

## **Title: Untold Stories: Emergency Medicine Residents' Experiences Caring for Diverse Patient Populations**

Adrienne Haggins, MD, MS,<sup>1</sup> Michael Clery, MD, MPP,<sup>2</sup> James Ahn, MD, MHPE,<sup>3</sup> Emily Hogikyan, MD,<sup>4</sup> Sheryl Heron, MD, MPH,<sup>5</sup> Renee Johnson, MD,<sup>6</sup> Laura R. Hopson, MD<sup>7</sup>

1. Assistant Clinical Professor in the Department of Emergency Medicine at Michigan Medicine at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI. [ahaggins@med.umich.edu](mailto:ahaggins@med.umich.edu)
2. Assistant Professor in the Department of Emergency Medicine at Emory School of Medicine, Atlanta, GA. [michael.j.clery@emory.edu](mailto:michael.j.clery@emory.edu)
3. Associate Professor in the Section of Emergency Medicine Department of Internal Medicine, and Program Director of Emergency Medicine at University of Chicago Pritzker School of Medicine, Chicago, IL. [jamesahn@uchicago.edu](mailto:jamesahn@uchicago.edu)
4. PGY-2 in the Department of Pediatrics at Northwestern Feinberg School of Medicine, Chicago, IL. [Emily.hogikyan@northwestern.edu](mailto:Emily.hogikyan@northwestern.edu)
5. Professor in the Department of Medicine and Assistant Dean at Emory University School of Medicine, Atlanta, GA. [sheron@emory.edu](mailto:sheron@emory.edu)
6. Assistant Professor in the Department of Emergency Medicine at the University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston McGovern School of Medicine, Houston, TX. [Renee.C.Johnson@uth.tmc.edu](mailto:Renee.C.Johnson@uth.tmc.edu)
7. Associate Chair for Education and Associate Clinical Professor in the Department of Emergency Medicine at Michigan Medicine at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI. [LHopson@med.umich.edu](mailto:LHopson@med.umich.edu)

### **Corresponding Author:**

This is the author manuscript accepted for publication and has undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the [Version of Record](#). Please cite this article as [doi: 10.1002/AET2.10678](https://doi.org/10.1002/AET2.10678)

This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

Adrienne Haggins, MD, MS  
Department of Emergency Medicine  
Taubman Center B1-354L  
Ann Arbor, MI 48109  
Phone 734-763-5343  
Fax 734-936-9414

**Previous presentations:** This project was presented as a poster at the Health Professions Education Day in June 1, 2016, Ann Arbor, MI and the Council for Graduate Education Affairs Meeting in March 31, 2017, Chicago, IL. The project was presented as an oral presentation at the Association of American Medical Colleges Live Learn and Serve Annual Meeting in November 4, 2017, Boston, MA.

**Financial Support:** This work was supported with funding from the Center for Research and Learning at the University of Michigan.

**Author contributions:**

study concept and design, AH, MC

acquisition of the data, AH, EH

analysis and interpretation of the data, AH, MC, LH, JA, EH, RJ, SH

drafting of the manuscript, AH, MC, EH, JA, SH, RJ, LH

critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content AH, MC, JA, EH, RJ, SH,  
LH

statistical expertise n/a

acquisition of funding AH

**Conflict of Interest Disclosure:**

AH reports no conflict of interest.

MC reports no conflict of interest.

JA reports no conflict of interest.

EH reports no conflict of interest.

SH reports no conflict of interest.

RJ reports no conflict of interest.

LH reports no conflict of interest.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30

DR. ADRIANNE HAGGINS (Orcid ID : 0000-0003-4030-2815)  
DR. JAMES AHN (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-6060-5146)  
DR. SHERYL L HERON (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-9987-2073)  
DR. LAURA R HOPSON (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-1183-4751)

Article type : Original Contribution

## Abstract

**Objectives:** The Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education expects specialties to teach and assess proficiency in culturally competent care. However, little guidance has emerged to achieve these goals. Clinical training within socioeconomically disparate settings may provide an experiential learning opportunity. We sought to qualitatively explore resident experiences working in the generic clinical learning environments (i.e., exposure to socioeconomically diverse patients across different training sites) and how it shapes cultural competency related skill development.

**Methods:** Residents were recruited from emergency medicine (EM) programs. We used purposeful sampling across all post graduate years and elicited experiences related to working at the different sites related to cultural identity, frustrating patient encounters, vulnerable populations, and development of health disparities/social determinants of health knowledge. Individual structured interviews were conducted via phone between May and December 2016. Interviews were audiotaped, transcribed, anonymized and analyzed using systematic and iterative coding methods.

**Results:** Twenty-four interviews revealed 3 main themes. EM residents' experiences caring for patients across sites shaped their understanding of: (1) potential patient attributes that affected

31 the clinical encounter, (2) difficulties in building rapport had adverse effect on the clinical  
32 evaluation, and (3) residency program and training experiences shaped their clinical  
33 preparedness, and willingness to work in underserved areas.

34  
35 **Conclusion:** Assessing the impact disparate clinical setting exposures have on trainees'  
36 preparedness to care for socioeconomically diverse patients can provide valuable insight for  
37 medical educators into barriers, and facilitators to delivering optimal learning and patient care.  
38 Participants provided a breadth of stories illuminating their real-world consciousness and  
39 competency with meeting the needs of diverse populations and their access to varied educational  
40 outlets to grapple with the disparities they observed. More research is needed to uncover  
41 effective strategies to help residents thrive and feel more prepared to care for diverse  
42 populations.

