

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN  
COLLEGE OF LITERATURE, SCIENCE, AND THE ARTS  
Department of Mathematics

Technical Note

RESTRICTED CLUSTER SETS

Paul Erdős  
George Piranian

UMRI Project 2913

under contract with:

MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES DIRECTORATE  
AIR FORCE OFFICE OF SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH  
CONTRACT NO. AF 49(638)-633  
WASHINGTON 25, D. C.

administered by:

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN RESEARCH INSTITUTE ANN ARBOR

January 1960

Engr

UMR

1369

## ABSTRACT

Collingwood has shown that if a function  $f$  is continuous in the upper half-plane, then the real axis contains a residual set at each of whose points each Stolz cluster set of  $f$  coincides with the complete cluster set of  $f$ . The present paper shows that the hypothesis of continuity can be dropped from Collingwood's theorem. The paper also describes a function whose segmental cluster sets exhibit a large measure of independence.

## RESTRICTED CLUSTER SETS

Let  $f$  be a complex-valued function defined in the upper half-plane  $H$ . The cluster set  $C(f,x)$  at a point  $x$  on the real axis is defined as the set of all values  $w$  (including possibly  $w = \infty$ ) for which there exists a sequence  $\{z_n\} = \{x_n + i y_n\}$  such that  $x_n \rightarrow x$ ,  $y_n \searrow 0$ , and  $f(z_n) \rightarrow w$ . We use the term restricted cluster set generically: the word "restricted" indicates either that the sequence  $\{z_n\}$  occurring in the definition above is subject to special conditions (for example, that it lie on a line segment), or that the cluster set  $C(f,x,*)$  is defined in terms of unions or intersections of certain "primitive" cluster sets.

### AN EXTENSION OF A THEOREM OF COLLINGWOOD

By a Stolz angle at the origin we mean a triangular domain with one vertex at the origin and the other two vertices on a common horizontal line in  $H$ . Corresponding to each Stolz angle  $\Delta$  at the origin and each real number  $x$ , we denote by  $\Delta_x$  the image of  $\Delta$  under the translation that carries the origin to the point  $x$ . By  $C(f,x,\Delta)$  we denote the set of values  $w$  for which there exists a sequence  $\{z_n\}$  in  $\Delta_x$  such that  $z_n \rightarrow x$  and  $f(z_n) \rightarrow w$ . For each function  $f$  and each real number  $x$ , we use the symbol  $C(f,x,\delta)$  for the intersection of all sets  $C(f,x,\Delta)$ .

Collingwood [2, Theorem 2] has proved that if  $f$  is continuous in  $H$ , then  $C(f,x,\delta) = C(f,x)$ , except for a set of values  $x$  which is of first category. (The proposition is actually announced for meromorphic functions; but the proof uses only continuity.) We shall now show that the hypothesis of continuity can be dropped from Collingwood's theorem.

THEOREM 1. If  $f$  is a complex-valued function in  $H$ , there exists a residual set of values  $x$  for which  $C(f,x,\delta) = C(f,x)$ .

(After this report had been approved, we learned that on December 10, 1958, E. F. Collingwood had given a proof of Theorem 1, in W. Hayman's seminar.)

For the sake of notational convenience, we assume, throughout the proof, that  $f$  is bounded; the proof becomes valid for the general case provided the metric of the plane is replaced by the metric of the Riemann sphere.

Let  $\epsilon > 0$ ; let  $w_0$  denote a fixed complex number, and  $\Delta$  a fixed Stolz angle at the origin. We denote by  $E(f,\Delta,w_0,\epsilon)$  the set of values  $x$  for which the disk  $|w-w_0| < \epsilon$  meets the set  $C(f,x)$  while the closed disk  $|w-w_0| \leq \epsilon$  does not meet the set  $C(f,x,\Delta)$ .

LEMMA.  $E(f, \Delta, w_0, \epsilon)$  is of first category.

Suppose that the lemma is false. Then there exists a positive number  $h$  and a subset  $E_h$  of  $E(f, \Delta, w_0, \epsilon)$  which is dense in some interval  $I$  and satisfies the following condition: if  $x \in E_h$ ,  $z \in \Delta_x$ , and  $\text{Im } z < h$ , then  $|f(z) - w_0| > \epsilon$ . Since the union of the domains  $\Delta_x$  ( $x \in E_h$ ) is a trapezoid with the base  $I$ , the disk  $|w - w_0| < \epsilon$  cannot meet the set  $C(f, x)$ . This in turn implies that  $E(f, \Delta, w_0, \epsilon)$  does not meet the interior of the interval  $I$ , and therefore the lemma is true.

