2006

Using Paleosols of the Picture Gorge Basalt to Reconstruct the Middle Miocene Climatic Optimum

Sheldon, Nathan D.

http://hdl.handle.net/2027.42/148632
Using paleosols of the Picture Gorge Basalt to reconstruct the middle Miocene climatic optimum

NATHAN D. SHELDON
Department of Geology, Royal Holloway University of London, Egham, Surrey TW20 0EX, United Kingdom; n.sheldon@gl.rhul.ac.uk

The Picture Gorge Subgroup of the Columbia River Basalt preserves numerous, minimally altered, interflow paleosols that were formed during the middle Miocene climatic optimum. These paleosols are used to reconstruct a high-resolution paleoclimate record. Between 16.0–15.4 Ma ago, mean annual precipitation (MAP) was 500–900 mm/year and mean annual temperature (MAT) was 8–16°C, which is consistent with independent estimates of paleoprecipitation and paleotemperature from fossil plants and paleosols of the contemporaneous Mascall Formation. The record suggests cooling and aridification similar to marine foraminiferal isotopic records. One possible cause for the middle Miocene climatic optimum is transient elevated atmospheric CO\textsubscript{2} levels, though some recently compiled marine isotopic records indicate near-modern CO\textsubscript{2} levels. This possibility is explored using an equilibrium model to simulate the formation of the dominant Picture Gorge paleosol type. Model results indicate elevated CO\textsubscript{2} levels 2–3 times present atmospheric levels were necessary to form the observed mineral assemblage and mass-balance characteristics of the paleosols. This result is consistent with stomatal index studies of gingkos and laurels, which indicate CO\textsubscript{2} levels 2–4 times present atmospheric levels.

INTRODUCTION

Recent compilations of Phanerozoic atmospheric $p$CO\textsubscript{2} based on the stomatal index of plants (Retallack 2001a; Kurschner et al. 2002), and foraminiferal boron isotopes (Pearson and Palmer 2000; Demicco et al. 2003) indicate transient greenhouse conditions in the middle Miocene. This short-lived warming event, named the middle Miocene climatic optimum, is indicated independently by paleosols, marine foraminifera and molluscs of Japan (Itoigawa and Yamanoi 1990), South Australia (McGowran and Li 1997), and Germany (Schwarz 1997). Additional evidence comes from fossil plants (Utescher et al. 2000), and $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{18}$O isotopes from benthic foraminifera (Zachos et al. 2001). Western U.S. floras at 49 Camp, Fingerrock, Pyramid, Mascall, and Latah indicate an unusually warm and wet paleoclimate at 16 Ma, but much drier and cooler conditions by 15 Ma (Graham 1999). Middle Miocene (at ~16 Ma) fossil floras of North America had high percentages of exotic plants from Asia (Graham 1999), which is the likely source of elephants, gelocid deer, and other mammal immigrants to North America at the same time (Janis et al. 1998). Similarly, in Oregon marine rocks, larger foraminifera and corals occur in the Astoria Formation for only a restricted interval centered around 16 Ma, whereas other parts of the formation have less diverse molluscan faunas (Moore 1963), and cool climate indicators such as glendonites (ikaite pseudomorphs; Boggs 1972).

It has been suggested recently that CO\textsubscript{2} and climate may have been decoupled for some climatic events (Coxing 1999). For example, Royer et al. (2001) failed to find significantly elevated $p$CO\textsubscript{2} for the interval of the middle Miocene climatic optimum based on paleobotanical data straddling the event temporally. Carbon isotopic proxies based on pedogenic carbonate (Ekart et al. 1999; Tanner et al. 2001) and on marine phytoplankton compared with foraminifera (Pagani et al. 1999, 2000) also appear to indicate a CO\textsubscript{2}-temperature decoupling. The $p$CO\textsubscript{2} levels calculated by Pagani et al. (2000) and Royer et al. (2001) are below modern pre-Industrial levels. Retallack (2001a, 2002) suggested that isotopic proxies may be compromised by methane clathrate dissociation events, which release extremely isotopically light carbon. Furthermore, new stomatal index data, located temporally during the transient event instead of flanking it (as in Royer et al.’s 2001 data), indicate elevated atmospheric $p$CO\textsubscript{2} levels during the middle Miocene climatic optimum (Kuerschner et al. 2002; Retallack 2002). The purpose of this study is to address whether the observed degree of weathering among middle Miocene paleosols could have occurred under near-modern $p$CO\textsubscript{2} levels, or whether elevated $p$CO\textsubscript{2} levels were necessary to account for the observed weathering.

