

References

Bond, J. Address before the National Counseling Center Directors Conference, in *Proceedings*, Annual Conference of University and College Counseling Center Directors, Vail, Colorado, October 10-12, 1972, 2-10.

Brandenburg, J.B. The needs of women returning to school. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1974, 53, 11-18.

Stubbins, J. The politics of counseling. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1970, 48, 611-618.

Warnath, C.F., College counseling: Between the rock and the hard place. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1972, 51, 229-236.

Warnath, F., et al. *New directions for college counselors*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1973.

Race as a Counselor-Client Variable in Counseling and Psychotherapy: A Review of the Research¹

Don K. Harrison²
University of Michigan

In recent years, the literature has devoted increased attention to race as a variable in counseling and helping relationships, particularly in regard to black clients receiving help from white counselors (Vontress, 1967, 1970, 1971; Thomas, 1970; Grier and Cobbs, 1968). While these writings have contributed meaningful insights to the counseling profession, quite often the observations have not been based on empirical data. Although the effects of client-counselor personality variables have been investigated (Jones, 1968; Mendelsohn and Geller, 1963; Mendelsohn, 1966), there is a relative lack of serious research devoted to race and social factors in client-counselor interactions (Banks, 1972). Sattler's (1970) review of studies concerned with the effects of the experimenter's race on experimentation in behavioral research identified only three studies which he considered relevant to the issues of therapist-client interaction. The purpose of this paper is to review and summarize the findings of studies that bear on the effects of race as a counselor-client variable in the counseling relationship. For convenience, the studies have been grouped under two major headings: (1) Effects on clients, and (2) Effects on counselors. The summary statement will include implications for future research, theory and practice.

¹Part of the material in this article was prepared with support under Grant No. 91-24-70-56 from the Manpower Administration, U.S. Department of Labor, under the authority of Title I of the Manpower and Training Act of 1962, as amended.

²Based on a paper presented at the Annual Convention of the National Association of Black Psychologists, Detroit, Michigan, August, 1973.

Effects on Clients

Preferences, Attitudes and Satisfaction

Black high school students. The effects of (1) the race of the model and (2) the age of the model, on the vocational-educational planning behaviors of 105 eleventh grade black students were investigated (Stugart, 1970) through random assignment to four experimental groups — (a) black peer model, (b) white peer model, (c) black adult model, and (d) white adult model, with an active control group as the fifth group. Models were depicted on booklets with pictures and narrative explanations of the model's activity. Experimental groups were exposed to different (age and race) models performing identical information-seeking behaviors while controls were exposed to no models. Measures of frequency in performance of the modeled information-seeking behaviors were obtained after an interval of 12 days. The use of models produced more vocationally-relevant behaviors than control procedures, but differences relative to race and age of the model were not obtained.

A questionnaire designed to measure junior high school students' satisfaction with their counselor was completed by 2,000 students, 161 of whom were black (Mims, Herron and Wurtz, 1970). The object of this study was to analyze responses of blacks in two nonadjacent suburbs in Detroit where the black students were a distinct minority. Each school had black and white male counselors and white female counselors but no black female counselors. The investigators concluded that counselors of black students do not have to be black; rather, sex is a more important consideration than

race. For example, the data suggested that black junior high school girls do not want a female counselor. Black boys had a similar degree of unhappiness with black male counselors and white female counselors. One limitation of the study was that black female counselors were not a part of the counselor population.

Phillips (1960) investigated the question: "Can white counselors attain positive results in counseling Negro pupils?" Counselors, who were doctoral degree candidates with two years' teaching experience and three years' counseling experience, saw 12 boys (six assigned to white counselors and six assigned to black counselors) during 40-minute sessions on a weekly basis for one semester. The boys had been repeatedly referred to personnel for noise, tardiness, uncooperative attitudes, and failure to utilize abilities or to formulate plans. White counselors were unable to establish a true rapport with their black clients during the sessions because of the clients' suspiciousness; thus, former behavior patterns continued. Black counselors, on the other hand, established rapport quite easily; the boys were never again referred to the personnel office. Phillips concluded that white counselors cannot penetrate racial barriers, and therefore, cannot counsel black students effectively.

Barnes (1970) studied the relationship between high school students' counselor preferences and the sex, race and cultural background of counselors. The students (N = 180) saw videotaped counseling sessions of counselors of different sexes, races and ethnic backgrounds. These results demonstrated that black students preferred black male counselors.

Another study explored the attitudinal differences of black high school students toward their white counselors and white students toward the same counselors (Burrell and Rayder, 1971). A sample of 50 seniors (10 blacks and 40 whites, both groups divided equally by sex) who had visited their counselors at least three times, were asked to react to a 12-item attitude schedule, each item rated on a 5-point continuum ranging from "strongly agree" to "strongly disagree." A Chi-square analysis by race indicated that the black students' positive attitudinal statements about the counseling situation were significantly lower (P is less than .001) than those of the white students.

White high school students. Eiben (1970) investigated (1) the effects of the presence of a black counselor and (2) the effects of the type of problem on the helper preferences of white high school students. A questionnaire was used to gather data from students in four types of high schools: Type A — white student body, private, small city, no black teachers or counselors; Type B — integrated urban, black teachers and counselors; Type C — rural white, no black teachers or counselors; and Type D — White, small city, black and white teachers and counselors. For various problems or concerns, students were asked to respond as to the "source of help" they would seek: (a) black counselor; (b) white counselor; (c) black friend; (d) white friend; (e) black teacher; (f) white teacher. Where the focus of group participation was on the improvement of race black counselors were preferred in all four schools. The

presence of black counselors in Type B and D schools did not increase the students' choice significantly for a black counselor compared to schools Type A and C. In short, white counselors were preferred for most problems that concerned the students except in the area of race relations.