43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61

62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92

93

94

95

96 **Introduction**

97 The Association for American Medical Colleges (AAMC) published a framework<sup>1</sup> along with  
98 other investigators<sup>2-5</sup> synthesizing the empirical evidence related to cultural competency in an  
99 effort to guide undergraduate medical education. In this 2005 AAMC report cultural competence  
100 was described as “patient/family-centered care with an understanding of the social and cultural  
101 influences that affect the quality of medical services.”<sup>1</sup> As medical students advance to the level  
102 of trainee the principles of cultural competency do not change, and become increasing more  
103 relevant. However, little practical guidance has emerged for post-graduate educators. At a  
104 national level, there has been increasing attention to this gap in post-graduate training  
105 curriculum.<sup>6</sup> In a cross-sectional survey of senior residents across multiple specialties,  
106 investigators found that residents overwhelmingly affirmed the importance of providing  
107 culturally competent care, however only 8% felt prepared with these skills.<sup>7</sup> In qualitative  
108 interviews of Internal Medicine senior residents, many desired additional educational  
109 opportunities to optimize cross-cultural patient care.<sup>8</sup> In general surgery specialties, clinical  
110 training opportunities in international low-resource settings were found to have a positive  
111 influence on resident’s understanding of health disparities and confidence in their cultural  
112 sensitivity.<sup>9</sup> Emergency departments (EDs) present a unique challenge for providers to  
113 continuously adapt to the diverse socio-cultural and economic needs of their patient population.

114

115 The Emergency Medical Treatment and Labor Act of 1986 ensured that patients seeking  
116 emergency medical care in hospitals were essentially guaranteed access to medical screening  
117 exam, treatment if unstable, and that they would not be turned away based on their inability to  
118 pay.<sup>10</sup> Therefore, emergency departments have evolved as a healthcare entry point for those with  
119 acute medical conditions, and others vulnerable to unmet care, such as underinsured patients, as  
120 well as patients facing non-financial barriers<sup>11</sup> related to sexual orientation,<sup>12,13</sup> or  
121 discrimination. In the United States, residency clinical training which occurs in diverse  
122 environments (i.e., low-resource public hospitals, suburban community hospitals, well-resourced  
123 academic centers, etc.) may provide unique experiential learning opportunities related to cultural

124 competency and health disparities. Despite the Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical  
125 Education (ACGME) requirement for all specialties to teach and assess proficiency in culturally  
126 competent care, education in Emergency Medicine (EM) is challenged due to limited guidance  
127 by EM educational organizations (personal communication), and time pressures on  
128 accommodating additional formal education into the EM residency curriculum. Therefore,  
129 within current generic clinical learning environments that provide exposure to socioeconomically  
130 diverse populations, it is imperative to explore how these unstructured learning experiences  
131 affect residents' knowledge, perceptions, and cultural competency skill development.

132

## 133 **Methods**

134

### 135 **Participants**

136 We recruited residents from three accredited multi-site EM training programs. Each of these  
137 programs provides their residents with clinical training experiences in at least 3 distinct sites  
138 (i.e., tertiary/quaternary care academic medical center, medically low-resourced/underserved and  
139 suburban/community hospital setting). We selected multi-site residency programs in order to  
140 ensure that the residents would have a high likelihood of encountering a wide range of patients  
141 from varied racial/ethnic, and socioeconomic backgrounds. We used purposeful sampling<sup>14</sup> (i.e.  
142 sample selected based on predetermined criteria and having completed a clinical rotation at all 3  
143 hospital sites) to recruit residents across all post graduate years. The project was introduced to  
144 residents during residency conference, and follow-up recruitment emails (approximately 4-6  
145 weeks apart) were sent from a primary contact person within each program.

146

### 147 **Data collection**

148 Individual interviews (n=24) were conducted by the research team (AH, EH, JS) using a semi-  
149 structured guide (Appendix 1) between May and December 2016. We elicited resident  
150 experiences related to working at the different clinical sites and specifically direct or observed  
151 patient care interactions. We explored topics related to cultural identity, and frustrating patient  
152 care experiences related to differences in cultural identities between the provider and  
153 patient. Based on the ACGME EM milestones,<sup>15</sup> we inquired about strategies for identifying and  
154 caring for vulnerable populations, as well as the residents' understanding of and application of

155 health disparities/social determinants of health knowledge in daily practice. Interviewers had  
156 prior experience with qualitative methodology (i.e., designing interview guides, conducting  
157 interviews/focus groups, and/or thematic analysis).

158  
159 We considered one-on-one in-depth interviews via the phone to be the best modality given the  
160 sensitive nature of the dialogue, which encompassed topics such as race, values, and  
161 socioeconomics. We believed that the residents would be more likely to share their thoughts and  
162 experiences in a setting that maintained their privacy and enable residents to express freely their  
163 positive and negative thoughts related to their clinical experiences. The faculty interviewer (AH)  
164 also did not interview residents from their local institution. Prior to each interview, participants  
165 provided their verbal consent for both the interview and audio-recording. Each participant  
166 received a \$20 gift card via mail as a token of appreciation for participation. We collected self-  
167 reported year in residency and demographics or obtained it from National Resident Matching  
168 Program applications (e.g., race, and gender). Interviews were audio recorded and anonymized  
169 using a random identifier, then transcribed verbatim and reviewed for accuracy. Interviews were  
170 reviewed throughout the study and conducted until thematic saturation.<sup>16</sup> This study was  
171 reviewed by the Institutional Review Boards at all participating sites and either approved (site 2)  
172 or deemed exempt (site 1 and 3).

