"Cracking the Code: Allegory and Political Mobilization in the Greek Resistance"

Janet Hart

CSST Working Paper #65

CRSO Working Paper #455

June 1991

Cracking the Code: Allegory and Political Mobilization in the Greek Resistance

Janet Hart

Department of Sociology

The University of Michigan

Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109

I would like to thank George Steinmetz for inspiring me to incorporate a narrative dimension into my work; Bill Sewell and Charles Ragin for their comments on an earlier draft; Ron Aminzade and M.J. Maynes for their editorial advice; Michael Hickok for apprising me of the Dedijer diaries; Barry Strauss for discussing Herodotous and Thucydides with me; Nelson Moe for several conversations about Gramsci and Boccaccio; Charles Stewart and Karen Van Dyck for bibliographic and other insightful suggestions; Lena Katsika for helping me to work out certain ethnographic details; and the resistance organization EAM as a character in my own allegory.

Introduction

If the ship had not been wrecked, Odysseus might have remained on the island and become, you might say, the sort of yogi who, on achieving full enlightenment, remains there in bliss and never returns. But the Greek idea of making the values known and enacted in life brings him back.

She reworked the stories, without reliance on the chronological sequence of events, into a collection of significant objects of reflection and understanding—a collage, a mobile. She told how Thales fell into a well while star-gazing, to the amusement of a Thracian peasant girl, and this story became the story of the dangers of unworldliness. And, rather than condemning the Thracian girl, as Hegel did, Hannah Arendt admired her common sense. But she also told how Thales the astronomer predicted a good year for olives and bought up all the olive presses to rent out at a profit, and this story became the story of the possibility of relating star-gazing and shrewdness, of the far reaches of common sense. 2

When the theme of the greatness of its subject, announced at the beginning of the work, is reintroduced at the end of chapter 21, the unpretentious prose style slips away and the third person narrator of the opening sentence yields to a new speaker, the war itself: "This war will nevertheless make clear to those who examine the actions themselves that it was greater than all that went before."...The following chapter, although claiming neither divine inspiration nor complete exactitude in the reconstruction of the past, affirms that the work will have a utility for all who wish to know about the past and the recurrence of approximately similar situations in the future.

That narrative can be more than a mechanical recitation of events is epitomized in Thucydides' challenge to historiographical paradigms current during the 5th century B.C.. definitive history of the war between Athens and Sparta, the Athenian general in effect tells a "story" with a beginning, middle and end. Thucydides history of the Peloponnesian War is anything but a neutral description of events. Instead, the collection interprets the conflict for the reader. The tale contains a discussion of the role of alternative military strategies and of the wider political implications of the war. In addition, Thucydides' account embodies a moral imperative summarized in the words of the Athenian speakers at the first Conference at Sparta: "recognize before you enter into it, how much there is in war that cannot be predicted." According to

Thucydides, the fractionization and polarization engendered by war as a mode of resolving political conflicts is too high a price for victors and losers alike to pay. Thucydides warned of psychic as well as material costs. Thus the ancient political scientist tells the story of the Peloponnesian War so as to assert that the "sequences of real events be assessed as to their significance as elements of a moral drama." 5

Thucydides' rendering of the Peloponnesian War has been likened to that used by speakers in the law courts, different from the prevailing style of popular oratory. b However, antiquarian narrative as an expression of the political conscience of the writer and not as a mere sequential ordering did not owe its existence entirely to the stylistic innovations of Thucydides and his predecessor Herodotous. By the 5th century, well-worn myths in which for example, Icarus' wings melted when in his youthful enthusiasm he flew too close to the sun while Daedulus succeeded in reaching his destination by taking the middle route, provided Greeks, as members of an essentially oral culture which used "stories of human action to store, organize, and communicate much of what they (knew), " with a way to understand the past and to set moral boundaries around future behavior. Narrative in Greece has long been "a socially symbolic act," reaching beyond description and into the realm of the signification of experience. As a form of intersubjective communication, narratives are empowered to suggest social alternatives; ergo "Greek history is not legend, it is research; it is an attempt to get answers to definite questions about matters of which one recognizes oneself as ignorant." In summary, since ancient times and the popular dissemination of the work of writers such as Homer, Aeschylus and Sophocles, Greek mythological cum historical narrative has performed a cryptographic function. By supplementing prevailing legal codes and by directing individual actions, myths have provided ordinary people a means of deciphering what they ought to do in everyday life and why they ought to do it.

The lessons of Prometheus' struggle with the Titans, of Antigone's insistence on giving her brother a decent burial, or of the curse of the House of Atreus have also played an explicit socializing role even in contemporary Greece. Authority figures will sometimes use mythological examples to point out the expediency of proposed courses of action. The stories embedded in the lyrics of popular songs (dimotika tragoudia) have been mined for instructions and support, have helped to create personal identities, and have stirred the public imagination. Lines from these ballads are quoted regularly and form the basis of a range of metaphorical beliefs which are carried around throughout the life-course and evoked when circumstances warrant their use. In a trope reminiscent of the propensity of goddesses and gods to transform themselves into animals, a well-known song says, "Don't be angry with me my dear, now that I must

go abroad; one day I'll turn myself into a bird and fly back to you." Responding to this longstanding tradition, poets and writers such as George Seferis and Nikos Kazantzakis liberally employed mythical images. 13 "And as I sat," writes Angelos Sikelianos in the poem "The Sacred Way," "I folded my hands over my knees, forgetting if it was today that I'd set out or if I'd taken this same road centuries before."

Anthropomorphic conceptions have been largely responsible for making the triumphs and failings of ancient deities relevant to quotidian struggles. Consequently,

(e)ven at the stage of their highest development the immortal Olympian Gods were supposed not only to look but also behave like people, especially Greeks. True, they were stronger and wiser but they, too, had problems. Divine family quarrels were not infrequent and not unlike those of the ordinary families down below. As a rule, they enjoyed intermingling with people and they spent considerable time participating in human affairs. Their primary concern — apart from meddling in people's lives — was, of course, feasting. They sought pleasure and disliked pain; they knew how to love and to hate and were capable of envying and seeking revenge as much as ordinary men. 15

In addition, since early Christian times history, myth and scripture have interacted in Greek culture. Biblical narratives are part of a broad communal and psychological orientation, a folk religion that disperses ethical precepts with or without direct and ongoing participation in church rituals. In other words, as metaphors for synchronous behavior, these old, multifaceted stories have helped to "frame" both ordinary and extraordinary experiences since "(b)y rendering events or occurrences meaningful, frames function to organize experience and guide action, whether individual or collective." On a more or less continuous basis, popular trust has been placed in, if not the exact content of each legendary representation, then at least in the anecdotal form as a way of framing life's eventualities.

What can be extrapolated from the historic Greek use of narrative? What does the foregoing tell us about narrative as a form, as a medium through which social identities are constructed which might then illuminate the question of the role of narrative in social transformations? In this paper, I will begin by discussing some of the implications of narrative in social science. The rest of the paper will be a case study in which I will attempt to apply the salient theoretical points raised by a general consideration of narrative to the role of narrative in the resistance movement that was constituted after the Nazi invasion of Greece in 1941. Although I have employed a Greek

example to introduce the paper and will return to it as an empirical illustration later on, I seek to establish that narrative is a suitable <u>comparative</u> analytic device that can be applied across national boundaries. 20

I. THE ROLE OF THE NARRATIVE FORM

What are the major issues for publics and the key troubles of private individuals in our time? To formulate issues and troubles, we must ask what values are cherished yet threatened, and what values are cherished and supported, by the characterizing trends of our period. In the case both of threat and of support we must ask what salient contradictions of structure may be involved.²¹

The cursory look at narrative in the Greek past above suggests various ways in which the narrative form might lead us toward a more comprehensive understanding of the historical dynamics of nations, classes, organizations and social movements both at the elite and popular levels. But first it is important to make explicit two possible uses of the term "role."

"Role" may refer to narrative as an interpretive tool. Recent applications of literary modes of analysis, primarily but not exclusively to historians' products, 22 have illuminated aspects of the process of reconstructing and presenting the past that were often not critically examined, especially during the formative 19th-century when largely for political reasons, obscurantist academic discourse reached a vertex. More recently, new ground in narrative analysis as applied to testimonies about lived experience at various levels of the social hierarchy has been broken by an increasingly-less renegade band of oral historians. 24

"Role" may also refer to narrative as a means of constituting and diffusing collective identities in particular societies such that narrative may provide a shared language that then becomes the basis of mobilization around particular Although referring specifically to the ways in which literary characters as narrators express oppositional politics through discourse, Mikhail Bakhtin's dialogic notion can be used here to illustrate a point. For Bakhtin, "(e)very moment of the story has a conscious relationship with this normal language and its belief system, is in fact set against them, and set against them dialogically: one point of view opposed to another, one evaluation opposed to another, one accent opposed to another (i.e., they are not contrasted as two abstractly linguistic phenomena)." 26 However Bakhtin is not positing a crude dichotomy or binary opposition regarding dialogic content, as his concept of <u>heteroglossia</u> or the existence of multiple voices in any given political fable demonstrates; instead, he is referring to

narrative as a modality of expression and argumentation. 27

The dual role of narrative then can be summarized as a) a method used by social historians to reconstruct the past using primary or secondary sources, carefully problematized; and b) a sort of "independent variable," active in shaping the past. At once departing from and synthesizing this typology, I want to suggest an important nexus of the two conceptions of the role played by narrative if narrative is viewed as an approach which may complement other ways of knowing about human behavior (e.g. archival, quantitative, ecological data). In tracing how microlevel concerns become macro-level concerns, I would advocate that all source materials -- not just narratives -- be approached with questions about the ontological concerns of historical actors (who I suggest below might more accurately be termed "authors"). Identifying the ontologies behind the stories people tell about events makes it possible to deduce the roots of ideologies which at first might seem contradictory. Looking at narratives in this 5 manner may also explain why some rather than other ideologies appeal to people and have the power to alter their behavior.

A number of inferences may be drawn about the role of narrative in broad social transformations. These are that

1. Narrative is more than description.

The type of narrative which concerns us here is analogous to a story with a beginning, middle and end; with a plot; with main characters, scoundrels and paragons, and background settings. Incidents are placed in some meaningful context and it is possible to capture the relationships among key elements of the story.

The most important element in the construction (and deconstruction) of narratives is <u>emplotment</u>. Emplotment entails "(p)roviding the 'meaning' of a story by identifying the <u>kind of story</u> that has been told." As a type of explanation, emplotment "is the way by which a sequence of events fashioned into a story is gradually revealed to be a story of a particular kind." 30

Attempting to make sense of the message behind the words of subjects in the search for operative social patterns amounts to an exercise in interpretation. The social historian is called upon to conceptualize a broad storyline and to draw logical conclusions about those sections of the story where the evidence is either deficient or indefinite. Narrative interpretive history can be contrasted with the style of narrative mentioned above that is more mechanical in nature, in which the content is devoid of meaning and the author -- as chronicler -- strives to produce faithful notations about the past. Although very much concerned with establishing causality, this type of interpretive

history is also different from conventional positivism which insists upon scientific proof of assumptions about the relationships among historical actors. Links to broader theory are accomplished either through analogy or logical deduction, based on an analysis of the encodement of social processes.

Essential to the use of historical narrative as emplotted story is the development of a reflexive consciousness on the part of or regarding the author as narrator. This entails the conceptual recognition that what intellectuals write are actually allegories; therefore the subjective narrative content of works by historians and social scientists can and should be identified and the plots and tropes of the personal stories they tell deconstructed. 31 From this perspective historical writings consist of both the presentation of perceived reality and the presentation of self. An awareness of the general contours of the researcher's "story" is vital to fully understanding the uses of historical material. Already, this is why most of us comb through the preface, acknowledgements, dedications and jacket notes of secondary sources for crucial information prior to reading a text. (At the same time there is a danger that the need to contextualize written historical products could, if taken too far, lead to a kind of reflexive paralysis whereby the actual content becomes secondary to a psycho-intellectual "diagnosis" of the author.)

2. The authors of narratives need not be intellectuals.

As mentioned above, a unique aspect is that the participants in historical events are comparable to authors of fictional accounts. The label "author" is no longer the exclusive domain of the poet, the writer of fiction, the social theorist. The status of author is accorded to participants and to informants who are touched by the experiences being studied. Whether projecting into the future or explaining the past, these participant—authors may be viewed as mentally ordering events in a way that actually tells a parable. The message contained in the parable might then be considered a reflection of what C. Wright Mills calls the "major issues and key troubles," of individuals and of aggregates of individuals or collectivities.

The narratives of participant-authors or historical protagonists can be divided into two interrelated spheres: the <a href="https://doi.org/10.1001/journal-jo

Thus, as we noted earlier, <u>ontological narratives</u> unite the psychological aspect that Hankiss refers to as the "structuring

of the image of the self," 33 elements of a <u>weltanschauung</u> or world-view, and actors' collective interests, whatever they may be. In the frame-analytic tradition, Jo Freeman makes a similar point when she writes about reference groups:

Although a reference group is not always a group, it is a standard against which people compare themselves in order to judge their behavior and attitudes. This well-established concept in social psychology is not one that has been used to analyze social movements, but it has a great deal of explanatory power.

What makes narratives socially-significant is that they are at least partially externalized during periods of social unrest. 35 In other words, the ideologies subsumed in informants' versions or stories about what happened or is happening have public consequences precisely because they don't remain private but are in some sense acted out by participant-authors. for particular dramaturgical stories or mobilizational narratives might be envisioned such as for example, "Why My Family Joined the Mau Mau Rebellion," "Why I Chose to Ignore My Family's Disapproval and Donate My Savings to Marcus Garvey in the 1920s," (a story which my late Uncle Vance could have told), or as in a recent book written by a Yugoslavian partisan commander which just happens to be about the Greek Resistance, "How and Why the People's Liberation Struggle of Greece Met With Defeat." 3t Implicit in these titles is a collectivization of individual experience and the metaphorical proposition that others, faced with similar situations, might react or conduct themselves according to an analogous logic or face similar results. narratives facilitate a process of identification with the speaker's portrayal, articulated in ways more or less forceful than Thucydides' warnings but with the same allegorical flavor. Ontological and mobilizational narratives often coexist in a symbiotic relationship and are not always clearly distinguishable from one another. However, I would argue that a deliberate effort to separate them is a worthwhile prerequisite to further generalization.

2 14 2

430

3. The narrative form may contain intelligence about political processes such as the motivations of mass publics to participate and of leaders to mobilize constituents.

Ira Katznelson makes the observation that "class is discursive." Oppositional politics -- in the sense of demands for increased levels of formal political participation and acknowledgement -- are also discursive. To the extent that class and politics are intertwined as in relatively straightforward cases of union-based protest with industrial workers behaving concertedly <u>für sich</u>, the paraphrase only emphasizes a different aspect of the same phenomenon. However, subjects may not necessarily conceive of themselves as struggling to defend

workerist or related agendas. Contrary to the assumptions in the literature particularly regarding the mobilizational narratives of so-called "old social movements," some activities are "purely" political insofar as they involve the negotiation of power relations in dialogue with established governmental institutions and mechanisms and as such are best understood as the expression of more commonsensically-understood political Narrative analysis can reveal why people engage in a wider assortment of explicitly political activities which at times might be concentric with workplace concerns and at other times unrelated, from voting to joining political associations to protest, especially in those instances where their participation is not motivated wholly by economic factors. For example, the case below involves the growth of a style of class consciousness which underplayed many of its characteristic themes. mentioned occasionally in resistance "folklore" as a factor behind activism, as a rule proletarian and bourgeois economic concerns per se were secondary to a much broader political consciousness. To the extent that traditional economic categories formed the basis for participation, classes combined with others to act "in themselves" and not "for themselves." 38

Searching for clues in the stories people tell is a way of projecting the underlying motivations of actors of varying ranks within the political system. Narrative history offers access to the cultural codes that sanction or constrain the activities of elite policy-makers within established political institutions as well as those of latent or politically disfranchised actors. Generally we do know more about the former than about the latter simply because elite actors have been studied more. A major consequence of structural dominance and direct efforts to maintain hegemony is that elite actors are kept track of better and they tend to record their political steps more fully. By no means am I suggesting that we stop studying the elite level; in fact I'm proposing that we study it just as much if not more, but in such a way as to extract its lessons from the complex hegemonic overlay which Gramsci brought to our attention. However I read, perhaps presumptuously, the justifications of history-from-below which are appearing with increasing frequency in social scientific journals as, in effect, a call to historians and political sociologists to acknowledge the importance of narrative history in mining resource material about mass publics. 40 For example, it is possible to gain insight into what leads persons with few or no citizenship rights to engage in unprecedented political acts by considering how such potentially scandalous activities might reflect changes in the stories that people tell themselves about their right to make their political voices heard.

Finally, from a more instrumental point of view, the significance of narrative in the political realm lies in its role as a type of mobilizational capital for influential figures.

Leaders manipulate specific (but not necessarily theoretically-predetermined) stories or mobilizational narratives in order to persuade potential adherents to follow a particular course, thereby transforming certain versions into political resources. From a narrative perspective, then, the story of "Once Again, the Government Tried to Wipe Out Our People Through Its Lethargic Relief Efforts After the Big Earthquake" becomes the highly-persuasive rallying cry of a burgeoning social movement, compels citizens to vote a candidate into office, occasions the mass loss of faith in a previously-popular regime, or gains broader currency within what Habermas called the "realm of our social life in which something approaching public opinion can be formed."

This approach is especially valuable in the study of what, elongating the term for organized, extra-institutional challenges to the political status-quo, 43 I call "socializing movements." Socializing movements teach new political values to members of a particular target group and also attempt to recondition political attitudes within civil society regarding what kinds of groups may legitimately exist in relationship to state structures. Seen in this light, socializing movements perform exactly the same pedagogical function as such traditional agents of moral and political instruction as families, schools, labor unions, and parties. In the absence of narrative modes of persuasion, it is as hard to imagine an effective socializing movement 4 as it is to imagine early childhood education without stories.

4. Although segmented, the content of socially-symbolic narrative is just as often synthetic.

A perhaps banal statement that nonetheless bears repeating is that formulaic models have limited explanatory power when used to account for political actions. The pressure to rely on overt, established constructs is in keeping with academic orthodoxy in a number of human scientific subfields. Complicating challenges, Kuhn reminds us, are often suppressed by "(n)ormal science...because they are necessarily subversive of its basic commitments." A consequence of too-meager templates for the study of political behavior is that, whether or not the suppositions underpinning standard models are made explicit -- and often they are not -- the motivating reasons behind political action are assumed instead of being allowed to emerge from the Broad generalizations and the use of ideal-types are crucial to causal explanation; otherwise source material would remain mired in descriptive detail. But as a number of scholars have argued recently nor can deterministic models account for the complex mixes of factors which hide behind political behavior.

A more realistic approach must admit the possibility that subjects' identities and therefore political motivations may derive from multiple influences, both ideological and

experiential. Thus what will soon no longer be labeled "the new histories" are breaking older, surer molds because they "treat anthropological ideas as enmeshed in local practices and institutional constraints, as contingent and often 'political' solutions to cultural problems. They construe science as a social process. They stress the historical discontinuities, as well as continuities, of past and present practices, as often as not making present knowledge seem temporary, in motion. authority of a scientific discipline, in this kind of historical account $_46$ will always be mediated by the claims of rhetoric and power. 46 For example, how is it possible to explain a Beijing University instructor's claim that in the years prior to Tiananmen Square, Chinese students were fascinated by modernization theory, especially the work of one of its more controversial proponents, Alex Inkeles? What of the generation gap which surfaced in the Spanish labor movement in the 1970s between factory council leaders whose collective identities were shaped under Franco and those whose formative experiences came after the dictator's death? 48 How did 19th-century dockworkers in Marseilles form a coalition that allowed their "supremely unified and confident" union to be "tolerated -- sometimes even encouraged -- by the merchants and the political authorities."?49 These cases are difficult to understand solely as expressions of the primacy of the class struggle in China of the 1980s, as a measure of the success of labor mobilizations by the Spanish socialist party (PSOE) in the post-Franco era, and as an instance of repressed workers defying state capitalism.

