have developed in the most economically devastated areas of Greece since the country imposed severe austerity measures. Only time will tell.

REFERENCE CITED

Wolff, Kurt

1964 Surrender and Community Study: The Study of Loma. *In* Reflections on Community Studies. Arthur J. Vidich, Joseph Bensman, and Maurice R. Stein, eds. Pp. 233–263. New York: John Wiley and Sons.

The Embodied Eye: Religious Visual Culture and the Social Life of Feeling

David Morgan. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012. 280 pp.

Andreas Bandak

University of Copenhagen

In recent years, studies of the materiality of religion have been introduced with great subtlety by a range of different scholars. Within anthropology, great work has been done by Matthew Engelke, Webb Keane, and Birgit Meyer. A significant voice in the broader field is professor of religion at Duke University David Morgan. Morgan has already contributed several weighty books on the role of visuality in the construction of the sacred (1998, 2005), and with his new book *The Embodied Eye*, he expands this work. As with his previous books, it is remarkably well written; in it, with clarity and great insight, Morgan scrutinizes ways of engaging with religious worlds and considers how such worlds are made inhabitable. Morgan draws upon a great variety of sources, which makes the book a compelling read and one that allows for cross-fertilizing between different academic fields and disciplines.

The central argument of the book is that religion must be approached not as meaning in a Geertzian manner but, rather, as a configuration of social relationships—and that these are constituted in what Morgan designates as “visual fields.” Such visual fields carry histories of power relationships, which are embodied in sensual attitudes—what the book also labels as “ways of seeing” or “gazes” (p. 67). Hereby, Morgan makes a strong case for understanding vision as existing in a relationship with other forms of sensation. It is these historical configurations of relationships that Morgan explores through cases studies of phenomena such as devotion to the sacred heart, icons, sympathy, and apparitions. The case studies are drawn from Protestant and Catholic traditions but also from civil religion in the United States; all are used to open detailed discussions of theories of vision, media, and perspective in different, predominantly Western traditions ranging from René Descartes and Albrecht Dürer to Maurice Merleau-Ponty, Roland Barthes, and beyond.

The book is organized into two parts. In the first part of the book, Morgan explores the role of bodies for the

construction of the sacred. Bodies are understood here as both being somatic and social. Morgan presents seeing as an interface and thereby an ethical practice—but a practice that historically has materialized in various kinds of gazes. Morgan presents us with a taxonomy of over eight such gazes for further consideration.

In the second part of the book, Morgan deals with what he terms “senses of belief.” He deliberately takes on the notion of “belief,” which has been so heavily criticized in much scholarship. He asserts the need to deal with the notion of belief—but only as a material and practical relationship people come to have in and through particular communities.

Of particular value in this book is the focus on how various senses affect and help both influencing and constituting what people hold as sacred. Where visual culture has been Morgan's trademark in his previous work, he hereby covers new territory in attending to how the various senses and their interplay make particular worlds distinct and yet shared.

Where Morgan beautifully engages case studies and theory about vision, feeling, and sensual interplay, one could only wish to further the questions probed. Morgan aptly describes the constitution of shared communities of feeling. This is a promising avenue for further research. Yet it also begs questions such as the following: What kind of communities are we able to discern and talk about, and are all affected in the same manner? Morgan deliberately writes that people experience a visual field differently; however, how can we in practical terms incorporate structures of indifference and outright ignorance in relationship to the theoretical idea of visual fields? In other words, how do we avoid taking the visual fields as totalities and instead acknowledge them as prevalent yet often contested ways of both being in and seeing the world?

With the publication of *The Embodied Eye*, Morgan has given us a very important book that deserves a wide readership. The book more than obviously is critical for all working with the role of materiality and the senses in studies of religion but also those who study social worlds more widely. Morgan allows us to see and sense not merely

the ways in which religious worlds come into being but also how they are made familiar to people. This form of familiarization is a sign of the author's particular skill and deftness in that he allows for that which is otherwise invisible to gain a place in which to be seen and dealt with.

The Modernity Bluff: Crime, Consumption, and Citizenship in Côte d'Ivoire

Sasha Newell. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012. 296 pp.

Syna Ouattara

University of Gothenburg

The Modernity Bluff is based on fieldwork undertaken by Sasha Newell in Abidjan during 2000 and 2001. In this monograph, the author investigates two parallel processes of authentication, both of which were meant to produce Ivorian nationality. In one case, urban youth constructed themselves as modern Ivorian citizens in opposition to foreigners through their ability to consume authentic (as opposed to fake) brands. At the same time, the politics of the Ivorian nation shifted to exclude those within its boundaries who did not conform to this new idea of Ivorian-ness. The author challenges the cultural presuppositions underlying our understanding of the "fake" to recast anthropological theories of the relationship between mimesis, modernity, and postcolonial identity.

The author contests the representation of Côte d'Ivoire in the ranks of African nations stereotypically characterized in the media by their irrational violence structured by timeless ethnic oppositions. He suggests that the instability of contemporary Ivorian politics is closely linked to the cultural processes underlying the "bluff" and its relationship to the imagination of modernity. He uses the Ivorian concept of the bluff to highlight the ways in which masking activities are not mere deceptions but, rather, performances that produce meaningful fictions, thereby making social reality a part of the fabric of everyday fictions. The word *bluff* is used by urban Ivorians to describe both the act of artifice and the people who performed it (*les bluffeurs*). Men perform the bluff in public space underground, outdoor bars in their neighborhood, buying large amounts of alcohol to impress and seduce women.

Three key concepts are central in the book: *nouchi*, *yere*, and *gaou*. *Nouchi* is a self-reference of Ivorian urban youth constructed around fashion as urban popular culture, taking on the role of a panethnic national language. *Nouchi*, a term that means bandit or hoodlum, assumes a more positive reference as in "coolness" or streetwise, with an ability to survive by one's intellects. *Nouchis'* ability, which integrates linguistic material from a wide variety of languages, is an important factor in urban cultural integration. *Nouchis* interpret mostly hierarchical relationships and values, including those among brand-name objects, in terms of a dis-

REFERENCES CITED

Morgan, David

1998 *Visual Piety: A History and Theory of Popular Religious Images*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

2005 *The Sacred Gaze: Religious Visual Culture in Theory and Practice*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

inction between *yere* and *gaou*. In the *nouchi* language, *yere* means to see clearly, to scam, to dress stylishly, and to detect others' attempts to exploit them. It is opposed to *gaou*, which refers to someone incapable of discerning his surroundings and therefore someone easily duped, but it also describes such a person's lack of intelligence and uncivilized qualities as well as inability to dress stylishly. However, it is important to note that a *gaou* can become a *yere* and vice-versa.

The author suggests that it is through these conceptualizations of the external, these varying imaginings of modernity according to differentiated social positions within Côte d'Ivoire, that an Ivorian (as opposed to ethnic) selfhood is forged. The mimetic performance of bluff, through which Ivorians model their speech, clothing, and musical taste upon the media's stereotypic figure of the *nouchi*, creates the possibility of a "real" Ivorian identity. According to the author, much about the Ivorian conflict can be understood by examining stylistic oppositions between bluffeurs and those they despise as *gaous* and what these reveal about divergent representations of modernity in relation to *Ivoirité*. He argues that the emergence of the discourse of *Ivoirité* in the 1990s works according to a logic similar to that of brands. Thus, nationality and brand value are both unstable semiotic forms that must continually perform their authenticity by policing, excluding, or destroying the doubles and counterfeits that threaten identity by mimicking the role of "real" citizens or products.

The author's main point is that for the Ivorians, the bluff is an art, an achievement that at once publicly authenticates their ability to make a living by duping their peers with imagery and establishes their reputation as legitimately modern urban citizens. The modernity of bluff, therefore, is neither fake nor real but, rather, the ability to produce the real through manipulation of the imaginary. The imaginary word is produced through masking, an act that displays the presence of power while concealing the power itself.

Overall, the book is well written and easy to read. It makes a significant contribution to the cultural history of the conflict in Côte d'Ivoire and African modern urban studies as well as a substantial theoretical input to semiotic and performance anthropology.

The Life of Cheese: Crafting Food and Value in America

Heather Paxson. *California Studies in Food and Culture* series. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012. 332 pp.

Steffan Igor Ayora-Díaz

Universidad Autónoma de Yucatán

The Life of Cheese is a clear, readable, and accomplished demonstration of the complexity of contemporary anthropological studies. The craft of artisanal cheese making in the United States has gained visibility and preference among growing numbers of consumers. Heather Paxson focuses her attention on the practices and values held by artisanal cheese makers, remaining attentive to the supplementary values of their customers. The picture that emerges is complex and nuanced: it reveals the heterogeneity of practices and values held by cheese makers on both the east and west coasts of the United States and allows us to understand the sources of their pride as individual entrepreneurs.

In chapter 1, Paxson challenges the understanding of U.S. artisanal cheese makers as a monolithic group. Some are professionals who chose cheese making as a career change; others were milk producers who took on cheese to create another source of income; and still others began making cheese to express an alternative lifestyle. Their personal and family trajectories help shape their productive choices, both in the type of cheese (from goat's, sheep's, or cow's milk) and the level of mechanization. Paxson introduces several concepts that support her nuanced analysis throughout the remaining chapters. The book leads the reader to examine postpastoral practices, discourses, and values involved in the widespread negotiation and resignification, among artisanal cheese makers, of their relationship to nature—as opposed to urban life—and the appropriation of values and practices that inform the rationale for using different forms of mechanization.

In chapter 2, Paxson unpacks the concept of “ecologies of production.” She defines these as assemblages of organic, social, and symbolic forces that support the postpastoral style of life. It includes practices that suggest multispecies activities comprising artisanal cheese makers, animals, fungus, and bacteria, actively collaborating to produce distinctive commodities. “Hard work” increases the value of artisanal cheese, and this category includes not only human labor but also the animals' production of milk. Chapter 3 describes the “Economies of Sentiment,” demonstrating the juxtaposition of economic rationality and moral values in shaping the meanings of craft cheese as an “unfinished” commodity. Here Paxson argues that to understand the reasons why someone chooses to take on strenuous work, one has to take into account the subjects' cultural, emotional, ethical, and political dispositions. She discusses the different values that have led different individuals into artisanal production: a rejection of urban lifestyles and a desire to return to the land; a view of

cheese making as a source of work pride; an understanding of the self as being an entrepreneur and artisan; the strategy of employing artisanal production to (re)build communities threatened by the advance of the city; and, finally, the placement of value on the quality and taste of “good food.” Paxson shows that producers seek a balance between their moral, ethical, and political values and the need to remain economically viable.

Chapter 4 contrasts the values of European and U.S. cheese makers. Paxson argues that, in Europe, contemporary cheese makers' discourses and practices invent ties with the past and support the meaning of commodities as “traditional,” regardless of the fact that many techniques and technologies employed by artisans are of recent creation. In contrast, artisans in the United States draw from a tradition of invention: instead of seeking to recreate age-old European cheeses, artisans seek to invent cheeses that are their own. Chapter 5 describes the ways in which producers seek to balance the expectations of traditional manufacturing and the appropriation of scientific and technological advances applicable in the crafting of artisanal cheese.

Chapter 6 deals with microbiopolitics: artisanal cheese makers must contend with institutional views based on a Pasteurian understanding of microbial life in which all microscopic organisms are potentially dangerous for the consumer and thus must be removed from handmade cheese. In contrast, artisanal cheese makers hold a post-Pasteurian position, recognizing the importance and value of different bacterial and fungal strains in creating taste and meaning in their commodities. Microscopic life is to be accepted and worked with to make distinctive cheeses.

In chapter 7, the author describes the strategies deployed by artisans to appropriate the value of *terroir*. Again, the main contrast is with Europe, where *terroir* is a collective political issue, where the creation of denominations of origin imposes a degree of uniformity in local cheeses and the main value of a product is derived from the taste attributed to the land and to local manufacturing procedures. In the United States, with hegemonic individualist values coinciding with the tradition of invention, the meaning of *terroir* becomes restricted to the land, pastures, and work of specific individuals, resignifying the meaning of place.