Let  $\{w_n\}$  be a set of  $N$  numbers such that for each  $z$  in  $H$  the distance between  $f(z)$  and the set  $\{w_n\}$  is less than  $\epsilon/2$ . By the lemma, the union of the  $N$  sets  $E(f, \Delta, w_n, \epsilon)$  is of first category. This implies that the set of points  $x$  for which  $C(f, x)$  contains a point at a distance greater than  $2\epsilon$  from  $C(f, x, \Delta)$  is of first category.

Next we assign to  $\epsilon$  successively the values  $1, 1/2, 1/4, \dots$ , and we see that  $C(f, x, \Delta) = C(f, x)$ , except on a residual set. Finally, we can select a sequence  $\{\Delta^{(m)}\}$  of Stolz angles at the origin such that each Stolz angle at the origin contains one of the  $\Delta^{(m)}$ , and the proof of the theorem is complete.

Let  $\lambda$  denote a Jordan arc which lies in  $H$  except for one endpoint at the origin; let  $\lambda_x$  denote the image of  $\lambda$  under the translation that carries the origin to  $x$ ; and let  $C(f, x, \lambda)$  denote the cluster set of  $f$  at  $x$  along  $\lambda_x$ . Collingwood [2, Theorem 1] proved that if  $f$  is continuous in  $H$ , then  $C(f, x, \lambda) = C(f, x)$  for all  $x$  in some residual set. We point out that this result can be obtained by a slight modification of our proof: since  $f$  is uniformly continuous, in each compact subset of  $H$ , there exists a domain  $\Delta^*$  that contains all points of  $\lambda$  except the origin, and such that, with obvious notation,  $C(f, x, \Delta^*) = C(f, x, \lambda)$  for each  $x$  (in cases where the continuity of  $f$  deteriorates rapidly near the  $x$ -axis, the domain  $\Delta^*$  is very narrow near the origin). If the role of the fixed Stolz angle  $\Delta$  chosen at the beginning of the proof of Theorem 1 is assigned to  $\Delta^*$ , the proof can be carried out as before.

Our next result shows that in the conclusion of Theorem 1, no assertion concerning the exceptional set can be made, except that it is of first category. Notation:  $C(f, x, S)$  is the union of all sets  $C(f, x, \Delta)$ .

THEOREM 2. If  $E$  is a set of first category on the real axis, there exists a function  $f$  in  $H$  such that  $C(f, x, S) = \{\emptyset\}$  for each point  $x$  in  $E$ , while  $C(f, x)$  is the extended plane, for each real  $x$ .

If  $E$  is of first category, it is contained in the union of disjoint closed sets  $F_j$ , each nowhere dense [3]. Let  $\Delta_1$  denote a triangular region, symmetric with respect to the  $y$ -axis, and with an angle  $\pi-1$  at the origin; and let

$$D_1 = \bigcup_{x \in F_1} \Delta_{1,x}$$

When  $D_1, D_2, \dots, D_{n-1}$  have been defined, we choose a triangular region  $\Delta_n$ , symmetric with respect to the  $y$ -axis, and with an angle  $\pi/n$  at the origin. Clearly, if  $\Delta_n$  is small enough, then the set

$$D_n = \bigcup_{x \in F_n} \Delta_{n,x}$$

meets none of the sets  $D_1, D_2, \dots, D_{n-1}$ . If  $f(z) = 0$  in each of the sets  $D_n$ , then  $C(f,x,S) = \{0\}$  for each  $x$  in  $E$ . Since the complement of the union of the sets  $D_n$  meets every neighborhood of each real point  $x$ , the function  $f$  can be defined so that  $C(f,x)$  is the extended plane, for each real  $x$ . We point out further that in Collingwood's theorem on cluster sets along families of congruent Jordan arcs, the hypothesis of continuity cannot be omitted. Indeed, let  $\{z_n\}$  be a sequence in  $H$  which does not contain any three collinear points but has each point of the real axis as a limit point. If  $f(z) = 0$  when  $z \notin \{z_n\}$ , and if the sequence  $\{f(z_n)\}$  is appropriately chosen, then every "segmental" cluster set consists of the origin, while each of the sets  $C(f,x)$  consists of the extended plane.

