Gary Beckman, Yale University

The genius, wit, and spirit of a nation are discovered in its proverbs.

Francis Bacon

Mesopotamian proverbs have been discussed thoroughly by Edmund Gordon, W. G. Lambert, and Bendt Alster, but this speech genre has until now received scant attention from Hittitologists, possibly because of the scattered and uncertain nature of the relevant material in the Boğazköy archives. The term "proverb" itself is somewhat problematic—everyone knows what a proverb is, but students of proverbs have yet to agree upon a definition. Here I will simply state with Alster that proverbs are sayings of "popular currency which express common knowledge in brief and concise form. For the scholar concerned with the texts of an extinct speech community, such as the Hittites, the chief difficulty lies in the determination of popular currency. In the absence of a folk among which to conduct research, there are four basic criteria by which to recognize proverbial material in a body of texts: (1) a saying is included in a collection; (2) a saying is explicitly cited as such; (3) a saying is found in the same shape in different texts, that is, it exhibits "bound form"; and (4) a saying, if interpreted literally, appears out of place in its context. For example, the English proverb "the leopard cannot change its spots" is most often employed in nonzoological discussions.

* In this instance, as so often, I have profited greatly from discussions with Professors H. G. Güterbock and Harry A. Hoffner, who also graciously allowed me to utilize the lexical resources of the Hittite Dictionary Project of the Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago. Professor Karla Taylor has been my guide to the literary-critical literature on proverbs, and Professors W. Randall Garr, Charles Carter, and Robert Falkowitz have made helpful comments. An earlier version of this paper was presented to the annual meeting of the American Oriental Society held in Seattle in March 1984.

Abbreviations used here are those listed in J. Friedrich and A. Kammenhuber, *Hethitisches Wörterbuch*, 2d ed. (Munich, 1975-), pp. 13-33.

[JNES 45 no. 1 (1986)]
© 1986 The University of Chicago.
'All rights reserved.
0022-2968/86/4501-0002\$1.00.

- ¹ E. I. Gordon, Sumerian Proverbs: Glimpses of Everyday Life in Ancient Mesopotamia (Philadelphia, 1959); W. G. Lambert, Babylonian Wisdom Literature (Oxford, 1960), pp. 213–82; B. Alster, Studies in Sumerian Proverbs (Copenhagen, 1975); idem, "Paradoxical Proverbs and Satire in Sumerian Literature," JCS 27 (1975): 201–30.
- ² H. Hoffner informs me that Albrecht Goetze delivered a paper on this topic to the annual meeting of the American Oriental Society in 1968. This work was unfortunately never published. See also the brief remarks of R. Werner, StBoT 4, 78.
- ³ The dean of proverb studies, Archer Taylor, declares: "Let us be content with recognizing that a proverb is a saying current among the folk," *The Proverb* (1931; Hatboro, Pennsylvania, 1962), p. 3. The best theoretical discussion of the proverb known to me is A. Dundes, "On the Structure of the Proverb," *Proverbium* 25 (1975): 961-73.
 - ⁴ Alster, Studies, p. 37.
 - ⁵ Ibid., pp. 37 f.

Although the presence of trilingual Sumerian-Akkadian-Hittite tablets of "wisdom" character at Hattuša⁶ demonstrates that Hittite scribes were familiar with Mesopotamian proverb collections, we have uncovered no compendia of Hittite sayings. Thus the first criterion for proverb recognition fails us.

That the Hittites themselves were conscious of a genre of proverbs, however, is clear from a passage in the Prayer of Queen Puduḥepa to the Sun-Goddess of Arinna (CTH 384):

[1] Among humans one often speaks the proverb (memian)⁷ as follows: "A god is well disposed to a midwife." I, Puduḥepa, am a midwife, (and since) I have devoted myself to your son, be well disposed to me, O Sun-Goddess of Arinna, my lady! Give to me what [I ask of you]; grant life to [Hattušili], your servant!⁸

Thus Puduhepa appeals to what "one often says among humans"—indicating a proverb according to the second criterion—in order to persuade the goddess to heed her plea.

It is probably the same queen who cites a further proverb in a letter to a son-in-law (CTH 180):⁹

[2] Why does one speak [th]us: "The son-in-law whose wife has died remains in every sense a son-in-law"? You were my son-in-law, but you do not recognize [m]y relationship(?).10

Here the quoted saying serves to underline the queen's complaint about unfilial conduct.

⁶ CTH 315, 316, 814 (Akk. only). The first two compositions are also attested at Ugarit. H. Hoffner and H. Berman have identified KBo XII 128, assigned by E. Laroche to CTH 389, as a probable Hittite column of a bilingual Akkadian-Hittite "wisdom" text (CTH 316). Hoffner's collation, however, shows that it cannot be part of the same tablet as KBo XII 70 + KUB IV 3. On "wisdom" in general, see Excursus below.

⁷ This lexeme, whose basic sense is "utterance," has a wide range of contextually defined meanings, as may be seen from a perusal of the passages quoted in *CHD* III, s.v. (forthcoming).

8 KUB XXI 27 ii 15 ff.:

- 15. A-NA DUMU.NAM.LÚ.ULÙ^{LU}-pát-kán an-da me-mi-an kiš-an me-mi-jš-kán-zi
- 16. har-na-a-u-wa-aš-wa SAL-ni-i DINGIR^{LUM} ka-a-ri ti-y[a-zi]
- 17. am-mu-uq-qa-za ^fPu-du-hé-pa-aš har-na-a-waaš SAL-z[a...]
- 18. A-NA DUMU-KA še-ir SAG.DU-az pí-ya-an ha[r-mi]
- 19. nu-mu dÚTU URUTÚL-na GA[ŠAN-Y]A kaa-ri ti-ya
- 20. nu-ut-ta [ú-e-ik-mi] ku-it na-at-mu pa-a-i
- 21. A-M[A mHa-at-tu-ši-li l]R-KA TI-tar pa-a-i

For the translation of SAL *harnauwaš* as "midwife," see StBoT 29, 233 f.