The Life of Cheese is a very important ethnography that uses concepts in a creative and illustrative manner to demonstrate the complexity and heterogeneity of meanings of artisanal cheese in the United States. It is a book worth reading to appreciate the complex forces involved in the creation of meaning of commodities and work in the contemporary United States as well as an important addition to the field of food studies.

Operation Fly Trap: L.A. Gangs, Drugs, and the Law

Susan A. Phillips. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012. 192 pp.

Jorja Leap

University of California, Los Angeles

Operation Fly Trap begins as a well-crafted ethnography of a media-heralded FBI–LAPD Task Force that relied on wiretaps, confidential informants, and the federal courts to destroy a drug network operated by two African American gangs in Los Angeles. However, Susan Phillips goes far beyond simple qualitative reportage, as this ethnography expands to encompass multiple facets of the criminal justice system: the process of turning offenders into informants, the vagaries of conspiracy charges (also known as the “prosecutor’s darling” for their ambiguity and low threshold of proof), and the inequities in sentencing guidelines. Phillips explores the social contexts that create crime and the unintended consequences that emerge from traditional suppression strategies. What emerges is a delicately nuanced portrait of individuals operating within a community—and how their multiple agendas and concerns all collide—resulting in a situation without resolution or easy outcomes.

In five elegant chapters, Phillips delineates the myriad forces involved: misguided public policy, the gaps in economic and social service infrastructure that have widened since the 1970s, and the wounds of poverty and racism alongside the long-term struggles for existence and material indulgence. Within the context of this analysis, the details of Operation Fly Trap unfold most dramatically through the inclusion of parallel renderings of the same event: the precision narrative and the disordering narrative. In the discrepant accounts of law-enforcement officers, alleged drug dealers, and their families, there is plenty to learn about the rule of law and the meaning of community.

Phillips details the emergence of gangs as a focus for federal sentencing, buttressed by the public policy sleight of hand that enabled the largely unsuccessful “War on Drugs” to be repackaged as a “War on Gangs.” Additionally, the confusion of active gang membership with less-involved gang association reveals how the reality of context is soon redefined, losing all meaning and relevance beyond the sensational. In examining how external intervention may unwittingly engender community breakdown, Phillips achieves her goal of providing a “fuller understanding of the state’s role in creating violent groups like gangs” (p. 140) by exploring how criminal justice strategies may enlarge the problems they seek to resolve.

There are conflicts and losses on each side. LAPD Lieutenant Mark Brooks clings to his vision of a safe community as

steadfastly as six-year-old Tink Tink, the godson of a drug-dealing family at the center of the book, who has already learned to reject a woman suspected—correctly, as it turns out—of being a snitch. “Don’t talk to me, because you’re a police,” he tells her, despite her entreaties.

Along with demonstrating the misdirection of public policy surrounding drugs and gang violence, the book also offers important insights about the workings of attachment, separation, and loss. The intrusion of law enforcement as it seeks to remove drug dealers with “surgical precision” yields collateral damage: family systems, bound by both blood and history, are negatively affected and social capital is destroyed. Even the fate of Tink Tink is ultimately tied to the ever-expanding circles of loss within this south Los Angeles community. Phillips likens these stresses to the reaction to a natural disaster and internalized trauma involving physical and mental illness, dislocation, and social strain. She quotes Louis Yablonsky’s generalization that “criminals do not make good fathers” (p. 71), a gloss that overlooks the complexities of fatherhood in communities in which men are frequently incarcerated. But this remains a minor misstep in this sensitive and insightful work.

The research blends rigor with tenacity, as Phillips reaches out to all 28 “Fly Trap” targets. Unsurprisingly, few respond, given the suspicion and mistrust that characterize their lives, but Phillips works hard to “unpack” the experiences of five individuals at the core of the case. She confronts the dualities of their lives alongside those of the law-enforcement officers involved, one of whom is African American (his race identical to all of the targets) but who identifies first as an LAPD officer.

Most importantly, *Operation Fly Trap* questions conventional wisdom regarding the dynamics of gang violence and community crime, instead considering the sociopolitical, economic, and racial forces that conspire—alongside drugs, mental disability, and family dysfunction—to destroy the interdependent system of social capital at work in this community. Additionally, the short-term “success” of such law-enforcement task forces yields long-term disarray: breaking down informal community mechanisms for control (including shame), damaging families, creating distrust, and sadly strengthening the cradle-to-prison pipeline. Phillips cautions that both the realities of incarceration and reentry remain to be examined. This book has a depth and richness that will undoubtedly prove meaningful to future policy development, community building, and applied research.

The Predicament of Blackness: Postcolonial Ghana and the Politics of Race

Jemima Pierre. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013. 280 pp.

Carolyn M. Rouse
Princeton University

Before reading Jemima Pierre's *The Predicament of Blackness: Postcolonial Ghana and the Politics of Race*, I had been wondering about the direction of African diaspora studies in anthropology. The turn to diaspora studies in the 1980s and 1990s was inspired by the possibility that it could do work that other cultural diffusionist models, and attendant methodologies, could not. Unlike concepts including globalization, migration, or international finance and law, diaspora captured the role of race in global subject formation.

But given current international economic and social alignments, earlier theories of race and diaspora seem almost wishful. In projects from religious evangelism to foreign direct investment, the "global South" has become deeply entangled with the "global North" in ways that trouble traditional racial, political, and economic alliances. Kamari Clarke recently tried to capture these changing postcolonial alliances in her 2010 article, "New Spheres of Transnational Formations: Mobilizations of Humanitarian Diasporas." Clarke argued that new financial and economic entanglements are reshaping diasporic subjectivities in unprecedented ways.

This is where Jemima Pierre's book comes in. Pierre, like Clarke, decimates any lingering nostalgia for a postcolonial racial utopia where blacks from around the world are able to objectify the economic and social goals of revolutionaries like Kwame Nkrumah, Sekou Toure, or W. E. B. DuBois or the latent cultural linkages celebrated by Melville Herskovits. Since colonialism, the United States and Europe have been wooing black Africans with cold hard cash and dreams of technocratic quick fixes.

The idea that racism only exists outside of Africa, as if black Africans occupy a geopolitical space free from white supremacy, is, as Pierre shows, patently false. Pierre's project in *The Predicament of Blackness* is to make racism and self-hate in Ghana visible. In this timely and brilliantly researched and executed text, Pierre unpacks how white financial largesse has made black-skinned people leery of other black-skinned people. Similar to Ira Bashkow's (2006) Orokaiva in New Guinea, most Ghanaians feel that whites are endowed with particular gifts and authority unavailable to people who possess more melanin. Ghanaians know that whites have particular weaknesses, but experience shows that white tourists, ex-pats, and NGO workers typically come with money and power. Black tourists, in contrast, often travel to Ghana on some redemptive cultural tour

to reconnect with (imagined) lost ancestry. Put bluntly, Ghanaians prefer the former. The race-conscious dystopia described by Pierre is the product of decades of failure on the part of Ghanaian leaders to free the country from European and U.S. control. Today in Ghana, neocolonialism is so welcomed that a recent headline in a major Ghanaian paper celebrated that presidential hopeful Akufo-Addo sold "Ghana to U.K. investors."¹

Each chapter in Pierre's text approaches the near absence of a liberatory black consciousness from a different perspective. Following the "Introduction," which makes the case for racialization as an important analytic in diaspora studies, chapter 1, "Of Natives and Europeans: Colonialism and the Ethnicization of Racial Dominance," examines the construction of whiteness in the Gold Coast through indirect rule. Chapter 2, "'Seek Ye First the Political Kingdom': The Postcolony and Racial Formation," describes how difficult it was for the first leaders of independent Ghana to disentangle themselves from foreign capital.

Chapter 3, "'You Are Rich Because You Are White': Marking Race and Signifying Whiteness," shows that the connections many African Americans imagine having with Ghanaians presume an economic and social history that never occurred. Chapter 4, "The Fact of Lightness: Skin Bleaching and the Colored Codes of Racial Aesthetics," reminds readers that the collapse of beauty with whiteness is not a relic of the colonial era.

In chapters 5 and 6 (respectively, "Slavery and Pan-Africanist Triumph: Heritage Tourism as State Racecraft" and "'Are You a Black American?': Race and the Politics of African-Diaspora Interactions"), Pierre demonstrates that the last vestiges of race-conscious identification with African Americans depends on mythologizing the past. By representing the slave trade and colonialism as the beginning and the end of racial exploitation, the racial dimensions of neocolonialism are made illegible. Finally, in chapter 7 ("Race across the Atlantic . . . and Back: Theorizing Africa and/in the Diaspora"), Pierre asks, "What are the ideological and conceptual precepts guiding contemporary research on Black identity formation? In what ways do the various and contentious meanings of 'Africa' remain central to cultural and political debates about community and identity?" (p. 186). The book ends with a thoroughly engaging epilogue entitled "Writing Ghana, Imaging Africa, and Interrogating Diaspora," which locates the significance of Ghana's predicament with blackness geopolitically and once again asserts the need for more empiricism in diaspora studies and more racialization theory in anthropology.

Returning to the question of African diaspora studies, what Pierre's book does is demonstrate how we, as researchers, can study race as a meaningful signifier globally while acknowledging its indeterminacy. At one point in the 20th century, there was hope that race could unite marginalized people from around the world who were loosely connected by a migratory past. But money continues to distort how those with neither money nor power experience themselves in the world. Importantly, bleaching cream can permanently scar its user, making it the perfect metaphor for Ghana's postcolonial racial dystopia.

NOTE

1. The exact title of the article is "Akufo-Addo Sells Ghana to UK Investors" (Daily Guide 2012). The article describes how then-presidential contender Nana Akufo-Addo highlighted Ghana's

investment potential as a way to attract business. The double entendre was not intentional.

REFERENCES CITED

- Baskow, Ira
2006 *The Meanings of Whitemen: Race and Modernity in the Orokaiva Cultural World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Clarke, Kamari Maxine
2010 New Spheres of Transnational Formations: Mobilizations of Humanitarian Diasporas. *Transforming Anthropology* 18(1):48–65.
- Daily Guide
2012 Akufo-Addo Sells Ghana to UK Investors. Daily Guide, June 19. <http://www.dailyguideghana.com/?p=52350>, accessed November 17, 2013.

Bodies in Formation: An Ethnography of Anatomy and Surgery Education

Rachel Prentice. *Experimental Futures series*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2012. 312 pp.

Carolyn Sufrin

University of California, San Francisco

The ritualistic and epistemological processes of training medical professionals have long been a topic of anthropological inquiry. Rachel Prentice enriches this literature with her innovative study of surgical learning *Bodies in Formation: An Ethnography of Anatomy and Surgery Education*. Prentice differentiates her approach to medical training from prior studies by focusing intensely on embodiment—not embodied experiences of patient illness but, rather, the embodied development of the surgeon herself. How, she asks, do surgeons craft their technical, ethical, and emotional selves as bodies that can enact the controlled violence of cutting open another body?

Bodies in Formation explores three elements of training: anatomic dissection, operating on live bodies, and the development of computer-simulation training technology. In each of these three sections, familiar themes of medical perception, biomedical objectification, and acquisition of professional identity appear. But the focus on embodiment of the practitioner reveals a more nuanced—and, in my view as someone who has experienced this training, more accurate—depiction of the complex integration of manual skills, cognitive abilities, and affective dispositions involved in surgical therapeutics.

The ethnographic material is based on a cumulative total of 18 months between 2001 and 2006 spent at two North American academic medical centers. Prentice enrolled in a

gross anatomy course, observed operations, and spent time in design laboratories for virtual anatomy and surgical simulation training. In each of these settings, Prentice finds that surgeons, innovators, and trainees are navigating fundamental notions of ethics in the practice of surgery.

Previous analyses of anatomy class in medical school have emphasized the detachment toward the body that students develop. This simplification, Prentice argues, rests on a representational, visual understanding of what anatomy teaches. Instead, through keen observations of the multisensory experiences of dissection, she argues that students orient their bodies toward the cadaver's body as something with an "ontological duality": sometimes it is a material object comprised of decipherable parts, and sometimes it is a socially embedded being, marked by a retained wedding ring or by the recognition of hands as tools for communication and creation. Students activate cadavers' personhood in reflective discussions, writings, and memorial services. Thus, cadaveric dissection helps students develop both a biomedical, material orientation and an affective, bodily stance toward future patients.