#### 173 174 **Data analysis**

175 Using a phenomenological approach, we explored individual narratives, as well as convergent  
176 and divergent patterns within the study sample.<sup>17</sup> All transcripts were initially independently  
177 reviewed and iteratively coded (A\_, E\_). We compared codes and discussed among the authors  
178 (A\_, E\_) to ensure the trustworthiness of the analysis. We (A\_, E\_) organized recurring codes  
179 into categories of similar content, then further discussed and arranged into broader themes. Two  
180 authors (\_C, \_H) independently read the transcripts to confirm the identified themes. Coders  
181 reflected on potential biases which could color interpretations. The lead author (A\_) identifies as  
182 an underrepresented minority and has a scholarly interest in health disparities, and curriculum to  
183 improve care to socially and economically disadvantaged populations. One secondary coder (\_C)  
184 previously conducted research on injury prevention in low-resource communities. Another  
185 author (E\_), a medical student at the time of the study, was less familiar with residency in

186 general, which likely enhanced their inquisitive nature and interviewing. The other secondary  
187 coder (\_H), a residency program director, had concerns that they were able to identify some of  
188 the participants. However, their participation in the analysis was considered valuable, given their  
189 perspective and ability to weigh in on the practical implications of these findings on residency  
190 curriculum. Resident participants and non-participants were presented with the findings during a  
191 grand rounds style presentation at two of the participating sites to allow for discussion about the  
192 results and achieve better understanding of the findings. Data management and analysis was  
193 facilitated through use of Dedoose® (Version 7.5.15, Los Angeles, CA) software.

194

195

## 196 **Results**

197 Twenty-four EM residents participated in the study and their characteristics are in Table 1. The  
198 majority of the participants were from site 1 (n=10, 41.7%), in their first year of training (n=10,  
199 41.7%), male (n=14, 58.3%), and not from under-represented in medicine backgrounds<sup>18</sup> (n=20,  
200 83.3%). Interviews were an average of 50 minutes in length.

201

202 Our analyses revealed three main themes: EM residents' experiences caring for diverse patient  
203 populations across the varied clinical sites shaped their understanding of: (1) potential patient  
204 attributes that affected the clinical encounter, (2) difficulties in building rapport had adverse  
205 effect on the clinical evaluation, and (3) residency program and training experiences influence on  
206 clinical preparedness, and willingness to work in underserved areas. Additional illustrative  
207 quotes representing main themes and subthemes are in Table 2.

208

### 209 **Trainees perceived that challenging clinical encounters were attributed to patient factors**

210 Residents described frustrating experiences that they had either experienced or observed between  
211 patients and providers with different cultural identities. The cultural identity difficulties  
212 occurred in instances when there were differences related to gender, race, ethnicity, and/or  
213 socioeconomic status. Residents perceived that there were underlying reasons specific to the  
214 patient that potentially explained these challenging encounters. Resident participants commonly  
215 referred to patient social behaviors, perceived patient values, language or literacy barriers, and

216 mistrust of providers. One resident described an experience with a frustrated patient who felt she  
217 was being ignored because of her race and socioeconomic status:

218  
219 *“I remember walking by and... her saying, and trying to get the message out there, “I don’t think any of*  
220 *you guys are seeing me because you know I’m Black and I don’t have insurance, and you’re putting me at*  
221 *the bottom of the list.” ....I think...she was thinking that maybe the doctors were biased against*  
222 *her...Going into that patient interaction was tough because I knew there was already this frustration on*  
223 *her part. I was a little scared to go in.” -10028, Site 2*

224  
225 When reflecting on personally challenging cross-cultural patient experiences, residents described  
226 how it was “human nature” and not secondary to malicious intent. The participants noted that  
227 differences between them and their patients made it difficult to build rapport because it pushed  
228 the trainees out of their “comfort zone.” Certain patient behaviors were felt to contribute to  
229 difficulty in communication and engagement. When patients were perceived as angry, or  
230 demanding, residents were reluctant to engage with them. For example:

231  
232 *“I was talking with another doctor.... He said if he walks in a room and ..., no matter who they*  
233 *are, [if] the first thing [the patient does] is complain, “Finally I get to see a doctor. Man, I’ve*  
234 *been waiting hours to see you.” He was like, “My brain just shuts off.”*  
235 *-10031, Site 2*

236  
237 Another patient-specific contributor that residents mentioned was the perceived value patients  
238 place on health and health care services. Residents voiced an ease of engagement with more  
239 affluent patients or those with higher education/health literacy, due to what they felt was better  
240 alignment with expectations of emergency care and ability to communicate their health  
241 needs. Conversely, participants noted frustration with patient care expectations in the low-  
242 resource hospital setting. Residents reported observing differences in values related to health  
243 behaviors and healthcare utilization in these settings, which were further attributed to poor  
244 patient health literacy. One resident shared their view of a minority population and perception of  
245 how this group valued healthcare:

246

247 *“I have had the most challenging encounters with the more low-income, African American*  
248 *population, because it's so different than the culture in which I was raised. I'm from a somewhat*  
249 *wealthy, White background. My medical school was actually an urban safety net hospital, so I've*  
250 *been exposed to this population for several years now, and I'm definitely learning how to relate*  
251 *with them better ...but I would say overall, they give the impression that when you're dealing*  
252 *with them, it seems less respectful and a lot of time they seem less engaged in their healthcare.” -*  
253 10013, Site 1

