Book Reviews


As Pastoralists Settle is a set of papers that collectively explore the impact of sedentarization on the health and well-being of pastoralists living in northern Kenya’s Marsabit District. The book is crafted upon the premise that settling in “towns” is one more strategy within a larger set of adaptive strategies employed by pastoralists as they try to manage in a hostile and unpredictable environment. As such, sedentarization yields both costs and benefits, and much of the book is devoted to delineating these impacts and investigating how they intersect with age, sex, marital status, and class to produce diverse outcomes. Within the framework of adaptation, the book broadly focuses on four areas: an overview and history of the area, the ecological setting, and the nonhealth and health impacts of settlement. These areas are, to varying degrees, examined within a hierarchical explanatory framework that links individual and household outcomes to patterns of settlement, which are in turn linked to regional investments and historical process that reflect events occurring in the wider world system. These multiple levels create a somewhat bewildering array of individual and community outcomes and responses.

The early chapters of As Pastoralists Settle offer a rich historical overview of the region that highlights the role that larger structural factors play in constructing the environment in which the Ariaal, Rendille, and other pastoralists live. These include the roles of British, Kenyan, and Ethiopian governments in nation-building, and particularly the political issues within Kenya which led to underinvestment in the northern section of the country but also the occurrence of famines and the emergence of a culture of aid. As an example of this structural inequality, Fratkin and Roth point out that the northern section of Kenya (then the Northern Frontier District) was temporarily closed to commerce, in part to reduce competition with European cattle ranchers. Fratkin and Roth and Galaty also link larger political processes to the intense and violent cattle-raiding that undercut the security of individuals. These are important chapters that set the context for the community and individual-level analyses to follow.

Several chapters focus on nonhealth outcomes and the changes that occur with settlement. Schwartz blends historical data with aerial survey data to pinpoint the severity and distribution of environmental degradation around watering holes and settled villages. On the basis of these and other data, Schwartz argues that the inevitable incorporation of pastoralists into regional markets will act as a wedge to further widen the chasm between the “have nots” and “have haves.” Importantly, he argues that engagement in market economies by wealthier households will also result in less surplus stock to redistribute to destitute kin through traditional social-support networks, thus producing and reproducing inequalities in Marsabit. McPeak and Little paint a less somber picture by calling attention to the tremendous diversity in outcomes across communities, and to the roles of education and economic diversity in promoting food security. To cement the overall theme of diversity in outcomes and responses to settlement, Adano and Witsenburg present data on perceptions of settlement, noting that is was difficult to quantify the responses because “usually, a combination of [positive and negative] answers was given.”

The final chapters focus on health outcomes and on comparing the settled sites with a community that maintains a mobile lifeway. The chapter by Fujita et al. is exemplary, taking on the issue of patterns of dietary intake and maternal health in a settled village and in a nomadic community, and statistics on the added dimensions of season, social class, and reproductive status, using a longitudinal study design. The methods are clearly laid out, and issues of missing data are explicated. Importantly, Fujita et al. detail the limitations of the study, mostly notably the difficulties in collecting dietary data, and discuss how those limitations temper conclusions. They find, unexpectedly, that maternal arm-fat area is related to social class in the mobile community, but health and social class are unrelated in the settled community. This important finding runs counter to the prediction that settlement increases inequality.

Other standouts include the excellent chapter by Shell-Duncan et al., which adopts a mixed-methods approach to explore the cultural context within which female genital cutting occurs. On the basis of ethnographic and survey data, the authors make a compelling argument for a step-by-step approach to reduce the practice of female genital cutting, beginning with the promotion of more hygienic methods. Roth and Ngugi link sedentarization to a reduction in sex-biased schooling decisions and to a reduced risk of sexually transmitted diseases, the latter operating through female education. Their results demonstrate that uneducated women experience earlier sexual debut, which in a high HIV context (might) increase risk of sexually transmitted diseases. It will be particularly interesting to see whether their hypothesis is supported when biological data are used.

As Pastoralists Settle raises important methodological issues such as variable definitions, most notably in the meaning of class and self-reported perceptions of health across different social ecologies. The latter is relevant to the finding that children from the nomadic context appeared to suffer fewer bouts of diarrhea than did children in settled villages. As pointed out by Shell-Duncan et al. (p. 247), what is considered “normal” likely depends on local conditions. The book also raises important issues of causality and study design. Ultimately, the project of identifying the causal impacts of sedentarization on health, economics, and well-being is supremely difficult, as both theory and empirical data suggest that there will be a tremendous amount of self-selection into settlement villages. Empirically, this means that many variables will covary, obfuscating attempts to make clear statements about the consequences of pastoralist settling. These issues, and many others, would make for productive classroom discussions. Enthusiasm for this book was periodically tempered by redundancies in the text, typos, and poor editing, and limited explanation in some of the chapters’ methods sections. Nevertheless, this book or, more likely, selected chapters would make welcome contributions to courses on human ecology, African pastoralists, and nutritional anthropology.

Craig Hadley
Center for Social Epidemiology and Population Health
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, Michigan

DOI 10.1002/ajpa.20441
Published online 21 April 2006 in Wiley InterScience (www.interscience.wiley.com).

