

**TEACHING THE VALUES OF LIFELONG MUSIC ENGAGEMENT TO MIDDLE
SCHOOL BAND MEMBERS: A TEACHER RESEARCH STUDY**

by

Jennifer Kustec-Barringer

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Music Education
in The University of Michigan
2019

Thesis Committee:

Professor Marie McCarthy, Chair

Professor Colleen Conway

Dr. Andrea Brown

Acknowledgements

The inspiration for this paper came primarily from my father, who has devoted his life to music education. After a successful 36-year career as a school band director, he continues to promote lifelong musical engagement by directing the community band featured in this study.

Thank you to the adults involved with this study, who so freely gave of their time to help plan and implement every detail. I quite literally could not have done this without you. You are an inspiration to me and your support and mentorship means more than you know.

My sincerest gratitude is extended to my advisor Dr. Marie McCarthy, who expertly guided me through this study, from its conception to completion. She generously gave of her time and wisdom and I am honored to have had the opportunity to work with and get to know her.

Thank you to Drs. Colleen Conway and Andrea Brown, who as committee members provided valuable input and insight to help make this a successful project.

Finally, thank you to my husband and family for their constant love and support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ii
List of Figures	vi
List of Appendices	vii
Abstract	viii
Chapter One – Introduction	1
Introduction	1
Need for Study	2
Purpose Statement and Research Questions	3
Definitions	3
Chapter Two – Review of Literature	8
Introduction	8
What motivates adults to participate in community music?	9
What motivational factors are involved in the process of informal music making?	13
What do scholars describe to be the benefits of community music?	16
What curricular approaches can foster a sense of lifelong music engagement?	18
What recurring themes appear in research regarding intergenerational educational programs?	27
Suggestions for Future Research	28
Chapter Three – Methodology	31
Purpose Statement and Research Questions	31
Research Design	31
Context of Study	32
Personal Orientation as Researcher	34
Description of Participants	35
Port Clinton Middle School Students	35
North Coast Concert Band Members	36
Data Collection	38
Surveys	38
Focus Group Interviews	39
Classroom Discussions	39
Small Group, Student-Led Interviews	40
Teacher Research Journal	40
Timeline of Data	42

Resource Needs	41
Ethics and Trustworthiness	43
Analysis Strategies	43
Organization of Findings	45
Chapter Four – Project Description and Data Analysis.....	46
Overview	46
Orientation Phase	47
Seventh Grade Student Perspectives	48
Adult Participant Profiles	51
Musical Background and Perspectives of Adults	52
Summary	56
Immersion Phase	56
Adult Musicians Visit the Classroom	57
Classroom Discussion on Lifelong Musicianship	60
Adult Musicians Speak with Band Members	64
Student Participant Profiles	65
Small Group Student-Adult Conversations	66
Summary	70
Reflection Phase	70
Seventh Grade Student Reflections	70
Reflections on Being a Lifelong Musician	74
Summary	80
Chapter Summary	80
Chapter Five – Findings and Thematic Exploration	82
Emergent Themes	82
What do community band members’ interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music?	83
How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians?	85
How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward students’’ lifelong musical engagement?	86
Chapter Six – Teaching the Values of Lifelong Music Engagement: Conclusion.....	89
Implications for Middle School Teaching	89
Future Directions	94
Recommendations for Further Research	96
Conclusion	97

References.....99

Appendices.....103

List of Figures

Figure 1: Description of Student Participants36
Figure 2: Description of Adult Participants37
Figure 3: Timeline of Data Collection42

List of Appendices

Appendix A: Middle School Letter of Intent.....	103
Appendix B: Lifelong Musical Engagement Student Survey Questions and Examples	105
Appendix C: Post-Discussion Student Survey Questions and Examples.....	108
Appendix D: Adult End-of-Experience Survey Questions.....	111
Appendix E: Adult Musician Focus Group Questions	112
Appendix F: Interview Questions for Adults.....	113

Abstract

The purpose of this teacher research study was to develop a collaborative classroom project in which adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band interacted with members of the 7th grade band at Port Clinton Middle School with the goal of teaching the importance of lifelong musical engagement. Three main research questions guided this study: a) What do community band members' interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music? b) How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians? and c) How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward students' lifelong musical engagement? This study involved collecting data from 46 middle school band members and four adult community musicians through surveys, small group interviews, a video recorded class discussion and journal logs from the teacher/researcher. Findings indicate that the following elements impact producing lifelong musicians: fostering a classroom environment that develops and celebrates students as musicians, creating additional opportunities in the classroom, providing connections with the community, and increasing the overall visibility of music in the school.

Chapter One

Introduction

Researchers have acknowledged that there is a disconnect between the musical experiences and motivations of school ensemble members and those who participate in adult music making (Allsup, 2003; Aspin, 2000; Myers, 2007). Cavitt (2005) stated that “[o]ne terminal goal of music education is to provide opportunities for music students to master music making in such a way that they will independently pursue lifelong learning and fulfillment” (p. 42). An attempt to reduce the disconnect between school music and adult music making and to explore the motivations of adult community musicians who continue to perform will provide insight for current music educators who wish to teach the values of lifelong music participation in their classroom (Cavitt, 2005; Mantie & Tucker, 2008).

The study was designed using a practitioner inquiry approach. Collaboration in this study involved several interactions between adult community band musicians and middle school band members in the form of interviews, classroom conversations, and side-by-side rehearsals. Documentation of this classroom project aims to help music educators understand the importance of connecting students’ music learning in school with adult music making. Jellison (2000) calls this type of transfer of knowledge, skills, and motivation between formal school music education and adult music in the community “transition.” Transition is “a valuable principle that can guide curricular and instructional decisions and increase the probability that meaningful school experiences will continue in adulthood” (Jellison, 2000, p. 121). Within PK-12 school music, transition requires careful planning of experiences that are directly relatable to contexts for music experiences that could be valued in adulthood.

Need for Study

As both a middle school band director and a member of the community band participating in the study, I have the unique opportunity to witness the process of musical learning and engagement from both vantage points: children ages 10-13 and adults whose lifespan ranges from recent high school graduates to those in their 90s. I notice community band members' tremendous dedication to the organization, as well as personal commitment to advancing their musical knowledge and skill. I admire and am compelled by their dedication. I was curious as to the sources of their motivations and the longevity of their musical participation with the goal of informing my own teaching and helping me teach with lifelong music engagement in mind.

Within my middle school bands, I see a wide range of student attitudes toward band. While most students seem to genuinely enjoy the process of learning and making music, others display an uninterested and noncommittal attitude. I often wonder if, once the pressure from their parents and the attachment of a grade which influences their GPA are no longer a factor in their musical education, will the students choose to continue to play their instruments and participate in music as adults? Since I was born and raised in the same area of Northern Ohio in which I now teach, I am incredibly invested in instilling a lifelong appreciation of music in my students. I want the current commitment and dedication to the arts, witnessed in adult community musicians in the area, to continue to flourish well after my middle school students complete their schooling and reach adulthood. How can music educators reduce the disconnect and nurture relevant connections between the role of music in the lives of middle school band members and in the lives of adult community musicians? I agree with researchers who point out that finding ways to connect the community to the school is essential to developing an attitude of cohesiveness in the

musical lives of students as they become adults (Cavitt, 2005; Mantie & Tucker, 2008). While researchers have completed many survey studies on the motivations of community music participants (Bowles, 1991; Cavitt, 2005; Mantie, 2012b; Rohwer, 2009), few have focused on capturing qualitatively the voices of participants during a collaborative project between adult community musicians and middle school music students. Furthermore, I have not located any studies that have focused on studying community musical groups in Northern Ohio.

Purpose Statement and Research Questions

The purpose of this teacher research study was to develop a collaborative classroom project in which adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band interacted with members of the 7th grade band at Port Clinton Middle School with the goal of teaching the importance of lifelong musical engagement. Three main research questions guided this study: 1) What do community band members' interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music? 2) How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians? 3) How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward students' lifelong musical engagement? These questions were explored by observing and documenting the process, and interviewing and recording participants' responses.

Definitions

“Lifelong learning” and “lifelong engagement.” In reference to this study, a distinction needs to be made between the terms “lifelong learning” and “lifelong engagement.” While many researchers use the term “lifelong learning” to describe a goal of music education or a motivation for adults' participation in community music organizations (Aspin, 2010; Cavitt, 2005), from my perspective, the word “learning” implies an environment with structured aims and goals of which

community is not at the center. I believe the term should be reserved for only a specific practice of community music, one in which the primary goal is to teach adults. Mantie (2012a) stated:

One's purpose for learning is most often to do something: golf, play tennis, swim, build a shed, navigate, sew, find out about, bake, fix the bicycle, paint, shop, and yes, make music. Every activity arguably involves some form of learning as a prerequisite; it may or may not involve explicit teaching or instruction. That is, we do not do things in order to learn, we learn in order to do things. When learning takes precedence over doing this distorts the nature of the activity. (p. 223)

Mantie (2012a) also argued that when the rhetoric of "lifelong learning" is pushed upon community music ensembles, the focus changes from "the celebration of community and becomes instead about individual learning accomplishments" (p. 227). My experience as a member of the community band whose members are featured in this study allows me to attest that the celebration of community and making music for fun precedes the objective of learning or individual accomplishments. Individual accomplishments are certainly celebrated, but that is not the primary focus of the ensemble. These inherent values that drive the community band create an interesting dichotomy when compared to the learning community found within a middle school band, which is often structured by state content standards, the need to show student growth, and school administrative requests. In a community band, learning happens inherently throughout the rehearsal process, but it is not the main objective. Therefore, throughout this study the term "lifelong engagement" will be used (Mantie, 2012a). A large part of my personal teaching philosophy is to inspire my students to want to participate in music for the rest of their lives. By choosing to use the term "lifelong engagement," I am acknowledging that my students'

desire to participate in musical activities later in life will most likely not stem from their desire to continue learning in an academic sense, but to be involved in something musical for the social benefits. The term “lifelong engagement” stresses the fact that humans learn in order to participate (Lave & Wenger, 1991), and the inherent learning that occurs in the specific type of community band featured in this study is motivated by social factors. This definition will help guide interactions between the adult community musicians and the middle school band students.

Community music ensemble. The term “community music ensemble” also needs a refined definition in reference to this study. In the most general sense, a community music group is a “service to the entire community via performance” (Bell, 2008, p. 240). However, there is a wide variety of community music ensembles in existence; church choirs, recorder consorts, community bands, and jazz ensembles are just a few of the many possibilities. The community music ensemble featured in this study is a community band. For the purposes of this study, I am referring to the band members as “community musicians.”

The North Coast Concert Band. This is the name of the community band that is featured in this study. It is a non-auditioned concert band that “averages about 70 musicians who come from several communities throughout northwest Ohio. Many professions and ages are represented, and there are ‘family units’—spouses, siblings, children, and grandchildren—among the members” (“Welcome to the NCCB & BB Website,” Retrieved June 22, 2018). It was founded in January, 1983 by a group of music educators who were eager to get back to playing their instruments in an ensemble as well as teaching and conducting from the podium. The band has been led by seven different directors, the current director being Mr. John Kustec, a retired school band director. The Band's constitution, created in February, 1984, states the Band's purposes:

1) To contribute positively to the musical environment of the area it serves, 2) To provide opportunity for individual musical expression and growth among its membership, 3) To provide opportunity for contact among musicians of advanced proficiency, and 4) To reconfirm the Community Concert Band position in American music (“Welcome to the NCCB & BB Website,” Retrieved June 22, 2018.).

The group holds weekly rehearsals in a local high school band room early October through early June and performs about seven concerts per year.

Informal music learning. Green (2008) identified five principles of informal music learning: 1) music is chosen by the learners themselves, 2) copying the music of recordings by ear is the main method of learning, 3) peer and/or self-directed learning is the largest part of the process, 4) skills and knowledge are put together in “haphazard, idiosyncratic, and holistic ways, and 5) the integration of listening, performing, composing, and improvising processes” (p. 10). According to Green (2008), these principles set the processes of informal music learning apart from formal music learning which occurs in the school music classroom. The definition of informal music learning in the context of this study involving the North Coast Concert Band (NCCB) will focus on Green’s (2008) first, third, and fourth principles above. NCCB members come together, with the leadership of the director, to choose music that not only they will enjoy performing, but also that the targeted audience will enjoy listening to. Additionally, while the director is in charge of rehearsing the ensemble from the podium, most of the learning of the music happens on an individual basis, and little emphasis is placed on pedagogy or development of individual skills within the ensemble, so it often comes together haphazardly. These principles (Green, 2008), which differ greatly from principles of a traditional middle school band room, will be reflected in the questions that are asked of both the adults and students. Additionally, it is

the goal that the adult community musicians will influence the middle school band members in relation to these principles.

Additionally, many researchers (Cavitt, 2005; Mantie, 2012b; Rohwer, 2009; Rohwer, 2010) have data that points to the importance of the social aspect of community music ensembles as a large reason for why people participate in community music. Cavitt's (2005) study revealed that "70 percent of the respondents indicated that enjoyment and having fun was the most important reason for participation in community band. Social interaction (25.1%) and being able to play with a group (12.9%) were also important factors" (p. 51). From my unique position as both the researcher and a participant in the NCCB, I believe it is important to consider the enjoyment and social aspects of the community music ensemble when defining "informal music learning" for the purposes of this study. These aspects are easily overlooked in the traditional middle school band room, yet are synonymous with my philosophy and use of the term "lifelong musical engagement." One goal of the implementation of this study is to nurture the enjoyment and social aspects found in creating community within the middle school band room.

The literature review in chapter two explores existing literature on community music that is related to the study's purpose and research questions described in this chapter. Chapter three describes in detail the methodology of the study, including: research design, context, personal orientation, selection of participants, data collection, and analysis strategies. Chapter four provides detailed profiles and narratives of the participants as well as explores the data from the different phases of the project. Chapter five presents findings by the exploration of emergent themes, returning to the research questions, and relating to relevant past studies. Finally, chapter six considers implications for teaching middle school students, as well as future directions emerging from findings of this collaborative classroom project.

Chapter Two

A Review of Literature

Introduction

Higgins (2012) defined three perspectives of community music, which helped guide this review of literature: “(1) music of a community, (2) communal music making, and (3) an active intervention between a music leader or facilitator and participants” (p. 3). My approach to the literature focuses on the second and third perspectives above, with an additional goal of exploring the motivations of adult community musicians. The development of community music participants and lifelong music learners begins in the PK-12 classroom when the teacher influences the motivation of students’ learning. Researchers have acknowledged that there is a disconnect between the musical experiences of school ensemble members and adult musicians (Allsup, 2003; Aspin, 2000; Myers, 2007). An attempt to eliminate this disconnect and explore the motivations of adult community musicians in both formal ensemble and informal music making settings could be useful for current music educators who wish to nurture lifelong music learners in their classroom (Cavitt, 2005; Mantie & Tucker, 2008).

The following literature review explores topics regarding community music, and it creates a foundation for future study into community music involvement and the creation of lifelong music engagement. The five categories of literature to be examined are: a) What motivates adults to participate in community music? b) What motivational factors are involved in the process of informal music making? c) What do scholars describe to be the benefits of community music? d) What curricular approaches can foster a sense of lifelong music engagement? and e) What recurring themes appear in research regarding intergenerational educational programs?

What motivates adults to participate in community music?

Bowles (1991) surveyed adults' interest in participating in music as prospective participants in adult music education. The researcher sent out a survey of 55 questions to 800 randomly sampled subjects. The questionnaire contained questions about three categories: prior musical experiences, musical interests, and education preferences. The questionnaire resulted in a 38% response rate, and a total of 275 questionnaires (34%) were analyzed. 67% of the total respondents gave a positive response to the question, "If conditions were convenient, and given the opportunity to take something of interest, would you enroll in a music course?" (Bowles, 1991, p. 194). Most participants listed private lessons and participation in performance organizations as their prior experience; additionally, self-directed music learning was frequently reported. "Positive attitude toward participation was found to be significantly related both to current involvement and to early participation in classroom general music. Parents and home were the most frequently cited positive influences in developing music interests" (p. 191).

Cavitt (2005) advocated that "one terminal goal of music education is to provide opportunities for music students to master music making in such a way that will allow them to independently pursue lifelong learning and fulfillment" (p. 42). She carried out a survey study that investigated factors influencing 401 adults' participation in ten community bands from Texas, Michigan, and California. Subjects who had been involved in a community band for an average of 8.1 years were asked to respond to 30 questions that covered "demographic variables, descriptions of previous music instruction, performance history, attitudes toward various aspects of active and passive music participation, and perceived benefits of music participation" (Cavitt, 2005, p. 45), and additionally the influence of family and home on music participation. Survey results showed 78.1% of the respondents had chosen "secondary school-related music

experience” as the experience they perceived to be most influential to the development of their music interests. 52% of the respondents also indicated that “home influences prior to formal education” were influential experiences. Data from the open-response questions revealed that “70 percent of the respondents indicated that enjoyment and having fun was the most important reason for participation in community band. Social interaction (25.1%) and being able to play with a group (12.9%) were also important factors” (Cavitt, 2005, p. 51). Additionally, “personal satisfaction (sense of accomplishment, increased self-esteem, pride, self-discipline)” (pp. 53-54) and playing satisfying repertoire motivated their participation.

Rohwer (2009) conducted a quantitative survey study of 94 band members from three states: 28 middle school band participants from three middle schools and 66 senior citizen band participants from three adult bands. The researcher’s goal was to describe and compare adult and middle school band members’ perceptions of music teaching and learning, such as effective teaching and musical environment. The band members were surveyed at rehearsal, where they were asked to complete a questionnaire with 49 questions including: 26 Likert-type questions on effective teaching, eight Likert-type items on perceptions of ensemble participation, eight ranking questions on music preference, four open-ended questions on music participation, and three demographic questions. A mixed ANOVA was used to determine differences between the adults’ and middle school students’ answers. More about the analysis and findings of this study will be discussed in greater detail later in the literature review. However, it is important to point out within this specific section that the data showed that 52% of respondents noted that the most enjoyable aspect of being in band was “the combination of the music and the group experience” (Rohwer, 2009, p. 68).