Black and white high school students. In studying the effects of the race and dialect of the communicator upon attitude formation, black and white high school students in two midwestern cities were presented tapes of: (a) white communicator "general American dialect;" (b) white communicator "southern dialect;" (c) black communicator "general American dialect;" and (d) black communicator "southern dialect" (Lehman, 1969). Semantic differential and Likert type questionnaires were used to assess respondents' attitudes toward the communicator. Analysis of variance was used in assessing attitudes of the subjects on four independent variables, two levels each: race of communicator (black, white); dialect of communicator ("general American," "southern dialect"); race of student (black, white) and sex of student (male, female). The subjects were found to be more positive towards the communicators with the "general American dialect" than toward those with the "southern dialect." More positive attitudes were expressed toward the Caucasian communicator than toward the Black. "Southern dialect" was rated significantly less positively when used by the white communicator than by the black. Subjects tended to rate their own race more positively.

In investigating whether black and white clients share the same concerns regarding counselor preference, Silver (1972) used 122 black and 121 white high school students to test the hypothesis that: closed-minded clients would express a preference for directive counselors; open-minded clients would express a preference for non-directive counselors; and counselor style would be more important than counselor race for all clients. Four groups of clients were selected on the basis of their D Scale scores from the Rokeach Dogmatism Scale, Form E, and identified as follows: Negro closed-minded, white closed-minded, Negro open-minded, and white open-minded. Study group members read two case studies in script form dealing with a college selection problem in which the counselor was directive in one instance and non-directive in the other. Counselors also responded to two printed photos of the same man to indicate counselor preference and degree of preference. Counselors ranked preference for the four possible combinations of counselor style and race. In all instances, counselor style was more important than counselor race when both were known to client groups. Only in the absence of information about counselor style or with the variable controlled, did the respondents prefer a counselor of the same race as themselves. Negro closed-minded clients expressed a significantly higher preference than did Negro open-minded clients for a same-race counselor.

A group of counselors (apparently all white) in a large metropolitan high school, accused of racial discrimination in their counseling, denied that they discriminated. In order to investigate discrimination, Barney and Hall (1965) surveyed 85 black and 300 white students who were asked: if they had

received counseling and if they had, had they been encouraged to attend college or not to attend college? There were no statistical differences in responses between black and white students. However, an evaluation of the GPA of students who said they were counseled not to attend college seemed to indicate that counselors were less willing to advise black students with marginal GPA's to try college. Students indicated that the counselors had not discriminated in encouraging college attendance or non-attendance.

Gamboa (1971) examined the effects of the race of the counselor, the race of the client, and the counseling climate (cold-warm) on the counseling preferences of delinquent girls. None of the variables were found to be significant factors for vocational counseling preferences. However, the students' race was significant in terms of preferences for personal counseling. White students were more willing to see a counselor for personal problems than were black students, regardless of the race of the counselor.

Black college students. The personal characteristics of four white and four black counselors and the relationship of these characteristics to counselor facilitative effectiveness were viewed by 48 randomly selected black college sophomore students (Gardner, 1970). While all students viewed counselor function as the most critical element in effectiveness as a change agent, black college students perceived that black counselors would be able to function at higher facilitative levels with black students than white counselors. (P is less than .01). Other evidence also supports the view that counselors who generate high levels of facilitative conditions offer greater helping potential to blacks than is offered by counselors who generate low levels of facilitative condition.

In three separate samplings involving three different projects, SEEK (Search for Education, Exploration and Knowledge) students were surveyed to determine their attitudes toward the importance of similarity of ethnic background of counselor and counselee (Backner, 1970). The first survey involving 115 of 325 students revealed that only 12.7 percent of the students endorsed a counselor of the same racial background as compared to 25.3 percent desiring counselors of the same sex. In the second sampling, 174 or 44.8 percent of 408 questionnaires were returned by SEEK students about one and one-half years later. Only 25.3 percent stated that the counselor's ethnic background should be similar to counselees while 68.4 percent stated that it didn't matter. As Backner (1970) points out, a "greater percentage of students did indicate that their counselor's ethnic background was important to them, but the large majority continued to indicate that it was not (p. 633)." In a third survey, in which the questionnaires were distributed under less controlled conditions, 30 out of "probably a hundred or a hundred and fifty. (p. 634)" were returned. Twenty-one students responded that the ethnic background of the counselor did not matter. Backner concluded from the three samplings that most of the SEEK students questioned did not place great emphasis on the similarity of the ethnic backgrounds of counselor and student.

Payne (1971) found that black students felt that counselors offered different academic counseling to them than to white students, that is, guiding them into less difficult curricula.

Adair (1972) attempted to compare black clients' anticipation and perception of the degree of positive regard, congruence, and empathic understanding offered by black and white counselors. The subjects were 120 black students from four colleges who saw eight counselors (four blacks and four whites). Analysis of the data disclosed that black clients anticipated white counselors would offer less unconditional positive regard. The black clients also felt that white counselors, particularly males, behaved incongruently during counseling.

Jackson and Kirschner (1973) examined the relationship between a black person's racial self-designation and his degree of preference for a counselor of his race. The hypothesis tested was that individuals of African descent, referring to themselves as Black or Afro-American, would prefer assistance from someone of their own race to a higher degree than someone referring to himself as Negro or Colored. At a predominantly black urban county college, 391 black freshmen students (144 males and 247 females) were administered a questionnaire consisting of eight attitude items relating to demographic characteristics of counselors. Students were asked to check whether they were Black, Colored, Afro-American or Negro. Results indicated that students who referred to themselves as Black or Afro-American preferred a counselor of African descent to a more significant degree than those whose self-designation was Negro. Jackson and Kirschner call attention to the importance of considering individuals' "racial consciousness" as manifested by racial self-designation when assessing the attitudes of blacks.