254

### 255 **Lack of competency in building rapport with diverse patients affected clinical care**

256

257 Residents noted that cultural identity differences tended to affect care provided both  
258 interpersonally and in the clinical approach to evaluating the patient. Participants illustrated the  
259 ways in which difficulties understanding the patient and uncertainty in determining the patient's  
260 health care needs led to three reactions: 1) reduced amount of time with the patient, 2) spending  
261 a substantial amount of time with the patient, or 3) ordering more tests. For example, participants  
262 noticed times where they were fully engaged with certain patients, and reluctant to speak with  
263 other patients. For example:

264

265 *“This guy who is really well off, a White guy and very affluent... I think I spent probably almost*  
266 *15 minutes in his room,... The second [African American] guy was very similar to the rest of the*  
267 *people in the department where I said this is just another heart failure patient who can't afford*  
268 *his meds. All right, we're going to admit him and that's what I was thinking the entire time we*  
269 *were talking. Probably spent maybe five minutes in his room... I feel like I definitely maybe spent*  
270 *more time with the patient who is more like my, you could say, cultural identity.” -10021, Site 3*

271

272 Another resident describes how differences in language and culture lead to less confidence in  
273 clinical reasoning and resulted in opting to order additional diagnostic tests:

274

275 *“... using an interpreter phone,...I can only get so much of a history from the phone, so we have*  
276 *to, unfortunately, work somebody up a lot more than we would otherwise,... how you*  
277 *differentiate chest pain is a lot of the time based on history....you're not going to get it talking*

278 through an interpreter, so unfortunately, a patient is getting a very extensive workup that they  
279 *may or may not have needed,...That can be quite frustrating.*”

280 -10017, Site 1

281

## 282 **Training influences clinical preparation and willingness to work in underserved areas**

283

284 Residents commented on how their residency experiences affected their ability to communicate  
285 with diverse patient populations. Many participants remarked that their communication  
286 behaviors and interpersonal skills were shaped indirectly through modeling senior residents or  
287 faculty. They also mentioned the key role the faculty make-up had on their residency  
288 experiences:

289

290 *“...we have people with different sexual orientation, people with different ethnicities, Black,*  
291 *White, a good amount of females versus males...We [have] people who are Muslim....that*  
292 *increases the odds of delivering good care because you just have a better understanding.... As a*  
293 *physician you want to hear from other people, what their perspective is, just in case you're faced*  
294 *with a patient that may have a similarity with one of your [faculty] physicians...Sometimes if you*  
295 *don't have that supply or diverse experience you can be missing out on the efficacy of your care*  
296 *as well as the opportunity to send people from your program to serve a certain community.” -*

297 10024, Site 3

298

299 Participants recalled having training related to caring for diverse patient populations. These  
300 experiences were described as having occurred during medical school, self-initiated  
301 extracurricular activities (i.e., volunteerism, public health pursuits, etc.), and less commonly in  
302 residency training. Participants referenced experiences during residency with EMS ride-alongs,  
303 “windshield” tours, or a video, as methods for learning about surrounding areas and patient  
304 populations. Resident experiences with formal educational curriculum or didactic instruction  
305 were perceived to increase confidence and ability to address diverse patients’ needs. For  
306 example, one resident described utilizing recent residency lecture material while caring for a  
307 presumed LGBTQI patient that initially presented to the ED with altered mental status:

308

309 “...we had an opportunity to have a discussion about how they viewed [their] gender and  
310 identity...We were better able to care for the patient ...We allowed them to essentially advocate  
311 for themselves and be more involved in their care...I feel like we recently had a lecture about  
312 how to navigate these scenarios. I felt prepared for this....because I had to apply something that  
313 I had just recently learned.”

314 -10027 Site 2

315

316 Overwhelmingly, residents reported that working within diverse clinical settings exposed them to  
317 unfamiliar cultures, which helped to introduce them to different cultural practices, parenting  
318 styles, and language. They stated that their experiences helped broaden their perspective and  
319 increased their confidence in being able to care for a variety of patients. Participants training  
320 environment experiences were also described as a career asset post-residency because it  
321 improved their marketability (i.e., familiarity with different hospital settings, and electronic  
322 health record software, etc.), and helped them feel more informed in deciding which clinical  
323 setting they preferred. However, when participants compared their experiences across the  
324 disparate clinical sites, they commonly remarked on frustrating experiences they had working  
325 within the lower resource hospital settings and with underserved populations.

326

327 Residents revealed how they were initially eager to work in underserved environments, but often  
328 felt overwhelmingly defeated working in this setting, given that they were unable to make the  
329 difference they had envisioned. For example, one resident remarked, “That's why I wanted to  
330 just move—I've decided to leave and go into community *medicine*... You hear so many really sad  
331 situations. You can only do so much. I mean, you can give them the medicines they need while  
332 they're in the hospital, but if they can't get them once they leave, they're gonna come back again  
333 *in a couple weeks just as sick... It's very difficult.*” -10023 Site 2

334

335 Others commented that their attempts to identify barriers to patient health were felt to not be  
336 useful given that they were often unable to do anything about it:

337

338 “I love educating patients ..., and it became a repetitive thing [that] I leave a lot of my shifts  
339 very frustrated and being like I didn't help anyone. I didn't do anything...it obviously happened

340 *at all sites....but it seems to be very prevalent in the sense of the inner-city population. “Well,*  
341 *we’ll just go to the ER, and we’ll get everything figured out.” Or, “We’ll get a prescription for*  
342 *this.” ...It became just very frustrating for me in terms of [it was] hard to teach, hard to educate*  
343 *patients, hard to instill, [and arrange] follow up. It almost felt like a broken system to me, which*  
344 *some people thrive in... It just wasn’t really for me personally.”*