Puduhepa returns to this theme later in the same prayer, bidding the Storm-God of Zippalanda to intercede on behalf of herself and Hattušili

iv 35. ... har-na-a-u-aš-za ķu-it SAL-za

36. A-NA DINGIR^{LIM} EN-YA S[AG].DU-za šar-ni-in-kán ḥar-mi

because I have personally made restitution for the god, my lord, as a midwife,

and because the king had exerted himself severely in rebuilding the deity's beloved town of Nerik (iv 38-42).

Significantly, the imagery of child care is also employed in another prayer of Puduhepa and Hattušili, KUB XIV 7 + KUB XXI 27 ++ (CTH 383):

iv 11. ... ma-a-an UN-aš-pát

- 12. at-ti an-ni DUMU-an šal-la-nu-zi nu-uš-ši atta-aš an-na-aš
- 13. ŠA SALUMMEDA Ú-UL im-ma pa-a-i When any person raises a child for (its) parents, do not the parents give her (the fee) of a wetnurse?

Again, the service alluded to is the restoration of Nerik to its Storm-God, child of the Sun-Goddess of Arinna and the Storm-God of Hatti. (For the equivalence of the Storm-Gods of Nerik and Zippalanda, see Goetze, Kleinasien² 140, and V. Haas, KN 107-09)

- ⁹ See O. Carruba, StBoT 2, 15 with n. 16.
 ¹⁰ KUB XXIII 85: 7 ff.:
- [kiš-]an-ma ku-wa-at me-ma-an-zi ak-kán-ta-ašwa ^{Lú} HA-DA-NU
- 8. [š]u-wa-ru-pát L^úḤA-DA-NU zi-ik-ma-mu-za L^ūḤA-DA-NU e-eš-ta
- 9. [am-me-e]l-ma-za :pur-pur-ri-ya-ma-an Ú-UL ša-ak-ti

There can be little doubt that the two sayings already adduced are genuine proverbs, in fact the only definite examples known from Hittite texts. But we enter the realm of uncertainty when reduced to the final two criteria mentioned earlier, those of "bound form" and of disharmony with the literal context. First, the Hittite corpus is not so large that we have the luxury of accepting only sayings attested in similar form in two or more contexts as proverbs. Second, not all proverbs employ metaphor and thereby lift themselves from the literal, as shown by Puduḥepa's remarks on family responsibility. Finally, it is no simple matter to distinguish nonce usages of vivid or figurative language from traditional collocations, that is, proverbs.

We may skirt these difficulties and continue our inquiry by considering the situation of the creative literary individual in Hittite society. Since he did not address himself to a sophisticated audience eager for novelty, but rather to scribal colleagues educated in a system founded on instruction by rote copying, 11 to illiterate princes via other scribes, or to the ever conservative divine world, 12 his creativity naturally took the form of innovation with traditional material. That is, while an author of any period must set his own contribution within the generic and linguistic conventions of his society, thereby participating in the evolution of these forms, the degree to which the traditional dominates the individual is particularly great in the "cuneiform civilizations." Therefore, although we may be unable to determine with certainty whether a given expression of Hittite "common knowledge" is proverbial or an example of creativity, the water in either case is drawn from the same well, Hittite tradition.

I proceed, therefore, with a selection of passages which seem to contain proverbs, ¹⁴ and no great harm will have been done if I am mistaken in this or that instance.

In his Arzawa treaties (CTH 68, etc.), Muršili II prefaces an admonition against hasty action upon idle gossip with the pessimistic comment that

[3] Since humanity is depraved, rumors constantly circulate. 15

An admonitory function is also served by the inclusion in the Instructions for Temple Personnel (CTH 264) of a bit of wisdom. Lest those responsible for the property of the deity be tempted to appropriate something for themselves, they should bear in mind that

- [4] The will of the gods is severe! It does not hasten to seize, but when it does seize, it does not let go again!¹⁶
- 11 See my discussion in "Mesopotamians and Mesopotamian Learning at Hattuša," JCS 35 (1983): 97 f., esp. n. 2.
- 12 Note the Hittite preference for addressing a deity in his or her "native" language, even when that language was no longer well understood by the Hittite worshipers, as in the case of Hattic and Palaic in the empire period.
- ¹³ The anthropological literature on this subject is vast. For an introduction, see J. Goody, *The Domestication of the Savage Mind* (Cambridge, 1977), and idem, ed., *Literacy in Traditional Societies* (Cambridge, 1968).
- 14 Possible Hittite proverbial material identified by other writers but not treated here includes *KBo* I 10 + *KUB* III 72: 7-8 (R. Falkowitz, *The Sumerian Rhetoric Collections* [forthcoming], sub comment on LC 3.17), *KBo* II 11 rev. 8 f. (*HW*² 108), *KUB* XIII

- 33 ii 12, KUB XIII 35 iv 19 f., KUB XL 88 iv 13 (all StBoT 4, 78), and KUB XL 1 rev. 11 (C. Kühne, "Bemerkungen zu kürzlich edierten hethitischen Texten," ZA 62 [1972]: 237).
 - 15 KBo V 13 iv 8 f.:
- 8. nam-ma an-tu-uḥ-ša-tar-ra ku-it mar-ša-aḥ-ḥaan nu-kán A-WA-TE^{MEŠ}
- 9. kat-ta-an píd-da-a-eš-kán-zi
- Cf. J. Friedrich, SV I 134 f., and see CHD III 196 for a listing of parallel passages.
 - ¹⁶ KUB XIII 4 ii 22 ff.:
- 22. DINGIR.MEŠ-aš-ma Z[(1-an-za da-aš-šu-)]uš nu e-ip-pu-u-wa-an-zi UL nu-un-tar-nu-zi
- 23. e-ip-zi-[(ma ku-e-d)]a-ni me-e-ḥu-ni nu namma ar-ḥa
- 24. UL tar-na-a-i

Apparent proverbs are among the elements of popular speech recorded in the "transcripts" of peculation inquests, which constitute a valuable source of late Hittite vernacular usage.¹⁷ Unable to account properly for animals in his charge, the official Ukkura admits to lax bookkeeping and carelessness but adds (CTH 293):

