	TABLE I		
PSNR (dB) RESULTS FOR IMAGE	CORRUPTED BY	GAUSSIAN AND	IMPULSE NOISE

Filter Type	Image		
	Lenna	Home	Harbor
Median (3x3)	31.36	26.67	24.65
Bidirectional multistage median (5x5)	31.58	28.73	28.02
WM1	31.58	28.87	27.84
WM2	29.85	27.92	27.71
WM3	32.00	28.08	26.29
Spline filter	32.96	31.89	31.54

s. It should be noted, however, that the code of the proposed method and the other methods has not been optimized.

The convergence of the proposed method has been studied experimentally. The algorithm converged for each block of data in the sliding window during the image restoration.

## V. CONCLUSION

A new image approximation scheme is proposed. The structural constraints are incorporated in an iterative M-estimator algorithm. As a result, an image modeling method is obtained that is not influenced by outliers and reduces Gaussian and heavy-tailed noise efficiently; and, at the same time it retains important details. The images are modeled as tensor product bicubic B-splines. The smoothing parameter  $\lambda$  is estimated separately for each processing window, thus allowing it to adapt to local structures of the image. As a result, one can expect excellent Gaussian noise removal in smooth and slowly varying areas where  $\lambda$  is large and at the same time very good preservation of important details (small values of  $\lambda$ ). Results obtained by applying the filter based on the presented approximation algorithm to real scenes indicate that this method is robust with respect to variations in the statistics of both the noise and the image.

### REFERENCES

- M. Berman, "Automated smoothing of images and other regularly spaced data," *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Machine Intell.*, vol. 16, pp. 460–468, 1994.
- [2] M. J. Black and A. Rangarajan, "The outlier process: Unifying line processes and robust statistics," in *Proc. 1994 IEEE Computer Society Conf. Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition*, Seattle, WA, 1994, pp. 15–22.
- [3] A. Blake and A. Zisserman, *Visual Reconstruction*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1987.
- [4] C. de Boor, A Practical Guide to Splines, vol. 27. Berlin, Germany: Springer-Verlag, 1978.
- [5] R. L. Eubank, Spline Smoothing and Nonparametric Regression. New York: Dekker, 1988.
- [6] F. R. Hampel, E. M. Ronchetti, P. J. Rousseeuw, and W. A. Stahel, *Robust Statistics: An Approach Based on Influence Functions*. New York: Wiley, 1986.
- [7] P. J. Huber, Robust Statistics. New York: Wiley, 1981.
- [8] , "Robust smoothing," in *Robustness in Statistics*. New York: Academic, 1979.
- [9] M. Karczewicz, M. Gabbouj, and J. Astola, "Robust B-Spline image smoothing," in *Proc. IEEE Int. Conf. Image Processing*, Austin, TX, Nov. 1994, pp. 540–544.
- [10] M. Karczewicz, M. Gabbouj, and I. Defée, "Edge detection using robust B-spline," in *Proc. NORSIG-94, Nordic Signal Processing Symp.*, Alesund, Norway, June 2–4, 1994, pp. 190–194.
- [11] K. J. Kerpez, "Minimum mean square error impulse noise estimation and cancellation," *IEEE Trans. Signal Processing*, vol. 43, pp. 1651–1662, 1995.

- [12] A. Nieminen, P. Heinonen, and Y. Neuvo, "A new class of detailpreserving filters for image processing," *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Machine Intell.*, vol. PAMI-9, pp. 74–90, 1987.
- [13] I. Pitas and A. N. Venetsanopoulos, *Nonlinear Digital Filters*. Boston, MA: Kluwer, 1991, pp. 49–51.
- [14] W. H. Pun and B. D. Jeffs, "Adaptive image restoration using a generalized Gaussian model for unknown noise," *IEEE Trans. Image Processing*, vol. 4, pp. 1451–1456, 1995.
- [15] S. S. Sinha and B. G. Schunck, "A two-stage algorithm for discontinuity preserving surface reconstruction," *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Machine Intell.*, vol. 14. pp. 36–55, 1992.
- [16] D. Terzopoulos, "The computation of visible-surface representations," IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Machine Intell., vol. 10, pp. 417–438, 1988.
- [17] A. Thompson, J. Brown, and D. Titterington, "A study of methods of choosing the smoothing parameters in image restoration by regularization," *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Machine Intell.*, vol. 13, pp. 326–339, 1991.
- [18] V. Torre and T. A. Poggio, "On edge detection," *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Machine Intell.*, vol. PAMI-8, pp. 147–163, 1986.
- [19] R. Yang et al., "Optimal weighted median filtering under structural constraints," *IEEE Trans. Signal Processing*, vol. 43, pp. 591–604, 1995.

# On "The Convergence of Mean Field Procedures for MRF's"

## Jeffrey A. Fessler

In [1], Zhang attempts to establish convergence of a mean-field iteration for an Ising Markov random field (MRF) for large values of the hyperparameter  $\beta$ . Unfortunately, (16b), which states

$$|T_{\delta}(u_1) - T_{\delta}(u_2)| \le |u_1 - u_2|$$

is not correct for the function  $T_{\delta}(u)$  defined in (15) and Fig. 2. In fact, any function that satisfies (16b) for all  $u_1$  and  $u_2$  is necessarily a continuous function, unlike the particular  $T_{\delta}(u)$  defined in (15).

Thus, the convergence of the mean field iteration remains an important open question for large  $\beta$ .

#### REFERENCES

J. Zhang, "The convergence of mean field procedures for MRF's," *IEEE Trans Image Processing*, vol. 5, pp. 1662–1665, Dec. 1996.

Manuscript received February 6, 1997; revised August 19, 1997. The associate editor coordinating the review of this manuscript and approving it for publication was Prof. Stephen E. Reichenbach.

J. A. Fessler is with the Department of Electrical Engineering and Computer Science, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-2122 USA (e-mail: fessler@umich.edu).

Publisher Item Identifier S 1057-7149(98)04004-4.