The greatest challenge to undifferentiated models is the problem of explaining paradoxes and the role of ideas, indeed ontologies and emotional reactions, left over from previous eras or periods in individual life-courses. Take the example of nationalist ideology which I will come back to later in examining the case of the Greek resistance. In order to understand nationalism as a factor in motivating political action, it is also necessary to learn something about a) the meaning of nationalism to individual leaders based on educational background and life experiences that were sometimes shared and sometimes eclectic; b) the new collective national identities forged by coalitions of leaders; and c) the receptivity of mass publics at particular historical junctures to nationalism as a moral code that synthesized latent and manifest feelings, past experiences and present realities. As mentioned earlier, the point is being made much more often now by comparative historians whose work on social change combines a sensitivity to human agency and a recognition of the role played by structural constraints, that it is necessary to disaggregate the sources of the collective identities of the objects of study -- classes, political parties, social movements, civic associations -- and then to retrace how they came to be constructed. 51 The result is bound to be explanatory models that are stronger because they are more flexible and able to include disparate and sometimes

contradictory factors in answering the question, how do people with different backgrounds manage to act collectively?

Here a revival of the approach called "prosopography" 52 might help. Lawrence Stone writes (and is worth quoting at length) that

Prosopography is used as a tool with which to attack two of the most basic problems in history. The first concerns the roots of political action: the uncovering of the deeper interests that are thought to lie beneath the rhetoric of politics; the analysis of the social and economic affiliations of political groupings; the exposure of the workings of a political machine; and the identification of those who pull the levers. second concerns social structure and social mobility: one set of problems involves analysis of the role in society, and especially the changes in that role over time, of specific (usually elite) status groups, holders of titles, members of professional associations, officeholders, occupational groups, or economic classes; another set is concerned with the determination of the degree of social mobility at * certain levels by a study of the family origins, social and geographical, of recruits to a certain political status or occupational position, the significance of that position in a career, and the effect of holding that position upon the fortunes of the family; a third set struggles with the correlation of intellectual or religious movements with social, geographical, occupational, or other factors. Thus, in the eyes of its exponents, the purpose of prosopography is to make sense of political action, to help explain ideological or cultural change, to identify social reality, and to describe and analyze with precision the structure of society and the degree and the nature of the movements within it.

...

A valid complement to the prosopographic approach is narrative interpretive history in its ontological <u>cum</u> mobilizational aspect which, to recapitulate, involves distinguishing the stories or myths that "participant-authors" tell in placing their own experiences into some meaningful context.

Stone mentions the elite bias of prosopography. An extension of the prosopographic approach, this type of narrative analysis tries to explain the actions of a variety of actors as they, in the Bakhtinian sense, engage members of their own and other political and intellectual communities in dialogues about social change. Most importantly, asking of the data what story is being told allows us to speculate about the ideological

origins of complex movements and processes, as well as to identify and trace changes in "structures of feeling" or the Zeitgeist of a political cohort. For example, Randall Collins' description of the mood of the New Left during the late 1960s is reminiscent of the prevailing atmosphere in many youth movements, and seems to be one promising place for research on the historical sociology of emotions to begin:

After all, we had our "Berkeley-the-center-of-the-universe" self-image, full of not only the feeling that what we were doing was the most important thing of our own lives, but also the illusion that what we did rippled outwards and catalyzed followers everywhere else. With more detachment, one can say it is precisely that feeling that is the mark of a movement on the rise, and which constitutes one of its strongest attractions. 56

This brings us squarely back to C. Wright Mills' contention that one of the goals of social research should be to try and fathom subjects' basic ideological dispositions:

What they need, and what they feel they need, is a quality of mind that will help them to use information and to develop reason in order to achieve lucid summations of what is going on in the world and of what may be happening within themselves. It is this quality (that we) are coming to expect of what may be called the sociological imagination. 57

The types of source material used to deconstruct political outcomes can be unobtrusive, even unconventional: including not only speeches, elite interviews, letters, statistics, party platforms and formal archives but also oral histories of protagonists and their family members with an eye toward important psychological turning points, ontological themes, and vulnerabilities; and some of the more unusual artifacts of popular culture such as the childhood literature absorbed by a political generation (fairy tales, bedtime stories, family folklore, pedagogical material), family portraits, slogans on pens and buttons distributed by party flanking organizations, posters, unofficial newsletters, photographs, organizing songs, oral poetry and various types of iconography. 59 Because it is an essentially speculative enterprise, narrative history can never gain the status of an exact science, able to provide transcendent proof. But narrative is an especially valuable source of evidence when used along with other types of data to establish plausibility. 61 Nor should its role as an active historical force be dismissed.

II. TALES FROM THE GREEK RESISTANCE

Wars, crises, natural disasters and the like often represent what has been called a break in the political opportunity structure. 12 New political agenda are considered; political cultures, institutions and processes are open to restructuring. Crises are not only significant because they may involve societal groups in a series of violent encounters with each other and with authorities. Crises are also significant because they create what has been termed "political space," in which new resources, information and ideological support from strategically-placed allies are now available to groups to change their positions in the political hierarchy and, in some cases, to gain access to the political system for the first time. Whether or not new political space actually allows groups to fully realize their potential, political space makes the acquisition of power and prestige possible. Different ways of doing things are now conceivable to policymakers and to the public. An unintended consequence of war as a crisis signaling "dangers that threaten the identity of a society" by may be the introduction of revised narratives. In summary, wars and other apparent disasters may in retrospect provide a <u>narrative</u> opening for the political system: an opportunity for new political stories to be told featuring new plots and non-traditional characters acting in hitherto inconceivable settings.

Studies of resistance movements are frequently limited to assessments of military successes and failures. This case demonstrates, I think, that resistance movements may also mark broader national social and political transformations. My argument is that the Greek resistance movement which formed after the Nazi invasion of 1941 occasioned a structural opening for the country's political system, with the largest resistance organization (EAM) playing a major role in formulating and spreading the narratives which characterized the movement. During the occupation period from 1941-44, EAM managed to function both as a popular front movement at the leadership level and to initiate a populist movement at the base. In addition to coordinating military maneuvers, the organization also sought to alter traditional participatory structures and to recast popular definitions of Greek nationhood in the context of its wartime mobilizations.

What political stories fall under the rubric of the Greek resistance? My aim will be to analyze resistance testimonies and popular culture for the stories that in taking part in the resistance, participants thought they were telling about themselves, about the Greek past and about the country's future prospects. With mass consistency, groups with limited public voices such as youth and women now had roughly similar stories to tell, not only about the course of the war but also about their role in politics. I will argue that nationalism was the overall

theme of these stories and was the rallying cry that contributed to the movement's success in, even in the words of a conservative critic of EAM, "acquir(ing) control of almost the whole country" by the end of the war. These stories were an amalgam of continuous and discontinuous themes that acknowledged the past glories of ancient times and the Revolution of 1821; added current events such as the Greek successes on the Albanian front in 1940 and the Nazi atrocities directed against civilians; and advocated, for the future, full citizenship rights for all Greeks qua Greeks. The story entitled "The Greek Resistance" that leaders and members of EAM were telling can be seen as nationalist in two senses: first, in that one of its major goals was Greek national autonomy and self-determination (ethniki avtodikisi) of which the slogan "Greece for the Greeks" was emblematic; and secondly, as a popular plebiscite in favor of the "the empowerment of the subordinate classes (through) the transformation of conditions within civil society" " and the expansion of citizenship rights to include traditionally subaltern groups. EAM was the organizational expression of a consensus that the time to "crack the political code" built upon clientelist structures and political exclusion was at hand. Based on a reinterpretation of available documentary evidence, I will assert that this complex of stories may be contrasted with the over-simplified version enshrined in traditional historiographic accounts entitled "The Stalinist Communist Insurgency."

1. Historical background

Axis troops invaded Greece on April 7, 1941 following the country's defeat in the war fought the year before with the Italians in Albania. The government and royal family left the country for the Middle East on the 27th of the same month. government-in-exile, operating out of Cairo for the duration of the war, consisted of the king, a group of politicians from the pre-war political parties, and a number of British advisors. At home, the resulting political vacuum was filled by the two major resistance organizations, EAM-ELAS and EDES, 66 along with several smaller, Athens-based organizations. EAM (Ethniko Apeleftherotiko Metopo or the National Liberation Front) was founded in September, 1941. EAM was the largest organization and sought to become a mass-based political movement. Its military branch was called ELAS (The Popular Greek Liberation Army), its youth organization was EPON (United Panhellenic Youth Organization), and its welfare organization, staffed mainly by women, was called EA (National Solidarity).

Soon after the resistance organizations were inaugurated, forces from EAM/ELAS and EDES began to engage in localized clashes, predating the Civil War (1946-49) by several years. The organizations quickly became entangled in a struggle between Left and Right, the hallmark of Greek politics since the early part of

the century as government alternated unpredictably throughout the 1920s and 1930s. In November of 1942, EAM-ELAS, EDES, and members of a British envoy collaborated in sabotaging the Gorgopotamos Bridge. However, after the bridge was successfully blown up, EAM and EDES did not cooperate in any further operations. A brief initial period of reciprocity gave way to more acrid encounters and the two sides spent the rest of the war as adversaries.

German troops left Greece in October, 1944. The government-in-exile returned. However, the situation worsened in December with the "Dekemvriana", a series of street battles between ELAS, the Athens police, and the British. This trend continued through 1945. From 1946-49, the Democratic Army, made up of former EAM/ELAS members, and the National Army, supported by the British and the Americans fought the Civil War. On October 16, 1949, the Democratic Army announced a cease-fire. Its remaining forces, said to include many women and adolescents, of were defeated in the Grammos and Vitsi mountain region near the Yugoslavian border.

In 1944, the "White Terror", aimed at Communists and former partisans began. Many EAM leaders, members, and their relatives were arrested and sent to jails and concentration camps or were pursued by extreme right-wing terrorist bands. The movement was thus demobilized by state and parastate repression during the late 1940s and throughout the 1950s.

2. Approaches

It is perhaps not widely known that the events in Greece during the 1940s remain controversial and emotionally-charged Represented among the characters in this ongoing and in many ways still unresolved controversy are the forces of resistance, collaboration and subsistence, as well as participants in older, unconnected feuds that erupted during this period of tremendous dislocation. Over subsequent decades a legacy of clashes typical of wartime combined with a bitter civil war which, as noted above, followed almost immediately on the heels of the German evacuation. From a symbolic and affective point of view, the country continued to fight related battles well into the 1970s and strongly-held beliefs about the resistance period continue to be a feature of the contemporary political landscape. In broader epistemological terms, the fact that authors on different sides of the conflict dispute one another's stories, especially about highly-polarized issues and events, presents narrative analysis with a problem which it has yet to solve at this point in its evolution. Who one chooses to believe depends on the volume of available evidence, and arguably also on one's own moral code and reading of history. My point, though, is that the way to get at motivation is to try to reconstruct the plots of the stories that various groups of collective actors think

they're telling, a <u>multi-narrative</u> approach, which hopefully would make theoretical-overdetermination less likely.

A further, equally important and perhaps by now obvious point is that what I have summarized above under the somewhat misleading heading "historical background" is not and can never be "objective" history, because there is no such thing. have presented here is my own narrative rendering as a social historian, which has led me to structure the text according to my personal view of what happened. It is not an exaggeration to say that there are those who, upon reading this account, would become apoplectic. I have painted the EAM movement more as victim than victimizer contrary to standard postwar historical texts. doing, I support the allegorical position, shared by some scholars 10 and not by others, that what we think we know about this movement has gotten tangled in a Cold War rhetoric which has left little room for a fair reading of its popular political and psychological dimensions. While I acknowledge such negative factors as occasional violent episodes during which innocent people were accused of collaboration, at times sloppily-defined (which were not, I would argue, emblematic); the sinister (but again, in my opinion, a-typical) role played by prewar KKE leader Nikos Zachariades in fomenting conflict within the party and attacks against it upon his return from Dachau in 1945; and the general confusion regarding long and short-term goals, common to hastily-conceived populist coalitions, which was evident in various contradictory policies from 1943-49; my account features an essentially pro-EAM subtext, lamenting the idea that a nascent popular democracy was crushed during an uncritically repressive Consequently, the best way to approach my narration (and all others, I would argue) is as Martin Bernal has expressed it: I seek to offer a plausible model rather than a scientific proof which asserts a decisive, universal "truth." This does not of course in any way lessen my belief in the accuracy of this narrative analysis.

It would of course be impossible to give a full account of all the personal anecdotes to come out of the Greek resistance. Instead I will begin by sketching the broad outlines of an especially salient meta-narrative which has the "capacity to unite all of the individual stories" belonging to a particular The textual interpretation favored by a broad range perspective. of resistance participant-authors is, I have asserted, a story of the resistance movement as the embodiment of redemptive, pan-Hellenic nationalism. I will offer a few illustrations of the apparent power of this motif as a means employed by the organization to engender a new collective Greek political identity and as an incentive to potential participants in the resistance <u>cum</u> social revolution that EAM represented. examples come from the oral histories I conducted with Greek partisans, resistance songs, secondary sources and other published materials. The range of sources in which I detect that the same story is being told will hopefully provide a kind of reality-check or perhaps constitute grounds for assuming some degree of reliability regarding my interpretation.

3. Cracking the political code

a) Clientelism and populism

During the 20th-century, Greek politics have been dominated by typically Southern European clientelism. 73 Clientelism is a vertical mode of political linkage whereby citizens promise loyalty and support for politicians in exchange for protection and the provision of goods and services. Voters' contacts with the state, therefore, are through complicated, personalistic networks rather than through more mass-based political associations which, at least theoretically, equalize public access to the halls of government. The primacy of political clientelism in Greece meant that certain groups were excluded from participation. This method of political exchange excluded those not in a position to seek favors or to accrue the political Included in the "currency" necessary to make their voices heard. ranks of those who were disfranchised either de facto or de jure were peasants, the elderly, a large number of youth both male and female, and adult women.

A political antidote to clientelism which has appeared in several cases such as Peronist Argentina is leftist populism. Working "from above," charismatic leaders or social movements seek to mobilize the political participation of strategic groups — some of them latent — in the society. The attempted incorporation of new groups represents a direct challenge to the status quo as new participatory opportunities are extended and, with varying degrees of success, a new weltanschauung is constructed which takes as its guiding ideological theme the inherent right of the people, as opposed to the traditional politicians, to rule. The definition of the "people" or those who deserve to rule varies from case to case, but possibilities include women, workers, youth, peasants, the middle classes, intellectuals, economic collectivities, and various ethnic groups.

As a people-based philosophy, political populism is almost always ideologically linked by its exponents to nationalist appeals. But the concept of the nation is purposely kept indeterminate. Leaders construct narrative frames creatively employing history and pithy cultural symbols to attract a cross-section of the population while seeking to divert attention away from particularistic identities such as class, gender, region, ethnic group or religion. Paradoxically, then, at the same time that influential "authors" are emplotting narratives based on inclusionary principles, localized concerns are viewed with suspicion. A generic "progressive person" is invented, to use

Hobsbawm's term, or $\underline{\text{imagined}}$, to use Anderson's, as an entity whose ultimate orientation is toward a slightly blurry utopian future.

The conglomerate nature of populist ideology means that frameworks designed to explain cases where mobilization is based on more unitary concerns or is in support of single issues are inappropriate analytic tools. Understanding how class and gender consciousness form within populist movements, whether they lean toward right or left, requires a more complex model than is offered by, for example, Katznelson's linear model of working-class formation which others in this volume take issue with, or certain radical feminist approaches. The Movements linked to populism often confound researchers because they by nature rest on ideological patchwork. But it seems to me that it is worth rising to the challenge if the ultimate goal is to be theorybuilding informed by historically-specific empirical cases, as opposed to old-style, descriptive narration.

In summary, the mobilizing narratives of populist movements by definition may address diverse class, national, ethnic and gendered themes. In the detective work required to understand populist movements, therefore, it is advisable to remain open to a range of possibilities regarding the ideological make-up of these social formations when constructing one's own narrative account. Accordingly, in the case of the Greek resistance, the mobilizing narratives of the EAM movement represented a number of distinct but by no means incompatible tendencies. Contrary to the totalizing biases of certain segments of the social movement literature, the fact that class, popular nationalism, clientelistic paternalism, mass organization shared political space in Greece in the 1940s does not make that movement unique in its complexity. Instead I would argue that in broad theoretical terms, the case ought to be seen as adhering to a norm for populist movements; the problem, which is not small, is how to map the contours of populism in particular settings.

b) Greece in a Balkan context

Nicos Mouzelis offers a definition of political populism which, although he doesn't apply it to the Greek resistance, is useful in conceiving of EAM as a social movement:

(P)olitical populism involves drawing into the political arena people hitherto excluded from it or admitted to it only marginally. This type of political mobilization entails a radical restructuring of the prevailing relations of domination, without a concomitant radical transformation of the prevailing relations of production. This definition of political populism excludes revolutionary movements (like those of Russia, China, and Cuba) where popular mobilization

(sought) an overall restructuring of both relations of domination and relations of production. 76

Similarly, the EAM viewed itself in confrontation with the forces of domination, ambiguously-defined. In resistance popular culture, classical themes are privileged over those of class; patriotism and the "nation" are stressed, either as parental or Titan figures; and generally the resistance qua nation is cast in a morality play in which good is forecasted to prevail over evil. "Voice of the People--Voice of God," begins one marching song, teaming citizenry and deity in an apparently equal power relationship, "the enemy hears and trembles." History is put to safe use, as a way of emphasizing the glorious classical past or 19th-century revolutionary hero(ines) in the war against the Turkish occupation. The future is also used as a rationale for taking risks in the name of the nation: "We fight for the right of our generation, to see what kind of government we prefer!" 78 goes a stanza, repeated once sotto voce, of one song.

In part the EAM's reluctance as a mass organization to narrate its claim to political sovereignty in strictly orthodox communist terms can be accounted for by the historical idiosyncracies of Greek class structure. Since the late 19thcentury, the Greek economy had been dominated by a petty bourgeois stratum rather than by an industrial working class or by landless peasants in the mood to revolt. For example, Mouzelis compares the situation of Greek and Bulgarian peasants during the interwar years and concludes that "the only Balkan country which did not experience a strong peasant movement was Greece." Mouzelis accounts for this apparent contradiction among peasant share-croppers by citing the neutralizing role of foreign labor migration; return flows of foreign currency from emigrants; and depoliticizing effects of the Metaxas dictatorship The result was a decreasing gap between the urban from 1936-41. and rural elites.

Class-based ideologies were a less compelling reason for collective action than cultural nationalism, modeled after previous struggles against foreign powers. Late 19th-century Greeks had a strong collective memory of colonial domination, incompetent foreign rule and outside intervention, from the Ottoman Turks, to a four-year allied British, French and Turkish occupation during and after the Crimean War (1853-57), to the Othonian dynasty which fell to rebellious forces in 1862. Following the Russo-Turkish war (1877-78) the Russians sought, unsuccessfully, to include most of Macedonia in a pan-Bulgarian As a result of this move and the establishment of a state. number of Bulgarian churches and schools throughout the region, in the 1880s Greek nationalists redoubled their efforts to counteract a chronic, undisguised territorial interest on the part of their country's northern neighbor. Thus, while after 1917 Greeks occasionally admired some of the ideas generated by

"The Great Bear" (<u>To Arkoudi</u>), they were not especially inclined to adopt unfamiliar symbols or to conceive of themselves as provincial extensions of the Soviet Union. Ideas of national self-determination and irredentism (i.e. the <u>Megali Idea</u> to recapture Byzantium, disastrously attempted in 1897 and 1921) were more appealing to potential adherents than dialectical materialist proposals, formulated elsewhere.

The EAM's character is perhaps best contrasted with that of its closest spiritual sibling, Yugoslavia's Antifascist Council of People's Liberation (AVNOJ). 82 Although the two movements shared populist narrative tendencies, their orientations were strikingly different. While in Yugoslavia, hints of the 1948 split with Moscow were present as early as 1941 as signified by miscellaneous defiant acts on the part of Tito and other communist party leaders, nevertheless "Tito's group, which for years had carefully educated party members to exult in the example of the USSR and to revere Stalin as its leader, now had an opportunity to extol Stalin's cult among new recruits to the resistance, men and women who often had no previous exposure to Communist rites." 83 Accordingly, the overarching theme in most Yugoslavian recruiting propaganda created "the impression...that Stalin was the only antifascist leader and that Tito was his Yugoslav interpreter." 84 An additional factor was Yugoslavia's ethnic heterogeneity. In order to forge a union of diverse groups into a synchronized whole, Tito was obliged to employ relatively "neutral" rhetoric, citing symbols which because they were not part of any particular group's repertoire, could be used to promote wholesale allegiances.