An ideal data set to examine the middle Miocene climatic optimum event at high resolution is the Picture Gorge Subgroup of the Columbia River Basalt Province (Figure 1).
Picture Gorge Subgroup has preserved numerous interflow paleosols of varying degrees of development. The Picture Gorge Subgroup was emplaced at ~16.5–15.6 Ma (Baksi 1989), and its stratigraphic relationships have been well established (Bailey 1989). The middle Miocene climatic optimum has been dated to ~16 Ma as well (Hornibrook 1990; Zachos et al. 2001). Five paleosol pedotypes have been identified as having formed in ecosystems ranging from swamps (peaty soils) to forests (Sheldon 2003), and they are placed within the overall Cenozoic paleoenvironmental context of the John Day Basin (Retallack, personal comm.).

Sheldon (2003) reconstructed Picture Gorge paleoenvironmental conditions on the basis of physical characteristics and geochemistry of the paleosols, and performed a number of mass-balance calculations to show losses and gains of various elements as a result of pedogenesis. Although it is possible to reconstruct paleoprecipitation and paleotemperature estimates on the basis of bulk rock geochemistry (see below; Sheldon et al. 2002), it is difficult to reconstruct the paleoatmospheric pCO$_2$ that contributed to those paleoclimatic conditions in paleosols that lack pedogenic carbonate.

This paper will present two new findings: (1) a high-resolution paleoclimatic record for the interval from 16.1–15.4 Ma ago, and (2) results of an attempt to use an equilibrium weathering model to assess atmospheric pCO$_2$ ~16 Ma ago.

**PALEOSOLS OF PICTURE GORGE**

Sheldon (2003) identified five different types of paleosols in Picture Gorge, two of which preserve direct fossil evidence of previous ecosystems. Cenozoic paleosols of central Oregon are organized into pedotypes (similar to soil series) and given names in the local Sahaptin language (Retallack et al. 2000). Three of the five types of paleosols preserved in Picture Gorge are too poorly developed to be used for quantitative paleoclimatic or paleoenvironmental analysis, and also do not preserve plant or animal fossils (Sheldon 2003). In contrast, the two more well-developed Ilukas and Monana types of paleosols preserve plant and animal fossils.

Ilukas (firewood) paleosols, which preserve rare terrestrial gastropods but no plant fossils, are the most common type of paleosols preserved in the Picture Gorge Subgroup of the Columbia River Basalt (Figure 1), and are described in detail elsewhere (Sheldon 2003). To summarize, the Ilukas paleosols are typically very red (5YR4/4 to 10R4/4) with A-Bt-BC-C profiles (Tables 1 and 2; Sheldon 2003). The Monana (around underneath) pedotype is black and brown (2.5Y5/2) with O/A-A2-A3-C profiles (Tables 1 and 2), and was probably once a poorly aerated, histic Inceptisol (Sheldon 2003). The Monana pedotype does not preserve any animal fossils, but plant fossils are common throughout the A, A2, and A3 horizons.

The difference in fossil preservation between Ilukas (gastropods, no plants) and Monana (no animals, plants) paleosols is likely due to soil aeration and alkalinity/acidity in the soils during their formation. Well-aerated, alkaline soils

---

**Table 1. Palaeoclimatically significant Picture Gorge pedotypes.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pedotype</th>
<th>Diagnosis</th>
<th>FAO$^a$</th>
<th>USDA$^b$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monana</td>
<td>granular structure clayey peat over grey-green volcanisclastic sandstone parented by basalt</td>
<td>Humic Cambisol</td>
<td>Humaquept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>underneath</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>thick and red with clayey subsurface (Bt) horizons parented by basalt</td>
<td>Luvisol</td>
<td>Udalf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>firewood</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$Italicized text is the translation of the pedotype name from Sahaptin into English.