Cimbolic (1972) studied the effects of counselor race, experience level and counselor-offered conditions upon 17 randomly chosen black freshmen (nine females and eight males) who participated in initial interviews with four counselors — two black counselors, one experienced and one inexperienced, and two white counselors with the same experience differential. To some extent, this study represented a methodological improvement on an earlier study by Banks et al. (1967). Counselees rated counselors on three counselor dimensions: counselor effectiveness, counselor likability and counselor skill level. Results indicated that counselees did not show a preference for counselors as a function of race but as a function of counselor experience level. In contrast to the findings of Banks et al., in which two-thirds of their counselees were unwilling to return to a white counselor, all of the counselees in this study were willing to return to at least one of the white counselors for future counseling. Pointing out that geographical background could be, in part, a function of the results obtained, Cimbolic suggested that future studies might incorporate a pre-measure of counselees' racial attitude (Blacks in Banks et al. study were from the Northeastern section of the United States while Blacks in Cimbolic's study were from the Central Midwest).

Black and white college students. Sixty-four undergraduate students from Southeast Florida,

half black (16 females and 16 males) and half white (16 males and 16 females), participated in three counseling sessions. Afterwards, they responded to questionnaires and instruments designed to measure pre- and post-comparisons of preferences for counselors varying in professional experience, ethnicity and sex (Tucker, 1969). Eight counselors, divided into subgroups of "trained" (graduate students enrolled in Practicum in Counseling) and "untrained" (students enrolled in their first guidance course), were equally represented with two male and two female Caucasians and two male and two female Blacks. Counseling sessions consisted of one ten-minute initial interview and two thirty-minute sessions over a two-week period. Counselors had less difficulty viewing the experienced counselors positively regardless of race or sex. However, counselors who differed from their counselees in sex and racial membership were less preferred with choices as follows:

Counselor Preference: First and Second Choice	Sex and Race of Counselee
1. Black Females	1st Black Males 2nd Black Females
2. Black Males	1st Black Males 2nd White Males
3. White Females	1st White Males 2nd White Females
4. White Males	1st White Males 2nd White Females.

Black adults. An investigation into the nature of the counselor-client relationship as perceived by 39 adult unemployed and/or underemployed culturally different clients (18 males and 21 females) in a pre-employment program, concluded that racial similarity between counselors and counselees is a prime factor affecting individual counseling relationships when counselors' professional training and sociological characteristics are equal (Taylor, 1970).

In a study of black young adults enrolled in a job project and the factors related to their success, Guring (1968) examined the general issue of "whether the reaction of a trainee to a staff member is affected by the degree of similarity between staff members and trainee, similarity in terms of class background, values, cultures and sympathies" (p. 26). Using a series of rating scales, Gurin assessed trainees' perceptions of 93 black male counselors and 51 white male counselors with respect to: (1) trainees' attraction to staff member; (2) trainees' perception of staff member's influence; (3) trainees' perception of staff member's knowledge; (4) trainee's perception of staff member's punitiveness; (5) trainee's perception of staff member's emphasis on middle-class behaviors. Trainees were asked to indicate their perceptions of other staff members on the same scale — 100 black male basic educa-

tion teachers, 32 white male basic education teachers, 54 black male vocational educational teachers, and 20 white male vocational education teachers. There was greater attraction to black male counselors than white counselors (P is less than .01). In presenting the findings Gurin observes:

What we see very clearly when the data are presented . . . the race of the staff member makes a very critical difference in the counselor role but no significant difference in the other roles. When compared to the white male counselors, the black male counselor was much more attractive to the trainees under him and was perceived by them as having more knowledge and influence. The differences are large and significant. In contrast, when black and white education and workshop teachers are compared, the differences, though in the same direction, were clearly not as large or significant. Whether or not the staff member is black or white does seem to matter in a role that requires a relationship of trust and personal closeness. It matters less in roles that are less personal and where the major focus is on information and skills that have to be taught (p. 27).

Gurin's results also suggest that trainees react differently to program staff "socialization" attempts when they come from black rather than white staff members.

Pre- and post-attitudes of black clients toward white counselors and the effects of counselor race on goal persisting behaviors were analyzed on 191 unemployed black males (N=75) and females (N=116) in a large midwestern city who were trainees in three manpower programs: (1) Work Incentive Program; (2) Concentrated Employment Program; and (3) a Board of Education Skills Center (Harrison, 1972). Trainees were assigned to 19 counselors, 6 black (trainee N=53) and 13 white (trainee N=139); data was collected by black interviewers using questionnaire formats and two instruments: (1) The Consequences Model Questionnaire developed by Rosen and Komorita (1969), based on an adaptation of Edward's (1961) decision making paradigm of subjective probability and subjective utility, and (2) Gurin's et al. (1968) modification of Rotter's (1966) Internal-External Locus of Control Scale. Pre-measures revealed an overall favorable attitude toward white counselors before the counseling experience. Post-attitude measures revealed a significant (P is less than .01) negative attitude of black counselees assigned to white counselors and a more significant (P is less than .001) negative attitude toward white counselors by black counselees who had black counselors. Clients subscribing to more militant ideology and those more blaming of the system (as measured by the IE Scale) were less favorable in their attitude toward white counselors (P is less than .05). Effects of counselor race on goal behaviors of counselees were non-significant. Harrison's results suggest that experience sensitized counselees to the limitations of white counselors and to the positive aspects of black counselors, making them pro-black rather than anti-white.