Three chapters bring us into operating rooms where Prentice details abdominal and arm surgeries, some done through open incisions and others through minimally invasive approaches where a camera inside the patient projects the operative site onto a screen. We read about senior surgeons who train their apprentices with hand-over-hand guidance, cautionary tales of past complications, jokes, ergonomic bodily positioning, touching bleeding blood vessels,

and silent, instructive gestures. Throughout, young surgeons learn in these bodily and social engagements that control is a virtue and that with every action there is risk of harm. This is the essence of what Prentice calls “medical embodiment”: surgeons’ cultivation of judgment about where and when to cut (and when not to) by accumulating a range of bodily experiences while operating.

Thick descriptions of surgery allow Prentice to build productively on existing theories of embodiment. She argues for a broad view that extends beyond material acts to include things that are too often considered not realizable through practice, such as affect, emotion, intuition, judgment, and ethics—all things located in the surgeons’ bodily dispositions. These are also connected to what comprises good medical care in current configurations of biotechnical medicine.

The third domain of training in *Bodies in Formation* is computer simulations of anatomy and surgical procedures. Even as designers strive for fidelity to reality, virtual learning lacks the social context of a cadaver and the risk of harming an actual patient undergoing surgery. As such, the pedagogical focus becomes repeating technical skills not

on cultivating judgment around the vital ethic of surgical control.

Bodies in Formation shows the author’s impressive ability to perceive nuance in and to bring new perspectives to a topic that has been extensively studied in the past. For good reasons, she made a deliberate choice to focus on how surgeons relate to patient bodies in the operating room. But one wonders what kind of embodied processes are missed when we are not privy to how the same surgeons engage awake patients who bear the scars of surgeons’ craft. Furthermore, there is limited consideration of how the extreme physical demands of surgical residency, including sleep deprivation, play a role in the cultivation of embodied affect and clinical reason. There is a brief discussion of recent restrictions on resident work hours but little attention to operating in states of fatigue.

Overall, *Bodies in Formation* is an important and unique contribution to literatures on biomedical training, the development of perception, and embodiment. Prentice expertly weaves different aspects of training into subtle but clear arguments about bodily practice and technological innovation as central to the formation of an ethical subject and to care.

The Accompaniment: Assembling the Contemporary

Paul Rabinow. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011. 248 pp.

Michael M. J. Fischer

Massachusetts Institute of Technology

In the best of part I’s four chapters in *The Accompaniment*, Paul Rabinow points out that Michel Foucault was not an engaged intellectual, that he wanted to keep his distance from immediate political responses, that (quoting Foucault) he strove for “a mode of permanent and refractory relationship with politics . . . philosophy’s problem is not to liberate the subject” (p. 97). Rabinow would like to style himself in a similar manner of “adjacency” and adopt the affect of *thumos* (“spirited anger”), which produced “white hot” lucidity in Foucault’s response to historians (p. 64). In the sadder (affect of *pathos*) essays on Clifford Geertz, Rabinow adopts the opinions of the shallowest of anthropology’s critics: (a) cultural relativism is the inability to make evaluative judgments (rather than a methodological obligation of at least listening before judging) and (b) the analysis of symbolic forms can only be translation into Western categories reducing the Other to the Same (rather than following the anthropologists’ and linguists’ traditions of asking how Western categories cause methodological problems for such translation). Too bad Rabinow is unable to make the connection between this work in anthropology and its forms in Foucault (“philosophical fragments in the workshop of history” [p. 64]) and to broaden the conversation beyond Europe.

Making such connections might provide the accompaniments, collaborations, and ways forward that Rabinow claims to want; it would at least provide an affect of generosity and friendship rather than the Nietzschean antagonism (parading as mere intellectual agons) against the “blinded knowledge seekers” that he claims as method (p. 4).

The role of the university and its government-funded research centers remains underanalyzed. Rabinow chastises Edward Shils and others who, in the aftermath of Senator Joseph McCarthy’s attacks on the university, attempted, perhaps misguidedly, to defend the space of the university against politicization in the civil rights and Vietnam War battles of the 1960s. But there are many slippages in Rabinow’s polemic conflating Weberian distinctions between science as technical (value neutral) and political choice of topic (value relevant), with the distinction between science and power, as well as conflating incursions of the military industrial complex on the university with those of the market and audit culture in the present. What any of this has to do (perhaps a lot) with Rabinow’s dismissal as the principal investigator (PI) for human practices at SynBERC (the NSF-funded synthetic biology coalition) remains unclear.

In part II, two important issues are raised and then evaded. First is the ways in which the research seminar (and university) needs to be reinvented now that many students come with work experience with governments or NGOs

in war-torn areas or with severe environmental problems (p. 128). Second is the powerful embedding of the work practices of the contemporary biosciences in a financial and entrepreneurial complex that encompasses governments, businesses, and academia. Rabinow has experimented with what he calls a “labinar” (lab-seminar) and with two websites, without acknowledging or collaborating with others (with a few minor exceptions) who have been engaged in similar work, and has restricted his collaboration largely to his own graduate students. Instead of acknowledging, recontextualizing, and reanimating the many collaborative research endeavors in anthropology, he simply claims they are all forgotten or discredited (p. 115). With this rhetorical sleight of hand, he can claim that anthropology is resolutely individualistic. Ironically, with his mode of engagement and his limiting of collaboration to his own graduate students, he becomes a prime exemplar of such individualism. We learn little about synthetic biology (here or in either of his other main texts on the topic), and key moments in the history of SynBERC are reported only as they affect him: we do not learn what the substance was, for instance, of the “dramatic” fight between Drew Endy and lawyer Stephen Mauer that got the latter dismissed and Rabinow and Kenneth Oye of MIT invited to replace Mauer until Rabinow himself was dismissed. The essays in part II suffer from what Rabinow himself calls their “formalism,” and much of the content on synthetic biology, SynBERC, and

postgenomics is claimed to have already been covered in his other writings: however, for instance, a footnote on postgenomics is only to his book *French DNA* (1999) on a genomics project (p. 158), and the claim that *Designing Human Practices* (2012) contains his account of synthetic biology is not supported (one learns almost nothing about the field there nor is there acknowledgment of the anthropology of work practices).

Rabinow has much to offer, and perhaps someday he will drop his defenses, irritations (p. 141), ethnomethodology of how to arrange chairs in a seminar room (p. 128), and claims to being untimely and actually provide a substantive account of, if not SynBERC, at least the issues in the course on genomics and citizenship that he taught with molecular biologist Roger Brent. Until then we have to make do with sentences like “Concepts as opposed to theory need to be constantly adjusted, remediated, and ramified” (p. 121), in which the reason that theories need no adjusting is left to one’s best imaginative fantasies.

REFERENCES CITED

Rabinow, Paul

1999 *French DNA: Trouble in Purgatory*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

2012 *Designing Human Practices: An Experiment with Synthetic Biology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Terrifying Muslims: Race and Labor in the South Asian Diaspora

Junaid Rana. Durham: Duke University Press, 2011. 240 pp.

Ahmed Afzal

State University of New York

Terrifying Muslims is a masterful study of the South Asian labor diaspora. The study focuses on transnational Pakistani labor migrants in a variety of historical, national, and cultural contexts and makes a compelling case for “the Muslim” as not only a religious category but also as a racial category that has in fact been central to global racial formations. Drawing on history, media and film representation, and ethnographic evidence, Junaid Rana’s comparative and multisited analysis is one of the few in-depth studies of Pakistani labor movements in the post-9/11 epoch and is an essential contribution to Asian studies and Asian American studies. However, the reach of this outstanding work extends far beyond diaspora studies and post-9/11 ethnographies of Muslim Americans. Indeed, *Terrifying Muslims* will be a necessary and vital reference in future scholarship on international migration and globalization, critical race studies, the state, transnational religion, neoliberal capitalism, and criminality and terror.

Organized into two main sections, the first three chapters form part I, “Racializing Muslims.” Theorizing global racial formations, in chapter 1, Rana traces the racialization of Muslims to interactions between the New World and Old World, conceptions of European and U.S. Orientalism, the transatlantic slave trade, empire building, and flawed scientific theorizing around race in the early 20th century. Significantly, these historical contexts converge to produce anti-Muslim racism that endures into the present.

Chapter 2 builds on such historical contexts to examine Islamophobia in the late 20th century and the early 21st century. In the 1980s–2000s, U.S. foreign policy constructed terrorism as enemy of the state and as a legitimate site of state violence and biopolitics. Equally, it marked and produced certain nationality groups, such as Pakistani immigrants, as a terror threat. Using notions such as moral panic and Islamic peril and terror, Rana shows how global racial systems incorporate the “dangerous Muslim” as a racial category that is policed by the state. This category is central in anti-immigrant ideologies, practices, and narratives that construct illegality

and criminality. Rana elaborates on an example of a FBI alert in 2002 that identified five individuals as illegal immigrants and terrorist threats without concrete evidence to substantiate this assessment. That the media interpreted the alert as truth and as cause for moral panic recasts terrorism as “manufactured fear,” premised on gendered constructions of categories such as “friend” and “enemy.”

Chapter 3 builds on such historical and contemporary constructions of the racialized Muslim to theorize transnational labor movements. Rana’s analysis of ethnographic cinema—notably, a U.S. television series, *Sleeper Cell* (2005–06), and Hollywood film, *Syriana* (2003)—illustrates how a global racial system and neoliberal economy have marginalized and homogenized South Asian labor migrants, eliding differences of class, education, national origin, and even religion to represent them as potentially dangerous. Importantly, such mediated representations of the Muslim are informed by national histories such as the civil rights movement in the United States and transnational labor migrations during the 20th century.

In part II, “Globalizing Labor,” Rana relates global racial formations to his rich multisited ethnography of labor agencies and return migrants in Pakistan and the Pakistani labor diaspora in the United Arab Emirates and the United States. Drawing on historical data on South Asian labor migrations to the British colonies, as well as ethnographic insights about contemporary labor flows, Rana shows how global imperial capitalism and the contemporary neoliberal economy consolidate notions of illegality in population movements. Referring to narratives of Pakistani transmigrants, Rana argues that participation in revivalist movements in Islam in the late 20th century represents an important strategy to negotiate experiences of abjection, illegality, and racism following 9/11. Chapter 5 draws on ethnographic data to interro-

gate illegality as a “political identity and subjectivity that is produced through the state” (p. 140) and embedded in processes of racialization within the U.S. empire. Importantly, illegality is integral to the workings of the migration industry that is built on classed, gendered, and racialized gradations of transnational population movements.

The post-9/11 state-endorsed racism, as illustrated in the U.S. deportation and detention regime, also operates at the level of biopolitics and the body—the subject of chapter 6. For Pakistani migrants who returned to Pakistan in large numbers following 9/11, state technologies of violence including torture exemplify “the dangers inherent in the U.S. immigration system and the brutality of the [U.S.] state’s policing powers” (pp. 153–154) and provide an important context for understanding the rationale for return.

In *Terrifying Muslims*, Rana astutely argues that the post-9/11 racialized Muslim as militant, terrorist, and threat to the nation finds continuities with the past. Rana shows how labor migration is incorporated into global racial system and how it “follows colonial, postcolonial, and imperial trajectories that maintain hierarchies through a racial logic” (p. 177). *Terrifying Muslims* is an exemplary study and should be required reading for anyone interested in understanding the complexities of transnational labor movements and the predicament of Muslims in the early 21st century.

REFERENCES CITED

- Sleeper Cell* [TV series]
2005–06 Ethan Reiff and Cyrus Voris, creators. Season 1: 10 episodes; Season 2: 8 episodes. 60 mins/episode. Showtime. New York.
- Syriana*
2005 Stephen Gaghan, dir. 128 min. Warner Bros. Burbank.

Exhuming Loss: Memory, Materiality and Mass Graves of the Spanish Civil War

Layla Renshaw. *Critical Cultural Heritage series*. Walnut Creek: Left Coast, 2011. 259 pp.