Roulston (2010) applied Robert Schumann’s maxim, ‘There is no end to learning’, to the

concept of adult music learning. The author reviewed several studies by researchers in the field of adult education as well as introducing new developments in the field of adult education that could be applicable to adult music education. In the discussion of adults' orientations and reasons for learning, the author lists three different types of adult learners. 'Goal-oriented' learners respond to specific learning goals by taking a class or joining a group, 'activity-oriented' learners participate for reasons that may not have explicit connections to the content of the activity, and 'learning-oriented' learners take part for the act of learning itself. Roulston (2010) argued that "adult education research indicates that learners are likely to engage in musical activities and learning opportunities for multiple and complex reasons and that reasons for learning may change over time" (p. 344).

Shansky (2010) performed a case study in 2007 of the Bergen Philharmonic Orchestra in New Jersey with the goal of exploring the motivations of adult professional and amateur musicians who participated in community orchestras. The purposive sample of seven participants (three professional and four non-professional) was interviewed and observed during rehearsal while the researcher participated by playing in the rehearsals. Interview questions for the seven orchestra members included inquiry into why they joined, what they enjoy most and what they enjoy least about orchestra membership. The author gathered data in two ways: interviews and participant observation. After triangulation and coding, three themes were uncovered from the data: "(1) the desire to remain active musically, (2) the learning opportunity presented by participation and (3) frustrations in participation" (Shansky, 2010, n.p.). It is important to note that there was virtually no difference in responses from the professional and amateur musicians. "The responses were uniform: love of playing one's instrument, desire for musical challenge, inspiration for practice and commitment to the organization" (n. p.).

The purpose of Mantie's (2012b) study was to examine the characteristics, attitudes and perceptions of adult community band musicians ($N = 275$) in nine randomly selected ensembles in Canada in order to glean insights into how music education might facilitate (a) more meaningful connections between school and community, and (b) greater lifespan engagement with participatory music making (p. 21). The theoretical frameworks of Lave and Wenger's (1991) situated learning, leisure theory, and quality-of-life theory guided the study. The 95-question survey had five sections: the first included 25 dichotomous variables related to present and past experience; the second contained 25 five-point Likert-scale questions about attitudes and perceptions; the third had 18 categorical variables related to frequency and duration and three ranking questions; the fourth contained 12 open-ended questions asking about personal experiences and perceptions; the final section asked 12 questions related to demographic and socioeconomic status. Descriptive data was generated for all questions, and several methods including ANOVA, t-test and chi-test were employed to help statistically sort the data. The data suggested that while social factors within a community band might be a component, they are not the primary reason for ensemble members' involvement.

This finding was corroborated by a question in another section of the questionnaire that asked respondents to supply at least three answers to the question, "Why did you choose to involve yourself with a community band?" Responses included the following general categories: love of music/playing (28%), maintain/improve playing (14%), hobby/recreation/use of time (10%), and enjoyment/fun (8%). (Mantie, 2012b, p. 28)

Additionally, 31% of respondents reported that the ensemble they play in is not the closest one to where they live, showing that many members were selective about the musical level of the group, the individuals in the group, repertoire choices of the group, or the conductor of the

group. In addition to detailed discussion related to the researcher's findings, the article also discussed many implications for music education in PK-12 schools.

In summary, there is a variety of reasons that motivate adults to participate in community music. From the desire to remain active in music (Shansky, 2010) to social interaction (Cavitt, 2005), these motivations are often complex and typically change over time (Roulston, 2010). Additionally, evidence shows that both secondary school music experiences (Cavitt, 2005) as well as parents and the home (Bowles, 1991) play large roles in fostering lifelong interest in and engagement with music.

What motivational factors are involved in the process of informal music making?

To address the implications of group informal music learning in a formal classroom, Jaffurs (2004) performed an ethnographic study on a rock band that included one of her former students. She interviewed the five young adult members of the band, along with their parents, and observed rehearsals. The ethnographic study concluded after the band rehearsed about 20 times and composed two songs. She pointed out that "whilst the results of this case study may not be generalizable to a larger population, the results may be used to better understand what motivates children to seek outside methods for creating music from their own culture" (Jaffurs, 2004, p. 196). She observed several musical and social tendencies throughout the band rehearsals and reported that "the dual informal practices of peer learning and peer critique were impressive" (Jaffurs, 2004, p. 197). The band members said that there was no clear leader in the group and they made decisions collaboratively. Although her former student had made his garage band involvement public to her, none of the other members had told their former instrumental music teachers that they were involved in a band, demonstrating a separation in students' minds of formal versus informal music making. She believes that if educators can free themselves of bias

and cater their lessons toward what students are truly interested in and capable of, they will reap positive results. “School can be a place where positive musical identities are established, but not if students believe that the musicians they are in school are different from the musicians they are in their garage” (Jaffurs, 2004, p. 198).

Green’s (2008) book, *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy* describes “a pedagogical project which aimed to investigate whether it would be possible and beneficial to bring at least some aspects of informal popular music learning practices into the realms of the school classroom” (p. 9). The research, conducted with 13-14 year old students in post-primary schools in the greater London area from 2001 to 2008, led to the identification of five principles of informal music learning: 1) music is chosen by the learners themselves, 2) copying the music of recordings by ear is the main method of learning, 3) peer and/or self-directed learning is the largest part of the process, 4) skills and knowledge are put together in “haphazard, idiosyncratic, and holistic ways” (pp. 5, 10) the integration of listening, performing, composing, and improvising processes. These principles aided in the development of a new pedagogy, which when used as complementary to a traditional curriculum, could help teachers engage teenagers with music. The first part of Green’s (2008) pedagogy involves “dropping pupils into the deep end” (p. 25) with a lot of self-directed instruction and the second stage involves “modeling aural learning with popular music” (p. 25).

Mantie (2012a) argued in his position paper that the term “lifelong learning” should be used very carefully and specifically. After presenting a review of literature concerning several topics such as community music participation, lifelong learning, adult music education, Mantie explained his view that the use of the phrases lifelong learning and adult music education are not synonymous. “My contention is that invoking ‘lifelong learning’ carries higher risks than

rewards. It is not that learning is unimportant, of course. We cannot do without learning. However, if we place learning above doing we devalue the joy of participation” (p. 228). He places great value on emphasizing the sense of community versus the benefits of personal learning achievements. Similarly, Mantie and Tucker (2008) proposed the focus of community ensembles to be lifelong participation or lifelong engagement rather than lifelong learning. If too much emphasis is placed on learning, informal community music ensembles will lose adult amateur musicians who value participating in music for pleasure and as a social outlet.

Herzig and Baker (2014) analyzed and discussed the creative process of the jazz jam session, a popular form of informal music making, from a historical and social perspective, based on literature reviews, oral history, survey results, and interviews. Their analysis produced seven factors that facilitate the successful outcome of a jazz jam session: individual knowledge and competence of the field, practicing improvisation as the ability to overcome self-consciousness, establishing a system for mentoring and role models, democracy and collaboration, leaders and sidemen, community support, and continuous evaluation systems. These seven traits were discussed and exemplified as possible facilitators for any group engaging in the creative process and are transferrable to many different forms of informal music making. The authors concluded that “[o]ur current educational system, in an era of standardized testing, doesn't favor the principles of taking risks and learning from failure. On the other hand, the ability to generate ideas and take risks is currently cited as one of the most important traits for employment” (Herzig & Baker, 2014, p. 215).

In summary, multiple researchers have found educational value and promise within the processes of informal music making and learning (Green, 2008; Herzig & Baker, 2014; Jaffurs, 2004), such as an emphasis on the creative process, and the willingness to learn from several

tries or failures. Mantie (2012a) also values the emphasis on community versus personal learning achievements in community settings.

What do scholars describe to be the benefits of community music?

While many studies reviewed throughout this section focus on the benefits of music on the overall community, Bowles (1991) argued that community music can also be an asset to school music programs.

Adults who may be served by adult education are those who provide home music environments and experiences for their children, who participate in making crucial decisions regarding the quality of music experiences in the schools, and who support and participate in music and the arts in the community. If we are to secure the future of music as an art in our society, we must consider more carefully the music education of the present generation of adults. (pp. 203-204)

Aspin (2000) reported that “changes in society, economy, theories of learning and the power of modern communication technology impact upon, but are also promoted by, work in the arts” (p. 78). People involved with the arts are learning and creating new modes of thinking and participate in the ultimate model of individual participation within a cooperative group.

Furthermore, participation in the arts involves problem solving that can be transmitted to any type of work force.

In Bell’s (2008) position paper on community music, the President of the Music Educators National Conference (MENC) in the early 1990s, Peter Dykema was “stalwart in directing the promotion of community music” (p. 236). This was due, in part, to the democratization of music in America. Community music groups often serve as a signature for the community and give it an individual identity. In community music ensembles, members come

together to work toward a common goal, keep the interest in music alive, and indulge in the creative process of music making. Bell's 2008 position paper addressed two concerns of community choirs: from 1962 to 2000 there was a shift in age of community choir members from under 40 years old to over 40 years old, and community choirs were experiencing declining membership. Bell posed the question: "Is this an issue of recruitment, leadership, or a lack of interest and support for lifelong singing?" (p. 232). To explore the question, Bell researched the advantages and disadvantages of requiring an audition for a place in a community choir. He described a community choir in Australia that suddenly changed to an auditioned system in the early 2000s after hiring a new director with "greater ambitions". The change resulted in the rejection of former members who felt "devastated" after being involved for several years (Bell, 2008, pp. 234-235). According to Bell, these observations support "Dewey's educational perspective, [that] when an adult singer volunteers to be in a chorus, and is declined membership based on an audition, there is a breach of a fundamental democratic right" (p. 237). Through Bell's observations, she found that long-standing community organizations that "allow all comers to participate in a cooperative group effort (a choir) that results in serving the larger community (in a broad sense) then [community musicians] are practising the most basic and fundamental democratic principles" (p. 239).

The goal of Kertz-Welzel's (2016) article was, through a historical-critical method, to "understand what community music is and to improve its foundations in order to better utilize community music's educational potential" (pp. 114-115). Community music (CM), based on ethnomusicological research, "tries to implement the notion of music for all that transforms societies and people" (p. 113). However, few scholars have philosophically challenged or criticized the concept of CM, likely due to a disinterest in challenging such a successful project

and/or the desire of CM participants to separate themselves from higher education and scholarly research. The critique includes three sections. The first explored existing definitions of CM from the Community Music Activity Communion of the International Society for Music Education and scholars such as Lee Higgins. All share a common ideal of “music-making for all, where... all distinctions regarding talented, untalented, or high and low culture are overcome,” which exemplifies “a realm far removed from all problems formal music education has” (Kertz-Welzel, 2016, p. 117). The second section discussed theoretical and philosophical challenges regarding CM. Anti-intellectualism amongst CM members and the fascination of *kitsch* are brought to the forefront. The third section discussed issues related to music education “such as community music’s notion of music teaching and learning or the meaning of high education and research” (p. 115). Especially for its participants, CM is an emotionally charged subject which makes it difficult to challenge. But, as the author concludes, “together, community music and music education could really make a much-needed contribution to musicking internationally and thereby help to transform communities and individual lives significantly” (p. 128).

In summary, the research presented in this section examined many different benefits of community music on the community as a whole (Aspin, 2000; Bell, 2008). Additionally, Bowles (1991) argued that the education and opportunities given to adult musicians directly affect younger generations, and Kertz-Welzel (2016) believes the teaming of community music and formal music education could transform communities.

What curricular approaches can foster a sense of lifelong music engagement?

Jellison (2000) explored the idea of music learning, more specifically, “how all learners acquire music knowledge and skills through their school experiences and the impact of school music experiences on their adult musical lives” (p. 111). The researcher described education as

“intended to improve the quality of life” (p. 113), and inferred that schools of the future will change and operate under the main goal of preparing students for adult life. She introduced a different approach to teaching students involving a guiding principle of transition, which she defined as “the movement of individuals across a variety of school and nonschool environments throughout life,” and argued that it is “a valuable principle that can guide curricular and instructional decisions and increase the probability that meaningful school experiences will continue in adulthood” (p. 121). Planning for transition requires music experiences in school that are directly related to contexts for music experiences that could be valued in adulthood. She offered empirical support for the principle of transition by citing various educational research studies on transfer of learning. The biggest defining factor of a music program designed on the principle of transition is the opportunity for students to practice skills and knowledge in context.

In the same collection of essays that included Jellison’s important chapter, *Vision 2020: The Housewright Symposium on the Future of Music Education*, Yarborough (2000) discussed the question of “what should be the relationship between schools and other sources of music learning?” (p. 193). She considered issues that affect schools and music education, other sources of music learning that will exist in the future, and relationships among the various sources. The author stated:

Music educators, like other professional educators, must help students and their parents understand and make the connection between music and life. We must help students transfer what they have learned in music to what they will do with it when they leave the school setting. Teaching must include not only musical concepts and skills, but also how those concepts and skills can function for us through our lifetime. (p. 199)

Yarborough (2000) urged music educators, instead of fighting to save the same pedagogical approaches that exist in schools today, to hold themselves accountable for making music an important part of every person's life. She wrote: "We should maximize efforts to involve all people in our communities in meaningful, functional music listening and performing" (p. 199), with consideration to exposing students and communities to different genres of music that might not be easily accessible. She predicted that music education of the future will be more community-based instead of school-based. Additionally, "recreational music learning will become even more popular as increasing technological efficiency creates more leisure and the population of retired workers becomes larger" (Yarborough, 2000, p. 202).

In an ethnographic study, Allsup (2003) used philosophical inquiry, collaborative inquiry, and participant observation to investigate the notion of democracy as a community that is formed in small-group, school-music learning communities. The researcher and nine band students, ages 14-17, gathered to "create music that was meaningful and self-reflective" (p. 24). They split up into two separate groups and met for 2.5 hours after school, once a week, for 11 weeks. Rather than composing on their traditional band instruments, group one chose to use electric guitar, bass, drums, and synthesized piano. Group two composed music on their traditional band instruments. The culture of each group was largely decided by the choice of a genre and the traditions and creative practices that governed it. Based on their experiences, the researchers and composers decided that classical music was not conducive to group composing or the building of a community.

Composing in a jazz or popular style was conceived of as fun, nonobligatory, self-directed, and personally meaningful. In such settings, there was an emphasis on

interpersonal relationships, peer learning and peer critique, as well as an expectation that members will take care of each other (Allsup, 2003, p. 24).

Allsup argued that the themes and findings presented in this study “unveil possibilities for a reconceptualization of instrumental music learning in the school” (p. 29). The large amounts of peer learning that occurred within the small compositional groups had less to do with the transmission of skills than it did the process of discovery. Creating an open, workable space can illicit this type of peer learning and activity.

Multiple scholars call for greater community and school partnership and agree that schools need to provide students with more information about community organizations to foster an overall culture that is supportive of the arts (Aspin, 2005; Mantie & Tucker, 2008; Myers, 2007). Additionally, Aspin (2005) argued: “[T]he involvement of artists, craftspeople and designers with schools can serve as an excellent vehicle for creating a sense of community involvement and cohesion” (p. 84). This information, along with educators’ attempts to make students realize that their learning holds a deeper underlying purpose and set of skills, can help foster lifelong musical engagement.

Myers (2007) argued that, “school music programs in the United States are too concerned with preparing and polishing large ensemble performances, such that students do not have the skills needed for life-long musical involvement” (p. 49). By referencing survey results and scholarly articles by various researchers, Myers supported his claim that there is a disconnect between school music programs and community music engagement. “Were it not for the lifelong human need for music, there would be little reason for the school-based professional enterprise known today as music education” (p. 52).

Mantie and Tucker (2008) conducted three focus group interviews with members of three community ensembles. The total number of participants was not disclosed, but the researchers included direct quotes in their article from six different participants. Examples of questions include: “From grade five to grade twelve you’ve been involved in these music programmes, and this strong sense of family and closeness and these communities. You’ve made friends and great relationships with your conductors and all that sort of stuff. The end of grade twelve comes and then what?” (p. 219) and “When you got to grade twelve and it was your last year of high school, what did you think was going to happen the year after with your music?” (p. 223). Concurrent with the nature of focus group interviews, the quotes included in the article from interviews were very informal with a conversational feel. After conducting the focus group interviews, the authors analyzed the data through the lens of Lave and Wenger’s (1991) theory of situated learning and composed two overarching questions regarding formal school music education: “(1) Why do students not view community bands, orchestras or choirs as the object of their learning, and (2) Why do teachers not view community bands, orchestras or choirs as the object of their teaching?” (p. 225). As two former school band directors, the researchers were especially interested in “the gap existing between school music teaching and learning practices, and lifelong engagement with active music-making” (p. 218). “The self-perceived outcomes of the music programme, such as critical thinking and self-confidence were found to be influential in the development of lifelong learning skills, but traditional performing ensembles in secondary schools were not found to encourage lifelong involvement in music” (p. 217). Many of the participants interviewed for this study explained that their home influences or experiences of their friends or family had inspired them to pursue opportunities to continue making music after high school.

In an ethnographic study, Kruse (2009) studied the Cosmopolitan Music Society in Edmonton, Alberta, Canada, and the New Horizons Band in East Lansing, Michigan. The researcher defined the term andragogy as “self-directed learning behaviours that may indicate that independent musicianship has evolved and has manifested in self-governing actions in respect to specific musical settings” (p. 216). With the methods of observations, interviews, artifact collection, and immersion, Kruse studied these two groups of musicians and developed the themes of “inspiration for pursuing music, denied or delayed access to music instruction, motivation, flow, personal wellness and being part of a community” (p. 217). However, Kruse chose to focus on the challenges the adults faced while studying music, bringing to the forefront “several confounding musical characteristics that may be elusive to our students, and, perhaps, elusive even to us, those who work with adult musicians in community settings and who take special interest in promoting lifelong music making” (p. 217). General challenges reported in adult music participation included: establishing a self-concept as a musician, power sharing, and self-directed behaviors and beliefs. “The degree to which individuals were satisfied with musical experiences depended on the level of musical difficulty, the teaching styles of instructors, the ownership and sense of belonging to the larger community and a strong awareness of reciprocity within that community” (Kruse, 2009, p. 222). The author emphasized the importance of music educators applying lessons drawn from studies of adult music learning including:

Highlighting the role of the teacher in facilitating musical empowerment among students, examining the extent to which the concept of andragogy can or should be embraced by school music education, stressing the often disparate and conflicted relationship between school music and community music, and, finally, relating the many ways in which music functions

within community ensembles and, thus, determining how and to what degree this may be replicated in school music programmes. (p. 224)

Returning to Rohwer's 2009 survey of adult and middle school band members with the goal of describing and comparing their perspectives on music education issues, findings confirmed that there was no statistically significant difference between many of the responses of the older and younger musicians. In terms of important traits of strong teaching, both age groups rated personality characteristics highest, followed by instructional skills and, finally, musical skills. Therefore, "students may value how something is presented more than the content itself" (p. 69). Additional findings supported that the similarities between both age groups of musicians can be used to make informed educational decisions for the betterment of both age groups, for example:

While the younger musicians wanted music to be chosen that was enjoyable, the adults noted that the appropriateness of the music should be paramount. And while the youngsters wanted to add jazz and pop, the adults wanted to add classical. These results might be a reminder that balance is always important. (Rohwer, 2009, p. 71)

Mantie's 2012b study, discussed in detail earlier, also identified various implications for music education gleaned from the researcher's questionnaire given to community band members. Only 73% of respondents "agreed or strongly agreed that their school music experience prepared them well for participating in their community band" (p. 37). The researcher argued that this should be of great concern to educators who want to teach peripherally and for transition of musical knowledge past high school.