A deeper structural reading of the evidence in the Greek case suggests an inverse scenario. Not only was there infrequent contact between the Soviet and Greek resistance leaders during the war as opposed to an ongoing dialogue in the Yugoslavian case, it is also evident that the EAM's purpose was neither to encourage an allegiance to the Soviet Union in its members, nor to engender solidarity with other communist states in a direct assault against capitalism. Still, once in a while class or Soviet themes surface in resistance discourse, such as, for example, in a song whose opening stanza goes "Black crows with their hooked claws, fell upon the working-class; wildly squawking and aiming to draw blood, they wanted to see Dimitrov hang along with Danev and Popov, Tailman and the other antifascist leaders...and...they're still killing the heroic proletariat. However, the song also calls upon "workers, peasants, soldiers, people" to "move forward together in the fight against fascism." 86 A further example of the use of "classical" communist motifs comes from the last words of a political prisoner executed in 1949. Lambrini Kaplani, a factory worker from Ikaria shot in July, is represented as stating: "I am a worker. And I am proud that I did not betray the working class. I fought so that better days would come for all working people as well as for those of you who are killing me. You are all my brothers. Long live freedom! Goodbye!" However, despite their power, such words were not, as far as I can tell, a common feature in resistance narratives. Significantly, when they do appear, they are tempered with broader populist ideological constructions. Thus to recapitulate, the Greek mobilizing text greatly underplayed materialist and internationalist themes and sought instead to reconstruct politics using populist rhetoric tailored specifically to the Greek historical and political contexts.

4. Resistance narratives

73

3,71

7.

na m

1,4%

As I suggested earlier, the EAM's conception of nationalism had two facets. The first concerned the defense of Greece's national borders and took as its primary objective the expulsion of the Axis invaders. Elsewhere I have called this "defensive nationalism." The second involved the extension of citizenship rights to marginalized or disfranchised groups, or "political nationalism." In the Greek case, the need for defensive nationalist solutions meant that the issue of nationalism as citizenship could be addressed simultaneously.

The co-existence of these two types of nationalism is not unique to Greece in the 1940s. Many revolutions and resistance movements blend the same two definitions of "the problem." What is most suggestive is that while the two types are conceptually separate and might be expected to lead to different sets of mobilizing activities, in resistance movements they are often intertwined in the minds of leaders and followers and work to drive one another forward. Furthermore, the two kinds of nationalism together provide a very compelling rationale for heterogeneous groups of people to engage in collective action. As key elements in an epic trope, defined by mass movements as progressive and reconstructive, the two types of nationalism are often unselfconsciously woven together into a collective participant narrativization of the event.

Based on my reading of the figurative significance of nationalism, I have extracted from the data the following versions of "The Story of EAM" as authored by its members.

Defensive nationalism: It is 1940 on the Albanian front. Greek forces are pushing the Italians back to Italy and making a fool out of "Koroido Mussolini" (Laughing-stock Mussolini). The joke is circulating, "If you want to visit Italy, join the Greek army." Each new victory at the front brings people out of their homes and sets them cheering and congratulating one another. But eventually the Greek army begins to suffer dramatic reversals, culminating in a series of humiliating defeats (despite the assistance of British squadrons sent by Churchill) and Hitler's decision to invade Greece in April. With so many men caught on

the mainland in the process of evacuation from Albania, during the Battle of Crete in May-June 1941 women, children and elderly people fight with sticks and stones against the <u>Luftwaffe</u>. Greece is plunged into a tripartite German, Bulgarian (a long-standing enemy) and, especially infuriating after such heady successes in battle, Italian occupation. Y.T., the daughter of a bank executive from a wealthy suburb of Athens, recounts:

The Greek Resistance was one of the most spontaneous, that is, it wasn't necessary for someone to tell us, "come join this organization to fight the Germans" but, by ourselves, as soon as we saw the Germans were coming down, we experienced a "shock" because, we were the winners, and that played a large role; that is, if the Greeks in Albania hadn't won against the Italians, we might have been But, since we felt so proud of winning, so...the otherwise. feeling in the souls (o palmos mesa sti psihi mas) of the young people in Greece and of others, of everyone, was so enormous because of the victory of the Greeks up in the mountains of Ipirus and in Albania, where they pushed the Italians out, abruptly, and without any declaration of war, that came later when they had crossed our border; the enthusiasm of the Greeks at that time was such that, and so great the heroism of the boys that were constantly leaving for the Albanian mountains to confront the enemy that had so underhandedly (ipoula) tried to cross the border. And in Athens, every Greek victory was something...very triumphant. They would beat the drums, and their would be shouts of joy, everyone came out into the streets...yelling and celebrating, it was absolutely divine! (itan kati to thespesio) And suddenly, we the victors, had become slaves to a much greater power, the Germans...

Suddenly, we found ourselves faced with a conqueror (kataktitis) that we had already won against, because the Germans had brought in the Italians...that is, Italian orders on the walls, kommandatoura, blockades...for instance, to go from Filothei where we lived by bus (with the very rare buses then) the Italians would make checks (sou kanane elengho oi Italoi) At a stop, they would board the bus, searching around, yelling "Madonna"...and we despised them. The Germans we hated, but we just couldn't believe that now we were faced with the Italians in this way...

We never expected the occupation to last so long - that is, if anyone were to read the diaries that we kept as children...the first year, for example, my sister writes: "So many days of war, but it won't last the year" and she says here, "288 days of war, 107 of slavery." Everyday she would write how many days had passed. Here she says: "281 days of war (on the 4th of August, 1941) 100 days of

slavery, but it won't last out the year. September is coming and with it, freedom." That is, everyday we lived with these thoughts. Na, here she says, "110 days of slavery. Po, po, po ...what a horror. Today we got 30 grams of bread. People are beside themselves." (o kosmos exallos)

Especially harsh and gruesome conditions ensue. During the winter of 1941-42, an estimated 300,000 Greeks starve to death because of Axis requisitioning of supplies. Children are heard moaning, "I'm hungry..." (Pinao) Whole villages are executed. Curfews are enforced. People are shot for having radios or for stealing potatoes. Soon after their arrival, the Germans plant a Nazi flag on the Acropolis. On May 30, 1941, students Manolis Glezos and Lakis Santos rip it down. Their heroic deed is well-publicized. Axis troops are shocked to discover that cheering Athenians have not come out of their homes to welcome their heroic Aryan conquerors as expected, but rather in support of the commonwealth soldiers captured in Albania, now chained to one another in carts being escorted through the streets. The poet Kostis Palamas dies. Huge crowds defy patrolling soldiers to attend his funeral and shout allegorical slogans about bondage.

EAM is organized in 1941. Among its first activities in Athens is to help coordinate soup-kitchens to keep the population from starving to death. "The first goal EAM had set," says Anthoula, twelve years old at the time and from the middle-class Athens suburb of Kypseli, "was the fight for life. Against hunger. The first song that was heard was (starts to sing) 'For life and for freedom, bread for our people! The old, women, men and children, for our beloved country.' That was the first hymn of EAM that was heard around the city. It was sung to an old island tune and it went, 'Brothers and sisters, we who are faced with starvation and slavery; we will fight with all our hearts and our strength; for life and for freedom, so that our people might have bread.' That was our first song."

Throughout 1943 EAM organizes strikes of public employees in Athens to protest their unwilling role in helping the occupation to function. Responding to mass demonstrations organized by EAM, the Nazis rescind the orders for "epistratevsi" or the transporting of Greek workers to munitions factories in Germany. The organization constantly recruits new members and trains them in clandestine activity. In the mountains, its military wing, ELAS, is a cross between a guerrilla and a tactical army and engages regularly in battle with the armies of the Axis. Joining EAM is viewed as an opportunity to rid the country of the despised fascists and to help change the course of the war.

To summarize, the hero(ine) in the defensive nationalist story is Greece in contest with, in a phrase common to many resistance songs, "blackest (sic) fascism." (o mavros fasismos) The enemy is the Axis menace that has overrun the country and is

rationing food, performing executions, and shouting orders at innocent people in the square. The form the struggle takes is of an epic drama in which sacrifice is for a righteous cause. In the popular imagination, possible antecedents are the ancient wars against the Persians, the 1821 War of Independence, and the more recent war in Albania. The story ends with the occupation a shambles since "Greece cannot be enslaved by the Bulgarogermans." The Axis "dogs" slink away humiliated and Greece is free of all foreign domination, prepared for a future of national self-determination. (ethniki avtodiikisi)

Nationalism as citizenship: The year is 1938. Greece is under the stifling dictatorship of General Metaxas. People are disappearing daily into jails and prison camps in which tortures such as the infamous retsinolado occur. The designation "political prisoner" takes on a new meaning. Students are organized into mandatory falange units called "Metaxas Youth" (EON) which are modeled after Hitler's youth organizations. Political organizations not controlled by the dictatorship are outlawed. In the period before the coup in 1936, the country has seen a number of government changes and highly unstable political conditions. For the most part, these short-lived regimes have alternated between coalitions of liberal democrats headed by republican leader Eleftherios Venizelos and right-wing coalitions supported by the monarchy.

Women have no formal political rights. Political parties are built on clientelist networks rather than on mass participation. Earlier, in the 1920s, Venizelos had "tried several...times to create modern party structures (but when) faced with the adamant opposition of strong clientelist elements, (he) had to give up his attempts at party reforms." Thus, the last time a populist solution was tried, even at a time when the franchise belonged solely to men, it failed due to "the threat of dissatisfied local factions walking out en masse...(since) Venizelos...could not so easily by-pass their authority and appeal directly to the people."

EAM is formed in September, 1941. Although its leadership coalition is dominated by communist party members and its initial organizing strategies influenced by cell-structure methods, this fact is not widely known until well into the war. A significant number of members come from the ranks or are the children of the middle classes, civil servants, intellectuals, wealthy peasants, and the petty bourgeoisie. Thus, seeing others of the same class and motivated by patriotism, EAM becomes a legitimate resistance solution for upper and middle-class members.

Youth are particularly disenchanted with patriarchal restrictions, as well as with the lack of political alternatives during the 1930s. Characteristically motivated by idealism, they

join and participate enthusiastically in EPON, the youth organization created in 1943. An EPON poster shows a group of young people holding a banner which says "Long live freedom." "Youth always march forth," proclaims the caption. "Pure and incorruptible, with the heroic spirit shining from within, properly enlightened, they perform miracles." Tasia L., from a Cretan middle-peasant background, recollects:

If the resistance hadn't come along, I, and a lot of men and women, I don't know, of course it's hard to tell how the conditions of life would have been and how much it woke us up, (mas xipnouse) but I'm fairly certain that the war woke us up a lot more intensely, and if it hadn't happened, I doubt we would have been woken up so easily. Our political education up until that time, we had the Metaxas dictatorship and the kind of regime that didn't politicize us correctly. It led us astray. (den mas provlimatize Mas paraplanouse.) Whereas the war was a lesson for sosta. all of us. And especially for we women. That was when the woman began to understand that she also needed to participate in politics, and to follow what was going on politically. Before the war, the society was very conservative. We couldn't go around freely and we didn't really know much about politics. Before the war, I was in the Metaxas Youth Group, EON. I went to a high school, and they had organized us all into the youth group. And once Queen Frederika came here to Rethymnon and I cried...I saw She was our queen! her and I was moved to tears! That was all we knew. how I felt then. Later on, in the resistance, I learned who the queen was, what kind of role she had played. Slowly I learned these things. And I saw them. Later on, in the war, I saw what fascism was and that the youth group I had been in was a fascist organization, and I was very ashamed. I was very sorry that I had participated, but I just didn't know. How could I? And that's why I became such a loyal member of EPON. I believed in the cause of EPON very much. Partly to purge myself from having been in that youth group! (laughing) But I didn't know.

The following fictional narrative probably combines the expression of adolescent wartime "structures of feeling," a justification for the movement (since it was published in 1945) and an appeal to like-minded youth that the defensive nationalist cause is a legitimate reason to transcend parental and other forms of domination, as a prelude to political nationalism:

"Why were you late again, my son?" Andrea's mother knew that times were hard and that human life had been reduced to the cheapest possible commodity. Armed squads of Germans and Italians patrolled the streets of Athens and needed no pretense whatsoever to open fire on innocent passers-by.

Therefore it was best to return from any errands as soon as possible and to remain inside until dawn, when life under this evil would no doubt bring new challenges...

Andreas knew all of this very well; he'd been given the same advice over and over. But now another voice had found a place in his heart. He had heard it around midnight one night during the winter of 1943. It seemed to come from a height, from somewhere up on Philopappou Hill and it spoke, it said, for an organization. The voice urged Greeks to take up arms and fight in order to rid the country of the occupying forces. That night Andreas had gone up on the roof to sleep and it was almost morning by the time he was able to shut his eyes. The words he had heard made a great impression on him. Who could they be, these people who shouted into the darkness, fearing neither the occupation forces nor their collaborators? How could one join in this struggle for freedom? In the morning he asked his father what was this EPON, this voice he heard in the night and how could one find this group that was appealing to people to help in any way they could? His father replied tersely, advising him instead to concentrate on his studies, especially this year, so that he could enter the gymnasium and eventually, earn a decent living. His father hoped Andreas would strive hard to succeed like he had.

But Andreas wasn't a kid who was easily silenced. He asked other kids in his neighborhood if they had also heard the voice in the night. On his own, he went to some of his classmates whom he knew he could trust to find out if they knew anything. And little by little he learned that this organization was created especially for young people. And so with patience and persistence, eventually he was able to contact some of the leaders (<u>ipefthinous</u>). And he learned then how the organization had launched a fierce struggle to rout the oppressor...And so Andreas made his decision...of course he was young, he was barely twelve...

EAM offers an organizational alternative to political participation, in many ways modeling itself after a mass party and in some aspects taking on <u>de facto</u> the duties of civil administration normally reserved for governments. Besides having an appropriate organizational category for virtually each member of the family, ¹⁰² the institution of the <u>Ipefthinos</u>, or "responsible one" at the regional, neighborhood and village levels helped to insure that the decentralized administrative apparatus functioned smoothly and with some sensitivity to local issues. "He was the key local EAM/ELAS recruiting agent and the person through whom the district's EAM superiors would execute their policies." A series of "People's Courts" are set up to adjudicate cases in remote areas. ¹⁰⁴ The system gets underway more fully in 1943 when the Italians evacuate Greece and

subsequently a provisional government is set up in Roumeli province known as "Free Greece." (Eleftheri Ellada). Literacy classes are held for those who have never learned to read or write. For the first time, women are officially given the vote in the spring of 1944 under the P.E.E.A. government. Early in the war, girls' proto-organizations are set up to teach the social and political skills necessary to subsequent citizenship. In Athens,

I must say that, before the war, women who had a greater politicization (politikopoiisi), etc., were ridiculed, they were the objects of a lot of joking. (itan san andikeimena ironeias) Therefore, about that kind of thing, we were, that is, I'm talking about my generation now, and the girls in my circle, we would go to school, and we thought that -that is, it made us...we were exasperated by the joking, but I believe that we weren't ready to do a lot of things to break through this irony because we also had accepted, we had somehow internalized the ridicule. It wasn't something that we were in any way ready to fight. But after the war, after the occupation, when we entered the organizations, there there wasn't the same problem, there we fought because we were many together and we had conscious goals. (siniditous stohous) We knew what we wanted. And it was something else. But at first, it was all kind of hazy.

Later on, when girls were organized to take part in the national resistance struggle, in demonstrations, and they were killed on the streets and I don't know what else, all that changed the mentality in Greece. That is, there, where they would make fun of women, they would laugh at them, when we talked, they began to see things differently. And in the organizations, the mentality changed, whereas in the beginning they would say, "Ach, she's a girl, she'll never be able to do it," afterwards they said, "So-and-so did that, and she did it very well," or "she organized that assembly, she organized that operation, and maybe she did it better than such-and-such man would have." So we took on more responsibility.

In a Model Girls Unit in the mountains near Karpenissi:

One thing I want to point out is that even though I was used to a very different life...my father was a wealthy merchant, he was in charge of dispensing fish for the region around Missolonghi ...and because in my family I was the youngest and the most catered to and very spoiled, that is, to the point where when my mother washed my hair, her big concern was that she couldn't let any soap get in my eyes...in spite of that, I must say that I adjusted pretty well to the antartiko, to the life of a partisan, and I wasn't bad, in calisthenics, or whatever. I was very disciplined, I took

part in all the activities and did whatever they told me to do. Remember, Maria, how many illiterate girls we had? There were quite a lot. I remember one, when we were having a geography lesson, the teacher, Captain Ilias, put her on the spot and asked about a particular term. What was her name, the girl with the sort of hooked nose?

Maria: Athanasia.

Plousia: Right. And she said, "I don't bone it," 105 meaning, "I don't understand it." (den to kokiazo) And I burst out laughing, because it seemed so hilarious, because we don't use that word where I'm from. Then I realized that she didn't understand, and that's why she didn't answer. And because I laughed, I remember it very well, Captain Ilias got angry and said to me, "You tell the class." And I said the word. I said it and he asked her, "Now, do you understand?" and she nodded her head that she did. Because she was one of the girls who was completely illiterate. (den ixere katholou grammata)

Thus, by filling the vacuum left by the government-in-exile and by reaching out to "the people" in unprecedented ways, EAM offers a means of participating in politics never available to the masses of Greeks. "Woman's time has come!" claims a song. "She must throw herself into the struggle and fight like a man! Nothing -- not mother, not house, not husband and children should deter her; her single goal should be -- Freedom or death!"

To summarize: The hero(ine) of the story of nationalism as citizenship is the Greek people enlightened by EAM. The enemies are fascists such as Colonel Metaxas and those who would limit political participation to elites. The form the struggle takes is a populist social revolution working to create a mass parliamentary democracy. The story ends with the much-disliked royal family remaining in exile, and free democratic elections being held as soon as the occupation is terminated. The chorus of the song "We Are of the New Generation" is representative: "O Sweet Greece, People's Democracy, O Sweet Greece, we don't want the king."

<u>Greece and Yugoslavia:</u> <u>Comparative discursive themes.</u>

The primacy of political populism -- what Mouzelis calls a change in the relations of domination without a concomitant change in the relations of production is apparent in the "spaces" left by the movement in its mobilizing efforts. The absence of "hardline" themes and the primacy given to expressly Greek nationalist motifs is particularly striking when the official songs of the Greek and Yugoslavian resistance movements are compared. The Yugoslavian songs also stress nationalism but it

is of a different sort: an indigenous nationalism combined with orthodox communist references. Virtually to a song in the Yugoslavian renditions, some mention is made of Stalin, Tito, the Communist Party or Mother Russia as the heroes of the struggle. In contrast, Stalin, the KKE, and the Soviet Union appear much less often in the lyrics of the Greek songs. The "superstars" of the Greek songs are almost exclusively Greece, Freedom, the People. To cite a few examples:

Yugoslavian

The memoirs of Vladimir Dedijer 109 contain the following passages:

"I quit Croatia after a sojourn of three weeks. Pioneers from Lapac sang this lovely song:
Oh people of Lika and Kordun,
The time has come to rise up
Against your loathsome oppressors,
All of the Ustashe and all of the conquerors.

You fool, you who are called the Poglavnik, The soil beneath you is shaking, You won't be able to run, nor save your head, Our strong hands will grab you.

Oh Stalin, you are the people's idol, Without you they cannot live. Come brothers, let's measure the Drina, So we can build a bridge for Stalin.

Comrade Stalin and the red star Will destroy the fascist nests.

Oh youth, the beloved of our race, From you will dawn freedom.
On you will fall the weight
To eradicate this wretched fascism.

We will bear fortune and freedom To the Croatian and Serbian peoples.