Stranges and Riccio (1970) investigated whether counselees with different racial and ethnic backgrounds preferred to be counseled by counselors of

similar backgrounds. A total of 108 subjects (36 white, 36 Appalachians and 36 black) enrolled in Manpower Development Programs, were instructed to view each of six counselors on an audio-visual tape interview. Prior to viewing each counselor's tape, a brief biographical sketch was read aloud to each subject. After all six tapes had been shown, trainees were asked to state their preferences. Trainees, both black and white, chose counselors of the same racial and cultural background as their own.

Fifteen black and 15 white community agency clients (ages 17 to 40) volunteered to complete Barrett-Lennard Inventories as part of a study designed to explore the effectiveness of interracial counseling (Mullozi, 1972). Subjects were asked to evaluate the quality of the relationship established with their counselors during initial counseling sessions. Seven black and eight white counselors with an average of 3.5 years experience volunteered to participate in the study as a result of mail and telephone requests and personal contact. Clients did not rate their counselors as affording fewer therapeutic conditions in mixed-race counseling as compared to same-race counseling, with one exception: black clients rated white counselors as providing lower levels of regard than did white clients. Black counselors, surprisingly, rated themselves as providing more (P is less than .01) empathy to white clients than to black clients. White counselors perceived themselves as being more (P is less than .05) congruent and providing higher (P is less than .05) levels of empathy to black clients.

Depth of Self-Exploration

Black and white elementary students. The effects of the race of the group leader upon the improvement of intergroup attitudes was investigated among racially mixed elementary school children (Owens, 1969). Sixty fifth and sixth grade students were pre-tested on the Semantic Differential, the Ohio Acceptance Scale and the Self-Esteem Inventory. Ten children (five black and five white) were randomly assigned to each of six groups: one led by a white counselor, one led by a black counselor, and one group led by a black and a white counselor; three control groups were of the same composition. The experimental groups (one, two and three) engaged in group counseling, and the control groups (four, five and six) engaged in contact activities. Experimental and control groups met once each week for 40 minutes over an eight week period after which the subjects were administered the same instruments used during the pre-test. No significant differences were found among the six groups in mean gains in intergroup attitudes. Among racially mixed fifth and sixth grade elementary school students, the use of racially mixed teams of counselors in group sessions revealed that there may be no advantage to using either a black counselor or a white counselor alone as a means of alleviating racial bias.

Black and white high school students. Thirty-two males (16 black clients, eight lower-class and eight middle-class; 16 white clients, eight lower-class and eight middle-class) high school students in the 11th and 12th grades were randomly selected

and assigned to eight counselors (four black and four white) in a Latin Square design to investigate the effects of race and social class on counselor-client interactions (Banks, 1971b). Counselors were divided into high and low empathy groups based on pre-ratings. Dependent variables were rapport ratings and client depth of self-exploration. Racially similar pairing resulted in greater client self-exploration in initial interviews (P is less than .05). Empathy, however, which proved to be a source of effect for more positive outcomes, was derived from high empathy counselors rather than low empathy counselors (P is less than .05), regardless of race. Unlike race, social class was not a significant source of effect.

Reflection of feeling, race of subject and race of experimenter were investigated to determine their effect on the frequency of self-disclosure in 18 black and 18 white male high school students in Alabama (Mann, 1972). Subjects were randomly assigned to one of three temperament groups: (1) Group I — 12 black males who received reflective statements as a continuous schedule of reinforcement; (2) Group II — 12 white males who received reflective statements on a continuous schedule of reinforcement; and (3) Group III — six white males and six black males who received no reinforcement. Four experimenters (two black males and two white males) performed the treatment in which 71 pictures were presented to each subject and their verbal responses were recorded. After each response, experimenters either delivered reinforcement or withheld reinforcement as prescribed in experimental procedure. Reflection of feeling significantly increased self-disclosure in black and white subjects. There was no significant difference in self-disclosure between black and white subjects receiving verbal reinforcement. Racial difference of the experimenter did not significantly affect the frequency of self-disclosure.

Black college students. Grantham (1970) tested the hypothesis that clients counseled by counselors who are more similar to them (race, sex and language) will be better able to explore self and to make greater progress. Responses were gathered through taped, one-hour interviews with 14 black male and 23 black female college students in special programs for culturally disadvantaged using five black counselors (three males and two females) and nine white counselors (six males and three females). Random assignments were made so that each counselor was scheduled to interview two males and two females. Four instruments were used in the study: (1) a slang test — 40 multiple choice items measuring the counselor's comprehension of nonstandard English; (2) Client Outcome Questionnaire (COQ) — a measure of client satisfaction (3) Depth of Self-exploration Scale (DX); and (4) Counselor-Facilitative Conditions Scale (FC) — measure of counselor functioning in the interview. Language was not found to be a significant variable. Two significant findings were that subjects preferred black counselors to white counselors to a significantly greater degree and also that subjects of both sexes preferred female counselors to male counselors.

Black adults. Carkhuff and Pierce (1967) recorded the initial clinical interviews of four groups

of hospitalized black and white female patients (N=16) diagnosed as schizophrenics from upper and lower class status to study the effects of race and social class of therapist on depth of self-exploration. Subjects were assigned to black and white upper and lower class counselors (N = 4) who saw each patient in a Latin Square design counter-balanced to control for the effects of order. Race and social class were significant sources of effect on patients' depth of self-exploration (P is less than .01). Patients most similar to the race and social class of the counselors tended toward more exploration of self.

Black and white adults. Fourteen white teachers and ten black parents were subjects in an investigation of the efficacy of training as a means of facilitating relationships between the races (Carkhuff and Banks, 1970). Both black and white subjects increased their functioning in interpersonal skills. Trainers of a given race functioning at high facilitative levels significantly effected gains in trainees of similar and different races. However, whites tended to function at slightly higher levels with white adults and children. Blacks tended to function at slightly higher levels with blacks and adults and children. The authors indicate that the results "... reflect perhaps some generalized greater facility in communication with persons who are similar in characteristics" (Carkhuff and Banks, 1970, p. 417).