In her book *Chances and Choices: Exploring the Impact of Music Education*, Pitts (2012) drew from qualitative data from her study of the life histories of over 100 adults with an

active interest in music in the United Kingdom and Italy to address several key themes in music education. While she noted that it is difficult to pinpoint the ideal music curriculum through interviewing these community musicians, she did conclude that the strongest impressions were left on the respondents by the enthusiasm of their teachers and a sense of sharing a passion for music.

For many respondents, the specific skills and repertoire of school music had become obsolete in their later lives, but in the most positive cases they had retained a lifelong awareness of how to develop musically: they knew the effort involved in rehearsing for a performance as well as the rewards that resulted from doing so, and in their adult lives some had sought opportunities to replicate that experience in new contexts or had benefitted from the additional insight this afforded them to learn as listeners and regular concert-goers. (Pitts, 2012, p. 174)

While Pitts argued that music in schools should provide foundational learning in terms of sufficient literacy and to ensure children have access to continued musical development if they choose, as well as an introduction to the cultural heritage of music, in many cases the passion of the teacher can make all the difference. In the conclusion of the book, she offered several suggestions to music educators including: embracing students' cultures to allow them to discover new perspectives about their own music, recognizing students' independently acquired expertise, and taking time to teach about the possibilities of long-term musical engagement.

Jutras et al. (2015) completed a qualitative study of adults' perceptions and experiences of learning musical instruments by interviewing 15 adults (eight men and seven women) in the Southeast United States who were recruited from community music groups and private lesson instructors. The researchers conducted in-depth qualitative interviews ranging from 30 to 60

minutes with each adult, then transcribed and inductively analyzed data by applying open codes. The participants described “prior experiences as strongly influential in relation to decision making concerning current learning” (n.p.). Furthermore, participants in the study indicated that “learning as an adult brought “maturity” and “tranquility” that was absent as a young learner, that learning as an adult was “more fun”; and that they were “more aware” or “less resistant” as an adult learner” (n. p.). The authors argued that, “given the growing numbers of adults engaged in musical activities, information concerning adults’ experiences and perspectives of music instruction and music-making is needed to inform pedagogical practices of music teachers” (n. p.). The adults felt their ensemble teachers and directors were invested in them holistically as people, and the article lists a potential implication for music educators of children as the ability to meet children where they are in their development and “work with young students in age-appropriate ways to enhance their musical development” (n. p.).

Additionally, Jaffurs (2004) used her observations to revamp her own teaching style and philosophy.

By understanding how children construct a method for teaching themselves, music teachers may discover alternative methods for creating a learning environment... I was impressed by what my students in the garage band could do without anyone in charge. They collaborated and worked toward a common goal that they had a vested interest in.” (p. 196).

The research studies described above present a variety of ideas for music educators to foster a sense of lifelong music participation in their students. Yarborough’s (2000) prediction that music learning will become more community based, Jellison’s (2000) concept of transition, and Mantie and Tucker’s (2008) belief that community ensembles should be the ending goal of a

school music program could guide educators in revisiting their philosophy to encourage lifelong learning. In terms of practical strategies presented within the research, Jutras (2015) emphasized the importance of directors' holistic interest in their students, Rohwer (2009) showed that the presentation of material is more important than the material itself, and Jaffurs (2004) showed how she revamped her teaching style to better match her students' natural ability to collaborate.

What recurring themes appear in research regarding intergenerational educational programs?

Manheimer (1997) argued “[t]he growing popularity of innovative intergenerational education programs could make them an important and enduring component of lifelong learning in the future” (p. 79). Primarily concerned with programs that identify specific learning goals and aim to enhance educational ventures through multigenerational perspectives, the article defined intergenerational education and its learning opportunities, offered rationales for intergenerational educational programs, described transforming effects of intergenerational education, and discussed the difference between intergenerational and age-segregated programs. The many rationales for intergenerational education form a continuum with “doing for,” a service orientation at one end and “learning with,” a communal-developmental learning orientation, at the other (p. 81). Additionally, the author argued that it is important to find balance between “sentimental” and “utilitarian” standpoints, with a good example being the orientation of civic education or virtue (pp. 81-82). In addition to education and learning about oneself and the conditions of life of an older or younger person, the author concludes:

Additionally, co-learning programs seek to promote and enhance learning of skills and a body of knowledge by drawing on the fellowship fostered between younger and older persons to illuminate a particular subject matter such as an historical event, social

problems, work of literature, or the study of aging and human development.

(Mainheimer, 1997, p. 80)

Alfano (2008) aimed to contribute information on the experiences of participants and potential benefits of intergenerational educational programs. The article explored literature relating to intergenerational programs and theories, while describing how a program established by the researcher relates to the theories and epitomizes intergenerational interaction. The literature review and comparison explored five different types of intergenerational interactions: curriculum-based, relationship-based, reciprocal relations, community-based, and authentic work, as well as addressed how different age groups perceive and act toward each other. The author concluded that his LaSalle educational model, in which senior citizens and adolescents collaboratively learn to play band instruments, exhibited “all the ingredients of a successful and enriching intergenerational programme” (p. 262). Regarding benefits to the different age groups, the author stated that the activity of learning to play a band instrument “is the same but the benefits are different—at least at this stage in each of their lives. When the groups learn together, there is an interaction effect that may enhance the experience for both” (p. 263).

In conclusion, researchers (Alfano, 2008; Manheimer, 1997) have alluded that intergenerational educational programs can be beneficial for both the younger and older age groups involved, especially if they include a good balance of sentimentality and structure, and keep educational goals at the core. This research will help to inform my present study as my middle school students will be working with older, retired adults.

Suggestions for Future Research

Several implications for music education are discussed in the previous section of this literature review. Perhaps the most general suggestion for future research on this topic is

continuing to fill the gap between musical encounters of school-aged students and those of adult community music participants. Mantie and Tucker (2008) stated:

Based on what we heard from our research participants, it would seem music teaching, as it presently occurs in many schools, is premised on the belief that the goal of the activity is to ‘make it’ to grade twelve, after which point one can safely pack the instrument away in a closet until it is time for one’s own children to play an instrument in the school’s band. (p. 218)

Additionally, continuing to research the motivations for community music participants to participate in music making will help define the ideas on which music educators need to focus to encourage a lifelong appreciation of music for their students. While in Cavitt’s (2005) study, “70 percent of the respondents indicated that enjoyment and having fun was the most important reason for participation in community band” (p. 51), the “desire to remain active musically” was the highest-ranking response in Shansky’s 2010 study.

Implications of literature review for present study. The conflicting results of these and many other studies within this literature review support the conclusion that more research needs to be carried out on this topic. Furthermore, refining research on current formal music education in schools and how to make it more relevant to students’ needs and interests will make music even more appealing when students graduate and make the choice of whether or not to continue with music. By observing the interactions between adult community band participants and middle school band members, this study will analyze both motivations for community music participants and how current music educators can utilize that information to make it relevant to their students and to instill a sense of lifelong music engagement. It will provide information on

how to help fill the gap between musical experiences of school-aged students and those of adult community music participants.

Chapter Three

Methodology

Purpose Statement and Research Questions

The purpose of this teacher research study was to develop a collaborative classroom project in which adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band interacted with members of the 7th grade band at Port Clinton Middle School with the goal of teaching the importance of lifelong musical engagement. Three main research questions guided this study: a) What do community band members' interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music? b) How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians? and c) How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward students' lifelong musical engagement? These questions were explored by observing and documenting the process, and interviewing and recording participants' responses.

Research Design

This study used a practitioner inquiry approach, as it involved systematic and intentional inquiry of my own practice and students' learning. More specifically, this study is teacher research and included data from multiple sources: a) interviews, b) surveys, c) video recorded classroom discussions, and d) an informal teacher/researcher observation journal. Teacher researchers provide an important "insider" perspective on teaching and learning due to their intimate knowledge of teaching and of their students (Robbins, 2014). Teacher researchers embrace their own environment to make discoveries about both their teaching and their students' learning. They are able to be "systematic and intentional" which "provides a touchstone for defining the work of researching teachers" (Robbins, Burbank, & Dunkle, 2007, p. 42). In posing my research questions, I was "challenging the status quo" of my 7th grade band class (Robbins,

2014, p. 190). The research is personal, as it “represents not only the search for general principles or theories of school curriculum or classroom instruction but also the search for understanding and improving one’s everyday practice” (Zeichner & Noffke, 2001, p. 307). This study was designed with the unique needs of my students in mind, and with the ultimate goal of finding more effective ways to apply its findings to my teaching practices (with the hope that it will be transferrable to other music teaching situations as well).

Context of Study

This study took place January 8- February 7, 2018 (about 5 weeks) and involved two groups of participants: Port Clinton Middle School students and adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band. Data collection took place in two primary locations: Port Clinton Middle School and Bellevue High School (location of the NCCB rehearsals). Following are detailed descriptions of the groups in which the participants hold membership.

Port Clinton Middle School Students. The Port Clinton Middle School 7th grade band consists of about 50 students. The students are 11-13 years of age. It is a very active group that meets every day of the school year for 43 minutes and performs an average of three concerts each school year, and additionally performs at the Ohio Music Education Association (OMEA) Large Group Adjudicated Event. Several students also take advantage of other performance opportunities such as OMEA Solo and Ensemble and various honors ensembles throughout the year. The entire 7th grade band participated in classroom discussions during the study, and six students were purposefully selected to participate in the focus group interviews. Considerations for selection included the students’ instrumentation, musicianship/ability levels, personality traits, and work ethic.

The city of Port Clinton, known as “The Walleye Capital of the World,” is a suburban city on Lake Erie that thrives on tourism. Port Clinton’s population is made up of 93% White, 7% Hispanic or Latino, 2% Black or African American, 2% Multi-Racial, .2% Asian, and .1% American Indian¹ (“Population Demographics for Port Clinton, Ohio in 2016 and 2015,” Retrieved June 28, 2019.). Port Clinton’s estimated median household income is \$45,300. It is my experience that numerous social and financial inequalities between the citizens of the extremely affluent Catawba Island Township and those of low socio-economic status that live within the city limits of Port Clinton create a large disparity within the students of the school district. These two extremely different communities that are a part of Port Clinton City School District have been featured as a case study in Robert D. Putman’s book *Our Kids: The American Dream in Crisis* (Putnam, 2015).

Port Clinton Middle School, (PCMS) educates about 435 students in sixth through eighth grades. PCMS’ student population consists of 82% White, 9% Hispanic, and 7% Multi-Racial, and 2% other. Forty-eight percent of PCMS students participate in the free and reduced lunch program (Port Clinton Middle School Demographic Data, n.d.). PCMS operates on trimesters and a deliberately structured grade-level team schedule, and in 2016, was one of 15 schools in the nation to be honored as a National Forum School to Watch by the U. S. Department of Education. PCMS was also re-designated for this honor in 2018.

North Coast Concert Band. The adult community musicians were purposefully selected from the North Coast Concert Band, located in Bellevue, Ohio, of which I am a member. Considerations for selection included the adult musicians’ instrumentation, musicianship/ability

¹ The researcher recognizes that these total percentages add up to greater than 100%. It is possible that the survey was set up for overlap, and the category of “white” encompasses members of other ethnic groups.

levels, personality traits, and prior experience in PK-12 schools. The North Coast Concert Band is a non-auditioned community concert band that “averages about 70 musicians who come from several communities throughout northwest Ohio. Many professions and ages are represented, and there are “family units”—spouses, siblings, children, and grandchildren—among the members” (Welcome to the NCCB & BB Website, Retrieved June 28, 2019.). The group holds weekly rehearsals in a local high school band room early October through early June and performs about seven concerts per year in various venues across Northern Ohio.

Personal Orientation as Researcher

I am the band director at Port Clinton Middle School, where I have been teaching for the past four years. I started the students involved with this study on their instruments at the beginning of their 6th grade year. I have been a teacher for the past six years; prior to my position at PCMS I was the band director for Montpelier Exempted Village School for two years. Additionally, I am an active member in the North Coast Concert Band (NCCB), in which I play flute, piccolo, and alto saxophone. The band rehearses every Tuesday night, October through June, for an hour and a half. I have been a member of the NCCB for two years; prior to my membership in the NCCB I lived in a different community and played in the local community band for two years. I am also the teacher of the middle school band students involved in this study; the middle school band rehearses Monday through Friday for 43 minutes.

My father is a retired public school band director and has been the NCCB conductor for nearly three years. While growing up, the time I spent with him in his band room greatly influenced my desire to become a music educator and to continue to develop my personal musicianship outside of the classroom in community music settings. My familiarity with and knowledge of both groups of people involved was an asset to the study as I could purposefully

select participants from both groups with their personal background, personality traits, musicianship/ability level, and instrumentation in mind. Additionally, the participants involved with the focus group interviews were comfortable with me leading the discussions, and I was able to tactfully direct discussion because of my knowledge of and previous experiences interacting with the participants.

Description of Participants

All participants in this study were purposefully selected by myself, the researcher. Because I am both the teacher of the PCMS band students and participant in the North Coast Concert Band, I know and spend a great deal of time with both groups of people from which participants were selected.

Port Clinton Middle School students. The group of middle school band members were selected based primarily on what instrument they play and their personality traits, including: their willingness to participate in the two classroom discussions and small group interviews with an open mind, and likeliness to be responsive to what the adults are saying. While the entire band class interacted with the adults, and I surveyed and recorded responses from all the middle school students, I chose two students each that play a woodwind, a brass, and a percussion instrument for further interaction with the adults in the form of small group interviews. This selection was consistent with the mixed instrumentation (brass, woodwind, and percussion) of the adults. The woodwind students interviewed the adult woodwind musicians, the brass students interviewed the adult brass musician, and the percussion students interviewed the adult percussionist. Two students were chosen for each instrument group in an effort to make the students feel more comfortable and encourage open dialogue. I had an idea of who I would select prior to the first classroom survey, but the answers from the survey helped solidify my choices.

Figure 1 below introduces the student participants (using pseudonym names), and their profiles will be developed in greater detail in chapter four.

Figure 1: Student Participants

	Age	Instrument	Years in Band	Reason for Selection
Emma	12	Flute	2	Emma is an extremely hard worker, passionate about band, good communicator.
Andrew	12	Baritone Saxophone	2	Andrew is very friendly and great sense of humor. Passionate about band and loves jazz music especially.
Olivia	13	Trumpet	2, took private lessons for one	Olivia is incredibly intelligent and insightful. Loves playing the trumpet and works very hard.
Tony	13	Trombone	2	Loves to have fun in band playing the trombone. He is very passionate about sports and I was hopeful that the interactions throughout this study would help him appreciate long-term value and benefits of learning and performing music.
Noah	13	Percussion	2, took private lessons for four years	Noah is very passionate about percussion instruments and personable.
Amy	12	Percussion	2	Amy has an incredibly kind and friendly personality. She also possesses great communication skills.

North Coast Concert Band members. The community musicians were selected based primarily on their personality traits and the likelihood that they would interact openly and appropriately with middle school students. Additionally, the adults were selected based on which instrument they play. I selected four adults to interact with the middle school band members: one adult each that plays a brass and percussion instrument, and two adults (a married couple) that play woodwind instruments. The instrumentation was an important factor because I believe

middle school students' perspectives of the adults could be instantly biased based on what instrument they play. In my own experience, I have found that middle school students often associate different personalities or genders with different instruments. (For example, my students often see flute as a "feminine instrument," typically played by women. Since there are no male flutists in either PCMS or NCCB, I tried to avoid choosing an adult flutist so as not to legitimize the stereotype.) This could affect how the students relate to the adults. Figure 2 below introduces the adult musicians, and their profiles will be developed in greater detail in chapter four.

Figure 2: Adult Participants

	Age	Instrument	Current Profession	Reason for Selection
Catherine	50s	Bassoon	Retired public school band director	The fact that she has helped with PCMS band activities before, and has an educational background, provided a level of comfort for all involved.
Ken	60s	Clarinet	Retired public school band director	Ken is married to Catherine and provided an extra perspective on lifelong music engagement.
Beth	40s	Percussion	Culinary arts educator	Beth is a passionate musician and artist who has a plethora of unique experiences. She offers a unique perspective as she has traveled the world studying culinary arts, and can relate to the students because of her current work as a culinary arts educator.
Gary	70s	Trumpet	Retired school administrator	Gary never received any formal musical training, yet has worked his way up to directing the North Coast Big Band (made up of members of the NCCB). His educational background and sense of humor were a perfect fit for this study.

Data Collection

The data collection took place between early January 2018- early February 2018 and included: a) surveys of 7th grade band students and community musicians, b) a teacher-led focus group interview with the adult participants, c) class discussions with the 7th grade students, d) small group, student-led interviews with the community musicians and e) a teacher research journal. Prior to the start of any data collection, I sent home a letter at the beginning of the 2017-2018 school year describing the project and allowing the students' families to opt in or out of participating (see Appendix A). The various forms of data are described in detail below and chronologically organized in Figure 3 below.

A) Surveys

Pre-classroom visitations. Two surveys were administered to the full group of 7th grade band students. The first occurred before the adult musicians visited the classroom for the first time, and included general questions about community bands and lifelong music participation (see Appendix B, which also includes some completed surveys). The purpose of the first survey was two-fold: to help the students make a social connection with the topics before they meet the adults, and to help my purposeful selection of focus group interview participants.