Or,

"And then, suddenly the Montegrins burst into song--about rocks, like those along which we climbed:

In the camp of the Bolsheviks
They say it is my love;
For three months, maybe more,
She has neither come nor written,
I was with them yesterday

On Durmitor's peak. I sat by the camp And watched the Bolsheviks, Partisans all. I saw beautiful sights Among them is discipline And the comradely life. I listened to their reading, Lenin's teachings, And I watched my sister How she spoke the truth. I then gazed upon the standard: The hammer and sickle, the five pointed star, Beneath that two, three words, Comrade Molotov's name. Above all Stalin's promise: Enslavement no more! The sunshine shimmers, the dawn beams, I depart down the mountain And leave behind the Bolsheviks, Stalin's workers.

Greek

The Official Song of EAM (Written by Vasilis Rotas) 110:

Freedom, the beautiful daughter Descends from the mountain tops And the people embrace her And they sing and celebrate.

EAM! EAM! EAM! Voice of the people! which stretches as far as the stars in the sky! EAM! EAM! EAM! It echoes All of Greece shall speak with one voice.

Tell it to the birds and the winds
That now the beast will tremble
Black violence the time has come for you to leave
And great punishment will befall you.

And we shall be so happy and rejoice That we shall all see freedom together and we will live in brotherly love, Throughout the world, throughout the universe.

<u>One Voice</u>

One voice, one voice calls out to me, Giving me the signal to move forward. From the earth, it reaches to the sky, Whatever the people want! Whatever the people want!

Down with thrones, down with violence, Down with dark, insidious fascism! Forward with democracy! So that the people may have whatever they want! Whatever the people want!

These and numerous other examples show that although the Greek and Yugoslavian resistance songs share themes such as the glory of the land and natural images and the necessity to destroy the fascists, a close reading of the lyrics reveals how different the organizing principles of the two movements were. movements sought to mobilize a mass base, but the discourse of inspiration, written ultimately by the leaders, gave members in the two countries very different messages regarding for what and whom they were fighting. For example, early in the resistance the official language was declared to be demotic Greek, the language spoken by the majority of the people, instead of either katharevoussa, the elaborate style of Greek which only a minority of educated Greeks could read, or Russian. The curriculum of the People's Schools stressed literacy, personal growth, and how and why voting was a universal, inherent right; in short, training members to become somewhat attenuated "good Greeks" rather than An interesting "good Communists," envisioned in sharper relief. passage from Dedijer's diary describes a meeting of the international communist youth leagues which took place in Those groups that could not send delegates instead Yugoslavia. sent messages of support. Dedijer reports that the delegate of the French resistance, Raymond Obrac, spoke in the name of French youth: "We in France know that we are your comrades. We admire your people and your struggle. We greet Marshall Tito, who is the greatest symbol of your fatherland." In contrast to the message from France, and those from the Soviet Union and Bulgaria, the Greek message was brief and general: "Deeply touched by your invitation, we greet the congress of the Yugoslav Antifascist Youth, which is fighting heroically for the destruction of fascism. EPON, fighting with you, admires your successes and firmly believes in the fortunate resolution of the common struggle. It is impossible to participate in the congress because of the shortness of time. Our deep regrets."

5. Rethinking traditional models

These stories of nationalism may be contrasted to the more conventional Cold War version of the story that came to be told in the post-war era that the goal of EAM was a Stalinist-communist insurgency. The analysis of the situation embedded in the Truman Doctrine (the "Domino Theory" narrative) persuaded several generations of American lawmakers of the dangerous ramifications of foreign policy which tolerated any form of national-level communist activity:

Critics had pressed the Administration on its contention that Greece (was) threatened by Soviet aggression, but received lame answers. It became clear why. The EAM, although Communist-led, had minimal ties with Russia. Churchill had more than once said that Stalin had kept the bargain he made at their 1944 Moscow conference to stay out of the Greek imbroglio. In fact, Stalin disliked the Greek Communists because they were nationalists and they admired the independent-minded Yugoslav leader, Tito, who gave them aid. Yet Truman simplified the question, enamored as he and many other Americans were with the notion that all Communists took their orders from Moscow.

In the feature article of the December 1949 issue of National Geographic Magazine entitled "War-torn Greece Looks Ahead" the author sanguinely describes a visit to the island exile camp Makronisos where former members of EAM-ELAS were actually being detained and tortured. "Our luncheon host," he writes, "a major, was magnetic, handsome, and realistic: his approach that of conviction: 'I was a Communist, too, but I got over it. For, despite everything, I am a Greek.' Few malcontents can resist that appeal, although I interviewed some who still do." 12

The repression of EAM and its successor, the Democratic Army, in the decades following the war led to the silencing of social democratic nationalist narratives about the resistance for approximately forty years. On the ascendancy and postwar repression of such "texts," Constantine Tsoucalas notes that

for the first time in modern Greek history, the massive popular resistance had been undertaken in a spirit of general participation in the shaping of national destinies. For the first time, masses were intervening directly in the political and social sphere and were called upon to be directly involved in the edification of a large number of institutions...In short, the EAM experience had shattered the entire traditional framework that underlies the symbolic deformation of the representation by the masses of everyday life...It was this new feeling of collective power, the new spark of agonistic representation, the new spirit of popular spontaneity and initiative—which had probably gone even further than the communist leadership had wanted—that had to be neutralized at all costs.

In the revised version of the story, nationalism was used against the former participants in EAM: resistance activity was now recast as "anti-national" (antiethnikofrosin) and those who took part in the EAM movement had been "traitors to the Greek family and state."

However, as we have seen, strong counter-evidence exists that the model used by the resistance to mobilize its adherents was far more complex than the conventional representation. It basis for a reinterpretation of the role played by the nationalist narrative at the leadership level comes from a number of sources. This paper is not the place for an extensive discussion of counter-examples. However, I will offer a few clues which I think begin to explain why nationalist rather than Soviet communist ideology was used by leaders to persuade one and a half million Greeks to join and to endure severe tests of their loyalty to the movement, such as torture, long prison terms and death by firing squad, even after the Nazis left Greece. be noted here that my intention is not to imply that the goals of EAM were somehow normatively better or worse because they were nationalistic and not directly linked to Soviet themes. is only that our expectations about the reasons people have for creating and joining revolutionary movements are less revealing in the absence of a very close reading of the narratives emergent from the specific movements themselves.

a) The EAM leadership: A Telescopic View

There is no doubt that the Greek Communist Party (KKE) dominated the EAM leadership stratum. However the caricatured assumptions about the Moscow orientation of the movement as a whole or the insincerity of its social and political goals which have characterized vast stretches of the postwar historiographic literature do not necessarily follow for a number of reasons.

First, the EAM and the KKE were not synonymous, even though EAM has been habitually referred to as "The Communists" even in the scholarly literature. The EAM leadership actually comprised a coalition that in fact included two prominent social democrats from the Union for Popular Democracy party, University of Athens constitutional law Professor Alexander Svolos and Dimitrios Tsirimokos; Dimitrios Stratis of the Socialist Party; Dimitrios Asimakes from the United Socialist Party; and Constantinos Gavrilides from the tiny Agrarian Party. Later, the coalition was joined by General Stephanos Sarafis. Sarafis had been a colonel in the Greek army and a prominent supporter of Venizelos' Liberal Party before the war, and had been sent to the mountains on a mission to negotiate with ELAS. Seeing what the organization had accomplished in terms of social policies, he became the strategic commander of the ELAS forces in 1942. Sarafis had not started out a KKE-member, although he soon joined On the inter-party relations during the resistance, Sarafis' widow writes in a preface to his memoirs that

...EAM practice...was to promote unity in the liberation struggle by not overstressing party political identities. Everyone was first and foremost a member of EAM, whether on an individual basis or as a

member of one of the EAM parties was to be of no significance... In relation to his general way of thinking there was nothing problematic about his membership so long as KKE was prepared to accommodate - as apparently it was -- his personal, distinctly Utopian version of communism. 17

At the time of EAM's inauguration, its leading communist was George Siantos, who, in a style more characteristic of Gramsci or Togliatti than Stalin, was responsible for the decision to pursue a popular front strategy that would include representatives from all interested political parties and would place a solid emphasis on mass mobilization as a deliberate strategy to gain political legitimacy for EAM/ELAS. There does not appear to be any evidence that this decision was a matter of dispute within the top ranks of the party. In 1943, the KKE publicly announced that it would follow parliamentary methods to achieve political power, thereby formalizing for the record an earlier policy direction. Surely the communist members of EAM also hoped that these strategies would help the KKE achieve power in the post-war era. But this does not signify a priori that its communist leaders were driven solely by political mercantilism. It is more likely that in keeping with the behavior of other 20th-century communists, the Greek leaders were motivated to blend principles of democracy, nationalism and citizenship, taking their own terza via. 11

Secondly, on the eve of the war the KKE was small and relatively weak, compared to its counterpart in Yugoslavia (YCP) which was at the highest point of its power, both in terms of membership and charismatic leadership, since its inception in In the years just prior to the Metaxas dictatorship, the party had had modest success, compared to Venizelos' liberal democrats, in transforming itself into something other than a party of notables. [2] However, during the late 1930s most of its However, during the late 1930s most of its members were out of circulation in the jails of the Metaxas regime. Opposition to the regime was broadly defined and men from a variety of backgrounds were arrested and presumably politicized in jail, but the party was not in any position to pursue ambitiously communist goals and its ties to the Soviet Union were not particularly robust. Although inmates were given secret lessons in Marxist theory by now-exiled leaders, prison censors were particularly vigilant about written or openly "subversive" material and it might be fair to assume that those who were exposed to Marxist thought for the first time did not feel the necessity to pledge formal allegiance to the cause under clandestine circumstances.

On a global dimension, prison terms kept Greek communists from joining their comrades from other countries in the Spanish Civil War. For other communists of the 1930s generation, Spanish terrain served as a proving ground and a place of socialization

through international contacts. Elsewhere the solidarity experienced in Spain had fostered a resilient collective identity, sometimes on a relatively uncritical ideological basis, 123 and had attracted new party recruits. In other countries, national party leaders could buttress their legitimating narratives about Marxist ideology using the Spanish republican cause allegorically. Because ordinary people could readily identify with this fable of good trying valiantly to triumph in the face of overwhelming fascist evil, the Spanish example strengthened communist parties and their leaders' confidence in settings far from Barcelona.

Furthermore, and perhaps most importantly, those prewar KKE leaders who were versed in the tenets of Marxism and who had followed and participated in the Comintern debates during the 1920s and '30s, took the popular front directives of the Third International seriously, probably interpreting the institution of inclusive policies during the resistance as both a justifiable act of compliance and as an expedient course given a still uninitiated mass base. Describing a meeting with KKE leadership in Athens in the spring of 1943, before joining the party ranks himself, Stephanos Sarafis writes

The Communist leaders explained their view that, irrespective of the Party's ideology and long-term objectives, they believed that in Greece the bourgeois revolution had not solved all the bourgeois-democratic problems, and the conditions had not been created in which a socialist programme could be implemented. Consequently, they were aiming at popular democracy which would solve the outstanding bourgeois-democratic problems and prepare the ground for socialism. To arrive at popular democracy with free expression of the popular will, in accordance with EAM's programme, we needed to fight at the side of the allies to achieve liberation and secure our liberties.

Third, the bourgeois backgrounds of EAM's KKE leadership may have contributed to its willingness to play down the idea of proletarian revolution and to support parliamentary strategies. The social origins of its leadership were mixed but in any case exemplified an elite, distinct in trajectory from the segment of the population who "generally knew only their local Greek dialect, dressed in the native attire of the arga and cared little for the frills of Western civilization" ': Phanariot and middle-class Levantine Greek families of Constantinople and Alexandria, former trade union members, wealthy peasants, freelance merchants and small-business owners, civil servants, and lawyers. The shared perspectives and educational priorities may have contributed to a propensity to form alliances with noncommunists in pursuit of nationalist goals, and made them, in Tom Nairn's terms, "a restless middle-class and intellectual

leadership trying to stir up and channel popular class energies into support for new states." 127 Nairn continues,

Nationalism is always the joint product of external pressures and an internal balance of class forces. Most typically it has arisen in societies confronting a dilemma of uneven development - "backwardness" or colonization - where conscious, middle-class elites have sought massive popular mobilization to right the balance. 128

Assuming this shared <u>weltanschauung</u>, one might wager that the rationale for the cooperation of communist and noncommunist leaders alike was a strong but typically vague populist nationalism which welded together an only partially homogeneous coalition during the resistance. For example, the non-communist leaders Svolos and Tsirimokos did not leave the ruling council until 1945, perhaps only then responding to destabilizing tendencies said to have surfaced somewhat before the German evacuation. However, prior to their departure, these men actively advocated for EAM's position at the strategically important wartime conferences in Cairo, Caserta and Lebanon in 1944.

Fourth, throughout the war, the lack of both Soviet and British sympathy with the EAM as a political organization made alliance-seeking a particularly attractive alternative to almost guaranteed marginalization. As one scholar observed, "On important Balkan issues...the Kremlin could be counted on to advocate positions that would benefit the Bulgarian comrades and embarrass the Greeks." Stalin clearly felt the Greeks to be too nationalist. At the Moscow Conference which took place in October, 1944, Stalin's stance toward the Greek communists in EAM became even clearer. At that time, a famous red-line bargain was struck in which Stalin joined Churchill in a crude imperialism that did not augur well for international communist cooperation: Europe was divided into territorial jurisdictions, with 90% of Greece bestowed upon Britain. Churchill's famous comment at the time was, "It's a pity God did not seek our opinion when he built the world." Stalin's reply was, "This was God's first mistake." Moreover, Churchill's well-known conflation of EAM's goals with those of "rabid communism" as well as his desire to counteract the organization's popularity as a threat to his support of the Greek monarchy, ruled the British out as potential allies. Faced with rejection by representatives of the traditional parties, for organizational strategists movement success was predicated on a more conciliatory position regarding broad participation.

Finally, EAM's success in its mass organizing efforts led to more of the same. From 1942-44, encouraged by favorable outcomes in remote villages and as a result of the efforts of the PEEA government in the mountains, national leaders and local

ipefthinoi began to take an even less restricted position with regard to membership. The popular enthusiasm evident in areas dominated by EAM inspired a vision of the expansive capacity of a populist coalition which, in hindsight perhaps naively, included some potentially incompatible bedfellows. After all, EAM had accomplished what the 19th-century parties had not: it had proven "unstoppable in its enterprise of mass mobilization and in its ability to establish structures of effective control, even in areas still under direct German military occupation. KKE and EAM had far outpaced the traditional parties in the art of mass mobilization, showed tremendous potential for power or political predominance through the peaceful democratic process, and therefore threatened to relegate the traditional parties to permanent obsolescence with an effectiveness that the king and Metaxas had failed to achieve." 132

Narratives composed at the top and apparently absorbed by the EAM rank-and-file can be seen, for example, through a textual analysis of the short-lived Athens youth journal Nea Zoi (New In keeping with resistance themes, Nea Zoi's subheading Life). reads: "Zondani Techni--Koinoniki Epistimi--Eklaikeusi" (Living Art/Social Science/Popularization). The poetry and articles on its pages make scant mention of communist doctrine or Soviet symbolism. In fact, a sample of articles reveals a certain bourgeois eclecticism: "The Jewish Greek," "The Constitution and the Unwritten Law of the Greek People," "Franklin Roosevelt" (written by EAM leader Alexander Svolos), "The 250th Anniversary of Voltaire," "Lord George: Elements of Political and Social Biography, and "The French Theatre under Nazi Terrorism" (translated from French). The opening editorial of the first issue, published on March 25, 1945 (Greek Independence Day) points out that

...when the rest of Europe was still in the stone and iron ages...when they were dressing in bearskins, eating wild uncooked meat, Greece was creating her incomparable Parthenon...While Greeks attained the highest levels of culture we were then unknown to the world and to history. But as fate would have it, we didn't stay obscure or unrecognized on the broad horizon of human thought. What else but war could provoke such greatness? Could justify such action? That's why petty squables do not suit us as a nation; we are not an unresourceful, self-pitying PEOPLE. (LAOS) Indeed the poet Sapho speaks the truth when she says that "In the house of the Creative, tears don't belong." On the other hand, neither did our own feuds destroy us, and that indicates...another historical phenomenon: the clashing of our shields any time our Freedom (Eleutheria) is in jeopardy. Freedom, in its broadest sense. Encompassing Freedom of thought, of opinion, of consciousness. And all our other related

Freedoms as a PEOPLE. On these we find ourselves of one mind, hand in hand, our hearts aloft.

b) Organic intellectuals: Toward an evenemential 134 reading of political culture

As I have tried to establish, at the heart of socializing movements is an attempt to reconstruct civil society through deliberate (though sometimes informal) pedagogical means. central role played by radical organizations in promoting civil reconstitution as a "cause" distinguishes socializing movements such as the EAM or the American Civil Rights Movement from those engaged in more frontal, protest-centric forms of collective action, intended to produce immediate outcomes. Hence it is no accident that socializing movements devote considerable time and attention to youthful and otherwise "prepolitical" segments of the population and in turn draw significant support from latent In this process, basic traditional curricula constituents. combined with normative messages about what qualifies as legitimate public sphere behavior, are vital strategic resources. As Antonio Gramsci points out to justify "wars of position" waged by revolutionary parties, success in the fight against hegemonic structures depends upon effective modes of countersocialization.

Earlier I asserted that a combination of psychological antecedents (private, ontological narratives) and dramaturgical factors (public, mobilizational narratives) cause leaders to push movements in particular directions. Given that many nationallevel movements are mobilized initially "from above" rather than materializing spontaneously from a discontented rank-and-file, it strikes me as difficult to fully comprehend the narrative emplotment of specific "big" events without paying close attention to the development of leadership consciousness. also suggested that this view of narrative emplotment is similar to Stone's prosopographic approach, although it has a literary dimension that goes beyond externally observable traits to extrapolate subjective identities created from the raw materials of unconscious thought, self-image, and imagination. Analyzing the transformation of leadership narratives can help to explain why history unfolds in particular ways at particular junctures.

Here we might turn again to political theorist Antonio Gramsci and consider the concept of the "organic intellectuals." Gramsci distinguishes this group as "in general the entire social stratum which exercises an organizational function in the wide sense-whether in the field of production or in that of culture, or in that of political administration." The organic intellectuals play a pre-eminent role "in directing the ideas and aspirations of the class (socio-economic or political) to which they organically belong." For Gramsci, the organic intellectuals constitute a resource pool from which the

leadership of any contemporaneous movement is likely to emerge. Broadly speaking, the organic intellectuals can be understood as a cohort which shares a common exposure to a range of cultural influences; in the course of events, certain organic intellectuals may coalesce into a dominant political generation. Thus, "an age group is transformed into a generation when its members are aware of their uniqueness, feel a sense of solidarity, and join together to become an active force for social and political change." 138

Based on Gramsci's logic, EAM's leadership was a stable coalition of organic intellectuals, or representatives from particular social classes and ideological schools. Accordingly, different political conceptions "were...combined in the same political movement, and even in the ideas of the same person." 139 We have seen that while dominated by members of the Greek communist party (KKE), EAM's ruling council was a popular front composed of the major 19th and early 20th-century tendencies, communist, social democratic, nationalist and liberal. large extent the coalition shared an intellectual history and a consensus regarding the desirability of movement goals. Under emergency conditions, leadership of the EAM movement was a necessarily cooperative enterprise and rank-and-file members were mobilized based on a program condensed from several ideological The EAM -- as a social actor, or in keeping with one tendencies. of our original themes, as a Thucydidean character in its own drama -- sought to define the boundaries and content of Greek nationalism in a way that was congruent with the value systems and political histories of its leadership. Resistance ideology as translated into policy, therefore, bore the various stamps of its leaders' formative experiences.