345 -10010, Site 1

346

347 Other common sources of frustration conveyed were related to the health system or inherent to  
348 the chaos of the emergency department. These extrinsic challenges identified by the resident to  
349 care delivery were associated with lack of time, lack of relationship with the patient, lack of  
350 resources, lack of ability to secure and verify follow-up with appointments. Residents disclosed  
351 these sentiments when referring to all clinical training sites, but they more often described  
352 dispiriting experiences at low-resource training sites. For example:

353

354 *“The [low-resource hospital] that I’m at is so incredibly busy, it’s bursting at the seams with*  
355 *patients...The actual attendings who take care of the patients never have time to talk to the*  
356 *families. Because they see so many patients.... There’s no time left to talk to a group of 20 family*  
357 *members... I mean, they spend eight hours... just trying to see the patients....I don’t see that in*  
358 *the other hospitals.*

359 -10023, Site 2

360

## 361 **Discussion**

362

363 Exposure to contrasting clinical sites in residency programs ideally provides trainees with an  
364 experiential learning opportunity that contributes to achieving a practical and deeper  
365 understanding of different cultures, disparities in allocation of resources and social determinants  
366 of health. Assessing the impact exposure to diverse domestic clinical settings has on trainees’  
367 preparedness and ability to care for socially and economically diverse patients can provide  
368 valuable insight into barriers, as well as facilitators to delivering optimal learning and care.  
369 Resident reflections on difficult patient experiences help to illuminate the real-world challenges  
370 they face as they attempt to adapt to the constantly changing needs of their diverse patient

371 populations. Through this exploration, residents were able to identify factors which were felt to  
372 shape their development such as training in addressing differences in identity, faculty  
373 diversity, and significance of exposure to low-resource hospital environments. However, it is  
374 noteworthy to uncover how these clinical exposures can overwhelm and disempower some  
375 residents previously motivated to work in safety-net communities.

376

377 It is conceivable that over the course of training cultural competency skills will develop.  
378 However, discerning which strategies are most effective and align best with the residency  
379 workflow requires attention. The pace of the emergency department, uncertainty in diagnosis,  
380 unfamiliarity with the patients, and innumerable distractions are a recipe for relying on quick  
381 judgement, which may be more likely to be influenced by stereotypes or cognitive biases.<sup>19</sup>  
382 Medical classes have increased in gender and race/ethnic diversity over time,<sup>20</sup> but racial/ethnic  
383 shifts have been marginal when adjusting for population growth.<sup>21</sup> The majority of medical  
384 school matriculants are from more affluent backgrounds with higher parental incomes and  
385 educational attainment than the patients they serve.<sup>22,23</sup> Despite Emergency Medicine (EM)  
386 being the frontlines of healthcare access and service to many diverse populations, the specialty in  
387 particular remains predominantly white<sup>24</sup> and male.<sup>25</sup> These differences in lived experiences  
388 between provider and patient presented a challenge for residents and their ability to connect and  
389 empathize with their minority patients or those in low-resource hospitals.

390

391 Phelan et al. found that graduating medical students with more negative racial attitudes were less  
392 likely to practice in underserved or minority communities.<sup>26</sup> Suhkera et al. emphasized the  
393 importance of physician identity and recognition of implicit biases. However, in their qualitative  
394 study, residents described looking toward faculty for guidance, but found an insufficient number  
395 of faculty primed to have such conversations.<sup>27</sup> Deliberate conversations related to  
396 understanding, managing, and appreciating differences across cultural identities will be essential  
397 to developing appropriate skills in trainees. Some residency programs have incorporated case  
398 series to prompt these types of race and cultural discussions.<sup>28</sup> Carefully designed curriculum has  
399 been developed in other specialties to promote conversation related to racism and health  
400 disparities on the wards, and in didactics.<sup>29,30</sup> The unique ED environment may require the  
401 development of brief tools to aid residency programs in debriefing common difficult patient

402 interactions and prompt provider reflection on personal identity differences, especially in low-  
403 resource settings.

404

405 The composition of the residency program matters. Residents described the value of learning  
406 from faculty of different racial/ethnic and religious backgrounds, as well as gender and sexual  
407 orientation. Residents commented on how their access to diverse faculty was an essential  
408 resource to provide guidance when caring for patients similar to the faculty member. However,  
409 the specialty of EM is challenged in recruiting a workforce diverse in race/ethnicity, and  
410 gender.<sup>31,32</sup> In addition, from 1988 to 2017, there has been limited shifts in the socioeconomic  
411 diversity among the sampling pool of medical school matriculants.<sup>33</sup> Identity diversity within  
412 teams has been found to improve overall performance and problem-solving.<sup>34</sup> Diversity is not  
413 simply a goal to align the appearance of the workforce to the general population, but our work  
414 highlights the educational benefits to residents and faculty in spurring conversation and gaining  
415 exposure to diverse identities. Similar findings related to the proportion of racial/ethnic diversity  
416 in medical school classes was found to positively influence White students attitudes related to  
417 equitable care.<sup>35</sup>

418

419 Finally, some residents previously interested in working in low-resource hospital settings,  
420 inspired to make a difference in those communities, shared how they leave these training sites  
421 disempowered to seek alternate, more affluent practice settings. There are inherent challenges to  
422 working in safety-net hospitals related to finance, resources, education, poverty, violence, and  
423 other aspects related to social determinants of health (SDH), which are not easy to rectify in a  
424 single patient encounter. Many of these issues that plague low-income communities will require  
425 more investment of financial and non-financial resources to address social determinants of  
426 health. Residents described their frustration with patients in the low-resources settings and the  
427 manner in which they failed to access health care “properly.” Residents’ erosion of empathy for  
428 underserved communities may be prevented if they had a deeper understanding of the people,  
429 their history, as well as the influence of structural and institutional policies that impact the  
430 surrounding environment. Other investigators highlight the importance of trainees developing  
431 structural competency (i.e., awareness of social and economic policies, and laws that influence  
432 the allocation of health care and community resources) in order to have a better understanding of