Post-classroom visitations. The second survey (see Appendix C, which also includes some completed surveys) was administered to the full group of middle school students after the final classroom discussion led by the adults. The questions on the survey were determined by my observations of the events and interactions throughout the entire partnership experiences. Responses helped me (the researcher) generate themes of how the collaboration influenced the middle school band as a whole.

Community musicians. A written survey (see Appendix D) was administered to the community musicians after the classroom discussion and individual interviews took place. This allowed the members to reflect individually on their interactions with the students and help me draw some conclusions about how I can apply that information in my classroom to instill a sense of lifelong musical engagement in my students.

B) Focus Group Interview

Community Musicians. A focus group interview was conducted by myself with the four adult community band members who were purposefully selected to interact with the students and to lead the culminating class discussion at Port Clinton Middle School. The focus group interview with the adult participants before the class discussion served as a way to gather more data about the adults' personal background and thoughts on lifelong musical engagement. The questions were designed with a combined approach of Patton's (2015) interview guide and standard approach (see Appendix E for the list of potential questions). While planning for this interview, I specified "key questions exactly as they must be asked while leaving other items as topics to be explored" at my discretion. This gave me the freedom to "build a conversation with a particular subject area, to word questions spontaneously, and to establish a conversational style." (Patton, 2015, p. 441). The interview also served as a planning session for the class discussion at PCMS. The interview took place before a North Coast Concert Band rehearsal at Bellevue High School, lasted approximately 45 minutes, and was video recorded and transcribed.

C) Classroom Discussions

Led by community musicians. The classroom discussion led by the adult community band members on the topic of lifelong musical engagement was video recorded and transcribed. I moderated the discussion and it took place during the normal 7th grade band time in the PCMS

band room, lasting approximately 40 minutes. The content of the discussions was determined from the focus group interviews with the adult musicians. In addition, the adults visited the classroom at least two times prior to this discussion (once to sit in on rehearsal and/or to lead sectionals), so those interactions also influenced the content of the discussion. I (the teacher) moderated the discussion, but the adults came prepared with prompts to lead the discussion, which were determined during my focus group interview with the adults.

Led by researcher. The day after the school visit by the adult musicians, I led another short, informal class discussion on the topic of lifelong musical engagement. The purpose of the discussion was to summarize the previous classroom discussion with the adult musicians, and precede the final survey for the band students. It took place during the regular 7th grade band time in the PCMS band room, and lasted approximately 10 minutes.

D) Small Group, Student- Led Interviews

After the class discussion, six purposefully selected students each interviewed one or two adult(s) (the adult that plays within the same instrument family). The interviews took place in the music facilities at PCMS and lasted approximately 30 minutes. I helped the students plan potential questions for these interviews using the same methodology for the adult focus group interview questions: a mixed interview guide and standard approach, as described above (see Appendix F for the list of brainstormed questions). The interviews were audio recorded by the students and transcribed by the researcher.

E) Teacher Research Journal

Throughout the process of this collaborative classroom project, involving PCMS students and North Coast Concert Band members, I kept a journal on my school laptop (since most data collection happened at the PCMS) that included my observations of class interactions, and

thoughts based on the recordings of focus group interviews and classroom discussions. I would typically add to it before and after each activity within the project, or even at random, unrelated times when thoughts would come to me. The journal included approximately seven typed pages of notes and was primarily an informal way for me to remember specific thoughts or realizations I had throughout the course of this project. Considering the long timespan of this project, the journal became a valuable tool, as it not only provided additional clarity while analyzing the data, but it also helped me to reflect upon the project. It is referenced multiple times throughout chapter four, primarily when describing the adults' classroom visits and the classroom discussion. It also played a large role in helping me develop the implications found in chapter five.

Figure 3 on the next page describes the timeline of this project. In general, the project consisted of three phases, which are represented in the table: Orientation, Immersion, and Reflection.

Resource Needs

This study did not require any funding or additional resources. All video and audio recording was completed on my personally owned iPad and/or iPhone. Interviews took place in the "normal" venues for each participant group; the interviews of the adult musicians took place before rehearsal in a classroom space at Bellevue High School, and classroom discussions and interviews with the middle school students all took place at Port Clinton Middle School.

Figure 3: Timeline

	1) Surveys	2) Focus Group Interviews	3) Classroom Discussions	4) Individual Interviews	5) Teacher Research Journal
Orientation Phase: January 8- 31, 2018	Survey administered to all 7 th grade band members [done earlier in the fall as study was still in planning stages]	Focus group interview held with purposefully selected adult participants to prepare for school visits	Brief discussion led by teacher/ researcher to introduce topic of lifelong music engagement		Additions to journal are made during and after the first two classroom visits from adult musicians
Immersion Phase: January 16- 31, 2018			Classroom discussion led by community musicians on topic of lifelong musical engagement	Six purposefully selected students interview the adult participants	Updated during and after the recorded individual interviews and classroom discussion
Reflection Phase: February 1- 7, 2018	Survey given to all middle school students after final class discussion, led by teacher/ Researcher. Survey also given to adult musicians as a culmination of the experience				Teacher research journal updated based on recordings and/or transcriptions of classroom discussions and interviews

Ethics and Trustworthiness

In this study, validity was established through a) data collection triangulation, b) relational ethics, c) researcher expertise, and d) IRB review. a) Multiple kinds of data provide different perspectives upon which to analyze the middle school students' and adults' motivations and views on lifelong music engagement. b) Due to my dedicated, vested interest in each of the study's participant groups, relational ethics also reflect the validity of this study, because I explored the relationship between two different groups of people as well of the ethics and personal values that play a role in lifelong music participation. Additionally, this study depends heavily on the three kinds of relationships created within the partnership: the community members with the students, myself with the community members, and myself with the students. The complex intertwining of all relationships greatly impacted the course and outcomes of the study. c) My teacher research journal provides valuable insight and expertise to the study, especially since I am both teacher of the 7th grade band students and a member of North Coast Concert Band. Because I played the roles of teacher, researcher, and adult community musician, I was able to observe and provide insight from a variety of perspectives. d) Finally, this study was reviewed by the University of Michigan Institutional Review Board. Completion of the steps required for approval by the IRB ensured that the rights and welfare of all participants involved were protected.

Analysis Strategies

Analysis was completed at the conclusion of each phase of the project, beginning with the Orientation Phase. After collecting the first student survey and transcribing the focus group interview with the adult community musicians, I immediately began looking for patterns and developing categories that correlated with the research questions. I wrote memos, "short phrases,

ideas or key concepts” that occurred to me in the initial reading of the data (Creswell & Poth, 2018, p. 188). Analysis of these initial patterns helped define the overarching topics of lifelong music engagement that would help guide the rest of the project. “Searching text for and counting recurring words or themes” is a type of qualitative analysis called content analysis. “Content analysis refers to any qualitative data reduction and sense-making effort that takes a volume of qualitative material and attempts to identify core consistencies and meanings” (Patton, 2015, p. 541). The initial coding of core meanings was completed on my laptop, where I could easily highlight key words, add comments and move things around within a digital document. When I started noticing patterns I assigned numerical codes to certain key words/topics and checked that they appeared frequently enough throughout the data to emerge from a pattern into a theme. Patterns are often descriptive findings, whereas “a theme takes a more categorical or topical form, interpreting the meaning of the pattern” (Patton, 2015, p. 541).

Data from each phase of the project helped inform the next. I applied the established patterns from the initial student survey and adult focus group interview of the Orientation Phase to the planning of the classroom discussion and small group interviews within the Immersion Phase. Finally, the frequency of codes and emergent themes from the data in both the Orientation and Immersion Phases helped me to finalize the Reflection Phase, and plan questions for the final student surveys for both the students and adults. After concluding the project’s final activities, I coded the final survey responses and compared the codes with those of the earlier data along with my teacher research journal. This allowed me to discuss commonalities between the adults and students with their perspectives of lifelong music engagement.

Organization of Findings

The following three chapters present findings of the study. Chapter four provides a detailed description of the collaborative classroom project, organized by the three phases, as well as data gathered in each phase. Chapter five presents the findings and emergent themes. Finally, chapter six includes the discussion, implications, and conclusion of the study. Both chapters five and six include applicable references to past research.

Chapter Four

Project Description and Data Analysis

Overview

The purpose of this teacher research study was to develop a collaborative classroom project in which adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band interacted with members of the 7th grade band at Port Clinton Middle School with the goal of teaching the importance of lifelong musical engagement. In this chapter I present a detailed description of each phase of the collaborative classroom project and analyze the various data sources that I collected as part of the project. The analysis of the data describes the interactions between the community musicians and the middle school students regarding lifelong musical engagement and provides insight into how middle school students perceive their interactions with adult musicians. It also generates ideas of how current educators can teach toward lifelong musical engagement, which relates to the overall goal of the study.

This chapter includes responses and recognition of patterns from the data of the classroom surveys of the full 7th grade band, detailed profiles of the purposefully selected adult and student participants, and analysis of the interactions between the adults and students in the form of interviews and surveys. The chapter is organized around the three phases of the project: Orientation, Immersion, and Reflection. In an effort to give the most complete picture of this collaborative classroom project possible, the data described and analyzed in this chapter is presented in narrative form and in chronological order, according to when each activity happened and how it fits into the experience as a whole. I made this decision with the hope that readers could feel completely immersed in the project, as if they were experiencing it with me. Please note that within the data, individual responses are often quoted verbatim and indicated by either

quotation marks or italics. Many responses from the surveys and class discussion cannot be credited, because they came from an anonymous respondent within the 7th grade band. If a response did come from a “named participant,” that participant is credited.

Orientation Phase

The purpose of the Orientation Phase was to provide the students with some background knowledge of the concept of lifelong music engagement and to allow the adults to reflect on their life experiences that have led them toward lifelong musical engagement. This was accomplished by performing a classroom survey (Seventh Grade Student Perspectives), in which students provided written responses to general questions about community bands and lifelong musicianship. In the process, students started thinking about the topic with the goal of their developing a social connection with the topic. The focus group I conducted with the adults (Musical Background of Adults) gave them a chance to reflect on their lives and what led them to participate in a community band; it helped gather data about their personal backgrounds and thoughts on lifelong musical engagement; and, it served as a planning session for the class discussion at Port Clinton Middle School.

The students were first introduced to this project when I sent home a letter at the beginning of the 2017-2018 school year describing the project and allowing the students' families to opt in or out of participating (see Appendix A). At that point, the project was still in its planning stages, but I wanted to distribute the letter as early as possible so that the students and their parents would be informed and prepared when the time came for the project to begin. I reminded the students of my participation in the North Coast Concert Band (NCCB), and told them that I was working on an exciting project that would allow them to get to know some of my fellow band members. I briefly explained that most of my fellow band members were not career

or “professional” musicians and simply chose to continue to be involved in music as an adult. By learning what inspired them to continue with music into their adult lives, hopefully we could all learn to appreciate the power of learning an instrument and the benefits of being involved with a performing ensemble.

Seventh Grade Student Perspectives

The Port Clinton Middle School 7th grade band consists of 46 students, ranging 11-13 years of age. It is an active group that meets every day of the school year for 43 minutes, performs an average of three concerts each school year, and additionally performs at the Ohio Music Education Association (OMEA) Large Group Adjudicated Event. Several students also take advantage of other performance opportunities such as OMEA Solo and Ensemble and various honors ensembles throughout the year.

As part of the Orientation Phase, students were given a survey that asked general questions regarding the topic of lifelong musicianship. This survey gave the students a brief introduction to the topic before meeting the adults. By reflecting individually on the questions, I anticipated that students would form their own social connections to the topic. Forty-six students completed this first classroom survey on January 8, 2018, before the NCCB members began visiting the classroom. All band students were present to take the survey, and they did so anonymously. Due to the anonymous nature of the surveys, direct quotes are not able to be credited as the quote could have come from any of the 46 band members. General topics addressed in the survey questions are listed below, followed by an analysis of the responses from both closed and open format questions.

Perspectives on musicianship. When asked what it means to be a musician, of the 46 students who responded, 29 (63%) stated that a musician was someone who played an instrument

or sang. Seven students mentioned passion, love, or dedication to music while nine alluded to the importance of talent or ability level (for example “a person who is really good at music and practices it a lot”). In general, students associated the concept of being a musician with the act of performing, either with an instrument or voice. Several students also associated the concept of being a musician with an individual’s talent or ability level, but that was not always the case. One student stated: “It doesn’t necessarily mean that you have to play an instrument. You can be a musician in many different ways. The main quality you need to be a musician is that you love music!”

Music in the community. Students were asked if music plays an important role in their community. Every student answered “yes” to this question. Below are some verbatim examples of why some individual students thought music plays an important role in their community:

It brings the community together and makes everyone happy.

You don’t have to be smart, strong, nerd, cool, popular, it just requires you to read and play your instrument.

People around town and our school always make time for our concerts and plays.

The claim that music plays an important role in their community seems to be based on their limited experience as a middle school musician. Additionally, the students demonstrated some knowledge of community music opportunities. Thirty-nine students listed the NCCB as a community music group (which was expected because I talk about it frequently in class). Two students listed other groups (Toledo Symphony Orchestra and a local rock band), and five students responded that they did not know of any music groups in the community. Therefore, the students’ knowledge of other community music groups or opportunities was limited, in most cases, to what I had told them in class.

Music at home. When asked if any older family members regularly play an instrument or sing, 21 students (45%) responded yes to this question. Many stated that their parents, grandparents, or older siblings play with the alumni marching band each fall. A few students gave examples of informal, social musical settings such as their grandfather playing the accordion at home or their mom singing and playing the piano for fun. One student elaborated that her grandmother sings in a community choir and at church. More than half of the students do not have a family member that they consider to be musical (at least in terms of performing).

Lifelong musicianship. Several questions in the survey focused on students' current musical experiences and asked them to consider if they might continue with music in the future. One question asked students what is their favorite part of band. This is important because to encourage lifelong musicianship, students need to find enjoyment in music early in their experience. The five most popular responses were, in order of frequency: the music, being with friends, the challenge, learning the instrument (and the satisfaction from getting it right), and that it feels good/relieves stress. When asked if they planned to continue band throughout middle school and/or into high school, 32 students stated that they planned to continue, six were unsure, and four said they would not continue into high school. This gave an insight into their approach on music; whether it is something they plan to make a lifelong activity/hobby or if they are currently participating to fulfill a credit or parental requirement. When asked about their musical experiences outside of band, 45 students (all but one) responded that they listen to music regularly. One student stated: "I listen to music everywhere. Without music my life would never be the same." One student responded that they take drum lessons, and one stated "sometimes around the holidays I will find a holiday song and perform it on my instrument for my family." Noticeably, music outside of band class is a large part of these students' lives.

Adult Participant Profiles

Following are detailed profiles of each of the four NCCB members/adult participants. These profiles contain background information on each participant as well as the reasons they were purposefully selected. The profiles will help provide context that is an important piece in understanding the data presented involving the adult participants.

Beth is a percussionist with the NCCB and a culinary arts educator at a vocational school. She teaches classes to high school students who have elected to attend the vocational school instead of traditional high school classes, as well as adults who take classes in the evening to further their culinary skills. She traveled the world while studying culinary arts and lived in Paris for a few years after college. She was selected for this project because she is comfortable interacting with students in an educational setting, but also because she offers a valuable perspective and can draw from unique, worldly experiences.

Catherine is a female in her late 50s and is successful, retired public school band director. She plays bassoon with the NCCB. Because her town of residence is near PCMS, she has assisted with many PCMS Band activities, including running sectionals, providing feedback and advice before OMEA Large Group Contest performances, starting beginners in small groups, and preparing OMEA Solo and Ensemble participants. The PCMS band students know her well and she has already built up a strong rapport with many of the students. That is a primary reason why she was selected for this project. Additional reasons include: her primary instrument is in the woodwind family, and her positive, nurturing personality.

Gary is a trumpet player with the NCCB and directs the North Coast Big Band, which is an additional secondary ensemble consisting of members of the NCCB. He is a retired educator, and throughout his career held various positions from a high school music teacher to an

elementary teacher. Furthermore, he first learned to play the trumpet by ear, and although he did not have any formal musical training past his school band experiences, he has become an accomplished musician, especially in the jazz genre. Gary has a kind, humorous personality and was selected because I knew he would immediately have a strong rapport with the PCMS students.

Ken is married to Catherine. He is in his 60s, plays clarinet with the NCCB, and is also a successful, retired band director and a woodwind player. When it was decided that Catherine would participate in the project, Ken volunteered his time as well. He has a great sense of humor and great potential for interacting with and relating to the students. Although the original plan was to involve only one adult per instrument family (woodwind, brass, and percussion), his participation and additional perspective was very beneficial to the overall project.

Musical Background and Perspectives of Adults

On January 30, 2019, a focus group interview was held with all four community musicians selected to interact with the students and to lead the culminating class discussion at Port Clinton Middle School. The interview was moderated by the researcher and the students were not present. The focus group interview served as a way to gather more data about the adults' personal backgrounds and thoughts on lifelong musical engagement. It also served as a platform to get them to think about and discuss their musical backgrounds, which led into a planning session for the class discussion at PCMS. To give the adults an idea of the students' perspectives on the subject material, and to further prepare them to interact with the students, I also showed them the responses from the first classroom survey. A list of potential interview questions for the adults, formulated with a mix of interview guide and standard approach methodology (Patton, 2015), can be found in Appendix E. Following is a summary of the

discussion, identification of patterns, and/or verbatim quotes from the participants to support the analysis.

Perspectives on musicianship. After some discussion of the definition of “musician”, adults considered that “musician” is a word that is not used enough; it is often reserved for people who are seen as professionals, or people who have a career in the music industry/field. Lengthy discussion followed about the interconnectedness of the arts. If students can understand that there are many ways they can choose to express themselves and the various kinds of arts are connected, that may help them understand the importance and potential power of participation in music. Both topics are represented with quotes from the conversation below.