Francisco Ferrándiz

Spanish National Research Council (CSIC), Madrid

This important and pioneering book has the merit of being the first full-fledged monograph on 21st-century Spanish Civil War exhumations. During the war (1936–1939)—and later in the early postwar years—tens of thousands of civilians were executed by paramilitaries linked to Francisco Franco’s rebel rearguard army and thrown into unmarked mass graves throughout the country. Abandoned to their fate for decades (dictatorship, transition to democracy, and 20th-century democracy), these mass graves are now be-

ing exhumed, to the country’s astonishment. Renshaw’s groundbreaking study is based primarily on field research conducted during excavations performed in 2003 and 2004 and concentrates on two nearby sites in the province of Burgos.

In *Exhuming Loss*, Renshaw chiefly focuses on the local impact of these exhumations. To differentiate the preconceptions and agendas of the different social actors involved, she defines three main constituencies, selecting informants in each category: (a) the relatives of those being exhumed; (b) the memorial associations, most specifically the Asociación para la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica (ARMH),

which coordinated the exhumations she participated in; and (c) the technical teams. Drawing on the author's knowledge of ethnographies in Spain, especially those written in English, chapter 1 sorts out the memory politics behind mass grave exhumations and assesses the extent to which the associative movement has managed to break open the "pact of silence" established by the political elites after Franco's death by fostering a "Republican identity"—a debate that is, in my view, problematically framed by the author (pp. 54–63). In chapter 2, Renshaw analyzes the origins, meaning, and political scope of the memory idioms of Republican loss and victimhood that emerge in relatives' and survivors' testimonies as well as in the public discourses put forth by the main historical memory associations.

Chapters 3–5 focus more specifically on the transformations and shifts that material objects—skeletons, personal objects, bullets, documents, mementos, and photographs—and material practices undergo before, during, and after the two exhumations that Renshaw analyzes. In these chapters, the author presents data that is closer to her area of expertise. It is also where the book is most engaging and theoretically grounded. The sequential approach in these chapters allows for the critical study of the many routes of anticipation experienced in relation to the possibility of exhuming a particular grave (pp. 121–146), the impact of the gradual exposure of the bones and objects (pp. 147–184), and, finally, the anxieties created by dismembering of skeletons when they are packed for the lab and the complex negotiations that take place in relation to the return and reburial of remains (pp. 185–224). Throughout this section, Renshaw uses a very dynamic perspective that considers "the dead and their traces as part of the material culture of the living" (p. 27) and incorporates objects' very agency into her ethnographic analysis. This is most vividly illustrated in the case of the remarkable social life of the "cardboard fathers," photographs of those executed (pp. 131–136); in the shifting interpretations of the bodies' anatomical assemblage (pp. 151–156); and in the emergence of a visual canon to portray mass graves and their products (pp. 167–177).

Besides the book's undeniable virtues, a word of caution is needed for readers who aim to extrapolate specific conclusions as a description of Spain's broad, complex, and ever-changing use of exhumations in the last decade. In *Exhuming Loss*, Renshaw has made a significant contribution to the understanding of the logic and impact of these excavations,

especially through her detailed study of the transformations in the different scales and repertoires of material objects associated to these investigations. Yet, due to the time frame of her field research, to the dynamism of the exhumation process itself, and to some gaps in the author's use of the literature written on this topic up to 2010, Renshaw's study does not—and, in fact, could not—factor in major changes in the exhumation process after 2006. These changes—which include the establishment of a line of government funding that supported exhumations between 2006–2011; the development of public memory policies in some regions; the feasibility and increasing prestige of DNA identifications; the popularization of digital technologies and the use of new media to deploy emergent memorial practices; the controversial passing of a Memory Act in Parliament in late 2007; and Judge Baltasar Garzón's failed attempt to use international human rights law to indict Francoism (Escudero 2011; Etxeberria 2012; Ferrándiz 2013)—have radically transformed exhumation practices. All of them directly affect the main theme in Renshaw's text.

Having weighed its strengths and limitations, the book is a must-read analysis of Spanish exhumations conducted prior to 2006, as it paves the way to further studies of the events thereafter. While many of Renshaw's insights eloquently hold despite the passing of time, thus proving the author's remarkable scholarship and intuition, others have swiftly aged, as tends to be the case in such fast-moving processes. Scholars and students of human rights, the archaeology of conflict, forensic anthropology, and the anthropology of violence and social suffering will greatly benefit from reading this engaging book.

REFERENCES CITED

- Escudero, Rafael, coord.
2011 *Diccionario de memoria histórica* [A dictionary of historical memory in Spain]. Madrid: Catarata.
- Etxeberria, Francisco
2012 *Exhumaciones contemporáneas en España: Las fosas comunes de la Guerra Civil* [Contemporary exhumations in Spain: Civil War mass graves]. *Boletín Galego de Medicina Legal e Forense* [Galician Bulletin of Forensic and Legal Medicine] 18:13–28.
- Ferrándiz, Francisco
2013 *Exhuming the Defeated: Civil War Mass Graves in 21st-Century Spain*. *American Ethnologist* 40(1):38–54.

Social Zooarchaeology: Humans and Animals in Prehistory

Nerissa Russell. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012. 560 pp.

Amber VanDerwarker

University of California, Santa Barbara

Nerissa Russell's recently published text, *Social Zooarchaeology*, fills a substantial and significant gap in the literature on the theorization, analysis, and synthesis of the specialty of zooarchaeology. This text, published in 2012 by the University of Cambridge Press, will undoubtedly become a requisite tome for all zooarchaeological practitioners, to be found on the shelf next to Elizabeth Reitz and Elizabeth Wing's (2008) *Zooarchaeology* and Lee Lyman's (1994) *Vertebrate Taphonomy* (both also published by Cambridge University Press), as well as Donald Grayson's (1984) *Quantitative Zooarchaeology*. The significance of this volume, however, stretches beyond the specialty of zooarchaeology in that it provides comprehensive reviews of key topics and debates in archaeology that continue to resonate in the literature (e.g., Pleistocene megafaunal extinctions and the debate between human overkill and climate change as catalysts for extinction). Newcomers to any of the topics and debates treated by Russell should begin their education with this book in order to get a handle on the issues involved and the set of literature cited by Russell, which is utterly comprehensive. Below I detail the issues that Russell considers in her book, but first it is important to state that this is not a text on how to identify animal bones, sort out natural versus cultural deposits or modifying agents, or quantify and analyze faunal data; those texts already exist and provide the baseline for conducting primary zooarchaeological analysis. Rather, Russell considers what comes after the identification and analysis—that is, the connection between the faunal data and the humans that created the record. Russell's perspective moves past basic subsistence reconstruction and embeds the faunal record in the social world of humans.

The book is organized around several key topics and debates in the archaeological literature, for which Russell provides a balanced and nuanced treatment of various competing perspectives. The topics include animal symbolism, the origins of animal domestication, the murky area between wild and domesticated animals (e.g., the taming, management, and relocation of animals), Pleistocene megafaunal extinctions, early human hunting versus scavenging, the ritual use of animals, recognizing animals as pets, origins of dog domestication, systems of animal wealth (including the generation of social inequality, the connection to early agriculture, and implications for gender relations), game as property, meat sharing, feasting, and uses of animals as sources of medicine. Russell refers to relevant archaeological literature on these topics but also cites key ethnographic

sources, which provide a broader context for interpreting the connection between animal bones and human sociality. In terms of structure and execution, the writing is quite accessible to the nonspecialist, meaning that any archaeologist (or anthropologist for that matter) should be able to read and distill Russell's arguments without reference to a zooarchaeological glossary. I can imagine using this book as a formal text in my zooarchaeology courses, as a source for lecture notes for more general anthropology courses in which I cover topics related to the issues synthesized in the text, or as a reference source for the extensive list of primary references in the bibliography (142 pages in length).

The book is divided into ten chapters of varying lengths, covering the topics listed above; each chapter consists of several sections broken up by descriptive headings. For example, the chapter "Animals in Ritual" is broken into subtopics of ritual treatment of animal remains, sacrifice and ritual killing, divination, dancing with animals, and the zooarchaeology of ritual. The book's manner of organization thus makes it easy to quickly locate passages of interest to those who do not have time to read the book cover to cover. My only slightly negative comment is that the index could be better, as it is only six pages and consists almost entirely of geographic place names and archaeological periods and cultures, with very little topical or thematic coverage and no indexing of authors cited in the text. And while all scholars lament poor indexing when they are scouring a book for key source material, this one drawback to Russell's stunning and unprecedented synthesis of social approaches to zooarchaeological data is not enough to detract from its value to the discipline at large and to individual researchers, instructors, graduate students, and undergraduate students. As a practicing archaeologist with an interest in the social uses of food, I will be consulting this book regularly as I pursue my own research agendas.

REFERENCES CITED

- Grayson, Donald K.
1984 *Quantitative Zooarchaeology: Topics in the Analysis of Archaeological Faunas*. Studies in Archaeology series. Waltham: Academic.
- Lyman, R. Lee
1994 *Vertebrate Taphonomy*. Cambridge Manuals in Archaeology. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Reitz, Elizabeth J., and Elizabeth S. Wing
2008 *Zooarchaeology*. Cambridge Manuals in Archaeology. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

What Kinship Is—And Is Not

Marshall Sahlins. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012. 120 pp.

Dwight Read

University of California, Los Angeles

Despite proclamations to the contrary, kinship is alive and well, as attested by recently published books focusing on kinship and by major sessions on kinship held as part of the last several AAA meetings. Papers in these sessions have discussed topics ranging from the connection between past and present research on kinship to new research addressing fundamental questions regarding what constitutes kinship. The latter is the subject of this short book by Marshall Sahlins.

The two chapters making up the book present Sahlins's take on what kinship is and what it is not—hence the title of the book. The underlying premise is that kinship is grounded in “mutuality of being” (p. 2), whereby “kinfolk are members of one another, intrinsic to each other's identity and existence” (p. 62). Unlike biological relations, where “relation” is our construct used to explore the biological consequences arising from biological reproduction, mutuality of being invokes the widespread view, as evidenced by Sahlins through numerous quotes, that kinship begins with the perception of connectedness, or mutuality of being, between persons. Sahlins directs our attention to the view expressed in many groups that there is no fully contained, completely isolated self. Thus, kinship, he states, does not begin with a self–other opposition that assumes the self exists separately from the other but, rather, with a conjoined self and other, or what he refers to as the “kinship I” (pp. 35–36), using an expression borrowed from Jørgen Johansen's (1954) ethnographic account of the Maori. The “kinship I” becomes a self–other opposition (p. 33) in which the other is divided and structured by the relations identified through a kinship terminology (p. 29). From this perspective, the self exists in the other and in each of its divisions: that is, mutuality of being determines the domain of kinship, thereby countering David Schneider's (1972) simplistic claim that the ontological similarities in American kinship with nationalism and religion mean that kinship does not exist (pp. 15, 60).

The first chapter leads us to the radical and controversial conjecture, taken up in the second chapter, that rather than kinship being derived from biological reproduction through extension and metaphor, it is the reverse: “the relations of birth are reflexes of the greater kinship order and are incorporated within that order . . . what is reproduced in the birth is a system of kinship relations and categories in which the child is given a specific position and positional value” (p. 65). Calling what people say about reproduction “theories of procreation,” Sahlins says, already presumes that what is being said is merely their attempt to account for the bio-

logical process of reproduction: “It is as if these were just so many mistaken ideas of the physiology of conception” (p. 74). Instead, he argues, we should begin by understanding that what is being said is not a treatise on the physiology of conception but, rather, an account of how a child is being situated in a “structured field of kinship relations” (p. 74) through conception and birth. It is not the degree of concordance between their “theory” and our biological account that we should focus on, he explains, but what they are saying about how the biological reality of conception and birth is the vessel, as it were, for contents expressing how a child becomes situated in a field of social relations. The vessel—the biological process of reproduction—does not engender kinship, and if we strip it away, we are left with the contents, namely kinship, as Sahlins quotes from Eduardo Viveiros de Castro (2009:241): “Kinship here [in Amazonia] is what you have when you ‘do without’ a biological theory of relationality” (p. 89). The distinction being made is similar to what Jane Goodale (1994) reports for the Tiwi in her book, *Tiwi Wives*. She writes that while the Tiwi recognize coitus as being necessary for the birth of a human, it is not sufficient (and not even important) for the birth of a Tiwi child; the latter cannot occur without the father's dreaming, for it is only through the dreaming that the child's social identity is determined. We can paraphrase this as saying that creating a member of *Homo sapiens* is a biological act with sociological prerequisites; creating “one of us” is a social act with biological prerequisites. The biological process by which the former takes place is not the culturally constituted process by which the latter takes place, and it is this difference, rather than its biological underpinnings, that Sahlins says is critical for understanding what kinship is.