433 the external influences that shape the underserved or minority communities and their health  
434 outcomes.<sup>36,37</sup> Prior qualitative work of practicing physicians found that opportunities for self-  
435 reflection, positive role-modeling, and positive patient encounters were important in fostering  
436 empathy.<sup>38</sup> Residency programs can also look upon the safety-net experiences as an opportunity  
437 for innovation. For example, Caldwell et al. examined the acceptability of ED interventions to  
438 improve access to family planning services.<sup>39</sup> The challenges faced in safety-net hospitals could  
439 be an opportunity for residency programs to consider the value of developing career tracks that  
440 promote advocacy, and local engagement with the community to improve health care delivery  
441 and health outcomes.

442

### 443 **Limitations**

444

445 This qualitative study focuses on socially sensitive topics of disparities in access to care and  
446 health and socio-cultural identity. There was potentially an element of social desirability  
447 influencing participants responses as it may be disconcerting for them to acknowledge observing  
448 or participating in interactions that resulted in differences in care based on differences in  
449 identities. Our study data was gathered to provide context and rich insight into EM residents'  
450 experiences training at disparate settings. Two sites were in the Midwest, and one in the South,  
451 and may not represent experiences in other regions. Sample selection bias may have played a  
452 role, as participants more inclined to speak about diversity and health disparities may have been  
453 more likely to participate. Therefore, our data may not reflect the opinions or experiences of  
454 residents less comfortable with speaking about these issues. The majority of our respondents  
455 were interns, and they may have more frustrating experiences given their early stage in their  
456 training.

457

### 458 **Conclusions**

459

460 Emergency Medicine training is considered a core clerkship in many medical schools,<sup>40</sup> and a  
461 required rotation for many non-EM specialties. The ED training experience is expected to  
462 prepare trainees to deliver acute care, as well as introduce them to the complex challenge of  
463 serving a socially and economically diverse patient population. Our work has implications for

464 EM education, as well as provides valuable insight for other specialties whose training programs  
465 utilize diverse training sites. Participants provided a breadth of stories illuminating their real-  
466 world awareness and competency with meeting the needs of diverse populations and their access  
467 to varied educational outlets to grapple with the disparities they observed. Our study  
468 underscores that residency training can be a critical juncture to introduce necessary conversations  
469 related to socio-cultural diversity for residents and faculty. These academic and community  
470 hospital partnerships may be the only intimate exposure providers have to persons marginalized  
471 by race/ethnicity, poverty, sexual orientation, and housing instability. These resident stories  
472 provide much needed context to the challenges faced, and the need for educational tools for  
473 trainees and faculty. More research is needed to uncover effective strategies to help residents  
474 thrive and feel more prepared to care for diverse populations.

475

476

477

478

479

480

481

482

483

484

485

486

487

488

489

490

491

492

493

494

495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515

1. Cultural Competence Education. Association of American Medical Colleges 2005.
  
2. Betancourt JR. Cross-cultural Medical Education: Conceptual Approaches and Frameworks for Evaluation. Acad Med 2003;78:560-9.
  
3. Lie DA, Lee-Rey E, Gomez A, Bereknyei S, Braddock C. Does cultural competency training of health professionals improve patient outcomes? A systematic review and proposed algorithm for future research. J Gen Intern Med 2011;26:317-25.
  
4. Padela AI. Can you take care of my mother? Reflections on cultural competency and clinical accommodation. Acad Emerg Med 2007;14:275-7.
  
5. Hobgood C, Sawning S, Bowen J, Savage K. Teaching culturally appropriate care: a review of educational models and methods. Acad Emerg Med 2006;13:1288-95.
  
6. Krisberg K. Disparities, Cross-Cultural Education Slowly Gaining a Foothold During Residency. Special to AAMC News. Association of American Medical Colleges 2017.
  
7. Weissman JS, Betancourt J, Campbell EG, et al. Resident physicians' preparedness to provide cross-cultural care. JAMA 2005;294:1058-67.

- 516 8. Park ER, Betancourt JR, Miller E, et al. Internal medicine residents' perceptions of cross-  
517 cultural training. Barriers, needs, and educational recommendations. J Gen Intern Med  
518 2006;21:476-80.
- 519 9. Campbell A, Sullivan M, Sherman R, Magee W. The medical mission and modern cultural  
520 competency training. J Am Coll Surg 2011;212:124-9.
- 521 10. Emergency Medical Treatment & Labor Act (EMTALA). Centers for Medicare and  
522 Medicaid Services. (Accessed October 16, 2018, at [https://www.cms.gov/Regulations-and-  
523 Guidance/Legislation/EMTALA/.](https://www.cms.gov/Regulations-and-Guidance/Legislation/EMTALA/))
- 524 11. Young G, Wagner M, Kellermann A, Ellis J, Bouley D. Ambulatory visits to hospital  
525 emergency departments. Patterns and reasons for use. 24 Hours in the ED Study Group. JAMA  
526 1996 276:460-5.
- 527 12. O'Brien G, Stein M, Zierler S, Shapiro M, O'Sullivan P, Woolard R. Use of the ED as a  
528 regular source of care: associated factors beyond lack of health insurance. Ann Emerg Med  
529 1997;30:286-91.
- 530 13. Moll J, Krieger P, Moreno-Walton L, et al. The prevalence of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and  
531 transgender health education and training in emergency medicine residency programs: what do  
532 we know? Acad Emerg Med 2014;21.
- 533 14. Coyne IT. Sampling in qualitative research. Purposeful and theoretical sampling; merging  
534 or clear boundaries? J Adv Nurs 1997;26:623-30.
- 535 15. The Emergency Medicine Milestone Project. In: and TACfGME, Medicine TABoE, eds.  
536 Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education 2015.