For obvious reasons, a functional consensus was needed to direct the grass-roots national movement under emergency Later, this spirit of compromise began to give way conditions. to a more tenuous understanding and then outright internecine conflict, especially as the movement was suppressed more emphatically during the "white terror" of the mid- and late The KKE's prewar general secretary Nikos Zachariades returned from a German concentration camp in 1945 and resumed leadership of the party from the generally less-dogmatic George As the civil war progressed, the wartime populist coalition with its expedient tendency toward defactionalization, gave way to more palpable intra-organizational controversy. Among other anti-consensual elements was Zachariades' vision of himself -- his psychological referent in Freeman's terms -- as This position led to his support of Stalin the Greek Stalin. over Tito in 1948 and ultimately to Yugoslavia's decision to close its borders to escaping Democratic Army partisans in 1949, an act which brought about a particularly bitter end to the civil As Vlavianos has written, "Zachariades had dismissed the notion that peaceful evolution in Greece was possible by the time of the Second Plenum, and now led his party to the disaster that the abstention (from the 1946 parliamentary elections) was supposed to have prevented... As Zachariadis himself admitted after the defeat of the KKE in the civil war, the decision to boycott the election was also taken on the grounds that the boycott 'would prepare the people better for the new armed confrontation.' It is not difficult to imagine what this 'better' meant. Blinded by his revolutionary illusions and following textbook instructions, Zachariadis became a prisoner of his own ideology." 140

As we have seen, the KKE was never very prominent in Stalin's own referent narrative. Soviet disinterest in Greek events can be contrasted with Churchill's more blatant regard for Greece as a salient figure in his own allegories of receivership and even classical grandeur; as well as his long-term allegiance to the idea of the Greek king as a cornerstone of British Mediterranean policy. For our purposes, then, the course of the movement, like most, was largely determined by the ontological and mobilizational narratives of the organic intellectuals who initiated and directed it, interacting at various junctures with those of key international actors as well as various structural constraints.

Of course the character of the movement was also contingent upon the ways in which policies inaugurated at an administrative level were absorbed into everyday practice by the membership. is not uncommon for assorted popular reinterpretations to take on lives of their own, which subsequently yield unanticipated consequences. While space does not permit a full exploration of this aspect, it is nevertheless an important consideration in assessing the trajectories of social movements. However, in this case I would argue that, due to the relatively hierarchical structure of social authority in Greece, the membership was not inclined to deviate too widely from policy initiatives set at the Therefore, an understanding of the "human element" or the reasons behind the authoritative decisions of the organic intellectuals who defined the character and direction of the movement is crucial to an empirical grasp of the Greek resistance Approaching political developments in this way as an event. makes it harder to hang one's argument on the uncomplicated models that I have lamented earlier ("communists have only one thing in mind in mobilizing popular movements; and bourgeois liberals another").

c) <u>Sketching the possibilities: Influences on leadership</u> narratives

As bilingual intelligentsias...and above all as early twentieth-century intelligentsias, they had access, inside the classroom and outside, to models of nation, nation-ness, and nationalism distilled from the

turbulent, chaotic experiences of more than a century of American and European history. These models, in turn, helped to give shape to a thousand inchoate dreams. 142

Before concluding, I will attempt to construct a brief (and necessarily speculative) synopsis of the ontologies which the 1940s Greek organic intellectuals would translate into EAM's mobilizational narratives. This is undertaken more to delineate an approach than as an encyclopedic portrayal. What were some of the relevant political, psychological and intellectual reference groups for EAM's leadership? If these now-deceased leaders were to tell a story about their prewar past, how would they emplot such stories? What narrative aspects -- main characters, timing of their entrances, salient role models and incidents, to name a few possibilities -- could then be traced to resistance social policy? In short, what sorts of factors account for the transformation of these individuals as an age-cohort; "born at a similar time...(and) destined to experience a particular set of meaningful events at the same stage of life-cycle development" 143 into a political generation which, through its reformist aspirations and despite its rather dramatic failure, altered the course of Greek social history?

Like all ontological narratives, those associated with the EAM leadership were shaped by a range of correlated political, cultural, and social/psychological influences. I have already noted some of the main components of the communist experience and speculated about some of the reasons behind that party's conciliatory tendencies during the resistance. The Greek communist and noncommunist left had always steered a relatively moderate course, conditioned by a diversity of influences, often marked by idealism, and dedicated more to a nationalist than a reverently-CPSU lineage. In this regard, George Siantos, party general secretary until 1945, and Major-General Stephanos Sarafis, military and strategic head of the ELAS army after 1943, enjoyed wide credibility and were particularly influential.

It is perhaps worth focusing briefly on the case of Sarafis as one of the main architects of resistance social policy. Sarafis, born in 1890, was old enough to be privy to the national humiliation which took place following the 1897 defeat of irredentist forces attempting to recover Byzantine Empire-lands from Turkey. Soon after hostilities broke out, on Easter, the Sarafis family fled Trikala to settle temporarily in a nearby village. Sarafis' narrative includes meeting partisans in the mountains of Thessaly at that time. He writes that "One day I saw some men armed with rifles and crossed cartridge-belts. They had long beards and wore shaggy coats, black tunics and foustanellas. They told us they were guerillas with Capetan Arkouda and had come from Mouzaki to stop the Turks from reaching the mountains. They made a great impression on me and I couldn't

take my eyes off them." 144 One might speculate that these partisans struck a romantic cord in Sarafis and inspired his penchant for soldiering in the service of national mythology.

A further formative influence was the failure of his father's money-lending business. The family fell into poverty, which in a Mediterranean honor/shame society, his British widow writes was "concealed as far as possible from the mocking eyes of a gossip-ridden provincial town...he began to think that a world in which this could happen to his honourable and kindly father and in which some of those who had contributed to his ruin could flourish like the green bay tree was a world without justice. From now on, when he was asked the question usually put to small boys: 'What would you like to be when you grow up?' he would reply rather threateningly that he would be a judge and see justice done." In fact, Sarafis did go on to study law before becoming an army officer and Greek military attache in Paris during the 1930s.

As evidence of Sarafis' continuing preoccupation with social justice and inclusive policy, Marion Sarafis notes in a preface to What Rigas Said by Turkish Mihri Belli (the only non-Greek to have fought in the Democratic Army during the civil war)

Bulgarians, Albanians, Armenians, Greeks, black and white, let us belt the sword all together in a surge for freedom, so the world will know that we are the brave

How often, nearly thirty years ago in Greece, I have awoken to the sound of these strains!...in the whole of this warsong by his 18th century Thessalian compatriot (widely sung in the resistance) his favorite verses were those which called for a common Balkan struggle. Already at our first meeting in 1938 when he was in deportation on the island of Milos under the Metaxas dictatorship, he had spoken to me of Balkan brotherhood and solidarity. This made a deep impression because it was the first time that I had heard such thoughts in Greece. Any mention of other Balkan countries had seemed guarantied to produce stories of "Bulgar-slaying" and "Turk-eating" heroes. I had already realised that the man I had met on Milos would one day do something important for his country. He thought deeply and with constructive originality about his country's problems. He had understood this need for brotherhood from his first army days as an NCO and then as a junior officer...as his thinking matured, he realised that such Balkan quarrels served only the interests of those Great Power "protectors" who were fighting out their differences with Balkan pawns. When in discussions with friends the subject of Turkey or of the "northern neighbors" came up, I would hear him say: "They've got us all boiling in the same pot" and the

implication was clear: it was the Great Powers that were the cooks. 146

This quote accurately suggests that "O Arhigos" ("The General," as he was called) was to a degree unique, although one should not underestimate his desire to reform the behavior of his associates nor his considerable influence on EAM policy.

It is of more general significance that, as part of a cohort which came of political age during the post-1897 era, Sarafis was accustomed to the combination of systemic crisis followed by periods of national self-critique. In this sense, he and the other leaders can be placed in a larger late 19th- and early 20th-century context. Globally, rapid and often sudden social changes, public-sphere power struggles, and debates over collective identities and mass political processes were common features of this period, shaded of course with the specifics of various national histories and environmental contingencies.

In Greece, the typical aftermath of a political crisis was marked by much heated debate in the popular press about how state-society relations were to be structured and broader questions of nation-building resolved. These episodes often turned polemical, with the sides glaring at one another across an ideological divide made less bridgeable by an honor/shame culture. Subtextually, the honor/shame complex, such that "social acceptance is impossible in the absence of unspoiled honour," 147 was central to any popular intellectual forum, even those in which larger questions of national identity were This was never more true than in the case of the post-1897 crisis, when a decisive setback for the irredentist solution to problems of national integration caused a round of soul-searching. For a sizable segment of nationalists concerned with issues of state-craft and the instrumental reform of civil society, a significant thrust of this period of self-exploration involved the "face" Greece was showing to the world.

Again, not atypically for aspiring 19th-and 20th-century nationalists from non-core states, the "West" had been constructed as an exemplar of Cartesian rationality and a standard by which "progress," or the lack thereof, was measured. (Difficult to classify, Greece is best described as part of the semiperiphery, to continue the Wallersteinian analogy.) This at times submerged and at times communal self-criticism took place on a number of dimensions: the merit of existing economic structures, the persistence of "folkloric" culture, popular educational attainment, "balance" in political institutions and activities, and in the midst of the 19th-century European imperialist/orientalist overlay, how people looked and dressed as a matter for symbolic concern. As was the case more generally in western and eastern Europe and the Balkans, at the same time that indigenous folkloric traditions were being

recaptured and celebrated as valuable popular cultural expressions by romanticists, these traditions were also seen by some as alarmingly parochial. In the wake of the 1897 defeat, to those nationalists distressed by a perceived "backwardness" that continually seemed to obstruct civil society on its path toward Enlightenment goals, augmented by a general anxiety about exposure to ridicule by the world community based on various stereotypes and "deficiencies," the notion that Greece might visibly fail in both the international and domestic arenas seemed an affront to a national code of honor.

As a nation at a geographical and historical crossroads, Greece's binary orientation toward both "East" and "West" was definitive and yet difficult to reconcile. Clearly, Greek national identity was double-sided; on the one hand, there was the Egyptian/Byzantine/orthodox religious/Ottoman legacy, a source of both pride and contempt; on the other, a European connection which among intellectuals combined a keen interest in the ideas of the philosophes with the repackaging and reimportation of the idea that "the ancestors of the modern Greeks possessed those characteristics of perfection in thought, art and literature which were so highly prized at the time. mattered not if the picture of the classical age that Europeans created for themselves was faulted by time and their own contemporary views. The images were satisfying and the form well set by the time the modern Greeks began to make use of these notions for their own purposes." 149 This view of the Greeks as original, undiluted Europeans is what Martin Bernal has called the "Aryan Model."

The political significance of a dualist mentalite for Greek organic intellectuals throughout the modern period cannot be underestimated. This was as true for the communists and socialists of political society as for liberals, centrists and conservatives. Here, certain figures whose works had caught the attention and imagination of educated Greeks across the political spectrum defined the terms of this Janus-faced discourse. antecedents in this dialogue were Righas Velestinlis, author of Sarafis' favorite Thourios war song (1757-1798); Adamantios Koraes (1748-1833), who from Parisian exile "edited the Greek classics in a series called the Greek Library, prefacing them with critical introductions, which he hoped would give his countrymen a proper understanding of their classical heritage; " 151 and Dionysos Solomos, poet of the revolution who penned the lyrics for the Greek national anthem. Subsequent historical narrators to which 20th-century organic intellectuals had varying degrees of exposure were nationalists Ion Dragoumis and Perikles Giannopoulos; and Iannis Psyharis, George Skliros, Penelope Delta, Alexander Delmouzos and Kostis Palamas. In my estimation the latter group, salient figures in the demotic movement, had the most directly traceable effect on the development and transformation of the EAM leadership as a whole. Since as stated earlier, this essay is not the place for a comprehensive discussion of intellectual mentorship, these names represent what one might call a "lowest-common-denominator" reference group.

While irredentist nationalism and its converse, defensive nationalism, were linked in different ways to external aggression, the demotic movement, like the political nationalism I want to argue it transformed into during the resistance, focused its energies on an internal agenda. Externally—and internally—oriented nationalisms had been complementary elements in the minds of influential reformers long before the Nazi occupation. As Iannis Psyharis, a leader of the demotic movement commented, "A nation, in order to become a nation needs two things; its frontiers must be expanded and it must produce its own literature." 152

The other historically-significant dualism, in addition to the East/West dichotomy, was ostensibly linguistic; in reality, it was more about the politics of exclusion and inclusion, as a dialogic interaction between elite and subaltern. The demotic movement was formed around the so-called "Language Question." Much of the controversy surrounding the language question was played out on the pages of the journal O Noumas, which most politically-active individuals read, as well as in popular newspapers. These debates happened at a formative stage in the political thinking of the EAM leadership. The key issue was the problem of diglossia, or a two-tiered language structure. form, katharevousa, or a "pure," stilted Greek forged from ancient and Byzantine religious elements and accessible only to a highly-educated elite, competed with demotic, or the less-adorned version used in everyday speech by the majority of the population. Demoticists argued that the one thing that could and deserved to unite the nation was its language and this should be the language spoken by "the people." Demotic Greek, members of the broadly-based Educational Society felt, should be the language of classroom instruction for future citizens as well as the medium of communication between the State and civil society. Debate in O Noumas was open to supporters of the demoticist cause regardless of political persuasion. Both "bourgeois nationalists" like Dragoumis and socialists like George who felt that demoticist doctrine could serve the Skliros, needs of the working-class, participated in defining the movement's position. Much of the EAM's educational policy and its decision to institute demotic as the official resistance language to be used in all communications can be traced to the participation of demoticists in EAM. In part, the ease with which EAM's "radical" social policies were agreed upon by a leadership with divergent tendencies was the result of this early inclusive intellectual "collaboration." Not accidentally, one of the most cohesive incidents of the resistance period was the death of demoticist poet Kostis Palamas in 1943. Huge crowds turned out on the streets of Athens for his funeral in covert

support of EAM. Palamas' position that art and poetry could be used constructively to ignite national pride and spirit was very much in keeping with both an ancient narrative tradition and the socializing goals of EAM. The use of mobilizing narratives to convey a social message of inclusion is expressed in the work-turned into organizing song lyrics-- of such poets as the aforementioned Sofia Mavroeidi-Papadaki and Vassilis Rotas, Government of the Mountains (PEEA) Minister of Culture and director of the Resistance Theatre.

All this talk of inclusion should not be taken to mean that the framers of EAM's <u>ordine nuovo</u> (in practical terms, a necessarily hasty production) were entirely successful in implementing radical goals during the brief period from 1941-44, or indeed that the group was wholly realistic about their chances for reconstructing civil society. The argument I want to make here is that in its zeal to propel Greece into what was viewed as an enlightened future, this short-lived regime was able to make striking, counterintuitive changes, of the sort that can only be discerned through an initially more inductive, narrative approach to historical analysis. At the same time that one must take great care not to sweep revolutionary deficiencies and activist dilemmas under the proverbial carpet, it is important not to dismiss the power of unfolding events for participant-authors based on anachronistic, present-day radical expectations.

The case within a case of EAM's efforts to mobilize women might serve as a final example. One might logically assume, along with the editors of a recent volume on women in war, that "the organic discourse of wartime patriotism, with its emphasis on national solidarity, discouraged expressions of women's rights and needs, labelling them selfish, divisive, or even treasonous." 154 The following story told by Marion Sarafis about her husband's 1950s parliamentary campaign would also sustain the position that advances in women's status during wartime are The couple had been invited to dinner at the house of illusory. a man who had been an important EAM/ELAS leader in Salonica, Mr. His wife and daughter, "and his daughter was even a qualified lawyer," served the meal and then instead of sitting down at the table with them, retired to the kitchen. "Well the first time I experienced that in his house, I found it highly embarrassing. felt awful sitting down at table and these women, not!" The next time the couple went to dinner, the women sat down to eat with "Yes, well I think Sarafis had said something to them, this shocks me and it shocks my English wife! This'll never do!! Or something along those lines. He was an elderly man so I don't think the resistance had changed him in any basic way."

However, the following testifies to the plausibility of another narrative; not unusual, I would argue, nor necessarily incompatible with the above statement. Typically enough, the EAM's success in its mass resocialization efforts was uneven, and

indeed, social change is by nature multifaceted. A then 37-year-old woman from the Peloponnese recalls:

Look. Without the resistance, a nothing I would have been. Eh--I was a teacher, but I can honestly say that without the ideals of the resistance I would have been nothing. I mean, I would have continued as a teacher, and let's say, a good teacher, going from village to village in that area of the Peloponnese. But the resistance gave us wings. (mas edose phtera) It gave me a perspective on the world, and I realized that Greece wasn't the center of the world; our area wasn't the center of Greece; and our problems were part of something greater. It opened our eyes to things like justice, and the equality of women, some women learned to read and write and we talked for the first time about the problems of equality.

There is little doubt that women's mobilization during wartime is often a bitter experience, offering no lasting solutions to problems of sexual asymmetry. But unless the woman speaking above is greatly deluding herself, sections like this one in her narrative and those of other participant—authors appear to indicate that something noteworthy occurred which can be traced, not to spontaneous action, but rather to specific resocializing messages conveyed from the top ranks of the organization to the membership.

Although space does not permit a detailed analysis, several types of factors might have influenced the emplotment of the ontological turned mobilizational narratives of EAM leaders on "the Woman Question," inspiring them to initiate comparatively radical women's policies. Three are, it seems to me, of primary importance: relationships with female relatives; exposure to socialist and bourgeois women's movement campaigns; and female characterizations in favorite literature. A fourth factor might involve "random incidents" which retrospectively become significant experiential turning points.

In sum, however much this seemingly anomalous case must be treated on its own terms, there are elements in the words of the participant-authors which would not be unfamiliar to other female participants in popular movements. Similarly, disregarding for a moment the specific content, a close reading of populist leadership narratives in other contexts where such data are available may reveal certain affinities across cases; or more meaningfully, may yield a more nuanced picture of the sorts of motivations that shape the course of specific events.

Conclusion

This paper has been concerned with the role of the narrative form in political transformations, using the case of the Greek resistance movement and its main organization, the EAM, as an illustration of the possible roles that narrative might play. The paper has tried to suggest two roles for narrative: as a methodological tool in understanding the details and patterns of particular cases and as a way that collective actors adapt, share, and make sense of their political identities. reading -- indeed the deconstruction of -- the ontologies behind the narratives of particular political groups whether active or latent can reveal much about the character of political movements and the appeal that certain political alternatives hold for participant-authors. In terms of mass political mobilizations, a sensitivity to what messages are being sent by leaders and what messages are being received and assimilated by followers is advocated. The effort to fathom the story that people think they're telling about political events and experiences makes it unnecessary to rely on assumptions about political motivations that are convenient but not always accurate. A close reading of narratives enables the researcher to detect changes in participant-authors' perceptions of themselves as political beings as well as macro-level transformations in the hegemonic political ideologies of their societies. A related point is that for historical works to be fully understood and utilized as accumulated wisdom which then might enhance particular bodies of literature, a recognition of the allegorical content of participant accounts ought to be combined with a similar understanding of the narrative dimensions of what literary critics call the "fabula" of the social historian's tale.

A final point which it seems to me cannot be made too forcefully, is that from a narrative point of view, there are no anomalous cases, only those which are in some respects surprising or in some ways paradoxical. It seems to me that the job of the comparative social historian is to determine what the mix of factors is; it is not to produce the type of grand theory that seeks to predict, with hubristic certainty, what given certain pre-conditions had to or will always happen. According to this logic, if social actors don't behave in known, recognizable, immediately aggregatable ways, the case becomes a victim of conceptual marginalization. Rather, and I am certainly not alone in taking this position, a less ambitious kind of theorybuilding based on less totalizing expectations might bear fruit of a more reliable quality. Using multi-narrative technology to make sense of specific events or crises, set in context by careful historical periodizations, seems to me to be one way of addressing the variable dimensions of cases which appear puzzling when approached with static models.