Reporting Behavior and Language Patterns

Black high school students. The effects of the race of inexperienced lay counselors were tested with black junior high school students (Heffernon and Bruehl, 1971). Four black and four white college men who had no counseling experience were given eight hours of training in Rogerian principles of counseling. Each counselor was assigned two groups, each made up of three black eighth grade boys matched by I.Q., reading level, seventh grade attendance records and grades. Assessment of reaction to counseling was made by: the result of giving counselees a choice at session five between reporting for counseling or going to the library; and measurement of pre- and post-counseling change on a 69-item version of the Mooney Problem Check List, the Barrett-Lennard Relationship Inventory, and an adjective check list describing real and ideal self. No systematic differences were observed on the paper and pencil instruments, but on the behavior measure, all of the counselees of black counselors chose to report to counseling rather than go to the library, but only 11 of 23 counselees (P is less than .01) with white counselors chose to report for counseling. The authors concluded that, on behavioral measures, blacks will tend to prefer black counselors.

Adults. Tourangeau (1970) attempted to evaluate the effectiveness of white middle-class employment counselors in "reaching" disadvantaged black and non-black individuals by comparing the number of counseling interviews held by 12 white counselors and one black counselor with black and non-black disadvantaged clients in the outreach units of the Michigan Employment Security Commission. No differences were found in the average number of counseling interviews held, although

there were considerable differences among counselors in their "success" in dealing with clients. However, when race was ignored, there was considerable variance between counselors in the number of interviews held.

Black and white college students. The influence of race and social class on attitudes toward psychotherapy and therapists, self-disclosure, and self-reports of treatment outcomes were investigated using 69 female college students, divided into three sub-samples representing 24 black lower-class females, 20 black middle-class women, and 25 white middle-class females (Wolkon, Moriwaki and Williams, 1973). The researchers administered a fixed-alternative questionnaire to gather demographic data; the Fisher and Turner (1960) Attitude toward Seeking Professional Help Scale (Jourard and Lasakow, 1958). Findings indicated that both social class and race were related to attitudes toward psychotherapy. Lower and middle-class blacks manifested lower self-disclosure scores than did middle-class whites. Blacks preferred black therapists and were more dissatisfied with treatments than were whites.

Burkett (1966) attempted to discover to what extent high or low prejudiced subjects (white and black) would interact differently in verbal interchange with a black or a white interviewer. The findings revealed that highly prejudiced subjects of both races talked less to an interviewer of the opposite race than did subjects of low prejudice. Highly prejudiced white subjects talked more with the white interviewer than did the low prejudiced subjects. Conversely, low prejudiced black and white subjects conversed more with the black interviewer.

Ledvinka (1969) used the natural setting of the employment interview to determine whether white and black employment interviewers elicit the same or different language patterns from lower-class black subjects. Tape recordings were made of the interviews of 75 black job seekers who were interviewed once each by a black interviewer and a white interviewer. On all measures, black interviewers elicited greater linguistic elaboration than did white interviewers. Ledvinka concluded that in the interview situation, and probably in the larger society, whites are a source of anxiety, they prescribe role behaviors for blacks to enact, and create distances between black and white.

Effects of Counselor Attitudes and Behavior

Prejudice

In a two-part study conducted at an NDEA Counseling and Guidance Institute, Milliken (1965) investigated differences in prejudice of male student counselors identified as "effective" and "ineffective." Counseling practicum grades formed the basis for dichotomizing "effective" and "ineffective" counselors for the first investigation. Counselor supervisor's rating was the basis for determining students' effectiveness in the second investigation. The Bogardus Ethnic Distance Scale was used to measure prejudice attitudes. That prejudice is related to counseling effectiveness as judged by practicum grades was supported; however, counseling effectiveness as judged by super-

visor rankings and prejudice were not significantly related, although the results were in the hypothesized direction.

In another study (Milliken and Patterson, 1967), 30 counselor trainees, prior to counseling a black coached-client, completed the Bogardus Ethnic Distance Scale and the Rokeach Dogmatism Scale to obtain ratings on prejudice and dogmatism. The coached-clients and the supervisors of the counselor trainees rated trainees behavior by completing an experimental Counselor Effectiveness Scale following the interviews. The hypothesis that "good" counselors would have low rankings on prejudice and dogmatism was not substantiated; findings were only in the hypothesized direction and not significant. The authors concluded that both prejudice and dogmatism may be factors to consider in successful counseling relationships.

Yamamoto, James, Bloombaum and Hattern (1967) studied the racial attitudes of therapists as they affect the frequency and number of interviews. Their results demonstrated that high-prejudiced white therapists (N = 9) saw male and female black patients for a fewer number of therapeutic sessions than low-prejudiced white therapists (N = 6).

Facilitative Functioning

In a study designed to determine the effects of counselor race and training on black clients in initial interviews, four counselors — one black and three white — with varying amounts of experience and education, were assigned to see eight black undergraduate students (four male and four female) in a counter-balanced design during consecutive weeks (Banks, Berenson and Carkhuff, 1967). Counselor performance was determined by independent rating of dimensions of interpersonal functioning: counselor empathy, counselor genuineness, counselor specificity of expression and client depth of self-exploration. Also, the counselees assessed the counselor's level of functioning on a 50-item relationship inventory. The black counselor and two inexperienced white counselors functioned at higher levels than the experienced white Ph.D. trained in the more traditional trait-and-factor approach. All eight counselees stated that they would return to see the black counselor, but none indicated they would return to see the white Ph.D. When the data on the black counselor is disregarded, the authors state that "Two-thirds of the counselees would not return to see a white counselor for a second session" (Banks, Berenson and Carkhuff, 1967, p. 72).