My primary choice right now is culinary. We make beautiful things with food plus there are some other things that I do as an artist. I have drawings that I do, I arrange my house so that it has a comfortable feel to it when you walk in. Music for me is another chapter in my life as an artist. Maybe not my strongest chapter by the way because I don't read my accidentals very well. But you know being an artist it goes two ways. First of all, it satisfies something in my soul and when I'm performing all I can think about is how can I display what I do or play what I do so that the audience is going to enjoy it. And it can be something as simple as rocking out a little Marimba, a piece for a Disney tune and you have the people watching, "Oh wow, you're having so much fun up there." I mean that's my connection to the audience is that sometimes for me as a percussionist especially there's a visual component to it as well as musicality of it. – Beth

It's all about pursuing it to the highest level of what you're capable of. There's a fifth grader who's a musician and there's high schoolers that are in a band that are not going

to be musicians. There are people who are never going to work a day in their life at making money at music. They are musicians. - Catherine

School music experiences. From the discussion it was apparent that each adult was the product of an active band program. Three of the four adults grew up in extremely small towns, but despite the size of the programs each of their directors made a concerted effort to provide a well-rounded, quality musical experience. When asked to describe positive qualities of their band directors the adults listed traits that included: “demanding but humorous” (Ken), visible in other aspects of community life, and encouraging students to go the extra mile and “take the ball and learn with it” (Beth).

Musical experiences in the home. Each adult had a unique experience of music while growing up. All of them referenced their parents’ record collections at one point or another. While not all of their parents were active performing musicians, listening to music was a memorable experience while growing up. The adults discussed the importance of exposing “kids” to a wide variety of music, because if they aren’t exposed to it at a young age, they will be less likely to be open to it later. Following are some direct quotes from the conversation:

For me, there’s lots of music and lots of different music. My mother’s family was primarily Methodist and my grandfather was a minister and he was always singing hymns and my mother, being my grandfather’s daughter, of course was involved with the church and we had an organ and we would play hymns. My oldest brother was 10 years my senior and by the time I was becoming aware of music he was playing everything that was rock and roll. He was like in everything from Led Zeppelin, James Taylor, to Pink Floyd. He had all that going on. My dad played trombone and he loves swing pair of music and I remember we had one of the collections from the time life series from the

30s, 40s and 50s kind of like the World War 2 era music so we always had that going on.

- Beth

I was raised in [the] 40s and 50s in my childhood years and before the days of air conditioning, My uncle would pick up his trumpet and played along with the music that's on the radio and people from houses around could hear that. I lived down the street, four houses across the street. I could hear and I always thought, 'Yeah. It's really cool I can be able to do that. – Gary

My parents had a great record collection, though neither one of them played or sang per se. Everything from classical to brass bands to jazz. - Catherine

Throughout their middle and high school experiences, most of the adults had also sought out musical opportunities in addition to their school band. As a middle schooler, Gary had been recruited to play taps at his local cemetery for a fallen veteran. He recognized this as a specific time that helped him realize the great power of music and the impact that it could have on others. Catherine had sung with their church choir while in high school. Beth had begun playing in a community band in high school and was also given the chance to play percussion with the Cleveland Women's Orchestra for a season.

Lifelong musicianship. The question of “why did you come back to music” engaged rich discussion between Gary and Beth regarding the community created within music. “It's that sense of coming together to make music helps all that sense of community and friendship and camaraderie. It's hard to see that when you're in middle school and your hormones are going crazy” (Beth). It is evident that community, friendship, and generally just having fun are all important reasons that Gary and Beth choose to remain active in music. Both Ken and Catherine

were career music educators, so this question did not necessarily apply to them, though they both also spoke of the friendships they have created and maintained from being involved in music.

It should be noted that one question on the planned list of focus group discussion questions was not addressed. It was a question regarding any children or grandchildren the participants have that have become musicians. I realized that I already knew this information about each of the adults from having interacted with them a great deal as fellow community band members. However, I did tell them to be prepared to answer this when the students interviewed them. Anticipation of this question is just one example of how I prepared the adults for the classroom project throughout the Orientation Phase.

Summary

In summary, many topics were discussed in the first classroom survey and focus group interview, including: perspectives on musicianship, school music experiences, musical experiences in the home, and lifelong musicianship. Discussing these topics in the focus group interview helped the adults reflect on their own backgrounds and experiences, preparing them to share and interact with the students. Data from the Orientation Phase helped inform the Immersion Phase, played an important role in starting to recognize patterns, and assisted in learning what types of experiences and perspectives are likely to lead to lifelong musical participation.

Immersion Phase

The Immersion Phase consisted of the many times that the adult community musicians visited the classroom and interacted with the student musicians. It included the adult classroom visits (Adult Musicians Visit the Classroom), the classroom conversation led by the community

musicians on lifelong musicianship, and the small-group interviews when the students interviewed the adults.

Adult Musicians Visit the Classroom

Each adult participant visited the 7th grade band two different times (each adult visited separately, except for Ken and Catherine who traveled together, making for six individual visits) between January 9-29, before the classroom discussion with students was scheduled to take place on January 31. The classroom visits were extremely informal and were meant to ease both the adults and students into the experience. The timeline of the classroom visits were somewhat intertwined with the Orientation Phase, but I chose to include them here within the Immersion Phase due to the fact that the adults and students were physically interacting. I very briefly introduced each adult during their first visit, but purposefully did not give the students a lot of information so that I could watch the interactions and relationships between the students and adults unfold naturally, with no preconceived notions. Initially, I tried to schedule the visits so that they were spread out and that the adults were not there on the same day; however, the adults ended up coming in whenever they could fit it into their schedules. Several weather delays and cancellations at PCMS that winter made it more difficult to get everyone into the classroom than I had originally anticipated. The visits included multiple interactions between the students and adults, from playing their instruments together, to informal conversations, and even Beth bringing cupcakes for the band one day. These visits helped increase comfort levels for all involved, increasing chances for an open and productive classroom conversation on lifelong musical engagement. Following are general descriptions of the visits of each adult participant, based on observations recorded in the teacher research journal.

As a married couple, Ken and Catherine traveled together and visited the classroom on the same two days. The first day, they sat in the band and played their instruments alongside the students. Prior to this experience, the students were very familiar with Ken and Catherine, which was apparent in the ease and normalcy at which they inserted themselves into the band. I observed both comfortably giving tips to the students next to them, suggesting alternate fingerings or fixing hand positions, and even occasionally cracking jokes. The second time they visited, Ken ran a clarinet sectional and Catherine ran a bassoon sectional. I was not able to observe those sectionals personally, as I was directing the rest of the band during that same time. Because they are both former band directors, I was confident in their abilities to lead the students through their music while simultaneously increasing familiarity and building rapport.

Both days that Gary visited the classroom, he sat in and played with the trumpet section (since trumpet is his primary instrument). I specifically asked him to sit next to the female trumpet player that I had purposefully selected to be one of the two students that would interview him after the classroom discussion. That also put him toward the middle of the section to be able to interact with multiple students at a time. The students had not met Gary before, so there was a slight sense of discomfort during the first visit, made evident by the students' hesitancy to interact with him aside from the occasional correction of fingerings. The first visit mainly consisted of both the students and Gary sitting quietly, following my instructions during rehearsal and playing when asked. When he came back the second time, there was a better sense of familiarity. I noticed more side conversations happening during rehearsal, Gary correcting fingerings, and offering suggestions on trumpet technique. The students were receptive to his advice and I even noticed a few laughs at his jokes.

Beth played with the percussion section when she visited the band. The first time, she brought an assortment of sticks and mallets which impressed the students greatly. She immediately jumped into action, walking from one percussion instrument to the other in the back of the room, helping students count their parts and make sure they were using the correct grip on their sticks and mallets. I was very impressed and excited by her willingness to move so freely amongst the percussion section, helping anyone who needed it, and trying her best to interact equally with all of the students. In my journal I notated that I even had to stop myself from asking the percussionists to be quiet several times, reminding myself that the purpose of these visits was for the adults to build relationships with the students. Once word began spreading that she was a chef, some students started requesting different treats that she could bring in for the band. Beth surprised everyone by bringing an assortment of cheesecake cupcakes for everyone to her next visit. This, of course, won over all of the band students, even if she hadn't personally interacted with them up until this point.

In summary, these classroom visits, while extremely informal, were a significant part of the project. The adults were able to build rapport with the students, which ultimately helped everyone involved feel more comfortable during the classroom discussion and small-group interviews. It also allowed me to observe interactions between the students and adults and gave me ideas on how to plan the classroom discussion. For example, I observed that Ken, Catherine, and Beth were all incredibly comfortable with the students and would need little help from me to communicate their ideas to the students. Gary, however, was quieter and more reserved, probably because he has not been teaching students in a formal educational setting. Because of my observations of the adults' personality differences and varying degrees of familiarity with the students, I decided it would be best for each adult to choose one "main point" that they would

focus on during the classroom conversation. (This idea was proposed in the focus group interview and later confirmed in an email thread between myself and the adult musicians.) This would ensure that each adult would get a chance to speak on at least one topic that was important to them. After they each had a chance to address their main point, they could open it up for discussion and questions from the students.

Classroom Discussion on Lifelong Musicianship

The classroom discussion on the topic of lifelong musicianship took place on January 31, 2019. The discussion was led by the adult participants and moderated by the researcher as necessary. It lasted the duration of the 42-minute class period and was recorded via an iPad set up in the back of the room (which should not have negatively impacted participation because students are used to me frequently recording rehearsals via an iPad or other recording device). The content of the discussion was determined by the data gathered from the first classroom survey and aforementioned focus group interview with the adult participants. The adults and I collaboratively decided that each adult would take turns formally introducing him/herself, then speak briefly on one aspect of lifelong musicianship that is important to them. After each adult had addressed their main point, they would then invite the students into the discussion and answer any questions they might have. Since the adults had all individually visited the classroom twice beforehand, they had a baseline knowledge of the students' personalities and how they would interact during the discussion. The adult participants stood in the front of the room, facing the students. I stood in the back, trying to stay out of the conversation as much as possible, but armed with a list of potential discussion questions to ask the group in case the discussion got off track or hit a dead end. The following is an interpretation of the classroom conversation.

Introduction and key points. I (as teacher/researcher) began by informing the students what was going to happen in class. Students were reminded of the survey they completed and the adult guests that had visited the school several times. They were then told that the adults would be discussing the idea of being a lifelong musician. “This project that you know I’ve been working on for my degree is all about one thing... basically me trying to get better about making you guys truly appreciate and enjoy what you’re doing here in terms of making music.”

Following the teacher’s introduction of the conversation, each adult introduced themselves and talked about one key point regarding lifelong music. Ken started off with the definition of a musician. “A lot of you have the concept that a musician is someone who makes a living doing music. Whether it’s a rock star or an opera singer. But that’s not necessarily so. Those people are obviously musicians. But there are a lot of musicians out there who do other jobs.” He also mentioned being a music consumer, or someday volunteering with their kids’ music booster programs. Catherine explained that she grew up in a very rural community. While her parents weren’t musicians by definition, they had an appreciation for music and had a large record collection. Her main point was that the friends one makes in band often end up being lifelong friends, and she gave several personal examples. She also asked the students how many of them think they are musicians (about 10 students raised their hands). She then clarified that everyone should have their hands up, stating: “You’re fledgling musicians, but anyone who is working on their craft, is by definition in my mind, a musician. So give yourself that credit.” Gary introduced himself, stating that he was the oldest person in the room at 77 years old. His main point was throughout his long career as a high school teacher and later administrator, music was his escape, and the one hobby he kept coming back to because of the immense enjoyment it provided. Finally, Beth introduced herself and told them a little bit about her career. She

considers herself an all-around artist, and although music is not her main art (since she is a chef), it is something that has been a constant ever since she fell in love with the snare drum in third grade. She also touched on the fact that band can help you figure out who you are and/or want to be:

So not only was it about friends, not only was it about fun, but it was also about skill and dedication and hard work. All those things put together help you build character. They help you find a foundation for who you are. Now obviously I went on to do other things in life.... And although my craft right now is food, when I think through the artistry of my life, music is a constant.... it is something that I always go back to and it's something that connects me not only to my present but it also connects me to my past and to myself.

(Beth)

After the initial introductions and main points, the students were invited to start asking questions. They were a bit shy at first, so Catherine asked them about their upcoming Solo and Ensemble event. She commended them on stepping out of their comfort zone to prepare for Solo and Ensemble, as the ability to step out of the box is a very important one to be successful in life. Students then began asking questions about the adults' other musical activities. During the discussion that followed, the students learned that when they were teenagers the adults had done the following: sang in choir, played with orchestras (community and school-based), played with and sang in church choirs, started a drum and fife group for America's bicentennial, and played taps for funerals at the local American Legion. A question was asked about being an athlete and musician at the same time. Catherine mentioned that she was the first female cross country runner at her school, and she lettered in cross country as well as basketball and track. Ken touched on the importance of trying everything when you're young, but emphasized the fact that

music can truly be a lifelong activity. “When you're 40 you probably won't be playing football but you can be playing your instrument. It's something you can do for a long time. We have a 94-year-old saxophonist in our community band.”

Other questions that were asked included: were any of you in orchestra and band at the same time? how many years have you been playing your instruments? is there a specific reason why you chose your instruments? what's your favorite song you've ever played? and are you all in the same community band as Miss Kustec? Answers to these questions are not included here because they were generally brief, did not result in any further rich discussion, or they weren't as closely related to the overall concept of lifelong musicianship. They did, however, provide context for the students to get to know the adults better, and hopefully for the students to better relate to the adults.

More discussion followed, including Beth's proposal for the students to start a flash mob at their spring talent show. Catherine ended the discussion with: “Enjoy what you're doing! Enjoy playing your instruments and enjoy each other. You can keep doing that for the next 60 years. You're at the tip of the iceberg. The best is yet to come.”

Researcher expectations of discussion. My expectations for the classroom discussion were met. I only needed to direct the conversation by asking a question two different times. At the beginning of class, the students seemed very hesitant to ask questions or contribute to the discussion but eventually showed much curiosity about the adults, asking questions about their musical experiences and relating them to opportunities they may have later in their schooling or life. For example, one student asked whether any of the adults were also athletes in school, which prompted a discussion on why it is important to pursue a well-rounded education and be involved in many activities. I believe that hearing Catherine, who pursued a career as a band

director and still actively plays her instrument, speak about how she was active in almost every sport possible throughout her time in high school, was very meaningful for the students who may be struggling to find their niche and/or wondering if they will be able to be successful with many activities. If I were to assign a title to the conversation based on the themes that emerged, I would title it: “How music can be a fun part of a long, active life.” The students seemed most interested in the many different activities and hobbies that the adults have, as well as why and how music was still important to them. They enjoyed hearing stories about how community band rehearsal is Beth’s emotional release, and how Catherine still enjoys social gatherings with her band friends. The students seemed genuinely sad when class was over. In summary, I think the classroom discussion adequately provided students with an understanding of what influenced the community musicians to value lifelong music engagement.

Adult Musicians Speak with Band Members

Immediately following the class discussion, six students interviewed the adults in small groups correlating to their instrument family. Below are detailed profiles of each of the 7th grade band students that were purposefully selected to interview the adults. These profiles contain background information on each participant as well as the reasons they were purposefully selected. Six students were selected, a male and female from each of the instrument families of woodwind, brass, and percussion. While I had an idea of who I wanted to select at the beginning of the project, responses from the first student survey helped solidify my choices. The survey was anonymous, but after reading the surveys, I asked the six purposefully selected students to identify their surveys so I could confirm my selection choices. These profiles will help provide context that is important in understanding the students’ interactions with the adult participants as well as the data set produced from the interviews.

Student Participant Profiles.

Emma is 12 years old and plays the flute. She started as a percussionist in sixth grade, but wanted to switch to flute for seventh grade and worked very hard to convince me to allow her to make the switch. She took private lessons with me over the summer, which is when I became familiar with her exceptional work ethic, kind personality and natural talent. Since that summer, she has continued working to become one of the strongest flute players in her class. She is passionate about band and always goes the extra mile to make sure she and the rest of her section is putting her best foot forward. From my extended interactions with her while giving private lessons, I also knew that she would communicate well and be open with the adults.

Andrew is 12 years old and plays the baritone saxophone. He is extremely friendly to everyone and has a great sense of humor. Andrew has an intense appreciation for jazz and classic rock, which is rare for students his age. His family goes to Tennessee every spring for a jazz music festival. In addition to his already strong appreciation for many types of music, I selected him because I knew that he would be able to have great conversation with the adults and ask some interesting questions.

Olivia is an incredibly intelligent and insightful 13-year-old. She and her twin sister both take private trumpet lessons and have an incredible work ethic. Music is also a strong influence in her life; her grandmother also plays trumpet and still comes back to play every year with the alumni marching band. I knew that I could count on Olivia to ask thoughtful questions and interact very maturely with the adults.

Tony is 13-year-old trombone player with an exceptionally outgoing and fun-loving personality. Although band does not always come easy to him, he works hard to get better every single day. I knew that he would not be afraid to interact freely and openly with the adults. Tony

is also a very dedicated athlete and I know he is on the fence about continuing with band throughout high school. Selfishly, I was hoping that his interactions with the adults throughout this project would help him appreciate the long-term value and benefits of learning and performing music.

Noah is a 13-year-old percussionist who started taking private drum lessons when he was only nine. Despite his love for the snare drum, he has developed into a proficient and well-rounded percussionist. He has become a leader in the percussion section and is a student I count on to be able to successfully play the difficult parts as well as help other students who may be struggling. In addition to taking music very seriously, he is very personable and therefore a perfect candidate for this study.

Amy is also a percussionist, and is 12 years old. She has an incredibly kind and friendly personality, to the point where the other percussionists often refer to her as the “mom” of their section. She is always organizing music, making sure everyone has what they need, and helping others play their part. She is perfectly happy to play auxiliary parts like the triangle (versus a more “important” or “glamorous” instrument). She also possesses great communication skills and I knew would be able to have great conversation with the adults.

Small Group Student-Adult Conversations

Immediately following the classroom discussion, the six students described above interviewed the adult(s) who play the instrument in the same family (woodwinds, brass, and percussion). Amy and Noah interviewed Beth (the percussion group), Andrew and Emma interviewed Ken and Catherine (the woodwind group), and Olivia and Tony interviewed Gary (the brass group). These three separate interviews took place on January 31, 2018, during regular class time. The small-group interviews were stationed throughout the band room, lasted

approximately 30 minutes each, and covered a variety of subjects from why the adults started in band to more in-depth questions on their personal lives and hobbies. I helped the students brainstorm questions prior to this interview (see Appendix F), but other than that I did not play any role in these interviews other than getting them settled in their respective locations in the school. The students were completely in charge of directing the conversation. Emergent themes from these conversations will be discussed here, and full transcripts of the interviews can be found in Appendices G-I.