[5] This one disappears, and that one's still here!¹⁸

That is, while confessing to a certain incompetence, this Hittite bureaucrat seeks to dispel suspicions of venality by employing a saying reminiscent of English "Now you see it, now you don't," and "Here today and gone tomorrow." Comparable is a remark from a fragmentary inquest record (CTH 294):

[6] [Something] is on hand, (but) something (else) is not on hand. 19

In a historical text from the Old Hittite period (CTH 13), the speaker, probably Hattušili I,²⁰ makes use of a proverb:

[7] May [they tak]e away my teeth [...] with (the wood of) the apple(-tree), if I have mixed fat into the clay!²¹

The sense of this self-imprecation is admittedly obscure, but the appearance in three other contexts ($KUB \times XXXV$ 145 rev. 18; $KUB \times LIV$ 4 + $KBO \times III$ 241 rev. 28 f.; and 1308/u i 3 f.) of language identical to that of our apodosis makes it clear that traditional material is involved.²²

Similarly, in prayers (CTH 378 and 381), Muršili II and Muwatalli appeal to divine compassion by means of the same ornithological observation:

[8] (When) a bird takes refuge in its nest, 23 the nest preserves its life (var.: and it lives). 24

The god should likewise be the salvation of his servant. The use of quite similar language by the two rulers in separate compositions again supports the interpretation of the imagery as proverbial.

Restorations are from KUB XIII 5 ii 30-32 and KUB XIII 6 ii 14-16: cf. E. Sturtevant and G. Bechtel, Chrest 152 f.

¹⁷ On this characteristic of these documents, see Werner, StBoT 4, 77-79.

18 KUB XIII 35 iv 45 f.:

45. ... mar-ta-ri-wa-ra-at-kán

46. nu-wa-ra-at-kán a-aš-zi

Lit., "It disappears and it remains." See StBoT 4, 14 f., 19, and cf. Güterbock, Cor.ling 67.

19 KUB XL 88 iii 9:

[ku-it-ki] Ì.GÁL ku-it-ki-pát NU.Ì.GÁL

See StBoT4, 22 f., 26 (utilized as Bo 4867).

²⁰ See A. Kempinski and S. Košak, "CTH 13: The Extensive Annals of Hattušili I (?)," *Tel Aviv* 9 (1982): 87 f.

²¹ KBo III 46 ii 12 f.:

12. [. . . nu-mu-kán(?)] ša-am-lu-wa-an-za ga-ku-ušmu-uš

13. [...da-an-d]u(?) ma-an wa-ar-kán ú-li-ni-i anda i-mi-e-nu-un See Kempinski and Košak, pp. 89 and 92 f.

²² See Laroche, "Etudes de linguistique anatolienne: 13. Hittite *kaga*-," *RHA* 31 (1973): 90 f.; and my comments in *StBoT* 29, 197.

²³ Güterbock, "The Ahhiyawa Problem Reconsidered," AJA 87 (1983): 137 f., suggests this translation for (-za) appa ep- in KUB XXIII 13: 5 (see H. Hoffner, review of Friedrich and Kammenhuber, HW², Lieferungen 2 and 3 [Heidelberg, 1977] in BiOr 37 [1980]: 201), and it fits well into the present context. See also Güterbock, "Hittites and Akhaeans: A New Look," Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society 128 (1984): 119.

²⁴ Muršili (*CTH* 378)—*KUB* XIV 8 rev. 22:

MUŠEN-iš-za-kán GIŠ tap-ta-ap-pa-an EGIR-pa e-ip-zi na-an GIŠ tap-ta-ap-pa-aš hu-u-[iš-nu-zi]

Muwatalli (CTH 381)—KUB VI 45 iii 40:

MUŠEN-za[!] ^{Giš}tap-tap-pa-an EGIR-pa e-ip-zi na-aš TI-iš-zi[!]

and dupl. KUB VI 46 iv 9 f.:

A final example along these lines is from the Bilingual Edict of Hattušili I (CTH 6). where courtiers are enjoined:

[9a] Let your clan be [united] like that of the wetna-!²⁵

which is to be compared to, and mutually restored from, a passage in Hattušili's shorter edict (CTH 5):

[9b] Let [y]our clan, that of my servants, be united like that of the wolf!²⁶

Although it is no longer held that wetna- is the Hittite reading of the Sumerogram UR.BAR.RA, "wolf,"²⁷ the term must nonetheless designate some beast. Therefore, we encounter here the same concept in the two passages, i.e., the body of the king's followers should be as cohesive as a hunting group of carnivores.

Animal imagery such as this is frequently employed in Hittite texts, and in many instances it is seemingly proverbial. In the historical introduction to the Akkadianlanguage Šunaššura Treaty (CTH 41), there is a discussion of the shifting allegiances of the land of Kizzuwatna. Once under Hittite domination, Kizzuwatna had gone over to the king of Mitanni, who boasted to his Hittite rival:

[10] Now, finally, the cattle have chosen their stable. They have definitely come to my country!

But upon recovery of this area, Suppilulium could throw this back in the face of the Hurrian:

Now (the people of) Kizzuwatna are Hittite cattle and have chosen their stable!²⁸

More frequent than the quotation of a complete saving is the allusion to proverbial material, to widely held conceptions about the qualities, behavior, or origins of common objects, plants, and animals.²⁹ In particular, the characteristic Hittite genre of analogic

[šu-me-en-za-na] ú-e-it-na-aš ma-a-an pa-an-ku-urše-me-i[t 1^{EN}] e-eš-du

See F. Sommer and A. Falkenstein, HAB 8 f. Although this is the sole attestation of phonetic wetna-, a restoration [hu-]ú-e-it-na-aš, "of wildlife (in general)," as suggested by Laroche, review of Friedrich, Hethitisches Wörterbuch, 3. Ergänzungsheft (Heidelberg, 1966), RA 62 (1968): 88, must be rejected on contextual grounds; see already HAB77, n. 1. ²⁶ KBo III 27: 15 f.:

15. [šu-]mi-in-za-na lR.MEŠ-am-ma-an UR.BAR.RAaš ma-a-an pa-an-g[ur-še-me-it]

16. 1^{EN} e-eš-tu

See HAB75 with n. 2.