Walker (1970) investigated the effect of client race on the empathic levels of 30 white counselors (doctoral students whose average age was 29). After basal empathy level was established (High and Low Empathic Counselors) by having counselors respond in writing to Carkhuff's 16 Client Stimulus Expressions, counselors were randomly assigned to view and respond to one of two simulated counseling videos, one of a black and one of a white client. The clients, six black and six white girls who were matched according to sex, socio-economic level and dress, role-played problems typical of preadolescents. Two raters used the Carkhuff Scale of Empathic Understanding to rate

counselors' responses. None of the comparisons of "High Empathic" counselors' responses to problems role-played by black clients and white clients reached significance. Significance was reached in two of the six tests in that the "Low Empathic" counselors responded significantly higher to black clients. In reference to sex of counselor, male counselors responded significantly higher (P is less than .01) to black clients than did female counselors although no significant differences in counselors' responses to white clients were based on sex. The findings suggest that the white counselors, at least from the population of counselors trained in offering core conditions, are capable of offering the conditions of empathy to both black and white clients.

Bryson (1972) studied the relationship between counselee-counselor race and understanding by recording 45-minute interviews between clients and counselors of different sexes and races. Eight master's level counselors (four black and four white, half male and half female) were assigned to 32 undergraduate students (16 black and 16 white) in which two different counselor-client racial combinations were employed: (1) white counselors with white and black clients and (2) black counselors with white and black clients. Thus, each counselor had four clients, each representing one of the race and sex categories. Counselor level of understanding was based on independent rating of judges. Statistically, counselor race-client race interaction was apparent with results favoring same race combinations. No statistically significant client race relationship and sex differences were found. However, statistically significant differences were found between the levels of understanding for the groups of white and black counselors. Overall, white counselors understood both black and white clients better than did counselors who were black.

Taylor (1972) used the following as independent variables: age, attitude toward race, teaching and counseling experience, participation in in-service training and contact with the opposite race — to study their effects on counselor functioning (dependent variable) in cross-racial situations in South Carolina. Using the Semantic Differential Technique, 31 white and 19 black public school counselors were administered the Attitude Survey of Public School Counselors to measure their attitudes (one of the independent variables) toward four concepts: (1) white people; (2) black people; (3) other people; and (4) myself. Other independent variables were determined by demographic data furnished by counselors. The level of functioning of counselors in cross-racial situations was determined by their scores on the Cross-racial Counseling Tape as measured by the Carkhuff Client Scales for Measurement of Counseling Dimensions. Data was subjected to step-wise regression analysis. Among both black and white counselors, experience was the only single variable that indicated a significant correlation with counselor function, but the correlation was in a negative direction. This suggests that the more experience a black or white counselor has, the less able he is to function at high levels in cross-racial situations. Although counselor experience was the only vari-

able that correlated significantly, but negatively, this variable in combination with the attitude variable and the evaluation of association/experience with white people had a multiple correlation of 0.63. Taylor suggests that counselor experience is related to and contributes significantly to the predictions of counselor function in cross-racial situations using both black and white samples. The level of functioning of school counselors in cross-racial situations is generally below levels considered minimally helpful by the Carkhuff Model, and, on the average, harmful to the extent that the model is considered a valid indication of effectiveness.

Young (1972) investigated how the race of the client and therapist may confound the therapeutic relationship and placebo effect. Relationship variables were defined as the client's perception of the therapist's empathy level of unconditional positive regard and genuineness. Placebo effect is the degree of competency the client attributes to the therapist. Young hypothesized that subjects would give higher ratings to therapists of their own race and sex and that the measure of the placebo effect would intercorrelate significantly with the relationship measures. Thirty-two black male and 32 white male college students served as subjects. Each was randomly assigned to one of four treatment conditions in which the client's race corresponded to his own. A psychotherapy dialog was role-played and tape recorded once between a male therapist and male client and a second time between a female therapist and a male client. Role-players' voices were pre-rated for ambiguity as to racial identity and tapes were rated for equivalence on dependent variables. Subjects were led to believe that persons on the tape were of the race or races appropriate for the treatment situation. After hearing each tape, the subject was asked to put himself in the place of the client and to respond to the Barrett-Lennard Relationship Inventory and to an item on the degree to which the client thought the therapist was competent to help him. The data did not indicate any statistically significant influence of race of subject, race of therapist, or sex of therapist across the dependent variables. Although statistical significance was not reached, white females were consistently rated lowest. For white male subjects, sex appeared to be more important than race as male therapists were rated higher than females. For black male subjects, on the relationship variables, race appeared to be more significant than sex as black therapists were rated higher than white therapists. On the placebo measure, however, black subjects rated the white therapists higher.

Johnson (1972) measured the Galvanic Skin Responses and social acceptability rating of 30 white male rehabilitation counselors by having them view the videotape presentations of different pairings of both black-white and male-female characters depicting three types of affective situations: (1) hostility, (2) affection, and (3) absence of affect. The subjects had a more pronounced reaction to the affect being portrayed in the presentations than to the pairing of characters. These results seemed to indicate that counselors did not exhibit exceptionally negative attitudes

toward blacks in most situations because the pairing of characters by sex and race did not produce significant differences in the subjects' reactions. However, it is interesting to note that four of the pairings produced the greatest GSR responses and the lowest acceptability ratings as follows: (1) black male to white female; (2) white male to black female; (3) white female to black female; and (4) white male to white female. The three following pairings were found to have the lowest stimulus GSR amplitudes and the highest social acceptability ratings: (1) white male to white male; (2) black female to black female; and (3) black male to black female.