- 1. Joseph Campbell, <u>The Power of Myth</u>, Doubleday , New York, 1988, p. 135.
- 2. Elisabeth Young-Bruehl, "Hannah Arendt's Storytelling," <u>Social</u> Research, Vol. 44, No. 1, Spring 1977, p. 184.
- 3. W. Robert Connor, <u>Thucydides</u>, Princeton University Press, Princeton, N.J., 1984, p. 29.
- 4. Connor, Ibid, p. 53.
- 5. Hayden White, <u>The Content of the Form: Narrative Discourse and Historical Representation</u>, The Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, MD, 1987, p. 21.
- 6. Connor, p. 28.
- 7. "(Herodotus) was only repeating what every Greek knew: that the power of Zeus is manifested in the thunderbolt, that of Poseidon in the earthquake, that of Apollo in the pestilence, and that of Aphrodite in the passion that destroyed at once the pride of Phaedra and the chastity of Hippolytus." R.G. Collingwood, The Idea of History, Oxford University Press, New York, 1956, p. 22. For an interesting discussion of Boccaccio's parallel role as popular scribe in the medieval Italian context, see Francesco De Sanctis' essay "Boccaccio and the Human Comedy," in The Decameron of Giovanni Boccaccio: A Norton Critical Edition, W.W. Norton & Co., New York, 1977, pp. 216-229.
- 8. Walter J. Ong, <u>Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the</u> Word, Methuen Press, New York, 1982, p. 140.
- 9. Fredric Jameson, The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, N.Y., 1981. Also see Stuart Hall, "Encoding/decoding," in Culture, Media, Language, Edited by Stuart Hall, Dorothy Hobson, Andrew Lowe and Paul Willis, Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies, University of Birmingham, Hutchinson, London, 1984, pp. 128-138.
- 10. Collingwood, p. 18.
- 11. Bruno Bettelheim discusses the role of fairy tales in childhood socialization and the acquisition of adult values in The Uses of Enchantment: The Meaning and Importance of Fairy Tales, Vintage Books Edition, New York, 1989. However, Bettelheim does distinguish between myths, whose endings he notes are usually tragic, and fairy tales, which more often than not end happily. Drawing heavily upon the work of Mircea Eliade, Bettelheim also emphasizes the superego wrestling with "idmotivated action and the self-preserving desires of the ego" (p. 37) as the pivotal character in mythical drama. Another interesting discussion of the authoritative construction of

- childhood can be found in the essays by Gil Frith, Carolyn Steedman, and Valerie Walkerdine in <u>Language</u>, <u>Gender and Childhood</u>, edited by Carolyn Steedman, Cathy Urwin, and Valerie Walkerdine, Routledge & Kegan Paul, Boston, 1985.
- 12. See Margaret Alexiou, "Sons, Wives and Mothers: Reality and Fantasy in Some Modern Greek Ballads," <u>Journal of Modern Greek Studies</u>, Special Issue "Women and Men in Greece: A Society in Transition," Vol. 1, No. 1, May 1983, pp. 73-111. Also Marcel Detienne, <u>Dionysus Slain</u>, Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, 1979 and Roderick M. Beaton, <u>Folk Poetry of Modern Greece</u>, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1980.
- 13. See for example John E. Rexine, "The Classical Tradition in the Poetry of George Seferis," <u>Indiana Social Studies Quarterly</u>, Vol. XXXII, No. 1, Spring 1979, pp. 28-42.
- 14. Angelos Sikelianos: Selected Poems, translated and introduced by Edmund Keeley and Philip Sherrard, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1979, p. 99. "The Sacred Way is the ancient road by which the great Iakchos procession went from Athens to Eleusis for the celebration of the Eleusinian Mysteries," (p.145) religious rites of the seasons dramatizing the descent of Persephone into the underworld.
- 15. Andreas I. Psomas, <u>The Nation</u>, the <u>State</u>, and the <u>International System</u>: <u>The Case of Modern Greece</u>, <u>The National Center for Social Science Research</u>, <u>Athens</u>, 1978, p. 21.
- 16. See Kallistos Ware, "The Church: A Time of Transition," pp. 208-227 and J.K. Campbell, "Traditional Values and Continuities in Greek Society," pp. 184-207 in <u>Greece in the 1980s</u>, edited by Richard Clogg, Macmillan in association with the Centre of Contemporary Greek Studies, King's College, University of London, London, 1983. Other important discussions of the role of religion in present-day Greek life are by Juliet Du Boulay, "Women--Images of Their Nature and Destiny in Rural Greece," pp. 139-168, and Anna Caraveli, "The Bitter Wounding: The Lament as Social Protest in Rural Greece," pp. 169-194 in <u>Gender and Power in Rural Greece</u>, edited by Jill Dubisch, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1986.
- 17. The definition of "frame of reference" is relevant here: "a set or system of ideas, as of philosophical or religious doctrine, in terms of which other ideas are interpreted or assigned meaning." The American Heritage Dictionary, Houghton-Mifflin Co., New York, 1982, 1985. For a pathbreaking sociological use of the term see Erving Goffman, Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience, Northeastern University Press, Boston, 1974.

- 18. David Snow and Robert Benford, "Ideology, Frame Resonance, and Participant Mobilization," in <u>From Structure to Action:</u>
 <u>Comparing Social Movement Research Across Cultures</u>, Edited by Bert Klandermans, Hanspeter Kriesi, and Sidney Tarrow, International Social Movement Research, Volume 1, JAI Press, Greenwich, CT, 1988, p. 214.3f.
- 19. Like the ancient Greeks themselves, the origins of narrative as a form of explanation and as an educational tool in the "lifecourse curriculum" may lie in the afro-asiatic roots of Greek civilization. Recently, Martin Bernal has argued that exclusionary conceptions of 18th and 19th-century European scholars motivated them to substitute what they saw as a more palatable model of the origins of European civilization by denying that the ancient Greeks had migrated from Phoenician trading cities to the east and Egyptian settlements to the south. Instead, the ancient Hellenes were theorized to have been Aryan invaders from the north. The notion that classical Greeks may not have been Caucasians but rather the descendants of North Africans and Jews called for the immediate bleaching of the 18th and 19th-century images of the ancient Greeks as well as, for example, the Egyptian pharaohs. (See Martin Bernal, Black Athena: The Afroasiatic Roots of Classical Civilization, Rutgers University Press, New Brunswick, 1988). Similarly, the 18th and 19th-centuries witnessed the birth and privileging of so-called "realist" forms of explanation over narrative, which was considered to be a less scientific and therefore inferior representational mode. In the racist environment of 19th-century Europe, then, narrative was no doubt initially derided because of its association with peoples assumed to have "lesser cranial capacities," and continued as part of what Bernal describes as "the European conceit that only Europeans can think analytically." (p. 404) A casualty of this formative period in academic discourse, augmented by important 20th-century additions such as quantitative positivism, was that narrative as explanation became the irrational opposite of scientific history, and was considered to be of little inherent value. Cartesian legacy is still apparent. For example, Lawrence Stone notes that in recent years, "a significant number of the bestknown exponents of the 'new history' are now turning back to the once despised narrative mode. And yet historians -- and even publishers -- still seem a little embarrassed when they do so." (Lawrence Stone, "The Revival of Narrative: Reflections on a New Old History," Past and Present 85, 1979, p. 15). Also see Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography, edited by James Clifford and George E. Marcus, University of California Press, Berkeley, 1986, especially Clifford, "Introduction: Partial Truths," (1-26) and "On Ethnographic Allegory," (98-121).
- 20. Some recent examples are William F.S. Miles, "The Rally as Ritual: Dramaturgical Politics in Nigerian Hausaland," Comparative Politics, April 1989, pp. 323-338; Lila Abu-Lughod,

Veiled Sentiments, University of California Press, Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1986; and John R. Bowen, "Narrative Form and Political Incorporation: Changing Uses of History in Aceh, Indonesia," Comparative Studies in Society and History, Vol. 31, No. 4, October 1989, pp. 671-693. Also the "classic" Selected Subaltern Studies, edited by Ranajit Guha and Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Oxford University Press, New York, 1988, notably Ranajit Guha ("On Some Aspects of the Historiography of Colonial India" and "The Prose of Counter-Insurgency") and Shahid Amin ("Ghandi as Mahatma").

- 21. C. Wright Mills, <u>The Sociological Imagination</u>, Oxford University Press, New York, 1959, p. 11.
- 22. Without meaning to lump together writings which differ in other respects, I refer here to the philosophers, social critics and cultural historians who were part of or in some sense in dialogue with the Annales school, such as Lucien Febvre, Marc Bloch, Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie, Robert Darnton, Michel Foucault, Pierre Bourdieu, Roland Barthes, and Paul Ricoeur. White's Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe, Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, 1973 is an obvious example of this genre of historical deconstruction, as is Joan Scott's Gender and the Politics of History, Columbia University Press, 1988. For an incisive discussion of historians' narratives see Renato Rosaldo, Culture and Truth: The Remaking of Social Analysis, Beacon Press, Boston, 1989, especially pp. 127-143. Also articles published during an approximately 10-year span in <u>History Workshop Journal</u>, such as Luisa Passerini, "Work Ideology and Consensus under Italian Fascism," HW 8, Autumn, 1979 (84-108); Hugh Cunningham, "The Language of Patriotism, 1750-1914," HW 12, Autumn 1981 (8-33); Karl Figlio, "Oral History and the Unconscious," HW 26, Autumn 1988 (120-132); Gianna Pomata, "Versions of Narrative: Overt and Covert Narrators in Nineteenth Century Historiography," HW 27, Spring 1989 (1-17); Peter Schöttler, "Historians and Discourse Analysis," HW 27, Spring 1989 (37-65). A comparative study of how reviewers interpret literary narrative for client publics is Wendy Griswold, "The Fabrication of Meaning: Literary Interpretation in the United States, Great Britain, and the West Indies," American Journal of Sociology, Vol. 92, No. 5, March 1987, pp. 1077-1117.
- 23. For example see Raymond Williams, Culture and Society: 1780-1950 (1958) Columbia University Press, New York, 1983 and The Country and the City, Oxford University Press, New York, 1973. Also Bernal, Op.Cit.; Gayatri Spivak, In Other Worlds: Essays in Cultural Politics, Methuen Books, New York, 1987; Joan Kelly-Gadol, "The Social Relation of the Sexes: Methodological Implications of Women's History," in Feminism and Methodology, edited by Sandra Harding, Indiana University Press, Bloomington, 1987, pp. 15-28 and Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, editors,

- The Invention of Tradition, Cambridge University Press, New York, 1983.
- 24. Prominent examples are Envelopes of Sound: Six Practitioners Discuss the Method, Theory and Practice of Oral History and Oral Testimony, edited by Ronald J. Grele, Precedent Publishing, Chicago, 1975; Paul Thompson, The Voice of the Past: Oral History, Oxford University Press, 1978; Biography and Society: The Life History Approach in the Social Sciences, edited by Daniel Bertaux, Sage Publications, 1981; Luisa Passerini, Fascism in Popular Memory: The Cultural Experience of the Turin Working Class, Cambridge University Press, New York, 1987; Interpreting Women's Lives: Feminist Theory and Personal Narratives, edited by the Personal Narratives Group, Indiana University Press, Bloomington, 1989. An exemplary use of oral testimonies is Bonnie Thornton Dill, "'Making Your Job Good Yourself': Domestic Service and the Construction of Personal Dignity," Women and the Politics of Empowerment, edited by Ann Bookman and Sandra Morgen, Temple University Press, Philadelphia, 1988, pp. 33-52.
- 25: For example, Selected Subaltern Studies, Op.Cit.; Natalie Zemon Davis, Fiction in the Archives: Pardon Tales and Their Tellers in Sixteenth-Century France, Stanford University Press, Stanford, 1987; and Alessandro Portelli, The Death of Luigi Trastulli and Other Stories: Form and Meaning in Oral History, State University of New York Press, Albany, 1991. Also, the following works more or less explicitly take narrative as a modus operandi: E.P. Thompson, The Making of the English Working Class, Vintage Books, New York, 1966; William H. Sewell, Jr., Work and Revolution in France: The Language of Labor from the Old Regime to 1848, Cambridge University Press, 1980; Gareth Stedman Jones, Languages of class: Studies in English working class history, 1832-1982, Cambridge University Press, 1983. Iain Chambers also takes a narrative approach in "Narratives of Nationalism: Being 'British'" New Formations 7, Spring 1989, pp. 88-103. interesting discussion of shifts in the collective linguistics of protest can be found in Peter Burke, "Languages and antilanguages in early modern Italy," History Workshop 11, Spring 1981, pp. 24-32.
- 26. The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays by M.M. Bakhtin, edited by Michael Holquist, University of Texas Press, Austin, 1981, p. 314.
- 27. For example see Peter Stallybrass and Allon White, <u>The Politics and Poetics of Transgression</u>, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, 1986.
- 28. Agnes Hankiss writes insightfully that "The image of the self is never just a simple reflection of the experiences related to the self: it always includes a specific response to the 'Why' of the development of the self. Everyone

builds his or her own theory about the history and the course of his or her life by attempting to classify his or her particular successes and fortunes, gifts and choices, favourable and unfavourable elements of his or her fate according to a coherent, explanatory principle and to incorporate them within a historical In other words, everybody tries, in one way or another, to build up his or her own ontology. Specific mechanisms are involved in this building process. Human memory selects, emphasizes, rearranges and gives new colour to everything that happened in reality; and, more important, it endows certain fundamental episodes with a symbolic meaning, often to the point of turning them almost into myths, by locating them at a focal point of the explanatory system of the self." (p. 203) Hankiss confines her analysis to individual life histories whereas I find the ontological dimension instructive at the group level as well. Furthermore, because Hankiss is talking specifically about the analysis of life-histories she quite rightly emphasizes memory. See Agnes Hankiss, "Ontologies of the Self: On the Mythological Rearranging of One's Life-History," in Bertaux, Biography and Society: The Life History Approach in the Social Sciences, Op.Cit., pp. 203-209.

- 29. Hayden White, <u>Metahistory</u>, p. 7. A good general text on narrative emplotment containing precise definitions and many possible but as yet unexploited socio-historical uses is <u>Mieke Bal's Narratology</u>: <u>Introduction to the Theory of Narrative</u>, University of Toronto Press, Toronto, 1985.
- 30. White, Ibid, p. 7.
- 31. See Clifford, "On Ethnographic Allegory," Op. Cit.
- 32. Although two of the better known writers on narrative and social history, Hayden White and Fredric Jameson, concentrate on classical social theorists and writers of literary texts respectively. See Hayden White, Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe, The Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore & London, 1973; and Fredric Jameson, The Political Unconscious, Op.Cit.
- 33. Hankiss, Op.Cit., p. 203.
- 34. Jo Freeman, "A Model for Analyzing the Strategic Options of Social Movement Organizations," in Jo Freeman, Editor, <u>Social Movements of the Sixties and Seventies</u>, Longman Publishers, New York, 1983, p. 201.
- 35. James C. Scott examines narratives as catalysts to more subtle forms of action in <u>Domination and the Arts of Resistance:</u> <u>Hidden Transcripts</u>, Yale University Press, New Haven, 1990.

- 36. Svetozar Vukmanovic, <u>How and Why the People's Liberation</u>
 Struggle of Greece Met With Defeat, first published in the U.K.,
 1950, Merlin Press edition, London, 1985.
- 37. Ira Katznelson, "Working-Class Formation: Constructing Cases and Comparisons, "pg. 34, in reference to chapter by William H. Sewell, Jr., "Artisans, Factory Workers and the Formation of the French Working Class, 1789-1848," Working-Class Formation: Nineteenth-Century Patterns in Western Europe and the United States, Edited by Ira Katznelson and Aristide R. Zolberg, Princeton University Press, 1986. Katznelson and Zolberg have been criticized for their mechanical and overdetermined treatment of working-class consciousness formation in spite of their original goal to offer a more differentiated perspective, an appraisal which I share. However, it has also been asserted that the volume's contributors do in fact take us closer to a humbler, more inductive consideration of the salient discursive themes of political consciousness formation. See Margaret Ramsay Somers, "Workers of the World, Compare!" Contemporary Sociology, Vol. 18, No. 3, May 1989, pp. 325-329.
- 38. See Claus Offe's discussion, "New Social Movements: Challenging the Boundaries of Institutional Politics," Social Research, Vol. 52, No. 4, Winter 1985, pp. 817-868. While Offe, following Marx, distinguishes the two types of motivation (an sich and für sich), definitely a sound analytic starting point, he also tends to equate the former with a postmodern participant generation and the latter with an "older" pre-war, materialist generation, instead of leaving these questions open to empirical, case-by-case scholarly evaluation. In considering relevant issues such as who potential allies in contemporary scenaria might be, however, Offe provides a much subtler treatment than is usual in the so-called "new social movements" literature.
- 39. See Franco Lo Piparo on the prestige theory of language in Gramsci's prison notebooks in <u>Antonio Gramsci</u>: <u>Selections From Cultural Writings</u>, Edited by David Forgacs and Geoffrey Nowell-Smith, Lawrence and Wishart, London, 1985, chapter V entitled "Language, Linguistics and Folklore," pp. 164-195.
- 40. See for example, Geoff Eley, "Labor History, Social History, Altagsgeschichte: Experience, Culture, and the Politics of the Everyday -- a New Direction for German Social History?" Journal of Modern History 61, June 1989, pp. 297-343.
- 41. A particularly evocative if for some overly technical label for mobilizational narrative as praxis is Gayatri Spivak's "strategic essentialism." For example see The Post-Colonial Critic: Interviews, Strategies, Dialogues, edited by Sarah Harasym, Routledge, New York, 1990, pp. 11-13.

- 42. Jurgen Habermas, "The Public Sphere: An Encyclopedia Article (1964)," reprinted in New German Critique 3, 1974, p. 49.
- My favorite definitions are Alberto Melucci's: a social movement "not only reveals the presence of a conflict; it pushes it beyond the limits of compatibility with the system in question, i.e. it breaks the rules of the game, puts forward non-negotiable objectives, questions the legitimacy of power, and so forth"; a political movement "expresses a conflict through the rupture of the boundaries of the political system. It fights for the widening of political participation and struggles against the prevalence of the ruling interests within the representative systems." Alberto Melucci, "Ten hypotheses for the analysis of new movements," in Contemporary Italian Sociology: A Reader, edited by Diana Pinto, Cambridge University Press, 1981, pp. 176-177.
- 44. For example: "There comes a time that people get tired," says Martin Luther King in his Monday night speech to bus boycotters in Montgomery. "We are here this evening to say to those who have mistreated us so long that we are tired--tired of being segregated and humiliated; tired of being kicked about by the brutal feet of oppression..." Juan Williams, Eyes On The Prize: America's Civil Rights Years, 1954-1965, Viking Penguin, New York, 1987, p. 76.
- 45. Thomas S. Kuhn, <u>The Structure of Scientific Revolutions</u>, the University of Chicago Press, 1970, p. 5.
- 46. Clifford, p. 11. I choose to ignore Clifford's unfortunate discounting of "feminist ethnographers" further on in the essay, which mars an otherwise worthwhile analysis.
- 47. University of Michigan Comparative Study of Social Transformations (CSST) Seminar, "A Panel Discussion of Recent Events in China," November 2, 1989. Obviously, the irony is that philosophically modernization theory was rooted in American coldwar imperialism and was intensely anti-communist. A classic in this regard is Alex Inkeles, "National Character and Modern Political Systems," in Political Anthropology, Edited by Francis L.K. Hsu, Schenkman Publishers, 1972.
- 48. Lynne Wozniak, "Industrial Restructuring and Political Protest in Socialist Spain," doctoral dissertation, Government Department, Cornell University, 1991.
- 49. William H. Sewell, Jr., "Labor History, Uneven Development, and the Autonomy of Politics: The Dockworkers of Nineteenth-Century Marseille," Center for Research on Social Organization, Working Paper Series, July 1987, p. 1.