$^b$FAO (1988)

$^a$Soil Survey Staff (1975)

---

**Table 2. Paleoenvironmental interpretation of interflow paleosols.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pedotype</th>
<th>Paleoclimate</th>
<th>Former Vegetation</th>
<th>Palaeotopography</th>
<th>Parent Material</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monana</td>
<td>subhumid, seasonally dry</td>
<td>peat swamp, seasonally dry</td>
<td>boggy floodplain depression</td>
<td>volcaniclastic sandstones</td>
<td>500–5000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>humid (600–1200 mm/yr), seasonally dry</td>
<td>upland old growth eutrophic forest, seasonally dry</td>
<td>flow top topography, well-drained</td>
<td>tholeiitic basalt</td>
<td>20000–75000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
HEATING BY THE OVERRIDING BASALT FLOW

Although much of the organic matter in Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols was lost to post-burial processes, the histic epipedon of the Monana pedotype preserved an amount sufficient for vitrinite reflectance analysis. Samples collected from within 3 cm of the contact with the overlying flow have a mean reflectance value of 1.14 (medium volatile bituminous coal), declining 6 cm below the contact to a mean reflectance of 0.80 (high volatile bituminous coal). At 10 cm below the contact, the mean reflectance is just 0.32 (lignite-grade), which is consistent with normal diagenesis rather than any significant heating of the paleosol by the overlying basalt flow. All of the samples have a small population of higher reflectance values representing degrado-fusinite, which is formed by fungi oxidizing humic kerogen. This process increases the carbon content, and thus the hardness and reflectance of the organic matter. Thus, only vitrinite was used to determine the maturity of the samples, and those results suggest heating to 160–180°C within the upper 6 cm of the Monana profile, but declining to no more than 60–80°C at a depth of 10 cm (Mukhopadhyay 1992).

Comparison between thin sections prepared from the basalt-paleosol contact and thin sections of red, smectitic clays fired into pottery shows significant petrographical differences. Paleosol samples exhibit high birefringent clays and show typical soil fabrics, whereas the pottery samples lack birefringence and have an amorphous clay fabric consistent with the heating they experienced (Sheldon 2003). Furthermore, the distribution of alkali elements within the paleosols is consistent with pedogenic processes, including cycling of airborne additions from nearby silicic volcanism, rather than with metasomatic alteration due to basin flow emplacement (Sheldon 2003). These results, combined with the quantitative heating estimates derived from the vitrinite reflectance analyses, indicate that the paleosols were minimally altered by heating associated with the emplacement of the basalt flows (Sheldon 2003).

PALEOCLIMATIC RECONSTRUCTION

Picture Gorge preserves a number of paleosols that can be used to reconstruct a high-resolution paleoclimatic record. As discussed in the previous section, the original chemistry of the paleosols seems to have been robustly preserved (Sheldon 2003). Sheldon et al. (2002) demonstrated that the chemical composition of paleosol Bt and Bw horizons may be applied to reconstruct mean annual precipitation (MAP) and mean annual temperature (MAT) using empirical relationships derived from modern soils. MAP may be calculated with reasonable precision and accuracy (R^2 = 0.72; p<0.0001) as:

\[ \text{MAP (mm)} = 221.1e^{0.971(\text{Bt thickness})} \]  

where CIA-K is the molar ratio of Al\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3} to Al\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3} + CaO + Na\textsubscript{2}O multiplied by 100 (Maynard 1992). MAT may be calculated with much less precision but similar accuracy (R^2 = 0.37; p<0.0001) as:

\[ \text{MAT (°C)} = -18.5S + 17.3 \]  

where S is the molar ratio of K\textsubscript{2}O and Na\textsubscript{2}O to Al\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3}. Using this approach to reconstruct Eocene and Oligocene paleoclimatic conditions gave estimates of both MAP and MAT that corresponded well with estimates derived from independent paleoclimatic proxies including paleosol Bk horizon depth and plant fossils (Sheldon et al. 2002).

A final consideration in making a paleoclimatic reconstruction is an age model. Based on the total number of mapped basalt flows in the Picture Gorge Subgroup and the total duration of their emplacement, the average time represented by each basalt flow is 8300 years (e.g., Tolan et al. 1989). Soil Bt horizon thickness can be related to formation time using modern soil data (from Markewich et al. 1990) to develop the following empirical relationship:

\[ \text{Age (years)} = 17.07(\text{Bt thickness}) + 645.8(\text{Bt thickness}) \]  

with R^2 = 0.87. No correction for compaction (e.g., Sheldon and Retallack 2001) is necessary because these paleosols were never deeply buried and because the basalt in the sequence is effectively un-compactible. By counting the number of basalt flows between paleosols and using equation (3) to calculate the duration of soil formation, it is possible to assign an approximate age to each of the paleosols in the succession (Table 3) starting from the Skaw paleosol, which was dated at 16.0 ± 0.2 Ma (C. Swisher 1995 unpublished data).