## 2. INTERSECTIONS OF SEGMENTAL CLUSTER SETS

Corresponding to each line segment  $L$  lying in  $H$  and terminating at  $x$ , let  $C(f,x,L)$  denote the set of values  $w$  for which there exists a sequence  $\{z_n\}$  such that  $z_n \in L$ ,  $z_n \rightarrow x$ , and  $f(z_n) \rightarrow w$ . There exists a function  $f$  in  $H$  with the property that each real point  $x$  is the endpoint of three segments  $L_j$  such that the set

$$\bigcap_{j=1,2,3} C(f,x,L_j)$$

is empty [1]. We shall extend this result.

THEOREM 3. There exists a function  $f$  in  $H$  such that each point  $x$  on the real axis is the common endpoint of a family  $\{L\}_x$  of rectilinear segments in  $H$  with the following properties;

(i)  $\{L\}_x$  contains  $2^{\aleph_0}$  elements, and the set of their directions is a set of second category;

(ii) the intersection of the cluster sets of  $f$  on any three segments in  $\{L\}_x$  is empty.

To prove this theorem, we shall first construct the families  $\{L\}_x$  in such a way that no point of  $H$  lies on three of the line segments; the construction of the function  $f$  will then be trivial.

Let  $\{L_\alpha\}$  ( $0 < \alpha < \Omega_c$ ; here  $\Omega_c$  denotes the first ordinal of cardinality  $2^{\aleph_0}$ ) be a transfinite sequence of the nonhorizontal lines in the  $z$ -plane; let

$\{M_\alpha\}$  ( $0 < \alpha < \Omega_c$ ) be a transfinite sequence of the point sets of type  $F_\sigma$  and of first category in the interval  $(0, \pi)$ ; and let  $\{x_\alpha\}$  ( $0 < \alpha < \Omega_c$ ) be a transfinite sequence (of real numbers) in which each real number occurs  $2^{\aleph_0}$  times.

Corresponding to the ordinal  $\beta = 1$ , we choose the first line in  $\{L_\alpha\}$  that passes through the point  $x_1$  and whose angle with the positive real axis does not lie in the set  $M_1$ ; and we denote it by  $L^1$ . Suppose that  $L^\beta$  has been chosen for all  $\beta$  in  $0 < \beta < \gamma$ . From  $\{L^\beta\}$  ( $0 < \beta < \gamma$ ) we extract the transfinite subsequence of lines that pass through the point  $x_\gamma$ , and we denote by  $\delta - 1$  the order-type of this subsequence. From  $\{L_\alpha\}$  we select as  $L^\gamma$  the first line that passes through  $x_\gamma$ , does not occur in the set  $\{L^\beta\}$  ( $0 < \beta < \gamma$ ), does not pass through the point of intersection of any two lines  $L_\beta$  and  $L_{\beta'}$  ( $0 < \beta < \beta' < \gamma$ ), and whose angle with the positive real axis does not lie in  $M_\delta$ . The selection is always possible, since the complement of  $M_\delta$  contains  $2^{\aleph_0}$  elements. We see at once that for each real  $x$ , the set of lines  $L^\beta$  through the point  $x$  has the power  $2^{\aleph_0}$ . Also, since the set of angles that these lines make with the real axis is not contained in any set of first category, it is of second category.

If  $z$  lies on none of the lines  $L^\alpha$  ( $0 < \alpha < \Omega_c$ ), let  $f(z) = 0$ . To define the function  $f$  on the lines  $L^\alpha$ , we establish a one-to-one correspondence between the family of lines  $L^\alpha$  and the set of lines in the  $w$ -plane that have positive slope and are tangent from above to the circle  $|w| = 1$ . Then, if  $z$  lies on two lines  $L^\alpha$  and  $L^\beta$ , we define  $f(z)$  as the value  $w$  that lies on the two corresponding lines in the  $w$ -plane; if  $z$  lies on precisely one of the lines  $L^\alpha$ , we define  $f(z)$  as the coordinate of the real point that lies on the corresponding line in the  $w$ -plane.