- 537 16. Morse JM. "Data were saturated . . . ". Qual Health Res 2015;25:587-8.
- 538 17. Smith JA, Shinebourne P. Interpretative phenomenological analysis. Washington, DC,  
539 US: American Psychological Association; 2012.
- 540 18. Underrepresented in Medicine Definition. Association of American Medical Colleges.  
541 (Accessed October 11, 2016, at [https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/urm/.](https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/urm/))
- 542 19. Kahneman D. Thinking, Fast and Slow. New York. Farrar, Straus and Giroux; 2011.
- 543 20. Diversity in Medicine: Facts and Figures 2019 Executive Summary. Diversity and  
544 Inclusion. Association of American Medical Colleges 2019.
- 545 21. Lett LA, Murdock HM, Orji WU, Aysola J, Sebro R. Trends in Racial/Ethnic Representation  
546 Among US Medical Students. JAMA Netw Open 2019;2:e1910490-e.
- 547 22. Jolly P. Diversity of U.S. Medical Students by Parental Income. Association of American  
548 Medical Colleges 2008.
- 549 23. Grbic D. Diversity of U.S. Medical School Students by Parental Education. Association of  
550 American Medical Colleges 2010.
- 551 24. Table 13. Practice Specialty, Males by Race/Ethnicity, 2018. Association of American  
552 Medical Colleges: Association of American Medical Colleges; 2018.
- 553 25. Table 1.3. 2017. Active Physicians by Sex and Specialty, 2017. Association of American  
554 Medical Colleges: Association of American Medical Colleges; 2017.

- 555 26. Phelan SM, Burke S, Cunningham B, et al. The Effects of Racism in Medical Education on  
556 Students' Decisions to Practice in Underserved or Minority Communities. Acad Med  
557 2019;94:1178-89.
- 558 27. Sukhera J, Wodzinski M, Pim W, Teunissen P, Lingard L, Watling C. Striving While  
559 Accepting: Exploring the Relationship Between Identity and Implicit Bias Recognition and  
560 Management. Acad Med 2018.
- 561 28. Perdomo J, Tolliver D, Hsu H, et al. Health Equity Rounds: An Interdisciplinary Case  
562 Conference to Address Implicit Bias and Structural Racism for Faculty and Trainees.  
563 MedEdPORTAL.
- 564 29. Brooks Katherine C, Rougas S, George P. When Race Matters on the Wards: Talking  
565 About Racial Health Disparities and Racism in the Clinical Setting. MedEdPORTAL 2016;12.
- 566 30. Schmidt S, Higgins S, George M, Stone A, Bussey-Jones J, Dillard R. An Experiential  
567 Resident Module for Understanding Social Determinants of Health at an Academic Safety-Net  
568 Hospital. MedEdPORTAL;13.
- 569 31. Boatright D, Branzetti J, Duong D, et al. Racial and Ethnic Diversity in Academic  
570 Emergency Medicine: How Far Have We Come? Next Steps for the Future. AEM Education and  
571 Training 2018;2:S31-S9.
- 572 32. Burkhardt J, DesJardins S, Gruppen L. Diversity in Emergency Medicine: Are We  
573 Supporting a Career Interest in Emergency Medicine for Everyone? Ann Emerg Med  
574 2019;74:742-50.
- 575 33. An Updated Look at the Economic Diversity of U.S. Medical Students. Association of  
576 American Medical Colleges 2018.

- 577 34. Page SE. *The Difference: How the Power of Diversity Creates Better Groups, Firms,*  
578 *Schools, and Societies*: Princeton University Press; 2007.
- 579 35. Saha S, Guiton G, Wimmers PF, Wilkerson L. Student Body Racial and Ethnic  
580 Composition and Diversity-Related Outcomes in US Medical Schools. *JAMA* 2008;300:1135-45.
- 581 36. Neff J, Holmes Seth M, Knight Kelly R, et al. Structural Competency: Curriculum for  
582 Medical Students, Residents, and Interprofessional Teams on the Structural Factors That  
583 Produce Health Disparities. *MedEdPORTAL* 2020;16.
- 584 37. Salhi BA, Tsai JW, Druck J, Ward-Gaines J, White MH, Lopez BL. Toward Structural  
585 Competency in Emergency Medical Education. *AEM Education and Training* 2020;4:S88-S97.
- 586 38. Ahrweiler F, Neumann M, Goldblatt H, Hahn EG, Scheffer C. Determinants of physician  
587 empathy during medical education: hypothetical conclusions from an exploratory qualitative  
588 survey of practicing physicians. *BMC Med Ed* 2014;14:122.
- 589 39. Caldwell MT, Hambrick N, Vallee P, et al. "They're Doing Their Job": Women's  
590 Acceptance of Emergency Department Contraception Counseling. LID - S0196-0644(19)31316-2  
591 [pii] LID - 10.1016/j.annemergmed.2019.10.014 [doi]. *Ann Emerg Med* 2020.
- 592 40. Percentage of Medical Schools with Separate Required Clerkships by Discipline and  
593 Academic Year. *Curriculum Reports*. Association of American Medical Colleges 2018-2019.  
594