Figure 2 depicts the reconstructed paleoclimatic conditions (MAP and MAT) obtained from equations (1) and (2) (original geochemical data available from the author) plotted against paleosol ages determined using equation (3). The reconstructed MAP of 500–900 mm/yr and MAT of 8–16°C represent temperate, sub-humid conditions consistent with independent estimates of MAP and MAT from fossil plants and paleosols elsewhere in Oregon (Retallack et al. 2000). There is some suggestion that cooling and drying occurred from 16–15.5 Ma ago, but there are too many uncertainties in the estimates to be any more precise. However, global climatic conditions cooled and aridified significantly by ~15 Ma (e.g., Graham 1999; Zachos et al. 2001), thus suggesting that the trend observed in these data may be real.

EQUILIBRIUM MODELING

Soils are excellent recorders of environmental conditions because they form in direct contact with the atmosphere. As a result, gas contents in soils equilibrate with atmospheric gases. However, soil respiration, especially in tropical settings, may lead to soil CO\textsubscript{2} that is 100–200 times higher than that of the atmosphere (Brook et al. 1983; Volk 1987). Thus, the minimum soil CO\textsubscript{2} expected is the atmospheric CO\textsubscript{2}. Elevated soil CO\textsubscript{2} values are associated with high-
biomass systems or with waterlogged settings where diffusive loss of soil $p\text{CO}_2$ to the atmosphere (if soil $p\text{CO}_2 >$ atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$) is inhibited. Thus, a well-drained soil with low to moderate productivity will generally have soil $p\text{CO}_2 = $ atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$. Weathering reactions can be most tightly constrained when the chemical composition of the protolith is well understood. The Ilukas pedotype paleosols of Sheldon (2003) formed in situ on basalt flow tops. However, not all of the Picture Gorge paleosols fulfill these criteria. The Monana pedotype also formed in situ on basalt, but it is a histic Inceptisol (peaty, moderately developed soil) that shows evidence of gleying. Because it formed in waterlogged conditions, it is likely that there was incomplete exchange of gases between the soil and the atmosphere. The Skaw and Kwak pedotypes (Sheldon 2003) formed on reworked volcanic ash, so it is difficult to differentiate weathering related only to pedogenesis from the weathering associated with the redeposition of the ash. Thus, only the Ilukas and Nuqwas pedotypes fulfill the criteria of being well-drained, of having low to moderate productivity, and of forming in situ on basalt, and Ilukas paleosols are much more common than Nuqwas paleosols.

Because the atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ level is unlikely to have been lower than the soil $p\text{CO}_2$ levels, equilibrium modeling of abiotic weathering reactions can constrain minimum atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ levels. In other words, if present levels of $p\text{CO}_2$ are sufficient to create the observed degree of weathering in these paleosols, then it is likely that paleo-atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ levels were also at near-modern levels because biota can only serve to enhance the degree of weathering. This approach is somewhat indirect, but the thermodynamics of microbial and plant interactions during weathering are still poorly understood.

The computer program CHILLER (e.g., see Palandri and Reed 2001) allows users to calculate heterogeneous equilibrium of gas-mineral-water systems. CHILLER forces equilibrium with different gas mixes by treating gases as homogeneous minerals. In other words, a water-rock system in equilibrium with present atmospheric conditions is in equilibrium with the “minerals” called $f\text{CO}_2$-3.5 ($\text{CO}_2$ fugacity = $10^{-3.5}$) and $f\text{O}_2$-0.7 ($\text{O}_2$ fugacity = $10^{-0.7}$). New $\text{CO}_2$ “minerals” were created for 0.1, 1, 3, 5, 10, 15, and 20 times present atmospheric levels (PAL) assuming a present day atmospheric $p\text{CO}_2$ of $10^{-3.5}$ (for dilute mixtures, e.g., $\text{CO}_2$ in the atmosphere, $f = p$). All equilibrium K values are from the SOLTERM database (construction of the database is outlined in Palandri and Reed 2001). The basic equation that controls the availability of $\text{CO}_2$ is:

$$\text{H}_2\text{O}_{(aq)} + \text{CO}_2_{(g)} = \text{HCO}_3^-_{(aq)} + \text{H}^+_{(aq)}.$$  (4)