If  $L$  is a line through  $x$ , and if  $L \in \{L^\alpha\}$ , then the cluster set  $C(f, x, L)$  lies on the corresponding line in the  $w$ -plane. Since no point  $w$  lies on three lines tangent to the unit circle, no three of the segmental cluster sets  $C(f, x, L^\alpha)$  have a common point, and Theorem 3 is proved.

It remains an open question whether the families  $\{L\}_x$  can be chosen so that, for each  $x$ , the family  $\{L\}_x$  contains all nonhorizontal lines through  $x$ , or at least a residual set of lines through  $x$ .

#### REFERENCES

1. F. Bagemihl, G. Piranian, and G. S. Young, Intersections of cluster sets, Bull. Inst. Polytech. Jassy (to appear).
2. E. F. Collingwood, Sur le comportement à la frontière, d'une fonction méromorphe dans le cercle unite, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris 240 (1955), 1502-1504.
3. W. Sierpiński, Sur une classification des ensembles mesurables (B), Fund. Math. 10 (1927), 320-327.



DISTRIBUTION LIST

(One copy unless otherwise noted)

Director  
Air University Library  
Maxwell Air Force Base, Alabama  
Attn: AUL 9663

Commander  
Army Rocket and Guided Missile  
Agency  
Redstone Arsenal, Alabama  
Attn: ORDXR-OTL

Commander (3 copies)  
European Office, ARDC  
47 Rue Cantersteen  
Brussels, Belgium

Applied Mathematics and Statistics  
Laboratory  
Stanford University  
Stanford, California

Commander  
Fifteenth Air Force  
March Air Force Base, California  
Attn: Operations Analysis Office

Department of Mathematics  
University of California  
Berkeley, California

Assistant CINCSAC  
(SAC MIKE)  
Air Force Unit Post Office  
Los Angeles 45, California

Commander  
Air Force Flight Test Center  
Edwards Air Force Base, California  
Attn: Technical Library

The RAND Corporation  
Technical Library  
1700 Main Street  
Santa Monica, California

Commander, 1st Missile Division  
Cooke Air Force Base  
Lompoc, California  
Attn: Operations Analysis Office

Commander  
Air Force Ballistic Missile Division  
Air Force Unit Post Office  
Los Angeles 45, California  
Attn: WDSOT

Department of Mathematics  
Yale University  
New Haven, Connecticut

Office of Naval Research (2 copies)  
Department of the Navy  
Washington 25, D. C.  
Attn: Code 432

Director  
Department of Commerce  
Office of Technical Services  
Washington 25, D. C.

Director  
National Security Agency  
Washington 25, D. C.  
Attn: Dr. H. H. Campaigne

Administrator  
National Aeronautics and Space Adminis-  
tration  
1520 H Street, N. W.  
Washington 25, D. C.  
Attn: Documents Library

Library  
National Bureau of Standards  
Washington 25, D. C.

Applied Mathematics Division  
National Bureau of Standards  
Washington 25, D. C.

DISTRIBUTION LIST (Continued)

Headquarters, USAF  
Assistant for Operations Analysis  
Deputy Chief of Staff, Operations,  
AFOOA  
Washington 25, D. C.

Commander (2 copies)  
Air Force Office of Scientific  
Research  
Washington 25, D. C.  
Attn: SRM

Director  
U. S. Naval Research Laboratory  
Washington 25, D. C.  
Attn: Library

Commander (2 copies)  
Air Force Office of Scientific  
Research  
Washington 25, D. C.  
Attn: Technical Library, SRLT

National Science Foundation  
Program Director for Mathematical  
Sciences  
Washington 25, D. C.

Canadian Joint Staff  
2450 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D. C.  
Attn: DRB/DSIS

Commander  
Proving Ground  
Eglin Air Force Base, Florida  
Attn: Technical Library

Commander  
Air Force Missile Test Center  
Patrick Air Force Base, Florida  
Attn: Technical Library

Department of Mathematics  
Northwestern University  
Evanston, Illinois

Institute for Air Weapons Research  
Museum of Science and Industry  
University of Chicago  
Chicago 37, Illinois

Department of Mathematics  
University of Chicago  
Chicago 37, Illinois

Department of Mathematics  
University of Illinois  
Urbana, Illinois

Department of Mathematics  
Purdue University  
Lafayette, Indiana

Commander  
Second Air Force  
Barksdale Air Force Base, Louisiana  
Attn: Operations Analysis Office