Interview with Beth. The students (Amy and Noah) interviewing Beth mainly stuck to their list of questions we had brainstormed. They asked lots of questions about what types of music she likes, her favorite percussion instruments to play, whether she can play drumset, etc. At one point Noah asked: “So, you’re a chef and you really like music as well. So, if you had to choose between the two, would you rather be a full-time chef or a full-time musician?” Beth responded with, “Oh, that’s not a fair question. I’d have to do them both. It’s kind of like, do you eat chocolate or peanut butter for the rest of your life? Pick one.” Interestingly enough, Noah responded: “Reese’s.” Beth then expanded upon this idea of balancing work, hobbies and passions, or as she said, having “the best of both worlds” in life. I feel that this was an important moment in the conversation, when the students started to realize that you really can be a musician as well as work a fulltime job in a completely different field. For example, Amy asked Beth if she ever used her “drum skills” while chopping something up. Beth responded by describing how she brings music into her culinary classroom with impromptu jam sessions with spoons or rapping. The students also talked with Beth about traveling, everything from Beth living in Paris after high school to Amy’s love of camping with her family. The conversation wrapped up with Beth discussing her favorite piece with the students. She described in detail a

song that was a musical depiction of the Battle of Gettysburg. The conversation finished with Noah saying, unprompted: “Now I really want to listen to that song.”

Interview with Ken and Catherine. The interview started with the students, Emma and Andrew, sharing about their lives to the adults. They shared that they each have family members (mothers, fathers, even uncles) that participated in band. Ken and Catherine commented that it was interesting so many of the students’ family members had played a band instrument, because neither of them had a musical background like that. The students and adults did share common reasons for starting band, however. Both Emma and Ken hadn’t thought about it too much until the time came to start trying and selecting instruments in 5th grade. Andrew and Catherine knew it was something they wanted to do since they were very young, thanks to their parents exposing them to many different kinds of music. After Ken and Catherine shared what they remember from their first concerts, they started discussing their hobbies. Going back to the theme of the connectedness of the arts, Catherine said: “I still like to run and occasionally I do a race or I have a marathon. I love to quilt and so that's another kind of art form that hopefully, it's circular and as I've learned photography, that affects what I look at and how I think and I think it affects my music too and read, avid reader and travel.” Catherine talked a lot about their two daughters and how although they aren’t currently involved in music, the many activities (sports, music and academic) they tried in school helped them prepare for life as an adult. She also mentioned that although they may not currently be musicians, they are both good “music consumers” and “art supporters,” which is an important aspect of music as well. Following was a discussion about the different types of music each person likes and how who you’re living with can affect your tastes. Emma stated: “I have five other step-siblings and a real brother so everybody listens to different things. I listen to everything all the time.” Catherine then talked about the importance of sharing

your tastes, and on the flip side, being open to trying new things, which led into a conversation about exploring different options, interests, and career paths during the middle and high school years. The conversation ended with talk about cars, and interestingly enough, earlier in life Ken had owned Andrew's dream car: a 64 Impala. The realization of this coincidence was very exciting for everyone involved.

Interview with Gary. The interview started by Gary explaining a little more about his family musical background. His dad (a trombonist) and mom (a pianist) inspired all six of his siblings to get started in music, and four of them are still active musicians. Then the students, Olivia and Tony, began asking Gary about why he decided to play the trumpet and what some of his other favorite instruments are. Gary spoke about his friend Ron, who is also in the NCCB. He brought in a newspaper article that was written about Ron to share with the students and to show that Ron is a car mechanic who still plays the trombone often. Gary then told the students about his favorite types of music (mainly classical and jazz singers) and bands. A question that they asked him was when he had been the most nervous to play, and he told them a story about playing taps at a military funeral while in high school. Then Tony asked if sports ever got in the way of band. Tony is a strong football player and I know is worried about this especially once he gets to high school. So, Gary was able to offer perspectives both as a former student-athlete and school administrator. He spent a few minutes calming Tony's fears about being overwhelmed and being too busy, which was an important theme of this conversation. The conversation ended by Gary telling a funny story about how he got in trouble in band because his friend hit a bass drum with a chair.

Summary

In summary, the Immersion Phase included all interactions (classroom visits, classroom discussion, and small-group interviews) between the adult and student participants. Patterns that began to develop in data from the Orientation Phase were confirmed by data from the many interactions that took place in this phase. The relatively open-ended structure of most interactions within this phase provided valuable insight into these data patterns. Finally, data from this phase directly impacted the Reflection Phase, as many questions in the final interviews were dependent upon the interactions between student and adult participants.

Reflection Phase

Data for the Reflection Phase was collected February 1-7, 2018, within a week after the Immersion Phase and upon the conclusion of the interactions between the student and community musicians. The Reflection Phase was the culmination of the collaborative classroom project. Data sets within the Reflection Phase include the second class survey (Seventh Grade Student Reflections), and the survey of the adult musicians (Lifelong Musician Reflections).

Seventh Grade Student Reflections

Thirty-seven students completed a survey the day after the classroom discussion led by the adults. The number of students completing the first survey in the Orientation Phase (46) and the second in the Reflection Phase (37) differed due to absences and scheduling conflicts with the students who are members of both band and orchestra. This survey was anonymous, like the first classroom survey, except for the six purposefully selected students, whom I asked to write their names on their surveys. Because of the anonymous nature of the survey, direct quotes will not be credited, unless they came from one of the six purposefully selected students. Many questions were the same as, or very similar to, in both surveys so that any changes influenced by

the classroom project could be noted. General topics addressed by the specific questions are listed below, followed by a representative selection of the responses and emergent themes.

Relating to the adult musicians. Students were asked in what ways they enjoyed working with the adult musicians. Answers varied greatly for this question. Some were related to music (“They helped me with my tone so I feel more confident”), but most were related to hearing their stories about how music had played an important role in their lives (“They were able to open up and tell their stories to a bunch of kids”- Amy). One student wrote: “They told me things that will help me in the future.” While I cannot be sure exactly what kinds of “things,” this student was referring to (whether musical or non-musical), I was glad that the students were making connections between what the adults were saying and their own lives/futures. When asked which adult they could relate to the most, many students chose the adult that played their instrument, or the instrument in the same family. Reasons for relatability included everything from “music also runs in my family” to “she had fun with music when she was our age, and still does,” and finally “I only really talk to my band buddies.” The wide range of explanations given by the students shows that they found relatability in different ways, implying that the students all got something different from the conversation based on their interests and interactions.

Lessons learned throughout the experience. A series of questions asked students about both musical and non-musical lessons they learned from interacting with the community musicians. Following is a representative selection of responses from the students (anonymous except for one from Olivia) regarding the non-musical lessons they learned:

If you want to try something new, just do it. - Olivia

The friends I have now can last forever.

Being a musician takes time and practice.

You can do other things with your life and still be a musician.

Sticking with something will make a huge impact on our lives.

Chef Funk makes great cheesecake cupcakes.

Many responses included throughout this section are quoted verbatim because it best conveys the students' thoughts and understanding of the material presented to them. Regarding the musical lessons learned, I was surprised by the range of answers, from instrument-specific techniques to considering how music could become a lifelong hobby. While musical instruction and advancing individual performance technique was not a direct goal of this project, it is obvious (and I am very happy) that the students learned musical ideas that will help them on their individual instruments. Following is a representative selection of anonymous responses from the students regarding the musical lessons they learned:

You can do many things with music including community bands, church bands, garage bands, and college.

Music can be a great feeling and help you later in life.

I learned how to play more smooth and connected.

I learned a different way to hold my instrument which made it easier to play.

Finally, the students were asked to provide their biggest "takeaway" from the classroom conversation with the adults ("takeaway" is a term used frequently at PCMS, allowing students to identify or reflect upon what they have quite literally taken away from any experience).

Following is a representative selection of anonymous responses:

Music is more than just playing for a few months and then quitting, music is forever, music is love and music is life.

Band can still be a part of your life for a long time and help you.

The friendships you earn from being in band or a group.

Sticking with something can make a very good impact on your life and future.

Music can connect people from many different backgrounds and cultures.

I was very impressed with the depth of these “takeaways.” From my observations of the students’ behavior, I thought that the classroom conversation (and overall experience for the students purposefully selected for the small group interviews) was successful. These responses show that the students are starting to think about how band and/or music could play an important role in their lives.

Reflections on musicianship. The students were asked to describe what it means to be a musician. Although the surveys were anonymous, it was obvious that many students answered this question the same way as they did on the first survey (in which most students related being a musician to the act of performing at a certain skill level). However, I noticed several answers that I did not recognize from the first survey, showing that the interactions with the adults may have influenced their thinking on the topic. As one student said: “A musician is a person who puts their heart and soul into the music because that is what they want to do.” Furthermore, there are no requirements of a certain title or skill level for someone to be a musician. A different student stated: “Anyone can be a musician if they want to.”

Current band experience. Students were asked “if you could change one thing about band to make your current experience better, what would it be?” Answers that appeared more than once included “more music, less book exercises,” students wanting more of a challenge, and general frustration with some of their peers’ behavior. None of these answers were surprising to me, especially since middle schoolers do not always enjoy the fundamental exercises often found in the method books we use in class. However, this was an important question because while

trying to encourage lifelong musicianship, it is important to make sure the students are enjoying their time in band. Therefore, I was very pleased that many students also answered “nothing.”

Future musical engagement. Similar to the first classroom survey, students were asked if they were planning to continue band for the duration of their middle school years and into high school and to indicate if their answer had changed since the last survey. The different number of respondents between the first and second survey (due to absences and other school events) made it difficult to compare. However, zero students said that their answer changed, and four said they were still unsure. Students were also asked to think about how they might benefit from a community music ensemble in the future. Answers varied greatly for this question, which shows that students were starting to think about music more holistically and how it could continue to be part of their lives.

I really want to start a jazz band. - Andrew

I could see myself joining a community band or maybe even writing music.

I could see myself creating an ensemble like Chef Funk.

Reflections on Being a Lifelong Musician

Within a week of the culmination of the whole project/experience, each of the adult participants completed a survey (see Appendix D). The survey was distributed, and responses collected, via email. The following are summaries of each general topic and responses. Due to the open-ended nature of many of the questions, many verbatim responses are included below.

Interacting with the students. The adults agreed that the students were generally quiet, attentive and interested. Most were reserved at first but opened up as the project progressed. “The students seem comfortable having various people come in and out of their room. Some are more reserved than others... normal... it was good to see some of them open up a bit as we went

on with the process” (Catherine). The adults appreciated getting to know the students in their small group interviews better. Additionally, the adults noticed varying levels of engagement from the students, especially when the project first began. Beth spoke specifically of working with the percussion students while visiting the classroom:

At first they were a little uncomfortable and on good behavior. When they started to “goof off” (as percussionists will do!) I tried to redirect them to pay attention by counting measures and listening to the other instruments/voices of the piece. As I was able to work with them one on one, they became more focused and attentive to your instruction.”

Ken made an effort to speak individually to students who were more reserved:

Some students were positively garrulous from the opening sessions. Others remained reticent to speak out in the large group. I tried to talk with a few of those kids and found they responded with questions and stories of their own.

Catherine noted that when the adults shared personal stories from their youth, the students were able to relate to them more which caused them to open up:

I think they became more comfortable as we went, especially as we related personal anecdotes of our youthful music experiences. It seemed that many of them may have had concerns regarding playing in the band through high school and maintaining other activities that they enjoy (sports, orchestra). I’m glad we got to those topics.

Finally, when asked if they could personally relate to any of the students they interacted with, the adults were all able to mention at least one student that stuck out in their memory as relatable. Considering the adults’ personalities and occupations, the following responses from the adults were no surprise:

The young lady to my left (and one of the students that participated in the interview) indicated to me through her friendly-yet businesslike behavior that she is or will soon become a leader in band as well as elsewhere throughout her school experience. - Gary

Yes. As an educator, I mostly related to the students who could not read music well, struggled in general as a student, or who I saw were struggling to stay engaged. For the others, we were having fun during class while playing with the group. - Beth

It was great to hear them open up a bit about their home experiences in the interviews. Everyone truly has a story. - Catherine

Benefits of the experience. When asked if and how they benefitted from this experience, it was implied that the students benefitted greatly. Furthermore, for various reasons, the adults agreed unanimously that they also benefited from this project. This was reassuring because mutual benefits are an extremely important part of intergenerational educational partnerships (Alfano, 2008; Manheimer, 1997). Gary spoke about how the experience influenced his opinion of young people:

I wouldn't say that the experience restored my faith in today's young people so much as to say that the experience reinforced what I believe about them. Reflecting upon my life of music, I can only hope that what we observed during our brief visits is just the beginning of the same kind of support that I enjoyed while in school.

Beth stated that this experience helped fuel her passion for participating in the NCCB. She also related this to her own teaching practice: "it gives me a better approach to bring my culinary students together to appreciate all the different "jobs" that they perform." Finally, Catherine stated: "It was an uplifting experience for me to examine all that music has and does mean to me and to share that with your students. Watching the students' faces and seeing them think about

such things was rewarding.” Touching on the important social aspect of making music as adults, she also added that “[I]t was also a very big bonus to get to know Gary and Beth better!”

Lessons on lifelong musicianship. The adults all agreed that the students can and should think of themselves as musicians, a label that should not be applied only to professionals, or individuals with a certain ability level. According to the adults, this was important for the students to understand. It also got the students thinking of the many possibilities for music participation after school, both involving an instrument or not. Ken spoke of the importance of being good music consumers, and getting involved with school booster programs and community events. Gary touched on the idea that music can be a lifelong activity:

I have long said that music is an avenue of release and relaxation that one can enjoy throughout a lifetime of work, raising a family and retirement. Chances of finding some like-minded 77 year olds that are physically capable of playing baseball, basketball or football are not very good, but our community bands are filled with similar-aged or older adults having a great time playing music and collaborating with a group of their peers while doing so. I watched the surprised reactions to announcements (or admissions) of our ages during the group discussion. The students were interested to learn of our backgrounds and how music as an avocation has filled our lives with enjoyment.

Finally, the adults noted that personal stories from their lives seemed to resonate with the students. Especially during the interviews, the adults and students alike felt comfortable going off script and talking about things unrelated to music, from cooking to cars. Lessons on lifelong musicianship happened organically through the many different kinds of interactions that the adults had with the students.

Suggestions for music educators. As the goal of this project was to provide ideas for music educators to teach toward lifelong music participation, the community musicians were asked to provide suggestions for music teachers to “plant the seed” and encourage young students to continue making music in their adult lives. Each adult mentioned the importance of inviting guests into the classroom as a part of their response, but also offered other suggestions. Adult responses are inserted verbatim here so that their unique voice and opinions are not misrepresented in my interpretation. Below are some portions of each adult’s answer.

I would recommend such a program for middle & high school level programs because I believe that during those years, students begin to reflect on what their lives may be like as adults. – Gary

Keep current. Like right now, rap a little bit. Talk to them about what they listen to and what they like. Take a “delay day” or an “off day” and jam a little bit. It builds relationships. - Beth

Invite community members to visit the program. Qualified persons could lead sectionals or rehearsals. Members of the community who play an instrument could be invited to sit in on a rehearsal or perform at a program with the band. Have a local musician or small group (professional or amateur) visit periodically for an interaction with the band. They could perform and chat with students. Although anyone would work, someone who is known to the kids in another role could be effective: business leader, storeowner, doctor/dentist, school staff member, local athlete etc. If students attend a fair, festival, wedding, church service, reception, etc. where there are musicians performing, encourage the

student to talk with the performers, if the chance provides itself, about the aspects of their participation in the group. – Catherine

Have guests come in to perform and talk with the students in some manner every year.

Music teachers should keep talking to students about their own music engagement outside of school. Continue to find community opportunities (church, Veterans of Foreign Wars, etc.) in which their students can participate. Continue to send students to honors bands and outside camps. –Ken

Finally, the survey ended with a purposefully vague and open-ended question. The adults were asked to reflect generally upon their experience during this classroom project and to share any observations or thoughts that might be useful. Again, due to the variety of answers to this question, adult responses are inserted verbatim here so that their unique voice and opinions are not misrepresented in my interpretation. Following are small portions of each adult's response.

If other music educators could understand how they could introduce such a program into their teachings among the concerts, contests, parades, etc. that they normally grapple with, their students would be better off for it and look back someday with a thankful attitude. –Gary

Following these students past graduation and into their adult lives might be interesting. Seeing if they participate in college groups, community groups, or groups of their own devising and asking if the exposure to the concept of music as a lifelong activity in middle school had an impact on their thinking. – Ken

All the best teaching practices will fall back to one thing. It is how well you know your students. To engage them is to ask them why they are there and what they like.

Your middle school students are only beginning to self-actualize so they will strongly connect their personal feelings with their successes in a larger social environment. They have chosen to be in your classroom. Giving them success in and with music only strengthens their personal voice. Challenge them. My middle school music teacher dared me to write music and perform it in public. Even though I never went on with music in college, these were some of the most formative memories I have about being in 7th and 8th grade. When they have setbacks, talk to them about experiences. – Beth

I think teachers easily (and understandably) get so wrapped up in the day-to-day tasks that must be done, that sometimes we forget the big picture of our mission to coach life-long engagement and learning. – Catherine

Summary

The Reflection Phase continued to strengthen the data patterns established in the previous two phases: perspectives on musicianship, school music experiences, musical experiences in the home, and lifelong musicianship. The profound reflections of both groups of participants also provided valuable insight into future directions and how I and other music teachers can teach the values of lifelong music engagement.

Chapter Summary

In summary, this project consisted of three phases: The Orientation Phase, The Immersion Phase, and The Reflection Phase. Throughout this chapter, data sources involving the adult musicians and PCMS students in each phase were examined. While many topics were addressed throughout the multiple data sets, through the content analysis it became clear that

there were five that had established strong patterns: a) perspectives on musicianship, b) music in the community, c) school music experiences, d) music at home, and e) lifelong musicianship.

Chapter five will explore how these patterns turn into emergent themes, with a return to the original research questions of this study. In addition to my personal interpretation and discussion, I will also relate the themes to relevant literature originally discussed in chapter two.