Summary and Implications

Research studies on the effects of race in the counseling relationship have focused on the relationship between race and client-counselor performance.

The preferences, attitudes and satisfaction levels expressed by clients with counselors of different race among high school students, college students and adults, although mixed, show a general trend — counselees tend to prefer counselors of the same race, particularly if they are black counselees. The counselor's ability to communicate empathic understanding, however, appears to be a crucial variable irrespective of race; however, empathic understanding as communicated by a counselor of the same race seems to result in greater depth of exploration of black clients. Black counselees' language elaboration has been found to be more extensive in the presence of blacks than in the presence of whites. The effects of race of counselor on client's behavioral outcomes, however, is less clear, suggesting that further research is indicated in this area.

Briefly, studies devoted to effects of the counselor's race on blacks — in regard to counselor preference, depth of client's exploratory behavior, and dialect and language preference — suggest that in a counseling situation, blacks tend to respond somewhat more negatively toward white counselors than toward black counselors. In the few studies that used white clients as subjects, it has been observed that white clients expressed a preference for white counselors (Tucker, 1969; Carkhuff and Banks, 1970; Eiben, 1970; Lehman, 1969). Empirical data on the effect of race upon the depth of self-exploration of white counselees, however, is less clear.

Studies concerned with the effects of client's race upon counselor performance are sparse. There is some evidence that the facilitative functioning of the counselor is affected by race of the client, but the studies are few and the findings mixed and inconclusive. Limited evidence exists that prejudice is related to counseling effectiveness, but additional empirical data is needed to determine the combined effect of race and prejudice in one-to-one interpersonal relationships.

At least two theoretical viewpoints form the bases for considering the effects of mixed race on counseling relationships. Black counselors may assume that black clients have had experiences similar to their own; the same is conceivable for white counselors and counselees. This would seem

consistent with Fielder's (1951) theory of assumed similarity — the relationship is enhanced to the extent that the counselor feels that his personal characteristics resemble those of the client. In mixed counseling relationships, the individual may be perceived as different, bringing a background of experiences that retard the identification process. Grosser (1967) seems to support the notion of assumed similarity when discussing the role and importance of nonprofessional personnel in manpower development programs:

The indigenous nonprofessional is seen as having mutual interests and common cause with program participants, able to communicate freely with them, and because like them, he is poor, resides in the neighborhood, and shares minority group status, common background and language (Grosser cited by Gurin, 1968, p. 2).

Thomas (1970) also advocates assumed similarity when he states that black students prefer a counselor of the same race, as black in thinking and feeling as they.

The other theoretical point of view pertains to role theory and the role expectations generated in social encounter between blacks and whites. White society's traditional expectations of blacks have generated role behaviors that often contribute to a certain lack of openness, "gaming," and "telling the man what he would like to hear." Previous negative experiences with whites may cause blacks to develop both sensitivity and concealment of true feeling. Self-disclosure, which is basic to the counseling process, has been found to be greater among whites than blacks (Jourard and Laskow, 1958). The hesitance of blacks to fully disclose themselves, often viewed as "playing it cool," suggests a cautiousness and initial lack of trust in the person to whom one is to disclose. Under such circumstances, establishing rapport with the counselee is more difficult, requiring sensitive and skillful counselor intervention in order to facilitate authentic communication. These findings clearly imply the need to educate more blacks for counseling functions. They also call for a reexamination and modification of selection procedures to increase the probability of selecting potential counselors who, after training, can offer the core conditions essential to effective counseling and therapy.

References

- Adair, R.G. The effects of counselor-client differences in race of black clients' anticipation and perception of counselor behavior. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Auburn University, 1972.
- Banks, G., Berenson, B.G., & Carkhuff, R.R. The effects of counselor race and training upon the counseling process with negro clients in initial interviews. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 1967, 23, 70-72.
- Banks, W.M. The black client and the helping professionals. In R.L. Jones (Ed.), *Black Psychology*. New York: Harper & Row, 1972, 205-212.
- Banks, W.M. The differential effects of race and social class in counseling students. Unpublished manuscript, University of California at Berkeley, Department of Afro-American Studies, 1971.
- Barnes, K.D. The school counselor preferences of senior high school students. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University, 1970.
- Barney, P.O., & Hall, L.D. A study in discrimination. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1965, 43, 707-711.
- Burkett, L.S. Race, ethnic attitude and verbal behavior. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Florida State University, 1966.
- Burrell, L. & Rayder, N.F. Black and white students' attitudes toward white counselors. *Journal of Negro Education*, 1971, 40, 48-52.
- Carkhuff, R.R. & Banks, G. Training as a preferred mode of facilitating relations between the races and generations. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1970, 31, 412-418.
- Carkhuff, R.R. & Pierce, R. Differential effects of therapist race and social class upon patient depth of self-exploration in the initial interview. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1970, 31, 632-634.
- Combolic, P. Counselor race and experience effects on black clients. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 1972, 39, 328-332.
- Edwards, W. Behavioral decision theory. In P.R. Farnsworth, O. McNemar, and Q. McNemar (Eds.), *Annual Review of Psychology*, Palo Alto, California: Annual Reviews, 1961.
- Eiben, R.E. White counselees expressed preference for help in solving different types of problems. Unpublished manuscript, Illinois State University, 1970.
- Fielder, F.E. A method of objective quantification of certain countertransference attitudes. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 1951, 7, 101-107.
- Fischer, E.H. & Turner, J.L. Orientations to seeking professional help: development and research utility of an attitude scale. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 1970, 35, 79-90.
- Gamboa, A.M. Race and counselor climate as selected factors in the counselor preference of delinquent girls. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University, 1971.
- Gardner, L.H. The therapeutic relationship under varying conditions of race. *Psychotherapy*, 1971, 162-170.
- Gardner, W.E. Jr. A study of how selected personal characteristics of counselors are related to their effectiveness as seen by black college students. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Michigan State University, 1970.
- Grantham, R.J. The effects of counselor race, sex and language variables in counseling culturally different clients. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, State University of New York at Buffalo, 1970.
- Grier, W.H. & Cobbs, P.M. *Black rage*. New York: Bantam Books, 1968.
- Gurin, G. *Inner-city negro youth in a job training project: A study of factors related to attrition and job success*. The University of Michigan, Institute of Social Research, 1968.
- Gurin, G. & Gurin, P. Internal-external laws of control scale. The University of Michigan, Institute of Social Research, 1968.
- Harrison, D.K. Similarity-dissimilarity in counselor-counselee ethnic match and its relevance to goal behaviors of job trainees. U.S. Department of Labor, Manpower Administration, Washington, D.C., 1972.
- Heffernon, A. & Bruehl, D. Some effects of race of inexperienced lay counselors on black junior high school stu-