- 50. Here the example of Gandhi and the leaders of the National Congress Party on the one hand, and the receptivity of the Indians who joined the nationalist movement to appeals such as civil disobedience, the Salt March of 1930 and the Homespun Campaign comes to mind. For an important discussion of the biographical significance of "feelings" see Renato Rosaldo, Culture and Truth, Op.Cit., and "Feeling History: Reflections on the Western Culture Controversy," paper presented at "The Historic Turn in the Human Sciences" Conference, University of Michigan, October 1990. Continuing scholarly ambivalence about the significance of emotion in narrative is examined in Peter Middleton, "Vanishing Affects: The Disappearance of Emotion From Postmodernist Theory and Practice," New Formations, no. 12, Winter 1990, pp. 125-142.
- 51. This approach shares similarities with "network" or "relational" analysis (for example, see Somers, Op.Cit., pg. 329) and "evenemential" strategies (see William H. Sewell, Jr., "Three Temporalities: Toward A Sociology of the Event," paper presented at "The Historic Turn in the Human Sciences" Conference at the University of Michigan, October, 1990, forthcoming in Terrence J. McDonald, ed., The Historic Turn in the Human Sciences.)
- 52. Greek translation: "face-writing."
- 53. Lawrence Stone, "Prosopography," in <u>The Past and Present Revisited</u>, Routledge and Kegan Paul, New York, 1987, pp. 45-46, emphases mine.
- 54. Raymond Williams, <u>The Long Revolution</u>, Columbia University Press, New York, 1961, pp. 48-71; <u>Marxism and Literature</u>, Oxford University Press, New York, 1977, pp. 128-135. Also see Roland Barthes, <u>Mythologies</u>, The Noonday Press, New York, 1972 Translation.
- 55. For example, Robert Wohl, The Generation of 1914, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1979; Political Learning in Adulthood: A Sourcebook of Theory and Research, edited by Roberta S. Sigel, University of Chicago Press, 1989; Catherine R. Simpson, "Female Insubordination and the Text," in Women in Culture and Politics: A Century of Change, edited by Judith Friedlander et al, Indiana University Press, Bloomington, 1986, pp. 164-176; George Orwell, Homage to Catalonia, Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1952.
- 56. Randall Collins, "Searching for the Structure of the Sixties," <u>Contemporary Sociology</u>, Vol. 17, No. 6, November 1988, p. 729. Along these lines, also see Todd Gitlin, <u>The Sixties: Years of Hope, Days of Rage</u>, Bantam Books, New York, 1987, and Doug McAdam, <u>Freedom Summer</u>, Oxford University Press, New York, 1988.

- 57. C. Wright Mills, <u>The Sociological Imagination</u>, op.cit., pg. 5.
- 58. See Paul Zumthor, <u>Oral Poetry: An Introduction</u>, University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, 1990; and Barbara Harlow, Resistance Literature, Methuen, New York, 1987.
- 59. An interesting discussion in this regard is Eric Hobsbawm, "Man and Woman in Socialist Iconography," <u>History Workshop</u> 6, Autumn 1978, pp. 121-138; and Maurice Agulhon, "On Political Allegory: a reply to Eric Hobsbawm," <u>HW</u> 8, Autumn 1979, pp. 167-173.
- 60. Ironically, there is some disagreement even among philosophers of science as to whether the narratives of historical protagonists are sufficiently detached from the experiences that produced them to provide reliable data without the foresighted intervention of the "omniscient" historian. See Rosaldo's discussion of Paul Ricoeur in Culture and Truth, Op.Cit., pp. 135-136. An additional point is that in order to use narratives to enrich analysis, the social historian must begin with a certain measure of faith in the integrity and mental health of informants.
- 61. For example, Bernal notes in the introduction of what is an essentially narrative analysis: "In these volumes I cannot, and therefore do not attempt to, <u>prove</u> that the Aryan Model is 'wrong'. All I am trying to do is to show that it is less plausible than the Revised Ancient Model and that the latter provides a more fruitful framework for future research." (p.8-9)
- 62. See Doug McAdam, Political Process and the Development of Black Insurgency, 1930-1970, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1982, pp. 40-43. McAdam states that "(t)he point is that any event or broad social process that serves to undermine the calculations and assumptions on which the political establishment is structured occasions a shift in political opportunities. Among the events and processes likely to prove disruptive of the political status quo are wars, industrialization, international political realignments, prolonged unemployment, and widespread demographic changes." (p. 41)
- 63. Jurgen Habermas, <u>Legitimation Crisis</u>, Beacon Press, Boston, 1975, p. 25.
- 64. C.M. Woodhouse, <u>The Apple of Discord</u>, W.B. O'Neill, 1985 edition, p. 146.
- 65. John Keane, ed., <u>Civil Society and the State</u>, Verso, New York, 1988, p. 23.

- 66. EDES (National Greek Republican League) was a rightist organization led by Napoleon Zervas and supported by the British. It was inaugurated in September, 1942.
- 67. See Dominique Eudes, <u>The Kapetanios: Partisans and Civil War in Greece</u>, 1943-1949, NLB, London, 1972, especially pp. 326-39. For a literary account of this battle see Stratis Haviaras' novel, The Heroic Age, Simon and Schuster, New York, 1984.
- 68. For a discussion of the legal ramifications of the White Terror during the civil war years, see Nicos C. Alivizatos, "The 'Emergency Regime' and Civil Liberties, 1946-1949," in <u>Greece in the 1940s: A Nation in Crisis</u>, edited by John O. Iatrides, University Press of New England, Hanover and London, 1981, pp. 220-228.
- 69. For a brief summary of this historiographic dilemma see John O. Iatrides, "Civil War, 1945-1949: National and International Aspects," in Iatrides, Ibid, p. 195.
- 70. See, for example, the essays by Svoronos, Petropoulos, Hondros, Richter, Alivizatos and Tsoucalas, among others in Iatrides.
- 71. See Louis O. Mink's discussion of universal history as a fallacy in "Narrative Form as a Cognitive Instrument," in The-Writing of History: Literary Form and Historical Understanding, edited by Robert H. Canary and Henry Kozicki, University of Wisconsin Press, Madison, 1978, pp. 129-149.
- 72. Hayden White, The Content of the Form, p. 148.
- 73. A relevant example of the literature on clientelism is Nicos Mouzelis, "Class and Clientelistic Politics: The Case of Greece", Sociological Review, Vol. 26, No. 3, August 1978.
- 74. Nicos Mouzelis, "On the Concept of Populism: Populist and Clientelist Modes of Incorporation in Semipheripheral Polities," Politics and Society 14, no. 3, 1985, pp. 329-48. As Mouzelis points out, populism can of course also be a rightist political phenomenon. On this point also see Geoff Eley, Reshaping the German Right: Radical Nationalism and Political Change after Bismark, University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor, 1991.
- 75. See endnote #37 and, for example, Alison Jaggar, Feminist Politics and Human Nature, Rowman and Littlefield, Totowa, 1986, especially pp. 249-302, "The Politics of Radical Feminism."
- 76. Mouzelis, "Populism," p. 344.

- 77. "Emvatirio," <u>To Antartiko Kai To Epanastatiko Tragoudi</u> (The Resistance and the Revolutionary Song), Mnimi Press, Athens, 1979, p. 58.
- 78. Cassette, "PEAEA Songs from Magnesia."
- 79. Nikos Mouzelis, "Greek and Bulgarian Peasants: Aspects of Their Sociopolitical Situation During the Interwar Period," Comparative Studies in Society and History 18, 1976, p. 85.
- 80. Richard Clogg, A Short History of Modern Greece, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1979: "the Convention of May 1832 between Britain, Russia, France and Bavaria...confirmed the offer of the 'hereditary sovereignty' of Greece to Prince Frederick Otto of Wittelsbach, the seventeen-year-old son of King Ludwig of Bavaria." (p. 68)
- 81. Accounts of formative events in 19th- and early 20th-century Greek history are in Gerasimos Augustinos, <u>Consciousness and History: Nationalist Critics of Greek Society</u>, 1897-1914, Columbia University Press, New York, 1977, especially pp. 20-24; and Richard Clogg, <u>A Short History of Modern Greece</u>, Cambridge University Press, London, 1979, pp. 70-132.
- 82. Milovan Djilas, Wartime, Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, New York, 1977; John Dunn, Modern Revolutions: An Introduction to the Analysis of a Political Phenomenon, Cambridge University Press, 1989, pp. 96-120 ("Yugoslavia"); Mark Wheeler, "Pariahs to partisans to power: the Communist Party of Yugoslavia," in Resistance and Revolution in Mediterranean Europe, 1939-1948, edited by Tony Judt, Routledge, New York, 1989, pp. 110-156; Barbara Jancar, "Women in the Yugoslav National Liberation Movement: An Overview," Studies in Comparative Communism, Vol. XIV, Nos. 2 & 3, Summer/Autumn 1981, pp. 143-164.
- 83. Ivo Banac, With Stalin Against Tito: Cominformist Splits in Yugoslav Communism, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, 1988, p. 7.
- 84. Banac, Ibid, p. 7.
- 85. Dimitrov was a prominent Bulgarian communist leader, Tailman was a martyred German communist leader, and Popov was head of the Soviet Mission. Possibly sung in conjunction with the visit of delegates from the Soviet Mission stationed in Yugoslavia in July 1944 to the ELAS-GHQ. Sarafis describes this visit, pp. 351-355 of his memoirs, <u>ELAS</u>, Op.Cit.
- 86. "Tou Dimitrov," <u>To Antartiko kai to Epanastatiko Tragoudi</u>, p. 66.

- 87. Olympia Papadouka, <u>H Yineka Stin Antistasi: Tragoudia tis</u>
 <u>Filakis</u> (Women in the Resistance: Prison Songs). First issued in
 France in 1977 after permission was denied by Greek authorities
 who felt, according to the record jacket, that the recording
 would "stir up memories of the past." (<u>anamoxleuvei to parelthon</u>)
- 88. Although during the 1930s and until the eve of war, Greek communist leaders participated in various Comintern debates and their policies reflected their apparent belief in the evolutionary and popular front directives of the Second and Third Internationals. See, for example, Haris Vlavianos, "The Greek Communist Party: in search of a revolution," in Judt, Op.Cit., pp. 157-205.
- 89. Janet Hart, "Women in the Greek Resistance: National Crisis and Political Transformation," <u>International and Working-Class</u> History, No. 38, Fall 1990, pp. 46-62.
- 90. For an especially helpful discussion of nationalism which influenced my thinking on this point, see Geoff Eley, "Nationalism and social history," <u>Social History</u> 6, January 1981, pp. 83-107.
- 91. In the defensive nationalist narrative, fascism is an evil external force, equated with the Nazi war machine. From the standpoint of political nationalism, fascism is indigenous, associated with the Metaxas dictatorship. But as stated above, the two conceptions probably constituted an interlocking sphere in the popular mind.
- 92. "Then borei pia i Ellada nanai; sklava stous Voulgarogermanous" "Oloi Stin EPON," To Andtartiko Kai To Epanastatiko Tragoudi, p. 36.
- 93. The Nazis are often referred to as dogs (<u>skiloi</u>) in the Greek resistance songs. In the popular "<u>St'armata st'armata</u>" (To Arms, To Arms) the "foreign wolves" are made to "shrink back and shut up trembling" (<u>loufazoun entromoi oi xenoi likoi</u>).
- 94. "Retsinolado" is a kind of resinated oil which would be given to prisoners in order to make them vomit blood once their stomachs were empty of food. Often they would be given retsinolado in addition to being made to lie naked on ice (another type of torture associated in popular memory with the Metaxas period) in order to force admissions of spurious political crimes.
- 95. For example:
- "I'll start with the story of my father, so you can understand one of the reasons I became so active in the resistance against the Germans. At the time, my father was a builder. But he was a master craftsman and he worked and made quite a bit of money. We

didn't go hungry at all, that is, until we were forced to fight against what Metaxas was doing, against Maniadakis, who gave the retsinolado, and who started putting people into falange units. My father had read a pamphlet, and at the time he had said, "It says words of great beauty, like those of Christ." And the person who had given him the pamphlet had been a plant and betrayed him to the authorities. They arrested him and gave him 40 days in jail. I was very young then, 9 years old. In jail they hung him upside down and they beat him on his feet and he had suffered internal hemorrhaging. When I saw this, I asked my father, 'Why?' because I was afraid that he had done something bad. I didn't know that in jail... I thought they only put murderers in jail, or robbers, I didn't know there was such a thing as political prisoners. But my father said, 'Because I don't want there to be any poor people,' when I asked him, when he got out And that's how it happened, originally. So when the Germans came into Greece I was in my first year of high school and I knew what 'fascism' meant. I knew very well what fascism was. From that previous experience of my father. There weren't any organizations right in the beginning. But as soon as EPON started, I joined." (Katerini)

- 96. Mouzelis, "Populism," p. 336.
- 97. Mouzelis, p. 337.
- 98. For example see John Louis Hondros, <u>Occupation and Resistance: The Greek Agony</u>, 1941-44, Pella Press, New York, 1983.
- 99. For example, J.L. Hondros' 1983 study concluded: "The GFP (German Field Police) and Wehrmacht Ic (Intelligence Branch of the German Army) reports sometimes included captured resistance documents. A September 9, 1943 GFP report on EAM/ELAS in the Peloponnese listed fifty-two names and thirty-four occupations of the region's EAM/ELAS. According to this report, the EAM/ELAS leadership in the area included seven teachers, six students, six self-employed individuals (merchants or shopkeepers), five lawyers, four skilled laborers, two former Greek Army officers, two medical doctors, two civil servants, two police officials, and one bookseller... These figures reaffirm the broad national and social basis of EAM/ELAS as emphasized by L.S. Stavrianos, who listed sixteen generals, thirty-four colonels, and 1,500 commissioned officers of the prewar Greek army in ELAS. There were also six Orthodox bishops, many labor leaders, thirty professors from the University of Athens, and two members of the Academy of Athens in EAM/ELAS...A noncommunist source inside of Greece in 1943 reported that EAM/ELAS was strongest among civil servants, white collar workers, merchants, shopkeepers and professionals in the urban areas and among wealthy peasants in the countryside. Artisans who were members were judged to be

above average in number of years of education. Leadership positions went to professional classes and merchants who were motivated by patriotism. EAM/ELAS was indeed a bourgeois movement that brought a new administration to Greece." (Hondros Ibid, pp. 119-20) Also see L.S. Stavrianos, "The Greek National Liberation Front (EAM): A Study in Resistance Organization and Administration," Journal of Modern History XXIV, March 1952, pp. 42-55.

- 100. One of the responsibilities of the youth organization (EPON) was to shout messages into bullhorns (https://doi.org/10.10 designed to keep the population informed of resistance activities. For example, A.L. says, "I was out early the morning of March 25th (National Independence Day), writing on the walls. I spoke into the horn. I still remember it like it was yesterday, what I said. 'People of Athens! The Voice of EPON is speaking to you! Tomorrow is a day of national joy, of national freedom! No one is to go into the center of the city! No one is to take part in the parade planned by the Germans! Everyone in the neighborhoods, in the churches, in the squares, together with EAM and ELAS, we will celebrate the 25th of March together!" Also see Linda Suny Myrsiades, "Greek Resistance Theatre in World War II," The Drama Review, Vol. 21, No. 1 (T73) March, 1977, p. 101.
- 101. From the notes of Themos Kornaros, published under the title "Andreas Lykourinos," in the government-of-the-mountains (PEEA) newspaper, "Free Greece" (Eleftheri Ellada), May 6, 1945. From Haris Sakellariou, Antistasiaka Paidika Diigimata (Selections from Children's War Writings), Kedros Publishers, Athens, 1984, pp. 9-11.
- 102. Here, the famous quote by the conservative C.M. Woodhouse, Commander of the Allied Military Mission in Greece during the war and generally critical of EAM/ELAS, is apropos: "(The organization) had acquired control of almost the whole country, except the principal communications used by the Germans, (and) they had given it things that it had never known before. Communications in the mountains, by wireless, courier, and telephone have never been so good before or since; even motor roads were mended and used by EAM-ELAS... The benefits of civilization and culture trickled into the mountains for the first time. Schools, local government, law-courts, factories, parliamentary assemblies began for the first time. Communal life was organised (for) the Greek peasant. His child was dragooned into EPON, his nest-egg levied into EA, his caique (boat) commandeered to equip ELAN." C.M. Woodhouse, The Apple of Discord, W.B. O'Neill, 1985 edition, p. 146.
- 103. Philip Minehan, "Dependency, Realignment and Reaction: Movement Toward Civil War in Greece During the 1940s", <u>Journal of the Hellenic Diaspora</u>, Vol. X, No. 3, Fall 1983, p. 28.

- 104. For example, resistance photographer Spiros Melitzis says, "One time me and a friend were walking up the hill and we got hungry. We passed a cherry tree, and I said, 'Let's take some cherries.' And my friend said, 'We'd better not. Because if someone sees us they could turn us in to the Popular Court and we would be in big trouble.' Who dared to violate the law? You just didn't dare. But it wasn't only fear. Something had been awakened, not fear, but some kind of consciousness. It just was wrong morally. So I went and knocked on the door, the owner of the orchard came to the door, we went inside and asked him, 'Do you mind if we have some of your cherries?' he said 'Fine, take some,' and that's the way we had to do it."
- 105. An approximate translation.
- 106. To Antartiko Kai To Epanastatiko Tragoudi, p. 55.
- 107. "O Ellada mas Glikia, Dimokratia Laikia; O Ellada mas Glikia, den theloume ton basilia." Tragoudi, Ibid, pg. 27.
- 108. In some cases, Greek poets were commissioned to write songs for the movements; in others, members attached their own lyrics to old folk melodies. Presumably this was also the case in Yugoslavia. See Kostas Myrsiades, "A Theory of Resistance Poetry During the Greek Occupation, 1941-1944," <u>East European Quarterly</u> XVII, No. 1, March 1983.
- 109. The War Diaries of Vladimir Dedijer, University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor, 1990.
- 110. Vasilis Rotas founded the Theatre of the Mountains, a cluster of acting and singing troupes which travelled the mountains putting on skits to raise spirits during the occupation and spread the social message of the resistance. See Linda Suny Myrsiades, "Greek Resistance Theatre in World War II," Op.Cit. Rotas wrote many of the most popular resistance songs and among other things during his long career, translated the works of Shakespeare into Greek.
- 111. Thomas G. Paterson, J. Garry Clifford, Kenneth Hagan, American Foreign Policy: A History, D.C. Heath and Company, Lexington, Mass., 1977, pp. 449-450.
- 112. Maynard Owen Williams, "War-torn Greece Looks Ahead," <u>The National Geographic Magazine</u>, Vol. XCVI, No. 6, December 1949, p. 743.
- 113. Constantine Tsoucalas, "The Ideological Impact of the Civil War," in Iatrides, Op.Cit., p. 327. Also see Procopis Papastratis, "The Purge of the Greek Civil Service on the Eve of the Civil War," in Studies in the History of the Greek Civil War, 1945-1949, edited by Lars Baerentzen, John O. Iatrides, and Ole

- L. Smith, Museum Tusculanum Press in association with the Modern Greek Studies Association, Copenhagen, 1987, pp. 41-54.
- 114. The text of the <u>diloseis</u>, or statements of correct political views that former EAMites were urged to sign in order to avoid arrest, possible execution, unemployment, etc.
- 115. John L. Hondros, "The Greek Resistance, 1941-1944: A Reevaluation," in Iatrides, Op.Cit., pp. 37-47. Also Edmund Wilson, Europe Without Baedeker: Sketches Among the Ruins of Italy, Greece, & England, Doubleday & Company, Inc., Garden City, 1947, especially Chapter 13 entitled "Greek Diary: Communists, Socialists and Royalists." Here Wilson, a British free-lance journalist who undertook a southern European journey in the spring and summer of 1945 for New Yorker magazine, writes "I had interviews, in Athens, with two remarkable professors who have become political figures: George Georgalas and Alexander Svolos. Both are middle-aged men of top standing in their fields, and they are typical of the Greek intellectuals who have been driven by the needs of their country to take an active part in the E.A.M. movement, the National Liberation Front, which organized the resistance to the Germans and which controlled most of the countryside of Greece before the Papandreou government, an invention of the British, took over. They present the best possible proof that that movement has not been the exclusive creation either of professional agitators or of cutthroats from the mountains." (p. 335.) I am grateful to the late George Kish for lending me his original copy of this book.
- 116. A typical example, of the type labeled "the Chatham House Version" by Elie Kedourie is Edgar O'Ballance's The Greek Civil War, 1944-49, Faber and Faber, London, 1966 Edition. recently Peter Stavrakis discounts the thesis that the KKE was Moscow-directed, but writes about the character of EAM, citing the not-unbiased Office of Strategic Services and U.S. State Department Reports of 1944: "Supposedly EAM gave expression to the Greek people's desire for national liberation, which allowed it to serve as a political front for KKE; the Communists could act through EAM and appear to represent the great majority of the Greek people...By 1943...ELAS was large enough for the KKE to contemplate the elimination of all rivals. With an independent base of military power, an effective mouthpiece for the expression of popular sentiment, and an efficient clandestine organization throughout Greece, the KKE was in an excellent position to pursue its own interests. One final attribute of the KKE is of crucial importance to this study: regardless of circumstances, the Greek Communist leadership remained overwhelmingly faithful to the Soviet Union and respectful of its position as the homeland of communist revolution. This pro-Soviet orientation had its basis in the KKE's fidelity to the ideology of Marxism-Leninism as developed under Stalin. Greek Communists looked to Russia for guidance and advice, as is

evidenced by their continuous attempts to reestablish direct radio contact during the war and their requests for more Greek-language broadcasts from the Soviet Union. Everything Russian was idolized by the KKE; ELAS general Stefanos Sarafis has described the adulation accorded the Russian Military Mission's members when they arrived in the mountains of Greece." (Peter J. Stavrakis, Moscow and Greek Communism, 1944-1949, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, N.Y., 1989, pp. 11-12).