Chapter Five

Findings and Thematic Exploration

The purpose of this teacher research study was to develop a collaborative classroom project in which adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band interacted with members of the 7th grade band at Port Clinton Middle School with the goal of teaching the importance of lifelong musical engagement. Three main research questions guided this study: a) What do community band members' interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music? b) How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians? and c) How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward students' lifelong musical engagement? These questions were explored by observing and documenting the process, and interviewing and recording participants' responses.

This project consisted of three phases: The Orientation Phase, The Immersion Phase, and The Reflection Phase. Using content analysis, data sources involving the adult community musicians and PCMS students in each phase were examined and coded for patterns. Topical patterns throughout the various data sets included: perspectives on musicianship, music in the community, school music experiences, music at home, and lifelong musicianship.

Emergent Themes

Through the content analysis process, the following themes emerged from the patterns above: a) the importance of the perspective that anyone can be a musician and that the title should not be limited to professional musicians, b) the necessity of exposure to a wide variety of music in school, and c) the need to create a classroom community that encourages friendship, life skills and leadership. These emergent themes all play a significant role in teaching the values of

lifelong music engagement to students. I now return to the research questions and integrate the data.

What did community band members' interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music?

The four community band members purposefully selected for this study interacted with the middle school students in a way that was thoughtful, open and honest. They made connections with the students through various mediums including: formal discussion in both large and small group settings, informal discussion, observing rehearsals, collaboratively playing their instruments, and even preparing food for them. Researchers who studied intergenerational educational interactions found that they can be beneficial for both the younger and older age groups involved, especially if they keep educational goals first and foremost, and are balanced with sentimentality and structure (Alfano, 2008; Manheimer, 1997). This project provided several opportunities, both structured (classroom discussion, small group interviews) and informal (classroom visits by the adults), for interaction between the adults and students. For example, Ken mentioned that some students were reticent to engage with the adults in a large group, but that after class he “tried to talk with a few of those kids and found they responded with questions and stories of their own.” Catherine noted that the students “became more comfortable as we went, especially as we related personal anecdotes of our youthful music experiences.”

Each adult chose one aspect of lifelong musicianship that was uniquely important to them to focus on with the students, and during the classroom discussion they talked to the students about those aspects in a way that was personable, engaging and relatable. Beth's “main point” during the discussion was her “band buddies,” and the lifelong friendships that have come from

them. She even managed to find some old pictures of her “band buddies” and brought them in the day of the classroom discussion to show the students. Ken’s main point was that anyone can be a “musician;” from the professionals who get paid to play their instruments every day, to the rock band musicians in the garage down the street, or even people who consciously make an effort to consume and support music. Catherine’s main point was that band is a community; not only inherently by making music together but also because of the social aspects and opportunities. Gary’s main point was how music has been a constant throughout his life and even into his 70s he looks forward to community band rehearsal as pure enjoyment and an escape from daily life. These main points chosen by the adults show what of their lifelong music engagement journey is most meaningful to them, and their insights shed light on how music educators could help their students find the value in lifelong music engagement. The adults told personal stories very effectively from both their childhoods and more recent stages of life. Gary stated:” I watched the surprised reactions to announcements (or admissions) of our ages during the group discussion. The students were interested to learn of our backgrounds and how music as an avocation has filled our lives with enjoyment.”

The diversity of ways in which the adults interacted with the students provided many opportunities for students to learn about lifelong musical engagement. The adults all spoke in one way or another of the life skills that they developed in their school music programs and the friendships that started in band and have flourished throughout the years, which speaks to the importance of creating that kind of classroom community while students are still young and impressionable. In their surveys, the adults unanimously agreed that they had benefited from this experience. The fact that Catherine specifically stated how great it was to get to know her fellow

band members Gary and Beth even better throughout this experience is a testament to the importance of the social factor of making music.

How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians?

Based on the survey responses, it is obvious that students learned a wide variety of knowledge, both musical and non-musical, from the adults. Most of the students genuinely appreciated that the adults were open and honest in the discussions and that they provided insight on how music has been such a large and important part of their life, from childhood to the present. For example, when asked “in which way(s) did you enjoy working with the adult musicians,” anonymous answers included:

I enjoyed learning about their lives and how music inspired them.

They told me things that will help me in the future.

In general, the students also learned a great deal from just having the adults sit in and play with them during rehearsals. Many students commented on something the adults taught them on regarding their instrument, from positioning the mouthpiece at a certain angle, to learning how to play with a more smooth and connected style, to improving their tone quality. The adults mentoring the students on their respective instruments was not a direct objective of the study. However, through those interactions the adults were able to build relationships and positive rapport with the students. This allowed the students to be more engaged with and open to the message of lifelong musicianship coming from the adults. Many of the students said they related best to the adult that played their same instrument (or at least an instrument in the same family).

Cavitt (2005) advocated that “one terminal goal of music education is to provide opportunities for music students to master music making in such a way that will allow them to

independently pursue lifelong learning and fulfillment” (p. 42). Based on the descriptions of their interactions from the students and adults alike, I believe that this project provided a successful opportunity for students to learn about music and think about how it could fit into their lives as they progress through their teenage years, young adulthood, and beyond. In their final survey, all the adults in one way or another suggested regularly involving adult musicians as a way to foster lifelong musicianship in middle school students.

How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward lifelong musical engagement?

There is much to learn from the data generated by this project, and throughout this project I had many realizations regarding the teacher’s role in nurturing lifelong musicians. Evidence shows that secondary school music experiences play a large role in a person’s desire to participate in music later in adult life (Bowles, 1991; Cavitt, 2005; Roulston 2009). As teachers, it is easy to get caught up in the day-to-day responsibilities and activities, and sometimes forget that our students are still very malleable and eager to learn about things beyond the notes on the sheet music in front of them. In today’s educational climate, it may not be possible to model a public school music curriculum entirely after Green’s (2008) informal music learning principles. However, it is possible to make small changes and additions as to how we interact with and plan instruction for our students that can teach them the value of lifelong music engagement. After all, “[w]ere it not for the lifelong human need for music, there would be little reason for the school-based professional enterprise known today as music education” (Myers, 2007, p. 52).

I learned a surprising amount about each of my individual students throughout this process, especially those who were selected to interview the adults and therefore had in-depth conversations with them. Observing my students interact with the community band members was an eye-opening experience that has inspired me to make changes in four main areas of my

teaching: a) fostering a classroom environment that develops and celebrates students as musicians, b) creating additional opportunities in the classroom, c) providing connections with the community, and d) increasing the overall visibility of music in my school. These four areas that are of great importance to teaching the values of lifelong music engagement will be further discussed as implications in chapter six. First, a demonstration of how the four areas of teaching listed above are further interwoven with the three emergent themes:

The perspective that anyone can be a musician. The definition of “musician” was discussed several times throughout the course of the study, as well as the importance of making students feel like a musician, as it is not a term reserved for professionals. Care should be given to create a balanced classroom environment, in which students are not only learning to be skillful, but also where successes are celebrated and diverse interests are encouraged.

The necessity of exposure to a wide variety of music in school. Each community musician spoke about rich musical experiences at home, which were furthered by their band directors’ commitments to their strong, involved programs. Teachers should not assume that all students are exposed to music in their homes, and therefore should make an effort to create as many diverse musical experiences and opportunities as possible in school, making it a natural and visible aspect of the school’s overall culture. This could also be accomplished by making connections with the community.

The emphasis of creating a classroom community that encourages friendship, life skills and leadership. As evidenced by interactions with the community musicians as well as prior studies (Cavitt, 2005; Roulston, 2010), the social aspect of making music is a primary reason why adults continue to participate in music. Teachers should be aware of this and try to nurture the enjoyment and social aspects found in creating community within the music room.

Finally, the development of life skills in the music classroom, as well as students' awareness of the development of these skills, will help the students see the value of learning music and how they can benefit from it throughout their lives.

Chapter six, the concluding chapter, contains an exploration of implications for middle school teaching, future directions regarding teaching lifelong music engagement, recommendations for further research on this topic, and a conclusion.

Chapter Six

Teaching the Value of Lifelong Music Engagement: Conclusion

The purpose of this teacher research study was to develop a collaborative classroom project in which adult community musicians of the North Coast Concert Band interacted with members of the 7th grade band at Port Clinton Middle School with the goal of teaching the importance of lifelong musical engagement. Three main research questions guided this study: a) What do community band members' interactions with students reveal about their lifelong engagement with music? b) How do middle school band students describe their interactions with the community musicians? and c) How is this research likely to influence how I teach toward students' lifelong musical engagement? This study involved collecting data from 46 middle school band members and four adult community musicians through surveys, small group interviews, a video recorded class discussion and journal logs from the teacher/researcher. Findings indicate that the following elements impact producing lifelong musicians: fostering a classroom environment that develops and celebrates students as musicians, creating additional opportunities in the classroom, providing connections with the community, and increasing the overall visibility of music in the school. The following section will further discuss these implications.

Implications for Middle School Teaching

There are several implications for teaching that can be gleaned from the findings of this study. As established in chapter two, previous research exists (Alfano, 2008; Kertz-Welzel, 2016; Manheimer, 1997; Mantie, 2012a; Myers, 2007) concerning the importance of encouraging lifelong learning and connecting community awareness to the educational setting. This study supports the value of being an adult community musician and the need to encourage

musical learning inside and outside of the school environment. Mantie's 2012b study of adult community band members revealed that only 73% of respondents "agreed or strongly agreed that their school music experience prepared them well for participating in their community band" (p. 37). That statistic has stayed with me over the course of this project, and I would often find myself thinking: what can I do to prepare and inspire all my students to want to continue making music into high school and their adult lives? Observing the interactions between the PCMS students and adult musicians has provided several ideas of how teachers can encourage the values of lifelong musical engagement. Through analysis of the data and a great deal of personal reflection, I have grouped the following implications into four categories (first introduced in chapter 5): a) fostering a classroom environment that develops and celebrates students as musicians, b) creating additional opportunities in the classroom, c) providing connections with the community, and d) increasing the overall visibility of music in the school.

Fostering a classroom environment that develops and celebrates students as musicians. Teachers should strive to create a demeanor of "demanding yet humorous," as an adult participant stated. Striking a balance of fun and hard work is essential so that students can both love what they're doing but also experience success. Each adult musician mentioned the social aspect of music and friendships they've made as a large reason they continue participating, which is synonymous with Cavitt's (2005) study in which "70 percent of the respondents indicated that enjoyment and having fun was the most important reason for participation in community band." (p. 51). Therefore, teachers should be mindful in creating an environment that will allow these relationships to flourish. Students should know that their teachers believe in them by encouragement of their best performance, which sets a high expectation for excellence. Students should also know, through ample and quality teacher demonstrations, that their teachers

are masters of their craft. Rohwer's 2009 survey of adult and middle school band members explored many "issues" related to music education. In terms of important traits of strong teaching, both age groups rated personality characteristics highest, followed by instructional skills and, finally, musical skills. Therefore, "students may value how something is presented more than the content itself" (p. 69). Consequently, presenting information by demonstration is an important skill and lesson delivery strategy. Finally, in student surveys for this study, almost every student attributed being a "musician" to talent/ability level and associated it with professional musicians. Teachers have a responsibility to educate students on what it means to be a musician, and all of the different ways that it is possible to be a musician. Students should also be made to truly feel like musicians by how their teachers interact with them on a daily basis, as the term should not be reserved for elite professionals alone.

Creating additional opportunities in the classroom. It is very easy to get stuck in the pattern of preparations for each concert cycle performance. However, this project reinforced the importance of creating a variety of opportunities for students to learn and grow in their music classroom. From my various interactions with the community musicians, it is obvious that their school band directors were incredibly invested in their music programs and took extra initiative to develop their students' musicianship. Teachers should encourage students to explore their interests and/or step out of their comfort zones by participating in things like Solo and Ensemble contest, or writing and performing student compositions. One specific example of what led to this realization for me was when Beth talked about her experience of writing a percussion ensemble for her classmates in middle school, and how her band director allowed the band to perform it on a concert and how that was one of the defining moments of her school band experience. That example speaks to the effectiveness of giving students more ownership and

leadership in their learning, which is an important dimension of informal music making. Many researchers have found educational value and promise within the processes of informal music making and learning (Green, 2008; Herzig & Baker, 2014; Jaffurs, 2004). Teachers could also help students develop their leadership skills by teaching them to run rehearsals or sectionals. Finally, teachers need to make an effort to stay current on what students listen to and enjoy. As Beth stated: “Keep current. Like right now, rap a little bit. Talk to them about what they listen to and what they like. Take an off-day and just jam a bit. It builds relationships.” Jutras (2015) emphasizes the importance of directors’ holistic interest in their students, which could include building relationships with them. Additionally, Jaffurs (2004) argued that if educators can free themselves of bias and cater their lessons toward what students are truly interested in and capable of, they will reap positive results. “School can be a place where positive musical identities are established, but not if students believe that the musicians they are in school are different from the musicians they are in their garage” (Jaffurs, 2004, p. 198).

Making connections with the community. Teachers should not assume that students know of the opportunities that exist to get involved with music in any given community. As I notated in my journal after the first classroom survey, I was surprised how little students knew of the many musical opportunities and groups in our area. Furthermore, it should not be assumed that students know their teachers participate in community music groups or practice at home to continue bettering their performance skills. Teachers should involve community musicians as much as possible in their instruction, whether it is inviting them in for a conversation, or if qualified, to help lead rehearsals or sectionals. These types of interactions will help fill the gap between musical experiences of school-aged students and those of adult community music participants. Additionally, teachers should also find ways to educate parents on what is

happening in the classroom and the importance of music in the community. Bowles (1991) argued that music education of adults is an important dimension of preserving music in communities, as educating the adults in the community provides information to those who “participate in making crucial decisions regarding the quality of music experiences in the schools, and support and participate in music and the arts in the community” (p. 203). Educating and involving adults as much as possible will help create informed music consumers, active parent volunteers, and booster members. Finally, teachers should take the time to talk about the life skills students are likely to learn when they participate in music education. Yarborough (2000) stated:

Music educators, like other professional educators, must help students and their parents understand and make the connection between music and life. We must help students transfer what they have learned in music to what they will do with it when they leave the school setting. Teaching must include not only musical concepts and skills, but also how those concepts and skills can function for us through our lifetime. (p. 199)

For example, during the classroom discussion Catherine commended students preparing for Solo and Ensemble. She talked about how participating in Solo and Ensemble requires students to step out of their comfort zones, and made the students feel very proud of the challenge they were working toward (as I notated in my journal that they were visibly happy and proud). She stated: “[T]hat’s another skill that music is going to bring to you no matter what you go through. A lot of times when you go through life you have to jump out of that box to be successful.”

Increasing the visibility of music in school. Each of the adult participants grew up in homes that placed a strong emphasis on music, whether it was through a family member’s performance on an instrument or their parents’ large record collection constantly playing. In

Cavitt's (2005) survey, 52% of the respondents also indicated that "home influences prior to formal education" were most influential in their choice to continue music into adulthood (p. 51). I believe that teachers should not assume that all our students are receiving that same kind of musical exposure at home, and thus, should aim to make music a more natural part of school life. Specific suggestions from the adult participants included: inviting school staff members who play(ed) an instrument to come to band, having the students plan a flash mob for their spring talent show, and planning special activities for Music in Our Schools Month. If students are constantly exposed to a wide variety of music at school, in ways that are different than or supplement their performing ensemble experience, there is a greater chance it will become a natural part of students' lives in general.

Future Directions

A great deal of self-reflection and personal growth happened throughout the duration of this project mention the sources of data you collected. Prior to this study, I understood the importance of connecting the idea of lifelong musical engagement and community music to the activities in my classroom. In my six years of teaching I have held band director positions in two different school districts, and have sought out community music opportunities so I could remain active in my own performance. My first teaching job was in a very rural, low socio-economic location, where students had limited access to out-of-school activities and in many cases did not travel out of the area. I tried to expose them to a wide variety of music as much as possible, either digitally by recordings/videos or taking trips to Nashville or taking them to participate in various honors groups or jazz competitions. In both school districts, I have invited the friends I made from my community bands and chamber groups into my classroom to work with my students, which has been an invaluable experience for us all.

One thing that became very clear to me throughout the course of this study is my responsibility as a middle school band director to perpetuate this idea of lifelong musical engagement. In middle school, students are often beginning to lay the foundation for who they are and think about what their lives are going to be like. As I spent time with the adult participants and observed their many interactions with students, I realized that the students have generally been trained to be skillful musicians for their age. Still, I kept asking myself: do they truly understand and love what they're doing? And, what can I do to help them understand and love everything that music is? When Catherine asked the students if they considered themselves to be a musician, very few hands went up in response. That is extremely troubling to me.

Myers (2007) argued that, "school music programs in the United States are too concerned with preparing and polishing large ensemble performances, such that students do not have the skills needed for life-long musical involvement" (p. 49). Similarly, Mantie and Tucker (2008) state:

Based on what we heard from our research participants, it would seem music teaching, as it presently occurs in many schools, is premised on the belief that the goal of the activity is to 'make it' to grade twelve, after which point one can safely pack the instrument away in a closet until it is time for one's own children to play an instrument in the school's band. (p. 218)

These claims that there is a disconnect between school music programs and community music engagement have bothered me throughout this study, because based on my own experience as an educator so far, it is completely true. As music educators, we often get lost in the day-to-day responsibilities and the "push to perform," and we lose sight of what it's all about. One student perfectly summed up what it *is* all about in her final survey: "I learned that music is more than

just playing an instrument for a few years and then quitting.... [M]usic is love, friendship, and life.” Because of the amount of time that has passed throughout the duration of this study, I am happy to report that this student, who was originally undecided about continuing with band because of her love for sports and various other activities, has committed to be in high school band for her freshman year. Additionally, Tony, who was a “named student participant” in this project and a dedicated football player, has signed up to participate in both football and band for his freshman year. I would like to think that this project had some influence on both students’ decisions. I can say with confidence that I have always been conscious of teaching toward a love of music, and this project has definitely caused me to reflect on my overall teaching philosophy and methods used with my students. Armed with the knowledge I’ve gained through observing my students throughout this project, surveying my students on the topic, and suggestions from the adult participants, I feel much more empowered and prepared to teach toward lifelong musical engagement.