REFERENCES CITED

- Goodale, Jane
1994 *Tiwi Wives: A Study of the Women of Melville Island, North Australia*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland.
- Johansen, Jørgen
1954 *The Maori and His Religion*. Copenhagen: Munksgaard.
- Schneider, David
1972 What Is Kinship All About? *In Kinship Studies in the Morgan Centennial Year*. Priscilla Reining, ed. Pp. 32–63. Washington, DC: Anthropological Society of Washington DC.
- Viveiros de Castro, Eduardo
2009 The Gift and the Given: Three Nano-Essays on Kinship and Magic. *In Kinship and Beyond: The Genealogical Model Reconsidered*. Sandra C. Bamford and James Leach, eds. Pp. 236–268. New York: Berghahn.

Beauty and the Beast

Michael Taussig. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012. 192 pp.

Virginia Blum

University of Kentucky

Beauty and the Beast is an apt title for a book that intentionally frames its subject, as the author tells us, in fairy-tale terms. He renames cosmetic surgery “cosmic surgery” both to underscore the fairy-tale quality of such transformational surgeries and to speak to the range of forces at work in their proliferation. While *Beauty and the Beast* certainly has fairy-tale aspects, filled as it is with seemingly fantastical accounts of surgical shape-shiftings and astonishing wealth yoked to unimaginable evil, it is also a kind of morality tale. The falseness of surgical transformation, we learn time and again, is linked to all that has gone wrong not only in Colombia, where the author has been doing fieldwork since 1969, but also worldwide, as we all reel in the aftershock of corporate and political predations on a global scale.

This is not to say this book isn’t a brilliant morality tale, but it is a morality tale nonetheless. The thing about cosmetic surgery is that it is hard to avoid being either for or against—ultimately either celebrating the body’s fluidity or lamenting the practice as the most overt symptom of a world given over to excess of all kinds, including the subordination of the inner self to its corporeal transformations. That Taussig links such excess and inauthenticity to the murderous paramilitary and drug cartels is what makes his project a distinctive contribution to the scholarship on cosmetic surgery culture.

I am reminded of two other morality tales about the tragic consequences of hyperconsumerism. The first is Bret Easton Ellis’s 1991 satire *American Psycho*, which suggests that the dizzying ascendance of Wall Street profits and consumer culture amounted to class murder. Patrick Bateman, a privileged and style-obsessed investment banker by day, is a serial killer by night whose favorite targets are prostitutes and homeless people. Similar to Taussig, Ellis chronicles the apotheosis of the rich person’s body as a site for excess spending, while the poor, by contrast, are ugly, disposable, anonymous, as though an altogether different species. The second fable of the excesses of the 1980s, Jennie Livingston’s 1990 documentary film *Paris Is Burning*, juxtaposes the poor black and Latino gay male community’s drag balls with images of the expensive (“real”) fashions to which they aspire. And, like Taussig, Ellis and Livingston give us fairy-tale-like takes on their respective odes to metamorphosis (the beauty-to-beast transformations of the quick-change artist, serial killer Bateman, and the Cinderella-esque drag ball makeovers by some of the poorest denizens of New York City). As transgender drag queen Venus Xtravaganza famously, heartbreakingly muses, “I want to be a spoiled rich

white girl living in the suburbs.” Well, the girls in Colombia, Taussig relates, want to grow up to be the girlfriend of a rich narco; and it is toward this end that they commit to extensive surgical makeovers.

While the pursuit of beauty is an effort to escape mortality, mortality is thus inevitably tied to beauty’s fleetingness. Colombians, we learn, are simultaneously preoccupied with bodily beautification and take for granted their context of wide-scale, state-sanctioned murders. Taussig is also interested in the degree to which the near-ritual mutilations performed by the terror machinery of Colombia look a lot like the obverse side of cosmetic surgery. Oddly enough, he remarks, Columbians seem more concerned with the failed outcomes of cosmetic surgery—from drooping butt implants and exploding breasts to eyes unintentionally and permanently sutured open—as though to displace the very real stories of brutality and terror that surround them onto a cosmetic surgery morality tale of wresting from the universe an undeserved beauty.

Taussig dates the origin of this preoccupation with the body and its transformational possibilities to the changing material circumstances of Columbia, which was a small farm-based economy until it was overtaken by agribusinesses in the 1950s. This “body,” he writes, is “now targeted by cosmic surgery in the force field of a peasant economy wracked by war and agribusiness” (p. 65). He continues, “It is the young, especially the young, who carry this new history on their bodies, as if, now landless, all the minutiae of care once bestowed on their intricate farms of trees, has been transferred to the care of the appearance of the body” (p. 73). “Cosmic surgery” with its transformations of flesh into image is an extreme instance of the disappearance of the centrality of the human from material and social landscapes. Surgeons don’t just remake women in the image of the narco’s fantasy playmate; they also reconfigure (multiple times) the faces of wanted criminals. Taussig is onto something crucial about bodily transformation, aesthetic judgment, and the murderous uncontained rage unleashed on human life, the sacrifice of which is seemingly requisite in the amassing of the “godlike” fortunes of the drug lords. What are these fortunes concerned with, moreover, but the accumulation of exquisitely crafted surfaces (cars, suits, women)? Like a closet full of expensive tailored shirts, Taussig suggests, the surgically enhanced girlfriend’s body is simply another piece of the wardrobe.

REFERENCES CITED

- Ellis, Bret Easton
1991 *American Psycho*. New York: Vintage.
- Livingston, Jennie
1990 *Paris Is Burning*. 71 min. Miramax Films. Santa Monica.

Wayward Shamans: The Prehistory of an Idea

Silvia Tomášková. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013. 288 pp.

Christine S. VanPool

University of Missouri

Have you ever presented an idea even though you know it has not been established? Well, I did so a few semesters ago when teaching a class on the anthropology of shamanism. During that course, my students would ask very insightful questions, and I was on occasion forced to say something like “that issue hasn’t been fully explored, but my impression is . . .” I wish I had this book when I taught that class. Silvia Tomášková’s detailed history of Siberia and of our fascination with its landscape and shamanic traditions would have made it much easier to field questions.

Tomášková provides both a history of research into and an analysis of the changing perspectives used to study Siberia’s shamanism. As we examine how early explorers and priests, and later ethnographers and social scientists, defined shamans, we learn a great deal about the changing perception of shamans over the years. This in turn provides a robust theoretical examination of Western thought and the development of anthropology, while also providing greater insight into Siberian shamanism. The conceptual trends that Tomášková identifies are further applicable beyond the confines of Siberia. In South America, for example, I have identified similar changes as early Spanish accounts that labeled shamans as devil worshipers were replaced by early anthropologists who considered them magicians practicing trickery, which were themselves replaced by more recent psychological analyses that considered them “mentally deranged.” Tomášková’s focus on the “homeland,” where the term *shaman* was originally defined, makes her analysis particularly significant. She brilliantly demonstrates these changes by examining Siberia history to show the nuances and complexities of how the term *shaman* developed and how it is not (and never was) a tidy term that can be used to pigeonhole people into a specific religion. This point is wonderfully presented in chapter 5, “Sex, Gender, and Encounters with Spirits.” Tomášková shows how the early Victorian explorers were baffled by cross-dressing men doing lowly women’s work while also having the high status of a male religious practitioner that Victorian thinking held they should. This contrasts with early-20th-century social scientists who were fixated on fitting male shamans into their unilinear schemes. There are limits to Tomášková’s analysis, though. Her work is primarily historical, so she does not discuss in detail modern anthropological conceptions such as third and fourth genders, which are gaining

acceptance in some circles. Still, Tomášková’s discussions of Siberian women and of the “Invention of Siberian Ethnology” (ch. 4) will make her argument relevant to those using more current conceptual frameworks.

Tomášková explores the connection between the researchers’ worldviews and their view (and treatment) of shamans. The early explorers had a different worldview that included the idea of spirits. Priests were not surprised by shamans when they encountered them—this is something I assert in many of my classes, so I am delighted to see this idea thoroughly explored in this book. The acceptance of aspects of the shamans’ spiritual claims was significant. In the U.S. Southwest, the first explorer-priests were wary of shamans and banned them from conducting their rituals. Not surprisingly, Tomášková noted a similar trend in parts of Siberia that were closest to Western civilization. She also documents how such intellectual traditions were challenged or modified. In his courses on European archaeology, Professor Lawrence G. Straus mentioned that Henri Breuil, the “Father of Prehistory,” was a Catholic priest. The implications of this did not fully hit me until chapter 7, when Tomášková discusses how skillfully he sidestepped the Catholic Church’s concerns with science. I am sure there is more to this science-priest than Tomášková has written here, and I hope she continues to pursue this topic. Chapter 7 is actually a nifty discussion on science and religion, and one that is important in today’s world, in which evolution and religion seems to be at war in the public schools. Again even this point supports Tomášková’s thesis that examining shamans provides us a critical way of looking at our own theoretical constructs.

Ultimately, scholars studying a variety of topics will find this book useful. Historians of anthropology will benefit from a much-needed look at Russian, German, and French documents that provide us with important details that seem to have been lost to time (or at least to U.S. scholars). Scholars interested in anthropological theory will profit from both a general outline of changing perspectives and especially from a consideration of how these perspectives articulated with real-world data to manifest themselves as analytically useful conceptual structures. Those interested in the study of shamanism will likewise benefit from the ethnographic information and historical analysis of the development of this concept, especially given the current debate over the appropriateness of the concept. People on both sides of the debate will find Tomášková’s work useful. I thoroughly enjoyed this book.

The Challenge of Epistemology: Anthropological Perspectives

Christina Toren and João de Pina-Cabral, eds. New York: Berghahn, 2011. 228 pp.

Robert H. Layton
Durham University

How is it that we can and do live the peopled world differently from one another yet all find our ideas of it by and large confirmed? This is a question that has fascinated anthropology at least since the pioneering studies by E. E. Evans-Pritchard in *Witchcraft, Oracles and Magic* (1937) and Godfrey Lienhardt's *Divinity and Experience* (1961). Christina Toren and João de Pina-Cabral's volume presents a variety of approaches by contemporary anthropologists to epistemology (what it is to know) and ontology (what exists), intended to show how we can understand others without assimilating them to our own perspective and instead treat other peoples' ideas of humanity and sociality as equally valid as our own.

The bottom line is that ethnography gains a purchase on the lived world. "Ethnography," the editors write, "reveals a plurality of ontologies, but this should not lead one to deny the existence of a single world" (p. 13). Even Jadran Mimica, in his contribution on the Canaques of Papua New Guinea, for whom dreams are as real as waking life, concedes that the Canaques must recognize the practical dangers of hitting a stone or falling into a fire if they are to survive. The catch is that verifiable truth does not exist independently of knowing consciousness. Knowledge is always embodied in culturally mediated forms; there can be no "naked" knowledge of the real world.

Peter Gow's chapter provides a good introduction to some of the issues (although not that of translatability). Traditional farming in the Scottish Highlands, as described by Gow and practiced by his ancestors until the clearances, relied on practical knowledge gained over centuries, supported by social customs such as common rights to grazing and social kinship between landlord and tenant. The Scottish Enlightenment offered an alternative rationality, in which private property signaled progress and justified the dispossession of tenants. J. M. Neeson (1993) documented how similar arguments were used to justify the English enclosures and deny the rationality of existing community organization, relegating smallholders to the status of primitive tribesmen. Knowledge, in the Scottish Enlightenment, was intended to be used for practical ends.

Marcio Goldman's chapter on understanding "fetishism," as exemplified by *candomblé* in Brazil, provides a lucid case study in translating culture. What, he asks, was the process by which a small statue of the *orixá* (orisha) Exu (Eshu), which Goldman had found in a market, became

animated by the *orixá* Exu himself? His friend Gilmar, who performs the necessary ritual, enlightens him. Has Gilmar made the statue into a divinity? No. There is a finite number of *orixá*, but anyone can have their personal Exu or Ogum; the *orixá* singles certain people out for initiation. Stones and metal objects also have *orixá* from the beginning, but to become *orixá* they must seek someone out to perform the necessary ritual. Our instructors in the field are also theoreticians, Goldman concludes.

