2009

5th and Division

Crabill, Daren

5th & Division:  
Rethinking Ann Arbor’s Plan for the Core  

Daren Crabill

**Background**

Ann Arbor, Michigan has set forth an ambitious plan to establish its downtown the “hot spot” in the region for dining, entertainment and culture, and living. After years of planning and public input, the city is poised to approve its new Master Plan developed by Peter Calthorpe Associates. The plan outlines new downtown zoning, urban design guidelines, historic preservation design guidelines, and a parking and transportation strategy. The new downtown zoning ordinance has been a contentious issue, as it allows for floor area ratios (FAR) of 6.6 with the possibility of greater density through bonuses. This increased density could substantially increase the value of land in the downtown area with the possibility of also dramatically changing its appearance. The plan also calls for enhancing the pedestrian experience and increasing the housing options within the downtown.

The project for the redevelopment of two blocks along Fifth and Division Streets has the distinct potential to bridge the perceived gap between “town and gown.” The main arterial streets of Fifth and Division are sister one way streets running north and south, while Liberty and William Streets are the main connectors running east and west along the site. The US Post Office and Federal Courthouse building, the Ann Arbor Transportation Authority (AATA) Bus Station, and the former site of the YMCA (now since demolished) are located on the western block; while the downtown Ann Arbor District Library (AADL), a DDA surface parking lot, the under-utilized Liberty Plaza area, and a number of homes and small businesses cover the eastern block.
Future plans have been discussed by each of the following entities to enhance services for their own customers:

**Stakeholders:**
OLD YMCA SITE (city owned):
- Would like to replace 100 single-resident occupancy (SRO) units lost with the demolition of the YMCA.
- Mixed use development

AATA:
- Increase covered off-street bus bays
- Enhanced bus station facilities

AADL:
- 25% additional space including auditorium, coffee shop, increased space for digital catalog, more administration space.

DDA:
- Plans in design phase for 4-story underground parking garage in existing lot next to library.

Other plans of interest:
- 250-key full service hotel with conference center
- Reenergized Liberty Plaza or new public space

Each of the above program requirements were to be considered for the study area redevelopment plan.

**Concept:**
A simple primary concept was devised to orient the program requirements around a central public space bounded by Fifth and Division Streets. Secondary goals for the design attempted to: minimize the need to acquire private land for program development, reemphasize nodes and corridors to create value which in turn could help finance the project, and lastly, to phase the development and placement of the program in an effort to save money and create a cohesive design of space.
**Education Through Architecture:**
The new downtown library creates an opportunity to express the sustainable ideals of the AADL while creating a public building that becomes the new face of the city.

**Ann Arbor Square:**
This new public gathering space is located over the DDA parking garage and incorporates waterplay, active and passive play opportunities, and a cafe. As a backyard to the new downtown library and adjacent to new housing, the square creates excellent opportunities for shared programming with the library and historical museum.
**Phasing Sequence:**
An important part of the design consideration was the sequencing of program to reduce costs and establish cohesiveness between the parts.

**Phase 1:**
- DDA underground parking garage
- Ann Arbor Downtown Library
- Ann Arbor Square

This is the key first phase combining design and construction of these three public spaces together. Also allows for the selling of development rights to Liberty Square and old library site to defray costs of phase 1.

**Phase 2:**
- 250-key hotel and convention center
- Mixed-use business center

Phase 2 could be broken up into 2a and 2b depending on market conditions. Old library site ideal for hotel along the busy arterial of Fifth St. while the mixed use building builds out the important node of Division and Liberty Streets.

**Phase 3:**
- Mixed-use development on old YMCA site: 15-bay covered AATA Transit Center, office and retail space, market residential, and SRO units.

This could be the most difficult piece due to the SRO units linked to the site. Added FAR bonuses and financial help from stakeholders could make this financially feasible.

**Phase 4:**
- Housing on the Park; stacked townhomes, condominiums or rental units with 10% marked for affordable housing.

Envisioned to be developed by a private firm. Currently, the land is in multiple parcels but through the addition of previous phases this last piece would have great potential due to its proximity.
ANN ARBOR SQUARE:
The public space becomes a destination at night as well as during the day. There are opportunities for concerts in the park and other performances on the community green, as well as, the establishment of the new center for the Ann Arbor Art Fair.

DOWNTOWN LIBRARY
This is chance to design a great public building in the core of the city. Matching the library and new public square together create one continuous public space through the entire block.