27 See H. Otten, "Noch einmal hethitisch 'Löwe'" WO 5 (1969): 94 f., where the equation of hartaggawith UR.BAR.RA is strongly supported.

²⁸ KBo I 5 i 17-19, 30 f.:

17. i-na-an-na-mi ap-pu-na-am-ma GUD.HI.A

- 18. É.GUD.HI.A-šu-nu ú-wa-ad-du-nim-mi ap-puna-am-ma
- 19. i-na KUR-va il-li-ku-um-mi . . .
- 30. i-na-an-na KUR URU Ki-iz-zu-wa-at-ni ša URU Haat-ti GUD.HI.A
- 31. ù É.GUD.HI.A-šu-nu ú-wa-ad-du-nim

See Goetze, Kizz 39, n. 151.

²⁹ To be noted in this regard are epithets applied to animals. For instance, at KUB XII 34 ii 25 (CTH 404-L. Rost, "Ein hethitisches Ritual gegen Familienzwist," MIO 1 [1953]: 358), the harziyala-("snail"(?)"—see C. Watkins, "Hittite harziyalla-," FsG. A. Kerns 345-48) is called pit-ti-va-li-iš (dupl. KBo IX 106 ii 24: pid-da-al-li-iš) GIR-aš, "fleet foot," while in the same ritual (KUB XXXIV 84 ++ obv. 15—Rost, "Ein hethitisches Ritual," p. 350, cum. line count i 40) the fish is referred to as a-ru-na-aš GUD.MAH-aš, "the ox of the river" (see Carruba, StBoT 2, 23, and H. Otten, RIA, vol. 3, p. 68). Unclear is the mention in KUB VIII 67 iv 17 (CTH 348.2—J. Siegelová, StBoT 14, 40 f.) of IKU-aš-ma KU₆.HI.A-uš ID-aš UR.ZIR, "the fish of the field (?), the dog of the river" as the food of the monster Hedammu.

^{9.} MUŠEN-za GIŠtap-tap-pa-an EGIR-pa e-ip-zi 10. na-aš hu-i-iš-zi

²⁵ KUB I 16 ii 46:

magic³⁰ is based upon this store. A typical example (CTH 395) includes these analogies:

[11] As a small (piece) escapes the grinding stone, may the offerant likewise escape the mouth of the god Agni!; as the rear wheel does not catch up to the front, may the evil day likewise not catch up to the offerant!³¹

From the Laws (CTH 291) comes a probable reference to an animal proverb. In § 37 we read:

[12] If someone elopes with a woman, and a rescuer goes after them—if two or three men die, there is no legal compensation. "You have become a wolf!" 32

That is, through his crime the offender has set himself apart from the human community and its norms and sanctions.³³ The exclamation is introduced here abruptly,³⁴ without a verb of speech, as befits proverbial material according to the fourth criterion listed earlier.

An animal reference also appears in a complaint made by Hattušili III in an Akkadian-language letter to an Assyrian king (CTH 173):

[13] Why do the men of Turiya sniff at(?) the gift of me, the lion?³⁵

This allegation of ingratitude should be compared to the English saying "Don't look a gift horse in the mouth." While Goetze's suggestion that this remark "alludes to a

- ³⁰ See Goetze, *Kleinasien*² 156-58, and also my comments in *StBoT* 29, 17 f.
 - 31 KBo XI 14 ii 20 ff.:
- 20. NA4ARÀ-za-kán GIM-an kap-pí-iš iš-pár-ti-i-e-iz-zi
- 21. EN.SISKUR-kán ^dA-ag-ni KA×U-za QA-TAM-MA iš-pár-ti-id-du
- 22. IGI-zi-an GIM-an ^{Gis}hur-ki-in EGIR-zi-iš an-da Ú-UL
- 23. ú-e-mi-ya-zi i-da-lu-uš-ša UD.KAM-az
- 24. EN.SISKUR li-e KAR-zi
- Cf. Hoffner, Al. Heth 134 f.
- ³² KBo VI 2 + (see B. Hrozný, CH, pl. 5, and cf. Güterbock, review of Friedrich, Die hethitischen Gesetze [Leiden, 1959], JCS 15 [1961]: 68) ii 10 ff.:
- ták-ku SAL-na-an ku-iš-ki pít-ti-nu-uz-zi n[u(?)-kán(?) šar-d]i-i-eš a-ap-pa-an an-da pa-a-an-z[i]
- 11. ták-ku 3 LÚ.MEŠ na-aš-ma 2 LÚ.MEŠ a[(k-kán-z)]i šar-ni-ik-zi-il NU.GÁ[(L)]
- 12. zi-ik-wa UR.BAR.RA-aš ki-iš-ta-at
- H. Otten and V. Souček, StBoT 8, 94, read [k]u-i-eš at the end of the break in 1. 10, which must be rejected both because the dupl. KBo VI 3 ii 29 has [ša]r-di-ya-aš and because it is probably the shared usage of the word šardi- which accounts for the placement of § 38 after this paragraph—see already Souček, "Bemerkungen zur Schlussformel der hethitischen Gesetze," ArOr 29 (1961): 22, n. 121.
- ³³ On the Indo-European background of the comparison of a human criminal to a wolf, see V. Ivanov,

"On the Interpretation of the § 37 of the Hittite Laws in the Light of Other Indo-European Traditions," Linguistica 13 (1973): 102-10, and cf. also V. Korošec, "Einige Probleme zur Struktur der hethitischen Gesetze," Acta Antiqua 22 (1974): 297 with n. 34. Do obv. 17-23 of the poorly preserved KUB XLIII 22 perhaps deal in greater detail with a case such as that described in Law § 37?