Table 3. Paleoclimatic data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pedotype</th>
<th>Age (Ma)</th>
<th>Bt thick (cm)</th>
<th>Time (yrs.)</th>
<th>MAP (mm)</th>
<th>MAT (°C)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Skaw</td>
<td>16.000</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monana</td>
<td>15.965</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>500–5000</td>
<td>854 (1)</td>
<td>13.4 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.932</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19744</td>
<td>686 (2)</td>
<td>11.3 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.904</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>53144</td>
<td>762 (1)</td>
<td>11.8 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.842</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>53144</td>
<td>612 (1)</td>
<td>10.8 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.781</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>65827</td>
<td>630 (2)</td>
<td>10.5 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.707</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>39900</td>
<td>657 (2)</td>
<td>12.9 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.659</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>43514</td>
<td>540 (2)</td>
<td>8.97 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.607</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100000</td>
<td>743 (2)</td>
<td>12.1 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.499</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>34737</td>
<td>683 (1)</td>
<td>11.4 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilukas</td>
<td>15.455</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>74965</td>
<td>649 (2)</td>
<td>10.6 (2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1Number of individual chemical analyses averaged to obtain the paleoclimatic estimate.
From here, a K value may be calculated from the following (where $a$ is activity):

$$K = \frac{a_{HCO_3} \cdot a_{H^+}}{a_{H_2O}}$$  \hspace{1cm} (5)

Rearranging that expression (equation 6) and taking the $\log_{10}$ of both sides (equation 7) allows us to calculate a new K value (here called $K^*$) that can be used to force equilibrium with a given atmospheric CO$_2$ value.

$$\log K^* = \log(f_{CO_2}) + \log K = \log \frac{a_{HCO_3} \cdot a_{H^+}}{a_{H_2O}}$$  \hspace{1cm} (6)

$$\log K^* = \log(f_{CO_2}) + \log K = \log \frac{a_{HCO_3} \cdot a_{H^+}}{a_{H_2O}}$$  \hspace{1cm} (7)

For example, to create a new CO$_2$ gas “mineral” that corresponds to present-day atmospheric conditions (i.e., $p$CO$_2$ = $10^{-3.5}$ bars), the following expression would be used:

$$\log K^* = 10^{-7.818} + 10^{-3.5}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (8)

O$_2$ fugacity was kept constant at present levels, which is reasonable because oxygen levels are thought to have been roughly constant throughout the Cenozoic. CHILLER is set up to compute different water-rock ratios by “titrating” rock into a water (Figure 3) and recording how that water changes composition in response to the addition of rock. If precipitation is approximately constant through time, then there should be a systematic decrease in the amount of water that reacted with the parental basalt with increasing depth in the profile (Figure 3). Thus, by graphing results depicting ascending water-rock ratios from the top down, an artificial soil profile may be modeled. These artificial profiles obtained for equilibrium with different CO$_2$ levels (0.1-20 PAL) can then be compared with actual geochemical data on mass balance and the mineral assemblage from Sheldon (2003).

Table 4 summarizes the input parameters used in this modeling. Because rainwater is very fresh (i.e., has low salinity and low total-dissolved solids), most of the cations available for reactions come from the rock(s) being weathered. Pedogenesis is dominated by the breakdown of base-bearing minerals either by hydrolysis (e.g., potassium feldspar being weathered to illite) or by acid attack that liberates cations for use by plants and microbes. An example of the latter type of reaction would be the dissolution of albite as:

$$\text{NaAlSi}_3\text{O}_8 \text{albite} + 4\text{H}^+ = \text{Na}^+ + \text{Al}^{3+} + 3\text{SiO}_2 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$$  \hspace{1cm} (9)

where most of the resulting species are aqueous. Acid attack reactions consume H$^+$ ions, thereby raising the pH of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rainwater Composition (mg/l)$^b$</th>
<th>Basalt Composition (weight %)$^c$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pH$^a$</td>
<td>SiO$_2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl$^-$</td>
<td>MgO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SO$_4^{2-}$</td>
<td>TiO$_2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ca$^{2+}$</td>
<td>Al$_2$O$_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg$^{2+}$</td>
<td>FeO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K$^+$</td>
<td>K$_2$O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na$^+$</td>
<td>Fe$_2$O$_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO$_3^-$</td>
<td>MnO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LOI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ pH = $-\log_{10}$ ($aH^+$)

$^b$ Rainwater composition #2 in the SOLTHERM database augmented by groundwater composition #5. The last four values (0.1) are not based on analytical results, but were used as input parameters because CHILLER requires input values for cations and anions that are to be speciated.

