

Correspondence

Reply to Correspondence From Inzelberg et al.—“Onset age of Parkinson disease”

To the Editor:

The association between Parkinson disease (PD) and apolipoprotein E (APOE) gene has been the subject of several studies. We first reported the observation that $\epsilon 4$ carriers had on average four years earlier age at onset than those without $\epsilon 4$ [Zarepari et al., 1997]. We had estimated that a minimum sample of 400 patients was needed to detect earlier age at onset of PD in $\epsilon 4$ carriers. In a study of 521 unrelated Caucasian PD patients, we found that $\epsilon 3\epsilon 4/\epsilon 4\epsilon 4$ patients had significantly earlier onset than $\epsilon 3\epsilon 3$ patients [Zarepari et al., 2002]. Inzelberg et al. [2002] have combined the samples from different studies and report that they do not detect a significant difference in onset among $\epsilon 4$ carriers and those without $\epsilon 4$.

One possible explanation is that the strength of the association between APOE and onset of PD may differ between samples collected at different sites. In our study, the difference in onset between $\epsilon 3\epsilon 4/\epsilon 4\epsilon 4$ versus $\epsilon 3\epsilon 3$ ranged from 2.2 to 8.5 years among patient samples collected in Oregon and Washington, respectively [Zarepari et al., 2002]. Furthermore, the two samples displayed different trends for effect of $\epsilon 2$ on PD onset [Zarepari et al., 2002]. Thus, it may not be suitable to combine samples from different centers without performing tests of heterogeneity. In fact, in two of the studies, $\epsilon 4$ carriers had slightly earlier onset [Inzelberg et al., 1998; Oliveri et al., 1999]. In addition, the combined sample is based on samples from different ethnic backgrounds. It is possible that the effect of APOE on PD onset differs between ethnic groups as mentioned by Inzelberg et al.

Inzelberg et al. [2002] confirm our finding of earlier onset in patients with positive family history. They further suggest that earlier onset in $\epsilon 4$ carriers may be due to family history and patients with *parkin* mutations. It should be noted that the earlier onset in $\epsilon 3\epsilon 4/$

$\epsilon 4\epsilon 4$ patients was significant even after adjusting for the effect of family history on onset of PD. We agree that *parkin* mutations are reported in patients with an age at onset of greater than 30 years [Lucking et al., 2000]. Our recent studies indicate that five of our subjects had *parkin* mutations. Two were excluded from analysis because their age at onset was less than 30 years. For the remaining three, the APOE genotype, family history, and age at onset were as follows: 1) non-familial, $\epsilon 2\epsilon 3$, onset 37 years; 2) non-familial, $\epsilon 3\epsilon 3$, onset 39 years; and 3) familial, $\epsilon 3\epsilon 3$, onset 37 years. Thus, contrary to Inzelberg et al.'s [2002] suggestion, our findings could not have been due to the inadvertent inclusion of *parkin* mutation carriers. Exclusion of *parkin* mutation carriers strengthens our data in favor of earlier onset in $\epsilon 3\epsilon 4/\epsilon 4\epsilon 4$ versus $\epsilon 3\epsilon 3$, and in familial versus non-familial PD.

REFERENCES

- Inzelberg R, Paleacu D, Chapman J, Korczyn AD. 1998. Apolipoprotein E and Parkinson's disease. *Ann Neurol* 44:294.
- Inzelberg R, Schechtman E, Paleacu D. 2002. Onset age of Parkinson disease. *Am J Med Genet*.
- Lucking C, Durr A, Bonifati V, Vaughan J, De Michele G, Gasser T, Harhangi B, Meco G, Deneffe P, Wood N, Agid E, Brice A. 2000. Association between early-onset Parkinson's disease and mutations in the *parkin* gene. *N Engl J Med* 342:1560–1567.
- Oliveri RL, Nicoletti G, Cittadella R, Manna I, Branca D, Zappia M, Gambardella A, Caracciolo M, Quattrone A. 1999. Apolipoprotein E polymorphisms and Parkinson's disease. *Neurosci Lett* 277:83–86.
- Zarepari S, Kaye J, Camicioli R, Grimsliid H, Oken B, Litt M, Nutt J, Bird T, Schellenberg G, Payami H. 1997. Modulation of the age at onset of Parkinson's disease by Apolipoprotein E genotypes. *Ann Neurol* 42:655–658.
- Zarepari S, Camicioli R, Sexton G, Bird T, Swanson P, Kaye J, Nutt J, Payami H. 2002. Age at onset of Parkinson disease and Apolipoprotein E genotypes. *Am J Med Genet* 107:156–161.

Sepideh Zarepari*

Department of Ophthalmology and
Visual Sciences
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, Michigan

Haydeh Payami

Department of Neurology
Oregon Health Sciences University
Portland, Oregon

*Correspondence to: Sepideh Zarepari, Ph.D., Department of Ophthalmology and Visual Sciences, University of Michigan, 1000 Wall St., Room 510, Ann Arbor, MI 48105.
E-mail: zarepars@umich.edu

Received 12 April 2002; Accepted 15 April 2002
DOI 10.1002/ajmg.10581