dents. *Journal of School Psychology*, 1971, 9, 35-37.

Jackson, G.G. & Kirschner, S. Racial self-designation and preference for a counselor. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 20, 560-564.

Johnson, J.T. Jr. A study of counselors' galvanic skin responses to video-taped stimuli or racial/sex pairing and three verbal affect situations. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Georgia, 1972.

Jones, H.T. The relationship of counselor-client personality similarity to counseling process and outcome. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Missouri, 1968.

Jourard, S.M. & Laskow, P. Some factors in self-disclosure. *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 1958, 56, 91-98.

Ledvinka, J.D. Race of the employment interviewer and the language elaboration of black job seekers. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan, 1969.

Lehman, L.C. Influence of race and dialect of communication on attitude formation. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Denver, 1969.

Mann, J.W. The effects of reflection and race on verbal conditioning of affective self-disclosure in black and white males. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Auburn University, 1972.

Mendelsohn, G.A. Effects of client personality and client counselor similarity on the duration of counseling: A replication and extension. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1966, 13, 228-234.

Mendelsohn, G.A. & Geller, M.H. Effects of counselor-client similarity on the outcome of counseling. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1963, 10, 71-77.

Milliken, R.L. Prejudice and counseling effectiveness. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1965, 43, 710-712.

Milliken, R.L. & Patterson, J.J. Relationship of dogmatism and prejudice to counseling effectiveness. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, Winter, 1967, 125-129.

Mims, J., Herron, L. & Wurtz, R.E. Parallel pigmentation and counselor satisfaction. Unpublished manuscript, Wayne State University, 1970.

Mullozzi, A.D. Interracial counseling: Clients' ratings and counselors' ratings in a first session. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Southern Illinois University, 1972.

Owens, I. The effect of the group leader(s) race on group counseling undertaken to improve intergroup attitude among racially mixed fifth and sixth grade children. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, West Virginia University, 1969.

Payne, Z.A. Race, sex and age related differences in academic counseling as they exist or are believed to exist among second year students in three selected community colleges. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Michigan State University, 1971.

Phillips, W. Counseling negro pupils: An educational dilemma. *Journal of Negro Education*, 1960, 29, 504-507.

Rosen, H. & Komorita, S.S. A decision paradigm for action research: Problems of employing the physically handicapped. *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 1969, 5, 509-518.

Rotter, J.B. Generalized expectancies for internal versus external control of reinforcement. *Psychological Monographs*, 1966, 80, Whole No. 609.

Sattler, J.M. Racial "experimenter effects" in experimentation, testing, interviewing and psychotherapy. *Psychological Bulletin*, 1970, 73, 137-160.

Silver, C. Counselor-client compatibility: A comparison of dogmatism and race in innercity college bound client decision-making. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, St. John's University, 1972.

Stranges, R., & Riccio, A. Counselor preference for counselors: Some implications for counselor implication. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 1970, 10, 39-46.

Stugart, D.B. An experimental study investigating the effects of model race and model age reference groups upon the vocational information-seeking behaviors of black male eleventh graders. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Michigan State University, 1970.

Taylor, P.L., Jr. A study of the relationships between selected variables and high and low level counselor functioning in cross-racial counseling. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of South Carolina, 1972.

Taylor, V.K. Black adult's perceptions of counselors within the counselor-client relationship. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University, 1970.

Thomas, C.W. Black-white campus issues and the function of counseling centers. In F. Kortzen, S.W. Cook, and J.I. Lacey (Eds.), *Psychology and the problems of society*, American Psychological Association, 1970, 420-426.

Touangeau, J. A comparison of the number of counseling interviews held with negro and non-negro counselees. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 1970, 7, 26-31.

Tucker, D.E. The effect of counselor experience, ethnic and sex variables upon the development of an interpersonal relationship in counseling. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The University of New Mexico, 1969.

Vontress, C.E. Counseling blacks. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1970, 48, 713-719.

Vontress, C.E. Counseling negro adolescents. *The School Counselor*, 1967, 15, 86-91.

Vontress, C.E. Racial differences: Impediments to rapport. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1971, 18, 7-12.

Walker, J.M. The effect of client race on the level of empathy of white counselor-trainees. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1970.

Wolkon, G.H., Moriwaki, S. & Williams, K.J. Race and social class as factors in the orientation toward psychotherapy. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1973, 20, 312-316.

Yomamoto, J., James, Q.C. Bloombaum, M. & Hattem, J. Racial factors in patient selection. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 1967, 124, 630-636.

Young, A.H. Race of psychotherapist and client and perception variables relevant to therapy outcome. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1972.