$^c$ This basalt analysis is from Sheldon (2003) and is typical of Picture Gorge Subgroup lavas. All of the loss on ignition was treated as H$_2$O gas. Because the thermodynamic properties of titanium species in solution are poorly understood, titanium was not included in the equilibrium calculations. This simplification is justified as titanium is extremely refractory during weathering, and is often taken to be an immobile element (e.g., Chadwick et al. 1990).
the system. While $\text{HCO}_3^-$ is the most stable carbon-bearing species at near neutral pH values (6–8), $\text{CO}_3^{2-}$ becomes the most stable species at higher pH values (>8). This change leads to the precipitation of carbonate minerals such as calcite, siderite, and ankerite. However, all of the interflow paleosols of the Picture Gorge Subgroup are carbonate-free, so the first appearance of carbonate minerals can be taken to represent the end point of the realistic weathering reaction.

Atmospheric $\rho\text{CO}_2$ values of 0.1, 1, 3, 5, 10, 15, and 20 PAL were used in model calculations, where 0.1 PAL is an extreme case used to represent the sub-modern $\rho\text{CO}_2$ levels suggested by Pagani et al. (2000) and Royer et al. (2001). All model calculations were for 25°C temperature conditions. While this reaction temperature may be slightly higher than the temperature at which the Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols formed, it is no more than 10°C high (Figure 2), and is probably very close based on paleobotanical estimates (Graham, 1999). Using a reaction temperature of 25°C has the additional advantage of being the temperature at which most thermodynamic data are best-constrained. All model calculations were run over the range of 0.001–10 grams of rock added to a kilogram of water, or $10^{-3}$ to $10^1$ grams of rock titrated. In all cases, calcite precipitated before the end of the titration run. Taking into account both kinetic factors and the temperature, a number of zeolite and high-temperature minerals were suppressed from forming in the calculations.

**MODEL RESULTS**

Using the first appearance of calcite as the upper limit to the extent of the weathering reactions (i.e., the maximum amount of rock that can be titrated), more rock can be titrated into solution if the system is at higher $\rho\text{CO}_2$ conditions. At 0.1 PAL (an unrealistically low $\rho\text{CO}_2$ value), just 0.099 to 0.199 grams of rock were titrated before calcite precipitation occurred. At 10 PAL, 0.599 grams of rock were titrated before calcite precipitation, or 3–6 times more rock than the 0.1 PAL case and 2 times more rock than the 1 PAL case (Figure 4). Regardless of the $\rho\text{CO}_2$ used, a substantial quantity of goethite (FeOOH or Fe(OH)$_3$) forms at very high water-rock ratios and is replaced by minor amounts of daphinite (Fe$_5$Al$_2$Si$_3$O$_{10}$($OH$)$_8$). In all of the runs, quartz is thermodynamically favored and precipitates as the dominant mineral phase in the final mineral assemblage. However, quartz precipitation is extremely slow, especially at 25°C, so most of the silica would actually be in amorphous colloidal phases in a typical soil. The assemblage in all of the runs of quartz, kaolinite, Ca-nontronite, and clinochlore with minor amounts of daphnite, Mn-clinochlore, and MnO$_2$ at the time of calcite precipitation is a good approximation of the actual mineral assemblage reported by Sheldon (2003). Clinochlore is a good proxy for metastable Mg-smectite (e.g., Mg-nontronite) minerals that typically form in soils formed under non-tropical precipitation regimes (Retallack 2001b). For example, in the 10 PAL case, Mg-nontronite precipitates and persists briefly before it is replaced by clinochlore.