**Table 1. Participant Characteristics**

<b>Demographics</b>	<b>Respondents</b> N=24 (%)	
<b>Residency Program</b>		
<b>Site 1<sup>a</sup></b>	N=10 (41.7%)	
<b>Site 2<sup>b</sup></b>	N=8 (33.3%)	
<b>Site 3<sup>c</sup></b>	N=6 (25.0%)	
<b>PGY-Level</b>		
<b>PGY-1</b>	N= 10 (41.7%)	
<b>PGY-2</b>	N=6 (25.0%)	
<b>PGY-3</b>	N=4 (16.7%)	
<b>PGY-4</b>	N=4 (16.7%)	
<b>Gender</b>		
<b>Female</b>	N=10 (41.7%)	
<b>Male</b>	N=14 (58.3%)	
<b>URIM status<sup>d</sup></b>		
<b>Non-URIM</b>	N=20 (83.3%)	
<b>URIM</b>	N=4 (16.7%)	

<sup>a</sup>. Training sites include an academic medical center, suburban community-based teaching hospital and an inner-city safety-net hospital per program website.

<sup>b</sup>. Training sites include an academic medical center, community-based teaching hospital and an inner-city safety-net hospital per program website.

<sup>c</sup>. Training sites include an academic medical center and safety-net hospital, inner-city community based-teaching hospital, and suburban community-based teaching hospital.

<sup>d</sup>Underrepresented in medicine (URiM) status defined by Association for American Medical Colleges (AAMC) as persons from racial and ethnic backgrounds underrepresented in medicine relative their numbers in the general population.

**Table 2.** Themes of EM Residents’ Experiences with Additional Illustrative Quotes

Themes and Subthemes	Illustrative Quotes
1.Trainees perceived that challenging clinical encounters were attributed to patient factors	
Perceived difference in values	<p>“The mom’s like, “We don’t have insurance, and we haven’t had money to fill out the prescription.” This prescription is like, \$5.00, really cheap generic medication. Then, in the meantime, the mom had a new iPhone and her nails are done and her hair is nicely weaved. That made me feel, I guess, a little frustrated at the situation. I just don’t think we have the same values in what’s important. I don’t know.” -10026, Site 2</p>
Patient behaviors	<p>“There was probably frustration from both ends. I think he was frustrated because he has a very chronic, irreversible problem with his kidney failure. He’s probably frustrated because it requires treatment every few days, and he has a tough time physically getting to the treatment, with an access to transportation issue. Then, subsequently, I think members of the team in the ED become frustrated when he shows up with a much more life-threatening, acute problem, where his hyperkalemia and his electrolyte problems could potentially be fatal if they’re not addressed quickly enough. I think there’s frustration from the treatment team of it seeming like he is neglecting his health care, when there might be an element to that, but there’s certainly an element of access to care issues as well.” - 10015, Site 1</p>
2.Lack of competency in building rapport with diverse patients affected clinical care	
Impact on care	<p>I've had homeless patients who have come into the emergency department,...everybody has a certain level of frustration with those patients, and I understand that, but there's just zero desire to spend time in the room on nursing staff, to talk with them, to see if anything else is going on. Not a whole lot of sympathy....A lot of frustration. A lot of "[physician] take care of this. Do you really want this lab test? Do I really</p>

	<p>need to get blood? Do I really have to take care of them? Do I really have to do this?" That's another undomiciled middle-aged African American male that's getting treated that way, but a drunk white freshman comes in, and everybody thinks it's funny, and they're smiling, and talking to him, and going in and making sure he has everything he needs, which there's really no difference in the resources that both require so—or workup or approach or anything else. There's really no difference, but the drunk white college freshman always gets a lot more leeway. -10017, Site 1</p>
<p>Differences in language</p>	<p> Oftentimes people just get frustrated and go in with their broken Spanish and try to make do, which I don't think is 100 percent a bad thing. I think that if there is gonna be a delay in getting the interpreter or if it's gonna disrupt the flow of the room and you've got a bunch of sick patients, I don't think it's wrong to try to speed things up. It's definitely not as good as being fluent in the language that the patient is speaking and being able to explain things to them and ask them specific questions and whatnot.”- 10022, Site 3</p>
<p>3. Training influences clinical preparation and willingness to work in underserved areas</p>	
<p>Impact of varied training sites</p>	<p>“I would say that I generally feel like exposures and experiences with different cultures and more diverse patients is pretty important. I noticed that after spending time working at [these] sites I noticed that I feel like I can connect better culturally, linguistically with patients who are at the different sites. For example, I felt like when I started working at [low-resource hospital] or also when I was interacting with patients who come from a different racial—especially a different racial background than I did at the [academic center] or at [the community hospital] often they would use language or slang that I wouldn’t understand.” -10011, Site 1</p>

<p>Skills used to communicate with vulnerable populations</p>	<p>“If you're transparent with everyone about why you're doing what you're doing—and this can be even as simple as just saying, "I notice you're here for your belly pain. I know you're worried about it. We're gonna get some labs, and if this does that, then we're gonna do this." It seems like a small thing, but not a lot of people do that. A lot of people go into a room, examine a patient, walk out, and then someone's in there getting blood, and they're wheelin' 'em off to CT, and people don't really know what's goin' on.” -10020, Site 3</p>
<p>Broadening perspective on other cultures</p>	<p>“A lot of times I think the hesitation is to ask a question about something that you're unclear about because it would display your ignorance. I think the opposite is actually true. Where a lot of times, patients are actually open to the fact that their culture is not what is customarily seen every day. They are actually happy to educate you about their preferences, their beliefs, why they do what they do.” -10027, Site 2</p>