34 See, for example, Korošec "Raub und Kaufehe im hethitischen Recht," in Studi in onore di S. Ricobono, vol. 1. (Palermo, 1932), p. 565 ("eine feierliche Erklärung"), R. Haase, "Bemerkungen zu einigen Paragraphen der hethitischen Gesetzestexte," ArOr 26 (1958): 34 f., and C. Watkins "Studies in Indo-European Legal Language, Institutions, and Mythology," in G. Cardona et al., eds., Indo-European and Indo-Europeans (Philadelphia, 1970), p. 324.

35 KBo I 14 obv. 18 f.:

- 18. ... am-mi-ni a-na ya-ši UR.MAH
- 19. LÚ.MEŠ URU Tu-u-ri-ya SUM-ya ú-uz-za-nu-ni-ni

The sense of the verb here is not certain. AHw. 252 lists it as "unkl." under the D-stem of eṣēnu, a form it renders as "beriechen, beschnüffeln." This interpretation informs my understanding of the passage. However, while CAD E 345 does not cite KBo 1 14, it translates uṣṣunu as "to smell bad, to make (something) smell bad." If this is the nuance intended by the Hittite scribe, Hattušili's complaint is rather "Why do they find foul (lit.: cause to stink) my gift?"

popular tale about a lion and some contemptible animal"³⁶ may well be correct, it was a venerable tradition in Hatti to compare the monarch to the king of beasts.³⁷

A particularly interesting use of a proverb is contained in an incantation to chthonic deities (CTH 447):

[14] O Sun-Goddess of the Earth, the king and queen have now heaped up for themselves the Black Earth (i.e., dug a ritual pit). The (materials of) the ritual concerning (evil omen) birds, (namely) nine sheep, nine loaves, (and) nine libation jugs (are placed) on the right. Cock a favorable (lit.: the right)³⁸ ear to them, O Sun-Goddess of the Earth, and receive this ritual with your right hand! And if it was a bird of evil (omen), you change it, O Sun-Goddess of the Earth! Render it nine times favorable! "The tongue is a bridge!"

Set out, O Sun-Goddess of the Earth! Make everything favorable; attend to it! If you do not attend to it, let the divine oath of this ritual proceed to seize you, O Sun-Goddess of the Earth!³⁹

In this instance the disharmony of the proverbial material with its context is particularly apparent. Nothing before or after the sentence "The tongue is a bridge" deals with human anatomy, with curses, or with architecture. Of the entire incantation, this sentence alone is provided with the quotative particle, thus setting it off explicitly. Here on the juncture between the request and the threat to the deity, the proverb affirms the power of the incantation to achieve the goals of the practitioner. The incantation, often referred to as a "tongue" in Hittite magic,⁴⁰ is a bridge⁴¹ between the human and the divine world. The inevitable oral accompaniment to offering or manipulation of ritual equipment renders explicit the logic of the magic and leaves even the most recalcitrant deity no choice but to comply with the human request.

We can now see that the function of proverbial material in Hittite texts is identical to that of the analogic magic incantations in rituals. Just as this analogic magic ensures

³⁶ Kizz 28, n. 113. No translation is offered.

37 The use of this imagery is quite frequent in historical texts of the Old Hittite period. To cite just one example, in his Bilingual Edict (KUB I 16 ii 39—CTH 6), Hattušili I predicts of his successor: [DINGIR^L]^{IM-} iš UR.MAH-aš pí-di UR.[MAH-an-pát tittanuzi(?)]

The [go]d [will install(?) only a] li[on] in the place of the lion.

³⁸ See Güterbock, "A Hurro-Hittite Hymn to Ishtar," *JAOS* 103 (1983): 161 for the interpretation of the adverb *kunna*, lit. "on the right," as "propitiously, pleasingly." On the symbolism of bodily symmetry, see the collection of essays edited by R. Needham, *Right and Left* (Chicago, 1973).

39 KBo XI 10 iii 10 ff.:

- 10. [(ták-n)]a-aš dUTU-uš ka-a-ša LUGAL SAL.LUGAL GE₆-in KI-an
- 11. pār-ki-ya-an-ta-at na-aš-ta MUŠEN^{HI.A} -aš SISKUR.SISKUR
- 12. 9 UDU^{BLA} 9 NINDA.KUR₄.RA 9 ^{DUG}iš-pa-an-du-uz-zi ZAG-az
- 13. nu-uš-ma-aš ták-na-aš dUTU-uš ZAG-an UZUGEŠTU-na-an
- 14. pa-ra-a e-ip nu-uš-ma-aš-kán ki-i SISKUR ZAG-az
- 15. ŠU-az ar-ha da-a na-aš ma-a-an HUL-uš

MUŠEN-iš

- 16. zi-ga-an KI-aš dUTU-uš wa-ah-nu-ut na-an 9-ŠU
- 17. SIG5-in MUŠEN-in i-ya EME-aš-wa GIŠar-mi-iz-zi
- 18. na-aš-ta KI-aš dUTU-uš i-ya-an-nį nu hu-uma-an
- SIG₅-in i-ya na-at-kán aš-nu-ut ma-a-na-at-kán
 Ú-UL-ma aš-nu-ši nu-ut-ta ú-id-du ki-i ŠA SISKUR.SISKUR
- 21. NI-EŠ DINGIR^{LIM} tu-uk ták-na-aš ^dUTU-un e-ip-du

Restorations are from KBo XI 72 + KBo XX 92 ii 47 ff., which has a few variants insignificant for our purposes. Cf. CHD III 22 ("The tongue is a bridge."), StBoT 2, 21 ("und die Zunge (sei) Brücke"), and Otten, "'Brücken' im hethitischen Schrifttum," FsBittel 434 ("Die Zunge (Rede) ist eine Brücke."). The interpretation presented by HW² 327—"Mache es (Opfer) zu einem 9x günstigen Vogel (der sagt) 'Brücke der Zunge' (sc. zu den Göttern)"—is in my opinion forced. See Hoffner, review of Friederich and Kammenhuber, HW², Lieferungen 4 and 5 (Heidelberg, 1979–80), BiOr 40 (1983): 412.