Both reference and signification in language are key to the success of such dialogue. Filipe Carreira da Silva and Mónica Brito Vieira, citing Ludwig Wittgenstein, downplay reference and emphasize signification—that is, the meaning of a term established by usage within a system of contrasting terms, a "language game." (Fortunately such games are penetrable because terms universal to modern human language include *before*, *after*, *like* [i.e., resembles], and *because*; see Wierzbicka 1996). Yoshinobu Ota takes a more balanced view in proposing that the fantastic tales told in rural Guatemala of people who sacrifice their kin for financial gain can both be interpreted in terms of the rules internal to the culture—in this case, what is believable in the context of rapid change, and in terms of reference to a reality that exists independently of the consciousness that mediates it.

Ota's contribution is particularly valuable because, as a Japanese citizen, he can provide a "native" perspective on Ruth Benedict's (1946) interpretation of Japanese society and culture in *The Chrysanthemum and the Sword*. He commends Benedict for drawing to her readers' attention that U.S. society is just as strongly mediated by the implicit values of U.S. culture as Japanese society is mediated by Japanese culture. Both Ota and Tony Crook are critical of anthropologists (Fredrik Barth, Marcel Griaule) who believed their native instructors were concealing the truth about their religion—a transparent but hidden cultural reality—behind oblique statements.

Susana Matos Viegas considers how we can generalize from the myriad of possible ways of existing in the world that anthropology reveals without "flattening" differences between people and homogenizing them. When we make meaning out of face-to-face relationships, she argues, we are already making connections to a multiplicity of "platforms of knowledge," and we can best generalize by analyzing how meanings are established, challenged, and altered in a variety of settings. Each contributor to this volume provides a challenging and interesting example of such an exercise.

REFERENCES CITED

- Benedict, Ruth
1946 *The Chrysanthemum and the Sword: Patterns of Japanese Culture*. Cleveland: Meridian.
- Evans-Pritchard, E. E.
1937 *Witchcraft, Oracles and Magic among the Azande*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Lienhardt, Godfrey
1961 *Divinity and Experience: The Religion of the Dinka*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Neeson, J. M.
1993 *Commoners: Common Right, Enclosure and Social Change in England, 1700–1820*. Past and Present Publications series. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wierzbicka, Anna
1996 *Semantics: Primes and Universals*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

A Companion to Chinese Archaeology

Anne P. Underhill, ed. *Blackwell Companions to Anthropology series*. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013. 664 pp.

Sheahan Bestel

University of Toronto

In *A Companion to Chinese Archaeology*, Anne Underhill has collected a formidable range of chapters dealing with current issues in Neolithic and predynastic Chinese archaeology. Scholars at the forefront of the discipline from both China and abroad have contributed to this edited volume, the scope of which covers the Neolithic period and early Bronze Age from approximately 7000 B.C.E. to the end of the Shang dynasty at circa 1045 B.C.E. This particular temporal focus places several issues that have captured the attention of international archaeologists outside the time frame of the book, including the difficulties of reconciling written Chinese history with the archaeological record and, as Underhill herself notes (p. 5), debates surrounding the origins of agriculture. This allows Underhill to clarify and focus research and debate on the topic for which she is best known: that of emerging social complexity in the Chinese Neolithic.

The range of authors showcased exhibits varying theoretical viewpoints, including a mix of old and new approaches to archaeology. The evolution of Neolithic civilization from matrilineal to patrilineal society is discussed within a Marxist-inspired framework (pp. 181–182). The discussion of Peiligang grinding implements as agricultural proxies (p. 174), despite recent research to the contrary (Liu et al. 2010), further balances other approaches in the volume (see p. 391). The end result is a composite volume that allows readers to experience the true flavor of Chinese archaeology at the beginnings of the 21st century.

The stated aim of the book is to provide English readers with new data to assist understanding of regional variations in social, political, and economic variation across time (p. 1). Underhill also attempts to illustrate a range of research on diverse topics rather than covering one topic in detail (p. 5). In an important commentary on the current state of archaeological research in China, Underhill notes that drawbacks to current research in Chinese archaeology include a greater need for “communication among archaeologists, historians

and ethnologists beyond modern political borders” (p. 9). Comprising as it does viewpoints from scholars in China and abroad, her book is an excellent step in the right direction when it comes to breaking down theoretical, linguistic, and geographical boundaries between researchers.

Aside from an introduction by the editor and the discussion of “archaeological heritage management” in China (p. 14), the book is loosely organized by geographic region. These regions include locations where international archaeological attention has been focused in recent decades, allowing the editor to avoid the “laundry-list” style of reporting archaeological excavations common in Chinese archaeology. While such reporting is necessary in a rapidly developing country with so much built history and archaeology, it is at odds with Western styles of ideal archaeological reporting, which involve a research question steeped in a theoretical or methodological problem to be solved. Regions omitted from the book include politically sensitive areas in which foreigners are generally restricted from working, including Tibet and the Xinjiang region. As Underhill notes (p. 6), local archaeologists from these areas have not provided reports for the book, and coverage of these areas would require other volumes to be written.

Most archaeologists worry about the protection of cultural relics (Underhill, p. 7). An important step toward protecting China’s vast archaeological heritage is to provide publicity around the problem, thereby allowing discussion and debate on how to resolve a challenge common to many countries. Robert Murowchick’s chapter describes the scale of the problem, including in some cases the use of dynamite to blow open tomb entrances (p. 14). While the Chinese government has tried very hard to stem the loss of antiquities out of China, the role of foreigners in purchasing and displaying unprovenanced artifacts in both museums and private collections contributes to the desecration of Chinese heritage (p. 15). Urban development appears to be another contributor to the loss of Chinese archaeological heritage (Murowchick, p. 25), with the destruction of thousands of sites since they were first recorded in the early 1980s.

One important aspect of the book is the use of Chinese characters throughout to introduce names and specific terms such as the types of pottery vessel forms (p. 11) that are less meaningful when transcribed in pinyin. This allows both English-language and Chinese-language readers to understand and translate new terms and to use the book as a Chinese-English archaeological dictionary. It is hoped that more books will follow the excellent, entertaining, and schol-

arly example set by Underhill and her contributors in this volume.

REFERENCE CITED

- Liu Li, Judith Field, Richard Fullagar, Sheahan Bestel, Xingcan Chen, and Xiaolin Ma
2010 What Did Grinding Stones Grind? New Light on Early Neolithic Subsistence Economy in the Middle Yellow River Valley, China. *Antiquity* 84(325):816–833.

Mexican Americans across Generations: Immigrant Families, Racial Realities

Jessica M. Vasquez. New York: New York University Press, 2011. 314 pp.

Ana Elizabeth Rosas

University of California, Irvine

Jessica M. Vasquez's *Mexican Americans across Generations: Immigrant Families, Racial Realities* is a thoroughly engaging consideration of the family histories of middle-class Mexican Americans in the United States. By investigating how such families experienced themselves as a race as opposed to an ethnic group, and how such experience is different for each successive generation, she argues that these families' ethnic, class, and racial identities and feelings of national inclusion or exclusion changed over time due to their interactions within family generations. Her nuanced and in-depth interrogation of the persistence and change in the scope and resonance of family conversations that centered on the history of their families in the United States urges scholars in anthropology and related fields of inquiry to embrace the investigation of the generational diversity of the Mexican American middle class to better understand the messiness of assimilation as a process and experience in U.S. society. Beginning in the early 20th century and working her way into the contemporary moment, Vasquez demonstrates that each generation of Mexican American middle-class families identified and explained patterns in which the occurrence of racialization significantly influenced the speed and direction with which they pursued belonging in U.S. society. Moving past these families being treated as a threat to the nation due to their language and fertility, this scholar mines how family separation, subordination, and racialization impacted their thinking on ethnicity and race across generations.

Vasquez's research is comprised of in-depth interviews and conversations with Mexican American middle-class families throughout the United States, and its strength lies in her examination of the intergenerational communication among these Mexican immigrants, Mexican Americans, their children, and their grandchildren. This approach demonstrates

that, indeed, Mexican American middle-class families became increasingly embedded in U.S. institutions with each successive generation as a result of sharing their thoughts on ethnicity and race with each other. Her rich combination of interviews and conversations with these families reveals that each generation used the experiential and family memory aspects of their racialization in U.S. society to discuss and negotiate the content, meanings, boundaries, and constraints of their Mexican American identity in the United States. Rigorous analysis of the resonance of frank conversations shared across generations of children, women, and men elucidates that Mexican American families were unafraid to discuss difficult chapters in the history of their families with each other in their attempt to make each successive family generation's transition into adulthood and U.S. society less alienating.

The first part of this anthropological investigation rests on the concept of "thinned attachment." Vasquez defines Mexican American middle-class families whose commitment to and familiarity with their Mexican heritage wanes over time as experiencing and using thinned attachment to their ethnic identity to confront their racialization in U.S. society across the generations. "Thinned attachment" is used to specifically refer to these families' tendency to not speak Spanish over time and their aversion to restrictively patriarchal gender roles. She uses this concept to argue that Mexican American families risked losing some connections to their ethnic identity while remaining aware of their cultural background but not bound by it. In placing an explicit emphasis on the elements that propelled these families to reflect on their ethnic and racial identity with each other, she illustrates that their attachment to their ethnic identity is highly contingent on generation, family orientation, social context, and the historical moment.

The second part of Vasquez's book is steeped in her presentation and exploration of what she describes as cultural

maintenance among the Mexican American middle class in U.S. society. She uses this concept to describe Mexican American families that remained committed to upholding Mexican cultural practices, Catholicism, and the Spanish language across the generations, and she argues that this took the form of family ideologies, teachings, and memories that are used to transmit ethnic, class, and racial identity. It became a combination of appropriated memories (inherited from others) and personally acquired memories (developed from direct experience) that were most helpful to these families' confrontation of their inclusion and

exclusion in educational spaces, peer networks, and occupations as a racial group attempting to make inroads in U.S. society. Throughout her investigation of the trajectory of the Mexican American middle class, Vasquez is exemplary in her dedication to rendering a balanced portrait of family life. Nonetheless, a more careful analysis of family experiences that took place in Mexico would have enriched our understanding of the complexity of the cultural maintenance that is most celebrated and helpful to these children, women, and men across space, generation, and time.

The Archaeology of Colonialism: Intimate Encounters and Sexual Effects

Barbara L. Voss and Eleanor Conlin Casella, eds. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011. 368 pp.

Maxine Oland
Smith College

The Archaeology of Colonialism, edited by Barbara L. Voss and Eleanor Conlin Casella, is an important new contribution to the archaeological study of colonization, which asks us to consider sexuality and sexual relations as integral facets of colonial encounters. As Casella and Voss write in their introduction, "intimate encounters are not merely by-products of colonial projects but are fundamental structures of colonization" (p. 1). The editors challenged contributors to consider all types of human intimacy, ranging from erotic to familial to exploitative, and the ways that these relations were changed, challenged, created, and manipulated in colonial worlds.

The volume seeks to examine the "sexual effects" of those subject to colonial policies, an inquiry that combines the study of sexuality with Fernando Coronil's (2007:13) concept of "imperial effects." The editors argue that archaeology is uniquely suited to examine how imperial policies were expressed in practice and how these policies impacted the everyday lived experience of both subject and colonizing populations (p. 2). The first two chapters are essential reading for archaeologists of colonialism, providing the theoretical background for the volume and challenging us to think about the myriad ways in which sexualities were woven into colonial encounters.

The case studies in the volume are organized into four sections, in which contributors struggle with their data, both documentary and material, to locate sexuality in private and public spaces. Most of the case studies deal with post-Columbian European colonialism in Australia, the Americas, and Africa. Case studies from the ancient Mediterranean and the Roman Empire are interesting comparisons, as are the case studies of 19th-century Omani colonialism in Tanza-

nia by Sarah K. Croucher and Barbara Voss's discussion of colonial policies concerning Chinese immigrants in late-18th- and early-19th-century San Francisco. The studies incorporate a wide variety of data sources, including documents, household and institutional artifact assemblages, grave goods, tombstones, rock art, and demographic reconstructions. Some of my favorite chapters are from the sections titled "Commemorations" and "Showing and Telling," which examine the ways that colonial narratives have been told by colonial governments, subject populations, and archaeologists. Mary Weismantel's chapter, on how our view of Moche pottery has been colonized, challenges us to evaluate our own gaze in studies of sexuality in the ancient or near-colonial past.