Institute for Fluid Dynamics and Applied  
Mathematics  
University of Maryland  
College Park, Maryland

Mathematics and Physics Library  
The Johns Hopkins University  
Baltimore, Maryland

Department of Mathematics  
Harvard University  
Cambridge 38, Massachusetts

Commander, Eighth Air Force  
Westover Air Force Base, Massachusetts  
Attn: Operations Analysis Office

Department of Mathematics  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Cambridge 38, Massachusetts

Commander, AFCRC  
L. G. Hanscom Field  
Bedford, Massachusetts  
Attn: Technical Library, CROT

DISTRIBUTION LIST (Continued)

Department of Mathematics  
Wayne State University  
Detroit 1, Michigan

Commander  
Air Force Missile Development Center  
Holloman Air Force Base, New Mexico  
Attn: Technical Library, HDOI

Department of Mathematics  
Folwell Hall  
University of Minnesota  
Minneapolis, Minnesota

Commander  
Air Force Special Weapons Center  
Kirtland Air Force Base  
Albuquerque, New Mexico  
Attn: Technical Library, SWOI

Department of Mathematics  
Institute of Technology  
Engineering Building  
University of Minnesota  
Minneapolis, Minnesota

Professor J. Wolfowitz  
Mathematics Department  
White Hall  
Cornell University  
Ithaca, New York

Department of Mathematics  
Washington University  
St. Louis 8, Missouri

Department of Mathematics  
Syracuse University  
Syracuse, New York

Department of Mathematics  
University of Missouri  
Columbia, Missouri

Mathematics Research Group  
New York University  
25 Waverly Place  
New York, New York  
Attn: Professor M. Kline

Commander  
Strategic Air Command  
Offutt Air Force Base  
Omaha, Nebraska  
Attn: Operations Analysis

Commander  
Rome Air Development Center  
Griffiss Air Force Base  
Rome, New York  
Attn: Technical Library, RCSSLD

The James Forrestal Research Center  
Library  
Princeton University  
Princeton, New Jersey

Institute for Aeronautical Sciences  
2 East 64th Street  
New York 21, New York  
Attn: Librarian

Library  
Institute for Advanced Study  
Princeton, New Jersey

Department of Mathematics  
Fine Hall  
Princeton University  
Princeton, New Jersey

Department of Mathematics  
University of North Carolina  
Chapel Hill, North Carolina

Commander General  
Signal Corps Engineering Laboratory  
Ft. Monmouth, New Jersey  
Attn: SIGFM/EL-RPO

Department of Statistics  
University of North Carolina  
Chapel Hill, North Carolina

DISTRIBUTION LIST (Concluded)

Office of Ordnance Research (2 copies) Department of Mathematics  
Box CM, Duke Station Carnegie Institute of Technology  
Durham, North Carolina Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Department of Mathematics  
Duke University  
Duke Station  
Durham, North Carolina

Department of Mathematics  
University of Pennsylvania  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

Commander  
Air Technical Intelligence Center  
P. O. Box AA  
Wright-Patterson Air Force Base,  
Ohio

Arnold Engineering Development Center  
ARO, Inc.  
P. O. Box 162  
Tullahoma, Tennessee  
Attn: Technical Library, AEOI

Commander  
Wright Air Development Center  
Wright-Patterson Air Force Base,  
Ohio  
Attn: WCOSI

Applied Mechanics Reviews (2 copies)  
Southwest Research Institute  
8500 Culebra Road  
San Antonio 6, Texas  
Attn: Executive Editor

Commander  
Wright Air Development Center  
Wright-Patterson Air Force Base,  
Ohio  
Attn: WCOSR

Department of Mathematics  
Rice Institute  
Houston, Texas

Commander (2 copies)  
Wright Air Development Center  
Wright-Patterson Air Force Base,  
Ohio  
Attn: ARL Technical Library, WCRR

Armed Services Technical Information  
Agency (10 copies)  
Arlington Hall Station  
Arlington 12, Virginia  
Attn: TIPDR

Commandant (2 copies)  
USAF Institute of Technology  
Wright-Patterson Air Force Base,  
Ohio  
Attn: Technical Library, MCLI

Department of Mathematics  
University of Wisconsin  
Madison, Wisconsin

Mathematics Research Center, U. S. Army  
University of Wisconsin  
Madison, Wisconsin  
Attn: R. E. Langer

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN



3 9015 02826 7790