40 See CHD III 23-25.

⁴¹ Note that the denominal verb *armizziya*-, "to bridge, überbrücken," could be used in a metaphorical sense; see HW^2 327.

that the action carried out on the physical level will find its equivalent in the realm of nonhuman forces, so the citation of, or allusion to, a proverb mobilizes the authority of Hittite tradition in the service of the rhetorical and social goals of the author. Indeed, because this material was shared by all participants in Hittite culture, its citation is often laconic, and its interpretation correspondingly difficult for the modern researcher.

I have restricted myself in this discussion to a few of the clearer examples of Hittite proverbs and proverbial allusions. A great many more are available, particularly in the incantations.

EXCURSUS

HITTITE "WISDOM LITERATURE"?

This paper raises the question of whether the Hittites possessed a literary genre comparable to the "wisdom literature" of the Old Testament. 42 At the outset of his study of Akkadian "wisdom" texts, Lambert admits the difficulty of employing this generic classification in connection with a text corpus other than that to which it is native:

"Wisdom" is strictly a misnomer as applied to Babylonian literature. As used for a literary genre the term belongs to Hebraic studies and is applied to Job, Proverbs, and Ecclesiastes. Here "Wisdom" is a common topic and is extolled as the greatest virtue. While it embraces intellectual ability the emphasis is more on pious living: the wise man fears the Lord. 43

This theological position is of course absent from ancient Mesopotamia, but Lambert nonetheless finds it useful to designate as "wisdom" those Akkadian literary works corresponding in subject matter to the Hebrew wisdom books.

Since Yahwist piety informs no Hittite texts, may we follow Lambert in recognizing a more general "wisdom" in Hittite analogues to Proverbs, Job, and Ecclesiastes? Such an approach yields little: in regard to the first Hebrew book, I have already mentioned that no collections of native Hittite proverbs are known. And although the Story of Appu (CTH 360)⁴⁴ is somewhat reminiscent of Job—both in the initial situation of its protagonist and in its Märchen-like character⁴⁵—the similarities are superficial. Finally, although both texts present advice to posterity from a wise and experienced ruler, ⁴⁶ the

42 On this genre in Mesopotamia, see most recently Sara Denning Bolle, "Wisdom in Akkadian Literature: Expression, Instruction, Dialogue" (Ph.D. diss., University of California, Los Angeles, 1982), in which extensive bibliography is presented. For an interesting application of genre theory to the comparative study of Mesopotamian and Israelite literature, see Tremper Longman III, "Fictional Akkadian Royal Autobiography: A Generic and Comparative Study" (Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1983).

43 Lambert, Babylonian Wisdom Literature, p. 1.

44 Edited by Siegelová, StBoT 14, 1-34.

45 See C. Grottanelli, "Observations sur l'histoire d'Appou," RHA 36 (1978): 49-57. To the proemium of this text, which seems to set forth the "moral" illustrated by the tale itself, compare now the fragmentary introduction to the Story of Silver (CTH 364), published by H. Hoffner and myself as

no. 12 in Hittite Fragments in American Collections (New Haven, 1985)=JCS 37 (1985): 23.

46 The display of wisdom in a more general sense is limited largely to the Hittite king himself. In addition to the wise policies enunciated in the various royal edicts (CTH 5, 6, 19, etc.), note the contrast between the intelligent orders issued by the king and the bumbling efforts of his officers to carry them out in the Siege of Uršu (CTH 7; see Güterbock, "Die historische Tradition und ihre literarische Gestaltung bei Babyloniern und Hethitern bis 1200," ZA 44 [1936]: 130). The sole example known to me of a royal advisor is Pimpira/it, author of the Fürstenspiegel CTH 24 (latest edition by A. Archi, in FsLaroche 39-44), who was himself a member of the royal house (see Archi, "L'Humanité des hittites," FsLaroche 39, n. 20).

Bilingual Edict of Hattušili I (CTH 6)⁴⁷ and Ecclesiastes differ radically in purpose and spirit.

An examination of the vocabulary of "wisdom" offers a second approach. According to a standard Hebrew lexicon⁴⁸ hkmh, "wisdom," may be more closely defined thus: "(1) skill in war; (2) wisdom in administration; (3) shrewdness; (4) prudence in religious affairs; (5) ethical and religious wisdom." By far, the bulk of the attestations, and almost all of those occurring in the three wisdom books mentioned earlier, are assigned to meaning 5.

hattatar, the Hittite noun usually translated "wisdom," is found most frequently in the divine epithet *hattannaš* EN/LUGAL, "lord/king of wisdom." The god thus qualified is usually Ea⁵⁰—but in a single text Kumarbi⁵¹—and the term is clearly a calque of the Akkadian $b\bar{e}l$ $n\bar{e}meqi(m)$. 52

hattatar is generally the possession of a deity. In the myths of the Kumarbi cycle we encounter the construction -za GALGA-tar/hattatar ištanzani piran/kattan da-, "to take hattatar into one's mind." For example:

Kumarbi takes *hattatar* into his mind, he who rears the (evil) day (and) the evil person. He (under)takes for himself evil against the Storm-God, and he rears a replacement⁵³ for the Storm-God.⁵⁴

Since this text proceeds to detail the initial actions in Kumarbi's scheme of revenge, a translation "plan of action, plot" is appropriate here.