The case studies are followed by a useful concluding chapter by Martin Hall, in which he synthesizes the methodological approaches to the archaeology of sexuality in colonial contexts. He points out (p. 339) that while authors in the volume have succeeded in finding the normative and tangible expressions of colonial sexualities, they struggle with the transgressive and intangible. He suggests that we look for the "low-Other" in the archaeological record: the ways in which the dominant group symbolically incorporates those on the "bottom" into its erotic fantasies. He urges us to explore rule breaking and absences of materials that should be there, as well as to free ourselves from functional interpretations of utilitarian artifacts.

I have taught this book in two undergraduate seminars, and I highly recommend it as a teaching text for upper-level undergraduates or graduate students. The book sparked nuanced discussions about the role of sex and sexuality in colonial encounters and about the limits and benefits of archaeological data. Some students felt strongly that the authors couldn't make the assertions they did based on the data presented. Nonetheless, some of these chapters for which

the evidence seemed scant led us to new questions and inquiries. One example is the chapter by Pedro Funari and Aline Vieira de Carvalho, which admittedly had no archaeological evidence for the polyandry that was suggested by the documents, but which led my class to a rich discussion about how we might envision social relations at *maroon* and *quilombo* communities (refugee communities composed of escaped slaves, Indians, witches, Jews, Muslims, and other outcasts fleeing the Spanish and Portuguese colonies in South America).

One problem with some of the chapters is that the original projects were not all designed with sexuality in mind. This feels at times unsatisfactory, as the reader (and most likely the author) wishes for comparative contexts or a slightly different sample with which to test or demonstrate

the chapter's assertions. Yet isn't this what we all must do? The chapters in this volume are a valuable step in pushing the boundaries in archaeologies of colonialism, suggesting various avenues in which we might all reinterpret our colonial data within the lens of sexuality. And this volume will no doubt spark new projects designed with precisely these intimate encounters and sexual effects in mind.

REFERENCE CITED

Coronil, Fernando

2007 After Empire: Reflections on Imperialism from the Américas. In *Imperial Formations*. Ann Laura Stoler, Carole McGranahan, and Peter C. Perdue, eds. Pp. 241–271. School for Advanced Research Advanced Seminar series. Santa Fe: School for Advanced Research.

Ancient Origins of the Mexican Plaza: From Primordial Sea to Public Space

Logan Wagner, Hal Box, and Susan Kline Morehead. *Wagner Fullington Series in Architecture*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2013. 273 pp.

Jerry D. Moore

California State University, Dominguez Hills

As I write this review in June of 2013, Istanbul's Taksim Gezi Park is the epicenter of political struggles in Turkey. An urban park of tree-bordered sidewalks and park benches that invite pause, nothing suggests Taksim Gezi Park would be a space for conflict, except for one thing: it is a place where people can gather.

"So public space, even a modest and chaotic swath of it like Taksim," the architectural critic Michael Kimmelman writes, "again reveals itself as fundamentally more powerful than social media, which produce virtual communities. Revolutions happen in the flesh" (2013:A1).

Tahir Square, 2011, Cairo. Zuccotti Park, 2011, New York. The daily protests in London's Hyde Park and Trafalgar Square. Tiananmen Square, 1989, Beijing. La Plaza de las Tres Culturas, 1968, Mexico City.

Ancient Origins of the Mexican Plaza: From Primordial Sea to Public Space is lavishly illustrated, richly documented, and conceptually limited. The result of a dozen years of field research, the authors draw on a valuable archive of digital images, photographs, and plans of 90 town centers in Mexico.

At the core of each town is a plaza.

The Mexican plaza, the authors write, is

the most complete expression of Mexico's rich four-thousand-year-old multifaceted heritage . . . The communal open spaces of Mexico delight all of our senses. When we sense also the layers of Mesoamerican and European history creating the place,

the passion in the iconography, and the human art and labor of building the place along with the lives of people moving around us, the space can consume us with its spiritual and sensual qualities. In its totality, it makes a place that is ultimately unique to its specific culture, to its geography, and to its particular moment. [p.1]

The authors present a wealth of information about Mexican plazas. Adding to their own observations and photographs, the authors include extraordinary images of early colonial towns illustrated in the *Relaciones Geográficas* held in the Benson Latin American Collection at the University of Texas, Austin. Curiously, a number of the plaza plans lack scales, which makes it difficult to assess the human experience of the plazas.

Despite their evident enjoyment at "being in the plaza" as the late Miles Richardson called it, the authors are principally interested in Mexican plazas as materialized expressions of the cosmological principles of a generic "Mesoamerican culture." One passage describes the 16th-century plaza at San Andres Calpan, Puebla:

Calpan is rich in examples of traditional Mesoamerican symbols that continue to carry meaning even after their incorporation into the Christian church and monastery complexes, symbols located in ornament as well as in open space. The Mesoamerican form of the universe, a quincunx with four corners marking the cardinal directions and a central axis mundi joining the earth to the heavens and the Underworld, was recreated over and over in the *atrios* of New Spain churches, with their four corner *posas* and central *atrio* crosses. The fact that Calpan's atrio lies nine steps below street level emphasizes both its symbolic role as a point of entry to the nine levels of the Underworld and its function as the primordial sea. [p. 113]

This passage exemplifies this book's flaws. First, the authors gloss varied prehispanic cultural traditions expressed over three millennia, referring to a generic "Mesoamerican" culture.

Second, the authors assert tendentious interpretations, as in their insistence that Mesoamerican plazas were conceived of as "primordial seas." They write, "Mesoamericans reenacted the creative process in sequence when constructing the ceremonial center, starting first with the plaza, the symbol of watery vastness" (p. 7) materialized by "the inclusion of fountains or water spouts in the colonial plazas [that] seem to corroborate the 'watery nature' of the plaza/open space of the community" (p. 55). So then why are fountains located in plazas in Spanish colonial settlements not in Mesoamerica? What archaeological evidence exists for fountains or waterworks in prehispanic plazas in Mexico?

The authors uncritically assume that they can interpret the functions and meanings of architectural spaces, an assumption challenged in the spirited debates regarding cosmological implications of Maya city plans (e.g., Ashmore and Sabloff 2002, 2003; Smith 2003, 2005). None of this relevant—but inconvenient—literature is discussed.

Setha Low, the astute observer of social life in Latin American plazas, has written about

how little we know about the meaning of these plazas . . . We must uncover how [the plaza] was designed and built, by whom, and for what purposes. The meanings of indigenous and colonial plazas need to be found through the study of their use . . . More needs to be known about the significance of the sacred spaces that were built upon by a colonizing people . . . Does architecture

obscure, as well as highlight, what is happening in other cultural realms? . . . What relationship does the built environment have to the experience of everyday life—and how do our analyses, constrained by our own biases and fragmentary visions, distort our interpretation of those environments? [Low 1996:759]

None of these concerns are addressed in this beautiful, frustrating book.

REFERENCES CITED

- Ashmore, Wendy, and Jeremy A. Sabloff
2002 Spatial Orders in Maya Civic Plans. *Latin American Antiquity* 13(2):201–215.
2003 Interpreting Ancient Maya City Plans: Reply to Smith. *Latin American Antiquity* 14(2):229–236.
- Kimmelman, Michael
2013 In Istanbul's Heart, Leader's Obsession, Perhaps Achilles' Heel. *New York Times*, June 7:A1. <http://www.nytimes.com/2013/06/08/world/europe/in-istanbul-taksim-square-an-achilles-heel.html>, accessed November 16.
- Low, Setha M.
1996 Indigenous Architecture and the Spanish American Plaza in Mesoamerica and the Caribbean. *American Anthropologist* 97(4):748–762.
- Smith, Michael E.
2003 Can We Read Cosmology in Ancient Maya City Plans? Comment on Ashmore and Sabloff. *Latin American Antiquity* 14(2):221–228.
2005 Did the Maya Build Architectural Cosmogram? *Latin American Antiquity* 16(2):217–224.

Under A Watchful Eye: Self, Power, and Intimacy in Amazonia

Harry Walker. *Ethnographic Studies in Subjectivity series*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012. 252 pp.

Michael A. Uzendoski

Florida State University

This ethnography is about the values that define Urarina personhood and their theory of being in the world as well as how they construct and live out intimacy and companionship. The Urarina are an Amazonian people that live on the upper Chambira River in the Department of Loreto of Peru. They live in relative remoteness; the author reports a long journey of several days by boat from Iquitos to reach the Urarina communities. However, the Urarina do not live far from other Amazonian groups, and other languages traditionally spoken in the vicinity are Candoshi, Omurana, Iquito, Jebero, Cocama, and Yameo (p. 21). The Urarina language is classified as a "linguistic isolate, unrelated to any other known language" (p. 21). As is the case with many

anthropologists, it took the author a considerable amount of time and effort to gain the trust of Urarina people.

Chapter 1 introduces the reader to the Urarina and to the author's project. It also situates the book theoretically. The emphasis is on the "psycho-acoustic field that subjects are called into being," in which "selves are always connected to their alters within shared acoustic fields" (p. 15). This orientation toward sound manifests throughout the book with numerous song texts being presented in full translation.

The book's organizational strategy, which is a good one, is to map chapters on the Urarina life cycle. Chapter 2 is about birth, and it contains a nuanced argument about the Urarina theory of sound and music, on the one hand, and hammocks, on the other—both as means of crafting and protecting the soul-energies and bodies of children.

Chapter 3, “Conceiving the Conjugal Body,” addresses marriage and synthesizes the Urarina theory of life with an analysis of the Urarina *couvade*. Writes Walker, “While bodily transformation plays an important role . . . it is the augmentation of the infant’s subjectivity via processes of ensoulment that is the basis of the new-found solidarity between the two parents . . . full conjugality does not precede parenthood for the two are inseparable” (p. 93). For the Urarina, in other words, kinship is a processes of cutting and joining social and spiritual flows, much like weaving, a process whereby people become interconnected and transformed as they move through the life cycle.

Chapter 4, “Mutuality and Autonomy,” discusses child rearing, gendering, and the processes by which Urarina bodies and souls are crafted into people who are both singular and submissive to the collective. The chapter discusses the sharing of food and the generosity of giving, including the generosity of the creator, which must be stimulated by shamans using psychotropics and song. Sharing is a primary value that reflects a nuanced and complex mastery over, and submission to, the needs of others.

Chapter 5 develops the theme of authority in solidarity and discusses naming, bride service, and leadership. Good leaders, shows Walker, are orators of skill, and they mediate between the Urarina and outside authorities “in order to appropriate or transmit tangible resources” (p. 150). The law, for the Urarina, is a “disciplinary force,” and local leaders stress obligations to the law and the state (p. 151). At the same time, however, Urarina practice drinking parties and consume large quantities of manioc beer in order to craft relations of kinship; the social logic is

that drinking “cuts” through normal inhibitions, to create a “mutual dissolubility” (p. 161) that can transform social relations.

The last chapter, “Mastering Subjugation,” discusses the Urarina theory of “nature” by looking at illnesses and the uses and meanings of psychedelic plants. The Urarina use both ayahuasca and brugmansia. Psychotropics allows for a dual kind of subjectivity that expresses a “heightened capacity to act in the world” (p. 191). Shamans, in other words, are people whose bodies are defined by a permeability with the powers and personae—mothers, spirits, teachers, masters of animals—of psychotropic plants.

The book has an epilogue that builds upon the theme of companionship, especially in death and dying. Walker discusses the theory of perspectivism, and he argues that the Urarina could be considered a perspectivist culture without the much-discussed predatory complex.