Recommendations for Further Research

In a future study, elongating the timeline of the classroom project, and/or adding more interactions between the adult musicians and middle school students could allow for more time for the relationship between the two different groups of participants to develop. Other considerations for further research include:

- Further exploring the student participants’ ideas of what it means to be a musician
- Further developing the survey questions and engaging students in more dialogue and reflection using other tools such as journals
- Investigating further the reasons that adult community band members continue to participate in music, perhaps with a survey of the entire community band

- Following this group of student musicians through high school and college to see what kind of an impact this project may have had on them as musicians (this was also suggested by an adult participant)
- Purposefully selecting students who are not as passionate about or dedicated to band to see what kind of an impact this project may have had on their attitude toward band
- Structuring an intergenerational collaborative project involving students and adult musicians such as a side-by-side concert.

Although this study was very specific to my current students and musical environments, readers should be able to transfer some of the findings to their own teaching assignments and situations. There is still much to be learned from both the adult and student musician populations in terms of lifelong music participation. Adult community musicians are a rich resource for curricular inspiration. Investigating additional connections, as well as collaborating with adult community musicians, should be a point of interest for educators.

Conclusion

This study has contributed to the vast pool of existing research that emphasizes the importance of producing lifelong music participants as an outcome of school music programs. Jellison (2000) calls this type of transfer of knowledge, skills, and motivation between formal school music education and adult music in the community “transition.” Partnerships between adult and student musicians are an essential step to make this “transition” happen. Music educators need to be sure their classroom environment and program goals are aligned with the idea of teaching toward lifelong musical engagement. Extending musical learning beyond high school needs awareness and advocacy in order to perpetuate the adult community musician

population. I will conclude with one final statement from Beth that, to me, sums up why teaching toward lifelong musical engagement is so important:

So not only was it [band] about friends, not only was it about fun, but it was also about skill and dedication and hard work. All those things put together help you build character. They help you find a foundation for who you are. Now obviously I went on to do other things in life ... but what I really have reflected upon is that I'm an artist. And although my craft right now is food, when I think through the artistry of my life, music is a constant. For me, music is something that I always go back to and it's something that connects me not only to my present but it also connects me to my past and to myself.

References

- Alfano, C. J. (2008). Intergenerational learning in a high school environment. *International Journal of Community Music*, 1(2), 253-266. doi: 10.1386/ijcm.1.2.253_1
- Allsup, R. (2003). Mutual learning and democratic action in instrumental music education. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 51(1), 24-37. doi: 10.2307/3345646
- Aspin, D. (2000). Lifelong learning: The mission of arts education in the learning community of the 21st century. *Music Education Research* 2(1), 75-85. doi: 10.1080/14613800050004440
- Bell, C.L. (2008). Toward a definition of a community choir. *International Journal of Community Music*, 1(2), 229-241. doi: 10.1386/ijcm.1.2.229_1
- Bowles, C. (1991). Self-expressed adult music education interests and music experiences. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 39(3), 191-205.
- Cavitt, M. E. (2005). Factors influencing participation in community bands. *Journal of Band Research*, 41(1), 42-59. doi: 10.5267/j.msl.2015.2.001
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: choosing among five approaches*. (4th ed.). Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Green, L. (2008). *Music, informal learning and the school: A new classroom pedagogy*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate.
- Herzig, M., & Baker, D. (2014). Beyond jamming: A historical and analytical perspective on the creative process. *MEIEA Journal*, 14(1), 183-217. doi: 10.25101/14.7
- Jaffurs, S.E. (2004). The impact of informal music learning practices in the classroom, or how I learned how to teach from a garage band. *International Journal of Music Education*, 22(3), 189-200. doi:10.1177/0255761404047401

- Jellison, J.A. (2000). How can all people continue to be involved in meaningful music participation? In C. Madsen (Ed.) *Vision 2020: The Housewright symposium on the future of music education* (pp. 111-137). Reston, VA: Music Educators National Conference.
- Kertz-Welzel, A. (2016). Daring to question: A philosophical critique of community music. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 24(2), 113-130.
doi:10.2979/philmusieducrevi.24.2.01
- Kruse, N. (2009). An elusive bird: Perceptions of music learning among Canadian and American adults. *International Journal of Community Music*, 2, 215-225. doi: 10.1386/ijcm.2.2-3.215_1
- Lave, J. & Wenger, E. (1991). *Situated learning: Legitimate peripheral participation*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Manheimer, R. J. (1997). Generations learning together. *Journal of Gerontological Social Work*, 28(1-2), 79-91. doi: 10.1300/J083v28n01_10
- Mantie, R. (2012a). Learners or participants? The pros and cons of ‘lifelong learning.’ *International Journal of Community Music*, 5(3), 217-235.
doi:http://dx.doi.org.proxy.lib.umich.edu/10.1386/ijcm.5.3.217_1
- Mantie, R. (2012b). A study of community band participants: Implications for music education. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 191, 21-43.
doi:110.5406/bulcouresmusedu.191.0021
- Mantie, R. & Tucker, L. (2008). Closing the gap: Does music-making have to stop upon graduation? *International Journal of Community Music*, 1(2), 217-227.
doi:10.1386/ijcm.1.2.2.17_1

- Myers, D.E. (2007). Freeing music education from schooling: Toward a lifespan perspective on music learning and teaching. *International Journal of Community of Music*, 1(1), 49-61. doi: 10.1386/ijcm.1.1.49_1
- Patton, M.Q. (2015). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Pitts, S. (2012). *Chances and choices: Exploring the impact of music education*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Population Demographics for Port Clinton, Ohio in 2016 and 2015. (n.d.). Retrieved July 1, 2016 from <https://suburbanstats.org/population/ohio/how-many-people-live-in-port-clinton>
- Port Clinton Middle School Demographic Data. (n.d.). Retrieved June 29, 2016 from <http://www.greatschools.org/ohio/port-clinton/1295-Port-Clinton-Middle-School/>
- Port Clinton, Ohio. (n.d.). Retrieved July 1, 2016 from <http://www.city-data.com/city/Port-Clinton-Ohio.html>
- Putnam, R. D. (2015). *Our kids: The American dream in crisis*. First Simon & Schuster hardcover edition. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.
- Robbins, J. (2014). Practitioner inquiry. In C. Conway (Ed.), *Qualitative research in American music education* (pp. 186-208). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Robbins, J., Burbank, M.K., & Dunkle, H. (2007). Teacher researcher: Tales from the field. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 17(1), 42-55. doi:10.1177/10570837070170010108
- Rohwer, D. (2009). Perceived instructional needs of middle school and senior citizen band members. *Journal of Music Teacher Education* (Online), 18(2), 62-73. doi: 10.1177/1057083708330864

- Rohwer, D. (2016). Research on community bands: Past, present, and future. *Contributions to Music Education, 41*, 15-30. Retrieved from: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24711126>
- Roulston, K. (2010). "There is no end to learning": Lifelong education and the joyful learner. *International Journal of Music Education, 28(4)*, 341-352. doi: 10.1177/0255761410381822
- Shansky, C. (2010). Adult motivations in community orchestra participation: A pilot case study of the Bergen philharmonic orchestra (New Jersey). *Research and Issues in Music Education, 8(1)*, np. <http://eric.ed.gov.proxy.lib.umich.edu/?id=EJ894766>
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Welcome to the NCCB & BB Website. (n.d.) Retrieved June 22, 2018 from <http://www.northcoastconcertband.com/AboutUs.htm>
- Yabrough, C. (2000). What should be the relationship between schools and other sources of music learning? In C. Madsen (Ed.) *Vision 2020: The Housewright symposium on the future of music education* (pp. 191-208). Reston, VA: Music Educators National Conference.
- Zeichner, K., & Noffke, S. (2001). Practitioner research. In Richardson, V. (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teaching* (pp. 298-330). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.

Appendix A

Middle School Student Letter of Intent

Dear 7th grade parent(s)/guardian,

My name is Jennifer Kustec and I am the Middle School Band Director at Port Clinton Middle School. I am currently enrolled in a Master's degree program at University of Michigan in Ann Arbor. In addition to traditional classroom coursework, I am writing a thesis paper. This research project will focus on promoting the values of lifelong musical engagement to students, and it involves working with several adult community musicians. **For my project to be successful, I will need to collect from students written responses to a variety of music-related topics, as well as video record students' verbal responses to working with the adult community musicians during class discussion and small-group interviews.**

In an effort to begin this data collection, I am writing to ask your permission for your son/daughter to participate in this research project. Should you agree to allow your child to participate, your child would be asked to complete a written survey which will be administered during a single class period. Following the survey, I will ask specific individuals to meet with me and/or the adult community musicians for small-group interviews. Should this occur, the interview will take approximately 15 minutes and would be arranged during a mutually convenient time during the school day. I also plan to video record three different full-classroom discussions to help in my data collection.

Participation in this study is voluntary. Your child may withdraw from the study at any time, and may in addition, skip or refuse to answer any survey or interview question.

Participation and information disclosed in this study will not affect your child's academic grade in any way. All information that is gathered for this study will be held in strict confidence. Student names will not be disclosed in the document. Results from this study will be made available to you and your child upon request. All data collected from surveys and video recordings will be destroyed at the end of the research study.

Should you have questions regarding any part of this research project, you may be contact either myself at Port Clinton Middle School, 419-485-6700 ext. 3181, jkustec@pccsd-

k12.net; or the faculty advisor for my study, Dr. Marie McCarthy, Professor of Music Education, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, 734-647-0557, mfmcc@umich.edu.

I have listed the activities your child may be involved in on the following page. If you wish to allow your child to participate in this study without any limitations, no further action is needed. If there is any activity listed that you prefer your child to **not** participate in, please indicate this by checking the appropriate box or boxes and return this letter to me.

I am excited about beginning this project and in the process; I hope to better understand my students' musical needs and interests and ultimately better serve the students I teach.

Thank you,

Jennifer Kustec

If there is any activity you prefer your child **not** to be involved in, please indicate so by checking the appropriate box or boxes and send the form back to school with your child.

- fill out a survey that will be completed anonymously.
- participate in video-recorded class discussions led by Ms. Kustec
- participate in video-recorded small group interviews with Ms. Kustec

I, _____, do not wish for
_____ to participate in the above indicated activities.

Signature

Date

Appendix B**7th Grade Band**

Lifelong Musical Engagement Survey

1. In your own words, describe what it means to be a musician.
2. Name some musicians you admire.
3. What is your definition of community music?
4. Do you think music plays an important role in our community? Why or why not?
5. Do you know of any music groups in our community?
6. Do any of your older family members (older than high school) or friends still play an instrument or sing regularly?
7. What is your favorite thing about participating in band?
8. What is your least favorite thing about participating in band?
9. Do you plan to continue to play your instrument next year and in high school?
10. Besides band, are there other times/places in your life where you regularly perform and/or listen to music?

Olivia

7th Grade Band
Lifelong Musical Engagement Survey

1. In your own words, describe what it means to be a musician.

Being a musician means to play music for other

2. Name some musicians you admire.

I do not listen to music often, so I do not have many, but one that I do admire that I know is Ms. Kustec. :)

3. What is your definition of community music?

Community music is music that brings people in a community together.

4. Do you think music plays an important role in our community? Why or why not?

Yes- Music brings people together, and lets people show talent in music.

5. Do you know of any music groups in our community?

Yes- I know about the North coast Concert Band that Ms. Kustec plays in.

6. Do any of your older family members (older than high school) or friends still play an instrument or sing regularly?

My grandma stills plays the trumpet in the alumni band every years, and helps my siblings and me with pieces we do not understand.

7. What is your favorite thing about participating in band?

My favorite thing about participating in band is playing larger pieces for concerts and listening to all of the instruments blending together.

8. What is your least favorite thing about participating in band?


My least favorite thing about being in band is having to wait for individuals to stop talking in between pieces.

9. Do you plan to continue to play your instrument next year and in high school?

Yes- I'm really enjoying my experience in band so far, and looking forward to trips & concerts in high school.

10. Besides band, are there other times/places in you life where you regularly perform and/or listen to music?

I do ballet and contemporary dancing. I unfortunately do not listen to music often, but not

 7th Grade Band
Lifelong Musical Engagement Survey

Amy

1. In your own words, describe what it means to be a musician.

Being able to express yourself in a
creative way through something

2. Name some musicians you admire.
everyone can enjoy
Ms. Kustec, Mr. Miller.

3. What is your definition of community music?

A community that 100% percent
supports music and makes
sure it stays alive, and everyone can enjoy

4. Do you think music plays an important role in our community? Why or why not?

Yes because the people around town and school
always make time for our concerts and
plays

5. Do you know of any music groups in our community?

The North Coast Concert Band

6. Do any of your older family members (older than high school) or friends still play an instrument or sing regularly?

No, unfortunately my mom could not afford an instrument,
but she was in choir—she always sings in the
car

7. What is your favorite thing about participating in band?

I can express myself in ways that
don't involve a colored pencil
or a canvas

8. What is your least favorite thing about participating in band?

Having to watch everyone else
play when we are told not to
(haha)

9. Do you plan to continue to play your instrument next year and in high school?

Absolutely!

10. Besides band, are there other times/places in you life where you regularly perform and/or listen to music?

No... Not really

Appendix C**7th Grade Band**

Lifelong Musical Engagement Survey (Post-Discussion)

1. In what way(s) did you enjoy working with the adult musicians?
2. Which adult musician did you relate to most? Why?
3. Describe at least one **non-musical** thing you learned from an adult musician during this experience.
4. Describe at least one **musical** thing you learned from an adult musician during this experience.
5. Describe what it means to be a musician. Has this changed since the adults visited our classroom? If so, how?
6. If you could change one thing about band to make your current experience better, what would it be?
7. Do you plan to continue to play your instrument next year and in high school? Has your answer changed since the last survey?
8. What type of community music ensemble could you see yourself getting involved with after high school? (Remember, a community band isn't the only option...)
9. How do you think you might benefit from a community music ensemble?
10. What is your biggest "takeaway" from yesterday's discussion?

Olivia

7th Grade Band

Lifelong Musical Engagement Survey (Post-Discussion)

1. In what way(s) did you enjoy working with the adult musicians?
I enjoyed interviewing and learning more about Mr. Keller's experience with music.
2. Which adult musician did you relate to most? Why?
I feel that I related to Mr. Keller the most due to relatives inspiring me to play too.
3. Describe at least one non-musical thing you learned from an adult musician during this experience. If you want to try something new, do it.
If you want to try something new, do it.
4. Describe at least one musical thing you learned from an adult musician during this experience. You do not have to play music in order to be a musician.
5. Describe what it means to be a musician. Has this changed since the adults visited our classroom? If so, how? Being a musician means to write, play, study, and to sell music with dedication.
6. If you could change one thing about band to make your current experience better, what would it be? I would change peoples' behaviors so that everyone can be on task and play better as a band.
7. Do you plan to continue to play your instrument next year and in high school? Has your answer changed since the last survey? Yes - My answer has not changed since the last survey.
8. What type of community music ensemble could you see yourself getting involved with after high school? (Remember, a community band isn't the only option...) I can see myself joining a community band and maybe even writing music.
9. How do you think you might benefit from a community music ensemble? I will meet and connect with other people with the same interest as me.
10. What is your biggest "takeaway" from yesterday's discussion?
My biggest takeaway from yesterday's discussion was that music can connect people from many different backgrounds and cultures.

Amy

7th Grade Band

Lifelong Musical Engagement Survey (Post-Discussion)

1. In what way(s) did you enjoy working with the adult musicians?
They were able to open up and tell their stories to a bunch of kids
2. Which adult musician did you relate to most? Why?
Chef Funk because she was my interview person and I now know her on a music-personal level
3. Describe at least one non-musical thing you learned from an adult musician during this experience.
Chef Funk's favorite thing to cook is pasta (one of them)
4. Describe at least one musical thing you learned from an adult musician during this experience.
Chef Funk has traveled to France and was mesmerized by the street performers
5. Describe what it means to be a musician. Has this changed since the adults visited our classroom? If so, how?
A musician is a person who puts their heart and soul into music because that is what they want to do
6. If you could change one thing about band to make your current experience better, what would it be?
to play more handouts and less book
7. Do you plan to continue to play your instrument next year and in high school? Has your answer changed since the last survey?
Absolutely!
8. What type of community music ensemble could you see yourself getting involved with after high school? (Remember, a community band isn't the only option...)
I want to be in college band... if there is one
9. How do you think you might benefit from a community music ensemble?
I will know more about the world/towns music
10. What is your biggest "takeaway" from yesterday's discussion?
I can't have any more of Chef Funk's cheesecake



Appendix D

Adult End-of-Experience Survey Questions

1. What did you notice about the students' interactions with you throughout this experience?
2. Did you notice any differences in the students' behavior or engagement levels throughout the time you spent with them?
3. Could you personally relate to any of the students that you interacted with?
4. Do you feel that you benefited from this experience? Please describe.
5. Several different aspects of lifelong musical engagement were discussed with the students. Which aspect(s) do you feel was the most impressionable or meaningful to them?
6. What suggestions do you have for current music teachers to "plant the seed" for lifelong musical engagement and encourage students to continue making music in their adult lives?
7. Are there any other observations, thoughts, etc. you would like to share regarding this experience?

Appendix E

Adult Focus Group Potential Questions

- Describe your middle school band experience.
- Was music a big part of your home life while growing up?
- In addition to band, were you involved in any other school music groups in middle or high school?
- Were you involved in any music groups outside of the normal school day?
- Describe your high school band experience.
- Describe any positive qualities your band director(s) possessed.
- Describe any negative qualities your band director(s) possessed.
- How has music been a part of your life since high school?
- Do you have children and/or grandchildren that are now involved in music in or outside of school?
- What is your experience working with middle school students?
- Why did you choose to come back to music?

Appendix F

Small Group Interview Questions for Adults

Brainstormed by students, with supervision from teacher/researcher

- How long have you been playing your instrument?
- Do you have any musical family members?
- Who or what inspired you to start band?
- What was the first instrument you played?
- What was your first performance like?
- What were your favorite things about your school band experience?
- What other genres of music do you like?
- What other hobbies do you have?
- Do you have any children? Do they play an instrument?
- What did you want to be when you were younger?
- Did you ever think that you'd be a musician when you were an adult?
- Do you have a favorite song to play?
- What's your favorite instrument?
- What inspired you to stick with music even though it is not your career? (Andrew & Emma you can't ask this one.)
- How can music help us grow?
- Do you think that music is important in the community?
- What's your favorite thing about being an adult musician?