Elsewhere *hattatar* is a quality dispensed by deities. The recipient might be another god, as in the prediction of a deity about to be born:

54 KUB XXXIII 98 i 4-8 (CTH 345):

- 4. ... nu-za dKu-mar-pí-iš GAL[GA-]tar (dupl.: ha-at-<ta>>tar) ZI-ni
- [k]at-ta-an(dupl.: pí-an) da-aš-ki-iz-zi UD.K[(AM-a)]n ku-iš (dupl. omits) LÚ.HUL-an
- 6. šal-la-nu-uš-ki-iz-zi nu-za dŲ-[(n)]i me-na-ahha-an-da
- 7. HUL-tar da-aš-ki-iz-zi nu dU-ni me-na-ah-ha-
- 8. tar-pa-na-al-li-in šal-la-nu-uš-ki-iz-zi

I have included only those variants from the duplicate KUB XXXIII 96 i 5-8 which are relevant for the present discussion. (For a complete edition, see Güterbock, "The Song of Ullikummi," JCS 5 [1951]: 146 f.). The interchange of preverbs in the duplicates suggests that the variation is merely stylistic. Other similar passages are KUB XXXIII 98 i 9-10 (dupl. KUB XXXIII 96 i 9-11); KUB XXXIII 101 + KBO XXVI 69 iii 6-8; KUB XXXIII 106 iv 25-26; KUB XXXIII 119: 9(?); and KUB XXXIII 113 + XXXVI 12 i 14-15. Since the reflexive particle is found in all cases where the text is preserved, it should be restored also (contra Güterbock's transliteration, "The Song of Ullikummi (continued)," JCS 6 [1952]: 10) in the last passage cited.

Old Testament prophets often speak out on contemporary problems in an attempt to correct the policies of the monarch. Such activity is not, however, attested for the Hittite Liúsiuniyant-, "ecstatic, prophet" (see Goetze, "Die Pestgebete des Muršiliš," KIF 1 [1927]: 233). Note only that the "men of the gods" (ši-ú-na-an an-tu-uḥ-ši-iš), who may be the same group, bemoan the internecine bloodshed in the time of Telepinu (KBo III 1 ii 32 f.—CTH 19).

⁴⁷ Edited by Sommer and Falkenstein, HAB.

⁴⁸ F. Brown, S. R. Driver, and C. A. Briggs, eds., A Hebrew and English Lexicon of the Old Testament (Oxford, 1907), p. 315.

⁴⁹ See *HW* 65: "Weisheit, Verstand, weiser Rat." See the basic discussion of this word and its family, -HAB 97-100.

⁵⁰ E.g., KBo IV 1 i 32 f. = KUB II 2 i 40.

⁵¹ KUB XXXIII 120 ii 5: ha!-at!-ta!-an-na-aš har-\$um!-na-aš [EN-]aš, and iii 15: ha-at-ta-an-na-aš har-\$um-na-aš EN-aš. This expanded form of the epithet, to be translated "lord of wisdom (and) of the headwaters," contains a reference to the Apsu; see Laroche, "Etudes de toponymie anatolienne," RHA 69 (1961): 79.

⁵² See *CAD* N/II 161 (c.1'); and n. 66 below.

⁵³ See H. M. Kümmel, StBoT 3, 36 f.

The Earth will give me her strength; Heaven will [g]ive me his heroism; Anu will give me his manhood; Kumarbi will give me his hattatar. 55

As an abstract term, comparable to "strength" and "heroism," *hattatar* should mean something like "capacity to generate a plot."

A human might also receive *hattatar* from a beneficent deity. The Prayer of Kantuzili (CTH 373) includes this praise:

Ever since I was born, I have experienced all of the compassion (and) hattatar of my god.⁵⁶

In contrast, Muršili II reproaches the gods in one of his prayers (CTH 376) for withholding the same:

Your *hattatar* has been cut off from humanity, so that the correct thing which we would do is nought.⁵⁷

Since this human incompetence is a consequence of the absence of divine *hattatar*, the nuance of the word here must be "advice" or "guidance."

Only two texts present *hattatar* on a strictly human level. Most important of these is the Bilingual Edict. Hattušili first instructs his subordinates:

But now [you who k]now my words and my hattatar—make my son h. (hattahheš-)!,

and later he directly addresses his heir:

Let this [tabl]et be read before you monthly, so that you will press my [wo]rds and my *hattatar* to (your) heart!⁵⁸

In this document *hattatar* seems to encompass both shades of meaning met thus far—the *hattatar* of the old king is guidance for the younger, while Muršili's *hattatar* must be his own skill in rule. Significant is the close connection of *hattatar* with words, for guidance and instruction would have of necessity been imparted orally to most Hittites.⁵⁹

Of great interest is the Hittite translation of a lost Akkadian proverb:60

⁵⁵ KUB XXXIII 120 ii 8-9 (CTH 344):

- 8. KI-aš-mu KAL-tar-še-it pa-a-i AN-iš-mu UR.SAG-li-ya-tar-še-it [pa]-a[-i]
- 9. dA-nu-ša-mu LÚ-na-tar-še-it pa-a-i dKu-marbi-ša-mu ha-at-ta-tar pa-a-i

The remainder of this passage is too damaged to be of use here, but note also line 12: na-ak-ki-ya-tar-še-it ḥa-at-ta-tar-še-it-ta pa-a-i, "will give his(?) power and his ḥattatar." Cf. also KUB XXXIII 105 i 10 ff.

56 KUB XXX 10 obv. 11: ku-i-ta im-ma mi-e\(\)-\text{ta-in-ta inu-za-ta} \(\) \(\) \(\) DINGIR-YA du-ud-du-mar \(\)

⁵⁷ KUB XXIV 3 ii 17–19 (CTH 376):

- 17. ... na-aš-t[(a A-NA DUMU.LÚ.ULÙ^{LU})]
- 18. ha-at-ta-tar-šum-mi-it har-ak-[(t)a (nu ku-unna-an ku-it i-ya<-u->e-ni)]
- 19. na-at NU.GÁL

Restorations are from KUB XXIV 4 obv. 8-9; see R. Lebrun, Hymnes et prières hittites (Louvain, 1980), p. 160.

⁵⁸ KUB I 16 ii 56–57:

- 56. [šu-um-me-eš-m]a ki-nu-na ud-da-a-ar-mi-it ha-at-ta-a-da-mi-it-ta
- 57. [ku-i-e-eš ša-]ak-te-ni nu DUMU-la-ma-an ha-at-ta-ah-hi-iš-ki-te-en

Ibid. iii 56-58:

- 56. ... nu ki-i
- 57. [tup-p]í ITU-mi ITU-mi pí-ra-an-ti-it hal-zi-ešša-an-du nu-za-an
- 58. [ud-da-]a-ar-me-it ḫa-at-ta-<ta->me-it-ta karta ŝi-iš-at-ti

See *HAB* 8 f. and 14 f. The Akkadian correspondence of neither passage has been preserved.