The main theoretical accomplishment of the book is to build upon the strengths of Eduardo Viveiros de Castro’s sophisticated theory of perspectivism while maintaining the emphasis on the Urarina philosophy of life and their lived realities. Walker reminds us that the real contribution of perspectivism is to pinpoint the problem of culturalist arguments in which “nature is effectively bracketed out for the purposes of making cultural comparisons (p. 209). The Urarina way of life shows us “profound insights on fundamental human existential predicaments relating to our constitutively accompanies way of being” (p. 209). I found this book a joy to read, very thoughtful, and well written. In my view, this book is a major contribution to Amazonian ethnography and anthropology in general.

The Mayan in the Mall: Globalization, Development, and the Making of Modern Guatemala

J. T. Way. Durham: Duke University Press, 2012. 328 pp.

Walter Little

University at Albany, SUNY

A contemporary history of Guatemala City is long overdue. Although there have been some fine studies of particular neighborhoods, economic roles and marketplace, and police security, the city itself has not been the object of focus, much less has there been a discussion of its political and economic articulation with the rest of Guatemala. J. T. Way promises to show how contemporary Guatemala City came to be what it is and how to understand the city in relation to national rural politics in his book, *The Mayan in the Mall: Globalization, Development, and the Making of Modern Guatemala*.

In his introduction, Way explains that the book “tells the story of the making of modern Guatemala. A history of the construction of social space from the 1920s to the new millennium, it focuses on Guatemala City’s poor neighborhoods, on the markets that provision them, and on their connections with the countryside and the greater world beyond (p. 1). Over the course of seven chapters, he explores elite ideological underpinnings of urban development in relation to the poor and Mayas. He analyzes shifts in national political trends from the caudillo-style presidents into the 1930s to the brief democratic period (1945–1954), to decades of military dictatorships, and eventually to the contemporary neoliberal democracy Guatemala is today.

The heart of the book is about El Gallito, a poor neighborhood in Guatemala City. When Way sticks to this neighborhood, how it was founded, and how residents adjusted to political and economic shifts over time, the narrative is convincing and interesting, particularly with respect to the tensions between its working-class residents and the city's elites, planners, and politicians. This ambitious plan, however, is derailed by Way's schizophrenic writing style and the pastiche of topics that leap forward and backward over time. Rarely with new scholarly insight, Way aims to link major 20th-century changes—Dictator Ubico's modernization efforts in the 1930s, the Arévalo and Árbenz governments' reforms from 1944–1954, the 36-year-long civil war, the Pan-Mayan Movement in the 1990s, agrarian policies, maquiladora exploitation, and recent problems with violent transnational gangs (*maras*)—to the poor neighborhoods.

There is little supporting documentary evidence to demonstrate the causality of these events to El Gallito. Rather than meticulously trace El Gallito's relationship to specific marketplaces or concentrate on the city planners' infrastructure development that directly impacted the neighborhood and its residents, these topics stand alone and are largely disarticulated from the neighborhood. The narrative about El Gallito is disrupted by detours into rural Guatemalan and global politics without explaining how these national and global contexts connect to this poor Guatemala City neighborhood.

Early in the book, Way dismisses ethnographic research of the 1930s and, by inference, most of it to the present by citing the racist comments of U.S. artist Eben Comins, who wrote an essay in the Pan-American Union's *Bulletin* in 1939. Summarily dismissed, Way discounts almost all ethnographic research into the 2000s. He presents ideas about Mayas' linguistic, cultural, and gender practices; about

rural agriculture and labor; about urban street economies; and about Guatemala's dictators and presidents that contradict other scholars. Instead of drawing on ethnographic research from the 1920s on—Guatemalan and foreign—to provide context or strengthen his arguments about how the rural communities and the city neighborhoods he describes are connected to the horrendous violence in the highlands or how these neighborhoods were subject to the same violence, this scholarship is ignored. In his discussion of markets, vending, and the informal economy, Way disregards the large body of anthropological and historical research that paints a very different picture of rural–urban economic and social dynamics and that provides more nuanced and critical assessments of informal economy. He also overlooks research by oral historians on Maya politics and gender. Without engaging this body of scholarship and explaining how his data contributes to better understandings of Guatemala City and its poor residents, Way gives an impression that he is the authority on these and other topics. He does not situate himself as a historian, linguist, or ethnographer, even though he takes the liberty to make anecdotal comments about Mayas from positions of historical, linguistic, or ethnographic authority. Moreover, it is not clear if such examples are exceptions or the rule.

Had Way not ranged over so many topics, which themselves skip across time and place, this would have been a far more convincing and rigorous history of Guatemala City. An explanation of his historical and ethnographic methods would have helped readers better understand his analytical processes and political positions. Buried in the book are gems—those moments when he sticks to urban life: struggles of residents in El Gallito, the politics of butchers, and the market associations fighting for vendors' spatial and economic rights.

Negotiated Settlements: Andean Communities and Landscapes under Inka and Spanish Colonialism

Steven A. Wernke. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2013. 390 pp.

Timothy Murtha

Pennsylvania State University

In the past several decades, landscape and the evolution of landscapes as dynamic social, economic, and political places have become increasingly common topics in anthropology, archaeology, and related disciplines, providing a creative connection to longstanding approaches to studies of landscape history by cultural geographers. First, efforts found footing in anthropological archaeology linking Geographic Information Systems (GIS), settlement pattern studies, and environmental archaeology, but the topics of this research have expanded considerably. Landscape is now a key and

quite common interpretive window used to better understand the relationship among human agents, the environment, and cultural systems. Steven Wernke's *Negotiated Settlements: Andean Communities and Landscapes under Inka and Spanish Colonialism* offers a creative and holistic study of the transformation of landscape in the Andes over a period of 500 years—between the 12th and 17th centuries. Wernke offers an emplaced landscape perspective relying on healthy doses of GIS to understand Andean communities under colonial rule.

Wernke provides a thoughtful, steady, and detailed narrative, investigating how particular Andean communities in the Colca Valley experienced, adapted to, and were trans-

formed by two colonial efforts: first the Inka and later the Kingdom of Spain. He weaves and integrates an extensive set of archaeological and ethnohistoric information, leaning on GIS modeling and practice theory. By doing so, Wernke embraces the messiness involved in anthropological approaches when linking material archaeological remains to the social processes leading to their formation. Wernke acknowledges early on that community in this book is not the outcome of a cultural or behavioral response but a negotiated system filtered through and by culture and acted upon by agents. For Wernke, this is a key assumption informed by practice theory and not an empirical observation.

The dense but careful narrative that Wernke develops is focused on how a local “emplaced” community experiences, adapts to, and is transformed by Inka and Spanish colonization. The historical narrative begins in the Late Intermediate Period, wherein segmented and heterarchical organization of communities shifts to centralized, but locally mediated, political systems. This section is carefully supported by a description and analysis of archaeological settlement patterns. Emphasizing local mediation, Wernke effectively argues that local communities were equipped to politically manage “aggressive foreigners.” In his argument, landscape is not simply the canvas upon which these historical events occur but also an active space of negotiation, whereby local traditions and structure engage each colonial effort.

This is a big book, but it seems necessarily so and comprises eight total chapters. The introduction and conclusion generally organize, introduce, and summarize the key arguments of the book. Chapters 2 through 7 offer the substance of Wernke’s argument. Refreshingly, chapters 2 and 3 offer a “bottom-up” description of the Colca Valley, its landscape and people. Chapter 4 not only describes Wernke’s archaeological survey methods but also establishes the con-

vincing foundation for his “emplaced” perspective. Chapter 5 bridges the Inka to Spanish colonial transformations, cautiously weaving archaeological information and spatial analysis with ethnohistoric observations, clearly articulating the negotiated spaces of colonialism. Chapter 6 describes the local and supralocal postcolonial organizational structure of communities and land use, documenting the landscape artifacts of both Inka and Spanish colonial efforts. Following in the long tradition of cultural landscape studies, Wernke uses a regional approach in this chapter but follows it up with a detailed description and analysis of *ayllu* (resource-holding kindred) land-tenure patterns in chapter 7. Wernke ties the entire narrative together in chapter 7, relying on creative GIS work that reconstructs land use and holdings at a number of scales, threading a careful narrative that binds adaptive patterns of local mediation and colonial strategies to the broader landscape history. Uniquely, Wernke also includes a 26-page appendix that provides the basic details about his archaeological site locations.

This book creatively integrates highly detailed and extensive sets of archaeological and ethnohistoric information in a place-based landscape narrative in the tradition of cultural geography, but it does so with a clear anthropological focus. Methodologically, Wernke offers a creative reconstruction and analytical approach that relies on GIS. This book is not just a GIS-based archaeological settlement-pattern study. It is an intriguing narrative of place and landscape, illustrating how space is negotiated and locally mediated in the Colca Valley over five centuries. It is also a compelling narrative about local adaptation to colonialism in general. At times, this narrative is hidden by Wernke’s dutiful approach to archaeological description, but in context, the archaeological detail in the book and appendix strengthen the validity of his arguments.

Histories of the Present: People and Power in Ecuador

Norman E. Whitten Jr. and Dorothea Scott Whitten. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2011. 280 pp.

Maximilian Viatori
Iowa State University

It is hard to imagine scholars who have had a more significant impact than the Whittens on the development and shape of Ecuadorianist anthropology during the last 50 years. Beginning in the 1960s, they conducted (individually or together) ethnographic research with Afro-Ecuadorian peoples in the lowlands of the country’s northwest coast and indigenous Quichua (Kichwa) and Achuar peoples in the central portion of the Ecuadorian Amazon, exploring the creative ways in which these peoples adapted to the upheavals of colonialism and produced alternative visions of development and moder-

nity in the process. The many published works that emerged from this research underscore the importance of a reflexive approach to anthropological theory, one in which the life ways of Afro-Ecuadorian and indigenous peoples serve as the foundation for understanding and analyzing broader systems of race, politics, and power in Ecuador and their contestation.

The current volume furthers this approach through an examination of how contemporary indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian political action has transformed Ecuador. In 1990, indigenous peoples staged a nationwide uprising that shook the foundations of Ecuador’s elite power bloc and contested long-held elite ideas that indigenous peoples could not

function as conscious political actors or did not have a rightful place in Ecuador's national politics. This watershed uprising kicked off two decades of concerted action by indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian people to reshape the nature of power in Ecuador and dismantle the notion that cultural assimilation and capitulation to global capitalism are precursors to national inclusion. As the authors state, this book is an attempt to understand what these millenarian (in the sense of their transformative potential) political projects mean to marginalized peoples and how they emerge from and are informed by Afro-Ecuadorian and indigenous cultural systems.

The authors use three key concepts to explore this issue: ethnogenesis, alternative modernities, and interculturality. These intertwined processes were set in motion in Ecuador, most significantly, by the advent of Spanish colonialism, which resulted in the emergence of new peoples who developed "new ways of appropriating the accoutrements of contemporary life" and novel ways of transcending "differences among people" (p. 12). As the authors note, in Ecuador elite political power has been rooted in attempts to "fix" racial categories and project (cultural, racial, geographic) divisions among white-mestizos (whites and individuals of "mixed" descent who aspire to be white), indigenous peoples, and Afro-Ecuadorians. Yet, the authors also argue that the latter two groups repeatedly have upset these clean distinctions in their social and political practices and cosmologies. As the authors explore in a number of this

book's chapters, this tension between "fixity and fluidity" (p. 25) is key for approaching contemporary Ecuadorian politics, in which Afro-Ecuadorian and indigenous peoples have contested elite concepts of *mestizaje* (cultural and biological "hybridization" with the end goal of an increasingly whitened population) by advocating for a notion of national belonging rooted in *interculturalidad* (an engagement with cultural difference rooted in interaction that rejects hybridization).

By tacking back and forth between the "fixity" of top-down elite projections of race and belonging and the "fluidity" of emerging indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian projects of contestation, the chapters in this book provide a nuanced examination of the dynamics driving Ecuadorian politics and political imaginaries in the contemporary historical conjuncture. A more detailed outline in the introduction of Ecuador's recent political history might have helped readers not intimately familiar with Ecuador to contextualize the chapters that follow. This is a minor quibble, though, as there are many other recent works on Ecuador that do this. *Histories of the Present* is an invaluable contribution to Ecuadorianist anthropology. This book will be required reading for any serious scholar interested in race, power, and history in the country. This book provides a fertile ground for thinking about the contributions of indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian peoples to transformative politics in Ecuador, and it is one that is sure to yield fruitful insights well into the future.