This volume is a signpost at the crossroads of research on the peopling of the Americas that points to both our initial scramble to understand this period in time and where we might go. Certain articles stand out for clear writing (Pearson and Schurr), others for boldness in attacking paradigms (Mandryck, Agenbroad and Hesse, and Chilton), and others for excellent analysis (Clark and Whitney-Smith). The multidisciplinary contributions are divided into three parts: the origins of the first American populations, possible migration routes, and how they colonized the continent.

The theme of Section 1 involves resolving the population source(s) of the first Americans. Articles in this section use biological, linguistic, and archaeological data to address the research question. Schurr's modern mtDNA and Y-chromosome data complement the traditional methods of using craniofacial data (Bruce et al.). While the craniofacial data indicate a wider range of world populations for ancestry (including the Pacific), both studies indicate East Asians as the key ancestral group. The articles in this section also include a linguistic review of when humans first arrived in the Americas, and an archaeological review of early American cultures. Each of the four articles neatly fits together in the sense that there is an agreement between data sets that indicates multiple migrations of multiple groups with multiple origins during the late Pleistocene/early Holocene.

The issue of migration is a heated topic for debate, and the selections in Section 2 reflect the intensity of that debate. A few stand out for innovative approaches to the topic. Pearson raises the question of whether artifact assemblages in the early migratory period support the accepted model of rapid population expansion southward, or if they represent a diffusion of culture from later migrations to existing groups. While in the end, he concedes that population expansion is very likely, he is captivated by a possible bottleneck in Panama that may have prevented migration but allowed diffusion of Clovis culture to the occupied south. Fiedel uses the analogy of the Thule (ancestors of Arctic populations) expansion eastward to explain the rapid Paleoindian colonization of the continent. The utility of this approach lies in its examination of social and environmental causes of migration. He adequately addresses critiques to the analogy, except the perhaps ungrounded assumption that the migration southward was intentional and directed. The fallacy of this argument is addressed, along with other related arguments, by Mandryck, who closes Section 2 with a provocative critique of the hero legend that surrounds the peopling of the Americas. The American Paleoindian hero legend tells a story of intentional and directed travel southward along the Rockies while tracking big game. Evidence suggests that the big game encountered in the North didn’t migrate south until after the Paleoindians, which would imply an impossible prior knowledge of big game in noncoastal areas. She points out that other prehistoric migrations throughout the world are described as “driftings,” rather than intentional movements. She further argues that this story persists despite a lack of geological and archaeological evidence to support an ice-free corridor. The alternative route, via the coast, is overlooked. Her point is to remind researchers that all knowledge, even science, is culturally guided, and academics are as much informed by the bias of social context as by theoretical considerations and historical contingencies. She refers to Plato’s analogy of the cave, in that we need to stop gazing at shadows and see the light.

Section 3 explores the aftermath of colonization from the perspective of human behavioral ecology, by examining Paleoindian impacts on creating the modern ecosystem. A few articles explore models (by Meltzer, McDonald, Whitney-Smith, and Barton et al., respectively) that move away from environmental overexploitation driven by a need to maximize resources, and toward the role of human decision-making and the consequences of those decisions on the new environment. Barton et al. suggest that if systematic data collection can reveal where early populations were and weren’t, the unexploited areas might offer valuable information on the decision-making processes at the time that led to such a rapid expansion of territory that included pristine environments. As did Mandryck, Chilton explores diversity in Paleoindian ecology via a critique of accepting the explanatory paradigm of Paleoindian big-game hunting simply because it makes sense. In her analysis of resource acquisition that considers contributions of all ages and both sexes, big-game hunting becomes a supporting actor rather than framing the stage. In a similar vein, Agenbroad and Hesse use paleo-environmental and archaeological data to overthrow the standing paradigm that there were no megafauna or humans in the Colorado Plateau, by presenting evidence of art and faunal remains that were satisfactorily dated to the late Pleistocene, using radiocarbon dates from associated animal fæcal and skeletal remains. The tone of caution in Barton et al. and Chilton about not accepting paradigms simply because they have been supported in the past is echoed here.

The capstone article by the editors that closes the book presents the argument that theory and model construction depends on intra- and intersite comparisons that flesh out the picture of the initial colonization of the Americas. They offer a synopsis that serves as a roadmap for areas under construction looking for work crews.

This volume is appropriate for advanced undergraduates or graduates, or those new to the field seeking orientation. The volume also serves the purpose of showcasing methods of study in biogeography and existing, re-modeled, and emerging theories in the field. While writing style and tone vary across chapters, there is a positive and collegial tone to the discussion.

KARA C. HOOVER
Department of Anthropology
Temple University
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
BOOKS RECEIVED

Baker BJ, Dupras TL, and Tocheri MW (2005) The Osteology of Infants and Children. College Station, TX: Texas A&M University Press. 192 pp. $34.95 (paper).


Rakita GFM, Buikstra JE, Beck LA, and Williams SR. Interacting with the Dead: Perspectives on Mortuary Archaeology for the New Millennium. Gainesville, FL: University of Florida Press. 391 pp. $75.00 (cloth).