59 Cf. also KUB XXXIII 101 + KBo XXVI 69: 7:

GALGA(?)-tar me-mi-iš-ki-nu-un.

60 See n. 6 above.

Be quiet now and listen! Such matters as concern (lit.: are placed before) a mortal—research (?)⁶¹ them by means of ⁶² your *hattatar*! Maintain them by means of regulation! Know them by heart!⁶³ Inquire into them by means of the assembly! Look them up on the wooden tablets!⁶⁴

Although *hattatar* stands here at the head of the resources available to the mortal, nothing in the Hittite material suggests that it was the highest virtue. LÚ-*natar*, "manliness," and *innarawatar*, "strength," for example, are mentioned far more frequently, and *hattatar* never appears among the boons requested on behalf of the royal family in the cult.⁶⁵ Nor is *hattatar* divinized.⁶⁶

In addition to the noun *hattatar*, there exists a poorly attested adjective *hattant*, "characterized by h.," and a verb *hattahheš*-, "to make h.," found only in the passage from the Bilingual Edict quoted above. Whatever the etymological connection between the family of words under consideration and the verb *hatta*-, "to cut, hew," the participle of this latter word is identical in form to our *hattant*-. Therefore, it is not always possible to distinguish the two words and/or meanings in broken or obscure contexts.

There are only three certain attestations of the adjective.⁶⁹ Note first yet another translated proverb:

[Do not buy(?)] a meretricious(?) man! [Purchase(?)] a hattant- companion!⁷⁰

and a similar passage from a myth:

Continually seek for yourself *hattant*- men [...(?)]!⁷¹

61 This translation of *arha au(§)*- is only a suggestion. Elsewhere this combination is always employed in connection with looking out a window, excepting only *KUB* XXIV 7 iii 21, where a directional sense is nonetheless present; see Friedrich, *ZA* 49 (1950): 226 f.

62 See H. C. Melchert, "Ablative and Instrumental in Hittite" (Ph.D. diss., Harvard University, 1977), p. 406, for the possibility that several of the ablatives in this passage indicate the source of the information sought.

63 C. Justus, Mat.heth. Thes 10/7 (1981): 54, translates kardit šak- here simply as "learn." It is difficult to see how such an action in the present context could be "unintentional" as Justus claims for usages of šak- without -za (p. 1). With this usage, cf. karta (šai-), on which see StBoT 29, 163 f.

64 KBo XII 128 rt. col. 6-14:

- 6. nu-uk-ku ka-ru-uš-ten nu GEŠTUG-ten
- 7. nu DUMU.LÚ.ULÙ^{LU}-li ku-e INIM.MEŠ-ar
- 8. pí-an GAM GAR-ri
- 9. na-at-za-kán ha-ad-da-na-za
- 10. ar-ḥa a-uš-ten
- 11. na-at iš-hi-ú-la-za ha[r]-ten
- 12. na-at ŠÀ-it še-ik-ten
- 13. na-at tu-li-ya-za pu-nu-[u]š-ten
- 14. na-at GIS.HUR-za a-uš-ten
 - 65 See StBoT 29, 4, 11.

66 Note only d Hazziz(z)i from Akk. hasīsu—"ear, understanding"), in Hurrian-influenced contexts, which Laroche, GLH 100, understands as a divinized attribute of Ea, corresponding to hattatar.

67 Sommer and Falkenstein, HAB 100, suggest a connection with this verb, while J. Tischler, HEG 214 f. and 222, posits a second, homophonous verb *hatta-, "denken, überlegen, klug sein," underlying hattatar and its relatives.

68 Uncertain are ha-at-ta-an-te-eš in KUB XXXIII
118 i(?) 26, and aššauwa mīyauwa ha-at-ta-an-ta
uid[du] in KBo XVII 105 iii 7-8. Hoffner has
suggested to me that in view of the latter context—the
referent is uddār in iii 6—we may be dealing here
with an assimilated form of handant-, "pleasant."

69 See also KUB XXXIII 120 iii 38:]-mi IGI.GÁLan-za-aš.

- 70 KUB IV 3 + KBo XII 70 ii 33-35 (CTH 316):
 - 33. me-iš-ri-wa-an-da-an-za UN-an [lē wašti(?)]
 - 34. (blank)
 - 35. a-ra-an-za ha-ad-da-an-da-an [waš(?)]

The Akkadian correspondence here is unclear. See Laroche, *Ugar* V 781.

- ⁷¹ KBo XXVI 88 i 5-6 (CTH 346):
- 5. ... nu-za ha-at-ta-an-du-uš UN.MEŠ-u[š... (?)]
- 6. [š]a-an-hi-eš-ki . . .

Unclear, but certainly belonging here, is a line from the Tale of the Fisherman (CTH 363):⁷²

The mind of the woman is *hattant*-. 73

These examples of the adjective confirm that the related *hattatar* is a positive attribute, but they add nothing to our understanding of this lexical family.

In summary, we may define *hattatar* thus: "(1) a plan or plot (for oneself); (2) advice, guidance (for others); (3) the ability to generate 1 or 2." Both the passages from the Bilingual Edict and several mythological contexts show that *hattatar* could be imparted by its possessor to another. Finally, *hattatar* is usually the possession of a deity or a human of high rank. Although "wisdom" is not inappropriate in some instances, the best single English translation would appear to be "cunning."

Comparing this result to the meanings of Hebrew hkmh adduced above, we see that hattatar might well encompass meanings 1-3. There is, however, no evidence that the Hittite word covered either meaning 4 or, more importantly, meaning 5. Thus it is best to avoid the term "wisdom" in discussions of Hittite intellectual categories and literary genres.

72 For the immediately preceding context see StBoT 29, 154. 73 KUB XXIV 7 iv 49:... SAL-aš Zl-an-za ha-ad-da-an-za... See already HAB 99.