It is possible to quantify the loss of a given element relative to its protolith composition using mass-balance calculations that assume an immobile element (Brimhall and Dietrich, 1987; Brimhall et al. 1991; Chadwick et al. 1990; Chadwick et al. 1999). Sheldon (2003) showed that Zr is nearly immobile and can be used to quantify the translocations of a number of weatherable cations. In addition to equation 9 above, equations 10-11 demonstrate the type of dissolution reactions common during the weathering of basalt:

$$\text{Mg}_2\text{SiO}_4_{\text{forsterite}} + 4\text{H}^+ = 2\text{Mg}^{2+} + \text{SiO}_2^{(aq)} + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (10)$$

![Figure 4](image-url). Minerals precipitated as a function of reaction extent. Calcite and muscovite form progressively later in the reaction with increasing $\rho\text{CO}_2$ level. In all three cases, the mineral assemblage at the first precipitation of calcite is quartz, kaolinite, Ca-nontronite, and clinochlore with minor amounts of daphnite, Mn-clinochlore, and MnO$_2$. 

---

**Figure 4.** Minerals precipitated as a function of reaction extent. Calcite and muscovite form progressively later in the reaction with increasing $\rho\text{CO}_2$ level. In all three cases, the mineral assemblage at the first precipitation of calcite is quartz, kaolinite, Ca-nontronite, and clinochlore with minor amounts of daphnite, Mn-clinochlore, and MnO$_2$. 

---

PALEOBIOLOGICAL GEOCHEMISTRY, VOL. 26, NUMBER 2, OCTOBER 2006
Figure 5 shows the losses (negative translocations) of Ca\(^{2+}\), Na\(^{+}\) and Mg\(^{2+}\) from reactions 9–11 as a function of depth within the paleosol profile compared to the model calculations. Weathering is typically most intense near the surface of a soil and declines rapidly with increasing depth and decreasing permeability (both initial and as a direct result of plant-rock interactions). Therefore, with the titration of progressively more rock into solution we would expect an increase in the activity (and by extension, molality) of a given cation. This pattern is observed in the model calculations for the cations most germane to pedogenesis (i.e., the bases K\(^{+}\), Na\(^{+}\), Ca\(^{2+}\), and Mg\(^{2+}\)), as shown in Figure 5.

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

While increasing pCO\(_2\) does not affect the liberation of Na\(^{+}\) (Figure 5), there are roughly three orders of magnitude difference in Mg\(^{2+}\) (Figure 5) between the 0.1 PAL and 10 PAL model calculations, and nearly two orders of magnitude difference between the 1 PAL and 10 PAL. In the actual translocations calculated for Picture Gorge paleosols, as much as 80% of the original Ca\(^{2+}\) and 70% of the original Na\(^{+}\) are lost, while only about 30% of the original Mg\(^{2+}\) was lost from the soil profile (Sheldon 2003). The Mg\(^{2+}\) that was displaced from the weathering of olivine and various pyroxenes was largely retained in the profile within Mg-smectites. While all three model cases precipitate clinohlore (our proxy for Mg-smectite), only the 10 PAL case liberates enough Mg\(^{2+}\) to account for the Mg-rich paleosol profiles that are observed, and it is also the only case to reproduce the “shape” of the data. Further, in higher pCO\(_2\) model calculations (i.e., 20 PAL), dolomite precipitates, and dolomite is both kinetically and thermodynamically unlikely to form in soils except for unusual cases (Capo et al. 2000).

Figure 6 depicts the changes in pH in each of the model runs. At 0.1 PAL the pH at the top of the model soil profile is 9.2, at PAL it is 8.4, and at 10 PAL it is 7.7. Alfsols typically have pH values between 6.0 and 8.5, therefore the 1 PAL and 10 PAL cases fall within the range of realistic values for Alfsols (i.e., Ilukas pedotype). At pH > 8.0 chert commonly forms in situ in soils (Retallack 2001b). Sheldon (2003) did not find chert in any of the Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols. In addition, carbonate minerals are most stable at higher pH values (Retallack 2001b), and the Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols are carbonate-free, thereby suggesting near-neutral pH values during their formation, again most consistent with the 10 PAL. It is possible that carbonate minerals formed in the Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols could have dissolved out and that it would have been better to consider the reaction between 1 and 10 grams of rock titrated rather than between 0.1 and 1 grams of rock titrated. This objection can be addressed by considering the water-rock ratios at which carbonate minerals began to form. The climatic transfer function based on the degree of chemical
further evidence for a transient rise in atmospheric CO$_2$ levels, as suggested by Pagani et al. (1999, 2000), are consistent with global cooling observed in a number of independent terrestrial and marine proxies.