- 117. Biographical Introduction by Marion Sarafis to <u>ELAS: Greek Resistance Army</u>, Major-General Stephanos Sarafis, English translation by Merlin Press, Ltd, London, 1980, pp. lvi-lvii.
- 118. See Hondros, Op.Cit., pp. 111-112.
- 119. For example see Roman Szporluk, <u>Communism and Nationalism:</u>
 <u>Karl Marx Versus Friedrich List</u>, Oxford University Press, New
 York, 1988; and Interview with Giorgio Amendola, "The Italian
 Road to Socialism," <u>New Left Review</u> 106, pp. 39-49.
- 120. See Chalmers A. Johnson, "Peasant Mobilization in Yugoslavia," in <u>Peasant Nationalism and Communist Power</u>, Stanford University Press, Stanford, 1962, especially pp. 164-167; and Bogdan Denis Denitch, <u>The Legitimation of a Revolution: The Yugoslav Case</u>, Yale University Press, New Haven, 1976.
- 121. Vlavianos, Op.Cit., pp. 159-160.
- 122. Stephanos Sarafis, ELAS, Op.Cit., p. xlvi.
- 123. See for example, Gerd-Rainer Horn, "The Language of Symbols and the Barriers of Language: Foreigners' Perceptions of Social Revolution (Barcelona 1936-1937), <u>History Workshop Journal</u> 29, Spring 1990, pp. 42-64, and Johnson, Op.Cit.
- 124. Vlavianos, Op.Cit.
- 125. Stephanos Sarafis, <u>ELAS: Greek Resistance Army</u>, Op.Cit., p. 97. A bit further on in his account of this incident, Sarafis states that "(a)t the end of this discussion I had complete faith in the sincerity of EAM and the Communist Party. I asked them to help me meet certain politicians and military leaders so that I could give them a picture of the situation and try to persuade them to co-operate with EAM." (p. 98)
- 126. Augustinos, Op.Cit., p. 11. The author's typology, which includes Aegean fishermen and merchants as well as Balkan and Asia Minor Phanariots, is devised for the period around the 1821 uprising against Turkish rule, but its relevance extends into the late 19th— and early 20th—centuries.

- 127. Tom Nairn, <u>The Break-Up of Britain</u>, NLB Press, London, 1977, p. 41.
- 128. Nairn, Ibid, pp. 41-42.
- 129. For example, one view, while noting that "the details...are still shrouded in mystery," holds that anti-EAM backlash was "Public disorders orchestrated actually provoked by communists: by the communists much perturbed the socialists in EAM, who were anxious that Greece should enjoy a peaceful political future. Their concern was voiced by Dimitrios Stratis, leader of the Socialist party of Greece and a founding member of EAM, to a British intelligence informant on November 7. Stratis still believed that the communists wished to cooperate with democratic parties, and he described their acts of violence as designed solely to counteract any rightwing effort to seize power. acknowledged that communist excesses, particularly in the countryside, were producing exactly that which he believed they were supposed to prevent: 'The danger of a rightist coup,' he observed, 'becomes greater by the very excesses...of EAM' itself." George M. Alexander, "The Demobilization Crisis of November 1944," Iatrides, p. 158. In possible support of the radicalization thesis which asserts a degree of alienation on the part of socialist "moderates," a rough content analysis of the KKE journal directed toward a general party audience, Kommounistiki Epitheorisi (Communist Review) from 1944-1947, shows a greater usage of terms such as "working-class" and "proletariat" after 1945. This change followed the switch in the mantle of leadership from Siantos to Zachariades.
- 130. John Tatrides, Op.Cit., p. 208.
- 131. For example see Nicolas Svoronos, "1940-1950: The Main Problems," in Iatrides, p. 11; and John A. Petropulos, "Traditional Political Parties During the Occupation," pp. 34-35.
- 132. Petropulos, Ibid, p. 34.
- 133. I am extremely grateful to Kosta and Linda Suny Myrsiades for sharing their library of Greek journals from the 1940s with me.
- 134. In company with Marshall Sahlins, Sewell's redesigned term for a processual, deep structural reading of historical events. See endnote #51. A seminal discussion of the concept as part of a typology of approaches to history is in Fernand Braudel, On History, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1980.
- 135. See Antonio Gramsci, "State and Civil Society: Observations on Certain Aspects of the Structure of Political Parties in Periods of Organic Crisis," in <u>Selections from the Prison Notebooks</u>, edited by Quintin Hoare and Geoffrey Nowell Smith,

- International Publishers, New York, esp. pp. 229-246. The secondary literature is vast; an important discussion about the wars of movement and position is in Anne Showstack Sassoon, Gramsci's Politics, University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, 1987, pp. 193-204.
- 136. Anne Showstack Sassoon, <u>Gramsci's Politics</u>, Ibid, p. 134; and Antonio Gramsci, "The Intellectuals," in <u>Selections from the Prison Notebooks</u>, Hoare and Nowell-Smith, Ibid, pp. 5-23.
- 137. Hoare and Nowell Smith, p. 3.
- 138. Richard G. Braungart and Margaret M. Braungart, "Generational Politics," <u>Micropolitics</u> 3, 1984, p. 350. Quoted in Michael X. Delli Carpini, "Age and History: Generations and Sociopolitical Change," in <u>Political Learning in Adulthood</u>, Op.Cit., p. 22.
- 139. Eley, "Nationalism," p. 87.
- 140. Vlavianos, Op.Cit., p. 196.
- 141. See for instance Heinz Richter, <u>British Intervention in Greece: From Varkiza to Civil War</u>, The Merlin Press, London, 1986, p. 119.
- 142. Benedict Anderson, <u>Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism</u>, Verso Books, New York, 1983, p. 128.
- 143. Richard G. Braungart and Margaret M. Braungart, "Life-Course and Generational Politics," <u>Annual Review of Sociology</u> 12, 1986, p. 215.
- 144. Sarafis, ELAS, p. xvii.
- 145. Marion Sarafis, ELAS, pp. xvii-xviii.
- 146. Mihri Belli, <u>Rigas Dedigi</u> (What Rigas Said), Themelio Press, Athens, 1984, pp. 165-66.
- 147. Constantina Safilios-Rothschild, "'Honour' crimes in contemporary Greece," <u>British Journal of Sociology</u>, Vol. XX, No. 2, June 1969, p. 205.
- 148. The "yardstick" impulse was of course not unique to Greece. For example, the Young Ottoman Turkish and Greek nationalist debates were symbiotic: see Taner Timur, "The Ottoman Heritage," in Irvin Cemil Schick and Ertugrul Ahmet Tonak, <u>Turkey in Transition: New Perspectives</u>, Oxford University Press, New York, 1987, pp. 3-26. The cross-cultural relevance of this type of

relativism in a world system context is evident in Irokawa Kaikichi, <u>The Culture of the Meiji Period</u>, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1985.

- 149. Augustinos, p. 7.
- 150. Bernal, Black Athena, Op.Cit.
- 151. Augustinos, p. 9.
- 152. Quoted in Augustinos, p. 22.
- 153. G. Skliros, <u>Erga</u> (Works), especially "To Kinoniko Mas Zitima" (Our Social Question) 1907, Epikairotita, Athens, 1977.
- 154. Behind the Lines: Gender and the Two World Wars, edited by Margaret Randolph Higonnet, Jane Jenson, Sonya Michel and Margaret Collins Weitz, Yale University Press, New Haven, 1987, p. 7.
- 155. i.e., "A fabula is a series of logically and chronologically related events that are caused or experienced by actors." Mieke Bal, Narratology, Op.Cit., p. 5.
- 156. For example see Norman K. Denzin, <u>The Research Act: A</u>
 <u>Theoretical Introduction to Sociological Methods</u>, Prentice-Hall,
 Inc. Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1989.

PROGRAM ON THE COMPARATIVE STUDY OF SOCIAL TRANSFORMATIONS UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

WORKING PAPER SERIES

The Program on the Comparative Study of Social Transformations is an interdisciplinary research program at the University of Michigan. Its faculty associates are drawn primarily from the departments of Anthropology, History, and Sociology, but also include members of several other programs in the humanities and social sciences. Its mission is to stimulate new interdisciplinary thinking and research about all kinds of social transformations in a wide range of present and past societies. CSST Working Papers report current research by faculty and graduate student associates of the program. Many will be published elsewhere after revision. Working Papers are available for a fee of \$2.00 for papers under 40 pages and for \$3.00 for longer papers. To request copies of Working Papers, write to The Program on the Comparative Study of Social Transformations (CSST), 4010 LSA Building, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1382 or call (313) 936-1595. The CSST working paper series is a part of the Center for Research on Social Organizations' working paper series. CRSO numbers are noted.

- 1. "Program in Comparative Study of Social Transformations," William Sewell, Terrence McDonald, Sherry Ortner, and Jeffery Paige, May 87, 15 pp. (CRSO #344)
- 2. "Labor History, Uneven Development, and the Autonomy of Politics: The Dockworkers of Nineteenth-Century Marseille," William Sewell, Jul 87, 45 pp. (CRSO #346) (Now in print as "Uneven Development, the Autonomy of Politics and the Dockworkers of Nineteenth-Century Marseille," <u>American Historical Review</u> 93:3 (Jun 88), pp. 604-37.)
- 3. "Coffee, Copper, and Class Conflict in Central America and Chile: A Critique of Zeitlin's <u>Civil Wars in Chile</u> and Zeitlin and Ratcliff's <u>Landlords and Capitalists</u>," Jeffery **Paige**, Sep 87, 10 pp. (CRSO #347)
- 4. "In Search of the Bourgeois Revolution: The Particularities of German History," Geoffrey **Eley**, Sep 87, 61 pp. (CRSO #350)
- 5. "The Burdens of Urban History: The Theory of the State in Recent American Social History," Terrence McDonald, May 88, 50 pp. (CRSO #355)
- 6. "History, Sociology, and Theories of Organization," Mayer Zald, May 88, 42 pp. (CRSO #357)
- 7. "Have Social Historians Lost the Civil War? Some Preliminary
 Demographic Speculations," Maris Vinovskis, May 88, 55 pp.
 (CRSO #358)

- "Revolution and the Agrarian Bourgeoisie in Nicaragua," Jeffery Paige,
 42 pp. (CRSO #363)
- 9. "Nationalism and Class as Factors in the Revolution of 1917," Ronald Suny, Oct 88, 42 pp. (CRSO #365)
- 10. "The Original Caste: Power, History, and Hierarchy in South Asia,"
 Nicholas Dirks, Oct 88, 30 pp. (CRSO #367)
- 11. "The Invention of Caste: Civil Society in Colonial India," Nicholas Dirks, Oct 88, 24 pp. (CRSO #368)
- 12. "Sociology as a Discipline: Quasi-Science and Quasi-Humanities," Mayer Zald, Oct 88, 43 pp. (CRSO #369)
- 13. "Constraints on Professional Power in Soviet-Type Society: Insights from the Solidarity Period in Poland," Michael Kennedy and Konrad Sadkowski, Nov 88, 37 pp. (CRSO #371)
- 14. "Evolutionary Changes in Chinese Culture," Martin Whyte, Nov 88, 20 pp. (CRSO #372)
- 15. "World Market, Class Conflict, and Rural Coercion in Post-Colonial Buenos Aires," Karl Monsma, Nov 88, 22 pp. (CRSO #373)
- 16. "Ritual and Resistance: Subversion as a Social Fact," Nicholas Dirks,
 Dec 88, 39 pp. (CRSO #375)
- 17. "Social Transformations of Gender in Andean South America: A Working Annotated Bibliography," Janise Hurtig, Dec 88, 24 pp. (CRSO #376)
- 18. "Labour History--Social History--Alltagsgeschichte: Experience, Culture, and the Politics of the Everyday. A New Direction for German Social History?" Geoff Eley, Jan 89, 85 pp. (CRSO #378. (Now in print in <u>Journal of Modern History</u> 61 (Jun 89), ppp. 297-343.)
- 19. "Notes on the Sociology of Medical Discourse: The Language of Case Presentation," Renee Anspach, Jan 89, 32 pp. (CRSO #379)
- 20. "World War Two and the Deradicalization of American Labor: A 'Deviant Case' Study," Howard Kimeldorf, Feb 89, 45 pp. (CRSO #383)
- 21. "Taking Stock: The First Year of CSST," Geoff Eley, Feb 89, 7 pp. (CRSO #384)
- 22. "Immigration Research: A Conceptual Map," Silvia Pedraza-Bailey, Feb 89, 15 pp. (CRSO #385)
- 23. "Culture/Power/History. Series Prospectus," Sherry Ortner, Nicholas Dirks, and Geoff Eley, Mar 89, 4 pp. (CRSO #386)

- 24. "A Feminist Perspective on Christopher Lasch, 'The Social Invasion of the Self'," Sherry Ortner, Apr 89, 6 pp. (CRSO #387)
- 25. "Does Rational Choice Have Utility on the Margins?" Akos Rona-Tas, Apr 89, 31 pp. (CRSO #388)
- 26. Research Fellows Conference Panel on "The Politics of Social Transformation," Seong Nae Kim, Joanne Goodwin, Kathleen Canning, Jun 89. (CRSO #389)
- 27. Research Fellows Conference Panel on "Struggle, Conflict, and Constraints on Social Change," Anne Gorsuch and Sharon Reitman, Jun 89. (CRSO #390)
- 28. Research Fellows Conference Panel on "Subordinate Actors and their Marginalization in Social Theory," Nilufer Isvan, Akos Rona-Tas, Cynthia Buckley, Theresa Deussen, and Mayfair Yang, Jun 89. (CRSO #391)
- 29. "Toward a Theory of Structure: Duality, Agency, and Transformation," William Sewell, Jun 89, 56 pp. (CRSO #392)
- 30. "The Power of Individual Subjectivity and the Subjectivity of Power in Education," Peter Appelbaum, Jul 89, 40 pp. (CRSO #396)
- 31. "Family Ideology, Class Reproduction, and the Suppression of Obscenity in Nineteenth Century New York," Nicola **Beisel**, Jul 89, 29 pp. (CRSO #397)
- 32. "Author Meets Critics: Reactions to "Theory and Anthropology since the Sixties," Sherry Ortner, ed., Aug 89. (CRSO #398)
- 33. "Does Social Theory Need History? Reflections on Epistemological Encounters in the Social Sciences," Margaret Somers, Aug 89, 23 pp. (CRSO #399)
- 34. "Gender, History and Deconstruction: Joan Wallach Scott's Gender And The Politics Of History," William Sewell, Aug 89, 20 pp.

 (CRSO #400)
- 35. "The Social Origins Of Dictatorship, Democracy and Socialist Revolution in Central America," Jeffery Paige, Sep 89, 12 pp. (CRSO #405)
- 36. "Max Weber Meets Feminism: A Reconstruction of Charisma," Cheryl Hyde, Sep 89, 24 pp. (CRSO #407)
- 37. "Understanding Strikes In Revolutinary Russia," William Rosenberg, Sep 89, 36 pp. (CRSO #408)
- 38. "Child Labor Laws: A Historical Case Of Public Policy Implementation,"

 Marjorie McCall-Sarbaugh and Mayer Zald, Oct 89, 41 pp. (CRSO #409)

- 39. "Putting German (and Britian) Liberalism into Context: Liberalism, Europe, and the Burgeoisie, 1840-1914," Geoff **Eley**, Nov 89, 39 pp. (CRSO #411)
- 40. "Bringing Unions Back In (Or, Why We Need A New Old Labor History),"
 Howard Kimeldorf, Feb 90, 13 pp. (CRSO #414)
- 41. "In Flight From Politics: Social History And Its Discontents," David Mayfield and Susan Thorne, Feb 90, 32 pp. (CRSO #415)
- 42. "Nations, Politics, and Political Cultures: Placing Habermas in the Nineteenth Century," Geoff **Eley**, Apr 90, 34 pp. (CRSO #417)
- 43. "Reviewing The Socialist Tradition," Geoff **Eley**, Apr 90, 29 pp. (CRSO #418)
- 44. "Rethinking Labor History: Toward a Post-Materialist Rhetoric," William Sewell, May 90, 20 pp. (CRSO #421)
- 45. "The Intelligentsia in the Constitution of Civil Societies and Post
 Communist Regimes in Hungary and Poland," Michael Kennedy,
 Jul 90, 51 pp. (CRSO #425)
- 46. "The Constitution of Critical Intellectuals: Polish Physicians, Peace Activists and Democratic Civil Society," Michael Kennedy, Apr 90, 38 pp. (CRSO #419)
- 47. "Dominant Class and Statemaking in a Peripheral Area: Argentina after Independence," Karl Monsma, Aug 90, 50 pp. (CRSO #429)
- 48. "Eastern Europe's Lessons for Critical Intellectuals," Michael Kennedy, Aug 90, 26 pp. (CRSO #430)
- 49. "The Alternative in Eastern Europe at Century's Start: Brzozowski and Machajski on Intellectuals and Socialism," Michael Kennedy, Aug 90, 21 pp. (CRSO #431)
- 50. "Collective Violence and Collective Loyalties in France: Why the French Revolution Made a Difference," William Sewell, Aug 90, 37 pp. (CRSO #432)
- 51. "Transformations of Normative Foundations and Empirical Sociologies: Class, Stratification and Democracy in Poland," Michael Kennedy, Sep 90, 39 pp. (CRSO #433)
- 52. "What We Talk About When We Talk About History: The Conversations of History and Sociology," Terrence McDonald, Oct 90, 27 pp. (CRSO #442)
- 53. "Is Vice Versa? Historical Anthropologies and Anthropological Histories," Nicholas **Dirks**, Oct 90, 27 pp. (CRSO #443)

- 54. "Narrativity, Culture, and Causality: Toward a New Historical
 Epistemology or Where is Sociology After the Historic Turn?"
 Margaret Somers, Oct 90, 26 pp. (CRSO #444)
- 55. "Is All the World a Text? From Sociology History to the History of Society Two Decades Later," Geoff Eley, Oct 90, 23 pp. (CRSO #445)
- 56. "Who Shapes the Text?: Sherpas and Sahibs on Mount Everest," Sherry Ortner, Oct 90, 19 pp. (CRSO #446)
- 57. "What Social Theory Needs from History Now: Culture and Action as Problems for Historical Sociology," Craig Calhoun, Oct 90, 19 pp. (CRSO #447)
- 58. "Three Temporalities: Toward a Sociology of the Event," William Sewell, Oct 90, 24 pp. (CRSO #448)
- 59. "The New Non-Science of Politics: On Turns to History in Political Science," Rogers Smith, Oct 90, 28 pp. (CRSO #449)
- 60. "Feeling History: Reflections on the Western Culture Controversy," Renato Rosaldo, Oct 90, 7 pp. (CRSO #450)
- 61. "Historicizing 'Experience'," Joan Scott, Oct 90, 19 pp. (CRSO #451)
- 62. "The Past as Authority and as Social Critic: Stabilizing and
 Destabilizing Functions of History in Legal Argument," Robert
 Gordon, Oct 90, 26 pp. (CRSO #452)
- 63. "Discursive Forums, Cultural Practices: History and Anthropology in Literary Studies," Steven Mullaney, Oct 90, 17 pp. (CRSO #453)
- 64. "Sexual Affronts and Racial Frontiers: National Identity, 'Mixed Bloods' and the Cultural Genealogies of Europeans in Colonial Southeast Asia," Ann Stoler, May 91, 60 pp. (CRSO #454)
- 65. "Cracking the Code Allegory and Political Mobilization in the Greek Resistance," Janet Hart, June 91, 48 pp. (CRSO #455)