3) Equilibrium modeling of the atmospheric CO$_2$ levels necessary to result in the observed soil formation indicates values 2–4 times present atmospheric levels. While there are a number of assumptions in the model regarding solution chemistry and biotic productivity levels, the results are consistent with previous CO$_2$ estimates from mass-balance modeling and from the stomatal index of plant fossils.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was funded by NSF Grant EAR000953, and by a student research grant from the Penn State Astrobiology Research Center. This paper benefited from thoughtful reviews by Dennis Terry and Steve Driese.

LITERATURE CITED


These model results do not preclude the possibility of very low atmospheric CO$_2$ coupled with non-analogous biotic productivity in the Ilukas paleosols. However, the flora and fauna of the middle Miocene was not substantially different than modern in terms of community structure and ecology, so it is likely that modern-analogue forests have comparable productivity to their Miocene counterparts. Therefore, these results are suggestive that the middle Miocene warm event was due, at least in part, to elevated atmospheric CO$_2$.

CONCLUSIONS

1) Paleosols preserved between basalt flows of the Picture Gorge Subgroup of the Columbia River Basalt province are well-preserved and can be used to reconstruct paleoclimatic conditions.

2) New geochemical results from paleosol Bt horizons indicate declining MAP and MAT between 16–15.4 Ma ago, consistent with global cooling observed in a number of independent terrestrial and marine proxies.

The 10 PAL model run is favored for three reasons. First, only the 10 PAL case produces a significant amount of Mg$^{2+}$. This value is an upper limit though, because higher CO$_2$ values result in dolomite precipitation and dolomite is not observed in the paleosols and is unlikely to form in any soils for kinetic reasons (Capo et al. 2000). Second, pH values produced by the 10 PAL case are near neutral, consistent with the lack of soil carbonate and chert, and within the typical range associated with Alfisols, the soil type being modeled. Third, the 10 PAL case produces water-rock ratios that are close to those predicted by a simple calculation using the MAP and formation time estimates of Sheldon (2003).

That the 10 PAL case best matches the geologic evidence raises the question of how much of that total CO$_2$ is due to atmospheric CO$_2$ and how much is due to soil productivity. Using the world soil CO$_2$ map of Brook et al. (1983), modern soils like the Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols have 3–8 PAL soil CO$_2$. Assuming that 10 PAL is the total CO$_2$, from both atmospheric and soil respiration sources, necessary to produce the Picture Gorge Subgroup paleosols, atmospheric CO$_2$ likely ranged from 2–7 PAL for the transient middle Miocene climatic optimum. Even at the low end of that range, it is clear that sub-pre-Industrial atmospheric CO$_2$ levels, as suggested by Pagani et al. (1999, 2000), are too low. A value of 2–4 PAL is consistent with estimates from mass-balance modeling and from the stomatal index of plant fossils.

These model results do not preclude the possibility of very low atmospheric CO$_2$ coupled with non-analogous biotic productivity in the Ilukas paleosols. However, the flora and fauna of the middle Miocene was not substantially different than modern in terms of community structure and ecology, so it is likely that modern-analogue forests have comparable productivity to their Miocene counterparts. Therefore, these results are suggestive that the middle Miocene warm event was due, at least in part, to elevated atmospheric CO$_2$.

CONCLUSIONS

1) Paleosols preserved between basalt flows of the Picture Gorge Subgroup of the Columbia River Basalt province are well-preserved and can be used to reconstruct paleoclimatic conditions.

2) New geochemical results from paleosol Bt horizons indicate declining MAP and MAT between 16–15.4 Ma ago, consistent with global cooling observed in a number of independent terrestrial and marine proxies.

3) Equilibrium modeling of the atmospheric CO$_2$ levels necessary to result in the observed soil formation indicates values 2–4 times present atmospheric levels. While there are a number of assumptions in the model regarding solution chemistry and biotic productivity levels, the results are consistent with previous CO$_2$ estimates from mass-balance modeling and from the stomatal index of plant fossils.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was funded by NSF Grant EAR000953, and by a student research grant from the Penn State Astrobiology Research Center. This paper benefited from thoughtful reviews by Dennis Terry and Steve Driese.

LITERATURE CITED


Tolan, T.L., S.P. Reidel, M.H. Beeson, J.L. Anderson, K.R. Fecht,

